

Maryam Bakoshi:Dear all, welcome to the NCSG Open Policy Meeting of Tuesday. 9th of December, 2014

Joy Liddicoat:Hi

Maryam Bakoshi:Hi Joy

Maryam Bakoshi>Welcome!

Joy Liddicoat:Hi Maryam!! Am I early ?

Maryam Bakoshi:yes

Maryam Bakoshi:meeting starts at 1300 utc

Maryam Bakoshi::)

Joy Liddicoat:ah - it is 1.40am here :)

Joy Liddicoat:better early than late tho - eish!

Maryam Bakoshi:yes

Maryam Bakoshi:Thank you for joining in

Joy Liddicoat::-) thanks for all your work and support

Maryam Bakoshi:Thank you so much.

Maryam Bakoshi:Its great to work with you

Maryam Bakoshi:all

Joy Liddicoat::)

Maryam Bakoshi>Welcome, Rafi

Maryam Bakoshi:Rafik

Rafik:hello Maryam

Rafik:is the sound working in AC?

Maryam Bakoshi::)

Maryam Bakoshi:Yes

Joy Liddicoat:i can hear

Rafik:using AC this time

Maryam Bakoshi:Great :)

Rafik:sounds umuting the mic doesnt work

Maryam Bakoshi:I have muted you from my end

Maryam Bakoshi:Let me know when you want to be unmuted

Maryam Bakoshi:Bill Drake and David Cake have joined

Maryam Bakoshi:Robin Gross and Rusi Vansnick have joined the meeting

Maryam Bakoshi>Welcome, all

Robin Gross:hello good people!

Maryam Bakoshi>Hello Robin

Rafik:resolving the echo issue :)

Rudi Vansnick:yes we hear you

Maryam Bakoshi:Yes we can hear you

Rafik:the last NCSG call...

Rafik:in 2014 :)

David Cake:Thank you Rudi

Maryam Bakoshi:Matthew is on the call

matthew:hi

Maryam Bakoshi:Ed Morris has joined

Maryam Bakoshi:Hi Matthew

Bill Drake:very loud and clear Avri  
Rafik:tomorrow is 10th Dec  
Maryam Bakoshi:Amr is on the call  
Maryam Bakoshi:Everyone can scroll through the document  
Bill Drake:main parts only please  
Amr Elsadr:Hi all. Not very strong attendance today.  
Avri Doria:i have a minority opinion on this- think i am the  
only in the council who looks on this favorably.  
Rafik:yes Bill , main parts  
Maryam Bakoshi:Niels ten Oever has joined the call  
Bill Drake:that is utterly absurd  
Bill Drake:VERY LOUD AVRI  
Maryam Bakoshi:Chris Dillon has joined the call  
Amr Elsadr:I think it was very unrealistic to actually make the  
NomCom smaller.  
matthew:why would we want GAC rpresentation to increase at  
their discretion?  
Amr Elsadr:GAC representation would increase with a cap of 3  
members.  
Bill Drake:CSG should have 1, period. I see no reason for ALAC  
to have 5  
Robin Gross:I've heard ALAC votes en block in NomCom and can  
drive the process as a result.  
Amr Elsadr:ALAC has five becasue of the 5 RALOs. :P  
matthew:where can I see hte breakdown of the allocations?  
Rafik:ASO 5 too?  
Amr Elsadr:@Matt:  
<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/bwg-nomcom-21aug14-en.pdf>  
Maryam Bakoshi:Marilia Marciel and Olevie Kouami have joined  
the call  
matthew:thanks  
Robin Gross:CSG has more than other SG's combined? Really?  
Robin Gross:Holy cow!  
Bill Drake:Amr: I know the ALAC rationale but it is  
nonsense. I have been on the "Board of Directors" of EURALO  
since 2008. It does not exist.  
Amr Elsadr:Not justifying it. Just explaining.  
Bill Drake:A lot of the RALOs are very problematic  
Bill Drake:it doesn't provide a remotely compelling rationale  
Amr Elsadr:CSG's reps are half of the GNSO reps.  
Bill Drake:that is a problem  
Robin Gross:the company union  
Amr Elsadr:WHAT?!  
Amr Elsadr:This is a board working group.  
Robin Gross:sorry, referring to something from awhile ago

Rudi Vansnick:extended till 9 January  
Amr Elsadr:The BC's got the drafting pen. :)  
matthew:got it thanks  
Amr Elsadr:I wouldn't mind equal representation by ACs/SOs.  
matthew:agree  
matthew:whats the rationale for reducing GNSO - and expanding  
the rest - imbalanced i ther other direction now  
Amr Elsadr:Switching constituency representation to SG  
representation in the GNSO.  
Amr Elsadr:Other ACs are rather under-represented.  
Joy Liddicoat:Maryam - can you please increase the size of the  
agenda so I can read it?  
Amr Elsadr:Acc-CWG first call is later today.  
matthew:sorry dodgy mic  
Marilia Maciel:No sound Matthew  
Amr Elsadr:@Matt: You can control the zoom yourself.  
Maryam Bakoshi:Matthew do you want a dial out?  
Avri Doria:stewardship or accountabilty  
Amr Elsadr:accountability now, I think.  
Avri Doria:ok - nothing to say  
Avri Doria:except it is a crick  
Avri Doria:crock  
Avri Doria:i am a participant  
Bill Drake:I am a participant  
Joy Liddicoat:I am a participant as well  
matthew:any luck?  
Robin Gross:me too  
matthew:sorry - i am a participant as well  
Avri Doria:means nothing as long as the board is free to change  
the bylaws, as it will. anything they agree to could end up null  
as soon as they decided it was a pain.  
matthew:avri - we aorked on that charter - can't give up on it  
Avri Doria:no. stewardship transtion is relevant to  
ttransparency  
Bill Drake:LOUD  
Amr Elsadr:Good point Avri.  
Robin Gross:This is a fundamental problem of ICANN being a  
corporation - doesn't fit all aspects of governance  
matthew:need to change iuts governance - accountability will  
flow from that  
matthew:depends on length of contract avri and whjther there  
are RFPs, etc.  
Amr Elsadr:Hi Chris. Nice to see you here. :)  
matthew:can I try speaking again?  
Robin Gross:I don't audio but can type here  
Bill Drake:porque?

Bill Drake:Audio is working today  
Robin Gross:5am - will wake the house if I speak  
Robin Gross:but I can type here  
matthew:can start to list items for the 2 workstreams that we can agree on  
Chris Dillon:Hi Amr. Thanks for the welcome!  
Robin Gross:I think a top priority (ws 1) is board adherence to bylaws  
Joy Liddicoat:I am happy with this approach Rafik  
Amr Elsadr:@Matt: +1. Items that are of particular relevance to WS1 are urgent. I'm not sure if there is anything that will be in WS1 that will necessarily be exclusive to the stewardship transition though.  
matthew:why start a pad or google doc on WG engagement, etc.  
matthew:why not  
Robin Gross:we have an NCSG mailing list focused on accountability if any member wants to join. Just ping me.  
Amr Elsadr:@Robin: Ping. :)  
matthew:I think I am on the stewardship one - can you to the accountbaility one  
Rafik:@robin better to share the mailing list url  
Rafik:@Matt cna you please take the list for actions and pad?  
Robin Gross:<http://mailman.ipjustice.org/listinfo/ncsg-acct>  
matthew:you mean set up the pad and post to list - yes  
Rafik:yes that is it :)  
Maryam Bakoshi:Klaus Stoll has joined the call  
Klaus Stoll:Sorry to be late  
Maryam Bakoshi:You are welcome, Klaus  
Bill Drake:yes but you don't pass the Kieren Stress Test  
Bill Drake:who says that?  
Amr Elsadr:I thought it was a Del Bianco stress test?  
Bill Drake:I was joking, Kieren was pissy about it  
Amr Elsadr::)  
matthew:so please look at Milton's pad for the evolving NCSG position  
Avri Doria:it is not the structure that is confusing, it is the conversation about the structure that is confusing.  
Bill Drake:very meta  
Avri Doria:somebody shiuld put the url in the chat window. i need to find it.  
Bill Drake:BTW I will be late for the accountability call tonight  
Avri Doria:Bill, alwasy  
Bill Drake:?  
Amr Elsadr:The NCSG drafting is taking place here:  
[https://docs.google.com/document/d/14mDNLW17CJ\\_7rHSprzSAW90jhzPj1](https://docs.google.com/document/d/14mDNLW17CJ_7rHSprzSAW90jhzPj1)

[MiJf8qkbRM\\_Lek/edit?pli=1](#)

Bill Drake:I had dinner plans before it was announced, hope that's ok with you

Robin Gross:depends on what's for dinner, Bill.

Bill Drake:I am not sure I want to look around Milton's pad though

Amr Elsadr:The NCSG consensus level on the need for seprability has been raised and questioned.

Bill Drake:probably has shag carpets, strobe lights, strange oils

matthew:key issues: composition of MRT, duration structure of contract, composition of CSC, linkages to RZM and numbers and protocols, etc.

matthew:does it satisfy NTIA criteria, tc.

Rafik:better to map those issues in some mind map to visualize them

Amr Elsadr:@Matt: Add mechanisms for flagging problems with implementation of policy - not necessarily tying that to composition of CSC.

matthew:yes, MM says that these go to appeals entity but not sure I agreee - why not to MRT

Robin Gross:and a door made of hanging beads

matthew:going to try and speak again

Amr Elsadr:@Matt: I agree. Not sure why the appeals entity is necessary. I would think the MRT should handle these.

Rafik:@avri MRT as last resort?

Avri Doria:i tedn to support 4 years for this and 7 for the recurrence of RFP

Amr Elsadr:Apologies about the acronyms. MRT = Multistakeholder Review Team.

Avri Doria:hey, i trnaslated it on first use at least, though may have neglected to do so on second use.

Amr Elsadr:I missed the translation. Sorry. :)

Amr Elsadr:The draft recommendations are here:

<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/cwg-naming-transition-01dec14-en.pdf>

matthew:For me the duration is not as important as a recurring RFP process that is strucutred and predictable

matthew:longer the contract the greater the need for linkages with ICANN accountability

Maryam Bakoshi:Joanna Kerr has joined the call

Maryam Bakoshi:Sorry, Joan Kerr

Avri Doria:i piced 4 becасue 4 is what they could get from NTIA, so givve them 4

Avri Doria:it is a transiton withy minimal cange.

matthew:4 is the two extensions outstanding

Avri Doria:compromise to get the RFP?  
Avri Doria:did he really say "out of the box"?  
Amr Elsadr:4 is good to allow for work and results related to R&D before having to worry about competition associated with RFPs.  
Rudi Vansnick:my preference goes to 4  
matthew:so we need to address these things before the end of the consultation process  
Joy Liddicoat:Maryam - can you please enlarge the agenda screen display?  
Maryam Bakoshi:Yes, you can too  
Maryam Bakoshi:Everyone can scroll through without it affecting the main one  
matthew:we had better get working on workstream 1 asap if we agree for a longer contract period for ICANN  
Maryam Bakoshi:@Joy, let me know if yours works  
matthew:ccNSO are dead set against RFPs - they don't want their situation to change  
Amr Elsadr:ccNSOs and ALAC, for different reasons.  
Avri Doria:YES, periodic RFP is the goal! the years is less important, i will take pretty much any period under 10.  
Amr Elsadr:Not up to speed with Item 7.  
Maryam Bakoshi:Stephanie Perrin and Walid Al-Saqaf have joined the call  
Rudi Vansnick:i would preferably see results of this round with regards successrate of applications, issues related to community implementation of GTLDs  
Joy Liddicoat:i have a question  
Rafik:is it possible to share the resolution here?  
Amr Elsadr:Can we have a discussion about the ALAC freeze request under AOB on this call?  
Robin Gross:Can we have an update on what (if anything) we are doing on the Human Rights Agenda for ICANN in Singapore?  
Joy Liddicoat:sure - i can provide an update  
Robin Gross:thanks!  
Robin Gross:These "public interest commitments" was not a GNSO made policy. Staff invented it in the "implementation" phase of the new GTLD policy.  
Robin Gross:I'd like a review of how PIC became policy?  
Stephanie Perrin:What is ALAC's rationale?  
Joy Liddicoat:you are not in a minority David  
Amr Elsadr:@Robin: Yes. That would be a good thing. Not sure it was completely bogus; in response to GAC Advice.  
Maryam Bakoshi:Kathy Kleiman has joined the call  
Amr Elsadr:@Stephanie: ALAC is pretty much asking for more commitments related to sensitive strings (such as those involving

healthcare, banking, etc).

Bill Drake:I'm not seeing the minority status. I would note that attempts to start discussion about this on the members list failed years ago when it was happening

Robin Gross:but a response to GAC advice that over-writes GNSO policy

Amr Elsadr:Yeah. A review of that would certainly be good. This spec in the registry agreement was drafted by staff.

Stephanie Perrin:So it sounds to me that while our rationale might be different, (I agree about regulating content) we might want to join in.

Avri Doria:i could go along with David's perception.

Amr Elsadr:I'm divided on whether this is a good idea right now. We could end up losing a lot more than we gain.

Robin Gross:that is exactly my worry, Amr. Of course business and IPC and GAC will load it up with goodies.

Rafik:@Amr can you draft a response to BC/ALAC :)?

Amr Elsadr:Sure.

Amr Elsadr:@Avri: PICS are in the contract.

Robin Gross:I think we need to ask for a review of how PICS became policy.

Stephanie Perrin:I agree that we should focus on PICS review.

Bill Drake:split the difference

Kathy:Freezing the new contracts for New gTLDs?

Stephanie Perrin:Who is going to be most upset by a freeze, the registrars? of course the applicants, but any other stakeholder group?

Kathy:Yes, the communities.

Robin Gross:I don't want to ask for any freeze.

Kathy:A freeze is a huge advantage to the portfolio applicants who have gotten their New gTLDs early

Kathy:sorry i'm not on the phone bridge

Rafik:@kathy you can join through audio in AC

Amr Elsadr:Good point Kathy.

Bill Drake:I accept temporary

Kathy:Call it what you will - it's a freeze

Rafik:moratorium

Kathy:The contracts yield to consensus policy - present and future

Amr Elsadr:@Avri: Everything you say makes sense to me except the need to freeze the new gTLDs until any of this happens.

Avri Doria:if you don't freeze, you can't change the contract.

Avri Doria:the contract needs to include consensus policy for PICS.

Amr Elsadr:Why not? The review of the PICS and their DRP is part of the process. New specs and dispute resolution rules can

be adopted and used.

Kathy:@avri, the new contract includes consensus policy for everything

Amr Elsadr:After going through a GNSO process.

Avri Doria:not in relations to anyone with a contract that says they dont really have to worry about.

Amr Elsadr:@Avri: I have a feeling I'm missing something you're trying to point out.

Avri Doria:Kathy, but for PICs/ if you can show me that PICs are included for consnsus policy regualtion, i will consider my new found view.

Amr Elsadr:If there is a new consensus policy regarding PICs, all registries will have to abide by them.

Maryam Bakoshi:Akinremi Peter Taiwo has joined the call

Avri Doria:re-consider. i love changing my mind based on new arguments and new facts.

Akinremi Peter Taiwo:Hi guys.....

Maryam Bakoshi:Welcome, Akinremi

Akinremi Peter Taiwo:@Bakoshi. Thanks

Avri Doria:btw, the part of me that is an observer in the NTAG (new tld applicants group) is very disappointed with the poostion I am taking.

Maryam Bakoshi:@Akinremi - Item iii on the agenda

Kathy:I would like to hear about the Expert Working Group

Kathy:@Avri, is that yours?

Amr Elsadr:Chris is on the call. The translation and transliteration of contact information pdp is nearing the public comment period on the WG's initial report.

Kathy:I was thinking more of the Board-GNSO

Kathy:Yes

Amr Elsadr:Avri: Could you please post on-list notifications when a call is scheduled?

Kathy:Tx Avri

Rudi Vansnick:i have to go in about 5 minutes for an outside meeting

Avri Doria:EWG Process Group

Avri Doria: Date: 10 DecemberTime: 21:00-22:30 UTC1:00-2:30 pm (PT) 4:00-5:30 pm (ET)

Akinremi Peter Taiwo:thank Avri for the info....

Amr Elsadr:Thnx Avri. Could you send the AC Room link too.

Chris Dillon:We have technical trouble.

Chris Dillon:In fact I can't say much more than Amr has.

Chris Dillon:We have one more meeting before we put the initial report our to public comment.

Chris Dillon:our -> out

Chris Dillon:And I don't want to second-guess it.



Chris Dillon:Thanks for a very good summary, Amr.  
Akinremi Peter Taiwo:That's good info @ Amr.  
Chris Dillon:We look forward to comments.  
Amr Elsadr:When the initial report is published, I'm sure someone will make sure it reaches the NCSG list. :)  
Kathy:Can we include UDRP in discussions. CSG knows a lot more than we do about the rollout of UDRP this spring...  
Amr Elsadr:BTW..., I don't know if anyone is interested or not, but the implementation review team of the "thick" whois PDP is ongoing. The legal review looking into conflicts of this policy with jurisdictions having strong data privacy laws is proving more difficult than ICANN staff initially expected.  
Robin Gross:CSG and NCSG came to agreement on Markus as board member and as David Cake as vice-chair. I think NCSG-CSG relations have never been better (low bar, granted).  
Chris Dillon:@Amr: I'll send the T&T report to the list.  
Amr Elsadr:Great. Thanks Chris.  
Stephanie Perrin:SOunds like an excellent idea Bill.  
matthew:good idea - lets have ammeting with local CDS players  
matthew:CS  
Rafik:@Amr share about thick whois pdp update to the list  
Rafik:@matt CDS?  
matthew:CS  
Akinremi Peter Taiwo:hmmmmmmm  
Amr Elsadr:@Rafik: Sure.  
Avri Doria:i like the idiea of the post friday  
Avri Doria:lots of people stay  
matthew:what about the saturday before  
Robin Gross:I hear that there may be an accountability ccwg mtg on the friday after (singapore).  
Bill Drake:after a week long meeting a lot of people don't really care to hear views etc anymore  
Stephanie Perrin:Exactly, must know long in advance  
Avri Doria:council has done afters and people stayed.  
Akinremi Peter Taiwo:@Bill. Yea you are right.  
Joy Liddicoat:the answer from me is: YES  
Avri Doria:yes on the event  
matthew:I support  
Avri Doria:either friday is fine. like friday after a bit better.  
Stephanie Perrin:What would we talk about? I agree it is not good to leave money on the table, but what do we have a burning need to talk about?  
Robin Gross:I support also (but Friday after could be a problem for me if CCWG-ACCT meets then).  
Robin Gross:we agree with CSG on many accountability issues

Bill Drake:I lost my sound  
matthew:lost the conection there for a moment  
matthew:I agree with Robin  
Avri Doria:ah, that would be a conflict to avoid.  
Walid Al-Saqaf:Fully support Bill's initiative. But advance  
planning is important  
Bill Drake:we still need IPC to bless, BC and ISPC are ok with  
it  
Kathy:Bye all - running to PPSAI meeting.  
Bill Drake:IPC discusses today  
Kathy:Tx to Rafik for leading!  
Robin Gross:I'd like to help working on this event and have  
some ideas on what issues we can find commonality and make for a  
productive mtg.  
Amr Elsadr:The advance planning requirement is enough of a  
reason to take this to the CSG in DC.  
Joy Liddicoat:It is 4am here in New Zealand  
matthew:ouch  
Bill Drake:Amr hope you can come to DC  
Joy Liddicoat::(  
Bill Drake:Joy wins the largest sufferer award  
Robin Gross:Joy wins the "most pain" award this month.  
Amr Elsadr:@Bill: Doubt it, but good luck over there.  
Walid Al-Saqaf:I only joined the second half due to time zone  
confusion. Thanks Rafik for great moderating. It was an  
informative meeting for me.  
Joy Liddicoat:ha ha robing - Ok, I will leave now - thanks for  
the call and thanks for all the work this year evveryone  
Bill Drake:please let us know as soon as you have a definitive  
read Amr  
Maryam Bakoshi:Thank yu all for attending  
matthew:Thanks Rafik - all  
Bill Drake:would hate to waste your travel slot  
Robin Gross:Thanks, Rafik!  
Akinremi Peter Taiwo:bye to everyone  
Marilia Maciel:Bye  
Chris Dillon:Goodbye , everyone  
Amr Elsadr:Thanks and bye to all.