Competition, Consumer Trust and Consumer Choice Review Team Work Plan

This document serves as a guide for the Competition, Consumer Trust and Consumer Choice Review Team (CCTRT) to plan its work for the coming year. This work plan outlines the key areas for discussion, data elements to be considered, milestones to be achieved, and timelines for producing both findings and recommendations.

The Affirmation of Commitments provides the following mandate: "ICANN will organize a review that will examine the extent to which the introduction or expansion of gTLDs has promoted competition, consumer trust and consumer choice, as well as effectiveness of (a) the application and evaluation process, and (b) safeguards put in place to mitigate issues involved in the introduction or expansion."

In order to improve the efficiency and impact of this review team, this plan lays out the necessary steps to ensure focused discussions, and includes a timeline with milestones for achievement noted, as appropriate.

1. **Preparation**

   a. *Terms of Reference:* The group shall come to an agreement on the Terms of Reference and ensure they share a common understanding of this review's scope.

   b. *Existing data:* The group shall conduct a high-level overview of existing data sources that have been gathered or prepared for this review. This includes, but is not limited to:
      i. Metrics recommended by the IAG-CCT and currently collected by ICANN staff: https://www.icann.org/resources/reviews/cct/metrics
      ii. Phase 1 consumer and registrant survey results: https://newgtlds.icann.org/en/announcements-and-media/announcement-2-29may15-en and https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2015-09-25-en
         1. Survey vendor Nielsen will present its methodology and plans for phase 2 of the surveys at the CCTRT F2F meeting 22-23 February in Los Angeles. CCTRT members will have the opportunity to provide feedback to Nielsen prior to the survey's fielding.
      iii. Phase 1 economic study: https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2-2015-09-28-en
         1. Economic study vendor Analysis Group will present its methodology and plans for the phase 2 study at the 10 February teleconference. CCTRT members will have the opportunity to provide feedback to Analysis Group prior to the study's commencement.
      iv. Program Implementation Review: https://newgtlds.icann.org/en/reviews/implementation/program-review-29jan16-en.pdf
         1. ICANN staff will provide an overview of this report and be available for questions and discussions at the first F2F meeting in Los Angeles on 22-23 February.

v. Rights Protection Mechanisms
Review: http://newgtlds.icann.org/en/reviews/rpm/rpm-review-11sep15-en.pdf
vi. DNS Abuse Review: https://newgtlds.icann.org/en/reviews/dns-abuse

Upon surveying the available data, the CCTRT as a whole may request ICANN staff to utilize its resources to gather additional data.

c. *Form sub-teams*: With the CCTRT's mandate as outlined in the AoC above, the team shall explore the available data and evidence by dividing the work into the following topic areas:
1. The application and evaluation process
2. Safeguards
3. Competition
4. Consumer choice and
5. Consumer Trust

CCTRT members shall, at its first F2F meeting, divide into these sub teams. Each team shall choose a leader, who will be responsible for guiding the sub teams to interim recommendations, findings and final recommendations. Each team, with its leader coordinating the discussion, shall determine an appropriate timeline for reviewing the data available in their topic area.

d. *Remaining metrics for discussion:* The IAG-CCT tabled 22 of the recommended 66 metrics for the full CCTRT to assess and determine their feasibility and utility for the review. Of those, ICANN staff determined five could be collected from internal sources and are now included in the other metrics currently being collected. The remaining 17 require input from the CCTRT.

2. **Interim recommendations:** The CCTRT, upon review of the available data sets and all metrics, shall endeavor to produce interim recommendations on a scheduled agreed-upon by the sub teams.

3. **Sub teams**

a. *Scope of work:* Each sub team shall be tasked with reviewing the available data that corresponds with its assigned review area and provide preliminary findings to be discussed with the larger CCTRT, to be followed by recommendations from each sub team to be constructed based upon those findings. The sub team will be responsible for determine which data are/are not relevant to its analysis. Sub team leads shall be responsible for keeping the full CCTRT up to date on sub team discussions.

b. *Timeline and process:* Each sub team will be responsible for drafting its own schedule, including milestones, and ensuring it meets larger milestones and deadlines set by the full CCTRT. The timeline should also include a deadline for delivering interim recommendations for consideration by the larger CCTRT. Sub teams may create their

own sub team email lists – to be open to the larger CCTRT so they may follow the discussions.

c. *Additional data:* The subteam may request additional data in the form of additional resources from ICANN staff or external to the organization. Any such requests shall be discussed with the larger CCTRT.

d. *Analysis and findings:* Each sub team will analyze its determined data set to reach preliminary findings. This initial milestone will require presenting the findings and underlying methodology to the full CCTRT for discussion. The sub team will then incorporate any CCTRT feedback on those findings as they regroup to discuss recommendations.

e. *Recommendations:* Interim recommendations may arise from the sub team's work. It is the sub team lead's responsibility to share these with the CCTRT. Final recommendations shall be agreed upon with the full CCTRT. Recommendations should be clear, concise, concrete, prioritized and implementable.

The recommendations will fall into two categories: those which can be implemented directly by staff and those which require further policy development by the community.

Those recommendations should be limited to those designed to enhance the market for gTLDs in general and specifically the further introduction of new gTLDs. These recommendations will be limited to those designed to:
- Enhance competition, consumer trust and consumer choice in the gTLD marketplace; or
- Improve elements of the application and evaluation processes; or
- Advance efforts to mitigate abusive activity in the DNS

The team shall document the rationale it has employed for any individual recommendation, and where possible, provide a quantitative target or metric for measurement of the recommendation's success.

4. **Draft report**
All sub team findings and recommendations will be incorporated into a draft report and shall be published for a public comment period of at least 40 days.

5. **Public comment period**
Each sub team shall consider public comments and incorporate them into their recommendations, presenting them to the full CCTRT for consideration. The CCTRT will work together to reach consensus on incorporating public comments, as appropriate, in the final report.

6. **Final report**
After incorporating public feedback, the CCTRT shall come to an agreement on its final recommendations and publish a final report.

7. **Implementation feedback**

   CCTRT members may be called upon for feedback on recommendations after implementation has begun. CCTRT members may wish to remain available for such post-CCTRT discussions.

Timeline

The following outlines all CCTRT teleconference. Sub teams, once formed, may schedule their own teleconferences during intervening weeks to discuss data and findings. CCTRT teleconferences shall provide a forum for discussing sub team progress, including findings and recommendations as they are prepared.

MEETING	DATES	MILESTONES/DELIVERABLES
Call 3	10 February	Analysis Group presentation on economic study; discuss additional data needs and methodology
First face-to-face in LA	22-23 February	Nielsen presentation on consumer and registrant surveys, provide feedback on methodology; divide into sub teams and choose sub team leaders; briefings on application process, contracting, onboarding, and Program Implementation Review
ICANN 55 in Marrakech	9-10 March	Sub teams present mini work plans, including timelines for interim recommendations, as appropriate. CCTRT discusses available data sets.
Call 4	23 March	Initial findings from application and evaluation process sub team
Call 5	6 April	
Call 6	20 April	
Call 7	4 May	Possible F2F? Initial findings from safeguards and competition sub teams
Call 8	18 May	Phase 2 consumer survey results published. Initial findings from consumer trust and choice sub teams
Call 9	1 June	Compose draft interim recommendations for ICANN Board

Call 10	15 June	Submit draft interim recommendations to ICANN Board
ICANN 56 in Panama City	Week of 27 June	Publish DNS abuse review; briefing for CCTRT or sub team?
Call 11	13 July	Safeguards sub team discusses published DNS Abuse Review report with CCTRT
Call 12	27 July	Application and evaluation process sub team presents findings and draft recommendations for discussion
Call 13	10 August	Safeguards sub team presents findings and draft recommendations
Call 14	24 August	Possible F2F?
Call 15	7 September	Possible F2F?
Call 16	21 September	
Call 17	5 October	Publish phase 2 registrant survey results
Call 18	19 October	Publish phase 2 economic study
ICANN 57 in Puerto Rico	Week of 29 October	Competition sub team presents findings and draft recommendations for discussion
Call 19	2 November	Consumer trust and choice sub teams present findings and draft recommendations for discussion
Call 20	16 November	Discuss draft report
Call 21	30 November	CCTRT agrees on draft report for publication
Call 22	14 December	Publish draft report in Dec.