

Competition, Consumer Trust and Consumer Choice  
Review Team Meeting – Call 02  
27 January @ 14:00 – 16:00 UTC  
Chat Transcript

Carlos Raul:Good morning. May we ask for listening and speaking rights through the PC please?

Pamela Smith:Good morning, Carlos.

Carlos Raul:its middle of the night in PST

Eleeza Agopian:Almost daybreak, Carlos. :)

Carlos Raul:can you please test sound?

Carlos Raul:i ok

Carlos Raul:i can hear

Carlos Raul:thank you

Carlos Raul:yes

Carlos Raul:I can't talk

Carlos Raul:so i will use the chat

Carlos Raul:I'm HERE!!!!!!!

Dejan Djukic:me too

Jordyn A. Buchanan:I've just joined.

Charla Shambley:Can x4735 please identify yourself?

Charla Shambley:Can x7218 please identify yourself?

Charla Shambley:Can x6543 please identify yourself?

Jordyn A. Buchanan:6543 is me.

Charla Shambley:Thank you Jordyn

Carlos Raul:Did you say WEDNESDAY?

Carlos Raul:I'm ok

Carlos Raul:13:30?

Carlos Raul:)

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):so is that 5am for CA?

Jamie Hedlund:Yes

Jamie Hedlund:5:30

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):sounds good

Carlos Raul:no its 6am for California

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):Great idea Eleeza especially with all the strong feelings on the group about data they would like to see

Jordyn A. Buchanan:I like the idea, but we may need to talk to them more in the LA meeting.

Charla Shambley:Please press \*6 to mute/un-mute your line

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):probably Jordyn

Kaili Kan:As I will not be able to attend the LA F2F meeting, please make it available remotely for me to join.

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):point is to get into it early enough to suggest slight mods rather than after the fact

Charla Shambley:@Kaili, we will have remote participation details sent out prior to the call

Gaongalelwe:i agree that it would be great to meet them as well in LA meeting

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):we'll be discussing that scope later Ravi

Carlos Raul:@Jordyn I support the separate briefings on the Agreements

Carlos Raul:@Zuck is not only about volume but also about prices!!!!

Carlos Raul:i'm traveling and I dont have it

Carlos Raul:can you put it on the screen?

Eleeza Agopian:Hi Carlos -- it's a 12-page document and I think Jonathan wants to focus on the questions he raises here.

Kaili Kan:As there are only 2 people from ALAC on this team and there are others who want to join, I would suggest to allow observers from AC/SOs to join the meetings.

Carlos Raul:@Eleeza, it would be nice to follow up the comments in a single online document

Eleeza Agopian:Hi Carlos -- do you mean the comments from teh group here today?

Carlos Raul:I think findings separate from recommendations makes perfect sense

Carlos Raul:@eleeza I mean to be able to follow up all comments online all along the drafting process. The sub group should wokr in a opena manner and we should be able to follow up all along, not only every time a draft is saved

Eleeza Agopian:I see. Thankk you.

Megan Richards, European Commission:re observers I have no problem for including so long as they are identified. ie no anonymous observers

Carlos Raul:@Megan +1

Megan Richards, European Commission:on terms of reference and definitions I would like to have some adequate time to examine in detail before committing. sorry but have been submerged by other obligations

Kaili Kan:As the new gTLD has amplified some problems that existed even with the legacy gTLDs, I would suggest to consider the legacy ones along with the new ones, thus come up with a complete gTLD recommendation.

Margie Milam:Definitions are on page 3

Carlos Raul:@Stanley +1

Carlos Raul:we need a defintiion of MARKET

Laureen Kapin:I agree with Megan, the definitions are key and we should all have suffcient time to carefully assess them.

Carlos Raul:"DNS Market"

Carlos Raul:including Wholesal and retail

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Carlos--are you trying to suggest that we define the market as part of the TOR exercise? I'd imagine this is a sub-workstream within the competition examination.

Jordyn A. Buchanan:We'll be months in defining the TOR if we have to wait to figure out the market in advance.

Dejan Djukic:i agree that registrants shuld be included in competiton definition.

Carlos Raul:@jordyn i agree we have to take a differentiated view between registries, registrars, registrants and users

Carlos Raul:sorry for the spelling

Jordyn A. Buchanan:My audio just went whacky.

Jordyn A. Buchanan:And now is gone.

Eleeza Agopian:Sounds clear to us -- Jordyn, could you try reconnecting?

Carlos Raul:@STan +1

Kaili Kan:+1 to Stanley on legacy gTLD

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Yeah, just dialed back in.

Eleeza Agopian:@Jordyn, sound ok?

Carlos Raul:and by legacy I understand both gTLDs and ccTLDs

Jordyn A. Buchanan:@Eleeza: yes, not sure what happened.

Eleeza Agopian:Great. Thanks.

Karen Lentz:we will send around the references to the previous economic studies that Jamie mentioned

Carlos Raul:one thing is the boundary of the study, another the recommendations

Megan Richards, European Commission:is there no extant data re legacy gTLD

Carlos Raul:exactly!

Megan Richards, European Commission:and could be useful to compare legacy and new

Jordyn A. Buchanan:I think what we're looking at is the effect of new gTLDs on competition within a market which also includes both gTLDs and ccTLDs.

Megan Richards, European Commission:exactly Jordyn

Carlos Raul:open to all identified observers please

Carlos Raul:Also the sessions for the f2f meetings

Megan Richards, European Commission:please send emails to a separate box !!

Eleeza Agopian:The email archives can also be publicly available, so even if you don't receive all messages, you can read them online.

Jordyn A. Buchanan:I think Carlos said he can only participate by chat.

Carlos Raul:like in the ACCT CCWG

Carlos Raul:members and participants

Megan Richards, European Commission:observers should identify themselves. IE not anonymous unidentified observers

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Carlos--so you're proposing that essentially anyone can participate fully in the discussion other than by voting, as long as they are identified?

Megan Richards, European Commission:for me observers listen and write comments to the dedicated email box. otherwise becomes complicated doesn't it?

Jordyn A. Buchanan:I agree Megan, just trying to understand what Carlos is suggesting, because observers in the CCWG were able to participate fairly fully in the ongoing discussion (i.e., there wasn't a real distinction between members and observers other than when it came to voting, which was rare).

Carlos Raul:perfectly so

Carlos Raul:thank you

Carlos Raul:@Jordyn will revert on that

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Great, seems like we are in agreement.

Laureen Kapin:My call just ended. Possible to get called back?

Eleeza Agopian:Laureen -- you should be able to go to the green phone icon up top to get a dial-in back to the mtg.

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):perhaps a "guest speaker" rather than a delegate or substitute that gets invited?

Megan Richards, European Commission:fine to invite expert testimony :-)

Laureen Kapin:Back again - thx Eleeza.

Eleeza Agopian:Glad to hear it. :)

Eleeza Agopian:@Fabro -- can you mute your line?

Fabro Steibel:wait

Eleeza Agopian:thanks

Fabro Steibel:agreed (signed)

Margie Milam:right Brian was chair so Paul Diaz would step in

Margie Milam:to help manage the work

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Sure, that's fine with me.

Jordyn A. Buchanan:I think that's useful in any case.

Carlos Raul:makes sense Zuck

Fabro Steibel:makes sense

Carlos Raul:no please

Carlos Raul:no Greg Shatan!!!

Carlos Raul:)

Gaongalelwe:I personally do not agree with the substitutes. bringing in outside expertise would be fine though.

Carlos Raul:What Jamie just mentioned is what i call the use of the DNS BEYOND intellectual property

Megan Richards, European Commission:agree re sectoral competition but will be difficult to do on global level. perhaps some market slices and sector comparisons useful

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):agree Megan

Carlos Raul:@STan congratulations

Laureen Kapin:I volunteer to be on work plan team.

Eleeza Agopian:You can email me.

Gaongalelwe:i am loving the chair-ship... good going!

Jordyn A. Buchanan:As with the TOR team, I'm happy to help with the work plan but if there's plenty of volunteers happy to step aside as well.

Fabro Steibel:I volunteer to be on work plan team. I am still learning about what has been done, but do count me in

Carlos Raul:It makes sense to put them in front, but i disagree that they aren't quantitative!

Carlos Raul:\$185'000 is quite quantitative to me

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):Carlos. You may be right but that's only a single data point. Hard to do a quantitative analysis of that!

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Definitely agree that we should be looking at existing data sources where possible.

David Taylor 2:Happy to join that drafting sub group following on from the ToR sub group, but if we are many happy to stand aside

Carlos Raul:@Jonathan if the amount led to unnecessary build up of reserves in ICANN it may be a quite uncompetitive behaviour: raising the barriers to entry

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):David. YOU're IN!

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):Carlos. Building up reserves isn't anti-competitive. We need to find a way to determine if the application fee was a barrier to entry and whether the JAS was insufficient to address it

Carlos Raul:@Jonathan we should come back to entry fees and use of auction proceeds at some point

Carlos Raul:and the underserved areas of the world

Jordyn A. Buchanan:In any case, the application fees (and auction proceeds) are being accounted for separately and not part of ICANN's reserves.

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):I think use of auction proceeds is outside of our remit but I'm open to being convinced

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):+1 Jordyn

Jordyn A. Buchanan:+1 Jonathan: use of auction as a decontention mechanism is probably within our scope, but not what ICANN does with the money after the auction ends

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):yep

Carlos Raul:agree

Megan Richards, European Commission:agree too

Carlos Raul:lets call it the auction as process to assignment

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):and remember it was only one decontention mechanism among many

Carlos Raul:lets say that one size does not fit all (applications) for the time being

Jamie Hedlund:ICANN auction was also used relatively little to resolve contentions when looking at universe of contention sets.

Jordyn A. Buchanan:Jamie, that's technically true, but a bit misleading as probably a majority of contention sets were resolved through some sort of auction.

Jamie Hedlund:well it's important to look at the distinctions between auction types. One is set by the AGB the other is voluntarily established among applicants.

Jamie Hedlund:ICANN urged self-resolution.

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):agree! Tried to slow down the GNSO PDP but failed

Jonathan Zuck (GNSO):good idea

Carlos Raul:the PDPs are rather early right now

Carlos Raul:yes

Gaongalelwe:i agree with semi-synchronization

Karen Lentz:i like the idea also

Carlos Raul:can help with subsequent procedures

Carlos Raul:TxS

Kaili Kan:Thank you and goodbye !

Fabro Steibel:thanks

Megan Richards, European Commission:thanks all

Charla Shambley:Thank you for attending the CCT RT Call!

Pamela Smith:THank you, everyone, for your participation! See you in 2 weeks.