

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear All, Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Working Group on Monday, 18 April 2016 at 22:00 UTC.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:Hello everybody

Michelle DeSmyter:Hello, welcome Carlos!

Yoshi Murakami(JPRS):Hi

Steve Coates (Twitter):I'm on, but just need to step away for a minute.

Steve Coates (Twitter):Back on.

Carlton Samuels:Howdy all

Karen Bernstein:Greetings and Salutations.

Rubens Kuhl:Good <time of day> everybody!

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:GAC 20 commandments of 2007

Steve Coates (Twitter):Link to the language Avri mentions:
<https://gnso.icann.org/en/issues/new-gtlds/subsequent-procedures-charter-21jan16-en.pdf>

Steve Chan:Lost in the ether...

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:lost in transmission

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:objection

Julie Hedlund:@Avri: You are now a host.

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):was the previous question you were addressing from a GAC member?

Jeff Neuman:Tracey, the topic was addressed last week by several members of the Working Group that wanted to go straight to talking about the guidebook

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):ok. thanks

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:Bravo!!!!

Carlton Samuels:Lost audiobut back on a refresh

Steve Chan:yes!

Carlton Samuels:Audio gone again!!

Phil Buckingham:lost audio

Rubens Kuhl:This time it looks wholesale.

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):did you look at GAC Jeff, or do you need someone to do this for you for the GAC?

Steve Coates (Twitter):I will have the BC's content when I am able to sit with Steve DelBianco.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:lost my audio

Steve Coates (Twitter):Carlos - The audio is still on.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:Avri is fine

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):Will help you from GAC.

Rubens Kuhl:Couldn't hear Jeff at all.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:its back now

Carlton Samuels:All I now hear is like a bird in a cage.....um, ok, Avri up again.

Rubens Kuhl:Bridge to Adobe might be working one-way.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez: congratulations Jeff for keeping dates as one of the columns

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:very useful
Rubens Kuhl:Can't hear Alan as well.
Rubens Kuhl:Can always hear Avri.
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:hope the other lsits keep the same fomrat
Carlton Samuels:Can't hear a thing out of Alan
Steve Coates (Twitter):I'll address next. It seems like we are
having audio problems.
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:can't hear the gentleman from ALAC
Jeff Neuman:Also, people in the RySG should check to see if I
got everything :)
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:Hey
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:I can only hear AVri
Carlton Samuels:I'm hearing Avri but nobody else
Craig Schwartz - fTLD Registry:I hear all fine.
Rubens Kuhl:Same as Carlton for me.
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:exactly
Greg Shatan:Probably a problem with using Adobe audio.
Greg Shatan:Rather than phone bridge.
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:maybe a bridge would help
Julie Hedlund:I heard Alan and everyone else, but we have had
some breaking up.
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:yes
Kurt Pritz:I only hear Avri
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:avri only
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:+506 8837 7176
Greg Shatan:We have a bridge...
Craig Schwartz - fTLD Registry:I am on the phone line so
perhaps an Adobe issue.
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:keep going
Susan Payne:I think it would be very useful to make it clear
what the type/status of the advice is. In case of the GAC for
example there should be a clear distinction between GAC Advice
and something which is less than formal GAC advice. Olga has
mentioned some principles from a GAC WG that she would like to
share - we will need clarity on the status of those principle
since I do not belieove they are GAC Advice or indeed formally
adopted by the GAC
Steve Coates (Twitter):Nobody can hear me talking with Avri?
Carlos Raul Gutierrez:@Susan +1
Rubens Kuhl:I couldn't, Steve.
Carlton Samuels:Not me sah!
Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):@Susan. I sent a document that
might be useful to you to Steve last week. Will also help with
gAC Advice
Robert Burlingame (Pillsbury):I can hear everyone
Steve Coates (Twitter):Rubens, perhaps relogin? This has

happened to me before.

Jeff Neuman:I think Susan's points are a good one for the GAC, which is uniquely positioned to give Advice directly to the Board
Rubens Kuhl:Tried once. Can try it again.

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):Yes. I offered a littl e further back in the chat (while you were speaking Jeff) to help you complete your spreadsheet for the GAC.

Steve Coates (Twitter):@Tracey - That is much appreciated. Would love that.

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):you're welcome

Steve Coates (Twitter):@rubens - I'm so sorry. Any staff recommendations?

Steve Chan:@Tracey, all, there is a page added to the WG Wiki, which will be used to capture the catalog of statements and advice:

<https://community.icann.org/display/NGSPP/Catalog+of+Statements+and+Advice+From+the+Community+-+2012+Round>

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):ok. thx

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:can't hear Jeff.....

Greg Shatan:I hear you fine.

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):I can hear you

Rubens Kuhl:Even after reloading again, can't hear Jeff or anyone from their side of the universe...

Greg Shatan:I am dialed into the phone bridge.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:suld staff please ask for a bridge to +506 8837 7176

Carlton Samuels:Hearing Jeff clearly!

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:only Avri :(

Phil Buckingham:cant hear jeff . can hear avri

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:please call me out

Kurt Pritz:I don't hear Jeff

Michelle DeSmyter:yes, one moment carlos

Steve Coates (Twitter):I see Carlos, Rubens, Phil, Kurt having audio issues with everyone except Avri.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:Txs @Kurt. We must have the cheap seats

Susan Payne:yes I can

Kurt Pritz:I can hear Jeff now

Steve Coates (Twitter):Can anyone hear through Adobe or on phone?

Christopher Niemi:Hear in Adobe

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):I'm on adobe and it's fine

Steve Coates (Twitter):I'm on the phone bridge.

Carlton Samuels:I hear you in adobe well!

Karen Bernstein:Just fine on my end

Carlos Raul Gutierrez:ok

Greg Shatan:Hear on phone.

Carlos Raul Gutierrez: will restart my pc

Richard Padilla:Hello All I'm sorry for being late had to work

Robin Gross:I hear through the adobe

Sara Bockey:No audio issues via adobe for me

Carlos Raul:txxs

Carlos Raul:yes

Carlos Raul: i´m on the bridge now

Steve Coates (Twitter):For those that can't hear Jeff, we are going through the pros and cons listed in Adobe, and making additions, as necessary.

Carlton Samuels:Regarding competition, the CCT RT is collecting data that might be useful in evaluating whether that statement is worthwhile

Rubens Kuhl:Phone bridge works fine.

Phil Buckingham:can t hear anything . shall I reconnect on adobe again ?

Rubens Kuhl:This is a bit more than the usual Adobe Connect issues, is the link between Adobe and phone bridge that is failing today.

Carlton Samuels:In regard to diversity, there is definitely more with IDNs coming along

Rubens Kuhl:And failing in a way not only impacting for those speaking, but also for those trying to follow.

Steve Coates (Twitter):@rubens, I think you are correct.

Carlton Samuels:Steve is very low!

Carlton Samuels:Didn't hear a word he said!

Steve Coates (Twitter):I will speak louder. I stated that we are at a competitive disadvantage is at a competitive disadvantage because we do not have a TLD.

Greg Shatan:I would distinguish that point from the "anticompetitive" point, which I read as alluding to possible antitrust claims.

Carlos Raul:that was close Jeff!!!!

Rubens Kuhl:A Con I usually hear is something in the line of "We already have all the TLDs people need. "

Carlos Raul:close to next round

Steve Coates (Twitter):@Greg, agreed.

Carlton Samuels:@Jeff: Thanks. Sounds practical

Carlos Raul:)

Julie Hedlund:It was me :-)

Carlos Raul:Julie can you number the list please?

Carlton Samuels:@Jeff: Yes, the CCT RT is looking at that matter and collecting data to substantiate

Carlos Raul:Segmentation I would say, instead of innovation

Craig Schwartz - fTLD Registry:Very little innovation yet to be seen.

Craig Schwartz - fTLD Registry: Differentiation...lots of that!
Carlton Samuels:@Carlos: Yes, that is what the preliminary data is suggesting has happened.

Carlos Raul:@Cragi differentiation/segmentation yes

Rubens Kuhl: There is data on innovation in general, although not on domains specifically. For instance, data showing correlation between timing and innovation success, which reinforces the principle of predictable timing.

Carlos Raul: getting a brand to the 1st level, does not create a "generic", but a brand at the first level with a new set of combinations at the second level possible (like delegating 2 letter country codes at the second level. Is that innovation or differentiation? I don't know, but is something new

Rubens Kuhl: One source on innovation success factors:
https://www.ted.com/talks/bill_gross_the_single_biggest_reason_why_startups_succeed

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat): +1 to Alan's statement

Carlos Raul: \$1 for Greg Shatan please

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat): Exactly. Cart before horse

Alan Greenberg: Only \$!?? That's a pretty low rate for a New York lawyer.

Rubens Kuhl: Con #2 is split If/When.

Carlos Raul: he said the forbidden word.....

Avri Doria: That is one reason we are doing mostly investigative work in these first stages of this PDP WG.

Alan Greenberg:@Carlos, a "round" is a multi-part song - https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Round_%28music%29. What's wrong with that?

Robin Gross: I would list as a "con" for new gtlds: how badly ICANN screwed up the last round. Took in tons of cash, expanded in size and mission scope, many applicants extremely unhappy with ICANN's changing of the rules and general mis-handling of the last round. Until those problems get fixed, we shouldn't do it again.

Greg Shatan: Carlos, you can have 6 seconds of my time for that price... :-)

Avri Doria: These are also questions we can include in the request for Constituency Comments 1 (CC1)

Carlton Samuels:@Alan: Restriction on use?

Steve Coates (Twitter): Greg - I can recommend our Vine platform of 6 second looped videos. Perfect for that purpose..

Avri Doria: Time check 45 minutes - Half way through meeting

Steve Coates (Twitter): Speak louder.

Carlos Raul:@Jeff +1 about 70 metrics

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat): :-)

Greg Shatan:@Steve, You can find me on Vine at @GSS1958. I've

posted a Vine just for you....

Greg Shatan:Robin, I misread your post as "messianic scope"....

Steve Coates (Twitter):@greg - Got it! Indeed.

Avri Doria:Time check: 30 minutes left

Carlos Raul:This classification exercise could be usefull for CCT purposes.....

Carlos Raul:5 times rounds

Carlos Raul:he said it 5 times

Avri Doria:These were not necessarily Brands. Sponsored were essentially simlar to community tlds

Craig Schwartz - fTLD Registry:Have to run, thanks all.

Avri Doria:and the restricted use are not necessarily Brands.

Greg Shatan:I wasn't saying that these were brands, just to be clear....

Kurt Pritz:It might be good to divide the TLD categories between those created by the Consensus Policy and those created in an ad hoc way after the Policy was approved

Karen Day:Google did get exclusive use for .PLAY

Avri Doria:Kurt, we are talking about the mergent types and not that they were created as types in the last round.

Greg Shatan:A generic term is only generic when it is used to as the name of the thing that makes it generic. Apples for apples, but not for computers....

Avri Doria:... emergent types ...

Avri Doria:please comment on the email list or comment areas on the wiki.

Avri Doria:i expect we will build these into a question in the request for Community Comments

Rubens Kuhl:One reason for having TLD categories is to allow applicants to request a specific category, and if ICANN wouldn't allow that, for that application to be denied.

Rubens Kuhl:Which gets more predictability than signing an agreement with ICANN and then having their categorization denied.

Carlos Raul:@Rubens I don't think it is up to the applicant to decide on categorization

Rubens Kuhl:Not to decide, but to request.

Greg Shatan:Agree that one size does not and did not fit all.

Carlos Raul:@Rubens as Avri said it's an emergent characterization by grouping the applications

Rubens Kuhl:Like in if .example doesn't get Brand TLD qualification, applicant prefers its application to be denied.

Greg Shatan:Should "faux communities" be a recognized type?

Carlos Raul:@Rubens another issue would be if after categorization, a new "channels" could be opened to a new category

Carlos Raul:l@Greg faux pass

Rubens Kuhl:Faux communities can be prevented by not having

policies that invite them to do so...

Avri Doria:Or was that just a funny line.

Carlos Raul:at least for the CCT it may be useful to have such a category framework, in a common language with this pdp

Steve Coates (Twitter):Sort of funny.

Steve

Chan:<https://community.icann.org/display/NGSPP/c.+Subject+Work+Spaces>

Greg Shatan:Not entirely a joke. Is there something useful in looking at a type that may not meet all the criteria of a community, but is not just a generic?

Greg Shatan:@Rubens, I agree that gaming by trying to be a community was inspired by the prioritization rules.

Robin Gross:We may want to re-think the whole concept of "community" tlds.

Rubens Kuhl:@Greg, I think Validated registry covers the use cases I can think that are between full generic and communities.

Steve Coates (Twitter):@robin - Definitely agree there could use some clarity there.

Steve

Chan:<https://community.icann.org/display/NGSPP/d.+Decision+Log>

Steve Chan:Decision Log: there is a Data Agreed column and to Avri's point, there is a Data Confirmed, which I envisioned as the second meeting, where the decision is confirmed

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO):Yes I think it is a gd idea

Steve Coates (Twitter):I think it's a fabulous idea, and I would be very grateful.

Mary Wong:The RPM Working Group will hold its first meeting this Thursday; presumably the liaison question will be discussed at one of its subsequent (but early) meetings.

Mary Wong:The liaison is required by the WG Charter, yes.

Steve Chan:It's captured in the WG Charter for both of the PDPs

Rubens Kuhl:But if the RPM WG thinks it's an awful idea, they can ask to Council to reconsider that idea... I think it's a good idea, though.

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):Can you show the list of pros and cons again on the screen? I'd like to take a screen shot

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):thanks/!

Carlos Raul:I will

Carlos Raul:its only two times possible

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO):as someone who often has issues with EU and NA tme zones.. the rotating times are fine by me even though ne is in the *middle of my night 0200) this one is just fine

Carlos Raul:Hobart in Tasmania to LA

Carlos Raul:Steve can check it with Lars hoffman please

Tracey Hind (GAC Secretariat):+1 to Cheryl

Michael Flemming:Being in Asia GMT+ 9:00, I end up spending a majority of my early morning hours (0:00 - 3:00) in ICANN related meetings. However, having them at this time, (7:00 - 8:30) is much better for my schedule.

Steve Chan:@Carlos, thanks

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO):We just have to share the pain

Julie Hedlund:Sure why not Avri :-)

Steve Chan:Yes :)

Greg Shatan:I will note that I am on the East Coast, and I have a Next Gen RDS call tomorrow night from 1-2:30 am (05:00-06:30 UTC). So we do get the short end of the stick sometimes (and more often lately).

Carlos Raul:I will send the times

Rubens Kuhl:Just limit people in WGs to be from UTC-3 to UTC+3 only.

Susan Payne:thanks, night

Karen Bernstein:Have a good evening, morning, and night

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO):Good call thans Avri and Jeff, thanks all, talk again soon... Bye for now...

Robin Gross:thanks, all, bye.

Robert Burlingame (Pillsbury):Thank you everyone!

Richard Padilla:Bye

Sara Bockey:thanks all

Marilia Maciel:Thanks

Carlton Samuels:Thanks all

Carlton Samuels:Bye

Greg Shatan:Rounds.

Iliya Bazlyankov:Thanks and bye!