

Adobe Connect Chat Transcript: CCT-RT Plenary Meeting #22

Pamela Smith: (10/26/2016 07:51) Hello, everyone, and welcome to the 22nd Plenary Meeting of the Competition, Consumer Choice and Consumer Trust Review!

Kaili Kan: (07:57) Hi, ladies!

Kaili Kan: (07:57) Hi, Stan!

Carlton Samuels: (07:57) Morning all

Megan Richards: (08:01) you will be pleased to know that our IT technician came to tune up my Adobe connection so all should be in order now :-)

Pamela Smith: (08:04) Congrats, Megan! :)

Jonathan Zuck: (08:07) What's the plan for the italics? Footnote hunt?

Carlos Gutierrez: (08:07) sorry

Carlos Gutierrez: (08:08) I was in the old room.....:/

Alice Jansen: (08:08) Link to the g-doc https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1Xvwd4d8K0dAQrHjU55pxa8KQo-2DpfWNCW75vraX5ttUc_edit-23&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY66F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=b5N1gXSgYQTwiKINTAfM57dFKtiNkT3rh_Yh3g_IAK4&s=EqpPQHYhOPcPBFj8xzcAvJbN1ntbyLnLpn2I1FBclwY&e=

Megan Richards: (08:10) Jordyn sorry to come back to my old "objection" regarding the bold in Industry Structure for example - hard to say "many "stand alone" gTLDs to continue to operate" as it is still early days and we have no reason to expect this so far as I see (unless there is substantial data supporting this I would prefer to say: "the structure of the industry may make it possible for "stand alone" gTLDs to operate even with low registration volums but it is still early in the evolution of the new gTLDs and this should be reviewed over time" (or something to that effect)

Megan Richards: (08:11) and I can do it orally now too :-)

Stan Besen: (08:15) Are the last two sentences in the Industry Structure draft sufficiently nuanced?

Megan Richards: (08:15) look - the economist has the same concern that I have !!

Alice Jansen: (08:16) Please mute your line if not speaking.

Pamela Smith: (08:16) Whose is the number beginning with 415?

Pamela Smith: (08:17) Also, whose is the number beginning with 661?

Waudon: (08:18) Megan's technician did not do such a good job. Her audio not clear

Carlton Samuels: (08:18) Megan sound like she's in a large room with a lot of echo capabilities

Megan Richards: (08:19) I do have a big office but the technician gave me a special microphone with no echo (in principle!)

Megan Richards: (08:21) I don't insist on wording about early days but that is the fact so we have to take that into consideration in extrapolating about the future

Stan Besen: (08:21) There is a more extended discussion of this point on p. 5 of the Industry Structure draft.

Megan Richards: (08:21) ok

Carlton Samuels: (08:22) Lost connection - my Skype dropped

Jonathan Zuck: (08:22) already out of there

Alice Jansen: (08:23) @Carlos - could you speak closer to your mic, por favor? Sound is fading

Carlton Samuels: (08:25) He's muted

Carlton Samuels: (08:25) Yes can hear you

Stan Besen: (08:27) The paper that Jordyn circulated earlier in the week expresses considerable skepticism about the viability of many new TLDs.

Jonathan Zuck: (08:28) yes. keeps getting lowered

Stan Besen: (08:31) Under backends, 1284 should be described as "unconcentrated" based on the DOJ standard.

Megan Richards: (08:32) agree with Jonathan on IPR - have a similar comment on the bold conclusion under trademarks that I had re industry structure - let's chat about slight editing changes to clarify

Megan Richards: (08:33) better to say "there is some evidence that ..." "incurring costs to register defensively" or something like that

Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:34) Thanks, Stan. But the .95 8-firm number would be relatively concentrated?

Megan Richards: (08:35) on "Parking" I would prefer to change slightly the last sentence as well to say "makes it more difficult to assess the impact of this on the overall gTLD marketplace" at least I think that is what you are saying - I leave it also to Stan/others to correct

Drew: (08:41) +1 Jamie

Jonathan Zuck: (08:42) and in the paper we draft

Megan Richards: (08:44) also agree with Jamie - re brand protection - better late than never

Jonathan Zuck: (08:44) and "defensive registration" being TOO costly could mean other issues

Jonathan Zuck: (08:47) Jamie's point is a bit simplistic but we can discuss that offline. ;)

Megan Richards: (08:55) keep going Leureen ;-)

Megan Richards: (08:55) Laureen

David Taylor 2: (08:55) twasnt me, in case someing things my smiley face was an admission of guilt!

Carlos Gutierrez: (08:59) We just received on against .feedback

Carlton Samuels: (09:00) @Carlos: Read it with interest and going over again.

Carlton Samuels: (09:01) It is intersting that it particularize each PIC violation so for the first time, I can see a list of potential measurement points

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:03) +1

Megan Richards: (09:11) all clear for me and very well explained - consistent with what I saw in the consumers and registrants survceys

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:18) The .FEEDBACK complaint is 50+ pages long.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:18) So it seems like there's lots of room to provide info.

Jonathan Zuck: (09:21) not over time yet

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:21) I will do it in wriiting Laureen

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:21) I just received your document

Alice Jansen: (09:22) Laureen's paper available here -

<https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https->

[3A__community.icann.org_download_attachments_58727388_Consumer-2520Trust-2520and-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_download_attachments_58727388_Consumer-2520Trust-2520and-2520Safeguards-2520Draft-2520Findings.docx-3Fversion-3D1-26modificationDate-3D1477488501000-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[2520Safeguards-2520Draft-2520Findings.docx-3Fversion-3D1-26modificationDate-3D1477488501000-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-2520Safeguards-2520Draft-2520Findings.docx-3Fversion-3D1-26modificationDate-3D1477488501000-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[26api-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[Y6-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=b5N1gXSgYQTwiKINTAfM57dFKtiNkT3rh_Yh3g_IAK4&s=cAMleMDGOazh2dTot](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=b5N1gXSgYQTwiKINTAfM57dFKtiNkT3rh_Yh3g_IAK4&s=cAMleMDGOazh2dTot)

[OK17_e9EaPaiFDjmuD31JPyzWY&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-OK17_e9EaPaiFDjmuD31JPyzWY&e=)

Kaili Kan: (09:22) We depend on data and information by consulting agencies commissioned by ICANN data on surveys to derive conclutions, but hose SHOULD NOT BE THE ONLY source of information for our review.

Alice Jansen: (09:22) AMGlobal - <https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https->

[3A__community.icann.org_download_attachments_56135378_New-2520gTLDs-2520and-2520the-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_download_attachments_56135378_New-2520gTLDs-2520and-2520the-2520Global-2520South-2520-2D-2D-2520Understanding-2520Limited-2520Demand-2520and-2520Options-2520Going-2520Forward-252010-2D14-2D16-2520-2528002-2529.pdf-3Fversion-3D1-26modificationDate-3D1476804586444-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[2520Global-2520South-2520-2D-2D-2520Understanding-2520Limited-2520Demand-2520and-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-2520Global-2520South-2520-2D-2D-2520Understanding-2520Limited-2520Demand-2520and-2520Options-2520Going-2520Forward-252010-2D14-2D16-2520-2528002-2529.pdf-3Fversion-3D1-26modificationDate-3D1476804586444-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[2520Options-2520Going-2520Forward-252010-2D14-2D16-2520-2528002-2529.pdf-3Fversion-3D1-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-2520Options-2520Going-2520Forward-252010-2D14-2D16-2520-2528002-2529.pdf-3Fversion-3D1-26modificationDate-3D1476804586444-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[26modificationDate-3D1476804586444-26api-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-26modificationDate-3D1476804586444-26api-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

[3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3Dv2&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDL)

Y6-

6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=b5N1gXSgYQTwiKINTAfM57dFKtiNkT3rh_Yh3g_IAK4&s=rwv5FWEkxVVYsBpVO
ZPIA6hmaEDZGKpFMB5k6rcaSEE&e=

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:23) We will write on that one

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:23) I agree

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:23) I have read it just once. I have a few comments

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:23) together with Carlton

Waudu: (09:24) I've not done proper analysis yet Jonathan

Eleeza Agopian: (09:24) Andrew Mack will be with you in Hyderabad.

Eleeza Agopian: (09:24) To have a longer discussion about his team's findings.

Waudu: (09:24) Ok

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:24) We can prepare some questions for the presentation by Andrew

Kaili Kan: (09:25) Sorry for the mis-typing. It should read as: We depend on data and surveys commissioned by ICANN to derive conclusions, but they SHOULD NOT BE THE ONLY source. Outside reliable sources should also be considered and included.

David Taylor: (09:26) Hi Megan, head my name, not sure regarding what as it was fading in and out, but ping me an email after this and I'll have a look over anything. Thanks.

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:28) I have to start driving. So if we go over 90 minutes please call me on +50688377176 please

Brenda Brewer: (09:29) Thank you Carlos. Will call if needed.

Megan Richards: (09:29) Just for info - I am arriving in Hyderabad early morning on 2 December so may arrive a bit late to the meeting but will be there

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:29) November I hope Megan

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:30) if you arrive in December you might be alone

Eleeza Agopian: (09:30) Carlos, Waudu and Carlton: I asked Andrew Mack to clarify a few points in the paper which I thought could benefit from some more explanation. He's revising the paper and we should send that to the full list soon.

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:31) note taken Eleeza. Please send the revised version ASAP

David Taylor: (09:31) I get in at 5.20am also on the 2nd... We should be sharp that day.

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:31) @DAvid also 02 December?

Eleeza Agopian: (09:31) Will do. Carlos. Don't anticipate major changes, just saw a few points that would benefit from some more detail.

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:31) @Eleeza

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:32) tahks

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:32) I have to move now

Carlos Gutierrez: (09:32) will be on the phone

Alice Jansen: (09:34) We have 25 min left - do we want to go back to Jordyn's document?

Carlton Samuels: (09:34) I get to HYD at 2am on Tuesday morning

Megan Richards: (09:34) @Carlos - sorry am doing CCT and IGF at the same time - indeed November !!
:-)

Carlton Samuels: (09:35) @Laureen: We should eb there at the same time

Waudu: (09:46) Hi Pamela. I arrive Hydrebad 01 November 08:40 (Emirates EK 526)

Megan Richards: (09:54) agree Stan

Drew: (09:54) Is it with mentioning Google's new open source backend registry software?

Kaili Kan: (09:54) I arrive at Hyderabad 9am 1 Nov.

Drew: (09:55) How this might affect competition in the future

Megan Richards: (09:55) @Drew - why ?

Jamie Hedlund: (09:55) What about ccTLD backend providers?

Jamie Hedlund: (09:55) Why limit to gTLDs.?

Drew: (09:56) @Megan - I haven't scrutinized it enough, but it might be a gamechanger in enabling registries to more easily provide their own backend services or for new players to enter the market because of the availability of free, open source backend software

Megan Richards: (09:56) we should compare apples with apples rather than apples and oranges so perhaps adding the ccTLD backend providers makes a useful comparison here?

Drew: (09:56) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__www.circleid.com_posts_20161018-5Fgoogle-5Fannounces-5Fopen-5Fsource-5Ftop-5Flevel-5Fdomain-5Fname-5Fregistry_&d=DQICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfw dloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=b5N1gXSgYQTwiKINTAfM57dFKtiNkT3rh_Yh3g_IAK4&s=ZI_S9_opAqzDQ6l8Hrz h5eV_if-X21Nb1FzZSWCkWP8&e=

Carlton Samuels: (09:58) I posted that story last week. Jordyn did make a response

Waudu: (09:58) If this is a software-defined registry - rather than open source software for a registry- that could be significant

Waud: (09:59) Rahter I meant software-defined back-end

David Taylor: (10:00) Got to drop off to another call, sorry, have liaised with Megan

David Taylor: (10:00) Bye

Carlton Samuels: (10:00) @Stan: Interestingly, that info shows back end providers here are likely barriers to entry of wouldbe entrepreneurs.

Stan Besen 2: (10:01) Half of the ccTLDs in LAC use external backend providers.

Kaili Kan: (10:01) Thank you all. Bye!

Drew: (10:01) thanks!

Drew: (10:01) ciao

Carlton Samuels: (10:01) Thanks all

Megan Richards: (10:01) see you in India