

From: amy.bivins@external.icann.org
To: amy.bivins@external.icann.org
Subject: Adobe Connect - Chat Transcript from ICANN Meeting 57 - Hall 6
Date: Tuesday, November 08, 2016 10:27:49 AM

Ivan Rasskazov: (11/8/2016 08:47) Hi Andy

Andy Simpson: (08:47) Good evening Ivan, how are things in Chicago? Calmed down after last week?

Presentation Laptop: (08:48) Hi Ivan and Andy, we will be getting dial-outs to you shortly

Ivan Rasskazov: (08:49) Yep, they said 5 million people came out on Friday. I tried my best to avoid downtown

Ivan Rasskazov: (08:49) But now we have the election tomorrow, so maybe not just yet

Andy Simpson: (08:50) Ahh yes good point. steering clear of downtown for a few more weeks is likely a good idea

Ivan Rasskazov: (08:53) I wish I would have made it out to this one. I have never been to India.

Andy Simpson: (08:54) yeah, agreed it would have been a nice one to make it to

Amy Bivins: (08:55) Hello, my name is Amy Bivins and I will be monitoring this chat room. In this role, I am the voice for the remote participants, ensuring that they are heard equally with those who are "in-room" participants. Please note that I will only be able to read your comment/question within the time set by the Chair of this session; I will not be able to read your comment or question on the mic if they are sent after the session/subject is closed by the Chair

Amy Bivins: (08:55) The chat rooms are the virtual meetings for everyone, in-room and remote. When submitting a question that you want me to read out loud on the mic, please start with a <QUESTION> and end with a "</QUESTION>". Text outside these quotes will be considered as part of "chat" and will not be read out loud on the mic

Amy Bivins: (08:56) Please note that chat sessions are being archived and follow the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior:

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__www.icann.org_en_news_in-2Dfocus_accountability_expected-2Dstandards&d=DQIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=uerz4ckt1v4Qhbv-TplkjKTey9bgtDWrvLyZDu0mXuk&m=W37APwA-bfnqnaq8mSO3rILX_0WDZaB69l8FV6aYyM&s=Vb8ghmbrozaqgwwG4j0-I5ubWf0Inu2sHrtDX5gy-5g&e=

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:03) Morning/evening/whatever all

Rubens Kuhl: (09:08) Morning John

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:08) Morning Rubens

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:08) 0338 here - not sure if I'm awake yet :)

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:09) Hi John - thank you for joining us at your early time

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:09) Got some web usage data on .rio, Rubens - will e-mail it

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:10) Morning Ivan - that acceptance curve thing was a good point

Rubens Kuhl: (09:10) That would be nice, thanks!

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:11) Thank you, I did not mean to ignore all of your points. There were some great ones, just wanted to

focus on one or two.

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:11) I certainly appreciate the detailed response. It gives everyone a lot to work with.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:12) it can take anywhere from ten years to twenty years for a TLD to be accepted

Hamish MacEwan: (09:12) Difference without distinction

Hamish MacEwan: (09:15) I would interested to compare trust between ccTLDs and gTLDs

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:16) People trust ccTLDs more than gTLDs because their ccTLD is local and their

ccTLD

Rubens Kuhl: (09:17) I think one of the new gTLD studies confirmed that ccTLDs usually enjoy more trust than gTLDs (legacy

or new)

Hamish MacEwan: (09:17) It would be nice to have a number to go with that view is all I'm saying.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:17) which numbers?

Olivier MJ Crépin-Leblond: (09:17) .UK too @Jim

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:18) have a hoster/domains stats breakdown on .uk

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:18) The UK market is heavily dominated by in-country players

Jim Prendergast: (09:18) Yes Nomiet has severaal "backend clients" including the M+M generics as well as some .brands

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:20) <comment>Most gTLDs are global whereas most ccTLDs are country focused - different markets.</comment>

Rubens Kuhl: (09:20) NIC.br also have some Brazilian TLDs as back-end clients. ZACR/Uniformom the same for South Africa.

Hamish MacEwan: (09:24) Awesome!

Rubens Kuhl: (09:27) .BR also provides details about adds and deletes. Portuguese knowledge required though... :-)

zhang kai: (09:28) where can i get the slide above?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:29) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__sched.ws_hosted-5Ffiles_icann572016_af_MktplaceHealthIndex-5FAdvisory-2520Panel-2520Meeting-252008-2520NOV-25202016-2520FINAL.pdf&d=DQIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=uerz4ckt1v4Qhbv-TplkjKTey9bgtDWrvLyZDu0mXuk&m=W37APwA-bfnqnaq8mSO3rILX_0WDZaB69l8FV6aYyM&s=XEtSG-2vM914al3p7Awl_iBEncLiGKfISOdK0zOvmIE&e=

Rubens Kuhl: (09:29) 93.749 were removed.

Amy Bivins: (09:29) Hi Zhang, the slides will be posted on the meeting session page

zhang kai: (09:29) not the one on the icann website...

Amy Bivins: (09:29) I don't think Andy's are up there yet

zhang kai: (09:29) not the same

Amy Bivins: (09:29) Zhang, I will post immediately after this session

zhang kai: (09:30) thanks ,you are so nice :D

Amy Bivins: (09:30) You are very welcome!

Rubens Kuhl: (09:30) .US is a gTLD for "We". :-)

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:30) Alexa data is problematic with this kind of measurement

Jim Prendergast: (09:31) Greeks love their ccTLD

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:34) yep but there are at least 77K Greek AMBIONIC gTLDs (com/net/org/biz/info/mobi/asia)

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:34) different from the ICANN registrar figure for GR

Hamish MacEwan: (09:37) Who wants to be the Swiss bank of TLDs? .tv?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:38) Except that it seems to be almost completely a US market for .tv

Hamish MacEwan: (09:38) health, probability of continued satisfaction of goals of ICANN

Hamish MacEwan: (09:39) But how does .tv differ from .book then?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:39) .book isn't active. (I think) and .book has a market outside the US

Hamish MacEwan: (09:40) It's a matter of promotion not availability

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:40) The difference is we have standardized whois requirements and easier access to gTLD data

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:40) But I agree, the more we can collect the better

Hamish MacEwan: (09:40) Agreed

Rubens Kuhl: (09:40) .br supports RDAP, which is more standardized than port-43 WHOIS...

Hamish MacEwan: (09:41) An api could fix that perhaps?

Rubens Kuhl: (09:41) Example: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__rdap.registro.br_domain_nic.br&d=DQIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=uerz4ckt1v4Qhbv-TplkjKTey9bgtdWrvLyZDu0mXuk&m=W37APwA-bfnqnaq8mSO3rILX_0WDZaB6918FV6aYyM&s=Gmc1lq3uZCy7wxkm0GmTzz84zqnKgeeaJUTHJXMbfjY&e=

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:41) My point is to move conservatively with a measure that has never been seen by the marketplace before

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:41) I'd be more inclined to add than to subtract in the future

Hamish MacEwan: (09:41) There are local reasons for local things. Translation can't be too hard?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:41) it would be great if summary country data for the registration base was a requirement for registrars/gTLDs

Olivier MJ Crépin-Leblond: (09:42) I am 100% aligned with Jordan. Consumers will not know what the difference is between ccTLDs and gTLDs.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:42) just summary data rather than by registrant data

Olivier MJ Crépin-Leblond: (09:42) Jordan -> Jordyn

Rubens Kuhl: (09:42) Registrars are better positioned to supply such data since they have it before applying privacy/proxy credentials.

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:43) if they cooperate

Hamish MacEwan: (09:43) Registrars want to have Registry health reports... they'll help

Rubens Kuhl: (09:43) Otherwise we would see like the LAC DNS Marketplace Study where Panama and Cayman Islands had millions of registrations...

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:44) .brand gTLDs are generally closed and don't impact the market as much as ccTLDs

Hamish MacEwan: (09:45) ng.visa not a goer then?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:45) Some gTLD registrars don't want to give out data. A few even have serious rate limiting on their WHOIS or even broken whois

Hamish MacEwan: (09:45) Then lets have a report on non-cooperative registries... this is bad how?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:46) registrars not registries

Hamish MacEwan: (09:46) Health seems to include operational compliance with standards.

Hamish MacEwan: (09:46) The goal is to serve the registrant for all registries.

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:46) ccTLD inclusion is easier to include for non-end user data points

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:47) more is more, i just want to make sure an ICANN venture moves carefully and doesn't undermine either usability or any TLDs

Hamish MacEwan: (09:47) Well I think you'll have a number of ccTLDs pleading to be let in.

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:47) (sorry everyone I am better typer than speaker at 10 pm)

Phil Buckingham: (09:48) more is more , but comparing apples and pears

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:48) ccTLD registries are a law unto themselves. They may cooperate or may not.

Hamish MacEwan: (09:48) ccTLDs are gazing too long into the gTLD abyss (aka race to the bottom)?

Ivan Rasskazov: (09:49) you need whois data to see if they are infact being used to compete - this is where registrant concentration for speculators comes in

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:50) ccTLDs dominate their markets. When a country market goes ccTLD positive, the ccTLD reg patterns cascade and the gTLD rates tend towards replacement and then loss

Hamish MacEwan: (09:50) ccTLDs are useful as parochial localisation but I think that's still worth including in the HI

Hamish MacEwan: (09:51) Their diversity in the face of TLD choice is valuable.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:51) Can do it with a country level breakdown for new gTLDs or even legacy

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:51) actually I do this kind of work continually

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:52) Despite the Nielsen report, most end users are unaware of new gTLDs and registrars are not pushing them as they concentrate on the moneymakers

Phil Buckingham: (09:53) Exactly JZ re same market

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:56) <comment>The best ccTLD for a gTLD:ccTLD comparison is .eu</comment>

Phil Buckingham: (09:56) Substitutes = opportunity costs of transferring from one to the other

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:57) <comment>It is essentially a gTLD in all but name with a set of country level markets and a single "global" market.</comment>

Rubens Kuhl: (09:58) .eu is a close relative to .asia, and when delegated, .africa

Hamish MacEwan: (09:58) The Index is for the registrant, others may use it but it is registrant-centric and that would require all TLD in the report, but breakouts are trivial and obvious. Everyone happy...

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (09:58) Agreed.

Andy Simpson: (09:59) <QUESTION>Before discussing the metrics, evaluating the definition is important. In the example of robust competition, who is supposed to have diversity of choice to experience competition? Registries, registrars, or end users? </QUESTION>

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:01) Andy, there might be another element that has not been addressed- demand. Is there any demand for the gTLD among potential registrants.

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:01) End user development is one consistent measure across any TLD. What percentage of the extension is developed into a site by registrants?

Phil Buckingham: (10:01) so this about the vertical structure between registries , registrars , resellers right ?

Andy Simpson: (10:01) John - agreed, demand is certainly a variable that could impact many of these metrics' ability to characterize marketplace health.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:02) Ivan, that's a very scary figure for some registries.

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:02) Can be

Andy Simpson: (10:02) Phil - great question, i would like to hear the staff weigh in on their perspective regarding that.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:02) usage dictates renewal patterns

Phil Buckingham: (10:03) Andy !

Rubens Kuhl: (10:03) That's called positioning.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:03) a developed website means the domain is more likely to be renewed

Phil Buckingham: (10:05) + ! Rubens - the four P s of marketing

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:05) <comment>The web dev business has become commoditised. It is often the web developer who registers the domain for the client rather than an individual registrant.</comment>

Rubens Kuhl: (10:06) Besides language/scripts, payment methods are decisive as well, and payment methods are much more varied by country than the standard Western style of credit card payments.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:06) I wish that there was more real world expertise on this matter.

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:06) Yes, except if a TLD prohibits resale or transfer based on their registry rules or geographical model

Hamish MacEwan: (10:06) To promote the competitive provision of Internet DNS services and facilities in an open and uncaptureable environment.(shamelessly lifted from 2.1 To promote the competitive provision of Internet access, services and facilities in an open and uncaptureable environment.)

Hamish MacEwan: (10:07) Trust is a critical user metric

Phil Buckingham: (10:07) + I Steve - about the end user / registrant (s)

Amy Bivins: (10:07) Hi, All, this conversation is moving quickly--if we can't read every comment at the mic, they will still be added to the comment tracker and will be provided to the Panel so that every comment can be fully considered as we discuss these topics

Hamish MacEwan: (10:08) Thanks for the heads up Amy

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:08) Good. Because some of the comments here might be more illuminating.

Phil Buckingham: (10:09) thanks Amy

Phil Buckingham: (10:11) + Steve - alot / a number of registrars are offshore for tax purpose !

Phil Buckingham: (10:12) Good point Rubens

Hamish MacEwan: (10:13) Many ingratiate themselves with gifts of registrants fees to worthy causes

Amy Bivins: (10:14) Hi all, if you have any comments questions on this topic please share them now

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:14) ICANN registrars are mature market events. This registrars/hoster split is something that a lot of people don't understand.

Hamish MacEwan: (10:14) User-centric model would survey the audience to evaluate the performance

Hamish MacEwan: (10:15) Or at least from the audience perspective.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:15) <comment>ICANN accredited registrars are generally mature market entrants. There are often hundreds or thousands of hosters in a market before this happens.</comment>

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:16) <comment>Most hosters outsource their gTLD ops to registrars either in -country or outside of the country.</comment>

Phil Buckingham: (10:17) the zone file/ whois show s the registrant 's address unless it has a privacy option ?

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:17) <comment>Web development is now commoditised so web developers tend to

register doms for their clients.</comment>

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:17) <comment> "The other question is how frequently will this index/data repository will be updated? That may help decide what is practical to include as well." </comment>

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:18) Any chance these comments will be read out ?

Amy Bivins: (10:18) yes john, I'm in the queue next

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:19) Thanks Amy

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:19) Thank you

Amy Bivins: (10:20) No problem, John, and we will go through the transcript to add everything in the question/comment brackets to the tracker. If anyone in the chat would like to be added to the Advisory Panel, the tracker will be distributed to them as soon as I can get it updated. I'll also post it on the wiki

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:23) There are approx 2600 ICANN registrars. There are hundreds of thousands of hosters.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:23) Many of the hosters are ccTLD registrars in their own markets.

Phil Buckingham: (10:23) Agree Mason - what is "fair "

Mason Cole: (10:24) Right Phil.

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:24) Personally, I think once we narrow things down, this will be a great resource

Ivan Rasskazov: (10:24) Thank you everyone

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:24) Interesting session.

Andy Simpson: (10:24) Thanks everyone. Have a great day.

Rubens Kuhl: (10:24) Most of the 2600 ICANN registrars are drop-catch registrars...

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:24) Yep.

Rubens Kuhl: (10:25) Bye all!

Phil Buckingham: (10:25) thanks

zhang kai: (10:25) hi, Amy

zhang kai: (10:25) the slide

Amy Bivins: (10:26) Hi Zhang, I will post in just a minute to this page

Amy Bivins: (10:26) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__icann572016.sched.org_event_8dQP_gtld-2Dmarketplace-2Dhealth-2Dindex-2Dadvisory-2Dpanel-2Dworking-2Dsession&d=DQIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=uerz4ckt1v4Qhbv-TplkjKTey9bgtdWrvLyZDu0mXuk&m=W37APwA-bfnqpnq8mSO3rILX_0WDZaB69l8FV6aYyM&s=n9hb5cariS0a3EiBVhHWRtdKSCx4XY6MV6BPMwXEn48&e=

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (10:27) The ccTLD issue is going to take a lot of work