

Maryam Bakoshi:Dear all, welcome to the NCSG Policy Call on Monday 18 February 2019 at 1700 UTC. Please be aware that this session will be recorded, and the recording and transcript circulated to the relevant group mailing list. Group members absent from this session will be able to access the AC recording and the content of the AC chat. The NCSG Secretariat will be the custodian of the recording, however please note that ICANN org cannot control how those external to ICANN will share the recording or respect the private nature of the conversation.

Rafik Dammak:hi all

Elsa Saade:Hey everyone

Farell Folly:Hi Rafik

Maryam Bakoshi:Welcome everyone!

Stephanie Perrin:Hi all. IS sound off?

Ayden Férdeline:I have no audio it seems. sorry to join late

Arsene Tungali:no audio for me too

Arsene Tungali:now yes

Stephanie Perrin:yes loud and clear

Ayden Férdeline:now I can. thanks

Stephanie Perrin:we are a little short of councillors...

Farell Folly:I can hear 5/5

Olga Kyrlyuk:Hi All

Farzaneh Badii:Maryam is the statement up on NCSG wiki?

Farzaneh Badii:Hi Olga

Julf Helsingius:Sorry for being late

Elsa Saade:how likely is it that the vote will have to go through the one by one voting given the updates?

Farzaneh Badii:I thought we were gonna finalize the report today and send it off to the council.

Stephanie Perrin:deferral? we are out of time!

Amr Elsadr:@Elsa: If any batching of recommendations will be done, it'll likely be based on level of support within the EPDP Team. So possibly a vote on Full Consensus recs, Consensus recs, Strong support, etc...

Amr Elsadr:But won't be on a recommendation by recommendation basis.

Stephanie Perrin:Sounds like a nightmare to me. Risk of many recs falling apart, in my view

Stephanie Perrin:lost sound??

Olga Kyrlyuk:No sound

Farzaneh Badii:oh I did too

Claire Craig:seems do

Amr Elsadr:I lost sound too.

Arsene Tungali:sound

Julf Helsingius:Glad it's not just me

Ayden Férdeline:I thought it was my WiFi... I lost audio too

Olga Kyrlyuk:yes

Rafik Dammak:when did you lose audio?

Farell Folly:I lost Rafik

Farell Folly:again

Farell Folly:but can hear Maryam

Elsa Saade:rafik we have u back

Amr Elsadr:Start again, Rafik.

Stephanie Perrin:about when you were talking about voting recommendation by recommendation

Stephanie Perrin:I am not hearing you.....

Elsa Saade:he's not in the adobe connect room

Maryam Bakoshi:I think Rafik is disconnected from the AC room

Stephanie Perrin:yes

Ayden Férdeline:yes

Claire Craig:yes

Farell Folly:But he appears as actively in my window

Farell Folly:Same on your on side, guys?

Farell Folly:actively *speaking* i mean

Farzaneh Badii:what is IPC doing?

Farzaneh Badii:BC is one group!

Farzaneh Badii:is IPC being a tag along?

Ayden Férdeline 2:BC and IPC is a joint submission

Louise Marie Hurel:hi all apologies for joining late

Ayden Férdeline 2:submitted by BC but states it has full support of IPC

Amr Elsadr:The GNSO Council can adopt the recommendations without the BC and IPC.

Farzaneh Badii:ok well IPC/BC can they block and stop the recs being passed?

Ayden Férdeline 2:I agree w/ Stephanie, a huge danger voting recommendation by recommendation

Arsene Tungali:bring back rafik

Amr Elsadr:But only if all others vote in favor of the report, including the ISPs and the NCAs.

Farzaneh Badii:oh Mr. Elsadr responded to my question even before being asked

Arsene Tungali:so i still cannot hear

Farzaneh Badii:I can

Ayden Férdeline 2:restart Adobe @Arsene?

Ayden Férdeline 2:seems unlikely we can get all the NCAs to vote with us

Ayden Férdeline 2:wait, they don't vote do they?

Ayden Férdeline 2:@Stephanie I think they can fool the Chair....

Farzaneh Badii:well Board can decide then

Julf Helsingius:Ayden: the house NCAs vote, Erika doesn't.

Stephanie Perrin:Bitter experience has proven that Ayden :-)\

Ayden Férdeline 2:thanks Julf

Farzaneh Badii:Amr in the queue

Farzaneh Badii:no sound

Elsa Saade:yes

Elsa Saade:if we abstain i think

Amr Elsadr:OK. Thanks. I'll keep my hand up.

Amr Elsadr:Yes. Saw Milton's email.

Amr Elsadr:@Farzaneh: Do you have a link handy?

Amr Elsadr:I believe we need Full Consensus or Consensus of the EPDP Team for the Council to adopt the recommendations.

Rafik Dammak: ""Section A-1 section 6 Any EPDP Recommendations approved by a GNSO Supermajority Vote shall be adopted by the Board unless, by a vote of more than two-thirds (2/3) of the Board, the Board determines that such policy is not in the best interests of the ICANN community or ICANN. If the GNSO Council recommendation was approved by less than a GNSO Supermajority Vote, a majority vote of the Board will be

sufficient to determine that such policy is not in the best interests of the ICANN community or ICANN""

Farzaneh Badii:here is the link to council

Farzaneh Badii:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1M8M0kaQSdQD3CC1HmpSTwMIKcufCT0ekVu7yHg_x-5Ff5w_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=1A9IIOkja11FXDmJ1R4Jn7wGT4ExHiVuBF89mvNt_Q&m=U6osEF7Sd2tXV_iVqj2oUzX5dLN5d-ZDGAuvO-mm58&s=VT_9YBQZHZvXitrHZl6RB_zpTGvNznzNeymH2iQgOEI&e=

Amr Elsadr:Thanks.

Tatiana Tropina:Hi all - sorry for being late, work.

Rafik Dammak:From operating procedures:"In the event that the Final Report includes recommendations that did not achieve the consensus within the PDP Team, the GNSO Council should deliberate on whether to adopt them or remand the recommendations for further analysis and work. Although the GNSO Council may adopt all or any portion of the recommendations contained in the Final Report, it is recommended that the GNSO Council take into account whether the PDP Team has indicated that any recommendations contained in the Final Report are interdependent."

Rafik Dammak:Regarding the vote threshold for EPDP, according to bylaws:(xiv) Approval of EPDP Recommendations: requires an affirmative vote of a GNSO Supermajority.(xv) Approve an EPDP Recommendation Imposing New Obligations on Certain Contracting Parties: where an ICANN contract provision specifies that "a two-thirds vote of the council" demonstrates the presence of a consensus, the GNSO Supermajority vote threshold will have to be met or exceeded.

Amr Elsadr:Cheryl is also an NCSG member.

Amr Elsadr:Did I lose audio?

Tatiana Tropina:I did, too

Ayden Férdeline 2:i ended my intervention

Amr Elsadr:Ah. Thanks.

Tatiana Tropina:Ah.

Stephanie Perrin:I am not so optimistic, Ayden. Alan rules on this issue

Ayden Férdeline 2:i hope i did not disconnect too soon, sorry

Ayden Férdeline 2:i have extreme difficulties with Adobe lately

Tatiana Tropina:Ayden. no, no disconnecting too soon

Tatiana Tropina:Amr, I remember I made a comment to a yes vote before the vote.

Elsa Saade:oh that's great

Ayden Férdeline 2:unfortunately the mute button no longer works in Adobe for me so i must manually disconnect my microphone so you have no background audio. so odd!

Rafik Dammak:@Amr for abstention it is required, operating procedures

Tatiana Tropina:(but that was before the vote started). I don't know how it would be better - couldn't we just do it before the vote begins as NCSG statement?

Farzaneh Badii:Tatiana I think it is better to vote yes and the last person who does from NCSG read it

Farzaneh Badii:but I am clueless. might be totally not workable

Tatiana Tropina:then we don't know who votes last. Never

Elsa Saade:Amr, same is happening in NGO/INGO....

Julf Helsingius:Back - my AC locked up, had to restart browser

Tatiana Tropina:They usually do do the vote sort of randomly, you don't know whose name from the SG reps comes first and last

Farzaneh Badii:I think you can decide on how to go about it ...

Elsa Saade:we could circulate the statement to all NCSG councilors ahead of the meeting

Tatiana Tropina:so in this case either we can ask Nathalie that someone speaks first from SG

Elsa Saade:and whoever comes last reads it

Tatiana Tropina:Elsa, we certainly could, but I won't really favour this. Imagine sitting there counting if you are the last or not.

Martin Silva Valent:sorry for being late, I got stucked at a work meeting beyond my power

Tatiana Tropina:why don't we just ask Nathalie to make someone go last. Or first. And read it.

Tatiana Tropina:Martin -- I had the same, just joined recently. Hi.

Stephanie Perrin:Very good point Amr. We did, in fairness, raise the issue of out of scope, we were ignored.

Farzaneh Badii:I think you should add that to the statement Amr

Farzaneh Badii:we kind of say it about purpose 7

Stephanie Perrin:We are on meeting 46 and I did not take notes....it would be hard to cite chapter and verse

Elsa Saade:just reached out to Nathalie... I'll let you know

Tatiana Tropina:thanks Elsa. If she can tell us who is the last, we will give this person the statement :)

Elsa Saade:sounds good

Elsa Saade:Thanks Amr, this was helpful

Farzaneh Badii:so looks like there is no support for what I have drafted and Amr should just write something and councilors read it

Tatiana Tropina:I missed the first part of the call, why there is no support?

Elsa Saade:but we are assuming that we will vote as a package for the statement - right?

Farzaneh Badii:they say it goes to substance

Tatiana Tropina:Ah okay. Got it.

Elsa Saade:if it's not a package vote, the statement won't work right?

Tatiana Tropina:we did substance statement before. But yes I got the point here. As a policy administrator we can't really go substance

Farzaneh Badii:so I dump this statement. it has been cursed and a source of confusion and now it's wrong apparently

Amr Elsadr:The statement has nothing to do with whether the recs will be voted on together, or divied up.

Farzaneh Badii:I don't agree with Amr but don't have a strong opinion

Amr Elsadr:It's a general statement.

Farell Folly:Package vote, i like the expression...:D

Farzaneh Badii:others (specially our

Tatiana Tropina:I am of both minds. We did substance statement on Red Cross and said we concure with the process

Tatiana Tropina:but okay.

Farzaneh Badii:NCSG members should also have access to the record and know why we voted how we voted. but anyhow. not gonna sweat over this

Tatiana Tropina:I get what Amr says and certainly this is right, although I would have been comfortable dealing with statement that has substance

Julf Helsingius:Did someone say "GAC"? :)

Amr Elsadr:@Julf: I don't think so.

Tatiana Tropina:Amr, so am getting confused a wee bit, due to being late (mea culpa) - you still are going to draft a statement?

Tatiana Tropina:Haaaa Rafik :)

Amr Elsadr:@Tatiana: Yes.

Tatiana Tropina:@Amr, thank you.

Elsa Saade:yes

Farzaneh Badii:yeah we can hear you

Rafik Dammak:I have Amr cut for few minutes

Elsa Saade:he's speaking Rafik

Rafik Dammak:not him of course but his intervention :D

Martin Silva Valent:yes!

Elsa Saade:yes

Louise Marie Hurel:yep

Tatiana Tropina:yes we can

Farzaneh Badii:yeah

Rafik Dammak:I lost him for some time

Ayden Férdeline 2:i can hear you

Farzaneh Badii:hmm I want a violet font too.

Farzaneh Badii:yeah

Tatiana Tropina:yes we can :)

Elsa Saade:So Nathalie just informed me that she can't give a name of last NCSG councillor to vote since it's always a random vote

Tatiana Tropina:am *very* concerned about Phase2 procedure-wise and content-wise

Martin Silva Valent:It took me like five calls to realize the order was random

Rafik Dammak:just read statement before the vote

Julf Helsingius:I think we can ask to state our statement after the voting.

Ayden Férdeline 2:me too, i am EXTREMELY worried about Phase 2

Amr Elsadr:@Tatiana: So am I. But not entirely clear on how to handle it.

Ayden Férdeline 2:i doubt the GAC can maintain their current level of participation into Phase 2 too

Tatiana Tropina:Elsa, so that's what I said, confirms... let's read before the vote, we did this already for red cross

Elsa Saade:sounds good

Tatiana Tropina:Steph, yes: legitimacy and sadly... legacy

Tatiana Tropina:Who wants to read it? I would gladly do it, but I wonder if someone else wants or would be on the better position? Ayden (as a full member of EPDP)? Elsa? Martin? we can decide later

Martin Silva Valent:I am far away from EPDP compared to Ayden

Amr Elsadr:Maybe wait until we have a draft, and decide whether we like it, or not? ;-)

Tatiana Tropina:Amr... I have difficulties to imagine I dislike your draft, but hell yeah

Elsa Saade:Rafik cut off for me... anyone else?

Amr Elsadr:Well..., there are opinions out there that there should be some substance in the comment.

Amr Elsadr:@Elsa: I can hear him.

Louise Marie Hurel:Same here Elsa

Elsa Saade:ah back...

Rafik Dammak:yes

Louise Marie Hurel:yea
Elsa Saade:i can share the timeline if you'd like to see it
Olga Kyryliuk:Tomorrow is gonna be a call for new gTLD SubPro WG with the update, and the day after tomorrow for WT5
Amr Elsadr:@Elsa: You're the Council liaison to Sub Pro?
Elsa Saade:yes
Rafik Dammak:guys it is not pronounced Kobi, just saying :)
Tatiana Tropina:HOW?
Tatiana Tropina:(not sorry for caps)
Ayden Férdeline 2:i thought it was pronounced how Stephanie said, interesting....
Julf Helsingius:kobee
Tatiana Tropina:I always said Kobiiiiii
Louise Marie Hurel:haha
Amr Elsadr:That's great, Elsa. Way to go!!
Julf Helsingius:kobê
Stephanie Perrin:We could of course send 4 questions and then surprise them with improv.
Elsa Saade:thanks Amr! It's a bit of an awkward role given that it's only bones so far! We're adding muscles as we go
Stephanie Perrin:Not really something we have views on, I wont cry over missing that one
Louise Marie Hurel:Sorry which one will be extended?
Stephanie Perrin:I put some comments in there on specific reviews.
Ayden Férdeline 2:planning process is extended
Rafik Dammak:yes for 2 weeks
Rafik Dammak:but not official yet
Martin Silva Valent:+100 speth
Martin Silva Valent:steph
Rafik Dammak:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1pEKINvc1ltbvYKEDGtgZ1FHrvttZFI3mXBhZsTOg1G8_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3P\[p6wrcrwl\]3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=1A9IIOkJia11FXDmJ1R4Jn7wGT4ExHiVuBF89mvNt_Q&m=U6osEF7Sd2tXV_iVqj2oUzX5dLN5d-ZDGAuvO-mm58&s=ZLBUeAI7InUANW9yd5y6vcZ7I8eIEBMTzo1Qkw2XzK4&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1pEKINvc1ltbvYKEDGtgZ1FHrvttZFI3mXBhZsTOg1G8_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3P[p6wrcrwl]3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=1A9IIOkJia11FXDmJ1R4Jn7wGT4ExHiVuBF89mvNt_Q&m=U6osEF7Sd2tXV_iVqj2oUzX5dLN5d-ZDGAuvO-mm58&s=ZLBUeAI7InUANW9yd5y6vcZ7I8eIEBMTzo1Qkw2XzK4&e=)
Rafik Dammak:operating standards
Farzaneh Badii:I need to drop off. have a lovely day night etc bye
Rafik Dammak:yes
Elsa Saade:yes
Rafik Dammak:yes
Bruna Martins dos Santos:y
Amr Elsadr:@Martin: Are there any contentious issues on the TMCH RPMs (Sunrise/Claims) that are of interest to us? I need to catch up on this topic.
Ayden Férdeline 2:very troubling; the fear of being sued could have a real chilling effect on participation
Ayden Férdeline 2:this "community" is unrewarding enough as it is, lest one face financial ruin for volunterring their time to service this \$100m+ org
Amr Elsadr:@Martin: That was helpful. Thanks. Will try to catch up, and maybe ask you some questions.
Stephanie Perrin:Thanks Martin.. very concerning
Stephanie Perrin:old hand

Elsa Saade:i think MArtin is lagging
Martin Silva Valent:lagging hard
Elsa Saade:lol
Martin Silva Valent:I think my VPN + a crappy connection is faulty of that
Amr Elsadr:I had to ditch my VPN to connect too. Annoying.
Bruna Martins dos Santos:yes
Martin Silva Valent:I usually do, but this time I forgot (is by default on)
Amr Elsadr:Elected vs appointed is a legit distinction, but NCSG officers should just stick to their duties as they are detailed in the charter.
Louise Marie Hurel:thanks for flagging that, Steph
Louise Marie Hurel:+1 Amr
Bruna Martins dos Santos:thanks, Rafik!
Stephanie Perrin:old
Bruna Martins dos Santos:Finance Committee meeting in Kobe will happen on wednesday, from 15h15 til 16h45
Amr Elsadr:@Bruna: Does that conflict with the GNSO Council meeting?
Bruna Martins dos Santos:Apparently not, only with the Subpro
Ayden Férdeline 2:thanks all
Stephanie Perrin:thanks everyone!
Amr Elsadr:@Bruna: Cool. Thanks.
Amr Elsadr:Thanks all. Bye.
Olga Kyryliuk:Thanks all
Claire Craig:Bye
Louise Marie Hurel:Thanks all!
Bruna Martins dos Santos:Thanks all, byw
Farell Folly:Thx
Elsa Saade:bye all
Farell Folly:see you all
Julf Helsingius:Thanks and bye!
Maryam Bakoshi:Thanks all for attending, good bye.