

ICANN CCWG-Accountability Work Stream 2

Design/Drafting Team Ombuds Office

1. Background for Ombuds Office in Work Stream 2

ICANN's new bylaws reflect the CCWG Supplemental Final Proposal, regarding Work Stream 2 (WS2)

ARTICLE 27 TRANSITION ARTICLE

Section 27.1, WORK STREAM 2

(b) The CCWG-Accountability recommended in its Supplemental Final Proposal on Work Stream 1 Recommendations to the Board, dated 23 February 2016 ("CCWG-Accountability Final Report") that the below matters be reviewed and developed following the adoption date of these Bylaws ("Work Stream 2 Matters"), in each case, to the extent set forth in the CCWG-Accountability Final Report:

(vii) Considering enhancements to the Ombudsman's role and function;

This WS2 item was described in the CCWG-Accountability Work Stream 1 Final Proposal (Annex 12):

Through the enhanced Request for Reconsideration process (see Recommendation #8: Improving ICANN's Request for Reconsideration Process), the CCWG-Accountability has given increased responsibility to the Ombudsman.

The Ombudsman can perform a critical role in ensuring that ICANN is transparent and accountable, preventing and resolving disputes, supporting consensus-development, and protecting bottom-up, multistakeholder decision-making at ICANN. ICANN's Office of Ombudsman must have a clear charter that reflects, supports, and respects ICANN's Mission, Commitments and Core Values, and must have sufficient authority and independence to ensure that it can perform these important roles effectively. As part of Work Stream 2, the CCWG-Accountability will evaluate the current Ombudsman charter and operations against industry best practices and recommend any changes necessary to ensure that the ICANN Ombudsman has the tools, independence, and authority needed to be an effective voice for ICANN stakeholders.

Draft of Report #1 26 August 2016 Page 1 of 17



2. Dependencies between the sub-groups

- Diversity (Sébastien Bachollet)
- Human Rights (Raoul Plommer)
- Jurisdiction (Farzaneh Badii)
- SO/AC Accountability (Cheryl Langdon-Orr)
- Staff Accountability (Avri Doria)
- Transparency (Michael Karanicolas)
- Reviewing CEP (Edward Morris)
- Guidelines stand. conduct (Karel Douglas)
- IRP "Phase 2" (Robin Gross)

3. Stress Tests

Any stress tests elaborate during Work Stream 1 dealing with Ombuds function?

4. Current role of the ICANN Ombuds Office

The Ombudsman Role has been expanded through WS1, to include a responsibility to perform a first substantive review over Reconsideration Requests.

In addition, the CWG-Stewardship identified a new role for the Ombudsman, as a place of escalation for complaints about (Public Technical Identifiers) PTI's naming function service delivery. [Can someone point to an official document?]

This expansion is in addition to the Ombudsman's existing role (as set forth in the ICANN Bylaws) and further described in the Ombudsman Framework.

The Ombuds office is a mediator and not a decision maker.

The Ombuds office can only suggest it can never tell anyone to do anything - which is why informality is so important.

5. Evaluation

Evaluate the current ICANN Ombuds charter and operations against industry best practices

a. ICANN Ombudsman Framework (April 2009)



b. International Ombuds Association

- i. http://www.ombudsassociation.org/About-Us/IOA-Standards-of-Practice-IOA-Best-Practices.aspx
- ii. http://www.ombudsassociation.org/IOA_Main/media/SiteFiles/



	ICANN Ombuds Framework ¹ April 2009	International Ombuds Association Rev. 10/09	Comments Herb Wave
Juridiction	 The ICANN Ombudsman will receive and have jurisdiction over complaints of unfairness concerning: Decisions, actions, or inactions by one or more members of ICANN staff; Decisions, actions, or inactions by the Board of Directors that may be inconsistent with the Articles of Incorporation or the Bylaws. Decisions, actions, or inactions by constituent bodies. The Ombudsman does not have jurisdiction over complaints concerning: Internal administrative matters; Personnel issues; Issues relating to membership on the Board; or Issues relating to vendor/supplier relationships. The Ombudsman may decline jurisdiction over a complaint in the following circumstances: The person making the complaint knew, or 		

¹ http://www.icann.org/general/bylaws.htm#V

26 August 2016

Page 4 of 17



		LUANN	
	 ought to have known of the decision, recommendation, act, or omission to which the complaint refers more than 60 days before the complaint was received by the Ombudsman; The subject matter of the complaint primarily affects a person other than the complainant and the complainant does not have sufficient personal interest in it; The complaint is repetitive, trivial, vexatious, frivolous, non-substantive, otherwise abusive, or not made in good faith; Having due regard for all the circumstances, further action by the Ombudsman is not necessary to resolve the complaint; The complaint is abandoned; or is withdrawn in writing by the complainant; The complainant revokes the ADR process by engaging in either a formal review process under Article IV of the Bylaws; or engages in an outside legal process. http://www.icann.org/general/bylaws.htm#l 		
Power	The Ombudsman shall use various ADR techniques to facilitate the fair, independent, impartial, and timely resolution of complaints. The Ombudsman does not have the power to make, change or set aside a policy, administrative or Board decision, act, or omission. To the extent a complaint is made relating to a policy, administrative or Board decision, act, or omission, the Ombudsman does have the power to investigate these events, and to use ADR techniques to attempt to resolve the complaint.		



	-	LCAMN	
	Where, in the conduct of an investigation of a complaint, the Ombudsman forms an opinion that there has been a serious breach of administrative fairness or mal administration, the Ombudsman may notify the Board of Directors of the circumstances. Where there exists no further opportunity for		
	ADR techniques to be applied, or there is no likelihood of a successful Ombudsman resolution, the Ombudsman shall advise the complainant of the formal review procedures.		
	If the Ombudsman declines jurisdiction, he shall inform the complainant in writing of the decision.		
	The Ombudsman may make recommendations to the Board of Directors with respect to matters arising from complaints reviewed and investigated by the Ombudsman. Where the Ombudsman makes a recommendation to the Board of Directors and to the extent the Board deems it appropriate and feasible, the Board should endeavor to respond to the Ombudsman's recommendation within 60 days after the Board meeting following receipt of such a recommendation.		
Independence	The Ombudsman is independent The Ombudsman reports only to ICANN's Board of Directors. The Ombudsman cannot be removed from office, except by a 75% vote of the Board. Should the Ombudsman believe starting an	 1.1 The Ombudsman Office and the Ombudsman are independent from other organizational entities. 1.2 The Ombudsman holds no other position within the organization which might compromise independence. 1.3 The Ombudsman exercises sole 	 Is perception of independence an issue? Better understanding of relationships? Term of office. Two year renewable by
	investigation on his/her "own motion" would be	discretion over whether or how to act	Board.

Draft of Report #1 26 August 2016 Page 6 of 17



	appropriate, the Ombudsman will request authority to do so from a Board committee to be determined by the Board of Directors. That committee shall then determine, based on the information provided by the Ombudsman and any information it obtains on its own, whether such an "own motion" investigation is sanctioned by the committee and thus whether or not the Ombudsman is authorized to proceed with that investigation.	regarding an individual's concern, a trend or concerns of multiple individuals over time. The Ombudsman may also initiate action on a concern identified through the Ombudsman' direct observation. 1.4 The Ombudsman has access to all information and all individuals in the organization, as permitted by law. 1.5 The Ombudsman has authority to select Ombudsman Office staff and manage Ombudsman Office budget and operations.	NomCom or Board appointment?
Neutrality Impartiality Fairness	The Ombudsman is impartial, and neutral. Upon the completion, but before transmittal, of a draft report to the Board of Directors, the Ombudsman will first provide the relevant ICANN department, committee, organization or individual(s) an opportunity to review, respond and provide feedback to the draft report. The Ombudsman will consider feedback generated by this Internal Fairness Procedure in the preparation of a final report for the Board. The relevant department, committee, organization or individual(s) should endeavor to respond to the Ombudsman, or request an extension to respond, within 30 calendar days from receipt of the draft report. Complaints to the Office of Ombudsman shall be dealt with in an informal, timely, and confidential manner.	2.1 The Ombudsman is neutral, impartial, and unaligned. 2.2 The Ombudsman strives for impartiality, fairness and objectivity in the treatment of people and the consideration of issues. The Ombudsman advocates for fair and equitably administered processes and does not advocate on behalf of any individual within the organization. 2.3 The Ombudsman is a designated neutral reporting to the highest possible level of the organization and operating independent of ordinary line and staff structures. The Ombudsman should not report to nor be structurally affiliated with any compliance function of the organization. 2.4 The Ombudsman serves in no additional role within the organization which would compromise the Ombudsman' neutrality. The Ombudsman should not be aligned with any formal or informal associations within the organization in a way that might create actual or perceived conflicts of interest for the Ombudsman. The Ombudsman should have no personal interest or stake in, and incur no gain or loss from, the outcome of an issue.	 Fairness Unbiased Advocate for equality among groups? Give voice to smaller groups when larger groups control? Balancing of power.

Draft of Report #1 26 August 2016 Page 7 of 17



	T	ESAMA	
		2.5 The Ombudsman has a responsibility to	
		consider the legitimate concerns and	
		interests of all individuals affected by the	
		matter under consideration.	
		2.6 The Ombudsman helps develop a range	
		of responsible options to resolve problems	
		and facilitate discussion to identify the best	
		options.	
Confidentiality	All matters brought before the Ombudsman	3.1 The Ombudsman holds all	1. Danger of emails &
Confidentiality	shall be treated as confidential. The	communications with those seeking	social media.
	Ombudsman shall also take all reasonable	assistance in strict confidence and takes all	Limited control over
	steps necessary to preserve the privacy of,	reasonable steps to safeguard confidentiality,	disclosure if one party
	and to avoid harm to, those parties not	including the following:	does not adhere to
	involved in the complaint being investigated by	The Ombudsman does not reveal, and must	confidentiality.
	the	not be required to reveal, the identity of any	3. Maintains open lines
	Ombudsman.	individual contacting the Ombudsman Office,	with organization
	The Ombudsman shall only make inquiries	nor does the Ombudsman reveal information	regarding complaints
	about, or advise staff or	provided in confidence that could lead to the	and issues.
	Board members of the existence and identity	identification of any individual contacting the	and loodes.
	of, a complainant in order to further the	Ombudsman Office, without that individual's	
	resolution of the complaint. The Ombudsman	express permission, given in the course of	
	shall take all reasonable steps necessary to	informal discussions with the Ombudsman;	
	ensure that if staff and Board members are	the Ombudsman takes specific action related	
	made aware of the existence and identity of a	to an individual's issue only with the	
	complainant, they agree to maintain the	individual's express permission and only to	
	confidential nature of such information, except	the extent permitted, and even then at the	
	as necessary to further the resolution of	sole discretion of the Ombudsman, unless	
	complaint.	such action can be taken in a way that	
	The Ombudsman has the right to have access	safeguards the identity of the individual	
	to (but not to publish if otherwise confidential)	contacting the Ombudsman Office. The only	
	all necessary information and records from	exception to this privilege of confidentiality is	
	ICANN staff and constituent bodies to enable	where there appears to be imminent risk of	
	an informed evaluation of the complaint and to	serious harm, and where there is no other	
	assist in dispute resolution where feasible.	reasonable option. Whether this risk exists is	
	Private and internal communications not	a determination to be made by the	
	distributed via public websites may be	Ombudsman.	
	designated as confidential by the party	3.2 Communications between the	
	providing such information and records.	Ombudsman and others (made while the	

Draft of Report #1 26 August 2016 Page 8 of 17



Nothing shall stop the Ombudsman from treating information confidential if the Ombudsman deems it appropriate to do so. In general terms, due to the very nature of the work of the Office of the Ombudsman, the Ombudsman will resist testifying in any process which would reveal informal, confidential information given to the Ombudsman during the course of an investigation.

Communication with complainants will normally be by email or telephone to expedite the exchange of information. When the Office of Ombudsman closes a complaint, it will be in one of the following categories, and the complainant, where possible, will be notified by email.

Ombudsman is serving in that capacity) are considered privileged. The privilege belongs to the Ombudsman and the Ombudsman Office, rather than to any party to an issue. Others cannot waive this privilege.

- 3.3 The Ombudsman does not testify in any formal process inside the organization and resists testifying in any formal process outside of the organization regarding a visitor's contact with the Ombudsman or confidential information communicated to the Ombudsman, even if given permission or requested to do so. The Ombudsman may, however, provide general, non-confidential information about the Ombudsman Office or the Ombudsman profession.
- 3.4 If the Ombudsman pursues an issue systemically (e.g., provides feedback on trends, issues, policies and practices) the Ombudsman does so in a way that safeguards the identity of individuals.
- 3.5 The Ombudsman keeps no records containing identifying information on behalf of the organization.
- 3.6 The Ombudsman maintains information (e.g., notes, phone messages, appointment calendars) in a secure location and manner, protected from inspection by others (including management), and has a consistent and standard practice for the destruction of such information.
- 3.7 The Ombudsman prepares any data and/or reports in a manner that protects confidentiality.
- 3.8 Communications made to the ombudsman are not notice to the organization. The ombudsman neither acts as agent for, nor accepts notice on behalf of,

Draft of Report #1



		the ergenization and shall not conve in a	
		the organization and shall not serve in a	
		position or role that is designated by the	
		organization as a place to receive notice on	
		behalf of the organization. However, the	
		ombudsman may refer individuals to the	
		appropriate place where formal notice can be	
		made.	
Informality and	The Ombudsman's function is to act as an	4.1 The Ombudsman functions on an	"One of the underlying goals
inioi manty and	Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) office for	informal basis by such means as: listening,	of any Ombuds Office in any
other standards	members of the ICANN community who may	providing and receiving information,	organization or government
other standards	wish to lodge a complaint that the staff, board	identifying and reframing issues, developing	is, bottom line, saving the
	or a constituent body has treated them unfairly.	a range of responsible options, and – with	organization time, money,
	The purpose of the Ombudsman is to ensure	permission and at Ombudsman discretion –	grief, lawsuits, and so forth if
	that the members of the ICANN community	engaging in informal third-party intervention.	conflict can be resolved at
	have been treated fairly.	When possible, the Ombudsman helps	the very lowest level
	The Ombudsman will act as an impartial officer	people develop new ways to solve problems	possible."
	and will attempt to resolve complaints about	themselves.	"The fairness aspect is
	unfair treatment by ICANN using ADR	4.2 The Ombudsman as an informal and off-	critical. But the informality is
	techniques.	the-record resource pursues resolution of	something that should be
		concerns and looks into procedural	kept in the forefront."
	The Ombudsman will adhere to the standards	irregularities and/or broader systemic	Coca Cola Ombuds
	of practice adopted by The Ombudsman	problems when appropriate.	does not even carry a
	Association, as they may be applicable.	4.3 The Ombudsman does not make binding	pen vs. our CMS with
	The Ombudsman will act as a leader by	decisions, mandate policies, or formally	online complaint form &
	modeling and promoting fairness, equality,	adjudicate issues for the organization.	use of emails.
	clarity, innovation, and by providing assistance	4.4 The Ombudsman supplements, but does	Privacy issue: storage
	to ICANN and the community in developing an	not replace, any formal channels. Use of the	of complaints
	awareness of the Ombudsman role.	Ombudsman Office is voluntary, and is not a	(archives).
	The Office of the Ombudsman will strive for	required step in any grievance process or	3. Requires organizational
	certification and peer recognition with relevant	organizational policy.	trust in Office.
	Ombudsman bodies.	4.5 The Ombudsman does not participate in	4. Requires community
	Ombudanan budea.	any formal investigative or adjudicative	trust in Office.
	All complaints to the Office of Ombudemen		5. Must not be seen as
	All complaints to the Office of Ombudsman	procedures. Formal investigations should be	
	must be made in writing.	conducted by others. When a formal	IRP or Reconsideration
	The Office of Ombudsman shall provide an interactive form on the ICANN website to	investigation is requested, the Ombudsman	appeal but can be used
		refers individuals to the appropriate offices or	at any stage around
	facilitate the filing of complaints.	individual.	either.
	Written complaints to the Office of	4.6 The Ombudsman identifies trends,	6. Process review not

Draft of Report #1 26 August 2016 Page 10 of 17



		ECANN	
	Ombudsman shall contain the following information:	issues and concerns about policies and procedures, including potential future issues	decision appeal. 7. First stop not last stop.
	 Information about the complainant: 	and concerns, without breaching	8. Should represent
	Name, address, postal address, phone	confidentiality or anonymity, and provides	opinion of « reasonable
	number, email contact, domain name;	recommendations for responsibly addressing	person »?
	The date of ICANN act, omission, or	them.	
	decision, and a description of that act,	4.7 The Ombudsman acts in accordance	
	omission, or decision;	with the IOA Code of Ethics and Standards of	
	A description as to how the complainant	Practice, keeps professionally current by	
	has sufficient personal interest in the	pursuing continuing education, and provides	
	matter;	opportunities for staff to pursue professional	
	The nature and basis of the complaint	training.	
	about the act, omission, or decision;	4.8 The Ombudsman endeavors to be worthy of the trust placed in the Ombudsman	
	A synopsis of contact between the	Office.	
	complainant and the ICANN staff or Board	Ollide.	
	on the issue, if applicable;		
	 Any other information the complainant wishes to provide. 		
• 4	The Ombudsman may post complaints and		
Communication	resolutions to a dedicated portion of the		
	ICANN website:		
	(i) in order to promote an understanding of		
	the issues in the ICANN community;		
	(ii) to raise awareness of administrative		
	fairness; and		
	(iii) to allow the community to see the results		
	of similar previous cases. These postings will be done in a generic		
	manner to protect the confidentiality and		
	privilege of communicating with the Office of		
	Ombudsman.		
	The Ombudsman will provide an Annual		
	Report to the Board of		
	Directors, and this will be posted on the		
	website.		
	The Ombudsman will conduct appropriate		
	outreach and consumer awareness with the		
	ICANN community to raise the level of		

26 August 2016

Page 11 of 17



		LEANN	
	understanding of the Ombudsman process, and to encourage the use of ADR processes.		
Output	Resolved: When the matter that the complainant brought to the Ombudsman has been resolved between the parties to the satisfaction of the Ombudsman. System Improvement: When during the course of conducting an investigation the Ombudsman makes a recommendation to ICANN (either informally or via report to the Board), which the Ombudsman believes may lead to the increased fairness of a process. Referral: When a complaint does not lie within the jurisdiction of the Ombudsman, and the complainant is either a) passed directly to the responsible staff person within ICANN, or b) given a point of reference outside of ICANN such as the Office of Fair Trading. Self Help: When the contact requires only the transmittal of information enabling the complainant to be self empowered to deal with the matter of the contact on their own (i.e. information found on various ICANN webpages). No further Action Required: The Ombudsman may begin initial steps in handling a matter and then find that there is no further action required due to the circumstances (i.e. the complaint may be related to a time sensitive issue, or on evaluation the complaint may not warrant investigation (trivial)). Decline Jurisdiction: The Ombudsman may decline jurisdiction, as described in the Ombudsman Framework, for matters such as the timeliness of a complaint, lack of personal		



interest, trivial, vexatious, etc., or in a circumstance where the complainant escalates the complaint to a formal process pursuant to Article IV of ICANN's Bylaws. Unfounded: When the Ombudsman investigates a complaint and determines that the matter presented to the Ombudsman was unfounded. Withdrawn: When a complainant notifies the Ombudsman that the complaint need not be pursued further. Abandoned: When a complainant ceases to be involved in the Ombudsman process without notice to the Ombudsman. Unresolved and escalated by complainant per Article IV of Bylaws. Resolved with Notification to the Board. Resolved with Recommendation to the Board.



6. Various types of Ombudsman roles

There is a lot of variance in the type of Ombuds Offices. They work differently, depending on their legislation and their powers. Some research could possibly be done in that area.

- a. Legislative
 - i. South African "Public Protector"
 - ii. France "Défenseur des droits"
- b. University
- c. Organizational
- d. Executive (like ICANN)
- e. etc.

7. Challenges

- f. Technical vs. common sense.
- g. Formal vs. Informal.
- h. Big issues and small issues. All problems come in regardless of importance/size.
- i. Reaching the community.
- j. Orientation to newcomers/staff/nextGen should be built in.
- k. Being used to game system.
- I. Ombuds shouldn't require a team of lawyers.

8. Recommendation

Recommend any changes necessary to ensure that the ICANN Ombudsman has the tools, independence, and authority needed to be an effective voice for ICANN stakeholders

Term of the ombudsman

True independence in a role that is subject to Board renewal

9. Additional role for the Ombuds Office?

Can and do we need to go beyond the traditional remit of an Ombudsman (i.e. fairness)?



Inspector General vs Ombuds.

Informality is critical. An Inspector General takes this in a completely different direction and is not an Ombuds role.

Some of the things that have or may be proposed are beyond the Ombuds competence and how we should handle that.

A way to answer this question is:

- To look at the powers and framework for the position we are looking for;
 - [For this document we will call it Ombuds Office].
- To hire the candidate(s) who embody those needs;
- To define the final name for the position.

"And an Inspector General or an Auditor General, or whatever you want to call it, watchdog of an organization, is a very different role. And for an Ombuds to go in that direction, it would be a complete change in the focus of having that accountability mechanism."

10. Interaction

How the new role of the Ombudsman would interact with other mechanisms, to avoid duplication and optimize effectiveness?

11. Communication & Relationship

- a. In-reach to community vs Out-reach
- b. Relationships with Board & Community leadership.
- c. All new Board and community leaders have Ombuds orientation?
- d. Give voice to everyone (regardless of size or perceived unimportance of group)
- e. Advocate for ethical behavior

12. Trust

13. Advice

Advice to the future ICANN Ombudsman?

Draft of Report #1 26 August 2016 Page 15 of 17



- New bylaw changes: Reconsideration
- Formal vs. informal?
- Involvement with community?
- Involvement in policy development to ensure fair input from all parties?
- Should policy issues be run past the ombuds office?
- Advocate for ethics/code of conduct?
- Harassment bullying behavior?

14. Conclusion



Annexes

Resources

ICANN Ombudsman blog: https://omblog.icann.org/.

Ombudsman Framework: https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/framework-2012-02-25-en

What the Ombudsman can do for you: https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/contact-2012-02-25-en.

Online Dispute Resolution Standards of Practice:

https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/odr-standards-of-practice-2012-02-25-en

Ombudsman Annual Reports & Publications: https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/reports-96-2012-02-25-en

International Ombudsman Association FAQs:

https://www.ombudsassociation.org/Resources/Frequently-Asked-Questions.aspx

Ombudsman's Program Management:

- ATRT Part 24 Ombudsman Report
- Ombudsman Evaluation Seminar
- Value Statement
- Results Based Management and Accountability Framework (RMAF)
 - Results Based Management and Accountability Framework (RMAF)
- Evaluation Papers
 - Statistical Comparison
 - Independent Review of Statistical Comparison
 - Client Survey Results (August 2006)
 - Third Party Review of Client Survey Results
 - Literature Base Review July 2006
 - Independent Review of Literature Based Evaluation
- Analytical Tools
- 50 Questions for Self-Evaluation
- A Practitioner's Guide to Evaluating Ombudsman Offices
- A Blueprint for the Evaluation of an Ombudsman's Office: A Case Study of the ICANN
 Office of the Ombudsman