

---

TERRI AGNEW: Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the At-Large Technology Taskforce call, taking place on Monday, the 10<sup>th</sup> of October, 2016 at 15:00 UTC.

On the call today, we have Alfredo Calderon, Olivier Crépin-Leblond, Judith Hellerstein, Beran Dondeh, Dev Anand Teelucksingh, Satish Babu, Stuart Clark, and Harold Arcos.

We have listed apologies from Gordon Chillcott.

From staff, we have Josh Baulch, Mark Segall, Corinna Ace, Ariel Liang, and myself, Terri Agnew.

Our Spanish interpreters today are Veronica and David.

I would like to remind all participants to please state your names before speaking, not only for transcription purposes, but also for our interpreters. With that, I'll turn it back over to you, Dev. Please begin.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you very much, and welcome everyone to the At-Large Technology Taskforce call. On this call, we're going to have a presentation update by Josh Baulch on Adobe Connect, and the recent change that ICANN has implemented regarding the use of Adobe Connect. And also, we're also hearing an update from ICANN staff on some of the technology issues, particularly from the LACRALO mailing list technology issues. So before we do that, let's go into our review of action items.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

The consolidated action items has been, I would say, much more cleaned up. We had a conference call with Ariel and the TTF co-Chairs, Glenn and Judith, to review and update and remove some of the TTF action items that accumulated over time. So we now have a much more streamlined, consolidated action items list.

I don't think [inaudible] has had a chance to do any updates. The only update I can see is that a [inaudible] Lutz Donnerhacke regarding the special purpose call on open PGP, and he should respond very soon on that call. The idea is to have that call later this month on open PGP.

Judith, do you have any updates or action items to report on? I see your hand raised, go ahead.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

I don't have any to report on, but some of the action items were things that were going to get done by this meeting. We had one about the exit poll functionality which Lutz may tell us about, and also, one of the items was also scheduling the face-to-face, which I think could also be almost taken off. And then Corinna and Mark will be following up, like you said, on the LACRALO mailing list.

I think that's mostly some of the – oh, and we were also going to ask IT about the potentiality of whether we should keep testing other conferencing solutions, or is it too difficult to do now that we have moved to [participate.icann.org](https://participate.icann.org)?

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Judith. Regarding the LACRALO mailing list, it's going to be updates from Corinna and/or Mark on the LACRALO mailing list, so we'll wait until we get to that item on the agenda. Indeed, regarding the conferencing solutions, one of the discussions we've been having is that given that Adobe Connect does seem to have the most features in terms of the conferencing solutions and that, there doesn't seem to be any conferencing solution that would match or exceed the Adobe Connect's features so that we would switch to it, we would recommend a switch at this time. The question is whether a report should be done still.

My thinking is yes, and the reason why I think we should do a summary report is that I think some of these conferencing solutions can help At-Large structures help to do their online conference calls and so forth. It doesn't have to be an elaborate report, we would just need to have a volunteer step up to help put together a few slides as to which conferencing solution would work best for At-Large structures. That's my suggestion.

There was one other conference solution that the IETF was to be looking at, which is Meetecho, which is probably one more conferencing solution we could probably just look at. And then given our experience with all of these conferencing solutions, let's have a slide just to show which ones will be great for At-Large structures to help do their online conferences for their internal meetings, or for other webinars. That's my suggestion for that report for conferencing solutions.

Okay, any other thoughts or comments? Alright, so let's move ahead to the next agenda item, and that's a conversation with Josh Baulch on the

---

changes on how ICANN uses Adobe Connect, and also some of the technology issues related to Adobe Connect.

Josh, thanks for taking the time to be on this call, I know you're a very busy person, especially with the upcoming ICANN meeting and so forth. You have the floor.

JOSH BAULCH:

Thank you very much, Dev, I appreciate you guys inviting me along. I'll try to keep this brief, but I'm just going to go through. There have been a lot of questions over the last couple of months, just based on feature sets and things that have changed, so this is going to be just kind of a quick summary, and I'll open the floor up for questions at the end.

Right now, we have five days left on our [icann.adobeconnect.com](http://icann.adobeconnect.com) servers, and once this expires, basically, all of the content that we posted over the last seven, eight years that we've had it will still be available. However, we have removed everybody's host and administrative rights as of the 15<sup>th</sup>. So if anybody needs content – and this goes for community as well – or security settings changed on a recording if you want to make something that was private, public, or something that was public private, whatever, you can submit that to [tech-support@icann.org](mailto:tech-support@icann.org).

So on the new servers, [participate.icann.org](http://participate.icann.org), right now they are up and running. That's what we are running on right now. We have been experiencing a few bugs related to audio as we work through the integrations with the phone providers. This is a matter of trying to get

---

three different companies all to work together and to make sure everybody's settings are all correct.

We ran into probably about almost two and a half weeks' worth of delays initially when we were setting this up, just in trying to get through some single sign-on and security issues. But Mike Brennan, who has been in charge of this product, has done an amazing job of kind of wrangling all of the different companies involved and getting the various aspects of this working. So right now, we're just kind of going through, and just there are a few minor bugs that will come up, and we'll just been hitting those as we can.

And so with this new system, ConnectSolutions, who are our partners with – basically, they're our private host at this point, and they have a team that is working around the clock, working on issues for us and in different things. There are some little backend things that we're trying to resolve. Alfredo asked me what's the turnover timeframe for a ticket being submitted. Generally, it's within 24 hours, something will happen. If it is something urgent, we try to get that escalated right away, so it kind of depends on the urgency of the ticket. If it's a problem in an Adobe room, we try to address that right away. If it's something with changing security settings or whatever, that usually gets bumped to a lower status and will be handled within 24 hours.

So improved security features with the full implementation of single sign-on, this is one of the goals of ICANN's IT area, is to get this, because it just significantly improves security and access from that standpoint. And then once the implementation is complete and fully operational, we'll start exploring custom pods, so a lot of the rest of this

---

conversation is going to be on custom pods, and just kind of where we can go from here.

One of the first questions that I wanted to address was about polling. Polling in Adobe Connect. The comment was – so what I’ve done here is the comments are in black, and then my response is in red, just so we’re all on the same page here. “Mobile users were not able to see the polls, inability for users to select more than one answer.” I went through and explored this, because I wanted to make sure. Polling is not something that I use on a regular basis, so I wanted to go through and explore this a little bit.

Using the Adobe Connect poll pod does allow for multiple answers, and it is confirmed. I went through and checked, it does work on the web add-in and the mobile application. And then additional information on the note. So the very first in the web links pod, if you click on the first link, that is some additional notes on just notes, chat, Q&A and poll pods. However, the one thing that I wanted to explain about the poll pods is that it is really designed to be more of a one-question poll. So if you have ten questions, then in reality, it was designed to be as an interactive thing, to where if I had a question right now for you guys, “Do you like polls?” Then I would have that pop up, and everybody would be able to answer the question.

Now, that is different than surveys, so I want to make sure that we’re not getting the two confused. Now, surveys are a little bit of a different question, so I wanted to just kind of recommend – there is an option, in the end when we close one of the Adobe Connect rooms, that you can kick it over to a web link. That can be Survey Monkey, it can be anything

---

that we deem as appropriate to be able to do a survey, but I just wanted to clarify the difference between a survey and a poll.

As for custom pods, the multilingual chat pods, would these work on mobile, what's the possible timeline for testing and implementation? There's a [forward] company that we can partner with that does do customization for Adobe Connect, and that was one of the reasons that we went to private server, just because now we have the ability to be able to do that. We have the ability to be able to manipulate the backend of Adobe Connect and customize things to our needs.

It would be about \$36,000 per year, so I'm not going to lie, it was a little bit of a steep price tag for me when I initially saw that, but that would apply to both desktop and mobile application. I don't have any allocation for funding in FY17 right now, because I went through all of my funding for Adobe. We basically put all of that towards just implementing into the private servers, because the price tag jumped up quite a bit when we did that. But it has allowed us to be able to customize things moving forward, and I think that that's really important for us to do.

You know what? I think the links – If we had put the PowerPoint up, you'd be able to click on them, but in the PDF, I'm not sure that you can. So the multilingual chat pod, this reflects a 10% discount that eSyncTraining would give us. The desktop only, if we only wanted to provide that multilingual chat, it would be about \$30,000. If we only wanted to do mobile, it would be \$18,000. Neither of those really make sense. I thought that it would make most sense to do both for \$36,000.

Now, the way that the chat pod would work would be that, as you can see here in our current chat pod, there would be an additional box or a dropdown that you would then select the language that you are using. So then what you would do is it would use Google Translate on the backend, and then it would – so if I, Josh, had typed in something in English and say that Terri had selected French when she logged in, then she would be reading everything in French from that point.

Alright, so moving on to the Adobe Connect recordings, would the changes impact availability of Adobe Connect recordings of past conference calls, Adobe Connect recordings in mp4 format and other sites like YouTube? No, there is no changes to that. That content is still all going to be available, there's not going to be any changes in that. We will leave that up for the next several years, until at some point we deem that the content can be retired.

But at this point, the change to participate doesn't change any of that and there should be nothing different from the past with regards to converting things to mp4 content and availability. So we'll still be able to operate exactly the same way that we did in the past. If there are any questions or anything on that, or concerns, let us know. Let either myself or Mike know and we're happy to go through and work out those issues.

Selecting more than one channel in the Adobe Connect room. This is an ongoing project to see what products and customizations can be made available for the support of this feature request. Right now, there isn't a timeline or a product that's available that provides what we're looking for on that, so there's always – from my team's perspective, we're

---



---

always looking for ways to implement this. This is important, because it also – I mean, we see the difference as well, and it's that you have to log into multiple tools to get different languages, that type of thing. So we completely understand that.

Hopefully in FY18 or something, it might be something where we can have something customized or built. Now, just my initial conversations with eSyncTraining, it could be anywhere from \$50,000 to \$75,000 for the customization, and that's not including annual fees. So it is something that I think should be a high priority for us, but it's a matter of allocating and getting funding for that.

So which pods will work with mobile devices, and which devices are these? Most people use iOS, Android and Linux. Will Adobe Connect work with Linux? That was kind of two questions, I merged them together. Most standard pods that come with Adobe Connect will work on the mobile. However, there are a few exceptions that won't work, and I went through and tested this just to make sure.

The file share pod, the web links pod don't work on the mobile, and the reason is that right now, we're in a transition between Flash, and right now we have three different things that are being in play with Adobe Connect: one is flash, one is Java, and one is HTML 5. The mobile app is running in Java and HTML 5, and so as the custom pods, they are now can be developed in Java or HTML 5, which then allows it to work on the mobile side. As Adobe is going through and fixing up their native pods, they're going through and adjusting that. So slowly but surely, we're getting there to where everything will be Java-based or HTML 5-based.

But another pod that currently does not work on mobile is the scribe pod, so the closed captioning pod. You also see timers, YouTube and music won't work from the mobile side as well because those were all custom .swf files, they're custom flash files.

But like I said, the transition is slow, we're getting there. As the demand for those pods increases, then we are able to get those working on the mobile side. And like you saw in the previous slide, there is a cost to customers doing this, and so the drive is a little bit slower, because you have to wait for that supply and demand. So these are a couple answers on the question continued.

Linux is not as strongly taken into consideration, because less than 1% of the Adobe Connect users are Linux-based. So from a business perspective for Adobe, this is not an area of focus, nor will it be in the future. The last Linux update was for Adobe Connect 8. We're currently on Adobe Connect 9, and have been for about a year and a half.

The official statement for Adobe on Adobe Connect 9 is, it just says, "Please note that although there is no currently known add-in for Linux, users on Linux, Ubuntu, Redhat and OpenSUSE can attend or host, present meetings with browsers." So basically, they're just recommending the browser. Now, I know that some of you guys have tested this and you have a workaround for this, but I just wanted to be up front that the support for Linux I don't believe will continue, unless there's a strong demand.

Mobile is only available for Apple, Android and Blackberry. Satisfy, yes, I do agree, but unfortunately, we're driven by the economics of the

---

---

larger perspectives of global users for Adobe. Linux is a little bit tougher to work with from a remote participation, because it is limited on the resources that are available for it. But with that being said, it's not something – the question at the top of the call was about exploring other tools.

If there is another tool that meets or exceeds the ability of Adobe Connect, I am all ears, and completely open to testing and potentially moving over to those. By no means is ICANN married to Adobe Connect, it just happens to be the one tool that we have found that meets the majority of our needs, and is the most customizable for what we need.

Audio quality, will it be improved with the new ICANN-hosted Adobe? We are almost completely converted over to the new servers and working through the load balancing issues ensuring best audio connections for the calls. The short answer is yes, we should see pretty significant improvement.

Now, does that mean that if a phone carrier is having issues, that phone call is still not going to have problems, or for some people who are dialing in from countries where Infrastructure is not the best, this is still going to be problematic, but it is something that as the demand from certain areas of the world increase and the infrastructure is improved, we will continue to see it. I can say over the last five or six years, the call quality has significantly increased for a lot of our calls.

Let's see. And just one thing I was going to say, and I think I said this earlier: this is really a pretty complicated setup on the backend that we've been working through a lot of little minor issues, of making sure

---

all the links work and that all of the – that we have peering sessions correctly set up with our telephone providers. And that includes Adigo, Verizon, PGI to be able to do that.

The other thing that I wanted to say about audio quality is it really plays into exactly the quality of Internet that you have at home. So if a participant is only pushing 1 Mb of data, the audio quality for this particular call is going to be pretty low. So it's one of those things where there are a lot of things, especially with the switch, that there's a lot of perceived issues that somebody would have not normally noticed. Which I completely appreciate, and so I want people to keep reporting this issues and we'll kind of keep working through them, but it is one of those things where there are a lot of factors that play into all the audio quality and how things run through. There are a lot of things that will have to line up perfectly for a perfectly crystal clear call.

Okay, so then moving on, so the ability to put in multiple pods, including one that uses machine translation when captioning is not available, and ability to have two captioning pods, one for English and the other for Spanish. So right now, there is not currently a tool that does machine translation. So from me speaking, turning it into text, that is integrated with Adobe Connect. I don't have a feeling that that's going to be available for a few years, because the technology is still in its infancy. Even if you're using Apples products or Google's products, you still see, I would say, a 50 or 60% understanding rate from that standpoint.

And then due to the nature of live scribing, closed captioning, it's not possible to have two live scribing teams working on two languages within the same Adobe Connect room. It would be kind of like having

---

two presentations going at the same time. The one thing that I would say that it's comparable to is having two interpreters on the same phone line for the same call, speaking at the same time.

So technically, it is not technically possible to provide dual service, and the way that those pods are particularly set up is because they basically have a connection – sorry, they as in the scribe have a connection – to the Adobe Connect room. The closest example I have that the way that Adobe Connect was designed to be operated would be from NETmundial in Brazil a couple of years ago, where basically, the Adobe Connect rooms are designed to be specifically dedicated to a language. So if we were to do this properly, it would be a dedicated room in English and a dedicated room in Spanish.

Now, we are at that awkward stage at ICANN where we don't have quite the population to be able to drive both rooms operating in independent languages. So I kind of feel like we're at those teenage years where we're not able to quite jump into adulthood, but yet we're not able to get out of the problems that we have with our teenage years.

Alright, so moving on to the English. And then Judith, I'll come to you here in just a sec. We'll get through all of these, and then I'll open up the floor for questions. So the English closed captioning pod with machine Google Translate. This is something that I wanted to tell you that is potentially available. It's something that we definitely need to test out and look into, so this is something that we hope to look into before December, but there is a custom caption pod.

So it's basically taking scribe pod, but it's being done in English, and then any user would be able to select the language that they want to read that English in, and then it uses Google Translate on the backend and would potentially translate up to 90 different languages. eSync is also the one who provides this, the custom pods for about \$30,000 annually, and then they had just given me an example of seven languages, it would be about \$20 an hour while that pod runs.

Now, we're paying per hour for that pod running any way it is, and it's about 10 cents a minute right now to run just with the scribe. So from that perspective, we understand that there is an hourly cost.

So the evaluation that ICANN has, and that I worked out with language services, that is absolutely imperative, because like we have Spanish interpreters on this call. There is nothing that would change the proper interpretation of a live human interpreting what I'm saying. Machine translation is inherently rough, so this is something where if something was put into play, we have to see at least an 80% accuracy rate. Google says that it's 90%, and then they've just put out an announcement that they have improved that, the phrase interpretation. But at this point, unless it is 80% or higher with the context of ICANN-related issues, it's something that we would probably postpone on.

But there is a demo link here that you can check out, and this is something too that we will continue to pursue, because each year, the quality gets higher. Look at this six years ago and it was extremely awful and now it's actually somewhat understandable. So just as something to be aware of.

---

---

Okay, so this slide here, just so you guys know, it is not necessarily public information. This was information that was shared with me when I met with Adobe Connect directly. So the Adobe user profile has about 40 million users right now. A little over 62% of that is Windows, 24% is the add-in, so a lot of you guys are probably using add-in now. A little over 11% is Apple products, 1% is Chrome OS, and less than 1% is Linux.

Just to kind of explain a little bit, most pods are already HTML 5-based to be able to work in the mobile. There is a slow transition from Flash to Java or HTML 5. They are interchangeable from Adobe's perspective. In the next 9 to 18 months, we should hopefully see Adobe push a switch to HTML 5. They have demo products that they are testing out with some clients.

The way that they would prioritize the room launch – and I actually saw that – is so exactly when you type in the URL, that it will try to launch the Java add-in first, and if you don't have it, then it will try to say, "Oh, well does this user have Flash in the web browser?" And if you don't have that, then it will launch into the HTML 5 web browser.

Now, the HTML 5 user experience will be different than the typical add-in. The design and the graphics are a little bit different. They tried to match it up as closely as possible, but because it is 100% web-based, it is a little bit different. And just one thing that I wanted to say was, natively, HTML 5 cannot share camera or mic audio and requires other APIs, like WebRTC or something like that.

So that is really why there's been a delay from Adobe's perspective from pushing, because they're not 100% sure that HTML 5 is really the

---

end-all product that'll go there. Now, granted, they have a vested interest in Flash, so I'm sure that they're dragging their feet on that perspective.

Then I wanted to give you guys just a little bit of information, a little bit of additional information. There is some basic information on the mobile app that I uploaded, so you can get that from the links that I have posted there. And then also, Adobe Connect in June or July of this year published a white paper on HTML 5, so I thought that it was something that this group would appreciate.

So at this point, I'd like to go ahead and open up the floor for questions. If you want to raise your hand in Adobe Connect, and then we'll go there. So Judith, we'll start with you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks, Josh, for this information. It's very helpful. When you just discussed the ideas about the web links, if someone is having a problem on mobile, I think – is there any option for them, or can they... I think you mentioned once before that you can force an HTML link or something. Is that only for people on laptops, or is that also on mobile? And then I also have another question.

JOSH BAULCH:

Okay, so let me make sure that I'm understanding your question correctly. So if you're on a mobile device and it won't open up the Adobe Connect room, is that what I'm understanding that you're asking?



JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, so let's say I was getting bad feedback from the app and the app was not working well, would you be able to give us – like now, she had to get an audio call, but if there's a way maybe to force a web browser to do it, that also could be a solution.

JOSH BAULCH: Yes. Right, so this actually just really depends on the mobile device that you're on. Because as an Apple user, I wouldn't be able to go to the web version at this point. Now, within the 9 to 18 months, that will change, because once the websites are HTML 5, then they will open up on an Apple device. But right now, they still are launching in Java on the website, which is why they have the mobile app. So kind of the answer to your question is no, there really isn't a way around that at this point, to be able to do that.

Now, unfortunately, we don't – as ICANN don't have a lot of control on the mobile app and what is published or designed or developed, so we're a little bit at the mercy of Adobe on this. However, the things that you are experiencing or that people experienced also means that a lot of other people are potentially experiencing it as well, so we hope that Adobe is addressing it. And we do put in tickets to Adobe to let them know the issues that we're experiencing from that.

So the answer, which is not a great answer, but it's basically no, there isn't a way around that at this point. Which is why we do offer the phone side of it, and we haven't gone to 100% the application audio. So you had a second question?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: The second question is, as I understand about the pods, when you're talking about this – if you're having captioning and we have the different room. So right now, as it's currently configured, we can only have one pod, but that pod does not necessarily have to connect with the – if the room audio is in Spanish, the pod could be in English, because we have an English interpreter.

JOSH BAULCH: Correct. You are correct.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: So we can choose which one we want to put in, and then the other one will just be a stream text link that other people could look at, and it could be posted in the chat or something else like that. That doesn't change, right?

JOSH BAULCH: Correct. You are correct in that.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay, so potentially, since we have Spanish interpretation, if we had a Spanish translation, we could have either one pod – one pod has to be the one that's chosen, and the other one would have to be on a stream text link, but potentially, that could be what we have, right?

---

JOSH BAULCH: Correct.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes.

JOSH BAULCH: Yes. Alright, so Olivier.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much, Josh. I'm going to ask a question on the technical side of things, where the different services are hosted. The previous Adobe Connect at [icann.adobeconnect.com](http://icann.adobeconnect.com) was located in Dallas, Texas, I believe, where they – Omniture, which is an Adobe company, was the hosting company. The current one is now hosted on Datapipe in San Jose. Have you conducted any tracerouting or anything like that to find what the lowest delay is or even the delay and jitter and delay from different parts of the world before choosing that provider?

JOSH BAULCH: We did. The reason that we had gone with this particular one in San Jose was we were able to – the location that ConnectSolutions had around the world, this was the one that we have that had the best connection with the Los Angeles datacenter that we have for ICANN. So we were able to do some direct peering with them directly.

Now, the advantage that we have also with San Jose is that what we can potentially do is that if we are seeing a lot of jitter or issues with that,

---

say, for Singapore or India, which is almost exactly opposite of where we are, where the datacenter is, is that we do have a second option now with this to be able to install a secondary server on that side of the world.

Now, this does complicate things a little bit, because Adobe, when they designed it, didn't design it for an active active situation to where we could have Los Angeles online and we could also have Singapore online at the same time, and having both rooms. So for example, this TTF room could be in Los Angeles as well as in Singapore. They didn't design it to operate that way, so if we did it, there would be a TTF room in Singapore and then a TTF room in North America or something like that.

So we kind of ran into some, I guess in my opinion, design flows with Adobe for them to be able to have redundancy and to be able to solve some of those issues. But to answer your question directly, they didn't have a lot in Europe to be able to do something there. It was mostly in the United States, or they had also one in Asia. But we went with the one in the United States partly because of our closeness to the Los Angeles datacenter, but also that we have the majority of our attendees are also still either North America or Europe.

So yes, I hope that kind of answers your question. I can go back to you and provide offline and actually provide the results to you directly, if you'd like, as well. I'll have to go back and get those. I don't remember them off the top of my head.

---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: If I could add, Josh, I'm particularly concerned perhaps not with [inaudible] because we have extensive links with North America, and although there is an 80 millisecond or 90 millisecond delay across the pond, of course, there's always going to be a pond somewhere in the world, so that's no big deal. But certainly, some parts of our community are based in Asia and particularly in Africa. They don't have that much resilience in the number of paths that there are to several networks, and so their delay they might be incurring in addition to what they have might actually be bigger because of the number of hops or the overall path that they'd have to take to go all the way down to San Jose.

And I wondered, had you considered – and whether even Adobe Connect was compatible with this, which was to consider content delivery networks such as the Amazons and the Googles of this world, who effectively offer you this kind of, “Your service is somewhere in the cloud,” and depending on where you're based, the DNS is going to give you a different IP address, bringing you in touch with the server that's supposedly – or at least the front end of the server – being closer to you.

JOSH BAULCH: Yes. No, thank you for that. No, that is definitely one of the things that we tried to explore with them, and that's kind of what I was referring with the active active. Adobe, the platform itself was not designed to be able to do that, which is really unfortunate. I'm hoping to see that change because as they get more enterprise customers on board, we're not the only ones that face these issues.

---

And exactly that. When we were in Durban, we were seeing 230 millisecond delay back to Dallas when it was in Dallas. At that point, it almost becomes unusable [inaudible] response time. But yes, I definitely do see that, and it is something that we are active – and that is one of the things that we try to work with them and try to set up peering sessions.

So if there is somewhere that someone who is really having an issue that is in Africa somewhere or whatever, and that we're able to, we could request now to set up peering sessions with their service provider so that we can minimize the amount of hops that that person might be going through. So there are some things that we can do now that we have more control and access to our backend to be able to help and resolve those issues. So I appreciate you bringing them up.

It looked like Dev had a question, but I think he may have dropped off.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: No, I was just putting myself in the [queue]. So thanks, Josh. Thanks for that. Thanks for the participation, Josh. And actually, thanks, Olivier, regarding that question regarding possibly having like how [inaudible] pairing audio, I guess like audio servers being in different regions so as to minimize latency. I think it's something that could be looked at.

So I know Beran – who's probably not in the Adobe Connect room – had some challenges with using the new Adobe Connect URL with the Safari browser, so I guess I just want to see if Beran still can't speak to this. Let us see. And if not, I can just summarize what it was. Okay, she did mention that she was in a noisy area, so maybe she's offline now. Let's

---

see, I'm seeing Terri just typing. Okay, well, maybe she can't talk right this moment, but alright, I'll come back to it.

Essentially, what she was saying was that when she uses, tries to connect with the link in Safari, it keeps saying – it prompts to update to Flash and the page just keeps reloading with that Flash plugin not working. So I guess this is something that perhaps we can help test with Beran with staff, because I know staff does use Mac as well. So we can probably look to have a [inaudible] session with Beran to solve this.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I'm using Safari right now, and I don't have any problem, so it also maybe – I don't know what version she's using, but all I can tell you is that I'm not on the latest operating system, so maybe it has something to do with the later operating system, because I'm only on 10.9.5. I don't know if Beran is on a later one and that's not working. But I know I'm on 10.9.5 in operating system, and then Safari, I'm using version 9.1, so I don't know about whether it's that.

---

JOSH BAULCH: This is something we can definitely help with, these little type of issues we see with our own staff and it's usually fairly easy for us to fix. So what I would just ask is if we could get a screenshot of the error that she has and then she can either e-mail myself or Mike, or send it in to tech-support@icann.org. We're more than happy to help troubleshoot from that.

I'm going to put a URL in chat that I would encourage everybody to use. What this does is basically it kind of tests out your system to be able to make sure that Adobe Connect can run on your system or if you need to do any updates. So if you go there, it'll run through a little test and kind of, say, try to update your Flash for you, and it'll add the add-in if you need, but that is really helpful. But yes, I don't want to spend a lot of time on that, so if there's something, if you want to send her our way, more than happy to help with that. So thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Great, thanks, Josh. I guess one observation, thinking about the presentation. Regarding the multilingual chat pod, perhaps what can happen is that maybe when the budget request period is open – and I believe the timeline is late December for a budget request from the various ACs and SOs – the TTF could consider submitting a budget request for that multilingual chat pod, given the implementation costs.

JOSH BAULCH: Yes, and that's – I just realized that I think I may – oh, I did skip a line when I was going through this. The community support would be really helpful on this project. If this is something that you, as the community



---

members, you guys think that is really important, if you – I feel like it's kind of like saying, "Write your senators." If you let ICANN know that you feel like this is a priority and should be, that helps me be able to allocate the funding when we have various groups and folks saying, "Look, this is important for us to have." That goes a long way with us.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: It would be, I think, very important for At-Large to support, I think, especially for LACRALO where we have multiple language communities, English, Spanish, and Portuguese as well, and French. Often, we're just using cut and paste between the chat pod and Google Translate from both language communities when we're trying to communicate.

Judith, your hand is raised.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We've got in the TTF several different questions about problems in the voice over IP, audio issues, and they are also not only from – they're from some countries that have good bandwidth, like James Gannon from Ireland and others. And I don't know whether these are old issues during the hiccups in the first two weeks or whether it's a more significant thing. I'm wondering about that.

JOSH BAULCH: Thanks, Judith. Thanks for the question. No, I can say that it probably was through issues in the first couple of weeks that we rolled this out. This, starting as of today, we're hoping that the audio and everything has been worked out. The guys did a bunch of operational things over

---

the weekend, so we hope that we have everything kind of refined and smoothed out between – really, some of our big issues were between PGI, our telephone provider, and Adobe.

So we think we've got those finally worked out, but again, if anybody has any issues, let us know. Try to give us as much information as you can: what time a call was, what provider was, what number you were trying to call into. The more information you can give us, it makes it a lot easier for us to be able to go back to the telephone providers and say, "Hey, what's going on here? Why did we have issues here?" Or, "Can we replicate the issues?" That type of thing.

So like I said, you guys let staff know if you're having issues, but also, keep in mind too that there may be localized issues, and so we'll try to help out and establish that, and try to troubleshoot those. And if it's something where it's on an active call, let us know. You can hit us up via Skype or anything, or staff can hit us up via Skype, and we'll jump into the room and see if we can help troubleshoot.

Because we have been able to jump into some rooms and we see the problem and were able to record it or be able to take a snapshot of it to be able to give to the other techs with the other companies and be able to provide that back to them. And it helps resolve the issue much quicker.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks, Josh. Alright, let's see. We do have another agenda item, so let's – and it's coming up to ten minutes before the hour, so let's – Josh, thanks so very much for this presentation and taking the time to

---

answer our questions. We obviously look forward to continue to work with you to address these technology challenges with Adobe Connect as ICANN moves forward.

Okay, so the technology issues page. I just wanted to focus on two of the technology issues. We do have an update on the LACRALO mailing list issues. Perhaps Corinna and/or Mark would like to take the floor to just give an update on this issue.

CORINNA ACE:

Sure, hi. Thank you for having us today. First, the LACRALO mailing list issue, we have – as we reported the past month or so with dedicated development resources working on resolving the bugs, so the team’s been making steady progress on all of the bugs. As of the end of last week, development is complete and all but one of the bugs has been addressed.

The bug that hasn’t been resolved was a non-critical bug, and it’s related to capitalization of a proper noun that Google Translate understands as an abbreviation. So this team is still looking into possible workarounds related to that bug. So now that we’ve gotten to this place though, with the other critical bugs addressed, we’re focusing on finishing regression testing, and preparing a launch strategy that’s consistent with the rest of our IT services.

So we will be working with Dev to do some final review and acceptance testing, and then scheduling a formal launch of the fixes. I am really happy to report this progress and really thankful for the patience of the taskforce and all of the support from Mark and also the talented and

---

hardworking development team that we've been fortunate to work with. So we will give the taskforce an official update when the fixes are released into production soon.

Mark, please let me know if I missed anything.

MARK SEGALL: No, that was a great update, Corinna. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks for this, Corinna. So just to confirm – and I've seen some of the testing messages going out as they were testing these things, so I think – can we probably then do another round of testing and see if we can identify any new, or possibly any other [inaudible] not necessarily regressions, but any new bugs that we detect?

CORINNA ACE: Yes, absolutely. I think that's part of what the testing focus team is working on now to see if we fixed these bugs. Other bugs can be identified and if there's any sort of situation that comes up where a bug maybe would not be resolved with a different type of mailing host or sort of a situation we might not have anticipated. So yes, absolutely, and we can work very closely together, Dev.

I'll be in touch this week to talk about what we think is the best route for testing and if you have any additional tests you want to do. And then obviously make sure that you're involved in the final round of those user acceptance testing before we launch anything.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Great indeed. Okay, thanks for that, Corinna. I know there are also a few other persons who we can also pull in to test with the translation engine.

Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev, my question is not on that. It's on the other items on the technology issue page, and so I'm waiting for that.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Oh, okay, fine. Alright, any other comments or questions regarding the LACRALO mailing list issues?

Okay, alright, so the second technology issue that's been noted – and Judith will speak on it – is the use of custom e-mail addresses. Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: So we understand from IT that we can't get – we would – generic e-mail addresses. So like in sense that we wanted to have like a Technology Taskforce general e-mail that would reach – so that instead of putting down all our personal e-mail addresses, we could have one generic one that we could use.

Or besides that – and we understand that the reason why this can't be done is that there's a need to archive and to make all the messages available publicly. So that was my question.

---

And then another workaround I thought, if we can't get generic e-mail addresses because of security issues, we could do team [inaudible] or something like that. And I'm wondering if someone from IT can discuss this and sort of advise us on how we could go forward.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks, Judith. So the issue regarding can there be specialty e-mail addresses, like – using the RALO as an example – chair@naralo.org and so forth. And I'm thinking the workaround [was] having sort of a mailing list, where a custom e-mail address is then posted at that mailing list, it gets distributed to the current leadership of NARALO. And the idea being is that I think in future, when there are changes in the leadership, it's just a question of adding a new person and removing the previous persons in that position.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Right, yes. And the idea also is like that in the TTF, we won't have to be – sometimes people are left off or not all the co-Chairs are put in, but if we had a TTF leadership e-mail list, we could just write that address and it would be distributed to everyone, and that will make sure that everyone who's on the leadership gets the correct information. If that's a possibility, then that could also work for us.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Indeed. Does anybody from staff have any observations or comments on this?

---

MARK SEGALL: I don't really have a comment other than I'm just taking notes here and can chat with some of our internal team what other – maybe for an action item for me to come back with some options, if that works for this team.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I think that'll be fine, so thanks for that.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev, it says – Silvia posted in the chat that we can have a mailing list, so hopefully, that could work. My other question was, on the technology issue page, we never marked off as done or not the remote participation in the ICANN face-to-face meetings. And this was what I found out. When we're at the meetings, if you're monitoring another room and you're listening in on the Adigo and the room is in English but the question is in Spanish or French, you'll hear the raw audio, then you'll hear that Spanish or French instead of the English. I think these were fixed so that if you click on the English only stream, you would get English only, even if the questions would be sent in Spanish. But maybe IT – and if that's the case, then we can mark this as resolved on the technology issues page.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes, indeed. I was waiting to put in the actual notes for how this was resolved before I marked it off as complete, so that, I guess, is an action item. I believe Mark did submit an e-mail to the TTF list addressing this, so I think we can mark it off as complete, but I just need to actually find

---

that e-mail and put it in the solution/workarounds column. So I guess that's an action item for us to update that.

Okay, I know it's coming to the top of the hour, let's see.

Any Other Business that anyone wants us to raise? Okay, going once, going twice. Okay, just a quick update on next steps, we're looking to have another special purpose TTF call with Lutz Donnerhacke on the open PGP, and we're looking to see if that could be done for next week, or possibly the week after that.

We are also planning to have a TTF session at ICANN 57, so we'll also be sharing on the mailing list some ideas for the proposed agenda.

Judith, your hand is raised.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

I was on mute. So, are we going to be – is there another time when we could be able to test in the exit polling feature to see if that works better on surveys than on either polls or surveys, so that people on mobile can actually use it, or people who are on Adigo could be given a web link to use it, or something like that?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Well, I think we could probably – let's see if we can work with staff, because staff will have to implement that feature in an Adobe Connect session, and then we could probably do perhaps a short testing session with Adobe Connect before the month ends. Okay?



---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, thanks, and can we add – so can we make this an action item?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Sure. Yes. And I see it's been noted. And Satish also notes the point that it may be interesting to do a quick survey on the OSes used by the At-Large community, so that we understand our user base better. I think that's an interesting idea, Satish. It's certainly something to consider. Perhaps that's part of even a wider At-Large survey, because the last At-Large survey was done in 2010, I believe. So it's probably due for an – it's probably update on having a new survey of At-Large done, might be something in the works that we should consider.

Okay, going once, seeing no further hands raised, I'd like to thank everyone for this call. Very informative. Thanks again to Josh, Corinna, and Mark for giving some great updates on technology issues that we're currently facing. And I'd like to thank all of you and to the interpreters as well. So have a wonderful good morning, good afternoon, good evening, and enjoy the rest of your day. Thank you all. This call is now adjourned.

TERRI AGNEW: Thank you. Once again, the meeting has been adjourned. Thank you very much for joining. Please remember to disconnect all remaining lines, and have a wonderful rest of your day.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**