

Adobe Connect chat transcript for Wednesday, 10 August 2016

Terri Agnew:Welcome to the New gTLD Auction Proceeds CCWG Charter Drafting Team held on Wednesday, 10 August 2016 at 12:00 UTC

Terri Agnew:wiki agenda page: <https://community.icann.org/x/gASsAw>

Olga Cavalli:hola Silvia!

Olga Cavalli:Hi Terry!

Sylvia Cadena:Hola :)

Jonathan Robinson:Hello All

Asha Hemrajani:Hello

Asha Hemrajani:Can some from staff give me the singapore access number? The numbers in the email are all mangled up

Marika Konings:800-120-4663

Lauren Allison:Erika is currently stuck in meetings and hopes to connect in 30 minutes. She sends her apologies in the meantime

Asha Hemrajani:any passcode?

Olga Cavalli:I hear nothing is this ok?

Marika Konings:65-6883-9230 (toll)

Terri Agnew:SINGAPORE

65-6883-9230

800-120-4663

Terri Agnew:passcode: Auction

Alan Greenberg:AUDIO ok

Olga Cavalli:ok I hear no sound I will connect and disconnect again

Asha Hemrajani:Thank you Marika and Terri. Please Terri could you confirm that it will be the same numbers for future calls?

Terri Agnew:@Asha, confirmed it is

Asha Hemrajani:Thanks Terri. Please check your private chat

Olga Cavalli:Ihear nothing :(can you do a dial up to me? +54 11 4826 2530

Asha Hemrajani:Olga, did you do "connect your audio" from your adobe top bar?

Olga Cavalli:yes i did

Olga Cavalli:no audio on the computer, it happens sometimes

Marika Konings:that is correct

Terri Agnew:@Olga, the operator will dial out in a moment

Marika Konings:comment #22, if I am not mistaken, is next

Olga Cavalli:thanks

Olga Cavalli:im in the phone now thanks!!

Marika Konings:that is correct

Lauren Allison:Sam is unable to make this call due to ill health and would like me to send her apologies for the record

Sylvia Cadena:I agree Jonathan.

Sylvia Cadena:We are not there yet.

Olga Cavalli:agree with Jonathan

Asha Hemrajani:agree - we should take the time that we need

Olga Cavalli:If GAC needs to approve it will take time please have that in consideration

Sylvia Cadena:We cannot drag this for too long either. It is important to get a final draft soon so the approvals process can take the time is needed.

Sylvia Cadena:Weekly meetings sounds ok so that we can get as close as possible to that deadline.

Sylvia Cadena:No, I didn't.

Marika Konings:Staff can try to reconcile those or mark where there is conflict in the revised charter?

Sylvia Cadena:There were a few notes in the document that we discussed in the conference call. I did add what I said on the last conference call.

Sylvia Cadena:Nothing different from what we discussed.

Sylvia Cadena:I was taking notes on the documents during the meeting about my own comments. Sorry if that generated any confusion, but I didn't add anything that we did not discuss on the last meeting.

Terri Agnew:sync is enabled, everyone can scroll themselves

Olga Cavalli:good point Alan

Asha Hemrajani:Marika could you speak a bit slower please

Sylvia Cadena:Thanks for the input Marika. Good to have that into consideration.

Marika Konings:Apologies Asha - I will do my best to slow down :-)

Sylvia Cadena:That will be to help to CCWG.

Marika Konings:if I remember correctly, the charter currently foresees the ability for the CCWG to identify expertise needed as part of its process

Sylvia Cadena:I don't think the DT should be calling for experts at this stage, but identifying the skills/knowledge that will be needed

Alan Greenberg:@Marika, yes

Alan Greenberg:Regarding CCWG ACCT experts, I believe it was more like 7 of them. We did not pay fees, but we did fly them around the world (largely or partially in business class).

Terri Agnew:Welcome Erika Mann

Erika Mann:Just joined

Erika Mann:Hi Terri

Asha Hemrajani:@alan actually Steve did not advocate separating into 3 buckets - he was very against that

Asha Hemrajani:@Alan the 3 buckets issue was just an example

Olga Cavalli:my call drop off, please Terry ask the operator to call me again

Alan Greenberg:The impression I got is he was advocating that. But it is moot as this will be a CCWG discussion and decision.

Erika Mann:Can someone guide me to the right topic

Asha Hemrajani:I agree Alan - it is a CCWG discussion and decision

Alan Greenberg:@22

Asha Hemrajani:Hi Erika, we are on #22

Sylvia Cadena:comment 22 Erika

Marika Konings:@Erika - comment 22 on page 17

Erika Mann:Thank you Marika

Asha Hemrajani:@sylvia I did not suggest that we call for experts at this stage. What I was talking about was in line with what Jonathan said

Erika Mann:Is everyone else hearing Sylvia badly?

Asha Hemrajani:Yes Sylvia sounded a bit muffled

Erika Mann:I think you can't hear me

Erika Mann:Move on

Asha Hemrajani:I just want to clarify that while knowledge of the ICANN ecosystem is good, it should not be mandatory

Terri Agnew:@Erika, I don't see your mic active. Please let me know if the op should dial out to you

Asha Hemrajani:We need to have as broad a participation as possible

Erika Mann:Try again please

Terri Agnew:@Erika, audio is now working

Asha Hemrajani:can hear you Erika

Erika Mann:I said we are fine

Jonathan Robinson:Thank you Erica
Erika Mann:Agree with Alan
Sylvia Cadena:23
Sylvia Cadena:Hold on, but thn we need something on the charter about how / who appoints / nominates members that are not from the chartering organizations?
Marika Konings:@Sylvia - only Chartering organizations can appoint members, but anyone can join as a participant
David Tait:I'm taking them
Asha Hemrajani:Sylvia has a valid point here
Sylvia Cadena:Yes, but what Asha said was to open members to others
Erika Mann:Open minded yes, but we don't need folks that understand the instrumental part of disbursement but the framing of programs yet
Sylvia Cadena:Ok, I think we had already said that on the charter.
Asha Hemrajani:yes that was my point - I think the text in the charter is broad enough already
Jonathan Robinson:N.B. Anyone may participate. There is nothing to stop experts participating. As per Marika's point.
Terri Agnew:Welcome Brad Verd
Asha Hemrajani:Agree Jonathan - we are not talking about participants, we are talking about members
Asha Hemrajani:good point Alan
Asha Hemrajani:Jonathan - it was important to take the time to get that sorted.
Sylvia Cadena:We said 2 to 5.
Olga Cavalli:The group should remain not too big
Erika Mann:Okay
Sylvia Cadena:+1 to what Marika said, and also agree with Olga that it should not be too big.
Asha Hemrajani:ok with that
Marika Konings:the charter currently foresees that the chartering organizations may appoint a chair to the CCWG (the Board is not a chartering organization)
Olga Cavalli:ok
Sylvia Cadena:Ok with appointing liaisons. It will be good to define such role at the CCWG level
Erika Mann:Since you can't hear me, I can only type. So, let's have Asha moving ahead first
Erika Mann:You can't hear me today
Erika Mann:Correct
Sylvia Cadena:Agree with Jonathan.
Asha Hemrajani:My hand is down - that was an old hand
Asha Hemrajani:agreed - outside of scope
Erika Mann:Exactly, this is outside the scope
Sylvia Cadena:Does the charter mentions that the CCWG needs to come up with the criteria?
Asha Hemrajani:This question came up because the audience at the public forum were not too clear on the 3 phased approach
Sylvia Cadena:Ok
Erika Mann:Outside the scope, agree
Olga Cavalli:ok
Asha Hemrajani:on a separate note, when we have a public forum in Hyderabad, India, we should take pains to clearly explain the 3 phased approach
Sylvia Cadena:I think we mentioned in the charter as one of the considerations for the CCWG to discuss
Asha Hemrajani:ok for me too
Olga Cavalli:agree with Asha

Marika Konings:I believe it is in the DT, but I will review
Marika Konings:in the charter
Marika Konings:not DT
Sylvia Cadena:Yes, I think on the charter we have a list of things to consider, criteria, evaluation etc were there
Asha Hemrajani:yes we do already!
Sylvia Cadena:I think we left it all quite loose because of the fact that the ICANN mission is also being worked out...
Erika Mann:YOu still can't hear me. move on
Asha Hemrajani:I agree that this part needs more fleshing out
Sylvia Cadena:No worries
Erika Mann:CCWG will have to frame and define the scope and goals for the allocation of the fund.
Asha Hemrajani:Steve Crocker had raised this point too. the CCWG should define what the end goals are
Erika Mann:Specific objectives might relate to goals and scope, objectives might be a subset of things to achieve
Asha Hemrajani:+1 Erika
Jonathan Robinson:@Asha, Erica - if we move point to right of colon as answer / DT response, is that satisfactory?
Erika Mann:For me yes, Jonathan
Asha Hemrajani:right of which colon?
Asha Hemrajani:in the notes section?
Asha Hemrajani:Comment 29 - The CCWG will be responsible for choosing the specific objectives and shaping those further. [ACTION: Staff to ensure this is mapped into Charter]
Asha Hemrajani:high level goals
Erika Mann:I agree with Alan, objectives is too narrow
Sylvia Cadena:Ok
Asha Hemrajani:I think this is a misunderstanding
Erika Mann:It's too confusing
Asha Hemrajani:#30
Erika Mann:This should be up to the CCWG to decide ... depends on the real allocation structure that will be setup in the future
Alan Greenberg:No restriction, but we do assume the disbursement will be over a relatively long period.
Erika Mann:Agree with Alan
Sylvia Cadena:I think the DT should state that there will be no restrictions of this kind
Erika Mann:I would separate the two items and not have them in a single sentence
Asha Hemrajani:why not split it into two separate sentences
Asha Hemrajani:exactly Marika!
Asha Hemrajani:I think it was about one time revenue source, not how many times an applicant has applied
Asha Hemrajani:agree with Alan's point - don't use the words "one time funding"
Sylvia Cadena:Ok, if it refers to one time revenue source then it will be ok. One time funding is a different expression, as Alan said
Asha Hemrajani:yes use "revenue source"
Erika Mann:Let's be silent
Sylvia Cadena:The mandate is at the beginning of the charter, about round 1.
Asha Hemrajani:so could we answer in the public comment tool but not put into the charter?

Asha Hemrajani:agree Jonathan
Sylvia Cadena:Ok
Sylvia Cadena:That will be great Marika
Sylvia Cadena:That will certainly make it clear for people that comments were addressed
Asha Hemrajani:Alan, from my notes - yes it was the gentleman from tu cows who brought this up. His name is Elliott?
Sylvia Cadena:Who was the person that made the comment so repetitively?
Marika Konings:Eliott Noss
Marika Konings:comment #36 also talks about one-off process
Sylvia Cadena:round 1, we should clarify that is round 1 (in full)
Sylvia Cadena:agree with Alan
Alan Greenberg:The CCWG, in its wisdom, may decide to use all of the money in one fell swoop!
Asha Hemrajani:yes Alan - the CCWG might give it all to a foundation
Alan Greenberg:I would fight it tooth and nail unless *I* am the recipient
Asha Hemrajani:Really Alan :-)
Alan Greenberg:ok, I will share with a few selected friends
Erika Mann:Agree
Asha Hemrajani:agree 500%!
Sylvia Cadena:Yes please, try to finish the comment tool
Erika Mann:Outside the scope
Asha Hemrajani:this is related to the previous point #30
Asha Hemrajani:a bit connected
Erika Mann:Alan!
Asha Hemrajani:I agree with the principle that the CCWG should have a finite life- again this question came out of ignorance of the 3 phased process
Erika Mann:Can you repeaat Jonathan
Asha Hemrajani:Jonathan, I like your draft answer
Jonathan Robinson:Thanks Asha. @Erica. Please see RHS - draft answer to comment 32
Erika Mann:Wil check
Asha Hemrajani:Comment 32 - DT does expect the CCWG to have a finite life and the CCWG will not be involved in any distribution decisions.
Asha Hemrajani:Erika, I pasted it above for you
Erika Mann:Thanks Asha. I have problem with the right column. Either it's so small that I can't read or I can only see half of the column
Erika Mann:Alan, good point but I would only say that the CCWG should consider and should come up with alternative proposals that should be investigated
Erika Mann:Exactly Asha
Jonathan Robinson:@Asha. Assume income accrues to the fund. Correct?
Erika Mann:Alan, I think we need to discuss this as soon as we have the processes in place.
Alan Greenberg:Just a note to augment the charter after we finish the PC review.
Sylvia Cadena:Agree with Alan
Erika Mann:Asha, let's discuss this with the Board
Erika Mann:Anyone still there???
Sylvia Cadena:I am here Erika
Erika Mann:Hi Sylvia!
Sylvia Cadena:~)
Sylvia Cadena:Maybe to have a diagram that explains? That way people might actually get it, as they might not read the whole charter

Erika Mann:It's a bit deeper this point. It says that criterias for the expected results should be setup.
Agree with what Alan is saying.

Asha Hemrajani:Sylvia, we did have a diagram at helsinki.

Sylvia Cadena:On 34 the DT can add to the list of things to consider for the CCWG what are the minimum outcomes for accountability

Sylvia Cadena:The PPT was a lot of text, not very clear. At least the one I saw before

Asha Hemrajani:but our thoughts were not that mature yet on this, but now they have formed up more. So for Hyderabad, we can have clearer material

Asha Hemrajani:sylvia, have a look at diagrams that marika added - you can ask her later

Sylvia Cadena:On 34 the DT can add to the list of things to consider for the CCWG what are the minimum outcomes for accountabilit

Sylvia Cadena:Is important to define a minimum

Asha Hemrajani:I agree with your proposed answer to #35

Sylvia Cadena:Agree Jonatahn, on diversity

Asha Hemrajani:jonathan, could we go back to #34

Sylvia Cadena:I also commented on #34. On 34 the DT can add to the list of things to consider for the CCWG what are the minimum outcomes for accountability

Sylvia Cadena:There are different outcomes depending on different projects, so for the CCWG can define what a minimum will be to compare all the different ones

Erika Mann:I recommend not to do this, these kind of things need more time to think through and it depends how much risk one would be willing to take.

Sylvia Cadena:That is not set from the start. That is based on each grant

Erika Mann:I agree with Sylvia

Asha Hemrajani:yes good point - Sylvia. I was referring to success of the funding, not individual projects

Asha Hemrajani:Jonathan, give us some time to mull over this a bit more

Alan Greenberg:This is a WELL established process.

Alan Greenberg:established

Alan Greenberg:We are nowhere near the first group to give away money with specific aims in mind.

David Tait:Jonathan just to clarify I've used the term 'grants' to make clear this is distinct from the stewarding function of the funds.

Sylvia Cadena:ok

Asha Hemrajani:open to another date

Alan Greenberg:I should be available to chair if needed. But Joanthan's wisdom is always helpful.

Sylvia Cadena:It will be great to have the comments asap, so that we can make progress on the charter

Asha Hemrajani:I have difficulty for 24th also

Erika Mann:Okay

Alan Greenberg:Good meeting

Erika Mann:Thanks!

Sylvia Cadena:Thank you all ::)

Asha Hemrajani:Excellent progress Jonathan, well done!

Asha Hemrajani:Thank you all