YESIM NAZLAR:	Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening for everyone. Welcome to the APRALO monthly call, taking place on Thursday, 22nd of September, 2016, at 06:00 UTC.

On the call today on the English channel, we have Satish Babu, William Tibben, Holly Raiche, Maureen Hilyard, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Ali AlMeshal, Winthrop Yu, and Lianna Galstyan.

On the Chinese channel, we have Kaili Kan.

We have received apologies from Nadira Alaraj, Gunela Astbrink, Suhaidi Hassan, Hong Xue.

From Staff, we have Kelvin Wong, Adam Peake, Silvia Vivanco and myself, Yeşim Nazlar.

Our Chinese interpreters today are [Jessie and Winnie]. Finally, I would like to remind everyone to state their name before speaking, not only for transcript purposes, but also for interpretation purposes as well. Over to you, Satish, thank you very much.

SATISH BABU:	Thank you very much, Yesim. Good morning, good afternoon and good evening to everyone on this call. This is likely to be our last call before ICANN 57, because we are likely to merge the protocol with the November call as a face-to-face meeting with remote participation at Hyderabad.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

We will get started with the agenda. We are very pleased to welcome Dr. William Tibben, who's a researcher from Australia. Will had [inaudible] to us if APRALO could collaborate with a research program on Internet governance, which, after discussion within the leadership team, we were very happy to go ahead with, and Will will be making a five-minute presentation, a brief presentation of his work, and how we can support and collaborate with his work. So, over to Will right now.

WILLIAM TIBBEN: Hi, can you hear me? I just had to unmute my microphone.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yes, we can perfectly hear you.

WILLIAM TIBBEN: Good, okay, thank you very much. Thank you for the opportunity to speak about a proposal to conduct a reasonably small research project for me. I've been part of APRALO for a number of years. I was originally a representative of the Thick ISOC group, and from around 2012-2011, I was on the Board of Thick ISOC for a few years, from 2009 to 2012. Since then, I'm still a member of Thick ISOC, and I'm also a member of Internet Australia. My research interest is driven by – if we could go to the next slide, or can I actually control that myself? Yes, I can. Thank you.

My interest is on collaborative technologies, online collaboration, and you'll understand why I've got an interest in this, because I've had a long interest in it in terms of my involvement with the South Pacific region.

In my former career in broadcasting, I was a technical advisor for Samoa broadcasting service from 1990 to 1994. I was challenged in many ways. I was meant to be the expert. I actually found that if I learned anything through my experience at Samoa mainly about how assumptions about how technologies work, and how they influence local context, such as culture and socioeconomic conditions, and [inaudible].

University studies in the late 1990s created new opportunities for me to learn about information technology and the Internet, and that partly explains why I got on with Thick ISOC. Essentially, at that time, when I was still working with broadcasters, I was motivated to create ways to help technicians and engineers in isolated places in the Pacific to participate in a social network of other technicians and engineers as a strategy to help them solve problems, because they're often very isolated and faced with complex problems.

In those days, I had this innovative idea of using fax. As you can see, it's quite historic in that respect. So that partly explains why I have an interest in multi-stakeholder governance. I'm very much interested in the opportunities that online technologies present to helping or assisting people in isolated parts of the world to participate for the benefit of themselves and also for the benefit of the wider world, of course, to ensure that that knowledge that exists in those places can be used to benefit.

I think that kind of explains what we're trying to achieve in multi-stakeholder governance, is that we want to try and empower people who would be normally considered to be marginalized and less involved perhaps to participate in policy development. Some have claimed that

the assumption that online networks will actually do this suggests that it's [inaudible]. I kind of believe that there's more t o it in terms of my own experience from the membership of Thick ISOC, which was largely an online-based community, and also, my academic work has also led me to question how practical the concept of consensus is. As you know, consensus is like an underlying rationale for decision-making within the online [roots,] or particularly the communities and online structures of ICANN.

So the research question essentially that I'm looking at is if consensus is not a viable justification for multi-stakeholder governance, is there an alternative justification that can still achieve the goals and empowerment of marginalized and less involved groups. So I'm wondering, would you like me to continue on? Has anyone got any questions, or should we leave questions until the end?

SATISH BABU: You can take the questions at the end [inaudible].

WILLIAM TIBBEN: Okay, that might be the easiest thing, given the fact that even though I've got a very good line [inaudible] not that clear. I hope that's coming through clearly.

Okay, so in terms of the academic side of things, I based my work on [Arrow] administrative organization, and this is really just a reference point, I'm not going to dwell too much on that, but [Arrow] similarly had reservations about the idea of consensus as a decision-making model,

and the paper that I sent to Satish and other people within the leadership group at APRALO, I've got that paper and I'm happy to share with everybody. In fact, it's available, it's been published, so in terms of the more theoretical, academic side of things, that's available for you to look at.

In terms of the authority, I think in terms of why I'm looking at authority, I think it comes out of the work that [Arrow] produced. It really comes from our understanding of bricks and mortars organizations in the real world. We tend to employ people with expertise, and with that expertise comes authority, so such people are given authority to make assessments of the kind of information that's available on behalf of others. That's how traditional organizations tend to work, and there's a [inaudible] link between authority and expertise.

I think that these kinds of concepts are useful for trying to understand how multi-stakeholder governance may proceed. So some of the questions that kind of spring from that connection between authority and expertise, can it always be assumed that all members have equal expertise to make the best decisions? Do you feel satisfied that your participation in online groups is worthwhile in terms of the outcomes achieved by the community? Do you feel satisfied that your participation – actually, I think I missed one. Sorry, I jumped forward a bit in the actual questions. I don't want to [inaudible] people.

These are the kind of broader questions that kind of spring from this idea of authority and expertise. The first one is, can it always be assumed that all members have equal expertise to make decisions, and does expertise naturally confer greater authority on some? What if

expertise confers authority? That's sometimes [inaudible] formal authority for forum moderators or the body that hosts the forum. So those are the kind of questions that I've developed, which in some ways, spring not necessarily so much from my participation in APRALO, but certainly in my previous association with Thick ISOC.

The specific questions that I was thinking of maybe posing to people like the members of APRALO, is in terms of earlier opportunities to develop expertise, influence decision-making, do you feel satisfied that your participation in online groups is worthwhile in terms of outcomes achieved by the community? I actually got the first question, which is, how would you assess your expertise to contribute to decisions in this committee? And just another proposed question, do you feel satisfied that your participation in the online group is worthwhile, or the organization you represent? I realize that many people are representing civil society organizations throughout the Asia Pacific.

That basically covers some, in fairly short time. I've probably already exceeded my five minutes, but in terms of the next steps, developing the research instruments I shared initially with the APRALO leadership group for feedback, I'll need to get an ethics clearance from my university for this to occur, and once this has been achieved, that's when I'll have possibilities to fill out a survey on SurveyMonkey, it's a possible opportunity for me to use. But a lot of these are just proposals at the moment, they're not set in stone.

I'd also like to introduce my co-researcher, [inaudible] who actually just walked into my office. [inaudible] has recently completed a PhD which investigated customer service and complaint-handling tactics of the

Internet industry in Australia, and he's also currently lecturing at the Federation University, which has a campus in Sydney. I think that brings me to the –

SATISH BABU: Sorry to interrupt, Will, I think we're running out of time. Can you please wrap up in another minute?

WILLIAM TIBBEN: I'm all finished, actually.

SATISH BABU: Okay. Are there any quick questions for Will? My own comment is that –

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Cheryl here.

SATISH BABU: Please go ahead, Cheryl.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you very much. Hi, Will, good to work with you again. I just have an overarching question on timing. I better declare, I'm being a little protective of our community and surveying whilst we are doing the surveying of our community for the At-Large and ALAC review, so I wondered, assuming all goes well through the next steps, what's the likely timing for this program to be beginning?

WILLIAM TIBBEN: It would probably be around, I'd say realistically, probably December would be the earliest, but January, February I think would be the timing.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Okay.

WILLIAM TIBBEN: Just given that there are certain delays in relation to the university, it's not a straightforward process to get ethics clearance, so generally takes at least four weeks or five weeks, so we still have to jump through those hoops, and I still need to work with [inaudible] just to finalize our proposed research questions and the like. That's the short answer, anyway.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thanks for that, I'm comfortable with that, because it would be envisaged – I assume Holly would agree with me here – that our active ALSes and At-Large community will have already contributed to the ALAC review process by then, so we won't be overworking them. I don't want to do either activity less justice than is deserved, so thanks for that, I appreciate it.

WILLIAM TIBBEN: No, I appreciate it, and I understand.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Cheryl, thank you, Will. Are there any other questions? I can't see any hands up, so Will, thanks very much for your presentation, and the topic is very much interesting, and aligned with our own [inaudible] talks, so we look forward to working with you, and also to your results. We are really keen to see your results as well. So thank you very much again.

WILLIAM TIBBEN: Yes.

SATISH BABU: We'll now move on to the rest of the agenda. The next is the policy updates. This is by Maureen. Maureen, please go ahead, you have ten minutes.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Satish. I don't think I'm going to need that whole ten minutes, because this month's policy list is actually quite short. One of the things that I wanted to bring to your attention, however, is amongst the statements that have recently been approved by the ALAC, and I think it's a great value to us as At-Large and as end users. And it's the very first document that's in the statements approved by the ALAC. The At-Large community policy issues, and why end users should care. I think that everyone who will access the wiki page and access this link.

This is a new [inaudible] that's recently been approved by the ALAC, and it describes the different policy areas that the ALAC follows and discusses. Each of the policy areas is followed by a section which

explains exactly why that policy area is important to us as At-Large and as end users. So please, internalize those documents, and read through the – the different policy areas are very interesting anyway, but of importance is like why is it important to us as end users?

The other policies which had been approved, I've explained them to you in previous meetings. The only statement that is actually still outstanding is the statement that seem to be stalled, and as we have one of the penholders in our meeting at the moment, it might be interesting, Holly, if you could just give us a little idea about what the new gTLD subsequent procedures [inaudible].

HOLLY RAICHE: First of all, I would like to second your statement about the At-Large policy issues and why end users should care. It's something that the ICANN staff did, and it's really excellent, because it lists all of the main policies right now. A really good summary of what they are, and why we should care. It's just a really useful tool for all of us to have, so I'm really happy with that.

With subsequent procedures, I have actually done my piece and I have sent it to Alan about a month ago, and he said he's drafting a statement. I don't know what's happened to it, but essentially, the new gTLD subsequent procedures is when the new gTLD process took place from its very beginning – and Cheryl knows this very well – we've had comments on the applicants guidebooks, we had compliments on the cost, we had comments on ideas, we had comments, and as we went through, we had lots of things to say about the whole process.

Now, Cheryl's involved in the new subsequent procedures, so maybe she's in a much better place than I am, but the comments that I made to Alan basically recap and said there are still issues. Now, some of those are being looked at by the Customer Trust Group that Kaili and Olivier are a part of, and some of them are in new subsequent procedures, the actual working group. Cheryl, have you got anything to add to that so far? What are we up to? Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Holly, the Subsequent Procedures Working Group, apart from meeting in the plenary as a whole – and we did some good basic work, as Holly was out learning – we've broken up into four subteams. Those subteams have taken on particular aspects of the work, ranging from various types of reviews, the Applicant Guidebook and the appropriateness of some of the technical questions, and looking at whether or not the aspects of internationalized domain names and the promotion of that was effectively done in the current round, and all those sort of things. That fits into what's called sub-pro team work team four, internationalized domain names or IDNs and technical matters. I'm one of the co-Chairs of that group. The three other groups are dealing variably with outreach and issues, legal and contract issues, etc.

The work on all of those is really just beginning. Most of us are only in our second or third meeting, when they've been fortnightly, and we will be having – I think most importantly, and it will be an opportunity if anyone is wishing to join us – on the first Friday afternoon in the Hyderabad meeting, in the PM session, we are having a four-hour block session for the subsequent procedures of New gTLDs Working Group,

and each of us particular work teams will have a section of that to work with, as well as some general stuff. I think that's probably enough to bring most people up to speed.

Other than that, of course, we'd welcome more APRALO involvement and importance, perhaps some of you might find a particular interest in some of the subteams. I didn't mention internationalized domain names by accident as one of the work teams, because I would think there would be a number of people within APRALO that could lend some expertise into that activity, and we are only just getting started. Just while I'm talking about the work of the internationalized domain names and technical issues subteam – and yes, I am a shameless advertiser here for the work team I am running, with the background from two of my granddaughters, thank you, ladies, it's very important for you to be recorded for posterity's sake for the world to hear your singing – but we're also looking at name collisions, and universal acceptance as part of our mandate. So if any of those topics get you excited, it's not too late to reach out to staff and join us. Thank you.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Cheryl, Holly and Maureen. Kaili, do you have anything to add to the policy?

KAILI KAN: No, I don't.

SATISH BABU: Okay, so we now move on. Are there any questions on the presentations on policies? Questions, comments, anything? Okay, seeing no questions, we'll move on now to agenda item number four. This is the APRALO Mentorship Program. It is a very important program that we have launched, or we're in the process of launching, that [inaudible] gets going. I request Ali to speak to us about the mentorship program.

ALI ALMESHAL: Thank you, Satish. In this program, as all of you probably know, it's something new in terms of the size of the program, so the number of calls and meetings that we have together on the APRALO Leadership Team to put the framework and the structures how we can take this forward.

Just recently, we had a call – as we had specified in our program – with the [inaudible] led by Cheryl Langdon-Orr about how we can move forward. Allocations between mentees and mentors have been done. So much of the progress is in place, we are doing it, and very soon, we will be calling the mentees to attend our first call between the mentors and the mentees, and possibly in week number four.

Also, all of those who are attending Hyderabad who are part of the mentee program, the mentors have been allocated to them. They would be meeting with them and taking them through the program itself. So far, we haven't announced the final program to the mentees, but this is ongoing, and very soon, as I said, we can see we would be calling for the call that we are arranging for. So far, I would say to the mentees to just

be patient with us. We are developing it and are doing it the best we know and to the best of our knowledge. That's that so far, Satish. If there are any inquiries or any questions, I'm more than happy to answer.

SATISH BABU: Are there any questions on the mentorship program? Seeing none, we [inaudible] get started next week, so we're all quite excited about it, and Cheryl has actually given us a very interesting set of tasks for the mentors, actually, and some advice on how we should be doing it, so we as mentors are also looking to the program as equally rewarding. It's not only for the mentees, the mentors also kind of benefit from the program, so we are looking forward to starting next week. Thanks, Ali, again. Are there any questions or comments?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I certainly agree, yes.

ALI ALMESHAL: I certainly agree, this is a learning curve for all of us that we are taking that forward, and thank you for the leadership by Cheryl taking this for all of us, and getting us into that part of the learning curve. Thank you.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Ali. We now move on to [inaudible]. This is planning for Hyderabad. [inaudible] where they can join in the mentorship program. Yes, so we have a new ALS which joined a couple of weeks back,

[inaudible] based in India, [inaudible] what I will do is pass on your request to Ali to coordinate the mentorship program, and Ali will come back in a short while, maybe in a couple of days whether this is possible or not. It could be already kind of [inaudible] supposed to be this week, tomorrow, but they've got pushed to the next week. But anyway, I will request Ali to consider your request, and let's see what happens. And thanks for that [inaudible].

We are now moving on to Hyderabad, ICANN 57. We've had a number of discussions and meetings on the Hyderabad program, and I'd like to mention the more important ones. Can we have the APRALO please join Hyderabad page? This is the ALAC page. We also have an APRALO page. It's coming up now.

Some of the important things that are happening from our side: now, since this meeting is happening in India, it's a part of Asia Pacific, and APRALO automatically becomes the host RALO for the event, so we are organizing the APRALO showcase, which is a regular kind of event by the hosting RALO. Now, with the showcases basically [inaudible] occasion and showcasing the community and also a little bit of local culture. So three [inaudible]: one is networking where we all get together, the second is showcasing our ALSes, so we will have a small subgroup presentation, it's one slide per ALS, [inaudible] because we don't have much time on it, but maybe 30 seconds per ALS, and we will be putting together this slide deck, and we will be requesting all the ALSes whether they are participating or not. We'll request them to give us the one slide, which we'll combine into a presentation of the APRALO community, and [inaudible] we are hoping to have a cultural kind of performance art presentation in [inaudible] be very short, and we hope

to have at least some – we will not have dinner, but maybe some snacks. So the details are being worked out, and I request my colleagues in the leadership team to add on to what I'm saying right now.

The second event is a capacity building session for the APRALO community, particularly who are [inaudible]. We are not sure whether we can organize remote participation for these sessions, because there are four sessions separately planned. It is for the ALS [inaudible] and for some of the newcomers who are not yet part of the ALS, or rather, their country does not have an ALS yet. For example, Afghanistan or Bhutan in South Asia. So we have a mixture of [inaudible] participating in this. We have ALS representatives, some are sending one, some are sending two or three. We have some of the At-Large community that's not affiliated with any ALS, and we also have people who may not be from the At-Large region of Asia Pacific, maybe from outside [inaudible].

So this session is very important, it is organized by both the APRALO PR people, and the capacity building working group of ALAC, headed by Tijani Ben Jemaa, so we are [inaudible] on this, and we are presenting the [inaudible] program. [inaudible] that ALSes are enabled to participate in ICANN and APRALO activities, so we will be sending out RSVP requests to all the participants that we are aware are attending the Hyderabad meeting, so kindly respond and indicate your participation. So this is a very important program, and I would request all the participating ALSes who are going to be present in Hyderabad to also join this session, the full session, which are currently scheduled for the next week. The exact timing [inaudible] so this is the [inaudible]. We also have the [in-depth] call of internet governance. This is being planned specifically to try to [inaudible] meeting. This is already kind of

announced [inaudible] and applications have been received and they have been [inaudible] we have about 40 participants, of which 25 would be from India, 15 from outside India, so that's pretty much on the way. So this is in brief. There is also a number of other events which are being discussed jointly with other parts of ICANN, like [inaudible] and so on. That has been [inaudible] Adam is actually making a call early next week for that, for coordinating coordination in different groups. This is all basically going to be universities all bringing students from the universities and institutions to the ICANN meeting. This is all being planned. This is, in short, the [activity] planning for Hyderabad, but I request my colleagues also to add whatever I've missed out. Maureen may want to talk about the circulation of the two people who are coming from NARALO. Maureen, do you want to talk about it?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Oh, okay, thank you, Satish. Yes, one of the things that we will be doing in Hyderabad is actually hosting two tribal ambassadors from NARALO. These are two young ladies who are natives, from an indigenous group within –

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Oh, she's gone.

MAUREEN HILYARD: [inaudible] April and one is [inaudible] the surnames actually allude me at the moment, but I will be working with them, and I had two [inaudible] actually from the APRALO team who will be working with the

fellows, because April and [Valerie] will be involved in the fellows program as well, so I will be introducing them to people who come to the Hyderabad meeting, and I hope you make them feel welcome to. Thank you.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Maureen. Are there any comments or questions from anyone on any of these programs, or any suggestions on how we should be meeting in Hyderabad? We have others also from India as well, so any suggestions are welcome.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Sr, Satish, could you repeat that question?

SATISH BABU: Yes, I'm just waiting for comments. It's not a question, it's a call for comments.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I was just wondering why there was a long pause. I thought Holly would have jumped in and said something.

HOLLY RAICHE: Well, I will.

SATISH BABU: Yes, [inaudible].

HOLLY RAICHE: I think we're going to know a lot more about what we're going to do, because we're having a teleconference tomorrow just on the actual showcase event. I think we're still doing a budget and fundraising, and that's going to have an impact on what we can do and what we can't do, because clearly, our showcase event always has refreshments, including drink and food. Up until now, there has been as well mainly entertainment. At one point, when I was Chair of APRALO, we did have just the slides of each of the –a presentation with every picture of each of the RALOs, just to show how many, and to also make the point that APRALO really is a very diverse group of people. We've got to decide, are we going to do that, or Abu Dhabi, I don't know, and we still have to work through what our cultural event is going to be, but we've sort of got an outline, and that will be finalized, or at least progressed tomorrow, and then we'll have more details for everybody, which maybe we can put on the website or something, but we're still kind of early days, I think, on that one. Thank you.

SATISH BABU: Thanks very much for that, Holly. As Holly just mentioned, we are having a call just for the showcase tomorrow, and in case you're not aware, APRALO's motto is celebrating diversity, keeping in mind our extreme diversity that we have in the region, so each showcase we usually highlight this, and build something around the theme. Right, so I hear some echo on the line. Okay, are there any persons to comment? If not, we will move on. We have any other business as the next agenda. I have a request from Kelvin to speak on this. In the meantime, if anyone

else has any other points to raise, [inaudible] after Kelvin, you'll have an opportunity to. So over to Kelvin of ICANN APAC Hub.

KELVIN WONG: Thank you, Satish. Can you hear me?

SATISH BABU: Yes, we can hear you.

KELVIN WONG: Okay. Thank you, Satish, and everyone once again. I will take this opportunity to share something with you. It is the upcoming FY17 first quarter stakeholder call, or the QSC as we call it. This will happen on the 18ᵗʰ of October, at 03:00 UTC, so that is 11:00 Singapore time, and you can complete the [inaudible] for your timings as well. The important thing that I wanted to share with you is that while it's not the first time the QSC is coming to APAC, I think it's going to be a move regionally, and this time, it's starting with the move to APAC timing, and we're going to start with more regional content as well, so we do hope to see everyone on the call.

I think we usually sort of hear people say that the global calls are not being held on the APAC time zone and stuff like that, so I think we sort of got what we fought for, so I hope that we can spread the word around and get people, our stakeholders to come for this QSC. I think more details will be shared in the next few days. This is just the timing and everything has just been quite fresh from the oven, so please look out for more details and the call details as well. Jai Rong, the VP for Asia

will be sharing about the APAC Hub update as well as our engagement in the APAC region. Of course, we are also looking for feedback, and more ideas on what you want us to touch, so if you have any ideas, you could feel free to share it now, or just e-mail it to myself. Thank you very much.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Kelvin. Kelvin, do you have the link for [inaudible] that people can go to?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yes, please.

KELVIN WONG: Not right now, it's really fresh from the oven. We are in the process of preparing for that, so do keep a look out.

SATISH BABU: Right, thanks for that, Kelvin, I think it's very interesting. Alright, so are there any other comments [inaudible]. We are at the end of our agenda now, we still have some time if required. Please note that all the meetings that have been listed in the chat are open, and if you would like to participate and contribute in the meeting, you are welcome to come, because for several of these immediate ideas, certainly for the showcase, how we can make a showcase considering our limited budget and so on, [inaudible] presentation on all the ALSes we have, 45 ALSes in APRALO now, how we can make it kind of interactive. Even

considering that not all of them are going to be present at Hyderabad, we would like to invite your comments and suggestions on how best we can – more interesting we can make this.

So those calls are there tomorrow and next week. I don't see any other hands up, so I think that we're done for the agenda for today. Right, so thanks very much for attending this call, and talk to you in person in Hyderabad, or by remote participation. Thanks again. Bye.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you, bye.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thanks, Satish, thanks everyone, bye.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you, bye.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: This meeting is now adjourned. You will now be disconnected. Thank you very much for your participation, and have a lovely rest of your day. Bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]