TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

YEŞIM NAZLAR:	Sure, certainly. I'll go ahead and start the recording now.
	Good morning, good afternoon and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the At-Large capacity building program 2016, our sixth webinar of 2016, on the topic, ccTLD managers and registrars, what is the impact on new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?
	Held on Wednesday 15th of June, 2016 at 20:00 UTC.
	We'll not be doing a roll call, as it's a webinar, but if I could please remind all participants on the bridge as well as computers to mute your speakers and microphones, and state your name when speaking not only for the transcript purposes, but to allow our interpreters to identify you on the other language channels.
	We have English, Spanish, and French interpretation. Thank you for joining. I'll now turn it back over to our moderator, Tijani Ben Jemaa, chair of the capacity building working group. Thank you very much. Tijani, over to you.
TIJANI BEN JEMAA:	Thank you very much Yeşim. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening everyone. This is the sixth webinar in the At-Large capacity working group series of webinars for the first semester of 2016. Today we'll address the topic on the new gTLDs on ccTLD registration and growth.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

And the, if you want to know more from the ccTLD managers and the registrants about this [inaudible]. Our speakers today are Edmon Chung, who is one of our community, used to be in the ALAC. And he's still working with us. He is, I think, the CEO of dot [Asia]. And Edmon will start by making his presentation, but before doing that, I will give the floor to Yeşim for some housekeeping. Yeşim.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Thank you very much. This is Yeşim speaking. Let's take a quick [inaudible] housekeeping presentation, now currently displaying on the screen. We'll have a question and answer pod during the webinar. If you have any questions, we do encourage you to type it in the question and answer pod. And staff will note your questions and they will be answered by the presenters.

We also have a pop quiz section and we'll have four questions after the speaker's presentation. Please be ready to answer the questions [inaudible], and finally we will have a user experience part. There will be a seven question survey at the end of the webinar, please try to stay around for two, three minutes to complete them, and [inaudible] so you can see that the question answer pod will be on the bottom side of the AC room.

And the pop quiz and the evaluation questions will be displayed on the middle right hand of the AC room. Over to you Tijani, thank you very much.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you Yeşim for this housekeeping announcement. And now the floor is yours, Edmon.

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you Tijani. And welcome everyone to the webinar. I will, as Tijani mentioned, will talk a little bit about the impact on ccTLDs in terms of the launch of new gTLDs. Currently, Andres is not with us yet. I was hoping that he would kick start the discussion today, more of a quantitative aspect, and I was going to focus a little bit more on the qualitative aspect. But in any case, I'll get started.

So, just in terms of, this is just two slides I will talk a little bit about numbers in terms of the direct impact. The general growth of domain registration, since the new gTLDs has been positive. As you can see from the chart, actually in the last year or so, the number of new registrations coming in from new gTLDs have reached about 20 million, a little bit more than 20 million new names.

So it is a reasonably significant number, considering that the total number of domains registered around the world is about 300 million, that represents close to 10% mark, which is a reason for us to see that there is interest in the new gTLDs. What is interesting though, is if you look at the new gTLDs, most of the top 10 is coming from what is called ASCII TLDs, which is alpha-numeric TLDs.

But there is actually one which is standing at number 10, which is an IDN from China. But that is not to say that actually part of the top 10, actually three or four of them, are actually based in China and in Asia,

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

and a lot of registrations are coming from Asia. So this is one theme I think is very interesting, especially coming from dot Asia.

And as I explained, actually much of the, what I want to talk about is as a comparison with the dot Asia experience. So one, and that will remain a, you know, come back to as a recurring theme. So building on that, actually, if you look at the distribution among registrars, you would see that the top, out of the top 10 registrars by volume for new gTLDs, it's just registering new TLDs, actually six out of the top 10 that is actually coming from Asia.

And the majority of it is China and then India and Japan. These represent a few of the bigger areas where new gTLDs are being adopted. And if you look at the percentage, actually, the percentage of the volume in terms of new gTLDs registered, is actually coming about half of which is coming, or at least half of which, some statistics have it a little bit further as well, coming from Asia and especially from China, India, and Japan, as I mentioned.

So this is a very rough idea of what's the numeric of which. But I, as I started the presentation, I was hoping that Andres will cover a little bit more, because I understand that they actually do more of that study. But I'll move quickly to some of the observations really from dot Asia and how we're seeing.

If you look at it in comparison with ccTLDs, for example, dot CN or dot AP, or dot TW, or number of especially Asian ccTLDs, there is no observed impact of, especially negative impact on the registration numbers. So with all of the growth from the new gTLDs, it doesn't

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

mean it's taking away registrations from ccTLDs. The growth rate, is that shrinking? Some of the TLDs have expressed some concerns when new gTLDs are launched.

Right after the launch period easily, we creates, turn to a steady state. And overall, the growth rate is still relatively stable. Especially when you look at, I guess, some powerhouses like that at the end. In fact, there is an observed growth alongside new gTLDs and new gTLD registrations as well. But if you look at more stable powerhouses right, of say like dot JP or dot AU, they remain relatively stable. So I don't have the exact numbers here, but it's quite easy to take a quick look at the statistics that dot JP or dot AU or dot CN offers, and you will able to see that the development is relatively stable and new gTLDs has not really, at least not have a negative impact.

What that really means is a net growth of the domain marketplace, and also a very interesting development in terms of what the market itself is actually absorbing. And now I turn to some qualitative observations, and what actually changed. So even though saying that the numbers, or the domain registrations and trends, remain relatively stable as new gTLDs are introduced, the market dynamics have changed significantly. That is, our observation, and here are four areas that we at dot Asia has kind of consolidated into, in terms of the most significant changes in the domain name marketspace, as new gTLDs are being introduced.

The registrar itself shelf space, and storefront evolution, how registrars actually placed the products and offer the products, TLD products for sale, that has changed significantly. How registrars do promotion and

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

the attention span that registrars can give each particular TLD, that has changed. In the past, there were just about 20 gTLDs and about 200 ccTLDs, but today we're looking at over 1,000 gTLDs. And if you just calculate the number of days in the year, it's easy to understand that particular dynamic.

And then an area is about registrar accreditations, many more resellers or agents, in terms of the new gTLD market, are becoming registrars. And that allows the registry or in this case, I kind of like the producer, to have better connection with the market and better connection with the registrants, tide a relationship with it rather than multiple layers, and that has led to the fourth area, which is the registry engagement in actual marketing programs.

But the type of marketing programs that registries are now engaged in. And I'll go into each of these points separately as well. So, in terms of the registrar shelf space, one of the most market changes is before the new gTLD program, a lot of the registrars have drop down boxes that are check boxes for top level domains, or domains that, or registries for those products that are for sell, that is because the list is relatively defined, and doesn't change so much over time.

And also because it's a reasonably small list. That has changed, because as I mentioned, there is over 1,000 new gTLDs, at least a few hundred, that is offered for open registration. That has led to more, much more of a search for, approach. So rather than type the name that you want and pick the TLD, it's no longer that user experience. The registrant experience is much more type in the name you think you want, or type

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

the keywords you think you want, and then the TLDs will be supplied to you, based on the registrar's suggestion. Or if you type the TLD and of course, as part of the search.   Another interesting development is beyond the drop down boxes and checkboxes for the TLD, TLDs are now being grouped into categories, by geographic region, and by the type, by succession, and sometimes also be trending keywords.

And that's a very interesting development in terms of how the registrant experiences the whole process of domain registration. That's one of the things that is very interesting to observe as well, as the registrar storefront and shelf space evolve. And this has impact not just on the first entry of the domain for registration, but also whether it's available and whether there are additional suggestions of alternative domains, if that particular name is not available.

So that whole process is now quite, much more elaborate than previous, a lot of additional big data development is happening, see what trends are being used to provide suggestions, relevance of TLDs based on the keywords that is being submitted, is also being evaluated before the registrar suggests the TLD or the domain to be registered.

So that area has gone through a significant change, and that leads also to, as I have already mentioned, the advertising or the promotion of TLDs, integrated very much into the search results of domain availability check. Not only the different TLDs, but also the keywords representing the relevance between the TLDs is being used.

The other thing, as I mentioned also earlier, is the timespan, the attention span that registrars can afford for each particular TLD. In the

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

past, registrars may be able to work with ccTLDs or gTLDs in a much closer fashion, in a longer period of time, two months, three months promotion periods, or even half a year promotion period, that is becoming less and less of a situation.

There may be a two week window of work that goes on, if it doesn't work, another TLD comes in as a promotion. That is a very different and much more dynamic marketplace that we have seen in the past. So these are some of the things that are being, is changing over time.

Another part that is significantly changing in the last few years as new gTLDs are launched, is the number of accredited registrars. And we observed it kind of first hand at dot Asia. Just a few years ago, we were standing at about 150 accredited registrars for dot Asia, in the last few years, has grown to 250, that's close, running upon… We were not through 2016 yet, but we're looking at probably doubling that amount in this year, in terms of number of registrars.

And the impact of that is that many of these newly accredited registrars used to be resellers of registrars, which the registry doesn't touch directly, and is unable to provide directly promotion materials, promotion programs, but that has changed and that is also going to be a similar… We expect that to be a similar situation for ccTLDs as well.

Another interesting development which is tied into some of the statistics that I mentioned is the growth from Asia. And again, I turn to the dot Asia experience here, from the last few years we've seen a significant group from all around Asia, and of course China and India leading the way in terms of volume just because of the share size, but

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

also Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore, Vietnam, and some of these developing regions is picking up speed.

And we believe this is part of the fundamentals of domain registration, which essentially are small medium sized businesses, looking to get online. And this is… And just for example, taking India as an example, there are more than 10 million small and medium sized businesses, whereas about half a million has their own website. That represents a lot of interest to new gTLDs and also ccTLDs for that matter.

And now, one of the core areas that we have observed in terms of the change in behavior, or the impact of how registries actually behave or act in the marketplace, is how registries engage in more direct marketing programs. And some of these are actually, again, firsthand experience from dot Asia, what we first launched, we pioneered a number of these programs, which at that time seemed to be a little bit crazy, some of the, our predecessors we say, why would you even think of trying to get a celebrity to use a dot Asia domain?

How does that help domain registration volume? But that has proven to be something that many more new gTLDs are looking to try, and that is becoming a trend. And not only celebrities, but also pioneer, pioneering usage of domains, having foundational usage of the new TLD, are programs that are very important for establishing the actual use of the new gTLD.

Now we're seeing that being used by more and more TLDs, and that is some of the programs, like the Pioneer Domains Program I mentioned, like working with celebrities. Dot Asia for example, when we launched,

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

we worked with Jackie Chan, we worked Donnie N. and some of the celebrities. We continue to support the Asian Film Awards to connect with the celebrities because they are influencers in the marketplace, and that's also a very important part, that new gTLDs, which has a marketing program, is adopting, so dot club, dot…

Many other new gTLDs are using these type of strategies. Live featuring live domains, dot Asia has been very good at featuring some case studies like Corona, when they used Corona dot Asia, like Johnny Walker when they launch a regional campaign, and Keep Walking dot Asia. We feature and highlight those, and that is some of the things that new gTLDs have done.

And I think this is going to trickle down to other registries as well, especially growing ccTLDs, these are strategies that conventionally the other TLDs have not been utilizing, but in the future, we can see that more and more TLDs will start to use. And that really brings down to the kind of positioning, the market positioning, and how the market sees the value of a TLD.

Dot Asia, when we started and as we go through, has been very keen on focusing on that as a value proposition, whereas in the past, when dot com, or others much more generic extensions, have usually depended on the registrar channel for very generic pushing of a name. Right now, more and more registries are positioning the value proposition much more closely.

Another very interesting development, especially in the last year or so, is the use of mascots, and well, dot Asia, we also pioneered [inaudible]

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

tiger, but also recently, dot club, a little monkey, dot [inaudible] with a little guy, and of course, earlier with dot co with a pig, flying pig. And one of the observations is that because the top level domain often is very much tangible product.

Sometimes having a mascot will help. And what is interesting to observe also, I have this in the middle, is to see ICANN going [cute?] as well, looking at the ICANN Helsinki [inaudible] form, deciding to use a few nice, little, cute icon characters. And that seems to also be part of the direction domain industry as well, going younger, and going into start up, and more exciting, and fun area of the marketplace, more on the consumer marketplace, if you will.

And just not really sidetracking, but just highlighting a little bit our own [inaudible]. He's actually representing dot Asia, of course, but also representing a cause for sustainable development, and the doubling of wild tiger, in fact, tiger conservation, and what people may know that tigers are being endangered. What people probably didn't know is that the internet has become the number one threat to wild tigers and many wildlife, because most of the illegal trade is happening online.

People paying through bitcoin and having a few clicks, and then the wildlife product sent to the doorstep. And this is one of the areas where we are contributing to in terms of supporting the policy and the technology to stop that. But that also ties into the dot Asia branding, and this is also part of the mascot, or the character, PR character idea, which are so many other registries are adopting.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

So [inaudible] is of course, running around, going to different events, and going through to different areas to promote dot Asia and his cause, but much more importantly, sustainable development. And the sustainable development area actually ties quite nicely into new gTLDs, and the reason why is especially on the provision of choice, and providing the, especially on the IDNs, multilingual and multicultural community that the SVG sustainable development goals from the United Nations is about.

And that's what [inaudible] is about, and in fact, [inaudible] has been going to the ICANN meetings, especially on the UASD. And this brings me to the last item that I think is very important in terms of the impact of new gTLDs, and that is what we call universal acceptance. Because this is an area we gTLDs create and issue, but also create an impact to us all.

The issue of universal acceptance is not just about internationalized domain names, or Chinese, or Japanese, or Korean domain names, but also about different extensions that are being introduced. To accept, validate, store, process, and display them properly, across all applications. Some of the databases, some of the web applications may choke on new top level domains, especially internationalized domain names.

And this is an issue that we are all a part of, especially because the future is not just about English domain names, but also about the different languages as well. And most importantly, is how these new TLDs, or how these domains are being used. Some people question

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

whether IDNs or different language domain names are actually being used. It has been introducing to the internet for almost over 10 years. Yes, today still, we don't see a lot of people typing in IDNs or multilingual domain names, but when you think about search, in fact, everyone searches, you know, in China, in Japan, in Korea.

I would hardly think that anybody searches in English, everyone searches in their own native language, and that has impact on domain names as domain names are being used for search engine optimization. And that is going to be an important aspect of new gTLDs as well. And again, when we talk about IDNs, we can't miss one of the aspect, which is mobile, and the audio input, especially voice input, people say that, you know, regular internet users are comfortable with typing in English alpha-numeric domain names, but when you speak into phone, hardly, if you're Chinese, or Japanese, or if you are speaking Arabic, you would hardly think of speaking to your phone in English or spelling out a domain name in English, rather than speaking in your own native language.

And speaking about mobile, some people say that domain names overall is no longer relevant as new gTLDs introduce apps are really taking over the usage of navigation, but surely, how many apps are you going to be able to put on one phone? 50? 500? Let say 1,000 apps, but there are many more companies or services than 1,000 or 5,000 apps can provide.

So domain names still provide a direct navigation, especially when you put apps and HTLM 5 in some of the emerging technologies together,

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

you will see that every app, in fact, behind every app, is a domain name. So that's one of the areas that, as we look at new gTLDs, another aspect for that is important for ccTLDs is also the changing landscape and the changing applications for domain names.

One of which, I think, I'm especially excited about, is the Internet of Things. Here again, when you name somebody, when you name a company, perhaps an English alpha-numeric like IBM, or BMW will suffice, but when you're naming your own prints, when you're naming your own oven, more likely you're going to use your own native language.

So the relevance for this is not just about new gTLDs, it is relevant also to ccTLDs, especially as new IDN and ccTLDs are being introduced. And the most important part is that universal acceptance itself is really about consumer trust, and we're all in this together, ccTLDs and gTLDs, because if we lose the trust of consumers, from these new TLDs, it will affect the older TLDs as well, it will affect the ccTLDs, it will affect the people, the consumer's trust in the whole domain name system.

And this is why universal acceptance and making sure that systems and applications can take in new gTLDs is going to be very important. And so, I summarize, a few areas, I think, four areas, I think, that is, have, are going to be a, for important impact of that, that new gTLDs have made in terms of the domain marketplace. One of which, just to summarize the shelf space, the promotion attention, the storefront, how people, how registrants interact with registration system, that's one area.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

The number of registrar accreditation and the channel expansion, that leads into how registries can connect more closely with registrants and resellers. And that leads to the third area, which is registries engaging much more intimately into consumer marketing programs, and how registries encouraging new domain applications. And finally, a very important impact is universal acceptance.

More and more, this is becoming an issue, and this is an issue that we must work together to solve, because it will affect every one of the TLDs together. But ultimately, I think, when we talk about new gTLDs, or ccTLDs, any type of domain names, it is really more than just a navigational tool or command line on the internet today. Domain names are a strategic asset, or a strategic value, how your network is built, how the domain names is structured.

It needs to be part of the strategy technically, marketing, and also administratively and legally. So the domain name marketplace is much more than just the technology now, and most important of all, it's about identities that connect with people. And I still believe that this is the core value of domain names, and whether ccTLDs or new gTLDs, or any type of domains, this is what the DNS is about, it's about connecting people with internet identities.

And with that, that closes my presentation. And just as a little bit of note, dot Asia, we talked a lot about the market aspects that we are actually a non-profit organization, and all the dot Asia domain names contributes to internet development and adoption in Asia, which is our core mandate. Thank you.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much Edmon for this great presentation. Since Andres didn't join us, I will open the floor for questions. Are there questions for Edmon?

Otherwise, I have one. It's not a question, it's more of a [comment]. Edmon, [inaudible] dot [cat?] for [inaudible], was delegated, the registration of dot ES, it didn't [decrease]. On the contrary, they announced a slight [inaudible] of the CS. This was for dot [inaudible], for [inaudible]. Is it the same for dot Asia, the ccTLDs in your country, in your region?

Is that there is not a negative effect, but is there any effect? Did you remark that there is an evolution in the other direction, for example? Edmon?

Have we lost Edmon?

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Hi Edmon, Yeşim Nazlar speaking. We cannot hear you at the moment, maybe you are muted?

EDMON CHUNG: Try to unmute, let me…

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Perfect, we can hear you.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EDMON CHUNG: Hello?

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Yeah, we can hear you now, Edmon. Please go ahead.

EDMON CHUNG: All right. Thank you Tijani. I was hoping that Andres would give us a lot more information on a more qualitative analysis, quantitative analysis, sorry. On an anecdotal situation, what we have seen is that there is usually a positive impact on awareness. Just I think the aspect of introducing, what is called introducing competition, but really, at this particular stage of new gTLDs, it's hard to say that it is very directly competing with dot com, but in terms of awareness, it has helped a lot, both for ccTLDs and for later gTLDs, if you will, like dot Asia or dot [patch?] that you mentioned.

And the experience from dot Asia is similar, all of the other ccTLDs are actually growing. And I mentioned a little bit about the new gTLDs situation in China. If you had heard about the huge growth, especially in China, since late last year, that has been driven by some of the new gTLD promotions programs, and we are seeing also dot [CN] growing very healthily, alongside all of that as well.

So far the anecdotal evidence, at least, is that it is growing in tandem, rather than a cannibalizing product at this time.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

Hello?

I do see Olivier and Alberto's hand up. But either people are not hearing me, or I'm not hearing the room.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Hi Edmon, this is Yeşim speaking. Tijani, you are currently muted, I believe.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, I am sorry. Sorry, I was muted. I was speaking to myself. So thank you Edmon for your answer. And I give the floor to Olivier. Olivier, go ahead please.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Tijani. Olivier Crépin-Leblond speaking. I missed part of the webinar, and I'm really sad about it. But I did have a couple of questions on these things, which goes along the lines of the question that was asked just before.

First the effect of the new gTLDs on the current country codes, or the previous set of country codes, that were there. There are two things. First, there is, of course, the internationalized domain names which have come out. So you have non-Latin scripts that are now being offered. And I wasn't quite aware of how are the Latin scripts received with…

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

I mean, when you have a country code that is in a non-Latin script, so for example, for China, dot CN would be in Chinese script, does this fall under as ccTLD, as a country code top level domain? Or is this seen as a generic top level domain? And has this effected the scales of the Latin scripts when you're looking at a very targeted audience? That was one.

The second question that I had, and I'll ask them both here so Edmon can choose to answer them, is when you have a country code top level domain registry, that then starts engaging in running generic top level domains, how does it affect their relationship with ICANN? And does it actually affect their relationship in the country code name supporting organization world as well or not?

I hope that you've heard it all. Thank you.

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you Olivier. Those are very interesting questions, indeed. I'll touch on each of them. First of all, you mentioned the G versus CC, I think the IDN ccTLDs are considered ccTLDs, so dot China or dot Thailand would be considered a ccTLD under the ICANN context. There is an ongoing work in terms of geographic names, country names, and how that will be dealt with in the future, on two fronts.

Right now, we have the fast track of IDN ccTLDs, and then we have the process of the IDN ccTLDs, which is almost finished. And then thirdly, we have the country names, longer country names, which is being considered in a different Wiki group. But at the moment, all the ones that are delegated are considered IDN ccTLDs, as far as I understand.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

In terms of the, guess, you were asking the market impact of IDN ccTLDs within their local market, that's very interesting. The last I looked at some of the statistics, the IDN version represents about 4% to 10% at most, of the volume of domain registration. So that's a relatively small numeric amount at this particular point, in terms of percentage amount at this point.

The third question is, I guess, [inaudible] in the sense that how it, how it effects the, when a ccTLD engages and implements or operates a gTLD, how does that effect the ICANN structure, if you will? That's, to me, it touches on a few things. First of all, in terms of the strict direct regulations, whether there are any type of restrictions for the same entity being in different supporting organizations, or different constituencies, there is for, I believe, with the GNSO there is some of the constituencies do have restrictions on whether you are already the same entity represented in different constituency or different stakeholder groups.

But if you're talking about across supporting organizations, not to my knowledge is there any restrictions at this point, so the same entity could be in the GNSO, in the ccNSO and in the ASO. And that leads to a very interesting question for ICANN and the general internet governance multistakeholder approach, which is the blurring of the lines between stakeholder groups in this case, especially in the case of new gTLDs.

As these gTLDs expand and grow, the program is not expected to just stop here in the first round. As we grow, the lines will continue to blur,

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

not only between ccTLDs and gTLDs, but also governments. There are GAC entities that are operating gTLD registries, and representative of the GNSO. How would that effect the entire ecosystem within ICANN?

I think that's something that is probably beyond this particular webinar, but it's definitely something interesting to watch, and be participating in.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you Edmon. Next speaker, next question is from Alberto Soto. Alberto, go ahead.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto speaking. Good morning, good evening, good afternoon. Do you make any analysis with respect to the new gTLD? I mean, in the end, you're making a… speaking about one exclusive gTLD, the adoption of [inaudible] in Spanish. We have a lot of information about inner-cooperation throughout Europe, I think, and they found out that certain [inaudible] were sold, etc. and so on.

So lots of that [inaudible] to that. Isn't that a motivation so that we may analyze the impact of that because a gTLD has not been approved, like dot health? Thank you very much.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Edmon?

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you for the question Alberto. It's a very difficult question, I guess. If I got it correctly from the interpretation, you're talking about some of the TLDs that have a lot of information, or malicious activity, or siding on unethical activity. It brings me to one of the early days of the internet, when some people say the internet is only used for porn.

Well, you know, maybe the porn industry did help the internet grow, but as we see it today, we're pretty sure that is just a very short period of time, and whether it even existed is questionable. When we look at some of the problems that come out from new gTLDs, the more I would say that there are a number of reasons for it.

One, with the new gTLDs there is an eagerness to lower the price, and you know, that lowers the barrier of entry for more questionable activities. The other is that it's obviously a whole new world for expansion, and yes, you know, the attention would often be put on controversial issues, and it is being, I guess, amplified a little bit more.

But what is important, I think, is two aspects, one of which is a policy aspect. And I think ICANN and the ICANN community, should think more thoroughly about how registries are to monitor and regulate. I hate to use these two words, but there is importance in how we do that and how we go about it, in a way not to infringe on privacy and freedom of expression, and all of those other issues.

But if we just say that it's unregulated, that it's not really doing the community a service, that's my personal view on that. The other aspect is to look at the actual, the real benefits for small, medium sized

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

businesses, the new applications that are being used with these new gTLDs, and highlight those positive usage as well.

I often, new technologies come with more spicy, if you will, activities to start off with, but it is important for us to look at the positive benefits that will, I believe, ultimately outweigh the malicious activities in the beginning. But in order to do that, policies need to be concise and also need to pinpoint where, to strike the balance to provide an environment that the new technologies and new uses can emerge. That's my feeling.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much Edmon. And before giving the floor to Harold, in answering the question of Olivier, you said that steady operator, that means [inaudible] list of ICANN, [inaudible] something that may disturb [inaudible] the structure of ICANN, because in the community and those [CROSSTALK]…

INTERPRETER: Alberto Soto wishes to speak…

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I will give him the floor… I finish, and I will give him the floor. Sorry for that. So, I tell you Edmon that ICANN is actually now, creating registers with that, and at the same time, operating ccTLDs. And [inaudible] for people in several stakeholders in ICANN, if something that is used today,

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

and if it is an actual problem that we need to address some day. Thank you. So, Alberto for a follow-up question.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto speaking. Thank you very much Tijani. With respect to what I was talking about, dot [shelf], and I will give you an example of a gTLD, it doesn't matter the name, but the regulation, requirement, conditions, whatever the name, would just to prevent and diminish certain malicious activities. Dot [Tur], T-U-R, with respect to [inaudible], does registered with a national organization.

I'm talking about local level, it is a national organization at country level, may be able to use this dot [TUR], so there was malicious activities related to [inaudible] will not perform. Of course, dot health is much more complex than dot [TUR], but it doesn't matter the term we use. I don't like to say regulation, I don't like to use the word conditions, but we should implement something like that because the implementation of this gTLD, the delegation of this type of gTLD, will prevent the death of people around the world. Thank you very much.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Edmon, any comment?

EDMON CHUNG: Yeah, I think that's a very good observation. And this is a matter, I think, very important for the next round of new gTLDs, when we think about whether there should be certain categories. We have shied away

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

from what we call [inaudible], but the marketplace, I kind of made that emphasis earlier, and the policy space, I think would require us to take a deeper look into whether we want, you know, we need to categorize them, and provide better policies around them to encourage positive use.

So I think I agree with Alberto, how, but the question is, how do we actually implement it in the future rounds?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much. Harold, you have the floor.

Is Harold speaking?

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Hi Tijani, this is Yeşim speaking. Our Spanish interpreters says that she cannot hear him either. [CROSSTALK]

INTERPRETER: We do hear Harold now.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, go ahead please.

HAROLD ARCOS: Okay, thank you. Thank you Tijani, thank you very much Edmon for your presentation. In your presentation, you said that there was 123

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

registrars, or something around that figure. Can you please tell me your experience, if you have make any projection of the growth in the market? Or if there may be that you have foreseen something, or if there is any feeling based on the demand there maybe, is there any feeling for the possible member of the registrars?

And do you think…? Or how do you think will be the impact of the gTLD, regarding the available registrars so far? And another question. Who would have, or who will be responsible for that market?

EDMON CHUNG: Edmon here. Thank you for that question. The accreditation process is actually done by ICANN, and in terms of each registry, in the case studies, for example, then each of the registrars need to be first accredited by ICANN. So for particular, each registry is what the, the number of ICANN can accredit in time.

In those, the overall market size, I think right now there are a few thousand registrars at ICANN and, but in terms of [inaudible], it's hard to describe that way, I guess. And it depends on the continuing evolving evolution of the market space. For one, in this round, we have decoupled the requirement for registry and registrar separation, so some of the registries are also registrars, whereas in the past, that was not the case.

With that in mind, you know, if each of the registries become its own registrar, then that number can further increase. So, I don't think, at this point, any… Of course, there is a feeling in terms, and that's

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

regulated, that's probably determined by the market size of the internet overall, and but I'm not sure the motivation question, but in terms of the regulation of the accreditation for gTLDs, and new gTLDs of course, that is done by ICANN.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much Edmon. Olivier, you have a new question.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much Tijani. Olivier Crépin-Leblond speaking. And I have another questions which is often asked, I often hear it asked by people who register domain names, and then they have a problem when they renew it, or they living in a country where they would like to get a domain name, and their local country top level domain, and then there are restrictions about who can register, perhaps only corporations are only able to register under the local country code, or perhaps the annual cost is prohibitive for locals.

And there seems to be some confusion in users as to, and of course, we know what the difference is between generic top level domain, and a country code top level domain. But there seems to be some confusion, and often the question is, you know, where do I go to? Who do I ask? Because our domain names at home are way too expensive, there are three times the average price out there.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

Is there any way to help them into understanding this? Or I don't know, this is some sort of question that is being asked, and it's not a very clear question, but it touches on a number of things.

And I wondered if Edmon had any thoughts about this?

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you Olivier. Certainly, it's a tough question, and it's a very real question for consumers and for registrants, and for small meetings like mom and pop business that just want to get online and have a presence online. Right now, I think the, you touch actually on a few aspects of it, G versus cc, and in the policy space around it.

In general, I would say that this is kind of the market activity, and we should leave it a little bit more to the markets and registrars, or the ones that would provide the information, and the local registrars, I think that represents an opportunity for taking on new customers. The question then goes to what ICANN or what the ICANN community should do? And whether there have been talks about even good registrar fields, for example, or where to go for information, more definitive information.

I think there is only so much that ICANN really can do in terms of an authoritative aspect for it, but definitely there is space just a little bit like… You know, I don't want to confuse the matter, but a little bit like the UASG, the Universal Acceptance issue, where ICANN can support the effort, and have the industry come together and work on the topic itself.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

Maybe this is something that is interesting to have ICANN put its resources and networks into, but not led by ICANN, but led by the industry and the market, to provide relevant information for local registrants, such as which registrars are actually operating in that area, the choices they have.

Of course, there is definitive data at ICANN, but it's not often easy to find in the most user friendly way for the mom and pop shops. So, some more down to earth kind of information may be interesting in how we advocate that out to the consumer and registrant level. Probably not the direct purview of ICANN, but definitely shouldn't be eliminated from consideration for ICANN to fund a response, or be part of a market industry initiative to build. That would be my answer.

I don't know whether it's the right direction that you were asking, but that was what I felt from your question.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much Edmon for your answer. Are there any other questions?

I don't see any hands. So perhaps I will give the floor to Yeşim to go to the pop quiz. So Yeşim.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Tijani, Olivier has just raised his hand.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Olivier, go ahead. Sorry.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much Tijani. It's Olivier Crépin-Leblond speaking. And I'm sorry I had another question here, but while we have Edmon on the line, I thought I'd ask this as well. He mentioned earlier the concept of universal acceptance, and I noted in the chat that some of the new gTLDs, generic top level domains, sorry, have not, well have been a bit lax in the way that they register things.

They might have had some policies that ended up causing spam, and malware, and so on, but that's just only one segment of it. Obviously, there is the technical side of it when it comes down to having internationalized domain names, that would be able to work in [inaudible].

But the third, what is it? The third aspect, I guess, of this is the search engine placements. Are these searches with generic top level domains coming before the searches with country code top level domains? Is there no difference between them? Is there a precedence with regards to the internationalized domain name as well? In general?

And I'm well aware that there is more than just one search engine, although most people just think there is just one search engine out there. But in general, with the different search engines out there, what has the reception been like? And is there any work going on there? Thank you.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you Olivier. Edmon?

EDMON CHUNG: Yeah, thank you for the question. I think it's a very, again, a very good question and difficult question. Of course, personally, I'm not an expert in search engines, but what I do understand is, well the search algorithms change over time, and it's pretty dynamic.   What is important for search engines is to try to find the most relevant content for the user and the search for certain keywords.

Domain names continue to be used as part of that algorithm because it's much more likely, you know, register a domain basketball dot Asia, it would be a little bit about basketball in Asia, right? So search engines depend on the domain name as part of the content, in fact.

And that's what is interesting, but going back to, in terms of ranking and everything, I think the bigger emphasis is on the actual content, not the, rather than domain name, first, but if everything is equal, then the domain provides an advantage, if the domain is relevant to the search term, and relevant to the content that is being presented at the particular site.

And that goes with the TLD. I think, from what I understand, search engines look in them together. They're part of the content and part of names, so that's from what I understand. And your earlier question about spam and technology and universal acceptance, certainly, there

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

are challenges to the new gTLDs. As mentioned, you know, some of the new gTLDs, especially investors and commercial open TLDs, sometimes have pressure to have more registrations, and they lower the price, and some of the malicious activities come in at a lower barrier.

What is important is the ICANN community continue to be vigilant on the policies on two areas, I mean, two aspects. One, yes we want to be protective, but on the other hand, we don't want to be too protective. Sometimes what is considered malicious, may actually be a new technology, an IDN and universal acceptance is a good example.

Some of the spam filters actually filters out IDN email addresses, or internationalized email addresses, thinking that they're somewhat malicious and wants to attack. So, sometimes we look at these issues in terms of policy and how we implement it, it's very difficult to draw a bright line on it.

And at this point in the development of new gTLDs, I would error towards innovation a little bit more than protection at this time. And I guess that's my personal advice on that.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much Edmon. Any other questions?

[Inaudible] someone has both telephone and Adobe Connect open.

Yeşim, can you please [inaudible] mute, yes please, make the operator mute the source of [the interference]. Okay, I think it was… No, still there is an echo.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

YEŞIM NAZLAR: [Inaudible]

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, Yeşim you have the floor to put up the pop quiz, please.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Thank you very much Tijani. This is Yeşim Nazlar. We do have some pop quiz questions for you. I'll now go ahead and read them. The first question is, how many at the current 10 gTLD of the registrars high volume, are based in Asia? It is 3, 4, 5, 6, or 7? Please cast your votes now.

We have, yeah, okay. We have more votes coming. And Edmon, would you like to tell us the correct answer please?

EDMON CHUNG: So based on the NTLD stats that I just looked at this morning, it should be six.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Thank you very much. The correct answer is B, it's six. Let's move on to the second question quickly. The second question is, what are some of the new developments in registrar [inaudible]? A, TLD checkboxes; B, TLD categories; or C, TLD drop box. Please cast your vote now.

Not receiving any votes. Okay. They are coming.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

	And Edmon, you would like to give us the correct answer for this one as well?
TIJANI BEN JEMAA:	Edmon?
EDMON CHUNG:	Sorry, I forgot to unmute. But also, I apologize, I probably didn't write the answers properly for this question. I should say gTLD categories. Of course, there has always been categories between gTLDs and ccTLDs that there is less of a categorization TLDs into different professions and stuff. That was the original question, but probably I should refine the question rather than saying the original suggestion, the original intent was for B to be the answer, but I can understand why a lot of people put A. [CROSSTALK]
YEŞIM NAZLAR:	I'll move onto the third question. Third question is, is there a substantial impact on ccTLD registration numbers as new gTLDs are launched? It's a yes or no question, please cast your votes now. And the correct answer, Edmon, is?

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

EDMON CHUNG: So no, that's correct. And that has been quite consistent across the board in terms of the experience.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Thank you very much Edmon. We quickly move on to the next question here. It will be our last pop quiz question. Okay, here you are. What is universal acceptance about? Web accessibility features; internet connectivity and digital divide; accept, validate, store, [inaudible] display names and email addresses in all applications; or is it the register resolve and renew domain names? Please cast your votes now.

And the correct answer, Edmon, is?

EDMON CHUNG: Yeah, so universal acceptance is accept, validate, store, and display all domains and email addresses properly in the applications. So yeah, I think everyone got it correct.

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Perfect. Tijani, would you like me to continue with the survey questions, or would you like to take the floor?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes please, go ahead.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

YEŞIM NAZLAR: Sure, thank you very much. For our first question survey, how was the timing of the webinar for you? Too early, just right, too late? Please cast your votes now.

Thank you very much for your vote. I'll now move onto our second question. The second question is, what region do you live in at the moment? Africa, Asia, [inaudible], America and Caribbean Islands, or North America? Please cast your votes now.

Thank you for your vote. Let's move onto our third question. How many years of experience do you have in the ICANN community? Less than one year, [inaudible], three to five, five to 10, or more than 5 years? Please cast your votes now.

Now we'll quickly move onto our fourth question. How is the technology used for the webinar? Example is audio, video, phone bridge. Please cast your votes from one to five, five is very good and one as very bad. Please cast your votes now.

Thank you very much for your vote. And we'll move on to our sixth question. Did the speaker demonstrate mastery of the topic? Please cast your votes from five to one, five is extremely strong, and one is extremely weak.

Thank you very much for your answer. Our sixth question is, are you satisfied with the webinar? Please cast your votes from five to one, five is extremely satisfied is one is not satisfied at all.

TAF_At-Large Capacity Building Program-2016: Sixth Webinar on the Topic: "ccTLD Managers and Registrars: What is the Impact

of the new gTLDs on the ccTLDs' registration and growth?" – 15 June 2016

EN

Thank you very much for your answer. I'll now move onto our last question. What topics would you like us to cover in the future webinars? Please type your answer in the blank space, and do not forget to please [inaudible] so we can receive your answers. Please cast your answers now.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much Yeşim, and for participating [inaudible] box, because [inaudible]… will address in the future, for the second semester of 2016. If you don't have time now to put it on the Adobe Connect, please send an email to the staff, and these topics that you want [inaudible] in future webinars. Thank you very much.

Okay, so [inaudible] for our [inaudible]… I would like to thank particularly Edmon Chung, who came and made the presentation. Thank you very much Edmon, and thank you our interpreters, our staff, thank you all for participating. This webinar is now adjourned. Bye-bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]