

Review and draft recommendations regarding SOAC transparency

Drafted by Steve DelBianco, last updated 29-Jan-2017

The new Bylaws tasked us to:

“review and develop ... recommendations on SO/AC accountability, including but not limited to improved processes for accountability, **transparency**, and participation that are helpful to prevent capture”

We asked each SO/AC (and subgroups):

“What are the published policies and procedures by which your AC/SO is accountable to the designated community that you serve? Specifically, **transparency mechanisms for your AC/SO deliberations, decisions and elections.** “

Review: A summary of responses and resources provided on Transparency, supplemented by independent research by the SO/AC Accountability working group:

ALAC:

- o ALAC Rules of Procedure are posted at <https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/Rules+of+Procedure>
- o ALAC's member At-Large Structures (ALS) are listed at <https://atlarge.icann.org/alses>. Individual members may choose to keep their names private.
- o 21-day public notice is given before voting is conducted.
- o All ALAC, RALO, and working group meetings are open to the public.
- o Meeting minutes, recording, and transcripts are published.
- o Most ALAC, RALO, and working group mailing lists are published.
- o Results of elections are published. Individuals may use secret ballots.
- o ALAC response spoke specifically about risk of “capture”:

The ALAC itself is effectively immune from capture, since its members are selected by very geographically and culturally diverse populations. To be admitted as an At-Large Structure (ALS), the organization must be largely controlled by its members, again spreading the responsibility over large areas. In the one RALO where there was a fear that a few countries, because of their relative size compared to the majority, might dominate, weighted voting was instituted giving each country an equivalent vote and if there are multiple ALSes within that country, the vote is divided among them.

There is a potential for multiple ALSes to be linked and “controlled” centrally, despite the local membership. There are a few potential examples, but these tend to be more a case of perceived possible control rather than real control. Overall, in all such cases, the real risk is not of some entity capturing a large percentage of votes, but is apathy of the rest of the organization. And that is true in much of ICANN.

ASO/NRO:

- o Members of the regional numbers community are listed at <https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/regional-internet-registries>
- o NRO officers are listed on ASO website

- o ASO sessions at ICANN meetings are open to anyone.
- o ASO provides glossary for acronyms and an FAQ page.
- o ASO publishes minutes of NRO meetings.
- o ASO email archives are published for anyone to see.

ccNSO:

- o ccNSO Guidelines are published at <https://ccnso.icann.org/about/guidelines.htm>
- o Allows non-member ccTLDs to be present at ccNSO meetings.
- o All ccNSO Council decisions are immediately published on ccNSO website and wiki.
- o All documents and materials are published on the wiki at least a week before ccNSO Council meetings.
- o ccNSO Guidelines Review Committee is reviewing current practices and documentation and may recommend updates and/or new guidelines.

GAC:

- o GAC Operating Principles are published at <https://gacweb.icann.org/display/gacweb/GAC+Operating+Principles>
- o Materials on GAC membership, meetings, key topics, correspondence and meeting notes are published on the GAC website.
- o Correspondence between the GAC and the ICANN Board is published on the GAC website.
- o All GAC face-to-face meetings are open and anyone can monitor real-time or through recordings and transcripts.
- o GAC Communiqué and meeting minutes are published in the six UN languages.

GNSO:

- o Operating procedures are published at <https://gns0.icann.org/en/council/op-procedures-01sep16-en.pdf>
- o Anyone can monitor Council meetings via audio. Meeting recordings, transcript, and minutes are published.
- o The GNSO Council email list is archived and published for public view.
- o GNSO Working Group meeting recording and transcripts are published on Working Group wiki.
- o GNSO Working Group meeting recording and transcripts are published on Working Group wiki.
- o Draft reports of GNSO Working Groups are published on Working Group wiki.

GNSO-BC (Business Constituency):

- o The BC Charter is published at <http://www.bizconst.org/charter>
- o BC members are listed at <http://www.bizconst.org/bc-membership-list>
- o All BC filed comments and ICANN correspondence are published on the BC website.
- o At ICANN meetings, the BC holds some closed sessions and at least one open session.
- o BC members can monitor BC meetings via adobe and/or audio. Meeting recordings, transcript, and minutes are published to member email list.
- o BC members all have access to a private email archive.
- o Open email communications are published at <https://forum.icann.org/lists/bc-gns0/>

GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- o Bylaws are published at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/bylaws>
- o Members are listed at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/current-membership>
- o Officers are listed at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/officers>
- o Filed comments are published at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/public-comments>
- o Archived emails are available at <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/ipc-gnso/>
- o Meeting minutes are published at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/meeting-minutes>

GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):

- o ISPCP Charter is published at <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=27854098>
- o ISPCP Operating Procedures are published.
- o Officers are listed at <https://gns0.icann.org/en/about/stakeholders-constituencies/csg/isp>
- o Comments filed prior to 2014 are published at <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=27853808>

GNSO-NCSG (Non-Commercial Stakeholders Group):

- o NCSG Bylaws are published at <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsononcomstake/Charter>
- o NCSG members are listed at https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1o0n2H5xkTPmon8K8wbFg0dAZTouHWgkWjcyNsSs_YXw/edit#gid=0
- o Executive Committee listed at <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsononcomstake/Leadership+Team>
- o Meeting minutes are published at <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsononcomstake/Meeting+Records>
- o Email archives are published for both NCSG and Executive Committee
- o Statements and letters are published and archived

GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

- o Bylaws published at <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/bylaws/bylaws-revision-2016/differential-document/>
- o Organizational Members are listed at <http://www.ncuc.org/about/members/>
- o Executive Committee is listed at <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/executive-committee/>
- o Executive Committee meeting minute are published at <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/executive-committee/>
- o Email archives are published at <http://lists.ncuc.org/cgi-bin/mailman/listinfo>
- o Statements and letters are published at <http://www.ncuc.org/policy/statements/>

RSSAC:

SSAC:

- o Charter is published at <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac/charter>
- o Operational Procedures published at <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/operational-procedures-20jun16-en.pdf>
- o Member bios and SOIs are listed at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/ssac-biographies-2016-12-15-en>
- o Officer (chair) is named at <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac>
- o Reports and Advice published at <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac/documents>
- o Correspondence is published at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/ssac-correspondence-2016-01-08-en>

Note that **transparency** is part of the structural review of the ALAC, ASO, ccNSO, GNSO, RSSAC, and SSAC, to be conducted at direction of the ICANN board every 5 years. ICANN Bylaws Section 4.4 requires the Board to cause an independent, periodic review (every 5 years) of each SO/AC, except that the GAC “shall provide its own review mechanisms”. Note that these are required to be independent reviews and are usually conducted by outside consultants hired by ICANN.

Draft Recommendations regarding SO/AC transparency:

Our review leads us to recommend that each SO/AC and subgroup consider adopting the following “best practices” regarding transparency mechanisms:

- o Charter and operating guidelines should be published on a public web page and updated whenever changes are made.
- o Members of the SO/AC or subgroup should be listed on a public web page.
- o Officers of the SO/AC or subgroup should be listed on a public web page.
- o All SO/AC meetings should be declared as either open or closed, giving specific reasons for holding a closed meeting. During each ICANN meeting, at least one SO/AC meeting should be open to public observation.
- o Minutes for all membership meetings should be published.
- o Filed comments and correspondence with ICANN should be published for anyone to see

Participation

Outreach:

ALAC: [expecting responses by 1-Feb]

- o Outreach events while at ICANN meetings;
- o Interaction with ICANN Fellows and NextGen;
- o Use of CROPP funding to attend meetings and other events, or targeted visits (such as to a country with no current At-Large participation);
- o Attendance at various regional and international events. Examples include: Regional IGFs, Global IGF, RIR meetings, regional Internet-related meeting (such as APRICOT),
- o Organizing, teach at or otherwise participating in Schools of Internet Governance.
- o Using social media to increase awareness.
- o Each RALO has an Outreach Strategic Plan.
- o Outreach to attract new organizational members (ALSes) is a constant focus. More recently, we are working to increase the number of individual members in the regions the allow them (NA, EU, AP) and results show we are successful.
- o We also are about to launch a new program to increase penetration within our ALSes.
- o Often, in many cases, it is just one or a few people in the organization who are active within At-Large, and we are determined to increase our breadth of coverage within the ALSes.

ASO/NRO:

- o Anybody who would like to be involved with the Internet number resource community in their respective region is welcome to suggest or comment on global policy proposals, be elected to serve on the ASO Address Council (ASO AC), or vote in elections. Anyone is welcome to attend ICANN meetings and come to the ASO session(s). Anyone is welcome to attend RIR events in person or remotely, and participate in policy discussions.
- o The NRO Number Council (NRO NC) performs the function of the ASO AC. For information on how the NRO NC is constituted, see <https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/the-nro-number-council>
- o Further, for information on how members of the NRO NC are elected/appointed from their respective RIR regions, see:
- o AFRINIC: <https://www.afrinic.net/en/community/ig/nro>
- o APNIC: <https://www.apnic.net/community/participate/elections/nro-elections>
- o ARIN: <https://www.arin.net/participate/elections/nronumbercouncil.html>
- o LACNIC: <http://www.lacnic.net/en/web/lacnic/aso-nro>
- o RIPE NCC: <https://www.ripe.net/participate/internet-governance/internet-technical-community/nro> [RACI program for the academics]
- o In addition, for information on the individual RIRs, see the RIR Governance Matrix at <https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/rir-governance-matrix>, specifically Section 1, RIR Bylaws and Operational Documents, and Section 2, Regional Policy

ccNSO: (extracted from CCNSO wiki page)

- o CCNSO has regional outreach
<https://community.icann.org/display/ccNSOCWS/Outreach>

GAC:

- o GAC face-to-face meetings regularly include capacity-building and outreach sessions to encourage the widest range of participation by members.

GNSO:

- o ICANN newsletters, and outreach to other SO/ACs.
- o Specific newcomer webinars and training tools are available for those that want to learn more about what it takes to participate in GNSO working groups.

GNSO-BC (Business Constituency):

- o The BC's commitment to outreach is described in the current BC Charter at §12 and in the new Charter at Section 9:2009 CHARTER, §12 "Business users' participation in ICANN is critical. The BC will, in tandem with other members of the CSG, make best efforts to broaden the participation of business users wherever possible according to available resources."
2016 CHARTER (undergoing review by ICANN Staff), §9.2:
The new BC Charter in §9.2 presents the Chair and Vice-Chair for Finance and Operations as being "primarily responsible for allocating funds, proposing plans/programs, and encouraging Member participation in activities designed to achieve the Business Constituency's outreach and recruitment goals." Complete text of new BC Charter can be read here.
- o Outreach Committee
- o Outreach Strategy
- o Annually, a BC Outreach Strategy is created and approved within the BC, outlining its implementation strategy for the upcoming year, and expected outcomes. BC Outreach strategy is administered by the BC Outreach Committee with the support of its Executive Committee and ICANN staff. In FY16, the BC's Outreach spending totaled 12,750.00 €, which includes activities such as support of events and travel requests.
- o The Outreach committee meets via teleconference before each ICANN Public meeting for planning purposes. The Outreach team also drafts an Outreach and Strategic Plan annually, which can be found on the ICANN Wiki space (<https://community.icann.org/x/XQKbAw>) and actively participates in the Community Regional Outreach Pilot Program (CROPP).
- o Newsletters are published by the BC in advance of every ICANN Public Meeting (<http://www.bizconst.org/newsletter>). Articles are written by BC members and designed by the BC for outreach purposes at each ICANN Public Meeting, and various outreach events that the BC participates in (such as AfICTA Summits, trade events, and IGF forums).
- o BC's CROPP travel forms for past and upcoming travel and outreach events in FY17 will be tracked here: <https://community.icann.org/x/zw2OAw>

GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- o IPC has an Outreach Engagement Committee, which is responsible for planning, oversight and some execution of the IPC's outreach and engagement strategy.
- o Outreach Strategy: The IPC Outreach and Engagement Committee is tasked with developing the Outreach Strategy for the upcoming year. The IPC Outreach and Engagement Strategic Plan for FY17 can be found at <https://community.icann.org/x/GgybAw>. After the Outreach and Engagement
- o Committee develops a draft Plan, it is reviewed and approved first by IPC Leadership (Officers and Councilors) and then by IPC Membership.
- o The IPC participates in ICANN programs such as the Fellows program, the Leadership Training Program, CROPP, and various Business Engagement activities.
- o planning team in advance of each ICANN meeting to coordinate the logistics and events of the IPC, including any outreach and engagement planned for the meeting.
- o The IPC holds an open meeting of the Constituency at each International Trademark Association (INTA) annual meeting and promotes the IPC at meetings of the INTA Internet Committee. The IPC also conducts informal outreach at other meetings where Intellectual Property Constituency stakeholders will be present (e.g., the annual meeting of MARQUES).
- o The IPC has a website and a print brochure for outreach purposes.
- o IPC Bylaws: <http://www.ipconstituency.org/Bylaws>
- o IPC Outreach and Strategic Plan for FY17: <https://community.icann.org/x/GgybAw7>
- o IPC's CROPP travel forms for past and upcoming travel and outreach events in FY17 will be tracked in the CROPP space, <https://community.icann.org/x/2A2OAw>.
- o ICANN Leadership Program: <https://community.icann.org/x/4hK4Aw>
- o The IPC brochure can be found here: https://ipc.memberclicks.net/assets/FactSheets/ipc_onepager_2016.pdf

GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):

- o Outreach efforts, per the ISPCP Procedures, are described in Section 7: "The ISPCP will undertake best efforts to broaden participation and awareness of the Constituency and its activities wherever possible and with the resources at its disposal. All ISPCP members should be expected to assist with this goal within their own sphere of activities and flag opportunities for outreach to the Executive Committee."
- o Outreach Strategy: Annually, an ISPCP Outreach Strategy is created and approved within the ISPCP, outlining its implementation strategy for the upcoming year, and expected outcomes, which includes activities like, but not limited to, the support of events and travel requests.
- o The Outreach committee meets via teleconference before each ICANN Public meeting for planning purposes. The Outreach team also drafts an Outreach and Strategic Plan annually, which can be found on the ICANN Wiki space (pending) and actively participates in the Community
- o Regional Outreach Pilot Program (CROPP)
- o Bulletins: Bulletins (sometimes referred to as Newsletters) are published by the ISPCP in advance of the annual ICANN Public Meeting and archived on the ISPCP website.
- o ISPCP Articles (2009 - current): <https://community.icann.org/x/EgWpAQ>

- o ISPP's CROPP travel forms for past and upcoming travel and outreach events in FY17 will be tracked here: <https://community.icann.org/x/2w2OAw>
- o ISPCP Bulletins archive: <http://www.ispcp.info/ispcp-bulletin>

GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

- o Outreach events before and during each ICANN meeting
- o Brochures in different languages
- o Free membership
- o Exhibitions and booths in various events outside ICANN meetings, such as IGF
- o Maintain a website
- o Participation in Internet governance related civil society email lists and events, such as WSIS, the Internet governance caucus list, Bestbits, global and regional IGFs and civil society organized events such as Rightscon and Internet Freedom Festival, among others. NCUC members aim to carry out outreach and inform the broader community about NCUC and ICANN at different IG-related events. A new initiative is underway to facilitate further the outreach requests from NCUC members and the external noncommercial users.
- o Close collaboration with ICANN global and regional engagement teams
- o Supporting noncommercial and civil society events outside of ICANN and informing them about our work
- o Use of CROPP to hold events and send delegates to meetings to encourage the NCUC designated community to join

SSAC

- o Appointment of new SSAC members is undertaken in accordance with OP Section 2.3 New Member Selection. Other SSAC outreach is focused primarily outside the designated community and is focused on publicizing SSAC Reports both to the Board and within the broader ICANN community. Additionally, individual SSAC members participate in many other technical fora such as the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), the Anti-Phishing Working Group (APWG), etc. and share any relevant SSAC work in those fora.

Recommendations:

1. Newsletters or other communication and publicizing tools
2. websites or wiki pages for advertizing outreach events
3. outreach program committee
4. mentioning outreach in the bylaws
5. outreach strategy