ATRT2 Recommendation 9 Implementation
Decision-Making, Transparency and Appeals Processes
30 June 2015

Implementation Timeline

March 2016
Recommendation Operationalized

Recommendation 9 Implementation Description

Recommendation 9 addresses ways in which the AoC Review process can be improved to make subsequent reviews more effective.

Using lessons learned, recommendations and observations from the Review Teams, the Board, stakeholders and staff, ICANN will propose improvements to make the AoC Review process more predictable, consistent and efficient.

Status of Deliverables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Deliverables</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Review Ombudsman Role</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>March 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Review Anonymous Hotline</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>November 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Complete
 Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.1 Implementation
Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice
30 June 2015

9.1 Implementation Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status of Deliverables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responsible</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community consultation to develop Bylaws amendments, including issues of workflow and definitions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bylaws amendments provided to Board to approve public comment posting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open public comment on Bylaws amendments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board approval of Bylaws amendments</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.1 Subproject Description

The 9.1 subproject implementation focus is on the proposed Bylaws change recommended by the ATRT2 to impose a requirement on the ICANN Board to acknowledge advice arising from any of ICANN’s Advisory Committees.
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.1 Implementation
Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice
30 June 2015

Project Status

Cross-departmental work is underway to make sure that the Bylaws amendments can be implemented in a way that provides some uniformity in workflow across advisory committees, including consideration of how the advice tracking tools may be used. With the significant amount of work underway within the community regarding the IANA Stewardship Transition Proposals, as well as the work of the CCWG-Accountability that ties into some of the work on the ICANN Bylaws and the interactions of the Board with the Advisory Committees, the initiation of further consultations on a closely related topic on the prior seemed to raise the potential for confusion of issues. As the CCWG-Accountability work draws to a close, and work begins on the drafting of the Bylaws changes needed to address the transition work, consultation will be initiated with the advisory committees to allow this language to be brought into the Bylaws in a manner coordinated with the large scale changes that are anticipated. The timeline for those Bylaws amendments to be completed is no later than January 2016.

Implementation Notes

The focus of the consultations will be on the identification of uniform processes across the advisory committees (outside of the GAC, which has defined processes within the ICANN Bylaws for how the Board considers GAC advice) can be implemented. In advance of Bylaws being formally adopted, there is consideration that the ICANN Board may be asked to pass a resolution noting that until the Bylaws amendment is passed, the Board commits to acknowledging formal advice arising out of the Advisory Committees. This will allow for partial implementation of the recommendation while further details are being worked out across the community.
### 9.2 Implementation Timeline

- **March 2016**: Operationalized

### Status of Deliverables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Deliverable</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confirm that CCWG-Accountability is reviewing the Independent Review and Reconsideration Processes as part of their work.</td>
<td>Community (CCWG)</td>
<td><img src="%E2%9C%93" alt="Checkmark" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continue regular monitoring of CCWG-Accountability work to confirm that 9.2 is still addressed within their work</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>June 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assess outcomes of CCWG-Accountability work to confirm if further work is needed to meet 9.2</td>
<td>Staff/Community</td>
<td>September 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Complete
- Planned/In Process
- Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
- Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

### 9.2 Subproject Description

The 9.2 subproject implementation focus is to review ICANN's existing accountability mechanisms through a community-comprised group.
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.2 Implementation
Review Accountability Mechanisms
30 June 2015

Project Status

The Cross Community Working Group (CCWG) Accountability work is addressing reviews of the Independent Review and Reconsideration Processes. Prior to moving forward with the composition of a separate community group, it is important to allow the CCWG work to move forward. If it is determined – through consultation with the CCWG – that the work called for in Rec. 9.2 is not being fulfilled by the CCWG, then ICANN will need to move forward with a separate implementation plan. ICANN will maintain regular dialogue with the CCWG to confirm that work is progressing toward this recommendation.

March 2016 - If work is not operationalized by this date, will revise to a new date

Implementation Notes

This work will be closely coordinated with the CCWG work.
## 9.3 Implementation Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Deliverable</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Re-plan Date</th>
<th>Original Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify expert to review current Office of Ombudsman structure and consider modification of role</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
<td>May 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert review completed, and results socialized with the Board and Community</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>January 2016</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bylaw changes (if needed) posted for public comment</td>
<td>Staff (dependent on Board approval)</td>
<td>January 2016</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If extensive modifications identified, allow for further community discussions at an ICANN public meeting after sufficient time to consider recommendations.</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>March 2016</td>
<td>March 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board Approval of Bylaws changes</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>June 2016</td>
<td>June 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Status of Deliverables

- **Identify expert to review current Office of Ombudsman structure and consider modification of role**: Staff, October 2015, May 2015
- **Expert review completed, and results socialized with the Board and Community**: Staff, January 2016, October 2015
- **Bylaw changes (if needed) posted for public comment**: Staff (dependent on Board approval), January 2016, October 2015
- **If extensive modifications identified, allow for further community discussions at an ICANN public meeting after sufficient time to consider recommendations.**: Community, March 2016, March 2016
- **Board Approval of Bylaws changes**: Staff, June 2016, June 2016

### 9.3 Subproject Description

The 9.3 subproject is for the implementation of a review of the Office of the Ombudsman, the role within ICANN, and whether the duties/scope of the Ombudsman should be expanded or changed in line with suggestions from the ATRT2.
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.3 Implementation
Review Ombudsman
30 June 2015

Project Status

An expert was expected to be retained and to perform a review of the Office of the Ombudsman by June 2015, with work expected to be completed by October 2015. Because of the unique nature of the Ombudsman role within ICANN, there have been challenges in identifying a proper independent expert to undertake this review. However, the search is continuing and ICANN expects to be able to retain an expert by October 2015.

Because of the scope of the recommended review, it is important for sufficient time for community discussion of the resulting recommendations, not only within a public comment period, but also at an ICANN public meeting prior to the adoption of any Bylaws amendments changing the role of the Ombudsman.

Close attention will be paid to the work ongoing within the CCWG-Accountability and any recommendations arising out of that work on the scope of the Ombudsman’s responsibilities. The expert review should be required to consider those recommendations as outputs and dialogue with the CCWG if any modifications to its recommendations are identified to meet with generally accepted roles and responsibilities for an Ombudsman. There may also be a need to tie this work into the Work Stream 2 efforts of the CCWG-Accountability.

Implementation Notes

As the CCWG work evolves to consider the role of the Ombudsman, implementation of this recommendation and the running of the review will closely align with the CCWG as necessary.
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.4 Implementation
Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting
30 June 2015

9.4 Implementation Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.4 Subproject Description

The 9.4 subproject implementation focuses on developing a full set of statistical data that will be published annually with each Fiscal Year Annual Report.
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.4 Implementation
Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting
30 June 2015

Project Status

As the ATRT2 Final Report was approved at the end of FY14, the full component of statistics recommended for tracking within the recommendation was not operationalized for that year. As a result, on a look-back basis, ICANN is identifying an initial set of statistics for publication in the FY14 Annual Report. Work is already underway to track statistics on a broader basis for an FY15 report.

There are also other reports already in existence that help meet the recommendation, such as the annual report on the usage of ICANN’s accountability mechanisms that is published every year on the Board Governance Committee page following ICANN’s Annual General Meeting. https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/annual-reports-2012-02-25-en?routing_type=path#reconsideration-requests

Once this full set of data is identified and cross functionally reviewed it will be published beginning with the FY15 Annual Report and all future FY reports thereafter.

Implementation Notes

The first set of reports will focus on the DIDP statistics and the use of ICANN’s Anonymous Hotline, as the tracking of those items is already underway. There are also other reports already in existence that help meet the recommendation, such as the annual report on the usage of ICANN’s accountability mechanisms that is published every year on the Board Governance Committee page following ICANN’s Annual General Meeting. https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/annual-reports-2012-02-25-en?routing_type=path#reconsideration-requests
ATRT2 Recommendation 9.5 Implementation
Review Anonymous Hotline
30 June 2015

9.5 Implementation Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task Description</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify expert to review existing policy and processes</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert report completed</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>October 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complete implementation of modifications to policy</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publish report to community</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.5 Subproject Description

The 9.5 subproject implementation will conduct a review of the Anonymous Hotline policy and processes, implement any proposed modifications to policy and publish a report on results to the community.
Project Status

An expert has been identified and a review is expected to be completed by October 2015.

Once the proposed modifications have been reviewed for feasibility and implemented, a report will be published to the community. All these activities are expected to be completed by December 2015.

Implementation Notes

Several potential experts have already been identified. ICANN is in the process of finalizing its vendor selection with a view to retaining an expert that can perform the entire range of the review that was called for in the Recommendation.