

---

DUBLIN – At-Large Technology Taskforce  
Thursday, October 22, 2015 – 08:00 to 09:00 IST  
ICANN54 | Dublin, Ireland

GLENN MCKNIGHT: ICANN 54. This is the At-Large Technology Task Force.

Hello, Dev.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Morning, Glenn. This is Dev.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Dev it's two minutes after the hour. Did you want to wait a couple more minutes?

Okay. We're just giving it a couple minutes, but if we could do a quick introduction to each of us. This is our first face-to-face for a while, so if we can go from the left-hand side around.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Good morning, everyone. My name is Maureen Hilyard from the ALAC.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

KAILI KAN: Good morning everyone. My name is Kaili Kan, the new NomCom appointee to ALAC this year. Thank you.

LUTZ DONNERHACKE: Lutz Donnerhacke from EURALO.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Sorry. And the person who's coming up to the table is Josh. He's one of the technology leads here at ICANN. Satish, could you go ahead?

Satish Babu: Good morning. Satish Babu from APRALO.

PAUL HOFFMAN: Paul Hoffman. I work in the CTOs office at ICANN.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Good morning. This is Seun, incoming ALAC member.

BERAN GILLEN: Good morning. This is Beran, outgoing ALAC member.

PHILLIPPE BATREAU: Phillippe Batreau, AFRALO.

---

ARIEL LIANG: Ariel Liang, ICANN staff.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ulrich, ICANN staff.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Judith Hellerstein, NARALO, also co-chair with my colleague over there, Glenn McKnight. And then we can take it over to the end.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: And online we have Dev, who is our chair of this Technology Taskforce. We also have Gordon Chillcott today. He's our Linux expert. If we can, I'll start off with a few slides, and I'll turn it over to Dev.

Sorry. I've just been told that somebody else just came in the room. Good morning. And you're? Sorry, sir. Okay. Sorry. We're just getting on mic.

---

JORDI IPARRAGUIRREH:      Jordi Iparraguirreh, EURALO

GLENN MCKNIGHT:            Great. Thank you so much. Okay. This is a lot of slides to go through, so we're probably not going to capture it all, but you're welcome to see them. We're going to give you a quick introduction, which I'll do, and then I'll turn it right over to Dev. Next slide.

Okay. We're going to give you a quick overview of the Technology Taskforce. Its main goal or reason for existing is to evaluate and review ICT – that's Information Communication Technologies – that help ICANN's At-Large community, including the At-Large Advisory Community, better able to accomplish its goals in ICANN's activities.

Anyone who is interested in a particular technology to solve its needs to better communicate, we would be happy to hear from you; so if you have solutions or ideas or demonstrations, this is the group to deal with. Next slide.

Going back in a bit of history, this was one of the recommendations from the community back in June of 2012. The two particular recommendations they had was introduced to the ALSes. And some of you, particularly from Europe, are here to select information, disseminate information,

---

communicate and collaborate with various different tools, and provide the necessary training for the end user to use the tools effectively.

We review communication and collaboration needs considered in our definition that have not been met by ALSes and the RALOs globally by evaluating technology currently in use at At-Large or elsewhere within the ICANN community and identify and review other technologies that may come available.

We're a bit of a test bed, so if a new toy comes along that we like to kick and try, whether it's Slack or other social media tools – because a lot of us are guys and, Judith, we like to play with toys – so this is the place to come. It's our sandbox. Next slide

Okay. So as the map shows, myself and Judith are the co-chairs with Dev; and in our North America region we can see the names that are associated with.

And I just want to point out Gordon Chillcott. He's the GTA – that's the greater Toronto Linux User Group. He's a very avid Linux person, so when we wants to test something on any kind of platform, he's the one that we go to. So those who are here, and I believe the gentleman on my left here is also Linux guy from Germany, right?

---

LUTZ DONNERHACKE:: I am not a Linuxx guy. I'm a [BSD] addict.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. I'm corrected. That's a good platform as well. Dev is from Latin America. He's with the LACRALO. And Beran and Seun are both from AFRALO. We have Maureen on the left-hand side from APRALO. And EURALO... Is there any EURALO? Sorry. Yes, but I'm looking for Jimmy. I don't see him. Okay. Next slide please. Okay. I'll do this slide and then I'm going to turn it over to you, Dev.

Okay. So who can belong? Again, we open this up to the wider community. We also really invite staff to participate with our cause. That's why Josh has been very active and participating on our call. He's demoed the mobile, which I hope everybody's using and giving him productive feedback from an end-user point of view.

We have a work space, which we encourage people to share their technology solutions. And we have our Wiki. And all of these slides will be available to all of you for the links. Okay. Next, please. Okay. I'm turning to you now, Dev. Dev, are you there? Not to belabor the point. Judith, do you want to carry on?

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Sure. This session, we're going to cover some of the review of some of the items tackled since the Buenos Aires meeting.

We've held five different conference calls. We've been discussing a couple items. Some of them were with looking at different potential ways of solving the knowledge management problem.

We've met with Steve Allison from ICANN to discuss Kavi to see if it was suitable for At-Large, because it only had been tested out by several of the other constituents, but they decided not to use it. So we're still looking for another tool to use.

We've also discussed the... There's a translation issue that's been affecting LACRALO. They have software that does machine translation for their listeners for English and Spanish, and they have had numerous problems with that, so we've been talking with staff –Josh Jenkins –about these issues.

We also have a preview from the team from LACNIC to discuss their policy development goals that they have been working on, and how they can be similar to ours. We, of course, work with Josh and his team when we demoed, a while ago, the app. And then last year Josh was instrumental in the captioning and the e-books.

And lastly, Josh gave us an overview of the mobile app before it came out. Those are the highlights of what we've done before.

---

At every meeting since London, we've been producing a technology tips newsletter which is called *Netizen Newsletter*. And we now have, through the work of our volunteers, Eduardo and Sebastian, we have the newsletter translated into Spanish and French to give out.

We've also, as I mentioned, we had the real-time caption pilot, which we are rolling it out shortly. We demoed it right here, and we compose a team within At-Large. Here's the postcards.

We composed a team within At-Large after we got the funding for it from the special budget request. We helped create the criteria, and some of the members on the Technology Taskforce were on this team. Beran and Seun were helpful on that, as well as some others.

Now that we have the criteria created and on the page, when the pilot starts rolling out, people can select which sessions they want to be real-time captioned and if they meet the criteria they will be selected for our pilot.

We're really looking with the captioning to target people who have not been engaged before, so people in the Pacific or in the U.S. or Canada, in South America, and Africa with limited bandwidth – people whose first language is not English, as well as people with accessibility concerns, to really try to get them...



---

How do we get them more engaged, more active within ICANN, and what can we do to help them?

We're hoping that this will help out along with the website and maybe captioning of different videos will help increase engage of participation.

Glenn, do you want to talk about the...

GLENN MCKNIGHT: No. I want to turn it back to Dev. Dev, are you there now?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: This is Dev. Hopefully you can hear me now.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. It's back to you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Actually, this is Dev. This is Dev.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev, we hear you.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Oh, good. Wasn't too sure there. Okay. So just thanks for the summary, Judith. Actually, if you go to the next slide, actually it is going to be an update on the captioning pilot, which I think you just did whenever I came in just midstream there.

Perhaps now, if you go to the next slide, there's going to be updates on the e-books proposal. Judith or Glenn, do you wish to talk about the e-books I've given up to you there?

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Great. Thank you so much. As similar to the proposal that was proposed and allocated by the Technology Taskforce in accessibility as one of the deliverables or recommendations from ATLAS II was more, how can we use other tools in order to facilitate the message? One of their suggestions made was doing e-books; so myself and Maureen have been working together on strategies. She's got some great ideas that we're going to be in open doc format, so we're working on that e-book.

We're also looking at a number of volunteers in the community for translation of the e-book itself, so if anyone's interested in joining with Maureen and myself, please do. We're very excited about the project. It's a very limited budget, but I think we have some strategies that will make it actually work.

Back to you

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev, are you on mute?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Indeed, I wasn't muted, so thanks again. The next item on agenda is to give an update on a LACRALO mailing list translation. If you go to the next slide. Okay.

Just to give a background behind the LACRALO mailing list translation. We have two mailing lists; one for English, one for Spanish. E-mails in English are sent to one list, it is translated - machine translated - using Google Translate and posted to the discussion list. The discussion list in Spanish, and similarly e-mails in Spanish are posted to the Spanish list and are translated and posted to the English list. Next slide

So while this sounds like, okay, that sounds great; but we've been having lots of translation issues. I just want to highlight a few of them. For example, there are missing identifiers in the subject line, so translated e-mails that are posted to the Spanish list. What happens is that it makes it difficult to track threaded conversations when the subject line changes. Next slide.

What happens, also, is that the subject line of translated e-mails from Spanish to English becomes garbled. What happens, it gets

---

worse when people start replying to messages. You can see four examples there on the screen.

If you go to the next slide, you see how this subject line just gets worse and worse, so it just evolves into gibberish. A totally unintelligible language. Next slide. Okay.

What also happens that is also very strange and unusual characters that end up in the translated versions. You see there are two passages of the text, and you see lots of double quotes and superscript and subscript in the e-mail; but, again, it is not a very good translation. Next slide.

What's been worked on is that a new version of the translation tool has been worked on. We have two mailing lists, New Transpot EN and New Transpot ES. I want those to try to do testing on the new translation tools.

There are two key things. One was that some of the key changes with that one – because punctuation, or lack of punctuation, was a key problem, because what happens is that when there is no punctuation, the translation tool has to make a choice or a decision where to cut the sentence. And sometimes when you translate the two phrases separately, you get poor results.

So one of the outcomes was that e-mails that don't have punctuation or aren't suitable for translation are rejected. And

---

persons will get a notice if they post an improperly formatted e-mail.

The second thing with that design decision was that subject lines will not be translated, so that we won't have that confusion of translated e-mails until the subject line getting garbled and so forth, and what happens also is you can now have threaded conversations again. Next slide.

Now, Josh Jenkins from ICANN has been sort of developing, or working on this in his spare time. I have to say it's fantastic. He's been taking this on, and you could just see an example on what happens of the new translation engine.

If you look on the text on the screen there you will see that this is an HTML formatted e-mail. You will notice there are still some glitches, especially in long URLs that truncates, if we understand it carefully.

Now, look at the next slide. You would see that the subject line remains the same. The subject line is translated as part of the e-mail, and you could see it's much more cleaner and much more better. Next slide.

There's still some challenges though. Lots of false positives. A short e-mail with just even two sentences sometimes gets rejected; so the testing is still ongoing to at least continue and

---

identify and debug the false positives. Once it's determined that it's good enough, the intent is to hold a conference call with LACRALO to discuss the upcoming changes and how to minimize their e-mails not being translated, and then perform the changeover.

According to Josh Jenkins, this changeover can be done very quickly. It's literally five minutes. So it's not a long changeover. It's a switch to the new translation tool.

So longer term we want to have this project properly supported by ICANN. It's, again, Josh Jenkins from ICANN is literally working on this in his spare time; over weekends and so forth; so which I have to check with, it's not suitable for ICANN for something of a project of this importance.

There's also now, after the implementation, we will look at a different redesign of the LACRALO list, which would allow for multiple different languages to be supported. And there's a Wiki page where you can find more information. I'll stop there, and I'll see if there's any questions or comments.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Yes. Thank you so much. I know you've spent huge amount of time on this. There is a queue, but I want to give Josh a chance

---

to respond, or if there are any other updates on what you presented and then I'll turn to Seun and then Beran.

Okay. There is no comment from Josh. Josh, there is coffee there, but I'll get Seun, then you're in the queue.

Okay. Seun, please?

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Okay. The translation list looks very interesting, and I'm wondering whether we could also see if we could use this for AFRALO. It's very, very helpful for us, especially... Most of our communication on AFRALO lists now, and even the African lists has been based in English, and that has actually disconnected a lot of people from the community. So it would good to see if we can also test in parallel the one for AFRALO as well. I'll be I'll be willing to participate in it as well, if it comes up. Thank you.

BERAN GILLEN:

I was actually going to suggest the exact same thing. A second comment I wanted to make was I wanted clarification on the false positives. I'm not quite clear what that is.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Dev, did you hear the question from Beran on the false positives? Thank you.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. Thanks. Okay. Thanks, Seun and Beran. So to answer Seun, I would say, yes, I think the idea is good. If we can get this implemented properly, we could then look at it for other regions such as AFRALO, so you can have French to English, but I think we wanted to make sure we get this working first and then we can do the implementation for other RALOs, because just for ease. Just to make sure we get all the bugs ironed out, rather than having two systems and trying to develop both of them at the same time.

To answer the fun question regarding false positives, I would say what happens is that the translation tool tries to [inaudible] the sentences and it makes a judgment call saying sometimes that the length of the sentence was too long.

If you go to the [Transpot] EN and ES list, you will see that a lot of the messages, even with it, but it's relatively simple messages, literally two lines, two sentences, get rejected. That's what I mean by false positives.

And if a lot of the e-mails gets rejected like that, then you know the communication's going to break down. That's why we want to make sure we fix those bugs. I hope that explains it



---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. I'm going to turn to Lutz. He's got some questions.

LUTZ DONNERHACKE: It's very interesting what we are doing there. First drafts from the new translation list, they are running on Google Translate, too, or have you tried out another translation engine? That's one question.

The second question is all these translations of mailing lists are done by ICANN, ICANN staff.

And then I have a comment for the people here. We do have translators, and they are doing really good. And if English is not your native language and your native language is offered to you, please do speak in your native language so that everybody here gets a feeling how it is. The communication language is not understood, for the one point. The other point is it's much easier for you. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Do you have any comment?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yep. So it's using Google Translate to – we are using Google Translate as the translation tool. That takes and basically the translation engine passes the e-mail and sends it to Google

---

Translate by its API, and then reconstitutes the e-mail in Spanish and then posts it on the Spanish list. And that is all machine translated.

Indeed the language services is amazing. We love to use the language services when we have work on official statements and so forth, so if there's a draft statement for a LACRALO being worked on, we try to get translated versions up on the Wiki and then have it side by side, and then we work on those. Then the whole community can participate in the discussions on the Wiki. And there's a translation tool on the Wiki itself as well, which also helps.

Regarding to the third question which I think, again, we should take advantage language services. I agree.

I will point out, there is an engagement challenge, I would say, for persons participating remotely. For example, as a person who's dialed in, I cannot hear the interpretation streams, for example. And I think that we want to raise that up with ICANN as a technology issue that needs to be solved. So I hope that answers the questions.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev, thanks so much for that. Yes, we did mention that issue of the interpretation having to do with the Adobe Connect –

---

including the original translation. And Josh's staff is going to look into this and see how if they can patch since the Adobe Connectors in the English channel, how they can patch in the audio from the different languages to connect it through the English channel. So we are already looking at that issue.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes, indeed. And it's something we have to follow up with ICANN, ICANN staff. So, okay. Let's move on. We're to the next agendas if there's no further hands raised.

This is going to be At-Large Summit II recommendations progress report. There's a lot of slides here, but that's really just to cover the highlights of what we've done between ICANN 53 and ICANN 54.

Just to give some brief background, the Summit was a meeting of all of the representatives from all the RALOs at the ICANN's 50th meeting. And there was a Summit declaration which developed a range of recommendations and observations on the future direction of ICANN. There's a link there that you can could read the entire [inaudible] recommendations. Some of these recommendations are were given to the Technology Taskforce and with other working groups for implementation.

---

If you notice there is a new recommendation that was allocated to us; recommendation 19. We will probably cover that, how we are handling that recommendation? So let's divert straight into it. Next slide.

So recommendation ten, there's been no major updates from other than Judith's captioning pilot project, which you already gave the update for earlier in this session. So next slide.

Also, we accidentally jumped one slide ahead. The previous slide talks about what language services already do, and we documented all on our Wiki page [regarding] this recommendation. Next slide.

Okay. And we have also demonstrated some captioning tools in the past, as well. And those, again, are all up on our Wiki. Next slide.

Recommendation 11, what we are doing apart from those captioning tools which can assist with this recommendation. We've also been doing the improvement of the LACRALO mailing list, as we talked about just before. Again, the Wiki link is there for anybody to read more about. Next slide.

Okay. What we've also done, we've noted that there is a lot of tools that can be used by the At-Large community to help with communicating and collaborating in another language. There is,

---

for example, Google Translate app for mobiles, the Microsoft Translator for mobiles, Skype Translator Preview, which is now coming out, too, which [inaudible] the regular Skype users and their web browser translation products. We have done an extensive – documented all of those tools, and you can find it at that link there.

And the next slide shows a screen shot of this -- of these tools. So once it's done, we've sorted it out by platform. So you see for MAC OS, Windows, Linux, Apple iOS, Android devices. There's also Windows [inaudible]. And also we sorted it out by task, so if you're looking to find out – and all of them have screen shots and some YouTube videos explaining how you can use these different tools. So again, probably this will be a great resource for the At-Large community. Next slide.

Recommendation 17. Since the Buenos Aires meeting, one of the concerns was that although we started at logging platforms of tools that could be used to allow access to such services that are blocked in certain countries. Next slide.

I was going to skip all this stuff because this we covered in the previous session. Next slide.

One of the things was that we initially had great concerns regarding whether we should list these tools, because it would be difficult for ICANN to endorse or promote; but there's been

---

still some sustained interest on the list, so we will have some conference calls after ICANN 54 to [find] some of these tools, the first one being a call with one of the developers of TOR, which is a tool that allows you to access the web anonymously. Next slide.

Okay. This is the new recommendation: eliminate barriers to participation and engagement with ICANN processes and practices.

One of the things that was noted was that the challenge of making the webinars and Adobe Connect more accessible for use after the webinars. So if you have missed the webinar on a particular policy issue or whatever, how do we... It's very cumbersome to watch the Adobe Connect recording. It's a big download. You need Adobe Flash on the desktop, so it's not really accessible. It's not like, say, watching a YouTube video.

So we want to try to work with ICANN staff to see how we can convert the Adobe Connect sessions to videos that could be uploaded to video platforms like YouTube or Vimeo, for example.

And another challenge with At-Large newcomers is the challenge of using a tool like Adobe Connect.

---

We have two tools, two pages, I should say, talking about Adobe Connect and one page about Adobe Connect on how to solve some issues and which screenshots and screencast showing the steps you need to, say, connect your audio to Adobe Connect.

We're also looking to see whether you can do a short video for newcomers and for persons who may not be as engaged with ICANN. Sometimes we'll have challenges in connecting.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Sorry. Sorry, Dev, let me interrupt. We've got a queue of questions. Can I just ask you a clarification question?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Certainly.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: When you asked about the video, is that an action item?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I think lets work on to do on the video.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: And I'll post it on the Wiki for comments. So, yes.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. I'll let Judith comment first and then Maureen.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: So now, Dev, we want clarification for the system. Do we want to assign this video as an action item for our task force? And also, when we talked about [path] with the translation and the issues with Adobe Connect and remote participation, in the Adobe Connect stream for people not to hear just the original language, but if it's an English-only channel, then to hear the English continuously even when they speak in French or Spanish. And we want to make sure that we notate that as an action item; for the record.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes, indeed.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: So as Dev just said, we now have two additional action items. We have one action item being the Adobe Connect stream in English needs to work on trying to get the audio from the Spanish and French interpretation onto the English channel so that the



---

remote participants do not have to have two channels open at the same time to be listening. And then they can participate.

The second action item is on creating a little video showing how to use Adobe Connect.

But my other – since I have the mic I'll just ask my question. Sorry, Maureen.

There is a lot of issues, also, with the videos and watching them in Adobe Connect. And the idea is when we have the videos after we have the webinars, if they can also be somehow put up in YouTube and maybe put up in different checks and so that they'll be indexed and tagged correctly so that people can skip around by looking at different indexes of the webinar and so they can skip to a different section very easily without having to wait for the YouTube or try to figure out where it was in the section. And I've seen that with a lot of other videos we were doing. It works really well. I think we could try that.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you, Judith. Just returning to this recommendation to eliminate barriers to participation and engagement with ICANN processes and practices, I guess it does relate back to what Glenn was mentioning before as to ways in which we can actually do this, especially for people who lack bandwidth to

---

access Adobe Connect, plus they can't access YouTube either. So we need to be looking at how we can transform these really important webinar messages to our clients, customers, ALSes.

And it relates to... Glenn and I were talking about, the e-book project that we've been looking at. I've been look at the webinars that APRALO has been providing through the [APAC] hub. Excellent, excellent information, which would be transformed into an e-book.

But, also, it's not just a book that they have got to read. It's got to be interactive and it's got to have – and it's something that I have to ask Siranush about and our leadership team, the APRALO leadership team, because I think there needs to be some sort of learning hub that needs to be formed within our leadership team that when people actually undertake the e-book learning program, that they actually have someone that they can actually interact with so that there's constantly activities that they have got to provide feedback. But that feedback is actually addressed in an online sort of way, so that they can do it by e-mails.

But I think that everyone's capable of communicating by e-mails until such time as the broadband issues are addressed across all areas. That just means that we can introduce... and our ALSes aren't missing out on those important messages.

---

And, Silvia, as you said, there's a lot of ALSes that don't actually engage, and there are reasons why they don't. We've got to find ways in which we can hook them in, give them messages, and help them to learn more about what we're trying to say. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Maureen, thanks so much. Maureen, do you want to put that as an action item?

MAUREEN HILYARD: It will probably be an action item for APRALO to start off with. I've just highlighted that with our boss lady.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Sorry, Dev, Seun's in the queue as well, or did you want to respond to it first before Seun starts?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Let's hear Seun's questions and then I can respond.

SEUN OJEDEJI: I just wanted to raise this future request. Considering for low bandwidths remote users, it is rather difficult to... Once you connect to Adobe Connects and if there is a video stream,

---

everything goes. You can't switch off any part of it. So I'm wondering if you're able to get dial-outs on your phone, is it possible to also find a way of getting the chats in Adobe Connect only? That is the chat window only; because that will make it complete.

Remote feature for low bandwidth participants is a feature required. I don't know if Adobe Connects does this. And perhaps if it doesn't, maybe we will start considering other means of communication like the [Jabber] and other platforms that are low bandwidth oriented. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Seun, thanks so much for that comment. We will have Josh address that, but I guess the clarifying question on that, were you also wanting... I know for an audio stream, the ICANN has separate low bandwidth audio streams that will not connected to anything. Is that also something that you were wanting?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Yeah. Actually, the audio stream is not a particular problem, because the audio stream, even if that doesn't work you can easily get the dial-out from staff to your mobile phone. The main thing is how do you follow-up with, the chats, conversations. That's just the one that is left.

---

So if, for instance, I'm on the audio-only channel whether there are dial-outs or via the audio stream, want to be able to interact via video chat as well. That's just [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much for the clarifying. Josh is going to answer. Josh, you can answer that?.

JOSH BAULCH: No, I really appreciate the comments about Adobe Connect. Adobe Connect is one of those products that we struggle with. Because it is a flash based application, we are limited by the ability of Flash, so we're not able to pull certain elements out of that.

One of the questions that I have back to this group is, in your experience or in what you guys have done with the community otherwise, are there other applications out there that would better suit our needs? Because we really have hit the limitations of Adobe Connect at this point.

I appreciate the desire to have the other multiple language bridges streaming in Adobe Connect. In doing that, we're just adding more bandwidth which compounds your problem. And I completely understand the ability to say, "No, I don't want to see video. I just want to be able to see the chat."

---

So the question that I have back is do you know of other products out there that would be able to help us with this? We're not married to Adobe Connect. We started with Adobe Connect about eight years ago because it was one of the only products out there that had the most flexibility for us to do what we need.

I think we've hit that point where we need to grow beyond that. But the question is what else is out there that you guys would like to see that would help us with that product? I've done a lot of exploring, and I haven't found something that meets our needs.

But I'm really curious if you guys have experience out there. You guys reach far beyond my areas that I can see, so I'd appreciate any feedback you guys have on that.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Yeah, actually I worked with IEEE on different conferencing tools, and I did a fairly extensive study. In fact, about a year ago we did Readytalk and a lot of different – but if you haven't seen that slide show on comparison, I'll be happy to share it. We really invite the community to add your ideas and suggestions.

This is great, but time is really in essence. In the queue we have first, Satish, and then Lutz.

---

SATISH BABU:

Thank you Glenn. Two quick points. First, regarding e-books. It's a welcome step, but I would also -- I'm not sure if it's been discussed. I would like to point out about audio books.

Now, audio books are not only for the blind. even the sighted people use it. While you're driving, for instance, you can listen in the background. It could be any kind of update. It doesn't have to be a book. It can be like a podcast. So I'd like to place it on the table it has not be discussed already.

The other point I would like to quickly mention is there was a reference to TOR. I've been a rather heavy user of TOR [inaudible] for some time. I'm not sure what ICANN's position is on these tools, because they at one level undermine the DNS and they take over the DNS by itself.

But the fact is that in some situations where people have approached us saying that, "Can you train us in the use of these tools?" So I'd like to know what is the official ICANN position vis-à-vis some of these tools.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much. We will try to get back to you on that. We only have Lutz in the queue, but Satish, did you want to make that an action item?

---

SATISH BABU:                                   The first one I think would be useful; the audio books.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Audio books.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:                   Okay. Thank you so much, Satish. And onto Lutz.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:                        I would like to respond to Satish's comments about the TOR project. We had a lot of discussion on that. I'm aware of that, and that's why I invited the lead programmer for the TOR project to be on our November call, so I invite everybody. David Goulet from the TOR project will be on November 16<sup>TH</sup> on the call. Please join us.

And we want to do it as a cage match. So somebody who hates TOR, I'd invite you to be there to do a dust-up with David. He's aware that he's going to have to defend his position, so it's going to be a great call.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:                        Thank you, Judith. Lutz?



---

LUTZ DONNERHACKE: What I'm doing here in the meeting is making a rather incomplete [inaudible] German only scripting of the meeting to the public. And I have a response and a stream from a person who uses Google Translate on a professional base, and he suggests that we could add to the translated e-mails a link where some native speaker can correct the automatic translation; because they had very, very good experience with putting in a correct translation. The algorithms at Google Translate are learning from this. They had only a few weeks, so that the mostly unknown [inaudible] phrases used in ICANN, and some other places are learning by Google Translate and translation can get dramatically better for them.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, Dev, it's back to you. I'm not going to take any more questions for a while, just so that, Dev, you can get through the slides. Go ahead

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. I'm very happy to hear the discussions, and so I would probably try to respond to all those questions and comment. Let me just finish one key aspect of a recommendation. Let's just go to the next slide.

---

There is recommendation 26, which talks about the policy management process system. So let's just jump ahead to the next slide.

We have on ideas – some key requirements –on what we want in a policy management process system. That's going to jump ahead. Next slide.

We've covered all of these in lots of sessions before and it's in the presentation. Next slide again.

So in terms of implementing this recommendation, the ALAC website has been developed and the beta version is already demonstrated early this week at ICANN 54. So just next slide.

I just want to highlight some of the key points of the website. What happens is that you can now drill down to the specific topics. And, also, you can also see how some of the policies that are being worked on by the At-Large community. Next slide.

Okay. So that is screenshot of one of the policies here. And if you note, you will see things like how the policies are key-tagged or with certain topics... Under which topic it falls under. You can see a timeline as to what our deadlines for terms of statements and so forth.

And, again, the At-Large website can incorporate the public comment page automatically without having to manually copy

---

and paste, which really speeds up and minimizes the efforts of the manual cut, copy, and paste when we started our process to comment on policies. Next slide.

This is just one example of if you were to [pick] WHOIS, for example, one of the topics. You would then see all of the previous statements that the At-Large community has worked on. So we have some historical background on this topic.

Also, on the right-hand side, you will see things such as possible videos and other informative material about WHOIS so a person can start learning about what we are doing the in this topic area. Let's move on to the next slide.

That's the At-Large website we designed. We also had two long conference calls with Steve Allison from ICANN staff to discuss Kavi which is a platform that allows you to collaborate on documents and receive notifications. As result of those discussions, we decided, ultimately, not to proceed to testing Kavi further, especially noting the progress of the At-Large website redesign. Next slide.

I've included the screenshots of what Kavi looks like. But in the interest of time, let's just skip ahead. Next slide. Next slide.

Okay. So one of the other things for recommendation 26, we also looked at the policy process of the RIRs.

---

We had a very informative call with the persons from LACNIC and it was actually very, very informative. Next slide.

We have, for example, it's showing us various links to how the policy process works. Next slide.

What they have done, they have custom designed their website to be a form base so that information can be added in directly. So here's a screenshot of how a person can submit a form. Next slide.

Here's also where the lists of policy proposals where it could see the different languages that the policies are available in and so people have just one place to see all their policy proposals, which you can sort and search and so forth. Next slide.

And what it also does, it also allows you for seeing how many people are supporting or expressing opinions on it; if people are in favor, they are against it, or they're neutral towards the policy. And they see different version of the policy in previous text form. You can have it in text, PDF, docx, and so forth. Next slide.

Okay. And I think we'll probably stop here in terms of other recommendations. Let's go back to answering any comments or questions from the floor.

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks, Dev, so much. I know we're running short on time. If we have one or two short questions we would love to have them.

Okay. So I guess we have no. Oh, Seun. Seun has a question.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay.

SEUN OJEDEJI: I was just wondering, when you were representing the new websites, I think there was some form of tracking of statements. Was it something that can really – is it actually similar to what has been presented here or can it be adapted? Because I saw that's where you were representing the new At-Large websites, there was an option to track statements, statutes, and so on.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Ariel, she's been the guru of the whole website. I'll let her answer that question for you.

ARIEL LIANG: We're building that function, so from when the official site is up and running you should be able to follow the process of the statement.

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I guess Seun's question is: is it similar to the LACNIC one that we reviewed, or how does it differ?

ARIEL LIANG: It shares some common features, but it's definitely not the same website, because we do need to develop our page base and how the ALAC develops statements and our process, but we can reference what LACNIC did and maybe do improvements in phase two.

DEVANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Well, just quickly answer some quick comments to comments that were asked earlier. Regarding Maureen's comments, indeed, I think this is where the captioning project can help, so that we can have realtime captioning for those low bandwidth users. They could just access the transcript and they could see what people are saying in their real-time and, therefore, could interact with it.

I think also going back to what Seun was saying about how people can get to access to chat alone. I think what happens [inaudible] group chat app services. Slack would work where we could have a separate channel for the particular working groups and then have questions and comments coming in through the Slack group chat services, which is very low bandwidth. You

---

know, there are mobile apps everywhere. You can use it on the desk top; so that's one thing.

So Josh, who talks about other applications that could do the job from Adobe Connect; indeed, the Technology Taskforce has been reviewing a lot of conferencing solutions, and we're finding, generally, that none indicate matches the Adobe Connect in terms of the feature sets, although we recognize that Adobe Connect has those challenges of being Flash based and so forth.

So we do have several conferencing solutions. I was noticing that the rise of our web RTC is leading to even more conferencing solutions coming out, so we need to – we probably could share with you, Josh, what some of the researchers have already done.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dev, we're running close to the end.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So we can stop right there.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So we can just stop and end the call. And I'll turn it back over to Glenn and Judith.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much for your presentation. We're running really short on time. And I know Glenn as one final comment that he's been dying to make.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I'm not sure if I'm dying to make this comment, but I'll just go back a little bit. I was part of the ARIN event in Montreal recently, which is the North America RIR, and I participated in the process. And there's a well-documented manual that they have created, Ariel, and I was working with their mentors and their shepherds, and it's an incredibly good process for policy development, so it's something we need to dive into a little bit more.

But I just wanted, since I've got the mic, and I feel like [inaudible]. You remember that scene in The Wedding Singer where that guy was drunk and he got the mic? I felt like that for a second.

We really invite you to come to our calls. And our call in November is a TOR project. We don't shy away from controversy, but if there is a technology you want us to demo, please suggest it to us. We have a great call. It's always available to have.



---

Judith, do you want to comment on that?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yeah. I was just going to say that we want your suggestions. Next topic after the TOR we're also going to look at is a new program by EFF and other non-technical community called Let's Encrypt to bring certificates that are free or very low cost to non-profits and small businesses and individual users who want to have secure browsing sites and opportunities, and have been put off by the higher costs of certificates.

So there's a program that's called Let's Encrypt that they have been working for a year on, and they just released a first part on it. So we're going to have someone from there talk about the project.

And, Dev, one more word, because we are closing the session. It's after 9:00 already, but I just want to make sure you had one more final thought.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks. I'd like to thank everyone to attending the call. I'm very appreciative of the questions. And as Glenn said, we appreciate you coming on to the calls and asking your comments and questions.

---

And again, for anybody in the At-Large community that has any tech issue or tech questions or tech idea, share it with us. We will welcome that.

So I'd like to thank everyone. Thanks to Judith and Glenn for helping to co-chair this. Thanks to the interpreters and to the technical staff for supporting the all the behind-the-scenes services to make this meeting happen. Thanks.

And this call is adjourned. Enjoy the rest of the day. Take care.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: And, Dev, thanks so much for staying up.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**