

13 February 2014

ICANN's Reply to the TF-AIDN Proposal to Form the Arabic Script Generation Panel

Thank you for your response to the call for Generation Panels to Develop the Root Zone Label Generation Rules. We sincerely thank each of the group members for offering your time and expertise to volunteer on the Arabic Script Generation Panel. Please find below ICANN's response to the proposal to form the Arabic Script Generation Panel as developed by the Task force on Arabic IDNs (TF-AIDN) formulated by the Middle East Strategy Group (MESWG).

Following the submission of your proposal, we reviewed the proposal and obtained advice from the Integration Panel in accordance with the [Procedure to Develop and Maintain the Label Generation Rules for the Root Zone in respect of IDNA Labels](#) (LGR procedure) and as outlined in the [Call for Generation Panels to Develop Root Zone Label Generation Rules](#). We find that the proposal sufficiently meets the required criteria. As such, the ICANN IDN Team is pleased to accept this proposal and formally seat the Arabic Script Generation Panel. Please find below information on panel membership as listed in your proposal, along with some logistic support information.

Review Criteria:

The review of the proposal determined that the proposed generation panel, its composition, and its scope meet the requirements set forth in the [LGR Procedure](#), and in particular the criteria set forth in the [Call for Generation Panels to Develop Root Zone Label Generation Rules](#) and summarized below. The following list of criteria has been taken into account in reviewing the panel's proposal.

General Criteria:

- Is the script relevant to the LGR?
- Is the Unicode subset clearly identified?
- Is the repertoire within the MSR?
- Are all principal languages listed?
- Are all significant countries listed?
- Are all relevant related scripts listed?

Panel Specific Criteria:

- Are there enough members?
- Are they representative of their linguistic communities?
- Does the combined expertise adequately cover the target writing system?
- Does the combined expertise include ICANN policy and process?
- Does the panel contain adequate DNS/IDNA/Unicode expertise?

Does the candidate chair appear to meet the required qualifications including recognition in the community?

Is there enough diversity in the panel (different economic interests, different institutional affiliation, members from outside of ICANN)?

Is the script unrelated to any other Script? If no, does the proposal identify the relation and address the necessary coordination?

Is the proposal sufficiently inclusive of relevant linguistic, regional and political communities?

Work Plan:

Is the timeline realistic?

Are the meeting schedules realistic?

Does the proposal adequately address issues of funding?

Does the panel membership cover the required expertise? If no, which expertise is lacking?

Any Other Issues Identified:

While reviewing the criteria on whether the proposal is sufficiently inclusive of relevant linguistic, regional and political communities, we noted the following:

While the IDN team understands that listing all user communities for a script as widely used as Arabic presents a challenge, we'd like to point the Generation Panel to the list of languages found in <http://std.dkuug.dk/jtc1/sc2/wg2/docs/n3882.pdf> which, among others, includes Rohingya. The IDN team encourages the Arabic Generation Panel to conduct a survey of claimed script use from publicly available sources like this to ensure whether some of this use either does not warrant support in the Root Zone, or cannot be accommodated because of lack of reliable information. This is a concern under the Longevity or Stability principles as described in the LGR Procedure.

Panel Membership Approved per the Proposal:

The Arabic Script Generation Panel is comprised of the following members:

1. Dr. Sarmad Hussein (Chair)
2. Abdelaziz Hilali
3. AbdulRahman I. Al-Ghadir
4. Adel M. Riyad
5. Alireza Saleh
6. Allan Ghazi Salahedin
7. Ammar Hussain Jaffri
8. Behnam Esfahbod
9. Hago Elteraifi Mohamed Dafalla
10. Hania Sabbidin-Dimassi
11. Hazem Hezzah
12. Inam Ullah

13. Meikal Mumin
14. Mohammad Ismail Nofal
15. Nadhem Al-Fardan
16. Noha Fathy Mohamed
17. Rinalia Abdul Rahim
18. Syed Iftikhar Shah
19. Tarik Merghani
20. Tariq Rahim Soomro

Changes to Panel Membership:

The Generation Panel maintains a current list of members and reports any desired changes to ICANN by sending updated information to idnvarianttlds@icann.org. In case of an addition, membership establishment guidelines will apply. The Generation Panel also maintains contact addresses for use by the public, ICANN and the Integration Panel on the [project website](#). The site will be maintained by ICANN staff based on information and updates submitted by e-mail by Generation Panel chair or designated representative.

Wikispace:

An ICANN Community wiki workspace for the Arabic Script Generation Panel (<https://community.icann.org/display/croscomlgrprocedure/Arabic+Script+GP>) has been created. At this time, the IDN team will maintain information on this page about the panel composition, membership, work plan updates and any other necessary information. The Generation Panel is expected to issue public reports on its ongoing work and email them to idnvarianttlds@icann.org for publication on the project website. We will look for your advice on how to keep this workspace up to date to best inform the community on the work.

Advisor Expertise:

Per the LGR procedure, ICANN makes available for Generation Panels the use of additional expertise through advisors. ICANN has retained the following advisors:

<https://community.icann.org/display/croscomlgrprocedure/Advisors>.

Additional advisors may be added upon request and approval by ICANN.

Working with the Integration Panel:

The LGR Procedure explicitly suggests that Generation Panels engage in some form of dialogue with the Integration Panel, even preceding the first submission. This dialogue would be a very useful way for the Generation Panel to be alerted early in cases where the Integration Panel anticipates problems with some features of the submission. Alternatively, it would give the Generation Panel an early opportunity to explain why it is taking certain decisions and why they are the right ones for IDN TLD labels and variants for its script. Part of such early dialogue may be the distribution of preliminary drafts. To enable this, ICANN has set up the LGR@icann.org mailing list to facilitate communications on matters related to LGR work and submissions of LGR proposals. Public archive of exchanges taking place on this mailing list are available at: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/lgr/>. All members of the Arabic Script Generation Panel have been subscribed to this list.

Announcing the Formation and Seating of the Arabic Script Generation Panel:

Please note that the ICANN IDN team will announce the formation of the Arabic Script Generation Panel on Friday, 14 February 2014. This will take place through an announcement that will appear on the ICANN website (<http://www.icann.org/en/news/announcements>).