
TERRI AGNEW:

Thank you. One moment while we begin the recording.

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the NARALO website brainstorm session on Friday the 7th of August 2015 at 20:00 UTC.

On the call today, we have Glenn McKnight, Murray McKercher, Judith Hellerstein, and Alan Greenberg.

I show no apologies listed for today's meeting.

From staff we have Laura Bengford, Ariel Liang, Andy myself Terri Agnew.

I would like to remind all participants to please state your name before speaking for transcription purposes. Thank you very much and back over to you Ariel.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks very much Terri. This is Ariel Liang speaking. So, for today's brainstorm session, it's going to be very informal. And we will have a very quick progress update, [inaudible] and then we'll jump right into the discussion. And also I will be sharing my screen the whole time, so let me know if you see my screen now.

Anybody?

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: It's Murray. I see your screen.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay. Good. Thank you. Okay, so let's start, and Laura would you like to do a quick progress update?

LAURA BENGFORD: Yeah, sure. Hi everyone, this is Laura. I just wanted to give a quick progress update. We met in Buenos Aries, where we should you kind of where we were at last month or so. Since then, we've been focusing on, continuing to focus on the policy band on the first section on the website there, if you scroll down a little bit Ariel.

You'll probably remember that we demonstrated just a couple of the issue topics. We have WHOIS, new gTLD, and a couple of others finished at that time, and we're very actively working on finishing all of the remaining topics for policy. And wrapping up final testing on that area.

We're doing a little bit more polishing and fixing up of just minor issues and testing, things overall on the website. And we are in the process right now, and part of our reason for reaching out to you, looking at the second band, and specifically, what should be on the RALO pages? And how and what information from the ALSs should be represented on there?

And so, part of what we're going to be brainstorming today is, I'm sharing some of the analysis that Ariel and I have already done, and some of our thinking, but really making sure that we are as best

informed, we are, you know, what the RALO's needs are, and what your needs are. And so we've kind of crafted about eight questions that we want to go through with you today, and just kind of talk about, and just make sure that we're going in the right direction here.

So that's it from a progress update. I'll go ahead and start out with the first page of questions. We're going to ask you some questions for... We're going to focus on the first three questions here, and then do a quick round robin to get input, and feedback, and comment from all of you.

So the first thing we really wanted to make sure that we understood, and heard in your own words, is what is the primary role of the regional At-Large organization and your RALO, and what, you know, key issues and activities that you feel are important in your region? Which ones are kind of regular ad-hoc?

And then also, if you wouldn't mind commenting on any thoughts or comments you had in terms of information that you would be interested in from other regional activities and from the other RALOs, so that we could be cognitive of that and build that into our designs as well.

So I think at this point we would like to do a quick round robin. I think Ariel will probably facilitate that, and then we'll go into questions right after that, and share with you some of the initial analysis that we did, and talk a little bit about what's on the Wiki and what's on the website.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Laura. This is Ariel speaking. So, please feel free to jump in and answer the question we have shown on the screen. Those three questions.

And Glenn, we didn't share the questions in advance because we want to just use this session to address these questions. So if you have any comments, please feel free to chime in and make comments. Anybody?

MURRAY MCKERCHER:

It's Murray speaking. I'll make a comment. Having not seen the questions, so it's fresh. I'm assuming that the primary role of NARALO, as a regional At-Large organization, you know reflects the same sorts of things that the At-Large, the same role of At-Large in representing the opinions and requirements of end users, which change from time to time.

In a big picture, when I talk about ICANN to people who know nothing about it, a lot of times people are worried about access to the Internet, or it's too [flow?], or it's too extensive. It's all about getting access to the Internet. Once people have access to the Internet, other issues of privacy, or concerns about inappropriate content, and all sorts of things pop into that.

So there is both technical concerns by the end users and, which are usually handled by technical folks within the organization, or the family, or children in the family know more about it than the adults.

So that role of representing and getting those kinds of ideas and issues to ICANN's attention, is what I would see as the primary role of the organization. But I'll leave it to others to comment. Thanks.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Murray. This is Ariel. I saw Glenn's note there, the RALO is the geographically organization with the primary role of advocating speaking on behalf of non-business community, especially civil society.

Okay. Sounds good. Does anybody else want to talk about question one? The primary role of NARALO?

Okay. And Judith, please go ahead.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Yes, this is Judith Hellerstein for the record. I guess, the primary role for NARALO is to engage in different ALSs or individual members, in advocating for a series of At-Large issues. So whether it's accessibility, whether it's access, whether it's domain names, accountability, intellectual property, any of those things.

I mean, I think it's a range of different things. And I guess that question number one, what is the primary role of... Much like, I guess, what NARALO, we need, depending [inaudible], we need to engage on these issues. And also get, recruit people who would be interested in these issues, and explain to them how they can get more engaged.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you Judith. And Alan, please go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: I won't answer the question directly, but I'll say that if we're not using words like, a conduit for information, or a facilitator, then I think we're probably missing the point. The RALO is not an entity in its own right, other than a couple of people who, you know, act to oversee it. The main construct of the RALO are the ALSs and the individual members who are supposed to be, using the information we feed them, providing information back up.

And the RALO is a mechanism more than something which has its own end purpose, certainly from my perspective. Thank you.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you very much Alan for that input, and thank you Judith, and also trying to keep track of Glenn's comment in the chat. And Glenn you can speak up as well, if you wish. So let's talk about question number two, the key issues effecting NARALO. And I saw Glenn put several issues that he thinks is important to NARALO there.

So I wanted to ask that question because I wanted to, you guys to think about how we're going to reflect that on the website. So, thinking the way that, okay. So these are the key issues and we need to promote them on the website, and if so, what are the issues that worth to be promoted on the website? What are the activities that worth to be promoted on the website?

So, if you have a comment you can feel free to talk about that, to address question number two. Anybody?

Yes, Judith, you have your hand raised. Judith first.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Yes, this is Judith Hellerstein for the record. And I also, I think Glenn's mic may not be working, so I may also add his in. But I would say the key issues, what we've been doing a lot in the RALO has been trying to make sure that everyone in our region has the ability to engage. And so whether it's on accessibility issues, whether it's on bandwidth issues for the Native American community, or the first Canadians, whether it's on other activities.

And Glenn was suggesting educational sessions, or symposiums, or other different things on, on Internet pricing in rural areas, [inaudible] policies, and so there is a whole range of different other things. I know ISOC New York has been doing, is starting a series of different access issues.

And so I think those types of things are something that would be key issues, and maybe want to link in with [Jolly] and see what IPOC New York is doing, and feature what different RALOs, what different ALSs might be doing in their area, in that function.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Judith. And I know that Alan's question in the chat, "How did those issues relate to ICANN's remit?" So, that definitely...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: That's easy. How they relate to ICANN because ICANN's... It's all in the effort of how do we engage our ALSs to take a more active role in ICANN issues? And all of those issues speak directly to our role in the RALO, in that the Internet is for everyone. And as ICANN and the domain issues, and the Internet governance issues, those issues really speak to everyone.

If they don't have access, if they have limited bandwidth, and think of other things, then they can engage in ICANN issues. So, we definitely need to work on those and help them engage. And see, and help them be able to engage more.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay. Thanks Judith. So along that line, let's talk about the activities that are going on in NARALO. Which are the ones that have a regular occurrence? And which are the ones that kind of happen on an ad-hoc basis? And can you give some examples, the ones that you think we should promote on the future website?

Anybody? Please don't be shy, just chime in because we have a really small group.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Hi Ariel, it's Murray speaking. I'll chime in for a second. Both on key issues, I mean, it's almost personal... It's hard to talk about North America, it's a big region. In Toronto, there is the Citizen Lab associated

with University of Toronto, and they look at all sorts of interesting issues as it relates to privacy and spying on people.

So there is a group of folks, and they're already engaged in various discussions at ICANN, that tracks that sort of thing. So the universities are involved in those kinds of discussions, so that the group at the University of Toronto. So I would go and have a look at their issues, and see whether those are key issues are aligned in some of the stuff that ICANN is dealing with.

When I first engaged with ICANN, my interest was about WHOIS, because there was a domain name that was mine at one point, and disappeared, and someone took it, and has been sitting on it, but I had no means to communicate with that person. And they're not in the WHOIS database, and there is a whole process of how you communicate with people.

That's a hugely frustrating thing for me. So policy around WHOIS has become kind of an important thing to me. So I'm going to be engaging more on WHOIS policy going forward. So I don't know if that's helpful, but that's an example. Thanks.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Murray. I think we have reached the bottom deck here, because what we're really trying to understand is what's really going on in NARALO, and what are the activities and events that are happening in NARALO, rather than just talking about NARALO, maybe interested in because otherwise, you know, we won't be able to build a site that can directly reflect what's going on in NARALO.

And also what Murray you are talking about, at the University of Toronto, do you think University of Toronto is [head] of NARALO? I mean, let's try to focus on what's going on in NARALO rather than going kind of a little too broad, just talking about North America in general.

So that's what we're trying to get information and input from vis a vis these questions. Anybody else have comments on question number one or number two?

Okay.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Sorry, this is Silvia.

ARIEL LIANG: Sorry, Alan had his hand raised. Alan can go first and Silvia you will go after Alan. Is that okay?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, sure.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay, thank you. Alan, please go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Just wanted to raise a question, which I think is worth answering. And I'm not sure what the answer means, but I think it's worth thinking of. Virtually all of our ALSs are organizations that exist, or existed in their

own right, prior to becoming an ALS. There are a few exceptions, but most of them are like that.

And many of those have lives of their own, based on whatever they were before, and under the auspicious of their, you know, of their real life, as it were. And one of the questions I think to ask is, to what extent, if their ALS status, you know, just went up in smoke, it disappeared, to what extent would that change what they're doing?

Or are we simply counting them as an ALS, and counting off the things they do, you know, almost going piggyback or riding on their backs, whereas they might have done it even if ICANN didn't exist? And so I think that's worth thinking about. Anyway, thank you.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Alan. This is a very good question. Silvia, please go ahead.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay. Just maybe to facilitate the discussion as a brainstorming idea, what comes to mind, in number two for me for example, is what could be the key issues of each region? I'm thinking, off the top of my head, for example, I think of Latin America, and I would recall the interest, the repeated interest in ccTLDs, in names, for example. [Inaudible], you know, and denominations such as those who have concerns for that region.

Then I think of IDNs for Asia. Then I think of privacy concerns for Europe. So I think that maybe we could also review what are the concerns for users in the region, based in the past interest that each

RALO has shown as specific items, whenever there are [inaudible]. We could take a look at the public [inaudible] and [inaudible]...

What are the issues? What are the issues that each region is most concerned about? That's just one idea that comes to mind, for me at least, from me for number two. Thanks.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Silvia. Judith, please go ahead.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Judith Hellerstein for the record. I do like Silvia's idea very much. And I think the policy issues are important, and we can put together a list, and we could, on our Monday meeting, we can ask, when we have more NARALOs here, because we only have a very select group, we could ask them, maybe do some kind of a survey and see what are the key issues, and then get some data from them.

Because I think that people, on policy issues, and if we can write up a listing of some of those, that would also be good. But I do think that a lot of these issues are very key to people. I was also thinking, each person who does, who works on issues, has a different, things that there are working on remote. And Alan, I see, I understand your question, but I do also think that those issues would be the same, if the ALS disappeared, those people would still be working on those issues.

But sometimes, when they're in a larger group, I know it's the case in my ALS, is that the larger group that we were in, which was ISOC BC, has no desire to be engaged with ICANN, but different people in the

leadership wanted to. And so we decided that we would do it separately, and so we engage in both areas.

And so, we see the pathway as, for some reason, if you are, if one area is blocked, you can go to another area. And that certain times different organizations can be all run by volunteers, volunteers have a certain idea and the leadership on how to run the organization, and that maybe different from your idea, and you may not be able to get your ideas across.

So that's why I think it's great to have different forums, because then people can participate more and get more engaged, and not get sort of like, I can't engage because this person is not listening to me. Let me just drop off. And then we lose them. And so I do think it's important to keep people.

And as Glenn... Hasn't had this type of discussion with NARALO, but we would like to have it, and we've always been pushing on accessibility issues, whether it's access to Internet, access to content, or access to other areas, whether it's the captioning of videos, or captioning of speeches, it is also for fellowships, for people who, just because they live in the US, which is a developed nation, even though parts are very much not developed, whether it's the First Nations, or the First Canadians, whether it's people we haven't reached out to, maybe in Appalachia, or some areas.

We're always looking at trying to reach out to other different parts in our region, to get them engaged. And I think a lot of these issues, I mean, a list of policy things as something else, would be helpful.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thank you very much Judith. So I think what we heard is a really good, some examples, like you touched upon accessibility and also look at the [inaudible] comment and be able to talk about outreach. And these are good examples. And I think will be a better productive, NARALO can get together and look at what they have been focusing on, or have done in the past, and have that list.

And that would be very good for us to reference that when we use the webpage. So I'm conscious of time, so let's focus on the third question now. Is it important to see other region's activities on future NARALO website? And if so, what would you like to see in other regions? Any comments? Any thoughts?

Judith has her hand still raised. Is that a new hand or an old hand?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

I [inaudible] on the screen. I was just saying, I think it's very important to see what other regions are doing, because it gives you an... If you're not thinking about it, it gives you an idea to think about, oh, that would be something that would work well in our region too. And so I think it is important to see what they're doing.

ARIEL LIANG:

Okay, great. Murray?

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Yes. I would agree also. That's important to share those, the things that are happening in other regions for sure. If there are a priority list of issues that are... So maybe an issue in Africa has a higher importance in the AFRALO region, so it would be interesting to see what the priority of issues are in different parts of the world, because I'm still convinced that issues are what brings everybody together, and common issues, as opposed to regional, we don't do regional differences, so we want to bring focus on a specific issue that's cross-regional.

So if we knew what the region's issues were, we might, bigger picture, be able to focus on priority issues that are common to all.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you Murray. And we can also kind of think broadly. It doesn't need to be just issues, it could be done for activities or leadership change, or any other thing that is happening in other RALOs. Then it's an issue. Any more thoughts on this question? Alan, we didn't hear from you, if you have thoughts so please feel free to chime in.

Okay. Didn't hear other things. So Laura, should we just go to question number four now? Or do you have any comments?

LAURA BENGFORD: Yeah. I just wanted to kind of introduce question number four, and just kind of reiterate, what Ariel and I have been very focused on is looking at what should be on the website. And as part of, for the RALOs and ALSs, took a peek at what's on the Wiki for all of the RALOs, and we put them into a document that Ariel is going to be bringing up now.

And again here, we're looking to figure out what belongs on the website and what belongs on the Wiki. You know, at the end of the day, we talked a little bit about that, but we also recognize that there is some reorganization, possibly opportunities that we're going to organize things better on the Wiki, as well as opportunities to possibly move things from the Wiki to the website, if that makes sense.

So what we did was a very quick analysis of what the commonality was, across all of the RALOs. So we would envision that there is something that are ICANN specific, which apply not only to At-Large but to other organizations as well. There are things that apply to At-Large. There are things on the Wiki that are common, and we put those in the RALO specific category.

And what our hypothesis is that, some of this will make sense for us to move onto the website, and you know, the most probably area is the column that says RALO specific, where we have common areas for all of the RALOs, and maybe some of the specific RALO information remains on the Wiki. But we wanted to just kind of go through this and talk about this and get some ideas, and thoughts, and feedback on what the Wiki is today, and what you might envision possibly moving over to the RALO page.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Laura for the introduction of this question. This is Ariel speaking again. Just to kind of follow on, we gathered that by looking at the Wiki. So this is the NARALO Wiki page. We looked at it almost page by page. And put [inaudible] information in those two columns and rows. And so

for column A, ICANN general, these are some of the web page links that link to the ICANN website.

And they are apparently in the NARALO Wiki. And the second column, At-Large general, there are the links to the current At-Large website, or the links to some other At-Large wide Wiki page, for example, the policy development page or the election selection page. So those links, they are also on the NARALO website, sorry, the NARALO Wiki as well.

And on the RALO specific column, these are the ones that are specific to NARALO, but also kind of these category information also can be found in other RALOs. So for example, every RALO has the ALS and independent member page, and they have their monthly meeting information there, and they also have organizing documents in the Wiki.

So these RALO information, but these categories of information are shared across the RALO. And on the last column you see here, is the NARALO specific, things, we sum up the web pages were linked, and that's really just concerning NARALO and not concerning other RALOs. And it's kind of unique to NARALO.

So what we want you to do is to take a quick look at this spreadsheet, and really give us some kind of feedback, what jumps out of your head? Like what needs to go to the web? Just by looking at the spreadsheet, and what should stay in the Wiki and not go to the web. So yeah, the floor is open and you can chime in any time.

And Glenn asks the question, what do the colors mean? So the color is just to help you understand the hierarchy. So the first one, ICANN general, I was trying to use the ICANN blue, and the second, the third

column, At-Large general RALO specific, these are just for the purple. So it's the At-Large color. So the yellow NARALO specific, that's specific to NARALO.

So that's just to help you to understand why we categorize information in this manner. And I don't think you need to worry about why there is no color behind the header. What you need to look at is the information on the color. So any thoughts? Murray?

MURRAY MCKERCHER:

So Ariel, it's Murray McKercher speaking. Just generally speaking, it would seem... I get a sense that the Wiki should be more the process that happens within ICANN. So I mean, policy development pages and resources, and all of the stuff that you need to get access to in order to work effectively with ICANN committees. I sort of see that as a Wiki, and in a website that's more front facing to the public, to really simplified and with specific...

Maybe it's a list of apologies or maybe it's ability to engage people, here are the things we're looking at and we're looking for your opinion on this. So we engage people with the website, and slowly bring them into the policy development process. And I think we spend a lot of time explaining the structure of ICANN and what it does, which is important. But it gets a little overwhelming. So that's my two cents.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Murray. Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. I think before even looking at the details, you have to understand the history. We've been dealing with a website which is effectively, to a large... Well, I'll be blunt. To a large extent, unusable for a long time. It has been difficult to change when changes are made, they often are, they take a long time, and we have simply resorted to using the Wiki for everything, because it's somewhere where we can put information in ourselves.

It might be bloody difficult to find, and the formatting may be less than optimal, but we can do it. So we see a lot of stuff that is there, and let me give you an example first of all. Let me paste something into the chat.

Here is the URL for the GNSO page describing the GNSO and the members. That's a website. It's prettily formatted, it's very accessible, the table that, if you scroll down showing the members is formatted so that they're organized in a way that makes some level of sense to someone looking at it. You couldn't easily do that on a Wiki.

If you look at our list, it's on the Wiki, because we simply took the easy way out. Our website hasn't been redesigned as the GNSO one has, I think twice since ours was designed. We don't have access to those, easy access to those resources, and we've simply taken the easy way out on a lot of things. So I think you have to look at it, you know, almost stand back and say, not what's on the Wiki right now, or even now what's on the website right now, because there is stuff on the website that's there historically that probably shouldn't be on the website, and how do we want to use them.

And there are different tools for different purposes. So, you know, I think in doing the analysis it's more complex than looking at what is there. It's a matter of saying what should be there if we have the right tools. I can go on, but I think you get some of the idea.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Alan. Yes, I did get an idea. And it's actually linked to other follow on questions. Because one thing that we want to mention though is that [inaudible] for the website staff is going to be able to access and update information and we won't be able to enable community members or others to access the website.

So that really limits how much we could do or keep up to date on the website, so we need to kind of pick and choose what are the most important information that needs to be on the website, and that's also some kind of information that we need to make sure that it's always fresh. So I get your point about not to be overly ambitious.

ALAN GREENBERG:

You might want to follow through the next pointer I put on, which is the list of ALAC members, one of the list of ALAC members we have. And that's actually on the website, not on the Wiki. You might want to look up and look at the URL we have. If we're going to believe it, this isn't current information. This is on the ICANN archive of ancient information that we're preserving for historic purposes.

Notice, archive. But it actually is the current page that is updated. So, we're dealing with a hodgepodge here. And as we're deciding what to

change, I think we have to acknowledge, there may not be a lot of rhyme or reason to what we have today.

ARIEL LIANG: Yes understood, and we will have the URL strategy as well, so that other up to date webpage won't look like an archive page.

ALAN GREENBERG: The problem is we do, ICANN does have an URL strategy, and that strategy very carefully says this is archived, ancient information.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: It does say that in the URL, the archive dot ICANN dot org.

ALAN GREENBERG: Yup. That's the place we put dead pages just so people can find them years later.

ARIEL LIANG: We know that we'll avoid that happening in the future.

ALAN GREENBERG: I'm not chastising, I'm just saying that as we're looking to move forward, we really have to do a zero based design, because where things are now is an accident of history, and an accident of about 10 years of history.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay. So if I hear you clearly, Alan, you mean we should go for a much simple design, with minimal information? Rather than having a lot of things that can keep them up to date?

ALAN GREENBERG: No. No, I'm not looking for a minimal design, I think we need to keep everything up to date, if it's in fact, things that chat. All I'm saying is, the organization of where things are, I don't, I wouldn't put a lot of stake in where they are today. They don't always make a lot of sense.

ARIEL LIANG: Understood.

ALAN GREENBERG: That was the only point I was trying to make.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay. Thank you. Judith, you still have your hand raised. Is that a new hand or an old hand?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: So I was going to say, my comments on the website design is, I think we need to, like I saw in the thing, to have all the working groups on there too. Because a lot of people don't know how to get involved. And so I think that needs to be on. And I also think that maybe the onboarding material, how to get involved into the webinar, and get, you know, a link to like, how to get involved in RALO, ICANN, and that type of thing.

I think the idea that of the onboarding may be because turn that into a link that can run a little training session or something, like how to get involved. Right from the website, and it could be launched. And so something like that. So basic information, as well as like, like you said, how do I form a RALO? How do I form an ALS? How do I get involved? What email...?

I guess also, maybe questions like, I guess, the emails, what do I pay attention to? Which do I don't pay attention to? How do I interact? A lot of that stuff, maybe, we don't necessarily, we could have a simple FAQ on there, of advising new people. And I think, I don't know, something helpful. Because people who are new, who don't know the craziness about ICANN, will come to the ICANN website thinking, that's how I find information.

When all the people don't look at the ICANN website, because they know they can't find any information. So, if we want to get new people, that's good to look into.

ARIEL LIANG:

Right. Thanks Judith. Yes, this is very good input. And actually we're already in the process of designing this page called get involved, that will be more like a FAQ page that teach newcomers different ways to get involved. And we'll make it very detailed so that they can hopefully find answers to most of the things they have for At-Large.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: And Glenn mentioned the question, also to a lot of websites that we design. Not only do we have to make sure that the website is accessible, but we also have to make sure that it's easy to navigate the mobile. So many of the people are looking at these things on the mobile devices, and we need to make sure that at least the new part, how do I get involved, in that section, is compatible with mobile.

ARIEL LIANG: Yes, we're working on that too. [Inaudible] I know Laura, you raised a hand for Jeff. Is Jeff or Laura going to speak?

Jeff? Okay.

JEFF SALEM: I will be speaking. So I have a question regarding the concept of [Tweeting]. I absolutely believe we should be directing interests to get involved, but I'm uncertain where we want users to get involved. Like if we consider the concept of joining the organization. Are they joining At-Large? Are they getting ALS? Or are they joining a RALO? How do we articulate that?

LAURA BENGFORDE: Or are they joining a path? Or helping out with penning a statement? Is it more task or membership related?

JEFF SALEM: And I want to point out, this is something that we're looking at, not exclusively at to At-Large, but I'm looking at this across the board. I'm looking at some working group projects for ICANN in general. So this is the issue that keeps coming up across the [inaudible]...

ARIEL LIANG: I know Alan has his hand raised. Alan, would you like to comment?

ALAN GREENBERG: And actually, I was going to comment on effectively what the answer is for that. I think, as we design this information, we have to do roleplaying. We have to put ourselves in the role as someone who does see this page, and say, yeah, I would like to get involved. What does that mean?

And the answer to Jeff's question is yes. I love answering yes to a question with three either or in it. It depends on the person and the situation. One of the ways someone might want to get involved is to join an ALS. Well, right now if you go to the website, try to find out where the local ALSs in your town or country, I challenge you.

And even if you find it, finding the contact information of someone to send an email to, is probably next to impossible, and if it's there, it's probably out of date. So that kind of information is one of the paths of, someone else maybe having gone to our introductory meetings and wants to form an ALS, and they need information of how do I join as an organization.

For NARALO, you can join as an individual user, I don't think that's anywhere on our website or Wiki, as far as I can tell. And yet, that's one of the options. So when someone says I want to get involved, we almost have to ask them a question, or give them several options and several little scenarios, of how to get involved.

If it is someone who is already involved in an ALS, they may be in fact, asking one of the questions that you raise, of how do I get involved in a working group? Or how do I get involved on a particular policy issue that I heard on the news? So I think we need to address all of those paths, and there is not one particular answer that's the right one, that's going to depend on who it is that's looking and where it comes.

You know, these days there is a huge amount of information about the IANA transition. And people may have well heard that literally on the local news. And they go to the ICANN website say, how do I get involved? So I think we're going to have to put ourselves into the role of the people using the site, and look at the various different scenarios and give them paths to follow. Thank you.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Alan. Any other comments on that point? And also, I want to narrow the scope a little. So we don't really have enough time to look at this whole spreadsheet and later we will follow up with the homework, for you guys to look at the spreadsheet and identify the information you think will be kind of necessary to put on the NARALO site.

I think these are things a newcomer would really benefit from. So we'll follow up with that question. And Laura, should we move to the next sets of the questions?

Sorry. Just let me go put the PowerPoint back.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Ariel, while you're doing that, it's Murray speaking. I just noticed that from Jeff's perspective I dug into the ICANN, actually I don't even know what it is called, but the Confluence place. And there was a vision and strategy document that I noticed Jeff had posted fairly recent. That looks like we should probably look through that a bit more, it would be helpful for us.

Just a comment, thanks.

LAURA BENGFORDE: Yeah, we have... I think, Murray, you're referring to our digital services Wiki out there. And we have been trying to upload documents on there and just kind of share those. So that would be very good to look at.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: There is the, just posted the URL in the chat, that was what I was looking at.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you Murray for that link. We will take a look at it after this call, because we only have 10 minutes left, unless you guys can stay on for a

little bit. We do have a few other questions we want to ask you. So if I may, let's talk about another question we have is, actually Alan kind of touched upon that too, it's what information should we have on the ALSs independent members?

So if we have a web page just for that, what do you think that should be necessary information on there? Should we have full, compact detail and the link, and the logos? What do you think? [So that's] question number five.

Any comments?

MURRAY MCKERCHER:

It's Murray speaking. My suggestion, we just link to the ALS's information on their own website, rather than trying to duplicate things. Like a really quick note to what they do, but a link to get in touch with them directly. That's my thought.

ARIEL LIANG:

Okay. I do want to let you know, well you probably also know, we have the ALS's page, I think, on NARALO's Wiki. And so we have, you know, the ALS [inaudible], and if you click on the individual page, you will see, oh, [inaudible] linked to the LinkedIn page for this ALS. And some of them link, actually have their own individual page that have a blurb about what this ALS does, and you know, the link compact and address and email.

So, we're thinking that this list can move from the Wiki to the website. Maybe I have the concern that if you look to the website, how can we

keep it up to date? If the community don't have access to the website yet. So we kind of need to think about it too. We should keep at both places, so [inaudible] can add complexity to keep them up to date.

Any more thoughts on this questions about ALSs and independent members? And Judith, please?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Yeah. So my thought is maybe what we could do is, see that doesn't answer Alan's question of where they're located. And maybe what we can do is put a link to the cities or states where the ALS is listed instead, and group them like that. So if you're an ALS in DC, so maybe they're looking at DC area ALSs, or Colorado, or New York.

And sort of group them by state, and then they can have a drop down within each state of city, of what ALS is there. And then you can go... And so... Because I find this place is not, the [inaudible] website is not very helpful because people don't know where they are. And I think if you have either a map, or if you like go by state, that will be more helpful to people.

Oh and Glenn talks about a geo-map, and that will [inaudible] the gap, so we need to work on. Because I think this is useless to me, if I'm coming and I've not... I want to know what's in my state. So if I want to get engaged, I can call that person. And then I can click on the link and get to that person. That's how I would do it.

That's also how I am to use the ISOC global one, and for different countries. I look at the maps and I see what state it is, or something like

that. And maybe some ALSs cover more space than one, but that could be also listed.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you Judith for this suggestion. We have taken note on that, and maybe we'll think about building some kind of a future search capability for the webpage on that. And Alan, please go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Yeah, I tend to agree with Judith. Although, maps are one way of doing it, but I think, you know, pull down lists of various things, or search capability is really important. Not everyone is visually oriented, and there is also accessibility issues with that. I question, what do you mean by independent members?

ARIEL LIANG: Unaffiliated. Should we change it to unaffiliated?

ALAN GREENBERG: Are you going to list them all? What are you planning to do?

ARIEL LIANG: Well, we don't know. We don't really know exactly, but we also know that, especial [inaudible] we need to make sure that independent members are recognized as well, have a place on the website. So we know that we need to have that, but we don't know exactly how we're going to do that.

And if you have suggestions, that would be really great.

ALAN GREENBERG:

I don't have a suggestion. I'm not sure that we've ever told people that we're going to publish their names in a list, and if we are, we better think about that. There are privacy issues involved.

ARIEL LIANG:

Yes, that's a good point, yes. And so let's move on to another question. So, the next question we have is, how important is social media? We ask this because we are [inaudible] NARALO Wiki page, we recently found out that they have their own Facebook and LinkedIn page. I didn't know about that before. And [inaudible] NARALO has maintained some kind of a social media account.

And if so, would you like to also put something up, have a place on the website? That's our question, number six.

Any comments?

MURRAY MCKERCHER:

Ariel, it's Murray speaking. I don't, I'm not aware that NARALO has any specific social media. Various people within the group do things, social media-ish. I don't think we have one specifically. It's a good idea, and I do think it should be, you know, links to that. You are all that Alan shared a minute ago, about the GNSO. The GNSO looks like they have a Twitter account, which is a good thing.

ARIEL LIANG:

Yes. That's for the whole GNSO, not for the constituency or stakeholder groups. So of course you know that we have a Twitter account and a Facebook page for At-Large. We're not just sure NARALO has any regional one that we have no idea before. But if you wish to have one, and there is also an issue that we need to consider is how to keep it updated, because it's not having much feed, then it doesn't have much value.

So and Glenn said, you have a, NARALO has a Facebook account. But it's not very busy. Okay. So we can return to this question later on. This is not a very, of a great importance for NARALO social media. Then we can just have the At-Large social media on there. And our next question is about translation. Well, we do know that in North America it's mostly English being used, but also I know that sometimes, based on my experience doing voting related things, sometimes French and Spanish are also required for NARALO votes.

So I was just wondering whether other languages with that English is also important for the website. And if so, should we have some kind of plug in that we can install for translation for the NARALO page? What are your thoughts on that? It's question number seven. And Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG:

Well, in general, yes we do have Francophone and Spanish speakers in NARALO. Over the years, we have occasionally said we should be bilingual, multilingual. We've never had a huge demand for it. And you

know, we don't do translation, simultaneous interpretation on our monthly conference calls, for instance.

On the other hand if there is a plug in that can be used, and it's one that we're using anyway for other regions, yes I think it would be a nice touch.

ARIEL LIANG: Right. Thanks Alan. Murray?

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Yeah I just want to echo Alan's sentiments there. So for North America and French speaking folks, it's useful in Spanish as well. Toronto is really multilingual to do anything in Toronto, it would be helpful for that crowd. And as far as plug ins go, when I need to [inaudible] to translate plug ins, [inaudible] I use, We Chat plug ins work, Mandarin to English translation in some instances.

So I do know that those things exist, and I'm happy to help out on that. I think it's important that we communicate with people in their own language, or their preferred language.

ARIEL LIANG: Thanks Murray. And you may notice in the chat, we were... So if we do the plug-in we could explore Bing translate, and that's what the GNSO site has been using. And I also want to share some information with you about EURALO. We just had a call on this as well. When we asked them about translation, they actually said it may be good to put in kind

of a [inaudible] policy, in the working language of EURALO is English, hence the information on the EURALO website will be in English, so that avoid much complication of translation.

So they actually they don't have really much demand for translation, because it's just too many languages in Europe. It would be difficult to provide that. [Inaudible] that would be easier. And then, I saw both Judith and Alan's hand. I'm not sure who raised their hand first, but maybe Judith go first and Alan next.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks. I think, I've actually used that Google, I think that Google looks better. Silvia can do a plug in for Google translate. But also I like the idea of putting a note in there, and saying, although NARALO has, uses three languages, the predominant language is English, and so it's, so Spanish or French, please use the Google translate. Or something like that. Unless we're going to pay to get them professionally translated into other languages.

We do have brochures both in Spanish and in French as well, so we do try to have the trilingual, as Murray said, and we do have brochures. And I think we should also have... And Spanish ones too if we want to get more ALSs in Puerto Rico or in other parts of the US, that are, that we want to get more people engaged. So I think it could be good.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Judith. And Alan, please.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. NARALO has a schizophrenic, has played a schizophrenic role. The operating principles say, and I quote, “NARALO will be multilingual from its inception. Public documents will be produced in English, French, and Spanish, as appropriate.” Well with the exception of those brochures that Judith was talking about, we’ve generally thought it wasn’t appropriate for anything else.

And it’s hard to really say that we’re multilingual from its inception, unless we cancelled it a week later and didn’t tell anyone. In reality, English is the working language of NARALO, and I don’t think that is likely to change. There is not enough demand and involvement right now. If there should be enough demand, that could change, I guess.

Europe is a different situation in that, ICANN tends to do things in the UN languages, and most of the European languages are not UN languages. You know, so you’ll often here from the Germans, or the Dutch, or the Belgians, or the, you know, there are many others that speak languages that aren’t held by UN language support.

So they have taken a position, sort of, that we should treat all languages fairly, and not do anything in other languages. And that’s somewhat understandable. I think we are generally an English, English is the default language, but as I started off saying, if we can do a plug in as poor as machine translation is, if we can do a plug in that we’re already using for other parts of the organization, then I see no reason not to. But I would not put a huge investment into it at this point. Not for NARALO.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you Alan. Murray?

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Yes. I just wanted to... I disagree with Alan's comments for sure. I think, by agreeing with EURALO. So if you make a statement that generally working language is English, I mean maybe we should consider changing it, NARALO, but I don't want to be shot by Matt.

I do go to ISOC Quebec, which is also in French, and use Google translate, and it's quite useful for me to find out what's happening in ISOC France or ISOC Quebec. I mean, we have the tools I think we should do that. And to Alan's point, it shouldn't be a fairly expensive thing to do. Thank you.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you Murray. So let's just go to the last question that we have here. First we talk about phase one of the website, we will give staff access first, because they will make sure it works, and you know, be stable and secure. And so given that background, what kind of content that you think we should keep up to date on the future NARALO page?

So would you like...? So if we keep it up to date, then that means the staff will need to keep it up to date. And that type of things that you think would be absolutely necessary?

Comments and thoughts?

Thanks Alan. I evidently can...

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Well Ariel, I think, since you have so much time on your hands, you might take on that task. I'm just kidding.

ARIEL LIANG: I think you mean Silvia, not me.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: I think that the RALOs... There should be some straightforward way to update news, so there is a basic consistency, and maybe that's a staff thing, if it can be funded, but obviously there needs to be some relevant content continually updated, and the RALOs should be able to do that, or maybe you do that through social media. I know you can have a fairly static page, and then there is always a Twitter feed, or a link to social media that's always active and fairly current about people who are engaged in that information.

They're always posting information. So that was what I would suggest. Thanks.

ARIEL LIANG: Thanks Murray. Any thoughts? Judith? Glenn? I didn't hear anything.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Are you asking who should update content?

ARIEL LIANG: Well, for phase one it will be staff. But for example, staff can collaborate with community to update content, that just would need to be listed here, because there is...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Ah, I think staff because I don't think, unless we have someone who we designate the web master, then someone is going to have to, either one is allowed, going to have to go off and edit it himself, and I don't know, you know, if I want to do that, or maybe they...

ARIEL LIANG: For phase one it is staff. Staff only has access to the website. But we're asking if staff is going to update content, what type of content you think should be absolutely necessary for phase one?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Well staff has the correct list of ALS members, so but I think there is a lot of different lists, and I think I know we were trying to work with Silvia and others to get a more defined list, a definitive list. Because there is lists and they're different things. So that's probably updated. I guess the statement that, staff has all access.

So my guess is, whatever gets updated from the meeting, from like the monthly meetings, staff easily puts those in anyway, about the policy statements and the other stuff. So whatever they're usually updating. Or is that people usually update the Wiki and then staff take it from a Wiki? I don't know what the process is now, so that's my question.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay, thanks Judith. I think that's kind of linked to question number four, what should be on the Wiki? What should be on the web? And so we kind of need to make that, well not a decision yet, but definitely need to give some thought, so that we can probably identify... We probably need to go to the web so that designated staff member will be responsible for that content update.

And so, yeah I know that we're 12 minutes past the hour. And we, I think we should close this call. Laura and Jeff, do you have any other comments you want to make?

LAURA BENGFORD: Not from our side, other than thank you very much for everyone's time today. Very helpful.

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you very much for everybody's time. The call is adjourned. And we will follow up with this homework that we mentioned, related to question number four. So we'll keep in touch via email.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]