

---

ALBERTO SOTTO: So I'll give the floor to the staff so that we can start the call. Terri, please go ahead.

TERRI AGNEW: Thank you Alberto. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the LACRALO monthly call, taking place on Monday the 20<sup>th</sup> of July, 2015 at 23:00 UTC.

On the call today we have Aida Noblia, Maricarmen Sequera, Milo Paraison, Cristian Casa, Sergio Salinas Porto, Johnny Laurenó, Javier Chandia Rojas, Alfredo Lopez, Juan Manuel Rojas, Johnny Laurenó, Jason Hynds, Fatima Cambrónero, Alberto Soto, Nirán Beharry, Humberto Carrasco, Bartlett Morgan, Lance Hinds, Alan Greenberg, Dev Anand Teelucksingh, Vanda Scartezini, and Alyne Andrade.

I show apologizes from Maritza Agüero.

From staff we have Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, and myself Terri Agnew.

Our Spanish interpreter today is David.

Our Portuguese interpreters today are Betina and Espernaza.

I would also like to remind all participants to please state your name before speaking, not only for transcription purposes, but also to allow our interpreters on the other language channel. We have Spanish and Portuguese interpretation. Thank you very much and back over to you Alberto.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking. If you could please add Antonio Medina Gomez, who has just joined the call. And if somebody, if there is somebody else that we didn't mention, please state now.

Nobody else? Okay. So let's now go to approving the agenda. I'll give the floor over to Humberto.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. Humberto Carrasco for the record. Let's now go to improving the agenda. First of all, we're going to deal with the status of the policy document in relation both to the creation of statements, and the proposal to recruit ALSs, then we're going to deal with a governance report by Sergio Salinas Porto. Item six is the participation of ALSs by Alberto Soto. And item seven is the presentation by Lance Hinds.

We're going to give him 10 minutes. As you know, there will be a vote to confirm his name as an ALAC member. And then some questions and answers to him. And then other issues that you would like to add at the end of the agenda. With this, then we will consider the agenda approved, and I now give the floor to Alberto, unless you would like to go to dealing with the documents now.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. There are no objections, so the agenda is approved. Let's continue with item number four then.

---

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto speaking. Thank you Alberto. I just wanted to say that in item 4A, with respect to LACRALO's proposed procedures for the creation, future, and publication of statements, I want to say that the definitive document is in English, and we are awaiting translations into Spanish, and in support of this as well.

If we want to put this to vote. There is nothing else to do there from the point of view of our work. What we are showing now is a webpage with the Wiki, where you can see the document compared to some suggestions that we made, which ones were approved and which ones were not.

This is actually explained in the Word document. You can click on the link where it says documents here, and where it says [inaudible] documents here, and you can click on the Word here, and then you can find some notes on the right where you see the comments, both from [inaudible] things and from Dev Anand Teelucksingh.

And you can see then which were acceptance and which were not. Once we have the translation, we will have a deadline for both. And once this is ready, we will inform this to the whole community members. As for the proposal to recruit new ALSs, I understand we are also undergoing the same process, but probably we are a bit before that. That is, we are on the part where we create the final document.

The same applies to the metrics proposal. I don't know whether you would like to add something, and I can give you the floor on this issue.

---

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking. Yes, we actually prepared the metrics document, the metrics proposal. It's not on the Wiki because it's being translated into English and Portuguese. And it has been prepared with the same policy of making clear what are the modifications, and who suggested each modification or amendment.

We have already met the deadlines for the stage that [inaudible] status actually in our rules, but still, because this is an issue that is a very high interest, and we want to achieve consensus, we will hold a webinar with the latest document that has at least all the opinion that we have reached so far. That was all I wanted to say.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. Thank you very much Alberto. And I now give the floor to Fatima Cambronero.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking for the record. Can you hear me fine?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: We are hearing you a bit from afar.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking. With respect to the metrics, I want to bring an issue that Carlos Agurria mentioned on the LACRALO list. And maybe you can help us with this. At some point, someone on ALAC said that

---

the metrics for the ALSs and the RALOs would maybe be created from ALAC. And this is a doubt that I have, that is, can each RALO have its own RALOs, or will this be as an instruction from ALAC, considering that in the latest meeting in Buenos Aires, on Thursday, the last day, Alan showed a draft that he himself explained that this is a document to start working on this requirement for ALSs.

In view also of preparing the metrics document. So I would like to have some clarification on this, considering that we are working on metrics, and that we need to make an effort, that it's not going to be good, because actually this would be coming from ALAC. So maybe Alan, you could make this clear to all of us, since you are now on the call.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. Alberto, I'll give you the floor if you want to clarify this, so please go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you very much. It's Alan Greenberg speaking. And we have some music on the English channel. I will speak over it. There are two levels. There are requirements that can be set by the ALAC, requirement expectations, rules, whatever, that can be set by the ALAC, which apply to all RALOs and all ALSs, if the ALAC decides of course.

And over and above those, a RALO can set its own rules and processes, that further guide the ALSs in their region. So it's a two level process, it's always been that way. We have had, in the past, we have not been

---

very active. We talked a lot about setting expectations for ALSs, but we've never done a lot in about eight, since about eight, nine years ago.

And we're looking at that now. But it doesn't alter the fact that RALOs have responsibility, and of course, RALO people and ALSs should be involved in the ALAC process as well. I hope that makes it clearer, but if not, I'll try again. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto Soto speaking. It's actually very clear. It has been discussed a lot. It has, I have also been told that 2010 onwards, people have been working on this at least at the RALO level. That, since no results were achieved, and we have processed all of this, I think this is not incompatible with the fact that we can finish our metrics beforehand, considering that the discussion in ALAC will take a long time.

And if we reach a good consensus, then maybe this is good, not as an example, but at least we can have some parameters. And if ALAC will determine some other kind of metrics, then we will have no problem commenting them, and including them in our RALO, or dealing with this in our RALO.

Would anybody like to make a comment or ask a question? Alan, please go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Yes, thank you. The other thing to remember is we are just starting on an external review of At-Large, and the focus of, the focus of the last

---

review, several years ago, was the ALAC, was the At-Large Advisory Committee. The focus of this review will primarily be RALOs and ALSs. And we all know we have had a problem with participation from many ALSs, not all of course.

There are some that are very active, but some that are not very active at all. And, you know, the discussions within the ALAC, have indicate, have said that we really want to demonstrate to the review, that we are being proactive. That we are trying to address the issue. We really don't want the reviewer to come in and say, you know, you have a problem. And you've never, ever done anything about it.

So even though we've talked about this for a number of years, the timing of the external review has almost convinced us that we really can't delay the process anymore. We really want to try to make our own recommendations before someone else comes in and gives us suggestions, that we should really be our own masters. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto speaking. Thank you Alan. We are working precisely on that issue. Unfortunately, we have just a few members, and it's all the time the same members, who are on that working group. We have not received any invitation to participate, and we hope to receive it before this [inaudible]. We're going to deal with this issue today.

We are trying to approach our ALSs so that they can get involved. We have taken some initiative. We have sent some email before to those that were not participating, and in some cases, who haven't even received an answer. In some others, we have received some replies.

---

And today in particular, we want to try and deal with this issue. Now for this, we have also sent an email not only to the list, including the agenda issue and the meeting, but we have also sent that email to each of the members who represent the ALSs, who have no participation, or who had little participation so far.

We are even going to see some ALSs do have some participation, and they were not listed there. Does anybody else want to say something?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto speaking. Sergio Salinas Porto wants to take the floor. Sergio, please go ahead.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio speaking. Can you hear me?

I had raised my hand, but I realized that I actually have to take the floor. So I'm going to talk about my report, and then make a clarification.

The report in the governance group, I mean, we have sent some documents for translation.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Just to continue with the agenda...

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio Salinas Porto speaking. And he's going to deal with item number five on our agenda.



---

This is Sergio speaking. Thank you Alberto. I need to inform... This is Sergio Salinas Porto for the record. And I was saying that we have sent two final reports, actually two final documents. One is a metrics document, and the other one is the operational principles document. We have taken the input for the operational principles. We have received very rich contributions.

This was a review made by Carlos Aguirre, and we have included inputs from others. I mean, we have included these in the operational principles, and we have sent it for translation. We have not posted this on the Wiki. Silvia asked me today, if I could post it at the Wiki, but we preferred not to post it until it is translated into English and Portuguese as well.

So that there are no problems in the region, and we come out together, and see it on each of our languages. So this is going to take a few days until the translation is completed. And then we will put the document to vote, and after ending this process, and after the vote, we will take this to our Secretary.

Now with respect to the metrics work, my opinion is that we need to continue with this metrics issue, because I mean, we need to adapt it to what ALAC says. We need to have it as a basis so that we can continue working, and of course, the rules of procedure will need to work on this metrics document as well.

So I would say that we should continue working on this. And then we will see what ALAC will say, and we will adapt our work from our

---

regional metrics documents to the global issues that ALAC can show. That's all I have to say. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto Soto speaking. Thank you Sergio. Does anybody have any question about this?

I see no hands up. So we're going to go to item number six, participation of ALSs. As I said, we do have a problem. We have been able to increase participation, we went from six to seven participants, to up to 50% of the ALSs that we were originally. We are now 47 almost 48 ALSs. We are receiving the last one, right now.

And today, we have around 20 participants. It's a good number, but it should be higher. And then the other problem, resulting from the lack of participation is related to the webinars. We are investing a lot of time and effort, and the work of many people. And this costs a lot of money. And I think we need to use or make the most of our resources.

We're trying, that is we are making external limitations. There are some of our people who are getting involved, but we want to increase the level of participation. So what I'm going to open now, is I'm going to say the following. Those of you who have participated, who have had low participation, if you want to start speaking now freely about why is it that you can't participate, or that you don't want to participate, and give us the tools, the necessary tools, to see how we can solve the participation issue and try to raise our levels.

Who is going to speak now? Please go ahead.

---

Nobody wants to take the floor? Please.

JAVIER CHANDIA ROJAS: This is Javier Chandia from Chile speaking. Please. I would like to say hello to all of you. Can you hear me?

The participation issue, well each person has their own time. I mean, in the world that we each of us is involved in, and sometimes the time we have, we use it in the association that we are representing. That is, in the different activities in the different presentations. But we do need to recognize that we are not participating as we should.

And in a way, I mean, this is not an excuse, but we receive many emails in English, and for those of us who do not speak very good English, those emails imply translating them, and it implies some additional time to understand them. So, for the RALOs in Latin America and the Caribbean, we need to say that sometimes all of the issues are very English centered. They are focused on English issues.

So I think we should receive a summary from the secretary, for example, with the main issues that are dealt with, because precisely, all of those emails are in English, and we end up losing them.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Are you done?

---

JAVIER CHANDIA ROJAS: Javier speaking now. And I was saying, we need to recognize certain issues. Especially in user's associations like the one I represent, this requires a lot of time after our working day. I mean, all of these activities require time after our working day. So sometimes we don't really have that time to participate in activities like the one we are having right now.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Javier, you mentioned an issue that is essential. I mean, we all get very tired. And, of course, we all receive a very large amount of emails. This is something we need to deal with. We need to review the number of emails, so that we don't get lost on them.

I really don't think that there is, there are people who don't want to participate, and there are many people who send their apologies all of the time. And now, when you send, I think you sent an email to the list today.

JAVIER CHANDIA ROJAS: Javier speaking. Yes, I think so.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto speaking again. Javier sent an email with two important activities that his own ALS is doing. He says that he is investing time, and he actually is doing that. The thing is, we didn't really have that information. And also, we need to consider the participation of hubs. There are organizations who have a hub convened in four hubs, and

---

those hubs had 28, 30, and even more participants in their own countries.

And this is an activity that is not being reported. I have received reports from Columbia, and I think Alberto, there are also at some point, and we also need to consider that as participation. This is extremely important. And it would be very important that each person who cannot go to the meetings, I mean, I have sent this by email. That is, once again, if you cannot go to the meetings [CROSSTALK]...

...he sent an email, and we follow that all the moments until the ALS receive the expenses that he has made. That is, this is an activity to really monitor, to follow up, and of course, this is considered active participation.

And so, we need to deal with emails and we need to see what other kinds of participation are there, not only monthly meetings, but also to consider that when each of our organizations was certified as an ALS, we assumed a participation commitment. There are different honors for participation, and before dealing with the metrics, though I have already [spoke to them], I think we need to add the other activities.

Javier Chandia Rojas has just sent me an email from Chile, [inaudible] against cyber bullying, and it contained to increase [digital rating]. These are all campaigns for individual users or end users on the Internet. So let's see, who else would like to take the floor? There are many.

---

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto Carrasco speaking. We first have Carlton, then Fatima, and then Dev Anand, in that order.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto speaking. Carlton, please go ahead. You have the floor now.

CARLTON SAMUELS: Okay. Thank you Alberto. This is Carlton Samuels for the record. I hope you're hearing me. [Inaudible] participation in a couple of... There is a participation that comes from engaging in conversations on the list. [Inaudible] the list, it is supposed to be a translated list, the translation engine is poor to very poor. And we know that is a problem.

The technology taskforce is spending a lot of time helping ICANN figure out how to get this thing going right. So I quite agree [inaudible] ideas, then we might not be have enough capacity to respond [inaudible] that can [inaudible]... policy development process, because that's what they're involved in....

INTERPRETER: Carlton, this is the interpreter speaking. Unfortunately, I cannot understand you. Your sound is very low, and I cannot understand you. Is there any way you can improve your sound?

CARLTON SAMUELS: I don't know. I have a headphone on, and I'm speaking as slow as I can. Are you hearing me any better?

---

INTERPRETER: Yes, please go ahead.

CARLTON SAMUELS: I was saying that participation is [inaudible]. First of all, the conversation on the list is important, because that all goes back to the [inaudible] on an idea, about what a regional perspective could be on any important issue that comes up for discussion on the list.

So we know that the list is translated. We know that there is a problem with the translator. And until such time as the translation is improved, we will have difficulty understanding each other on the list. I mean, sometimes we can look at what's translated. It's really [inaudible]. It doesn't help the understanding, but it's quite, sounds quite funny. As in ha-ha funny, with what comes out on the list.

So there was a problem, an operational problem that needs to be solved. It's been taking too long. It's taking much and forever to get it right, in my opinion. The second thing is, that because we are, most At-Large structures are not single issue organisms, they were not raised just to participate in the ICANN [inaudible] develop, policy development. That's not the case.

Most At-Large structures exist as an organization for this that or the other. That is why, for example, you will hear [inaudible] from Chile, saying that their WHOIS [inaudible]... very much concerned about. That that is [inaudible]... on the list and so on. But that really, [inaudible] At-Large structures to get involved in, because it's about end user [input].

---

But if you look at that [inaudible] topic in relation to numbers, I mean new development, policy development, they're actually not [inaudible], they're not within the mainstream of the kind of policy issues that come within ICANN. Because that is the content and those kinds of things. [Inaudible]... very little surface area on some of these issues that that ALS would be interested in, towards [names] policy development, which ICANN is all about.

So we need to understand that At-Large structures are not single issues organizations...

TERRI AGNEW: Excuse me, Carlton? This is Terri. I apologize for interrupting. But our... Your audio is breaking up, and our interpreters are unable to interpret at this time.

CARLTON SAMUELS: Terri, I can hear you perfectly. I don't know why they can't hear me.

TERRI AGNEW: And I apologize.

CARLTON SAMUELS: I'm going to retire. I don't know why they can't hear me, but I'm hearing you perfectly. [Inaudible]...



---

TERRI AGNEW: Are you able to chat? [CROSSTALK]

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima Cambronero speaking for the record.

CARLTON SAMUELS: No, it's too hard. I just, I'll just retire. Thanks.

TERRI AGNEW: Thank you Carlton.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima Cambronero speaking. With respect to what they were saying, there are each time, more and more emails, and they're posting this with each organization, and we, of course, need to increase the scope within ICANN. And then one suggestion I can say, is that they choose one or two items only, and then reduce the load of email to read. And then focus perhaps on one issue, and follow that up. And being able to debate with the whole group.

That is one of the suggestions that can work. And then if we are looking to the reasons, that is why people are not participating in general, it would be an easy thing, to look at what the causes are. And we would need to see what this classification is and why is it? Is it a lack of training, perhaps? And why is it that there is training needed in LACRALO?

---

Some people do not have the necessary time. We, all of us, do make an effort to be there, but this can be a cause as well. And also, if you consider that we were chosen as representatives in the region, there is a lack of leadership, and to ask you to not be representative, represented within that leadership line, there might be also a lack of interest. And if you say that these are the issues, there are not, that the ALAC is not interested in those issues, or that they don't want to discuss those issues, because these issues are not related to the work they do.

There is also the lack of discussion of policy within LACRALO. For a long time, within the LACRALO agenda, we dealt with the political discussions in ALAC, and these were somehow lost within the last LACRALO call, and in the last policies that were discussed, the ALAC members said that all of these issues were discussed.

And this is related to the first issue that was discussed today, which was the document for [inaudible] of LACRALO, and if we do not make any statement, this is not going to be any good. This is something that we have somehow lost, and this may be one of the reasons why people are not participating. This is just an issue that I'm putting now forward just for us to consider. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto Soto speaking. Thank you Fatima. There was an email sent with all of the lists and, with a list of all of those associations who were not participating, or who have a low level of participation, so that they could send today and say why is it that they are not participating. Was it because of lack of time? Or for any reason whatsoever. So I

---

would like to listen to everybody today, but especially those organizations who could not participate and see if we can remedy that.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This Is Fatima speaking again. Just to reply to that. I understand what you are doing and I am helping you. Let's see if I can be understood. I know that people are not answering, and then somehow I am getting some kind of classification so that people still can identify and see if they advertised they are identified or not. But if you want then, I can give the floor to others as well.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Dev, you now have the floor. Please go ahead.

DEV ANAND TELLUCKSINGH: Thank you. This is Dev Anand Tellucksingh speaking. Can you hear me?

TRANSLATOR: You are fine Dev, please go ahead.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. I think one of the challenges, there have been so many challenges related to the translation of the mailing list, but I think Fatima also hits on a key point, is that we are not even engaging with the At-Large persons that are involved in the various groups. The working groups are supposed to be where the At-Large is done, in coordination all of the five regions,

---

regional At-Large groups. So and I think I noticed, especially on the LACRALO calls of late, is that we haven't been discussing any policy issues, in terms of interacting with our ALAC members, or interacting with those persons on the various working groups, as to what is happening in those various working groups.

And so I mean, I would suggest, you know, what the RALO chair and the secretariat should do is to look at the, you know, the various reports coming from the working groups that is presented as part of the monthly ALAC call, and actually just look at the members, and ask questions. And ask questions beforehand, you know, I want to get an update from what is happening in this working group, and so forth.

And I think then you get... People will be better engaged, because right now, it's kind of frustrating, and I'm a person that is, I would say, is very involved in the working groups, and it's kind of like it's invisible to the RALO, in the sense that, you know, so the RALO is not engaging with me. I'll throw it back the other way. The RALO is not interacting with me, because of all of the work I'm doing on the working groups. So that's my key point.

And I'll stop because I know, I want to give other persons a chance.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto speaking. Thank you Dev. This is a very good point, and this is something that we can coordinate with our ALAC members, so that we can see how we can have this information being discussed within the region, and within the deadlines if we have picks. Alan, you have the floor. Please go ahead Alan.

---

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you very much. Just a couple of quick points. Javier made a number of good points when he started this discussion. And I think one of them is the lack of understandable messages, and understandable is not only a Spanish issue, but it's also a phrase in turn that can be understood by someone who does not spend all of their life in ICANN.

And I don't think it's reasonable to expect LACRALO or Humberto to do all of that kind of work himself. It's ICANN responsibility to make sure that we can present things, in both in a technology level and a language that people have access too. And that's one of the main things that we're looking at in the larger At-Large discussion of supporting ALSs, and seeing what we expect. So that's part of it.

The second thing is, it's really important, as we just said, that we try to find where ALSs have interests in ICANN, and focus on them. And the last point is, if we can ever get translation correct and working well on the LACRALO discuss list, hopefully we can use it on other lists as well. That may not help people contribute, but it will help people understand what's going in within ICANN.

So there is much work to be done. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto speaking. Johnny, you now have the floor.

This is Alberto speaking. Johnny, please go ahead. Johnny Laureano, please go ahead.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. Johnny Larueano is first. Johnny, you now have the floor.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking again. Johnny Larueano? It seems that Johnny has some kind of communication... Humberto, you now have the floor. We are waiting for Johnny.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. Can you hear me fine?

Actually we have talked about the reasons, and I want to focus on one issue, and an experience that as I have had as a secretary and interacting with other members in the region. The truth is that there are different levels of members in the region, and I could say that there are some advanced members, such as Carlton Samuels, or Dev, or Fatima, who know a lot whether a very, very knowledge when compared to others, and they know a lot how to see ICANN.

And there are some other members who are not so advanced, and who have an average knowledge, and there are some others who have some basic knowledge in the region. And the truth is that the best way to see people engaged and participating is to give them more responsibility. Not only working within the working group, because sometimes this will not work.

---

And still most of the time, this will work, so they need to be engaged, they need to be involved, they need to participate, and this will increase their level of knowledge. Aside from all of the training that we can offer, I think that the responsibility, once you accept it, or once it is accepted by all of the members, is the best way to learn. In the end, it's just to use the concept of learning by doing.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto speaking. Thank you. Johnny Laureano, have you solved your problem?

Johnny can you speak?

This is again, Alberto Soto speaking. Fatima, you now have the floor.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

This is Fatima speaking for the record. Since Humberto mentioned me, I can now give an opinion on this. This is an issue that has concerned us in LACRALO, the lack of participation. As you all know, I learned by reading by myself. I had some very good mentors who helped me approach those issues, but this is not something...

I mean, there is no school where you can learn all of this. So a good suggestion, perhaps, is to follow one issue only. If you do not have sufficient time or dedication to see all the issues going on in ICANN, because of course it is impossible, then you should stick one issue and learn that, and throughout time, you will include other issues, and this is how you'll learn.

---

This is not something that happens from one day to the other. This doesn't happen overnight. It takes time, and many of us have offered to help you if you need help to learn more. I still volunteer, I still offer my collaboration to help you. And my suggestion would be this, take only one issue and do not be overwhelmed by everything that is going on in ICANN, because you will not be able to learn everything.

But just limit to something. Focus on only one issue.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Now Cristian Casa has the floor.

CRISTIAN CASA: This is Cristian Casa speaking for the record. Can you hear me?

Our experience is that we have learned that being a volunteer in ICANN, this is something that we can call a [corporate] volunteering, it's actually different from volunteering as an individual action, that you do, or that you engage in, in other organizations. Since we started to have more engagement in London, and since we started working on the governance group, as Fatima said, we didn't really have the capacity, and we're starting to, we started to be more involved in the rules of procedure.

And this is how we started to understand the ICANN process. Our process is flow, it's very big and we have managed to be in all of the LACRALO meetings, and to at least listen to what is going on. To listen to the process. I have even been in contact with you Alberto, by email and I have asked how is it that we can contribute to the ALS process.



---

So, our process is slow, but we do feel very engaged, very committed within the governance working group, and we set short metrics. That is, the fact that we participate within the governance group that is, had [inaudible] such as Sergio Salinas Porto, imply that we wanted to contribute to some rules, to start to get some training on rules of procedure within LACRALO, and we found some ICANN ramifications inside, that has actually helped us.

So this is a slow process. We continue to contribute to ICANN. That's all. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto Soto speaking. Thank you Cristian. The process that you think is slow, is actually not that slow, and it actually is a constant permanent participation. It has never been interrupted, and it would be very good if we could all say that we have your kind of participation. I also want to say, and this is something that I have mentioned many times, when we talk about engagement and participation, and the right...

If someone has the right to vote, and he cannot be there, he, that is, the members of an ALS have all the rights to participate in all of the discussions, and to participate also in the working group if they do not have a right to vote. It is true, and it is saying in the chat room, I cannot really see everything, if there are elections and the representative is changed, that's why I insist that we need to have participation of more than one member per ALS, per organization.

---

In many of our meetings, we had only one ALS with two members, who are present, and many times, these ALS have the two participants. So, the way to achieve this is, for example, to have the participation of one if the other one cannot participate. So thank you Johnny. Johnny is saying that, let me read what Johnny is saying. Just give me one second.

He is saying he cannot speak, and he's saying that it is necessary to give the necessary weight to the calls, as expressed by Fatima Clambronero. We need to review the mechanisms [inaudible]... LACRALO should have a technical secretariat, it also needs to see how we can find the participation of at least one person from each ALS in the region. ICANN needs to see that the final, or the end users are represented. We will consider that. So let's see who is the next speaker. Alejandro Pisanty, you now have the floor.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro Pisanty speaking. Can you hear me?

ALBERTO SOTO: You are sounding very loud Alejandro. Go ahead Alejandro, please.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: I'm going to speak slowly because the sound is not very good. I do not believe that the hypothesis that there is a low participation because we are not dealing with relevant policy issues. This is just an experiment. And I think we can ask both the chair and the secretariat, that with an agreement of all of the volunteers, at least once each month, we can start a discussion on the different policies.

---

And what we have tried on many occasions throughout the year, especially last year, is to select those issues that are now being debated, then that are particularly relevant for the organizations in the region, and this is how we can get to know, or this is how we can attain the technical knowledge that we need, whether it is technical issues specifically or it's legal issues, or policy issues.

And then we can discuss this again, three, six, and 12 months later on. And then, there is an obligation for training. And we need to be more careful in admitting that. If an organization cannot show that they have the necessary knowledge, or ICANN, we probably need to condition their access through our bylaws. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto Soto speaking. Thank you Alejandro Pisanty. We are, within the governance group, we are trying to do the same. But we can take the same idea from the plan that you have mentioned for discussion. The thing is that we are going to be very choosy, and I have been given [inaudible] and people have told me, I don't want to participate in that because we don't have the specific knowledge.

And then, following that concern, that is the lack of training, we can even create a specific webinar. And that person, and many other people did not really participate on that. So I want to be told this. Why is it that you're not participating? If you're saying that you have a need for training, some of you are saying that you have a specific need for training, and we know that it's not only a single person, and people start participating.

---

So we what we're trying to do is to compliment what Fatima and Nathalie had done within, what has already been done by taking certain issues, that is it's not that these issues are wrong, but there are some issues that we need to shorten, and to make them more interactive. Those of you who have questions, even if you have taken the webinars that are online, you should participate and ask your questions.

And we don't really see a lot of participation. So there is a need for everyone to say, what is it that they want, what are the problems they have so we can try and to solve them.

Is there anybody else who would like to take the floor?

Go ahead, Alejandro Pisanty.

Alejandro needs to go a little further from the microphone because the sound is really bad.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

Is it better now?

This is Alejandro speaking. I think we need to insist on the policy discussions. We need to establish the agenda for each session, and in the first half hour needs to be dealt, that is we need to deal with policy issues within the first half hour. And we need to devote the rest of the time for procedural issues for training, etc. Otherwise, the necessary administration of each session will force us to give the policy issue.

So we need to focus on policy issues as well. So that we can change the focus, and even the kind of representatives that will participate,

---

focusing on the agenda issues and not on the procedural issue. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Thank you Alejandro. This is an issue that we're going to deal with again. We need to discuss this with our ALAC members so that we can...

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro speaking. Please do not rule this option out as you did the other time.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Hello?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Humberto speaking now. I think we lost Alejandro. Perhaps Alejandro, you can state this in writing, because we really not understand you even in Spanish.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro speaking. I want to make a formal motion. Perhaps when monitoring the time for the teleconferences...

INTERPRETER: It's very difficult to understand Alejandro. We apologize.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Perhaps we need to have an agenda with the issues to be discussed, with the substantive policies that are being discussed now. I ask you to consider this as such, and not to rule out these motion as you did in practice last time. This was a motion that included a proposal for consensus to obtain the objectives and the main criteria for assessing participation. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. I am saying that the motion was actually considered, and it needs to be worked together with our ALAC members, because we ourselves are not going to take each issue. The policies are the policies that are being discussed at the time of ICANN. And it will be considered as such. Johnny Laureano, you now have the floor.

SILVIA VIVANCO: This is Silvia Vivanco speaking, from staff. It was very... At least it was difficult for me to understand Alejandro's motion. So perhaps, I mean, just to be able to put this on the note. So if you can actually repeat it.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto Carrasco speaking for the record. Alejandro, if possible, I would like you to send an email or to write this on the chat room, because sometimes it was difficult to understand you. The sound was very bad, I understood that you wanted the first 30 minutes to be,

---

just to be for public policy, but then your sound was lost and it wasn't really understood.

So please, if you could write it on the chat room, you're writing it now. Okay. So this is how we can have this considered.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking. Johnny Laureano, you now have the floor.

JOHNNY LAUREANO: This is Johnny speaking. This is Johnny Laureano for the record. I think it is timely to discuss this issue Alberto. And I think that Fatima's input, with respect to identifying the causes are very valuable. This is how we're going to identify what is happening with the participation of the ALSs.

[Inaudible]... causes are. And if we identify which are the important causes and which are not, then we're going to be more successful. I'm referring to the way each RALO was created a few years ago. This follows the mechanism for the participation. And we have been following a very continuous mechanism, continuous mechanism, that now needs to be reviewed, because we need to have mechanisms that allow for participation of the ALSs.

There are different interests, and Fatima Clambronero representing some other members, she can convey a point of view that [inaudible]... and this has to be done. This is okay when it is done in a certain way, but this is slowly... I mean, we need to have this very clear.

---

INTERPRETATION: We apologize, but the sound is not very clear.

JOHNNY LAUREANO: I have heard many times that certain issues have advanced a lot, and each of them defends their role, and each of them defends their positions, and in those discussions in the LACRALO and in ALAC, this needs to be with those issues that prevent some participation. And Alan has said this and some others have referred to this as well. The way in which we feel sort of isolated, one from the other.

I think there is a very clear advantage for those of us who use the academic way, because this is important to refer to the teaching side, and the professional side.

So we need to consider what everyone wants to do with their participation in ICANN. When we talk about LACRALO, we talk about the mechanism for participation in ICANN. But probably, the issues, many of the issues have not been voted on, so we need to talk about mechanisms or causes, and we need to consider that there are certain motions that are not being considered, like what Alejandro said.

But I believe, Alejandro, I think we need to identify these causes, and I think we need to have a higher participation. And we will achieve this if we create a secretariat that will consider some technical aspects, and will bring it to a level of knowledge of an ALS.

I think we need to understand the differences between those who are academics, and the people who represent the users from different



---

points of view. I'm not saying that one of them is more intelligent than the other. But there is an advantage that you have when you learn that, when you learn and you can teach the final user, or the end user, has needs that they need to solve, and this sometimes takes a lot of time.

I think we need to create a technical secretariat that can translate some relatively difficult issues for those people, and we need to reach a level of understanding, and conclude some policies that have already been agreed.

We have reached the time when LACRALO needs to talk about a new structure that allows for better participation from all of the ALSs. We need to have them, just make them be more democratic. I'm not actually going to refer to countries, but there are ALSs have larger participation than others.

As ALSs we represent interests that are different one from the others. So this is a time where we need to consider whether the principles that founded LACRALO, and I think we need to review. Thank you.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. Alberto Soto are you there?

Alberto, we have 18 minutes.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking.

---

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel speaking. I was waiting for the call, but I couldn't really hear it. But I'm here now.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking. You need to be very brief because we have one more issue to deal with and we have no more time.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel speaking for the record. I think it's very unfair that I need to be short when everybody has spoken a lot. So one, I don't really understand why Johnny has said what he has said. I also work on the academia, and this has nothing to do with this issue. Two, I consider the working group that have been formed in ALAC, everybody can participate in them.

I have participated in many of them. And going back to what Fatima said, this also includes how much each person is interested in learning that issue that is being dealt with. I have been engaged in many groups, and I have had to study and learn, and even, I have even been able to improve my English, because there are many groups that don't really have simultaneous translation.

I'm not sure whether the technical secretariat that Johnny is proposing is a viable option, because if we have not been able to improve the rules of procedure for a long time, then maybe this is not a good proposal, though it could be a good idea for the future. Three, I think that the different issues in the different groups allow us to deal with specific issues.

---

I have just seen an email dealing with gTLDs that are now being protected, that [inaudible] etc. and we are seeing comments on these issues. There are many people who have legal knowledge. I don't have them. So those people could participate in that. And it also depends on what everybody says, and how everybody wants to participate in each of the groups.

So maybe you can, even if English is a barrier, you can participate anyway. And I think this is to do with the participation for everybody. That is, I know that there are people who do not participate in each of the monthly meetings, but you can still participate in other groups, as is my case.

This also has to do with the training that everybody has. That is the personal learning.

ALBERTO SOTO:

This is Alberto Soto. Your concerns are being considered. When all of the documents are translated, you will see why. We have very limited time. We need to go to item number seven, which is a presentation by Lance Hinds, as the next person who is going to be an ALAC member.

Lance, please go ahead with your presentation, and I'm open to questions later on. We have 15 minutes.

LANCE HINDS:

Hello? Hello?

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Hi Lance. I can hear you. Can the interpreters hear Lance?

INTERPRETER: We can hear you Lance, please go ahead.

LANCE HINDS: Okay. Thank you Alberto. So let's see, where do I start? I come with 28 years of, first as a provider of technology and solutions. And also in my later years, as an IT policy advisor and consultant. I think my first interaction with ICANN would have been when I start as an advisor to the Prime Minister at the time, dealing with the problems we had with our dot GY domain re-delegation back to what, and back to Ghana, as opposed to where it was at the time.

And that would have been in the 1990s. I was then a founding member of LACRALO in Buenos Aires, and have been a member of LACRALO ever since. I am one of those organizations... Well, I wear quite a few hats. I'm the chairman of [inaudible], first of all, which is an ICG development NGO. And one of the things that we do is just to continue to work on exposing all stakeholders in the use of IT, whether it's an economically challenged areas where there is [inaudible] where there is [inaudible].

Any area where there is weakness, we try to see how we can [inaudible] and [inaudible] the use of IPT. I'm a business man, to some extent. I own a company called The [Green Stream?] Group. And what we also do there is provide a range of consulting services, software development for governments, NGOs, and private sectors agencies as well.

---

On another hat, until the end of this year, I am the president of the Georgetown Chamber of Commerce and Industry, and that is as an advocate for a private sector group in Ghana. I continue to participate in a regional and [inaudible] institutions for technology and private sector IP development. [Inaudible] is a regional innovation and private sector [inaudible] group.

That is an European Union agency, where we have a mandate to continue to provide export, IP export and investment promotion services. So once again, continue to help ISP groups in the Caribbean, to expand in knowledge [inaudible] scope. I'm also a long time member of something called the [inaudible] ICT steering committee.

And one of the things that we work on there is to develop policy and develop an action plan, for regional initiatives to support regional governments and private sector, and other stakeholders, as we look to see how IP could improve the productive capacity, the economic empowerment of our citizens.

One of the things we also do here, is we... I'm one of the co-authors of the IC [inaudible] International development strategy, which again, is to provide a technical direction in terms of how ICP can have develop Ghana, and by extension, the Caribbean. I write extensively on ICP issues. As you can see here at your leisure, you can take your read. It shows the direction in terms of where I am heading, and things that we need to do.

We have a challenge in the Caribbean, or I'm not sure whether it is a challenge, per se, but we are doing two things at the same time.

---

Because we continue to have the requirement where we need to push IP penetration and propagation, and yet, we think it's critical that we also understand the management of the Internet space. By that I mean participating further in ICANN and its mechanisms.

Running all of those at the same time is always challenging. And especially as an organization, we are pulled in many directions in many instances. But we continue to believe that is a next step for us. We cannot continue to not participate more than ICANN a little bit more. I understand the difficulties, I am certainly guilty of not participating as I should.

But that is primarily because of being pulled in other directions in terms of needs of basic ISP penetration, the needs of basic ISP understanding, and that has effected, I think, to some extent, the kind of participation that I and certainly others would have like to have had in the ICANN process. One of the things that we have done now, is we strengthen ourselves more, to where I think we are better equipped, certainly [inaudible] is better equipped now to participate in both equally, to deal with the requirements of what as it pertains to ICP and national development, and still look at serving and participating in the ICANN, in the various IANN mechanisms and various [inaudible].

Those are my opening remarks for now Alberto. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO:

Thank you. We have 10 minutes for Q&A.

This is Alberto speaking. Sergio Salinas Porto now has the floor.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio for the record. I am really impacted by what Lance has said.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking. Sergio, please be very brief.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: I have known Lance for a long time, and I appreciate him a lot. I have a very high respect for him, that his presentation as an ALAC member, by saying that he can promote the private sector makes me very nervous because this is safe for the users. And there is someone who has a conflict of interest, because this is what our rules say, and with respect to what is going on with the end users, I felt a bit uncomfortable with that.

And I want to have this on the record because we need to understand that there may be a conflict of interest when he is saying that he is coming from the private sector and not from the end user's sector.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Now Alejandro has the floor.

Alberto Soto speaking again. Alejandro, you now have the floor.

---

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro speaking. I agree with what Sergio has said. He, Lance is the president of a chamber that includes companies where users need to be [inaudible], and on the other hand, he has not submitted any proposal, in writing, so that he is accepted as an ALAC member, and we need to understand what are the commitments, I mean that he can be subjected to.

I think we need to challenge, we need to object to this presentation.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking. I hope Alejandro you have finished your comment. Vanda, you now have the floor.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Thank you. My position is, I would like to see some expression of interest, because we know he is very capable. He is very [inaudible], but we need to know his understanding about his position in ALAC, what is the expectation. So this is translated into expression of interest.

So my suggestion is, he put to all of us by email, by week, his expression of interest, with all these commitments, or all of the ideas that he has to add you to ALAC. Thank you.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto. Thank you Vanda. There was someone who has raised his hand that has since been down now.



---

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: This is Humberto speaking. The hand is down. Are there any other questions? Lance, please go ahead.

LANCE HINDS: The reality of the Caribbean is that we have to do different things. Certainly, as a member of LACRALO, we understand what it is that needs to be done, and especially as it pertains to the interests of the individual user. It is a fact of life. We don't necessarily have the flexibility of doing one thing.

The company that I own, and I found it as a consulting firm, is really providing IP services where we, that's how you make a living. The other work that you do, is primarily volunteer work. And in terms of commitment that I should also say, certainly in terms of the Georgetown Chamber of Commerce, that finishes at the end of this year. I certainly would not have attempted to offer myself on the ALAC, if I know that I have too many commitments that take up my time.

And if I can continue, and certainly, if it's, it's not that I am unfamiliar with the work. Some of you might remember that I was one of the [inaudible] in the ATLAS 2 meetings, specifically when it came to thematic area three, when it came to the globalization of ICANN. I mean, we were there until 1:00 in the morning doing work.

Certainly, my dedication to the process is known by those who were there at the time. Thank you.

---

ALBERTO SOTO: Thank you. I think I understand what Sergio and Alejandro have said, because nobody doubts about your capacity, Lance. But actually, the thing is any potential conflicts of interest between the interests of an end user on the Internet, and a company that is providing some kind of service. This is arguable. We still have three minutes. Would anybody else like to take the floor?

Okay. I think that's, for the time being, the issue of the participation of the ALSs is done, it's completed. Carlton, in particular, I would like you to send an email, because we couldn't really hear you, and for the next meeting, if you could provide us with some kind of ideas, Dev, if the technology group that you are chairing, please tell us how are you progressing with translation, with emails, etc.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: This Is Antonio Medina speaking.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto speaking now. Please be quick.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: Antonio speaking. I want to something in relation to what Lance said, when he says that he has many hats, and he participates in different organizations. I was also thinking that he represents an ALS in LACRALO, and I also ask if he is assuming that position as a representative of that ALS, not the company that he's working with in consulting, or service commercialization, etc.

---

And for Alberto, my last question is, well, there is a possibility to have another candidate as an ALAC member to represent him.

ALBERTO SOTO:

Alberto speaking. We have no more time. I really don't know, and I promise to find that out. If anybody has some other concerns, please say this by email. But for now, I have no news about that. This has never happened before.

We need now to finish this call because we have no more time. So thank you very much for your participation. It was very good participation. And we will continue to discuss the participation of ALSs. I hope to receive many emails, even if there are a lot of emails. So thank you very much. Good afternoon, good evening, and good night. This call is now adjourned.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**