

ICANN
Moderator: Maryam Bakoshi
May 13, 2016
8:02 am CT

Coordinator: Recording has started. You may begin.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay thank you. So this is meeting of the NCSG executive committee. At the moment present are me, Tapani and the chair. Klaus, Monika and Maryam Bakoshi our secretary and presume someone who I don't know who is doing the technicalities in the back.

And the agenda especially just going through the membership application set up. If time allows we can discuss other things.

And we had quite a lot of technical difficulties getting this started but now everything seems to work.

So without further ado let's proceed on the new applications for the new individuals. I trust everybody has the spreadsheet in front of you.

The first one, Neto, however be pronouncing Neto, I guess is being Brazilian. Everything I can tell looks good to me. He was referred to by Renata Ribeiro and actually already contacted me asking why this is taking so long to

proceed. Apparently he applied just after our previous meeting. Anybody opinions, objections?

Klaus Stoll: Tapani no objections but I find it interesting that somebody applies for a body or an entity when it says it should not be governed by bodies and entities.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes that is an interesting comment I agree. But maybe his vision is that ICANN does not govern things merely just coordinate it or maybe (unintelligible) I don't know. But still. Monika?

Klaus Stoll: Okay I am fine with it.

Monika Zalnieriute: I think it is just perhaps the person doesn't really understand or is not very familiar with whatever is there because clearly everything is governed so there is no such thing as, you know, something that is not governed entirely.

I think it is just person perhaps not from this background. But I think it is not a super big deal. I think we should be okay with that.

Klaus Stoll: Yes and he will learn.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes Klaus?

Klaus Stoll: When we joins (unintelligible) he will learn.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes of course there are people who will disagree on that that everything is being governed. I know some serious anarchists but I think that is not the case here.

(Unintelligible) I guess so let's approve him. And pending Rudi and Robin comment later. And we will have to do that with all of this which is not our approval and will have to wait.

For Rudi and Klaus. Rudi and Robin to comment later. Let's move onto the next one.

(Alexandra Pedivina). Again referred by Renata Ribeiro. And I see problems with her application. How about you Klaus?

Klaus Stoll: Fine. No problem.

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes I agree as well.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay so again also approve pending Rudi and Robin. Next one. (Enoma Oni), I pronounced that from Nigeria. People who I know nothing. Klaus?

Klaus Stoll: Yes I have got a problem with somebody who just wants to talk propagandised human rights. It is all about in ICANN and in NCSG. Nothing against (unintelligible) I am completely for them on the Internet but they are not the sole issue.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes it does not indicate any standing of or even any interest in the DNS let alone GNSO and generic domains. So perhaps we should ask for clarification. What is his interest in DNS and GTLDs?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes we can ask just for more information like we do. Yes I agree we can ask for more.

Klaus Stoll: Maybe we shouldn't ask. We also should be explaining...

Tapani Tarvainen: What?

Monika Zalnieriute: No, but maybe we give a chance.

Klaus Stoll: Okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes that is what we usually been doing in cases we don't understand what is going on. So we ask. So Maryam make a note and ask why his or her interest in DNS and gTLDs and because that is what NCSG is about.

Okay next one. Robert Gellman. Who I also know nothing about except what is in here but the reference from Stephanie Perrin so some say it is real and he has been following ICANN and privacy issues still within a long time so it sounds good to me.

Anybody else? Anything suspicious or how do you feel? Klaus?

Klaus Stoll: I think I know him. Yes.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay you know him and you approve.

Klaus Stoll: I approve.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay Monika?

Monika Zalnieriute: Sorry you didn't hear me perhaps. Yes I have nothing against him. I know the next person on the list as well.

Klaus Stoll: Do we know - I'm nitpicking. Do we have each domain name? I can't find it.

Tapani Tarvainen: No. But individuals are not required to have a domain name.

Klaus Stoll: Okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: So Robert Gellman also tentatively approved. Valentina Pellizer. And I already heard Monika telling that she knows her. So Monika comment? Do you approve?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes I know Valentina. Let's just say my opinion. Yes I think that the person is from association from Verasive Communications doing a feminist and gender and sexuality issues online which is good.

I am not sure if the person is very reliable because in my experience we were let down on the last day perhaps approaching the conference and she did not turn up on the panel. But I think is not an issue to say no. So it is all – and I think she is the worth of joining us.

Tapani Tarvainen: So you think she has an interest in DNS and not just using us for other things, but looks good. I am happy with that since talking about Internet governance processes. So sounds good to me. Klaus?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes Valentina is there all the time in all the IGS and all that. So perhaps it is good that more people from ATC which usually they put all their focus and their work at least recently on gender and feminist things.

Perhaps it is good for us to expand our, you know, membership basis as well. Because if Valentina comes then more people from ATC would come. I think it is good for us.

Tapani Tarvainen: And we don't have any members from Bosnia Herzegovina until now I think so that is also good. Klaus, your views?

Klaus Stoll: What's good enough for ATC it is good enough for me.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay thank you. That is also tentatively approved.

Next one is Peeter Seling, actually Estonian.

Monika Zalnieriute: Oh wow.

Tapani Tarvainen: We don't have too many Estonian members like two I think.

Klaus Stoll: That is victim of crime I wish to find cooperation against crime. I don't think that is good enough motivation.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes that sounds strange.

Monika Zalnieriute: I would agree with Klaus. But maybe isn't it similar to that other person propagate human rights? These people and it is not strange seeing this person comes from Estonia. They are all about cybercrime and all that. So it is just random thing they know and then try to come in. But maybe let's ask for more information.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes in case the crime in question is something related to DNS then it would actually make sense. But otherwise. So let's ask for details and explain it since our mission is DNS and gTLDs. So what is his interest in that okay? Again ask.

Okay. Next one. Khalid Khelifi. An ISOC chapter member. Wants to promote freedom of expression and implement open and transparent Internet governance in this country and other region. Opinions?

Klaus Stoll: I don't think I have a problem.

Tapani Tarvainen: So you approve?

Klaus Stoll: Yes.

Tapani Tarvainen: Monika?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes I agree.

Klaus Stoll: I trust the ISOC chapter.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes okay likewise. So again tentatively approved.

Next one. (Christopher Dennett). Also ISOC in this case from the U.K. and lots of explanation and (unintelligible) and lots of useful sounding interesting explanation here. So sounds good to me. Anybody others?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay. Laughter as an approval Monika?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes, approved.

Tapani Tarvainen: So and (unintelligible) recommended, so let's approve him as well. So basically again tentatively approved pending Rudi and Robin later. Okay so that was individual applicants.

We have the organizations. Do we have any - have any UNIX Linux users group?

Monika Zalnieriute: Maybe Klaus can give a comment.

Klaus Stoll: I am looking.

Tapani Tarvainen: I should have checked with Olevie actually in this case.

Klaus Stoll: I don't see motivation with DNS at all. It is all about Linux and UNIX. And educational - which has nothing to do with us. Again ask for clarification.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay let's again put this into please explain your interest in DNS and gTLD. Same as the individuals we postponed. And in the meantime we will check with Olevie if he knows these guys because it is a reasonably small country he might.

So ask for clarification. Next. Costa Rica chapter. What is (unintelligible) member no? So I guess this is ...

Klaus Stoll: That's from (Melody).

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes I think this is an error because they did move it to the NCUC but that is not concern of ours. They are NCST member. So skip that one. I will (Carlos) that there is no need for NCS here to process that.

And then there is International Centre for Leadership Development in Nigeria.

Monika Zalnieriute: This is very funny. If you read there what it is about it is nothing to do with – it is just so broad that it is already impossible to understand what it is about.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes. So...

Monika Zalnieriute: And also corporate sponsorship.

Tapani Tarvainen: So let's ask not only for interest in DNS but also about your funding because it is unclear. We want a bit more detail where their funding comes from.

Klaus Stoll: That sounds like one Rudi tracked in.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay we will wait for – hope Rudi has something more to say about that. But in any case leave that pending.

That is all we had. Do we have anything under review? Oh yes we do. So let's move to individuals under review. Fabrizio Moreira. The last time I think we had dropped him because we didn't have his email address. But he contacted Maryam asking about that so now we do.

Any opinions on Moreira? Active enough to contact us so that is a good sign anyway. And the Internet governance topic is - yes Klaus?

Klaus Stoll: Yes sounds okay to me now.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay Monika?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes I agree as well.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay me too. So again tentatively approved. Next is Adetola Sogbesan from Nigeria. And he has attended Nigerian Internet governance forum and West African Nigeria IGF and Africa IGF belongs to three NGOs already and recommended by Rudi. But he doesn't say which...

Monika Zalnieriute: But he also belongs to business constituency he says.

Klaus Stoll: Exactly.

Tapani Tarvainen: Oh yes that is what is here.

Klaus Stoll: We don't have I mean further information as I can see.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes so we actually postpone this waiting for Rudi to do some research and see. He hasn't come up with that yet. But let's postpone him again. Let's include it to come up with it, okay.

Just lacking more information I can't really approve this either until we are waiting for this commercial or lack thereof. So postpone. Wait for Rudi to comment okay.

Monika Zalnieriute: Okay and now I see the other one.

Tapani Tarvainen: Which one?

Monika Zalnieriute: So it seems you replied to him that it was commercial and he replied back. That is what I see.

Tapani Tarvainen: Danny Glix?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes.

Tapani Tarvainen: So let's move to Danny Glix and you have his explanation below. And he has no DNS business but he is interested in it. Okay you can see this for yourselves. Your opinions? Does this look...

Monika Zalnieriute: I am just reading now.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay.

Klaus Stoll: I mean reading this maybe I read it wrong but basically he makes his money with the DNS and he wants to work in the DNS which is perfectly all right. But I don't think that he should be involved with the NCSG. Either the business or the trademark and copyright people.

Tapani Tarvainen: So you still think we should reject him Klaus? That is your stance?

Klaus Stoll: I am involved in Web site development that includes very seldom (unintelligible) naming issues.

Monika Zalnieriute: What does it mean naming issues indeed?

Klaus Stoll: Naming issues I mean if you try to register domain and somebody else already has it or wants to...

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes, yes, yes. But then the person is involved in DNS business clearly.

Klaus Stoll: Exactly that is what I mean.

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes I also agree with your opinion.

Tapani Tarvainen: So we stick with the earlier position, reject him.

Klaus Stoll: Yes and recommend to him to go either to trademark and copyright business constituents.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes.

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes.

Tapani Tarvainen: Some like business constituency you put (unintelligible) okay.

So let's do that.

Klaus Stoll: Commercial (unintelligible) okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay. That was the last one actually. I don't think we have any organization under review at the moment. Oh yes we have. Let's take a look at them.

Klaus Stoll: (Unintelligible).

Tapani Tarvainen: Isn't that the same one we just looked at? The African Centre for Citizens Orientation?

Monika Zalnieriute: No, no it is not the same.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay not the same okay. So African Centre for Citizens Orientation of (Peter Adeleye). Why did we postpone this last time?

Klaus Stoll: For non-commercial interests.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay there is a response as well. He says it is not for profit organization (unintelligible) professionals in ICT Malawi groups sending various (unintelligible) but mainly represent on the policy level (unintelligible) use of Internet.

So what I am slightly (unintelligible) Web site (unintelligible). That was an interesting concern here. They all seem to – or do they? Oh yes let's work.

Klaus Stoll: Are we talking about African Center for...

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes.

Klaus Stoll: I don't still understand the (unintelligible).

Tapani Tarvainen: Let me look at their Web site.

Monika Zalnieriute: But even the fact of the funding aside, they have also nothing to do with DNS or GTLDs or anything like that or even Internet broadly speaking.

Tapani Tarvainen: Certainly not their main focus as I can tell even though they have organized some fast Africa Internet rights events. But still their interest in the DNS policies somewhat...

Klaus Stoll: (Unintelligible).

Tapani Tarvainen: Farfetched.

Klaus Stoll: Election and good governance Internet and ITC diplomacy...

Tapani Tarvainen: Looking at their programs I don't see any of these that has anything much to do with DNS. I am beginning to think that we should put in our membership application form some specific questions about which DNS related policies you are interested in or something like that.

But so I understand that Monika you don't approve at least?

Monika Zalnieriute: No I don't approve.

Tapani Tarvainen: Klaus you want to argue your case? I suppose you will be suspicious about the funding.

Klaus Stoll: (Unintelligible).

Tapani Tarvainen: So we reject on the grounds of don't see interest in DNS and don't understand their funding.

Klaus Stoll: (Unintelligible).

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay. So we reject them. Maryam let's discuss how to phrase that reply to them but nonetheless reject it.

Next one ICTS – wait next one that is the (unintelligible) culture (unintelligible) in Democratic Republic of Congo. And again – yes?

Maryam Bakoshi: Sorry, the African Centre for Citizens Orientation.

Tapani Tarvainen: Did I miss something?

Maryam Bakoshi: Okay I will just type. I will type it.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes African Centre for Citizens Orientation.

Klaus Stoll: Yes. Basically we said to reject this.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes I think – I am working on a very small screen here. It is difficult to see everything at once.

Klaus Stoll: (Unintelligible).

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes they basically don't see anything to do with the DNS as far as I can tell. And let me see. So we asked for non-commercial interests and funding and we got no reply as far as I can tell. Is that correct?

But I see that Rudi has approved. But still if we ask for clarification and get no reply that is grounds for rejection without further discussion right?

So consider them rejected. If they do reply later we can reopen the case but for now drop them.

Klaus Stoll: The last one. Do we have a Web page that (unintelligible) question there. Web site didn't work last time.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes they had sent a response saying giving the Web site but nothing else apparently. So let's see what it looks like. AFAD.org. Seems empty to me.

Can you get that Web site to open? Something useful?

Klaus Stoll: Wait a moment I am trying.

Tapani Tarvainen: I see a blank page (unintelligible) so there is nothing.

Klaus Stoll: I have to disappoint you Tapani. I see white page.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes okay. I see white page as well. So the organization – I am kind of consider but an organization that its Web site is blank.

Klaus Stoll: Can't get it to open.

Tapani Tarvainen: Yes. It is nothing. So opinions? Shall we consider failed to manage their Web site? Of course it may be they need help in that but indicates they can't really have much of a policy concern.

On the basis of information we have and the lack of any in their Web site. Any descriptions they have don't indicate much DNS concerns. So I say that our options are to still ask them hey come on are you going to fix your Web site? Or just drop them and tell them that if you get it working come back to us.

Klaus Stoll: I mean who knows what is going on. Just give them a last chance.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay yes. Given the situation in Congo it is perfectly understandable if things don't work all the time. So let's give them another chance. We wait until – postpone the position pending they get their Web site working and then we will reconsider it in our next meeting okay?

Klaus Stoll: Okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: Monika you are find with that?

Monika Zalnieriute: Yes I agree.

Tapani Tarvainen: Okay so that is all we had. So let's see. Okay that was all I really had what I wanted to get done today. Do you have any other business you want to talk? Anybody wants to consider to talk about the Helsinki meeting? It is just the three of us so we can't really talk much useful. But if you want.

Klaus Stoll: Yes do you have any information? Do you get anything just in general?

Tapani Tarvainen: I don't have any new information about that either.

Klaus Stoll: Do we know by the way where we go after Helsinki?

Tapani Tarvainen: We don't know that either.

Klaus Stoll: Okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: So we are in this state of ignorance sort of. Although I am going to Switzerland but that doesn't count because it is not ICANN business after Helsinki.

Klaus Stoll: Why are you going to Switzerland?

Tapani Tarvainen: To climb a mountain of course.

Klaus Stoll: Okay climb a mountain. You know that I am now moving to Geneva that is why I am asking.

Tapani Tarvainen: You are? Okay.

Monika Zalnieriute: Oh.

Klaus Stoll: Yes.

Tapani Tarvainen: My brother lives there. I have to introduce you to him.

Klaus Stoll: Oh okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: But I guess we can call this meeting closed at this point unless anybody wants to talk about any other business here.

Monika Zalnieriute: No.

Klaus Stoll: Okay.

Tapani Tarvainen: Short meetings are good meetings. So you can stop the recording. The meeting is closed. Thank you everybody.

Klaus Stoll: Okay.

Monika Zalnieriute: Thank you. Bye-bye.

END