
TERRI AGNEW: Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the LACRALO working group DNS marketplace [wax?] study, taking place on Tuesday the 18th of October 2016 at 23:00 UTC.

On the call today we have Humberto Carrasco, Aida Noblia, Maritza Aguero, Carlos Vera, Harold Arcos, and Alberto Soto.

We have listed apologies from Silvia Herlein Leite.

From staff we have Silvia Vivanco and myself Terri Agnew.

Our Spanish interpreter today is Sabrina.

If I could please remind all participants to please state your name before speaking, not only for transcription purposes, but also for our interpreters.

With this, I'll turn it back over to you, please begin.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco speaking. Thank you very much Terri. Maritza, you have the floor.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Thank you everyone. Hello everyone. Good afternoon, good evening. We are going to get this session started. This is the DNS marketplace LAC study working group, and I have posted the methodology for this working group in our chat room. This is a

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

preliminary, or introductory call, because also we will hold a call focusing on the study on an item by item basis.

So here, we can see the methodology, the approach, the coordination of this working group, bearing in mind, or in viewing of the closing date of this public comment period. The closing date is in two weeks' time, that is on November 1st. So, I'm also going to post a link, I am positing it as I speak, a link to the study, to the DNS marketplace study.

You have that posted in the AC room. And also, I would like to focus on our contributions to this study, and how we're going to coordinate this working group. So if anyone would like to take the floor, please go ahead.

The microphones are open, the floor is open, please feel free to take the floor and make any suggestions, comments, contribution. Humberto, go ahead please, you have the floor.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto Carrasco speaking for the record. I'm running a quick audio check. Can you hear me?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia speaking. Yes, of course, go ahead Humberto.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto speaking. Hello, okay. Briefly, I see that this working group somehow or other, or at least the way I see it, is going to seek the

opinion, or LACRALO's opinion, because there is another group being created by Carlos Gutierrez, perhaps that other group is a little bit more cross community, because it engages people beyond the region.

So this is what we're trying to do. [Inaudible] or from LACRALO. So, in this regard then, we need to focus on this report and on providing input during the public comment period, as you can see the closing date is scheduled on November 1st. So we need to agree on whether we would be making a comment as LACRALO as a whole, or in any other way. Thank you Maritza.

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza speaking. Thank you Humberto for your comment. Is there any other comment about this study? About the proposed methodology? Have you been able to check out the links posted in the Wiki space, in the workspace, for this group? We have posted links to access the ICANN announcement on the purpose of this study with some background information as well.

So, it would be, if you haven't checked the documents or reviewed the documents, we could agree on a methodology for this group because as Humberto said, it's very important to decide whether we are going to make comments like a group as a whole, or in any other fashion.

I see that Aida is requesting the floor. Go ahead, Aida, the floor is yours.

Aida, you have the floor, go ahead please.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto speaking.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. We cannot hear you, Aida.

Maritza speaking. Aida, we can't hear you. Perhaps you want to post your message or question in the chat room? Or your comment?

HAROLD ARCOS: This is Harold speaking. Can you hear me?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Yes Harold, we can hear you.

HAROLD ARCOS: Harold speaking. Thank you and my apologies. I have some internet issues. My internet connection is not stable, therefore I am joining the call on my cell phone, and I can check the AC room whenever my internet connection is back.

I asked for the floor because I believe, it's worth noting our chair, Humberto's, position. And I believe it is also worth mentioning, or noting, that this study includes interesting information. It reflects user habits in Latin America, in our region, and it also shows do we use social media to consume content? And regenerate content as well.

So generating or creating content is a driving factor in the DNS market. So in that regard, I believe that our observations, our perspective, go

hand in hand with the user's perspective in the region. So we need to become the owners of the subject matter knowledge. There is plenty of knowledge within ICANN, so to learn how to turn the internet into a productive tool.

And that marks the difference between simply using the internet and benefiting from it, by turning it into a useful tool. So, to sum up, we need to share knowledge, especially in those countries that still lack user associations. In the study with the diagram, a diagram with the graphic representations of this situation. So we need to focus on outreach efforts in these countries so as to raise awareness and raise interest in internet governance.

In those countries that still do not have user associations. And at the same time, we need to present capacity building plan. There is plenty to do there. That was my comment. That's my comment. Thank you very much.

SABRINA: Several speakers are overlapping.

CARLOS VERA: Carlos Vera, I will now take the floor. Carlos Vera speaking. I would like to know the scope of this group's work. Is there any suggestion on how to proceed? Are we going to make a comment or comments on this study? That is, we need to define the scope of our work. What are we going to do?

What are we going to focus on? Are we going to comment on the study, etc.?

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza speaking. Thank you very much Carlos. If I may, I would like to say the following. This study is open for public comment, not only for people to review the content and make comments... I mean, not only to review the content, but also to make comments on the time window closes on November 1st.

So the opportunity or the time window is now. And we need to indicate whether we agree or not with the content of this study. So, we need to focus on how we're going to proceed. Unfortunately, time is of the essence. That's why we're scheduling these calls for us to have a deeper insight into this situation, this study and work as a team, and to come with, or come up with, a joint position or comment.

And apologies if I keep holding the floor, but Harold, I don't know if you're on the call. I have a question. I don't know if I can pose the question now Harold?

HAROLD ARCOS:

This is Harold speaking. Yes, my audio is enabled, my microphone is also enabled, and I am attentively listening to the call.

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza speaking now. Thank you Harold. You and Vanda are members of an ALAC group, and you're able to make comments on this

document. So the question is, do you have any substantive or additional comment or input to present so that we can join you and can support that comment, input, or position, in the other group?

HAROLD ARCOS: Harold speaking. Please bear with me. I need to confirm that. Maritza, can you hear me?

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Yes, loud and clear.

HAROLD ARCOS: Harold speaking. Harold Arcos for the record. Yes, together with Vanda, we are reviewing, or we are performing a more detailed study because this initiative clearly focuses on Latin America. So our task is to summarize part of the analysis. I believe this is something we need to share with this working group, and I believe it would also be ideal for the region to come onboard, and see or determine, if there has been, or if there is any aspect of the study that has not been approached or addressed.

Because perhaps, as we mentioned initially, or as I mentioned initially, there are certain findings that need to be further analyzed. For example, user awareness in terms of the DNS marketplace in the region. So, we ourselves, as users, we have some benchmarking elements, like the graphic or the graph that we saw yesterday, or that was shown to us yesterday.

We have some elements like the fees that need to be paid for domain names. So that is in line with positions on a regional market scale. We understand that we need to move forward towards becoming the, or towards ownership of that subject matter knowledge, so that we end up with a healthy market in the region.

So the expectation is to increase regional participation in this analysis that we are working on right now.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Thank you Harold. Humberto, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto Carrasco speaking for the record. Thank you. First of all, I want to check my audio. I see that you can hear me. Okay, thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Yes, we can hear you Humberto. Please go ahead.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto speaking. Thank you. Following up on Carlos Vera's reply, I would like to say that I was reading the report, the study, and of course, there is plenty to comment on, but I would like to focus on the relevant aspects for the internet users. For instance, the price, or domain name prices in Latin America. That is quite relevant.

For instance, if we look at the ccTLDs, we see that there are sharp contrasts between or among different countries. So, we also need to focus on the fact that in many cases, there are monopolies in the marketplace. And we as users, perhaps need to exert some pressure or encourage other mechanisms in order to foster or promote competition that will result in higher participation and...

Excuse me, my audio was choppy. So lastly, I would like to say that we are working on an initiative, so as to protect domain name users regarding certain issues involving trademark holders. Perhaps we might replicate that initiative, or those initiatives, on a regional scale. Thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Thank you Humberto. Alberto, you have the floor now. Go ahead.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto speaking. I would like to give the floor to Alejandro first, and then I will follow.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Great, thank you. So, Alejandro, you have the floor.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro speaking. Thank you very much. My apologies for joining late, for joining the meeting at a later state. I see that the participants

in this meeting also attended yesterday's meeting. I have a question and a comment. What's the desirable status or state that we want to achieve or reach in the domain name marketplace in Latin America?

In some places, the fact that Harold is not... The fact that growth is not that fast can be interpreted in different ways. We have new gTLDs that are growing quite fast, and that derives from two phenomena, defensive registrations on the one hand, trademarks, as Humberto was mentioning, that register domains to prevent their use by third parties. And also, we have some names such as dot XYZ that are being very rapidly adopted or used, and that has to do with blocking phishing attacks, blocking spam, blocking bot nets.

This has to do with DNS abuse, and it's a real issue or problem. So we do need to ask ourselves about the desirable or ideal state of this marketplace before we decide on whether something described in the report is going too fast or too slow. And also, as mentioned yesterday, we have dot Rio and dot NY in order to represent cities, and we see that public interest issues, in some cases, are not very clearly defined.

For example, in the case of dot NY, the city is controlling the delegations on the basis of public interest. That was mentioned yesterday or something similar was mentioned yesterday in the case of dot Rio. So we should go deeper into those situations before we take a position, bearing in mind that we are focusing mainly on user interest.

When somebody says that he or she is going to speak about the GAC, and also promote domain name businesses, well perhaps that is not in

line with users' perspective. So we need to go deeper into the different positions and be able to discuss and analyze them. Thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Thank you very much Alejandro. Alberto Soto, you have the floor now.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto speaking. Thank you. I agree with Alejandro and Harold. The thing is that we have a structural problem, and as such, there are certain measures or steps that need to be taken, maybe simultaneously, or some first than others, and others that need to be taken after another measure has been implemented, etc. But going back to what Alejandro said, in the case of dot NY, well, let me tell you about Argentina.

We started charging domain name registrations, and we found that some people had, for example, about 2,000 domain name registrations related to trademarks, so that in, or at a certain stage the trademark holder would have to engage in negotiations with them. Also, we see a delay within ICANN in the treatment of certain gTLDs.

For example, dot health or [Spanish] in Spanish. Well, we haven't engaged in the definition or the study of those cases. By way of example, recently there was a study in Europe, and it was discovered that counterfeit medication was being used, and plenty of people passed away as a result of that.

So this did not derive from dot health, but it derived from people selling the medication inappropriately. So as you can see, lots of lives could have been saved if that had been defined properly. Then in terms of cost, in the region and beyond our region, I attended a meeting with Olivier and I see that the cost issue is similar.

And cost means lack of content. As somebody else, it means that we are network consumers, but we do not produce our own content. And if there is a domain that might be used to create content specific to our region, we see the tax haven domain hunters to put it somewhere that can grab the domains that would be useful to the community. Africa and Asia Pacific also share these problems. Thank you.

CARLOS VERA: Carlos Vera speaking. I would like to take the floor.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza. Yes go ahead, Carlos. You have the floor.

CARLOS VERA: Carlos Vera for the record. Thank you. I agree with Humberto, Alejandro, and Alberto. And...

SABRINA: The interpreter apologizes, but Mr. Vera's audio is saturated and cannot be accurately interpreted into English.

Carlos Vera still holding the floor.

CARLOS VERA: So, this situation that I'm describing results in many fraudulent cases and we see that in Brazil and Ecuador, we have fake companies that have different domains, and...

SABRINA: The interpreter apologizes, but Mr. Vera's audio is saturated and cannot be properly or accurately interpreted into English.

CARLOS VERA: Carlos Vera still taking the floor.

So we see different fees for domain names, renewal fees, renewal policies, and a local operator will have to focus on this and address these issues so that everything works better.

SABRINA: Once again, the interpreter apologizes because Mr. Vera's audio is not clear enough to be accurately interpreted into English.

CARLOS VERA: And we need to focus on the current status of entities in charge of registrations. We see that we have universities, government, companies that got tainted with the domain name business. And we see that in Ecuador and in other countries.

Carlos Vera speaking. Yes, of course, my apologies. For one second, I forgot that we had simultaneous interpretation on the call. So, as I was saying, we need to focus on the structure, the legal status. We need to see if the entity is a company, a NGO, a government, because normally, in more countries, we see that there are issues, certain situations that derive in monopolies.

And also, sometimes governments do not have a lot of information on the fact that they can be the domain name managers. So, it would be interesting to see the evolution of the structure of the different registrars in different countries to see how this is evolving.

For example, Columbia wanted, or there was a situation in Columbia because dot CO was going to be sold to the private sector in order to represent companies, and the Colombian government took some steps in order to avoid this. Thank you very much.

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza Aguero for the record. Thank you Carlos. Before I give the floor to Alejandro Pisanty, I would like to go back to the agenda for this session or meeting. We need to organize this group. We need to see how we are going to work, because we will be holding a second call this week, with Carolina [inaudible] as a participant, and clearly we need to have reviewed the corresponding documents by then.

And the time window to present comment closes in two weeks' time. So we need to define our methodology. Alejandro Pisanty, please go ahead if you were asking for the floor, or perhaps that was an old hand.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco speaking. Maritza, if I may. Please do not get... When you take the floor, do not get that close to the microphone, so as to avoid saturating your audio. Thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza Aguero speaking. Thank you very much Silvia for that suggestion. So, in any event, we can then focus on the methodology. We only have 25 minutes left before bringing the call to a close, and we need to define this. So the floor is open.

Alejandro, go ahead please, you have the floor.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro Pisanty, this is a new hand. Thank you. I think we are lacking a goal before we decide on anything else, an objective. We all joined this working group because we are interested in this discussion and we want to express our view. But maybe we need a clear objective that maybe as brief as, give an opinion that is representative of the region.

But we do need this goal or objective.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Yes, of course. We can agree on the objective or goal. And I see Aida Noblia is asking for the floor. Go ahead Aida.

Maritza speaking again. Aida, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

Maritza speaking. Aida, we cannot hear you.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia speaking. Aida, we cannot hear you. We see that your microphone is enabled, but we cannot hear you. Maybe you want to join on the phone? Okay. It seems that we cannot hear Aida, so Maritza if you want to move on.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Yes, of course. Alejandro, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro Pisanty speaking. My apologies. I am used to another system in which the call coordinator lowers our hands after we have taken the floor. But I insist on our objective. We do need an objective, a goal, and also I believe that the domain name marketplace, or one of the drivers of that marketplace, is a combination of several factors, including speculation.

So, there may be others that believe that these considerations need to be corrected, etc. I see, or I don't think it's a bad idea to engage in a brainstorming session, so that we can quickly come up with ideas or a solution. And I am very interested in hearing Carlos Gutierrez's view on this and on the objectives. Thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Yes Carlos, go ahead.

CARLOS: Carlos speaking. My apologies. Alejandro, I was able to join the call only some minutes ago, and I had some audio issues. The way I understood it, the only goal, or the only objective of having this presentation, which I couldn't listen to, and I assume was a very good one, well, I believe that the only goal is to make comments, or contribute comments, during this public comment period.

They may be good, they may not be good. There may be a combination of both. In the GNSO non-commercial stakeholder group, a decision was made that we cannot engage in meetings of service sectors, partners, or stakeholders, or we cannot engage in discussions on the auctions, if we do not know what is happening in the region.

We believe ICANN made a very considerable effort by commissioning these studies. So my proposal is, let us do our best, at least in LACRALO, so that by November 1st, we are able to say whether we liked or did not like this study, at least. Because I believe this is an investment that ICANN is making in the regions, and we need to show our appreciation by expressing one or two comments or reviews.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Harold, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

HAROLD ARCOS: Harold Arcos for the record. I'm checking my audio.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Yes, we can hear you. Go ahead please.

HAROLD ARCOS: Harold speaking. So going back to the strategy and defining a strategy for this working group, since we have shared different views, and I said that we consumer rather than create content. So my suggestion is that we should draft a goal or an objective, along the lines of what Carlos just said, but bearing in mind that we want to achieve, or accomplish, a view or perspective from the region, so as to suggest the inclusion of new topics, or the inclusion of improvements.

Perhaps instead of using the word improvement, we can say include more items in future studies, or widen horizons in future studies. Additionally, I would like to suggest the following. We could organize our proposals, etc. in the following way. We can divide our comment and opinion part, sharing the different viewpoints, as Alejandro was saying.

And then we can have another part called comments, or devoted to comments. And perhaps there, we can express or reflect topics that, although measured, require further measurement. And a third part of our comment or input, maybe a request section, where we present or make direct requests for further studies, including the content of those further or future studies.

And finally, I would like to maintain our perspectives as users, because when it comes to a marketplace, as several colleagues have said, we

need to be able, or what we're doing rather is, engaging in an analysis that, at the end of the day, will have no impact upon the user. So, what we are doing is we are focusing on a niche market, so we are participating as isolated consumers, and our input would be another market study.

So, it's important to keep in mind these aspects that were brought up, that is monopoly, characterization, lack of real information, lack of a real tool for the end user, not for companies, and always take care, or be mindful, of that perspective, just to avoid working for a market study with a final or end position that will not have a direct impact upon the user. Thank you very much.

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza speaking. Thank you very much Harold. So, we might propose the following then. First of all, the working group needs to determine the items that need to be analyzed or completed, and we can also include Alejandro's proposals. We can make these comments, or provide this input in our Wiki space, so that we can share everybody's views and comments.

And taking into account that this Thursday we will be holding a second call then, this is a viable or a feasible course of action.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

There is a speaker that does not identify himself, and is requesting that everybody else mute their microphones because of background noise.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Silvia, if I may? I believe that what Carlos...

CARLOS GUTIERREZ: Carlos speaking. Carlos Gutierrez. I believe that we can go along with that proposal, I can get in touch with Alejandro, and we can get ready so as to kick off Thursday meetings, with these items already drafted. Maybe myself or somebody or somebody else can take care of that presentation, and I will be more than happy to join Thursday's meeting. And once again, my apologies for joining this meeting late.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Okay, that's great Carlos. We can post the comments in the Wiki work space for this working group, so that we can share anything. If there is any further additional content, or document, or statement, or joint statement, we can also post it there. We can work towards our end product.

Alberto Soto, I see that you are asking for the floor. Go ahead please.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto speaking. Yes, thank you. I have the following idea or suggestion. We need to analyze this study and make our comments, because as Humberto said, that is the overall goal, but I do believe that we need to break it down by themes or topics. We mentioned costs or fees, and that is a two-fold issue. Carlos said that it is more competitive for him to buy a domain abroad and not in his own country.

The end user faces the same issue. Secondly, we see that there is a domain that may benefit a region, but we see that there is a tax haven that has the financial resources to take over that domain. That, with regard to cost. Then we need to focus on DNS abuse. We need to focus on domain name sales.

Alejandro mentioned two or three cases that should be taken into account. So I believe that if we follow that breakdown, we can move along very expediently. Thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza speaking. Okay, so Silvia, please, if you can take this down. We are going to use the Wiki to post the relevant items, in which we are going to work. If someone shares any idea or material on our mailing list, I will take care of posting that to our Wiki space. And I will liaise with Carlos Gutierrez, who very kindly volunteered to draft this document.

And clearly, in order to be prepared for Thursday's call, we need to gather more ideas, comments, input, with a focus on our objectives, as proposed by Humberto.

Maritza Aguero speaking again. So as an action item, and a deadline between now and our next call, we need to focus on this action item. Is there any other comment before we bring the call to a close?

And once again, the floor is open for anyone willing to make any further comment, or suggestion. Aida, go ahead please, you have the floor.

AIDA NOBLIA: Aida speaking. Let's see if you can hear me now. Can you hear me?

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza. Yes, yes, we can hear you. Loud and clear.

AIDA NOBLIA: Aida speaking. I fully agree with the fact that, first of all, we need to define our goal or our objective, and I see that we have certain action items. We need to take into account the user's perspective. We need to focus on costs or fees, which is also very important. And... There are some findings in the report that may be useful in what we do in our analysis.

One of the findings focuses on the way users use social media, and I'm not aware of other elements online because of their lack of knowledge of the domain name system, which is partly related to cost. So that is my comment. Once again, I will repeat that I agree with the other proposals. Thank you.

MARITZA AGUERO: Maritza speaking. Thank you Aida. Okay. We are taking down the different action items, the different suggestions, all of them related to our whole overarching goal. And we have, or our time window closes on the 20th, on Thursday. So we need to have something ready by then.

With that, I would like to know if there are any further comments or questions. And Aida is typing something in the chat room. In terms of the end users. Yes, the idea is to analyze these items for this point,

taking into consideration the end user. Also, we need to see what needs to be taken into account documents, etc. between now and Thursday.

And at a later stage, perhaps we can add further aspects. It's important that we take into account all of these aspects and variables, to come to a consensus position. We need to include lack of knowledge of the DNS marketplace. That is only inferred. And that will be part of the items or points that we have been discussing.

And since we are a couple of minutes away from the top of the hour, these are the proposals then between now and Thursday. And once again, the floor is open for any further comments, questions, suggestions, etc.

CARLOS:

Carlos speaking. Do we know what time we're going to be holding the call on Thursday?

MARITZA AGUERO:

Maritza speaking. Yes, Carlos, at the same time, same time as today. And also, we have Carolina [inaudible] confirmed as a speaker, a guest speaker in our next call.

Maritza Aguero speaking again. Well, if there are no further comments or questions, we are going to bring this call to a close. And we will continue working in our weekly work space, or on our mailing list, consolidating everything before we meet again on Thursday at 23 UTC.

So, if there are no further questions or comments, then I will bring this call to a close. Thank you all very much for joining. Thank you to our interpreter, to staff. Have a good evening. Thank you very much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]