Version 7, 5 October 2016 + WG Comments

GENERAL COMMENTS ON VERSION 6 STATEMENT MADE ON WG MAILING LIST AND DURING WG MEETING (thru ~~5~~ 13 OCT)

DATE	NAME	ITEM	COMMENT (SUMMARY)
29/09	Hollenbeck	?	Find (and fix) two more instances of "gTLD domain names". – *Done.*
29/09	Perrin	?	See http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/gnso-rds-pdp-wg/2016-September/001718.html for overall commentary from Perrin. – *Refer to specific comments below.*
29/09	Anderson	?	Perhaps a more fulsome consolidated RDS purpose statement (which would replace the four specific purposes currently included) could be: "The Purpose of RDS is to provide access to information about Domain Names, Name Servers and Registrars in a TLD." – to be further discussed. • Consider replacing "provide access" by "manage access" (Stephanie Perrin, 4/10)
3/10	Mounier		I am also supportive of the simplification to the goals and criteria proposed by Stephanie Perrin as I see value in keeping this statement of purpose as succinct as possible. – to be further discussed.
5/10	Greimann		I would move to strike all references to data quality altogether from this document, e.g. "current", "accurate" etc. These are already required by existing policies and agreements and do not have to be referenced again at this point. We should focus on having to reflect the data as provided by the RNH at this stage, not make any presumptions about its quality.

Draft Registration Data and Directory Service Statement of Purpose	• *Proposed Title: Draft Statement of Purpose for the Collection and Use of Registration Data, and a Potential Directory Service for the Disclosure of Registration Data (Stephanie Perrin- 29/9)*
	     ○ *Note also comments from Andrew concerning the term 'collection' (see further below). Strictly speaking the collection happens in a different system – the registration system. RDS controls access, according to policies set, to the data that is already collected outside. RDS is publication mechanism. (Andrew Sullivan – 4/10)*
	     ○ *What about 'for the use and disclosure of data collected in accordance with ICANN requirements' (Holly Raiche – call 4/10)*
	 Proposal to leave title for now as is (see also notes from WG meeting on 4/10)

This statement is intended to define the purpose(s) of a potential Registration Directory Service (RDS) for generic top-level domain (gTLD) names. The statement is grouped into two categories: 1) Overall Goals for this Statement of Purpose; 2) Specific Purposes. To ensure that the purposes are understood in the appropriate context, a list of goals for each RDS purpose is also provided.	• *Several implicit assumptions appear to have crept in, namely that an RDS is necessary, and that data will be released through it. Add "potential" before RDS; similar edit to Specific Purpose 3 intro. (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)* - Agreement to make this change. • Replace "prerequisite conditions of" for consistency with later text (Chuck Gomes – 4/10) – Agreement to make this change.
Note that it is important to make a distinction between the purpose(s) of individual registration data elements[1] versus the purpose(s) of a RDS, i.e., the system that may collect, maintain, and provide or deny access to some or all of those data elements [and services related to them, if any.]	• *Add "the collection, use and disclosure of" before "individual registration data elements." After "system" replace "collect" by "assemble." The data has been collected already by registrars to register a domain name. (Stephanie Perrin- 29/9)* - Leave as is (see also previous discussion on title) • *Regarding overlap within statement of purpose being "unavoidable": By creating this greatly enlarged statement of purpose for the RDS, have we not then leapt to the conclusion that we need a (new) RDS? (Stephanie Perrin 29/9)* - Agreement to delete last sentence.

---

[1] Here, "registration data elements" refers to data about generic top-level domain names collected in the relationship between registrars to registries and in the relationship between registrars/registries and ICANN.

	Agreement to delete this section, noting that these goals do underpin the statement of purpose but these do not need to be captured in the actual statement.
	• *Delete Goal a. "To set unambiguous boundaries for RDS policy requirements and RDS consensus policies." Too ambiguous. Not very helpful. (Greg Aaron- 30/9)*
	• *Delete Overall Goals b-e (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)* • *The purpose clause [is] to come up with a succinct purpose for the exercise in which we are engaged....to limit the exercise to the minimum until such time as we have agreed on policy, as it is generally understood that many policy issues have crept into the WHOIS and RDS without benefit of a full PDP deliberation. (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)*
	• *Delete Overall Goals b-e (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)*
	• *Delete Overall Goals b-e (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)* • Move this possible criteria/goal back to goals for each RDS purpose section, becomes item v? (Steve Metalitz, 4/10)
	• *Delete Overall Goals b-e (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)* Move this possible criteria/goal back to goals for each RDS purpose section, becomes item vi? (Steve Metalitz, 4/10)
	• *While a statement of purpose is necessary for the interpretation of ICANN's policies with respect to the collection, use, retention and disclosure of personal information in the context of its registration activities, this is not it…because it requires policy decisions, and we are not there yet. A goal can be compliance with national and regional law, and with internationally recognized human rights obligations, but not crafting the actual purpose statement. (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)* • Move this possible criteria/goal back to goals for each RDS purpose section, replacing text for item iii) (Steve Metalitz, 4/10)

Goals for each RDS Purpose	• *Proposed Title: Goals for each use or disclosure of RDS Data (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)*
i. Consistency with ICANN's mission	
ii. Consistency with other consensus policies that pertain to generic top-level domains (gTLDs)	
iii. To provide a framework that enables compliance with applicable laws	• *Replaced with overall goal as suggested by Steve Metalitz (4/10)*
iv. To help ~~Helps to clearly~~ articulate a rationale for a potential RDS	• *Delete Goal for each Purpose iv (help to articulate rationale). We are not drafting this purpose statement to justify creation of a new RDS. (Stephane Perrin – 29/9)* – Support for keeping goal as is • *Item iv is poor parallel construction. It could be fixed with "To help articilate [clearly, if you want] (Andrew Sullivan – 4/10)*
v. To communicate purpose(s) of the RDS to registrants (and others)	• *Moved from overall goals for statement to goals for each RDS Purpose as suggested by Steve Metalitz (4/10).*
vi. To establish sufficient relationship between the purpose(s) and the use(s) of the RDS	• *Moved from overall goals for statement to goals for each RDS Purpose as suggested by Steve Metalitz (4/10).*

Specific Purposes for Registration Data and Registration Directory Services	
1. A purpose of gTLD registration data is to provide information about the lifecycle of a domain name (as specified by ICANN's Diagram of gTLD Lifecycle, understanding that there may be some variations in lifecycle for eachacross gTLD)	• *In purpose of data, "provide" seems to be the wrong word, although I'm unsure if store/manage/maintain/record/define are any better (Rob Golding – 29/9)* – To be further discussed. • *In purpose of data, replace "enable" by "assist with" (Rob Golding – 29/9)* – Irrelevant since phrase was deleted (see next bullet). • *Delete "to enable management of a domain name registration"- does not belong in a purpose statement; deals with a potential use case. (Marc Anderson – 29/9)* – Agreement, sentence deleted. • *Change from a statement of purpose to a framing statement by restating it as 'gTLD registration data contains information about the lifecycle of a domain name (as specified by ICANN's Diagram of gTLD Lifecycle)? (Andrew Sullivan – 4/10)* - To be further discussed - No strong feelings about this proposed change. No change made. • *This is more a statement of what Registration Data is, so probably shouldn't be a "numbered purpose", and perhaps should only be included, if we also include definitions of Registry, Registrar, Nameserver etc? Or simplified to: THE purpose of "gTLD Registration Data" is to record information necessary for the lifecycle of a domain name (as specified by ICANN's Diagram of gTLD Lifecycle). (Rob Golding – 5/10)* No change made ○ *I like where you're going with this, but data doesn't record information. If this is intended to be a definition, and not a statement of purpose, this might work better: "gTLD Registration Data" is information associated with the lifecycle of a domain name (as specified by ICANN's Diagram of gTLD Lifecycle). (Scott Hollenbeck – 5/10)*

2. A registration directory service (RDS) purpose is to provide information about domain contacts, domain names and name servers for gTLDs, based on agreed policy. ~~A purpose of a system to collect, maintain, and provide access to gTLD registration data (hereafter referred to as "the RDS") is to provide information that is needed by authorized parties to operate a generic top-level domain name in the DNS.~~	• *Chuck proposal for item 2: "A registration ~~data~~ directory service (RDS) purpose is to manage access and/or provide information about ~~registries,~~ registrars, registrants, domain names and name servers for gTLDs."* • *We've already defined it as systems to "collect, maintain and provide" so the extra "provide" here should probably be "handle" or "manage" (Rob Golding – 29/9)* • *re: Golding, proposed alternative: "facilitiate the management of" (Stephanie Perrin – 29/9)* • *Replace "needed by authorized parties to operate a generic top-level domain name" by "regarding a generic top-level domain name" (Rob Golding – 29/9)* • *RDS does not collect or maintain gTLD registration data – it provides access to that data, the Registration system itself that registries make accessible to registrars via EPP is the system that collects and maintains gTLD registrations data. How about: "A purpose of RDS is to provide information that is needed by authorized parities to operate a generic top-level domain name in the DNS". (Marc Anderson – 29/9)* • *Why we keep including "collect" in the description of the RDS ("RDS, i.e., the system that may collect, maintain, and provide or deny access to some or all of those data elements [and services related to them, if any]"). The RDS _does not_ collect the data. That is the responsibility of the SRSes underlying registrations. I recall spending some time making diagrams illustrating this some months ago (it was before I moved back to Toronto, so it was before the end of June, but I don't recall when exactly). The RDS provides _access_ to that registration data. The RDS policies might have implications for registration policies (i.e. what data must be collected), but I cannot see how expanding our scope to talk about what registration _may_ collect is helpful. And we keep tripping over this because people point to consensus policies sometimes that are in fact about registration and not publication of the data. I therefore think that item 2 under "specific*

	purpose" is actually false: that's the purpose of the SRS, and _not_ the RDS. The RDS is for lookup, and we should concentrate on that. (Andrew Sullivan, 4/10) o *It may not collect the data directly from the registrant, but it does collect the data from registries, who collect it from registrars. Ultimately, the collection must have a legitimate purpose. "Because we want the data to be public" is not a legitimate purpose. (Volker Greimann, 4/10)* o *I see Andrew has picked up on defining the "collect" concept – Volker may be correct in function but RDS doesn't "collect" in the normal use of the word, it may "collate" though. Perhaps this should be simplified to: THE purpose of the "Registration Data Service" (hereafter referred to as "RDS") is to manage authorised parties' access to information about [gTLD Domain Names, gTLD Nameservers, gTLD Registries and gTLD Registrars] (Rob Golding, 5/10)* ▪ *Agreed, with one minor suggestion:"access to information about generic top-level domain registries, registrars, names, and name servers. (Scott Hollenbeck – 5/10)*

	• *Renumber 3a and 3b as purposes 3 and 4 respectively. (Marc Anderson – 29/9) - Done*
	• *I believe that the specific purposes currently listed under 3a) and 3b) should not be regarded as secondary to 1) and 2). They should therefore be listed as 3) and 4) as suggested by Marc Anderson and Greg Aaron. – Done (same as above)*
	• *There is certainly a TLD Operations perspective to the purpose of an RDS, but we must also recognize that operations of TLDs have socio-economic impacts that lead to other purposes of an RDS, as is the case for:*
	    o *facilitating contact with registrants,*
	    o *registrars and proxy/privacy service providers enabling release of accurate gTLD registration data. (Gregory Mounier – 3/10)*

3. A RDS purpose ~~of RDS~~ is to identify domain contacts and facilitate communication ~~To enable contact~~ with domain contacts ~~registrants, registrars, (registries?), and proxy/privacy service providers~~ associated with generic top-level domain names, ~~for specific policy-defined purposes~~based on agreed policy	• *Comment offered during last WG call; Fabrico to propose new text. (concern may be addressed by Marc's proposal below?) (Fabricio Vayra – 28/9)* • *Delete "for specific policy-defined purposes" – doesn't belong in a RDS purpose statement, it's more appropriate to deliberation phase. Revise to read: "A purpose of RDS is to facilitate contact with registrants, registrars and proxy/privacy service providers associated with generic top-level domain names." (Marc Anderson – 29/9)* • *Re: Anderson, proposed alternative: "A purpose of RDS is to identify and facilitate contact with domain contacts, registrars, and proxy/privacy service providers associated with generic top-level domain names." Because "Registrants" does not cover other contact types. (Greg Aaron – 30/9)* • *Purpose 3(a/b) are possible use cases, not Purposes as such "Accurate" is definitely not a term to use if we ever expect to finish "Current" would be more accurate (sic) / appropriate. (Rob Golding – 5/10)*

4. To enable release of [accurate] gTLD registration data that may not otherwise be publicly available, under specific and explicit policy defined conditions	• Having accurate data may be a goal, but the purpose is to display the data of record – a potential use case is to facilitate data correction. Revise to read: "A purpose of RDS is to enable the release of gTLD registration data that may not otherwise be publicly available." (Marc Anderson – 29/9)
	• This is the doc's only mention of data accuracy, an important topic. The doc says that accuracy is a concern only in cases of gated or preferential access, but ICANN policy has always been to encourage data accuracy across the board. Add as separate Specific Purpose 5: "A purpose of a system to collect, maintain, and provide access to gTLD registration data (hereafter referred to as "the RDS") is to collect and provide information that is accurate." (Greg Aaron – 30/9)
	• Although I support the simplification to the language of specific purposes 3a) and 3b) (which should be renumbered 3 and 4), as proposed by Marc, I share Greg's views that the notion of "accurate" gTLD registration data should not just be deemed a feature, but rather an integral part of the purpose considering the importance of maintaining a repository of accurate data form a public policy perspective. As you know, the GAC has consistently advised that gTLD WHOIS services "should provide sufficient and accurate data about domain name registrations and registrants subject to national safeguards for individuals' privacy" (per its 2007 GAC WHOIS Principles[gacweb.icann.org], which it referred to in its 2015 comments on the RDS PDP Preliminary Issue Report[forum.icann.org]). I therefore support Greg Aaron's suggestion to add a fifth purpose: "A purpose of a system to collect, maintain, and provide access to gTLD registration data (hereafter referred to as "the RDS") is to collect and provide information that is accurate." (Gregory Mounier – 3/10)
	• A purpose of an RDS may be to release registration data that IS publicly available in other ways. Current examples include domain and nameserver data found in zone files and the DNS, registrar contact info, etc. (Greg Aaron – 30/9)

	• *"under specific and explicit policy-defined conditions" is not just about release – it implies that all allowable usages can be defined, managed, and enforced. A complicated and controversial area; too open-ended. Revise to read: "To enable release of gTLD registration data that may or may not otherwise be publicly available, where the released types of data are determined by policy-defined conditions." (Greg Aaron – 30/9)* • *Consider changing to 'To enable release of gTLD registration data that may not otherwise be publicly available under specific conditions defined by policy, and to develop mechanisms to encourage greater accuracy of data'. (Stephanie Perrin – 6/10)* Resolution: Support for combining purpose #2 and #4 (leaving only #2, deleting #4) and consider a new #5 (below) to address comments in relation to accuracy.

4. The purpose of collecting, maintaining and providing access to gTLD registration data is to provide a record of domain name registrations	• *Looking at the Board resolution, I think the following purpose seems to fit the bill and I'd like to suggest we include this on our list. "The purpose of collecting, maintaining and providing access to gTLD registration data is to provide a record of domain name ownership". Note I suspect the word "ownership" isn't quite appropriate here - so some word-smithing may be required. (Alex Deacon – 4/10)*
	    ○ *Consider changing ownership to 'registrations' (Chuck Gomes – 4/10)*
	    ○ *Consider changing ownership to 'assignment' (Stephanie Perrin – 4/10)*

5. A purpose of RDS is to provide an authoritative source of accurate data	• *Reflects 11/10 WG call discussion; left as starting point for further discussion of RDS purpose(s) related to accurate registration data*