

Teleconference – 3 September 2015

TERRI AGNEW: Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the Single Issue Call: LACRALO ALAC Member Election 2015 – Candidates Presentation teleconference taking place on Wednesday, 2 September 2015 at 23:00 UTC.

On the Spanish channel, we have Harold Arcos, Juan Manuel Rojas, Humberto Carrasco, Fatima Cambroner, and Johnny Laureano.

Currently at this time, there is no one on the English channel.

We have apologies from Alberto Soto, Leon Sanchez, Vanda Scartezini, Gilberto Lara, Alyne Andrade, Alan Greenberg, Leon Sanchez, and Heidi Ullrich.

From staff, we have Silvia Vivanco and myself, Terri Agnew.

Our Spanish interpreters today are Veronica and David.

I would like to remind all participants to please state your name before speaking for transcription purposes and also for our interpreters.

Thank you very much, and I'll turn it back over to you, Humberto.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much, Terri. We have a single issue in our agenda, and this is the presentation of candidates and the summary of the responses. For this part, we will see if there are new questions, and

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

then we will also discuss the replies to those questions by the candidates. Then there will be the closing remarks by the candidates.

Silvia Vivanco is telling me that Harold Arcos has asked or requested if it was possible to give his presentation in second place. I don't know if you agree with that. If everything is okay with that, we can proceed with that order.

Juan Manuel, are you on the call? I was saying that Harold Arcos has requested to give his presentation after you. But since from the alphabetical point of view he is the first one, I would like to ask you if you would like to be the first one and if he can present in the second place, if you are happy with that.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: No problem with that. I can start, or he can start. No problem for me.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: We will proceed in the alphabetical order then. Harold, please go ahead.

ANTONIO MEDINA: Sorry for interrupting you, Humberto.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Antonio Medina, you have the floor. Go ahead.

Teleconference – 3 September 2015

ANTONIO MEDINA: When the roll call was given, my name was not mentioned, and I am here at the call.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Okay, you are right. I would kindly ask staff to take note of your name. Thank you very much for the clarification.

Now I will give the floor to Harold Arcos for him to start with his presentation. Go ahead, Harold. Harold, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

HAROLD ARCOS: Here we have the SOI by Juan Manuel Rojas. If you could upload my presentation, Terri? Thank you. Okay.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Sorry for interrupting. Can you hear me?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Juan Manuel, Harold Arcos will be delivering his presentation right now.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Okay, thank you.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Harold, go ahead, please.

HAROLD ARCOS:

Okay then, I will start with my presentation. As you can see, the presentation is on the screen. I will speak about my profile, the challenges that we have with the RALO and ALAC. Then I will speak about the context and the questions.

When it comes to my profile, there you can see my ICANN profile. You can see my profile there. I am a social communicator, a chair of Internauta. I'm also a researcher in terms of information technology and information society. I'm also a member of the Research Center for Internet of the Latin America Internet users as well as an advisory member for the Association for the Promotion of Communication and Internet Users in Venezuela.

At the same time, you can see my statement of interest where there is further information about the profile that we can see. I mentioned some of the memberships. In case you might need further information, I am a member of the Internet Research Center and the National Congress. I'm also a secretary for that association and I'm also a researcher.

Within the three memberships that you can see there, I participate as a collaborator in Venezuela in some interdisciplinary working groups regarding knowledge and research in terms of information technology. We're working at the regional level with that topic. My main activity is pro bono researching. I'm also working in the development. As a

researcher, we also are developing documentaries and TV programs in terms of communication in Venezuela.

Also, I'm carrying out certain activities. We can speak about some of the activities I have carried out in Venezuela where I have obtained a good reception by students that come to see this participation mechanism. For us this is very important as the ICANN community to have this into account.

At the same time, we have created the first conference for Internet and social transformation in 2014. This gave the possibility to Venezuela to be part of the global Internet discussion. We had different panelists for the Internet governance panel that was carried out by ISOC Venezuela that same year. Then we have the second meeting on Internet governance that we have been developing this year. That information is contained in the SOI.

The following topic has to do with what I believe is important and the challenges that we have ahead. Among the different working groups, there are three that are really important in our RALO. These are a challenge for future activities. One is the IANA transition, the WHOIS issue, and of course the accountability working group, which is very important indeed.

Of course, we are devoting quite a lot of time to those issues. The IANA transition issue is a really important topic. When we speak about the IANA transition, we are focusing on the conditions, the roles, and the timeframes that we have to meet. Of course, it is a challenge for the

roles because we, as Internet user representatives, have the obligation to participate in these topics or in these issues. This is what we do in our RALOs and ALAC.

When it comes to the WHOIS, we have participated in the RAA 2013 and other basic concepts, such as the information transfer or the neutrality topic. Recently, we have been working on the intrusion in the ICANN system that were obtained or the problem that ICANN had. This is part of a new deployment that we have been working on.

This shows a way in which we will be facing the new challenges and the new responsibilities regarding this topic because, as you can see, we're not only speaking about responsibilities, but we're also speaking about the community and the corporation and we're also speaking about the things that we're working on. We're also working on different drafts together with Alberto Soto. We have until September the 8th to work on this.

Making the most of my time, I would like to see if there are questions for me. I see some questions. Humberto, you are the moderator. Is there any question for me, or should we leave these for the end of the call?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: You have two minutes to answer the questions.

HAROLD ARCOS: We have two questions. One question is if I have remaining time for ALAC. The answer is yes. I have five hours to devote to this. As it is stated on the SOI and in my profile, I am the one managing my own time, so in that sense I have plenty of time to meet the time needs. When it comes to working on a public entity, I work for a broadcasting company or a TV network company to provide different services.

When it comes to the question if I'm going to give up that position, the answer is no. I am working on that. I am working on the research field, and we're also promoting the Internet end users' interests here in Venezuela.

Is there any other question for me?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Not so far. If there are further questions, we will read them at the end in the Q&A session.

Now I will give the floor to Juan Manuel Rojas. Juan Manuel, please, you have the floor so that you can proceed with your presentation. Thank you.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Good afternoon. Do you hear me? Okay, I'm going to go ahead with my presentation.

First, I will need to say that I do not have any access to my AC room. I'm only connected through the phone, so I will ask Humberto to support me in case there are any additional questions in this call.

As you all know, my name is Juan Manuel Rojas. I am a social communicator and a journalist as well. I graduated from the university in Bogota. I am currently taking a master's in information technology at the University of Los Andes. I have a scholarship at that university to take that master's program.

I am also working as a teacher for the social communication program at the University [inaudible], and I also do ICT research right there. I have worked as an electronic government consultant as well.

My experience since 2008-2009, I have worked at the Information Technology Ministry to implement online programs in small municipalities in [Bajo Cauca] and in other regions in Colombia. I have also published an e-government research thesis in China and in Estonia in 2010 and 2011. Since 2011 as well, I have participated in ICANN meetings. I have been involved in LACRALO since our association was recognized as an ALS. Since then, I have been engaged in ICANN and in LACRALO as well.

I have also had the possibly to be involved because I had received a scholarship from the DiploFoundation. They held this government meeting in Brazil in 2010. I have also taken the DiploFoundation courses for research. They had three stages. It is this kind of knowledge I have

participated in different fora in Latin America in Cordoba, Bogota, and in Quito as well.

Since 2011, I have been involved in what we now officially call ICANN Hub, which work remotely. I have been working with different stakeholders for people to participate in ICANN meetings remotely. We started in the Beijing meeting with this remote participation. Since then, we have been connected remotely to the meetings. We have been present in the first and third meeting in the year. We were sort of a hub, as we know it now.

We are constantly organizing digital literacy courses and other courses in those hubs, which also include Internet courses, specifically in the cities where we are present in Colombia, which is in Bogota, Villavicencio, and Cúcuta. These are the cities where we have more presence within associations.

I think this is it for the time being for my presentation. Humberto, please let me know if I need to add something else to my presentation.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO:

Thank you, Juan Manuel. You actually have some more time because you were allotted ten minutes. The idea is now to answer to any questions that may arise right now. I am now posting a link that is from the previous meeting that you and Harold gave for questions posted by Carlos Aguirre and other people on that link. It's a link to the wiki webpage.

If you have no other presentations or if you do not want to reiterate the answers to the questions made, then I would open the Q&A session for LACRALO members. This is now open for each of the candidates. The responses will now be inverted. This means that the one who presented first will respond second and vice versa. If you presented second, then you need to answer first.

I am going to give you the floor and also to give the floor to the assembly members who are meeting now so that they can ask questions to the candidates. Is there anyone who would like to ask another question? There seem to be no questions so far, no questions for the candidates.

ANTONIO MEDINA: I have a question for Humberto.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: For me? I am not a candidate, but please go ahead.

ANTONIO MEDINA: I just want to know if we have been adding more participants to this meeting so that we get to know who is connected.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Okay. I'm going to go over the participants right now. We have here Fatima, Johnny, Holmquist Carlos Aguirre, and Dev, you and Juan Manuel. These are all the people who are online right now.

There's a question from Ricardo Holmquist. He says, "One of the requirements was speaking or understanding English. Could you please respond to the questions asked in English by English speakers?"

Then Juan Manuel needs to answer first, and Harold will answer after him. How is your English level? What are the questions in English?

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: My level is B2, but what the one asked is for us to answer in English.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: We will first have Juan Manuel and then Harold. This will be the order of answering. What I understand is that the question is whether you can answer in English to the questions asked in English.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Yes, that is possible, but what are the answers? Because I did a presentation regarding the questions that were written in English, and I can of course answer in English. But my presentation was in Spanish. I don't have the questions here with me.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Juan Manuel, you have participated in group. When there is no translation and interpretation, do you have problems to understand what is going on in the meetings?

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: No, actually. No. In the beginning when I started in LACRALO, I probably did lose a few specific terms, so to call them technical terms. But once I got familiarized with all the acronyms and all the technical vocabulary, it was easier for me to understand conversations.

When I attended ICANN meetings, some of you who know me did see that many times I don't use the simultaneous translation. When I am in the room and the room and the meeting is in English, I actually do prefer to avoid using the translation. Not because I don't like the translation but because I actually think I can understand a bit more what is being said.

In the past meeting in Buenos Aires, I was in one of the meetings in the capacity building meeting – this is one of the groups I am engaged in – and I actually participated in English during the meeting. I didn't really have any problems neither there nor in any of the groups that I had to work with.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much, Juan Manuel. We will now give the floor to Harold. Harold, it's the same question for you. What is your level of English like to maintain conversations? Because it's important, especially when there is no translation.

HAROLD ARCOS: That's right. This is one of the challenges. On a daily basis, I don't really speak or use English. I do understand when I listen to it. In other

languages like Portuguese, I did have an opportunity. But in English, I will need to retrain it, and I hope it will be one of the minimum requirements to [update].

We recently participated in a few meetings, including the Caribbean, and this helped us a lot to strengthen and to train our ear in English. I did have some difficulty of course because I don't use it every day. It's not something constant. When we attended the IETF, we discussed that issue as well, but there definitely wasn't any other problem with that. We definitely can issue an opinion based on what we were told.

As Juan Manuel was saying, we were asked some questions in English, and we responded to them. I think it is important to face the challenge of the issues we're going to confront here, so here we are in case you want to ask another question.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: I have a very quick question for both of you. If you could please summarize what is the function of an ALAC member, just in a few words, to see what is the function precisely.

HAROLD ARCOS: Well, I suppose I'm the one who needs to answer, right?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Well, okay. First you and then Juan Manuel.

HAROLD ARCOS:

As an advisory committee, I actually have reviewed some of the working methods. One of the sanctions ALAC has is a challenge for our joint work. As a region, if you want to have a strong and strengthened participation with a strategic and a regional view, I think it is very important to take note of each of the expectations and claims made by our colleagues in the region, especially on what happens on a daily basis. That is, what is the strategy for our daily basis?

I was thinking of something periodic that could help us to hold webinars. I would ask the RALO chair to maintain a constant dynamic of activating the different issues understanding that we as at At-Large community have the challenge to give an opinion in each of the working groups. We need to manage all of them if we want to have the perspective of the users as opposed to other working groups that need to focus on something specific, whether it is a policy issue or a technical issue. We, on the other hand, are called to participate in all of them.

As part of my proposal, my idea is to generating this constant dynamic, this daily dynamic, to receive all the input from all the RALOs. Of course, the mailing list would always be an option for us to be able to synchronize this all together.

Our chair, Fatima, made a reference to the consultation. She considered that in some consultations there was very little participation. This was a [double] reflection we need to make as a RALO to conduct the ALAC work.

Teleconference – 3 September 2015

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you, Harold. Juan Manuel, what is your reply?

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: The question is what is the work of an ALAC member, right? We could have a simple answer, such as an ALAC member needs to give recommendations so that the Board may or may not apply a recommendation or an advice on a specific case. This is what ALAC is.

ALAC members need to issue an opinion and generate results and working groups and show their opinions in documents and in statements to give advice to the Board. Because many times, they make decisions based on recommendations or advice made by ALAC members.

ALAC members need to be really knowledgeable of what is going on within ICANN as a whole. They need to know what the Board is doing and how this can impact on the different users, which is actually the area where ALAC has an interest. ALAC is made up by representatives of Internet users, and so the ALAC perspective will always be the perspective or what affects Internet users.

This is where ALAC has an important representation because the recommendations for its own RALO are given to the advisory committee made up of ALAC members from the other four RALOs and to finally be able to issue a recommendation or some advice.

But ALAC also has a responsibility of leading some of the working groups, both within ALAC at a general level in the At-Large community

and also to the inside of the community. This is one of the main issues that an ALAC member needs to do.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much, Juan Manuel, for your reply. I see Carlos Aguirre has posted a question in the chat. This is for both of you, so you will be the first one and then Harold will answer second. “In how many ALAC meetings have you participated?”

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: I believe this is the ALAC advisory committee. In general, I have participated in At-Large in ATLAS II last year, and in general ALAC meetings I have been able to participate just in a few of them, especially those that are held on a monthly basis. Perhaps I should say ten meetings since I began with my participation or throughout the year.

I was not able to participate in some of the meetings, but I have been participating face-to-face in certain meetings, such as the meeting that was held in Costa Rica or in other places. But remotely, I have participated in about ten meetings.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much, Juan Manuel. The same question goes for Harold. “In how many ALAC meetings have you participated, Harold?”

Teleconference – 3 September 2015

HAROLD ARCOS: I have participated in many meetings in the recent past, but not physically. I do a follow up of the meetings by means of the recordings and the transcriptions that I can read. I've been participating or following up the [visibility] issue, which is an important topic that is being now addressed within ICANN. I know there have been many proposals on that area here in Internauta Venezuela, and we are also focusing on the promotion of that.

But in terms of figures or numbers, in a face-to-face meeting I would say two meetings, taking into account ATLAS II. When it comes to follow up meetings, I would say I have participated in many meetings, indeed. I would say, and I am doing the follow up of meetings by reading transcriptions.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much, Harold. Now I would like to open the floor to participants to ask questions for the candidates. It seems that there are no further questions. I would like to ask again if there are further questions, otherwise we'll proceed with the closing remarks by candidates.

Dev, you have a question so, Dev, go ahead, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Are you hearing me?

Teleconference – 3 September 2015

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Yes, Dev. Go ahead, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you, Humberto. My question is really to the two candidates. My concerns are as follows. I've known Juan Rojas because he has been very involved in several of the working groups, and as he mentioned, he was at the At-Large summit and so forth.

But, Harold, I have to say you're a bit of an enigma to me because the first time I ever saw any sort of presence for you was in August 2015 in LACRALO. My question is: when did you really get involved in LACRALO? My concern is that if you're now new to LACRALO, how could you really represent LACRALO's interests in ICANN At-Large?

Thank you.

HAROLD ARCOS: May I reply now, or should I wait for other questions to be asked?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: No, go ahead, please.

HAROLD ARCOS: Thank you very much, Dev, for your question. Yes, I come from Internauta Venezuela. We have been doing research together with my colleagues for five years now. I have been appointed as a chair of the ALS that I represent. And last year... We have been actively participating

as an ALS in the webinars, and that is how I have personally been involved with the structure.

I have been working with, for example, Carlos because they have been pioneers in terms of the participation of Internet users. We have been working in some of the agendas. When it comes to my participation, that is recent participation I should say, but as an organization we have been participating and we have been involved with the ICANN community. We have been supporting the ICANN community, and we have been providing input by Internauta Venezuela, or we have been providing input from our ALS.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much, Harold. Are there any other questions? I open the floor for questions if there are any other questions for the candidates.

Since there are no other questions, now I will give the floor to the candidates for their closing remarks. First, Juan Manuel and Harold. Juan Manuel, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Thank you, Humberto. First of all, I would like to thank you all for joining this call. Those who are listening to this audio or reading the transcription once it is over, I would like to thank you as well.

I have a few things to say. The proposals that I would like to make on the RALO are especially related to strengthening these that Fatima once proposed. It's related to the participation of LACRALO members in ALAC

statements. Those statements that we make were those who participate are those who already have the knowledge or those who have time or interest and those things. It's not easy, but we definitely can propose that we do more. Those capacities that have been built in ICANN and inside the RALO itself, all this is helping all this to be more permanent.

In the answers that I wrote, I also proposed not only to attempt to generate that participation and to have a more intense interaction between the RALO and others, and hopefully we will see many people involved, but I also proposed the creation of a sort of a newsletter for the RALO. Something like what ICANN is doing at the global level, but perhaps our newsletter should be [now] focused on the region on the perhaps smaller things that we are doing, what LACNIC is doing, what other groups are doing within Latin America, referring to what are the issues being discussed and what we can propose or how we can look at this from the users' perspective.

There are many people who are interested in this within the RALO who can give their input and can help us clarify the perspective of many issues because we don't really know about all those issues. Maybe this can contribute to a more informed participation.

This is one of the proposals that I included. I hope this process will be a more aware process, a voting process where people are more aware and not just saying that I will support this or that person because I like him or her more or less. But actually I think there should be a really knowledgeable idea of what we can do, how we can improve

participation and engagement to consider also the experience of activities within ICANN and not just imaginary issues. That is, to be more concerned about [observed divisions] instead of having something that generates the participation for everybody.

Hopefully, this will be broken because this is a very common practice, but we would like any person who says, “I want to be a candidate,” to have the possibility to do this without having agreement with any person.

That is what I have to say. Thank you very much, and I hope you have the time to review what are the experience of the candidates. It’s a pity that [Lance] is no longer here. He was about to be here with us today. It would have been nice to have him here as well. This is basically what I have to say today. Thank you.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you, Juan Manuel. Your statements are also very interesting. Carlton Samuels is writing a few questions in the chatroom. Silvia is asking Carlton if he can write those questions on the wiki so that you as candidates can answer them. Having said this...

SILVIA VIVANCO: Perhaps an idea that I’m thinking about right now, maybe Terri can read those questions aloud in the English channel so that then they can be interpreted into Spanish right now and maybe the candidates can answer them.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: The thing is that we don't really know how much interpretation time we have. We actually have five more minutes. No, actually, I prefer Harold to make his closing remarks and then the questions can be answered. If the questions are read... Because what you want is for them to be read so that they are on record and then they are replied on the wiki? Okay. We will make a little pause, and then we will give Harold the floor.

We're going to ask Terri. Terri, please, could you please read aloud the questions written by Carlton Samuels so that we can interpret them into Spanish? Please, go ahead, Terri.

TERRI AGNEW: Certainly. Thank you. One moment. Carlton Samuels would also be interested to hear his views on the ALAC remit, the structure of the ALAC processes, and his contributions to the At-Large in general and ICANN policy development in particular. Carlton Samuels would appreciate if these matters are put to the candidates. I think that was his question. Thank you.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: That's it. Now that we have the questions on record, maybe you can answer them later on the wiki because we now have time issues. We have just a few minutes with the interpreters. We will now listen to Harold's closing remarks, and then you can answer to those questions on the wiki.

HAROLD ARCOS:

To close, I would like to focus because we have just a few minutes. I would like to put on the table the three keywords that I consider. They are education, participation, and organization.

In the proposals that I have made for each of the questions from the RALO and in connection with the future challenges as ALAC, I believe one of the most important ones is education. This is an agreement we have here on the RALO. We need to maintain or keep the region updated through webinars, through capacity building, and we need to ensure that those of us who are working with these working groups are also participating here.

It is very important that all the RALOs can handle the same information. This is a challenge because, as I have said before, we are called to be engaged with each of the issues. This is a challenge because none of us have been able to be present in all of those issues. We have typically focused on the ones we like most, or we have had to review the transcriptions, and this is a very useful tool.

The fact that we could have access to participation has been an important point. Participation in the organization is essential. We need to have a very knowledgeable participation. This is one of the things that Fatima pointed out. We wanted to create some kind of link so that there can be some impact on the recommendations and proposals. She talked to us about this little participation, so this is a reflection of that.

I'm proposing a different mechanism because it is not really very realistic. That is, our colleague Leon has done this before when he presented all the information before the RALO on the different scenarios facing issues such as the ones that the transition challenges [imposed] us.

Also, as a third aspect, I believe we have historically resorted to a space which is [LAC]. We need to be aware that we are only one region, and if we want to impact more deeply and we want to close the gap between ALAC members and ourselves, we need to contribute from the committee as such. We need to have organization. The organization is key.

This means that we should not facilitate our dissociation as a region because if we separate, we will never reach that impact that some of you have already mentioned, such as regional participation. That is, we need to have a real regional participation. So education, contact, and a direct dynamic are essential, are key.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you, Harold. Silvia is telling me that we have no more time. Fatima has also asked that it would be nice if you can answer the questions before starting to vote. We would like to tell Juan Manuel and Harold to answer those questions on the wiki before the vote begins. I believe the vote will reinitiate or restart at 23:00 hours on Thursday, so you have sufficient time to answer. So please do before the vote begins.

Teleconference – 3 September 2015

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Humberto, I am lost because I don't have the calendar here with me. When does the vote begin? I know it was moved.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: The vote will be for Thursday the 3rd at 23:00 hours. That is tomorrow, Thursday. But we will send you an e-mail to tell you when the vote is going to happen. This is for all of you to have the information, but actually you have a couple of hours to answer before the vote closes.

Thank you, all. This meeting is now adjourned. Goodnight.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks to the interpreters.

TERRI AGNEW: Once again, the meeting has been adjourned. Thank you very much for joining. Please remember to disconnect all remaining lines, and have a wonderful rest of your day.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]