ATRT2 Recommendation 9 Implementation
Decision-Making, Transparency and Appeals Processes
30 September 2016

Implementation Timeline

November 2016
Recommendation Operationalized

Recommendation 9 Implementation Description

Recommendation 9 includes recommendations of commitments of how ICANN will consider Advisory Committee advice, a requirement that ICANN initiates another review of its Accountability Mechanisms, that ICANN convene a review of the role of the Office of the Ombudsman, as well as commissioning a review of the Anonymous Hotline to assure that it meets with best practices. The Recommendation also specifies areas that ICANN should regularly report on regarding transparency.

Status of Deliverables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Deliverables</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Re-plan Date</th>
<th>Original Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Review Accountability Mechanisms</td>
<td>Community (CCWG)</td>
<td>Not applicable (n/a)</td>
<td>March 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Review Ombudsman Role</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>March 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>Nov 2016</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Review Anonymous Hotline</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>November 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Complete
- Planned/In Process
- Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
- Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted
**9.1 Implementation Timeline**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status of Deliverables</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Re-plan Date</th>
<th>Original Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community consultation to develop Bylaws amendments, including issues of workflow and definitions</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>No Longer Applicable</td>
<td>June 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bylaws amendments provided to Board to approve public comment posting</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>July 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open public comment on Bylaws amendments</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>August 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board approval of Bylaws amendments</td>
<td>Board</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The 9.1 subproject implementation focus is on the proposed Bylaws change recommended by the ATRT2 to impose a requirement on the ICANN Board to acknowledge advice arising from any of ICANN’s Advisory Committees.
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.1 Implementation  
Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice  
Recommendation fully implemented as of 30 June 2016

**Recent Update:** The ICANN Bylaws approved by the ICANN Board on 27 May 2016 include this requirement.

**Project Status**  
The proposed Bylaws text has been incorporated into the Draft New ICANN Bylaws that were approved by the Board on 27 May 2016 ([https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-bylaws-27may16-en.pdf.](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-bylaws-27may16-en.pdf)).

The Cross Community Working Group on Enhancing ICANN Accountability identified the language recommended for inclusion in the Bylaws through this Recommendation 9.1 as language that should be adopted as part of the Bylaws necessary to be in place for the transition of the stewardship of the IANA functions. The CCWG-Accountability proposal was provided to Chartering Organizations for consideration on 23 February 2016. [https://community.icann.org/x/8w2AAw](https://community.icann.org/x/8w2AAw), and the Board submitted the proposal to NTIA on 10 March 2016.

**Implementation Notes**  
This Recommendation is now complete, through the embedding of the language in the approved Bylaws. The Bylaws will go into effect upon the expiration of NTIA’s IANA Functions Contract with ICANN.
9.2 Implementation Timeline

March 2016
Operationalized

9.2 Subproject Description

The 9.2 subproject implementation focus is to review ICANN’s existing accountability mechanisms through a community-comprised group.

Status of Deliverables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confirm that CCWG-Accountability is reviewing the Independent Review and Reconsideration Processes as part of their work.</td>
<td>Community (CCWG)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continue regular monitoring of CCWG-Accountability work to confirm that 9.2 is still addressed within their work</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assess outcomes of CCWG-Accountability work to confirm if further work is needed to meet 9.2</td>
<td>ICANN Organization / Community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.2 Implementation
Review Accountability Mechanisms
Recommendation fully implemented as of 31 March 2016

**Recent Update:** This recommendation was fully implemented as of 31 March 2016.

**Project Status**
The Cross Community Working Group (CCWG) Accountability work is addressing reviews of the Independent Review and Reconsideration Processes. Prior to moving forward with the composition of a separate community group, it is important to allow the CCWG work to move forward. If it is determined – through consultation with the CCWG – that the work called for in Rec. 9.2 is not being fulfilled by the CCWG, then ICANN will need to move forward with a separate implementation plan. ICANN will maintain regular dialogue with the CCWG to confirm that work is progressing toward this recommendation.

**Implementation Notes**
This work will be closely coordinated with the CCWG work. The CCWG work can be followed at [https://community.icann.org/display/acctcrosscomm/CCWG+on+Enhancing+ICANN+Accountability](https://community.icann.org/display/acctcrosscomm/CCWG+on+Enhancing+ICANN+Accountability)
9.3 Implementation Timeline

| Identify expert to review current Office of Ombudsman structure and consider modification of role | ICANN Organization | Removed from Workplan* | October 2015 |
| Expert review completed, and results socialized with the Board and Community | ICANN Organization | Removed from Workplan* | October 2015 |
| Bylaw changes (if needed) posted for public comment | ICANN Organization (dependent on Board approval) | Removed from Workplan* | January 2015 |
| If extensive modifications identified, allow for further community discussions at an ICANN public meeting after sufficient time to consider recommendations. | Community | Removed from Workplan* | March 2016 |
| Board Approval of Bylaws changes | ICANN Organization | Removed from Workplan* | June 2016 |

*See Implementation Notes

9.3 Subproject Description

The 9.3 subproject is for the implementation of a review of the Office of the Ombudsman, the role within ICANN, and whether the duties/scope of the Ombudsman should be expanded or changed in line with suggestions from the ATRT2.

9.3 Implementation Timeline

June 2016
Removed from Workplan
Recent Update: Removed from workplan to avoid duplication with the CCWG-Accountability’s Work Stream 2 effort on the Ombudsman.

Project Status
An expert was expected to be retained and to perform a review of the Office of the Ombudsman by June 2015, with work expected to be completed by October 2015. Because of the unique nature of the Ombudsman role within ICANN, there were challenges in identifying a proper independent expert to undertake this review.

As ICANN was conducting a search for this review, work continued in the Cross Community Working Group on Enhancing ICANN Accountability on modifying the role of the Ombudsman. In addition to the changes to the Ombudsman role that are already reflected in the new ICANN Bylaws (particularly within the Reconsideration Process, where the Ombudsman has a new role), the CCWG-Accountability also noted that it will do a broader review of the Ombudsman role in its Work Stream 2 efforts that are under development now and anticipated to conclude mid-year in 2017. The CCWG-Accountability’s Work Stream 2 efforts on the Ombudsman can be followed at https://community.icann.org/display/WEIA/Ombudsman. ICANN committed to this work in the Bylaws as approved by the Board on 27 May 2016 (https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-bylaws-27may16-en.pdf).

To avoid a duplication of effort, the review of the Ombudsman role was removed from the ATRT2 implementation workplan, and ICANN will support the community’s Work Stream 2 efforts to align with the spirit of this ATRT2 recommendation.

Implementation Notes
The review of the Ombudsman role is removed from the ATRT2 workplan in favor of the broader community effort underway within the CCWG-Accountability.
**9.4 Implementation Timeline**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status of Deliverables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responsible</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Publish initial transparency statistics in FY14 Annual Report | Operationalized |
| Develop more fulsome set of statistics for FY15 and operationalize full set of statistics for annual reporting | Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan |

---

**9.4 Subproject Description**

The 9.4 subproject implementation focuses on developing a full set of statistical data that will be published annually with each Fiscal Year Annual Report.
Recent Update: Metrics supporting transparency are published in various places on icann.org. ICANN Organization to develop Annual Transparency Report to collect metrics in one centralized location. This work is aligned with the Performance Metrics and Key Performance Indicators in the process of being refined across ICANN (see Dashboard). The strategic objective that is closely aligned with transparency reporting is 5.2, which states that “ICANN will promote ethics, transparency and accountability across ICANN.” Cross-functional effort is currently underway to refine reporting of activities and measures supporting this goal - for ICANN Organization, Board and Community. A working session will be held at ICANN57 in Nov 2016 to gather feedback on this work.

In alignment with ICANN’s annual report publication, the Transparency Report is targeted for publication in November 2016. Work is currently underway.

Project Status
As the ATRT2 Final Report was approved at the end of FY14, the full component of statistics recommended for tracking within the recommendation was not operationalized for that year. ICANN published an initial set of transparency statistics in its 2014 Annual Report, available at https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/annual-report-2014-en.pdf. Work is already underway to track statistics on a broader basis for future annual reports that will be more specifically focused on transparency efforts.

There are also other reports already in existence that help meet the recommendation, such as the annual report on the usage of ICANN’s accountability mechanisms that is published every year on the Board Governance Committee page following ICANN’s Annual General Meeting. https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/annual-reports-2012-02-25-en?routing_type=path#reconsideration-requests.

Once this full set of data is identified and cross functionally reviewed it will be published. Given planned changes to the ICANN annual report, we are in the process of developing a report dedicated more fully to accountability and transparency benchmarks and tracking, and plan to have an annual transparency report available by the end of 2016, to be developed and established as a standard operating procedure.

Implementation Notes
The first set of reports will focus on the DIDP statistics and the use of ICANN’s Anonymous Hotline, as the tracking of those items is already underway. There are also other reports already in existence that help meet the recommendation, such as the annual report on the usage of ICANN’s accountability mechanisms that is published every year on the Board Governance Committee page following ICANN’s Annual General Meeting. https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/annual-reports-2012-02-25-en?routing_type=path#reconsideration-requests.
# 9.5 Implementation Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task Description</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Re-plan Date</th>
<th>Original Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify expert to review existing policy and processes</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert report completed</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complete implementation of modifications to policy</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publish report to community</td>
<td>ICANN Organization</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 9.5 Subproject Description

The 9.5 subproject implementation will conduct a review of the Anonymous Hotline policy and processes, implement any proposed modifications to policy and publish a report on results to the community.

October 2016
Operationalized

Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted
Recent Update: An expert conducted and completed a review of the Anonymous Hotline Policy and Procedures in January 2016. The expert analyzed the Anonymous Hotline Policy and Procedures to accepted global framework, identified gaps and provided recommendations for possible improvements that would elevate the Anonymous Hotline to a best practice reporting mechanism.


ICANN also commissioned a report reviewing the feasibility of expanding the use of the hotline more broadly to the ICANN community. That report is available at https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/icann-hotline-policy-review-21mar16-en.pdf.

Project Status

As at September 2016, ICANN has identified the specific implementation steps to address the recommendations furnished by the expert in its report. ICANN has completed the 1st tranche of the modifications in the updated the Anonymous Hotline Policy and Procedures, and we are in the final stages of further updating and modifying the Anonymous Hotline Policy and Procedures.

Some of the modifications that have been implemented include:
- The Anonymous Hotline Policy has been revised to allow reporting of all issues and concerns associated with misconduct related to laws, organizational policies and standards of conduct.
- The Anonymous Hotline Policy has been updated to include a description of good faith reporting and to define “non-retaliation” policy in more detail.
- A method has been adopted to ensure that the policy and procedures are both readily available to ICANN Organization to ensure that those who use the Anonymous Hotline have the benefit of the information in both documents.
- The Anonymous Hotline Policy has been updated to reflect that a reporter will receive an acknowledgement of receipt of report from the hotline service provider within 24-48 hours of making a report.

Implementation Notes
None.