








Detailed Quarterly Implementation Report on WHOIS Improvements




Details on the Implementation Status of the Board Approved¹ WHOIS Review Team Final Report Recommendations As of 31 December 2016		Key: Complete ✓ or  In Progress ○ or  In Planning ◇ or 	
	Topic	Summary of Implementation Activities	Milestones & Due Dates ²
	WHOIS - Strategic Priority		
1.a 	WHOIS as a strategic priority	<p>WHOIS emphasized in Strategic Plan as part of Strategic Objective 2.1 and funded in FY16 Operating Plan and Budget;</p> <p>WHOIS Program supervised by Strategic Initiatives Team and implemented through a cross-departmental effort.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Board adopts FY17 update to the Five-Year Operating Plan 27 June 2016 ✓ Registrars signed new 2013 RAA (2013 - 2018); List of Registrars on the 2013 RAA available here. ✓ New gTLD Registries now sign new registry agreements. List of registries available here. ✓ WHOIS Accuracy Specification of 2013 RAA to be reviewed annually ✓ First 2013 RAA Whois Accuracy Program Specification Review concluded in 2015
1.b 	ICANN Staff incentivization	<p>WHOIS projects identified in both WorkForce and the Halogen management system.</p> <p>CEO compensation based on the overall goals and objectives of the entire organization set forth in WorkForce.</p>	
1.c 	Board involvement in WHOIS improvements	Board updated, on a trimester basis on the status of WHOIS related activities and implementation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The Board considered the GNSO's Accreditation of Privacy and Proxy Services Final Report recommendations at its 15 May 2016 meeting, and deferred their consideration until after the Helsinki Meeting to be responsive to the GAC's Marrakech Communiqué ✓ GAC Communiqué - Helsinki, Finland on Privacy and Proxy Services Accreditation Issues June 2016 ✓ ICANN Board resolution on July 28, 2015 creating a new Board working group to liaise with the GNSO on the policy development process and oversee the implementation of the remaining projects arising from the Action Plan adopted by the Board in response to the first WHOIS Review Team's recommendations. ✓ ICANN Board resolution on April 26, 2015 created a new Board working group to address Registration Directory Services and follow up on WHOIS RT-related implementation

¹ This Summary highlights ICANN's progress measured against the [Action Plan](#) approved by the ICANN Board in its [8 November 2012 meeting](#). In some instances, the [Action Plan](#) adopts an alternative approach to implementing the recommendations from those proposed in the [WHOIS Policy Review Team Final Report](#).




² See Annex A of the 2014, 2015 and 2016 [Annual Reports on WHOIS Improvements](#) for previously completed Milestone and Due Dates.

<p>1.d</p> 	<p>Public Status of Implementation</p>	<p>Public closely apprised of the implementation progress through regular updates, announcements on icann.org, blog posts, updates at ICANN meetings, and the new WHOIS website. The implementation status of WHOIS recommendations is updated quarterly and published on the wiki page for the WHOIS Review.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Current WHOIS policy information ✓ Thick WHOIS Policy Implementation work documented to ensure that the resultant implementation fulfills the intentions of the approved policy recommendations. ✓ Draft Thick RDDS (Whois) Consensus Policy and Implementation Notes published 24 November 2015 ✓ Final Issue Report on a Next-Generation gTLD Registration Directory Service (RDS) to Replace WHOIS published 7 October 2015 ✓ Syntax Accuracy of WHOIS Data in gTLDs Presented in Accuracy Reporting System Phase I Report 24 August 2015 ✓ Publication of the Next-Generation gTLD Registration Directory Services to Replace WHOIS Preliminary Issue Report 13 July 2015 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public Comment - Staff Report on the Next-Generation gTLD Registration Directory Services to Replace WHOIS Preliminary Issue Report - 27 September 2015 ✓ Framework for a PDP Working Group on the Next Generation RDS, approved by the Board 26 April 2015, to provide guidance to the GNSO PDP for the examination of the EWG's recommended models and principles for the next generation registration directory services to replace WHOIS. ✓ Completed first formal review of the 2013 Registrar Accreditation Agreement's WHOIS Accuracy Program Specification, requirements to validate and verify certain WHOIS data and customer account holder information with a review of its terms by ICANN and the Registrar Stakeholder Group (RrSG). ✓ ICANN 56 Helsinki WHOIS related sessions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ GNSO Next-Generation Registration Directory Services to replace WHOIS Policy Development Process Working Group Face to Face Meeting ✓ Cross-Community Session: Next Generation Registration Directory Services ✓ GAC Public Safety Working Group Meeting ✓ ICANN 55 Marrakech WHOIS related sessions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Thick Whois Policy Implementation - Meeting with the IRT, 6 March 2016 ✓ Registrars and Law Enforcement, 7 March 2016 ✓ GNSO Next-Generation RDS PDP F2F Meeting, 9 March 2016. For further information about this PDP, please see https://community.icann.org/x/rjl-Ag. ✓ ICANN 54 Dublin WHOIS related sessions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ RySG - GEO TLDs ✓ Whois Review Team International Registration Data Expert WG ✓ Global Domains Division Update ✓ New gTLD Program: Reviews and Related Activities ✓ New gTLD Program Implementation Review: Report Discussion ✓ Contractual Compliance Program Updates and Q&A Session ✓ GNSO Privacy & Proxy Services Accreditation Issues PDP WGM ✓ GNSO Preliminary Issue Report - New gTLD Subsequent Procedures ✓ Registration Data Access Protocol (RDAP) Implementation
--	--	---	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Thick Whois Policy Implementation - IRT Meeting ✓ GNSO IGO-INGO Access to Curative Rights Protection Mechanisms PDP WG Meeting ✓ Contractual Compliance Registrar Outreach ✓ Public Comment: GNSO Privacy & Proxy Services Accreditation Issues Working Group Initial Report - Opened 5 May 2105, Closed 7 July 2015 ✓ Public Comment: 2013 RAA WhoIs Accuracy Program Specification Review - Opened 14 May 2015, and Closed 3 July 2015 and the Report of Public Comments 20 July 2015 ✓ Status of Improvements published on new WHOIS Website ✓ Series of webinars have been completed and are planned for future updates. ✓ Public Comment from Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information PDP Initial Report – 16 Dec 2014, closed 1 Feb 2015; Staff Report published - 19 Feb 2015 ✓ GNSO Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information PDP Webinar – 9 Jan 2015 2015 Blogs and Announcements: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System Update - ICANN - 01 Jun 2015 • WHOIS: Continuous Improvements in the Works - ICANN - 09 Jun 2015 • WEBINAR: WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System Phase I Report - 12 August 2015
2	Single WHOIS Policy	A Single Webpage containing links to all WHOIS related agreements and consensus policies developed.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Continued updates of the WHOIS Primer and the Knowledge Center: ✓ WHOIS ARS Phase 2 Cycle 1 Report: Syntax and Operability Accuracy - published 21 December 2015 ✓ WHOIS Accuracy Reporting: Phase 1: System Validation Criteria – 1 June 2015 ✓ Registrar Stakeholder Group input on 2013 RAA WHOIS Accuracy Specification – 14 May 2015 ✓ ICANN Staff Input on 2013 RAA WhoIs Accuracy Program Specification Review – 14 May 2015 ✓ Framework for a PDP Working Group on the Next Generation RDS – 26 April 2015 ✓ Implementation Report on WHOIS Improvements - April 2015 – April 2015 ✓ Implementation Reports on WHOIS Improvements are published quarterly.
3	Outreach: ICANN should ensure that WHOIS policy issues are accompanied by cross-community outreach	<p>Requirements that link to Registrant Benefits & Responsibilities document, written in simple language to educate registrants on obligations related to WHOIS, included in the 2013 RAA.</p> <p>ICANN Staff conducted global outreach to registrars to educate them on new 2013 RAA requirements.</p> <p>ICANN Contractual Compliance Staff conducted outreach in Asia/Pacific, highlighting WHOIS obligations in native languages.</p> <p>New WHOIS microsite launched:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Published in six languages; and • A one-stop-shop for those seeking information about WHOIS. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ ICANN Blogs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> WHOIS: Continuous Improvements in the Works June 2015 WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System Update June 2015 ✓ The 2013 RAA introduced improvements to WHOIS data with stricter validation and verification requirements. ✓ Contractual Compliance updates regularly provided at ICANN meetings: Marrakech at ICANN55 in March 2016, Dublin at ICANN 54 in October 2015, Buenos Aires at ICANN53 in June 2015, Singapore at ICANN 52 in Feb 2015 ✓ Completed system, FAQ, forms and Staff training to ensure 2013 RAA readiness. Please refer to this link for more details. ✓ Implementation of a Communications Plan to commence with the WHOIS Website launch ✓ Frequent updates through social media, such as twitter and Facebook in all UN languages.

<p>4</p> 	<p>Contractual Compliance: to managed in accordance with best practice principles</p>	<p>New Compliance complaints handling systems and procedures have been implemented.</p> <p>Greater visibility on WHOIS-related metrics and improvements to Compliance processes and results has been achieved.</p> <p>New 3 year Compliance Program on key registrar/registry obligations, including greater visibility on WHOIS-related metrics and improvements to Compliance processes and results</p> <p>New Registry Agreement Audit Program put in place.</p> <p>Compliance Staffing levels increased substantially and resources were allocated for additional headcount.</p>	<p>√ ICANN Contractual Compliance Performance Monthly Dashboard provide performance metrics information to the community on compliance</p> <p>√ Contractual Compliance Update – Quarterly reports</p> <p>√ Clarifications to the Registry Agreement, and the 2013 Registrar Accreditation Agreement (RAA) regarding applicable Registration Data Directory Service (WHOIS) Specifications</p> <p>√ 2016 ICANN Meeting Contractual Compliance Outreach Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ICANN55 Marrakech • ICANN 54 Contractual Compliance participated in several sessions • ICANN 53 Buenos Aires WhoIs Accuracy Specification Review Discussion - 24 June 2015 <p>√ Launched a WHOIS inaccuracy quality check on already resolved inaccuracy issues to confirm ongoing compliance</p> <p>√ Completed updates and additions to the complaint submission forms and FAQs for the 2013 RAA</p> <p>√ Contractual Compliance 2014 Annual Report – published Feb 2015</p> <p>√ Contractual Compliance Performance Reports now available</p> <p>√ Completed the plan and details for new Registry Agreement Provisions in Audit Plan Scope (New gTLD scope)</p> <p>√ Contractual Compliance Audit Program reflects new program and additional FAQ</p> <p>√ Compliance Department outreach activities.</p> <p>√ Contractual Compliance Staff levels published and updated regularly. Current Staffing covers the following languages: Arabic, English, French, Korean, Mandarin, Russian, Spanish, Turkish, and Uzbek.</p> <p>√ Contractual Compliance established in 3 regions; Los Angeles, Istanbul and Singapore.</p>
<p>Data Accuracy</p>			
<p>5</p> 	<p>WHOIS requirements for accurate data widely and pro-actively communicated</p>	<p>Staff developed a WHOIS Informational Website to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide historical record of WHOIS; • Consolidate WHOIS policy documentation; • Provide mechanisms to teach people how to use WHOIS; • Provide mechanisms for people to submit complaints as they relate to WHOIS data; • Direct people to the appropriate channels to become engaged in the community on WHOIS related topics; • Educate registrants on WHOIS, their rights and responsibilities; and • Provide a Knowledge Center where key WHOIS related documents can be located. 	<p>See #3 above.</p> <p>√ Usage of the WHOIS microsite has grown since its launch. This quarter (April through June 2016) there were 3,170,334 page views, and 1,792,576 sessions. 77.5% were from new visitors and 22.5% were returning visitors.</p>
<p>6</p> 	<p>ICANN should take appropriate measures to reduce the number of WHOIS registrations that fall into the accuracy groups “Substantial</p>	<p>To address this recommendation, the Board directed the CEO to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proactively identify potentially inaccurate gTLD data registration information in gTLD registry and registrar services, explore using automated tools, and forward potentially inaccurate records to gTLD registrars for action; and • Publicly report on the resulting actions to encourage improved accuracy. 	<p>See #7 & #11 below for information on the statistics on accuracy to be gathered in connection with the new WHOIS Search Portal.</p> <p>√ WHOIS ARS Phase 2 Cycle 1 Report: Syntax and Operability Accuracy published 21 December 2015</p>

	Failure and Full Failure"		
7	Annual WHOIS accuracy reports	<p>Staff is developing a WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System based on the methodology developed by NORC at the University of Chicago.</p> <p>To accomplish the requested analysis, Staff's work is focusing on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Statistical methodology; • Access to WHOIS records; • Parser to automate contact data extraction; • Automated address verification; and • Call center to call sampled records. <p>In 2015 Staff launched the Accuracy Reporting System to conduct bi-annual studies in collaboration with NORC. The project is being operationalized in phases, based on the stages of WHOIS Accuracy verification described in SAC058: SSAC Report on Domain Name Registration Data Validation (Syntax, Operational, and Identity). The studies leverage the commercial validation services customized to ICANN RRA requirements to test the syntactical and operation accuracy of the email, telephone number, and postal addresses using actual data of approximately 10,000 WHOIS records per study and produces estimates for the gTLD space as a whole as well as specific segments of interest. All records found to be inaccurate are provided to ICANN Contractual Compliance for follow up with the registrar.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Staff Report of public comments on WHOIS Accuracy Pilot Study Report - published 3 Apr 2015 ✓ Modifications to operationalize the Accuracy Reporting System ✓ Syntax Accuracy of WHOIS Data in gTLD's Presented in Accurate Reporting System Phase I Report (Syntactic validation) – August 2015 ✓ WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System (ARS) Criteria Updated to Include Operability Testing Criteria – Phase II (Syntactic + Operational) Criteria - September 2015 ✓ WHOIS ARS Testing Criteria - UPDATED 21 September 2015 ✓ Conclusion of 2013 Registrar Accreditation Agreement WhoIs Accuracy Program Specification Review in November 2015 notes that the specification will be subject to an additional review in approximately one year. This future review will have the added benefit of being informed by the data compiled via the WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System (ARS) initiative: ✓ WHOIS ARS Phase 2 Cycle 1 Report: Syntax and Operability Accuracy published 21 December 2015 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Webinar held 12 January 2016 ✓ WHOIS ARS Phase 2 Cycle 2 Report: Syntax and Operability Accuracy report released 8 June 2016 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Webinar held 16 June 2016 on Phase 2 Cycle 2: presentation materials ✓ WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System December 2016 report published 12 December 2016 ✓ All WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System (ARS) webinar recordings published in the knowledge center of the WHOIS website at: http://whois.icann.org/en/knowledge-center.
8	ICANN should ensure that there is a clear, unambiguous and enforceable chain of contractual agreements	<p>Additional enforcement provisions and sanctions applicable to registrars, registrants, and resellers with regards to WHOIS included in 2013 RAA.</p> <p>Enhanced WHOIS obligations included in New gTLD Registry Agreements.</p> <p>Renewals of existing gTLDs includes enhanced WHOIS obligations.</p> <p>WHOIS Accuracy specifications of the 2013 RAA reviewed annually.</p>	See #1.a above.
9	Compliance Metrics: Impact of the annual WHOIS Data Reminder Policy (WDRP)	The Board's Resolution addressing the WHOIS Review Team Recommendations offers an alternative approach to achieving the intended result of this Recommendation.	<p>See #5 - #7 above.</p> <p>In addition the following informational resources are available for WDRP compliance:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Whois Data Reminder Policy ✓ WDRP FAQs For Domain Name Registrants ✓ Implementation of the Whois Data Reminder Policy (WDRP) – 30 November 2004 ✓ WHOIS Data Reminder Policy (WDRP) ICANN Learn
10	Data Access – Privacy and Proxy Services: ICANN should initiate processes to regulate and oversee privacy	<p>New obligations related to Privacy/Proxy providers and commits ICANN to create a privacy/proxy accreditation program are included in the 2013 RAA.</p> <p>A GNSO PDP, beginning Oct 2013, has commenced to examine policy issues related to privacy/proxy services. A consensus policy, if produced out of the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The Board adopts on August 9, 2016 all the final recommendations of the Privacy & Proxy Services Accreditation Issues PDP Working Group, as passed by a unanimous vote of the GNSO Council on 21 January 2016 ("Privacy/Proxy Policy Recommendations"). ✓ The Board considered the GNSO's Accreditation of Privacy and Proxy Services Final Report

	and proxy service providers	<p>PDP, would become binding upon contracted parties when adopted by Board.</p> <p>Staff Implementation work to develop the operational aspects of the Privacy/Proxy Accreditation Program is to be conducted in parallel with GNSO PDP.</p>	<p>recommendations at its 15 May 2016 meeting, and deferred their consideration until after the Helsinki Meeting to be responsive to the GAC's Marrakech Communiqué</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Initial Report on the Implementation Advisory Group Review of Existing ICANN Procedure for Handling Whois Conflicts with Privacy Laws published 5 October 2015 ✓ Initial Report on the Privacy & Proxy Services Accreditation Issues Policy Development Process published for Public Comment- 5 May 2015 ✓ Final Report on the Privacy & Proxy Services Accreditation Issues Policy Development Process - 7 December 2015 ✓ Report of Public Comments on IAG Initial Report and Proposed Revisions to the ICANN Procedure for WHOIS Conflicts with Privacy Laws - 21 January 2016 ✓ On 21 January 2016 the GNSO Council approved all the consensus recommendations from the Working Group as contained in the Final Report. ✓ GAC Communiqué Marrakech, March 2016 ✓ ICANN issued a Call for Participation - Privacy & Proxy Services Accreditation Issues Policy Development Process (PDP) Implementation Review Team (IRT) September 19, 2016 ✓ An update of the proposed project plans was provided at ICANN 57 with a presentation that outlines all the implementation steps that will be undertaken.
11	 <p>Data Access – Common Interface: Overhaul of the Internic Service</p>	<p>ICANN developed a comprehensive WHOIS Portal, the development of which occurred in two phases:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Phase 1 - Launch of WHOIS Informational Website (see description above in #5); and • Phase 2 - Launch of WHOIS Online Search Portal to offer a place where people could initiate a search of global WHOIS records. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Future upgrades to include an overhaul of the Internic Service.
	Internationalized Domain Names		
12	 <p>Determine appropriate Internationalized Domain Name Registration (IRD) data requirements</p>	<p>The IETF WEIRDS Working Group has concluded its evaluation of technical protocols.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New Registration Directory Access Protocol (RDAP) developed; • Once adopted by the IETF, the new gTLD Registry Agreement and the New 2013 RAA will include commitments to adopt the new protocols. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ WEIRDS RDAP Protocol RFCs 7480-7484 published – Mar 2015 ✓ Registrars sign new 2013 RAA (2013 - 2018); List of Registrars on the 2013 RAA available here, ✓ New gTLD Registries sign new registry agreements. List of registry agreements available here. ✓ RDAP Operational Profile for gTLD Registries and Registrars - 3 December 2015 (Draft) ✓ IRD Team analysis under way ✓ Draft Final Report of IRD Team published for Public Comment – 9 Mar 2015 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report of Public Comments – 18 May 2015 ✓ Final Report from the Expert Working Group on Internationalized Registration Data - 23 September 2015 ✓ Board Approval of IRD recommendations Resolution 2016.03.10.05 – 2016.03.10.07 – 10 March 2016 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Implementation Plan to be developed – (TBD) 2016 See #13 below.
13	 <p>Requirements for Translation/ Transliteration of internationalized registration data</p>	<p>Issue of Translation/Transliteration was explored as a Policy matter within the GNSO Council. Consensus policy was produced out of the PDP and adopted by the Board and when implemented would become binding upon the contracted parties.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Initial Report on the Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information Policy Development Process - 15 Dec 2014

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ Final Report on the Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information Policy Development Process - 12 June 2015 √ Public Comment on GNSO Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information Policy Development Process (PDP) Recommendations for Board Consideration • Report of Public Comments – 13 August 2015 √ Board resolution adopting the GNSO Council Recommendations Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information recommendations - 28 September 2015 √ GNSO Policy Development Process (PDP) Update Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information 24 March 2016 √ GDD Memorandum to the GNSO Concerning Merge of Translation and Transliteration of Contact Information Implementation into Work Stream of “Thick WHOIS” Implementation Review Team - 10 May 2016 √ Board correspondence regarding GNSO consideration of the policy implications of the Internationalized Registration Data (IRD) Working Group’s Final Report - 11 May 2016 - Implementation dependent on when RDAP is in place, then est. three to six months for implementation plan development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Implementation Plan to be developed – (TBD)
14	Metrics on accuracy internationalized registration data	Internationalized WHOIS Records to be proactively identified once the work referenced in #12 and #13 is complete.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ GNSO Acknowledgement of receipt and next steps concerning the policy implications of the Internationalized Registration Data (IRD) Working Group’s Final Report 7 July 2016 √ Internationalized registration data (IRD) for WHOIS Records are being proactively identified in Phase I and Phase II of ARS reports. √ IDN Implementation Guidelines Also see #12 and #13.
15	Comprehensive Implementation Plan for implementing the Final WHOIS Review Team report.	ICANN Staff developed and published its proposed Action Plan , which was adopted by the ICANN Board.	
16	Publication of Annual Reports on Implementation of WHOIS RT Recommendations	ICANN published its first Annual Report one year after the Board’s approval of the WHOIS Policy Review Team Final Report Recommendations , with subsequent ones to be published annually thereafter.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ Publication of second Annual Report – 14 Dec 2014 √ Publication of third Annual Report – 4 Feb 2016