

ATRT2 Recommendation 1 Implementation

Board Performance and Work Practices

31 December 2015

Implementation 1 Timeline



February
2016

Recommendation 1 Implementation Description

ATRT2 Recommendation 1 states: The Board should develop objective measures for determining the quality of ICANN Board members and the success of Board improvement efforts, and analyze those findings over time.

The Board Governance Committee (BGC) has overseen staff's development of a comprehensive onboarding training program aiming at ensuring that new Board members will be able to carry out their roles and responsibilities effectively. In this respect, an "onboarding" training session was provided to the full Board on 24 April 2015 to ensure that the current Board has equal understanding and knowledge of their fiduciary responsibilities. The training material has been published online to the extent ICANN had the rights to do so. The new Board members (AGM 2015) have completed a full day onboarding training on Oct. 15th, 2015.

Staff is also working on putting in place a development/ongoing training program aimed at building new skills and knowledge among the Board to enhance performance of Board members in specific areas of expertise. Assessment of the trainings provided is being conducted to measure the effectiveness of the program and improvement efforts, and to determine what further steps can be taken to further improve the quality of the training programs.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-Plan Date	Original Due Date
Develop Board Member Skills Assessment	Staff		✓
Ensure Board members complete Board Member Skills Assessment	Staff		✓
Develop "Onboarding" Training Program	Staff		✓
Develop Training Platform to host onboarding/development/ongoing training resources	Staff		✓
Develop Post-training assessment	Staff		✓
Publication of Training Material	Staff		✓
Initial set of KPIs including training efficiency and Board Performance documented and vetted with the BGC and the Board in preparation for operationalization	Staff	February 2016	June 2015
Development of a list of preferred development/ongoing training providers, with geographical representation	Staff	February 2016	June 2015



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted



ICANN

Project Status

This project has both short term and long term components. ICANN staff mapped out specific tasks, milestones, deliverables and dependencies to implement all aspects of the ATRT2 Rec 1. The following short term improvements have been realized:

- A comprehensive onboarding training program focusing on the full Board's role in Board Governance, Finance, Audit and best practices, has been developed. The first session of the newly developed program was held with the Board on 24 April 2015 in order to help ensure a common set of skills and understanding across the Board. The material used for this training has been published online at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/training-materials-2015-06-09-en>.
- Following the assessment of this training session, the material has been further developed and new Board members (AGM October 2015) have completed a full day on-boarding training during ICANN54. The updated material is posted online: <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/training-materials-2015-06-09-en>.
- Several additional training modules are being developed to ensure that Board Members gain knowledge in technical and non-technical areas. Material will be posted online to the extent ICANN has the right to do so.
- Additionally, a Board Training Platform has been assembled in partnership with ICANN-learn (<http://learn.icann.org>), in order to make accessible to Board members a wide range of resources available across the Community. Specific training modules, such as training on Board tools in order to optimize the use of advanced tools across the Board or Policy webinars to keep the Board abreast of PDPs, are also being developed. A summary of the trainings available is posted on <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/training-materials-2015-06-09-en>
- In parallel, we will continue to assess Board member skill sets, through individual training questionnaires that have been completed and will help identify and propose tailor-made training programs for individual Board members, as well as inform any general training for the full Board that might be beneficial.
- In February 2016, the Board approved the initial set of KPIs and agreed to continue to develop of more comprehensive, richer set of KPIs and other relevant metrics with which the Board can measure its effectiveness and improvement over time – see [Board resolution](#) for more details.
- The tracking and analysis of these metrics over time will help ICANN to measure progress and identify areas needing adjustment; this will be part of the ongoing effort overseen by the BGC.

Implementation Notes

Board Governance Committee members, assisted by the relevant staff members, continue to ensure that the Board is comfortable with the process of assessing their skill sets and following relevant trainings. They participated in the organization of the 24 April 2015 training session and of the 15 October 2015 on-boarding training, which will now be made part of standard operating procedures. There is a significant challenge in developing objective metrics to measure an individual's skill set, as well as how to objectively measure improvements over time. To mitigate, staff has spent sufficient time with necessary experts (such as third party trainers and Board assessment experts) during the development process to help the BGC determine a first set of KPIs based on best practices in non-profit public benefit corporations. Staff is assessing, through surveys and post-training assessments, the quality of each training provided to the Board in order to implement improvements on an ongoing basis. Staff continues to populate the Board Training Platform with relevant resources and training materials. The Board Training Platform allows to track training courses completed by Board members and the regular monitoring (every two months) of the KPIs by BGC and the Project leaders to enable early identification of indicators not moving in the expected directions to inform changes in approach.

ATRT2 Recommendation 2 Implementation

Board Performance and Work Practices

31 December 2015

Implementation 2 Timeline



February
2016

Recommendation 2 Implementation Description

Recommendation 2 states: The Board should develop metrics to measure the effectiveness of the Board's functioning and improvement efforts, and publish the materials used for training to gauge levels of improvement.

The Board Governance Committee has overseen staff's development of a comprehensive onboarding training program aimed at ensuring new Board members will be able to carry out their roles and responsibilities effectively. In this respect, an "onboarding" training session was provided to the full Board on 24 April 2015 to ensure that the current Board has equal understanding and knowledge of their fiduciary responsibilities. The training material has been published online, to the extent ICANN had the rights to do so. The new Board members (AGM 2015) have completed a full day on-boarding training on Oct. 15th, 2015. The material has been published online.

Staff is also working on putting in place a development/ongoing training program aimed at building new skills and knowledge among the Board to enhance performance of Board members in specific areas of expertise. Assessment of the training provided is being conducted to measure the effectiveness of the program and improvement efforts, and to determine what additional steps can be taken to further improve the quality of the training programs.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Develop Board Member Skills Assessment	Staff		✓
Ensure Board members complete Board Member Skills Assessment	Staff		✓
Develop "Onboarding" Training Program	Staff		✓
Develop Training Platform to host onboarding but also "development/ongoing" training resources	Staff		✓
Develop Post-training assessment	Staff		✓
Publication of Training Material	Staff		✓
Initial set of KPIs including training efficiency and Board Performance documented and vetted with the BGC and the Board in preparation for operationalization	Staff	February 2016	June 2015
Development of a list of preferred development/ongoing training providers, with geographical representation	Staff	February 2016	June 2015



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted



ATRT2 Recommendation 2 Implementation

Board Performance and Work Practices

31 December 2015

Project Status

This project has both short term and long term components. ICANN staff mapped out specific tasks, milestones, deliverables and dependencies to implement all aspects of the ATRT2 Rec 2. The following short term improvements have been realized:

A comprehensive onboarding training program focusing on the full Board's role in Board Governance, Finance, Audit and best practices has been developed. The first session of the newly developed program was held with the Board on 24 April 2015 in order to help ensure a common set of skills and understanding across the Board. The material used for this training has been published at: <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/training-materials-2015-06-09-en>

- Following the assessment of this training session, the material has been further developed and new Board members (AGM October 2015) have completed a full day on-boarding training during ICANN54. The updated material is posted online: <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/training-materials-2015-06-09-en>.

- Several additional training modules are being developed to ensure that Board Members gain knowledge in technical and non-technical areas. Material will be posted online to the extent ICANN has the right to do so.

- Additionally, a Board Training Platform has been assembled in partnership with ICANN-learn (<http://learn.icann.org>), in order to make accessible to Board members a wide range of resources available across the Community. Specific training modules, such as training on Board tools in order to optimize the use of advanced tools across the Board or Policy webinars to keep the Board abreast of PDPs, are also being developed. A summary of the trainings available is posted on <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/training-materials-2015-06-09-en>

- In parallel, we are in the process of assessing Board member skill sets, through individual training questionnaires that have been completed and will help identify and propose tailor-made training programs for individual Board members, as well as inform any general training for the full Board that might be beneficial.

- In February 2016, the Board approved the initial set of KPIs and agreed to continue to develop of more comprehensive, richer set of KPIs and other relevant metrics with which the Board can measure its effectiveness and improvement over time – see [Board resolution](#) for more details.

- The tracking and analysis of these metrics over time will help ICANN to measure progress and identify areas needing adjustment; this will be part of the ongoing effort overseen by the BGC.

Implementation Notes

Board Governance Committee members, assisted by the relevant staff members, continue to ensure that the Board is comfortable with the process of assessing their skill sets and following relevant trainings and have participated in the organization of the 24 April 2015 training session and of the 15 October 2015 on-boarding training, which will now be made as part of standard operating procedures.

There is a significant challenge in developing objective metrics to measure an individual's skill set, as well as how to objectively measure improvements over time. To mitigate, staff has spent sufficient time with necessary experts (such as third party trainers and Board assessment experts) during the development process to help the BGC determine a first set of KPIs based on best practices in non-profit public benefit corporations. Staff is assessing, through surveys and post-training assessments, the quality of each training provided to the Board in order to implement improvements on an ongoing basis. Staff continues to populate the Board Training Platform with relevant resources and training materials. The Board Training Platform allows to track training courses completed by Board members and the regular monitoring (every two months) of the KPIs by BGC and the Project leaders enable early identification of indicators not moving in the expected directions to inform changes in approach.

ATRT2 Recommendation 3 Implementation

Board Performance and Work Practices

31 December 2015

Implementation 3 Timeline



February
2016

Recommendation 3 Implementation Description

Recommendation 3 states: The Board should conduct qualitative/quantitative studies to determine how the qualifications of Board candidate pools change over time and should regularly assess Directors' compensation levels against prevailing standards.

The implementation of this recommendation is partially tied to the implementation of Recommendations 1 & 2.

In order to evaluate the qualifications of Board candidates over time, a Board self-assessment questionnaire was developed. This questionnaire has been completed by all current Board Members and will be completed by new Board members when they join the Board. These individual questionnaires will help identify and propose tailor-made training programs for individual Board members, as well as inform any general training for the full Board that might be beneficial.

Staff is working on putting in place a development/ongoing training program aimed at building new skills and knowledge among the Board to enhance performance of Board members in specific areas of expertise.

In February 2016, the Board approved the initial set of KPIs and agreed to continue to develop of more comprehensive, richer set of KPIs and other relevant metrics with which the Board can measure its effectiveness and improvement over time – see [Board resolution](#) for more details. The tracking and analysis of these metrics over time will help to measure progress and identify areas needing adjustment, as part of ICANN's continuous improvement effort.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Develop a Board self assessment questionnaire	Staff		✓
Ensure that the Board completes self-assessment questionnaire	Staff		✓
Develop Post Training Skills Assessment	Staff		✓
Operationalize regular assessment of Directors' Compensation	Staff		✓
Initial set of KPIs including training efficiency and Board Performance documented and vetted with the BGC and the Board in preparation for operationalization	Staff	February 2016	June 2015
Recommendation Complete/Operationalized	Staff	February 2015	June 2015



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 3 Implementation

Board Performance and Work Practices

31 December 2015

Project Status

This project had both short term and long term components. ICANN staff mapped out specific tasks, milestones, deliverables and dependencies to implement all aspects of the ATRT2 Rec 3. The following short term improvements have been realized:

- The Board self-assessment questionnaire has been developed and completed by each Board member. Newcomers to the Board complete this questionnaire immediately upon appointment.
- A first set of KPIs based on best practices in non-profit public benefit corporations and on ICANN's Bylaws has been developed. Additional KPIs are in the process of being developed and will be regularly reviewed and evaluated by Board Governance Committee (BGC). The BGC has approved an initial set of KPIs to help measure the effectiveness of the Board's improvement efforts and the Board's Performance. The BGC has recommended that the Board adopt this initial set of KPIs to allow for operationalization.

In addition, note that the process for benchmarking Directors' compensation has been operationalized for several years. Since 2009, the Board has regularly directed staff to carry-out studies on ICANN Board members' compensation and approved the appointment of an Independent Valuation Expert to advise the Board regarding compensation arrangements. (See <https://features.icann.org/2009-09-30-study-icann-board-compensation> and <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/minutes-2010-02-04-en>).

The initial efforts lead first to approving compensation for the Board Chair in August 2010 (See <https://features.icann.org/2011-08-25-process-steps-consideration-board-remuneration>). This effort was followed up by the approval of compensation for the other Board members in December 2011, following ATRT1 Recommendation 5 (See <https://features.icann.org/2011-12-08-atrt-recommendation-5-board-compensation>). The most recent benchmarking of Board member compensation took place during the first half of 2014, as identified in the July 2014 resolution on Board compensation (See <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2014-07-30-en#2.b>). The independent valuation report on Board compensation that led to this resolution was posted for public comment on 30 April 2014. (See <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/board-compensation-considerations-30apr14-en.pdf>.) As indicated in this Report, the commitment is to review Board member compensation regularly, and the current plan anticipates every two years, if feasible and practical.

Implementation Notes

This process is closely tied to the work on Recommendations Nos. 1 and 2, and all three Recommendations (Nos. 1, 2 and 3) are being worked on by the same cross-functional team, which will help with the integration of these implementation efforts. Note that the assessment of the Board candidate pool is limited to the successful candidates, as access to information about the qualifications for all unsuccessful candidates is not available for this purpose.

To the extent there is non-confidential information relating to Board member candidates available, it can be found through links on the ICANN Nominating Committee page at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/nomcom-2013-12-13-en>. The Board will suggest that Nominating Committee consider adopting some changes in response to ATRT2 recommendation,

Outside of the execution of the tasks for Recommendation Nos. 1 and 2, impacting directly Recommendation No .3, there is nothing else that needs to be completed for this Recommendation.

ATRT2 Recommendation 4 Implementation

Policy/Implementation/Executive Function Distinction

31 December 2015

Implementation 4 Timeline



January 2016
Operationalized

Recommendation 4 Implementation Description

Recommendation 4 addresses supporting cross-community engagement aimed at developing an understanding of the distinction between policy development and policy implementation. Work has now been completed by the GNSO where a [working group](#) was formed and developed recommendations in relation to a set of principles that would underpin any GNSO policy and implementation-related discussions. Following the adoption of the recommendations by the GNSO Council, the ICANN Board has now adopted these recommendations and resolved that 'the Board considers ATRT2 Recommendation #4 hereby completed and invites ATRT3 to review these adopted recommendations in light of the ATRT2 findings and recommendations'.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Working Group Initial Report posted for public comment	WG/Staff	✓
Close of public comment period		✓
Review of public comments	WG	✓
Submit Final Report to GNSO Council	WG	✓
GNSO Council consideration of recommendations	GNSO Council	✓
Public comment forum prior to Board consideration	Staff	✓
ICANN Board consideration	Board	✓
Implementation of recommendations	Staff	January 2016



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 4 Implementation

Recommendation Name

31 December 2015

Project Status

Following the publication of the WG's [Initial Report](#) for [community input](#) prior to the ICANN 52 meeting, the WG reviewed the input received and finalized its report for submission to the GNSO Council. The [Final Report](#), which was adopted by the GNSO Council during its meeting in Buenos Aires in June 2015, includes the following recommendations in relation to the charter questions:

- A set of principles that would underpin any GNSO Policy & Implementation-related discussions, taking into account existing GNSO Operating Procedures. The WG recommends adhering to the principles outlined in section 4 of the Initial Recommendations Report when policy or implementation related issues arise in the implementation phase (Recommendation #1).
- The WG proposes three new standardized processes for GNSO deliberations (Recommendation #2) regarding such issues as also outlined in the high level overview in Annex B, namely: GNSO Input Process (GIP); GNSO Guidance Process (GGP), and; GNSO Expedited Policy Development.
- The WG also recommends adding a provision to the GNSO Operating Procedures that clarifies that parallel efforts on similar / identical topics should be avoided. As the manager of the process, the GNSO Council is expected to resolve which process would be the most appropriate to use (Recommendation #3).
- The WG recommends that the Policy Development Process Manual be modified to require the creation of an Implementation Review Team following the adoption of PDP recommendations by the ICANN Board, but allow the GNSO Council the flexibility to not create an IRT in exceptional circumstances (e.g. if another IRT is already in place that could deal with the PDP recommendations)(Recommendation #4) and the adoption of the implementation review team principles as outlined in Annex H are followed as part of the creation as well as operation of IRTs (Recommendation #5).

Following the adoption by the GNSO Council, the recommendations that involve changes to the ICANN Bylaws were submitted to the ICANN Board which directed ICANN Staff to post these for public comment. Following the close of the public comment forum (12 Sept 2015), the ICANN Board adopted the recommendations during its meeting on 28 September (see <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2015-09-28-en#2.f>).

Implementation Notes

Following the adoption of the recommendations by the ICANN Board, ICANN Staff will now update the ICANN Bylaws and GNSO Operating Procedures accordingly, which operationalizes the Policy & Implementation recommendations. This completes the project.

ATRT2 Recommendation 4 Implementation

Recommendation Name

31 December 2015

Project Status

In addition to the progress made within the GNSO, the following improvements were implemented:

- Increased participation of Board members in activities of cross-community working groups such as the Cross Community Working Group on Auction Proceeds or the CCWG on Accountability
- Use of Board/GNSO informal collaboration groups to provide guidance on policy development issues, such as the one created for the PDP on the Next Generation Registry Directory Services
- Overhaul of the agenda setting processes at Public Forum under the new Meetings Format where the Public Forum is to be scheduled twice during the Meetings A/C:
 - o The first session is to be held near the beginning of the meeting agenda for SO/AC updates and to listen to topics of interest by the community
 - o A second session later in the meeting agenda is held for community comment and Board response.
- Development of the Board Advice Registry System to track advice from SO/ACs and follow-up correspondence and actions.

Implementation Notes

ATRT2 Recommendation 5 Implementation

Decision-Making, Transparency and Appeals Processes

31 December 2015

Implementation 5 Timeline



March 2016
Operationalized

Recommendation 5 Implementation Description

Recommendation 5 states: The Board should review redaction standards for Board documents, Document Information Disclosure Policy (DIDP) and any other ICANN documents in order to create a single published redaction policy. Institute a process to regularly evaluate redacted material to determine if redactions are still required and if not, ensure that redactions are removed.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Create Pilot Log	Staff	✓	✓
Create report from log	Staff	March 2016	September 2015
Document process for review of redacted material	staff	March 2016	September 2015
Finalize draft of DIDP & Guidelines into combined document and submit to Board for review	Staff	April 2016	September 2015
Publish DIDP & Guidelines combined document	Staff	April 2016	October 2015



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 5 Implementation

Decision-Making, Transparency and Appeals Processes

31 December 2015

Project Status

A pilot redaction log has been developed and reporting capabilities are being tested so that a log can be made publicly available to the community. The log will assist in establishing a review cycle for the continued need for redaction for the separate items, and to accompany a process for such a review. The log is still under refinement because of the varying types of information that need to be tracked to make it a robust and transparent tool.

Work is also underway to deliver a singular document that will contain reference to ICANN's redaction process and practices. That document will serve as a single-source reference point for understanding the ICANN's redaction processes. That document was proposed to be submitted to the Board Governance Committee, which is responsible for the oversight of the implementation of the recommendations for review prior to publication, with the goal publication by June 2015. However, as ICANN worked on the development of the log, it was determined that more definitional work was needed to make the single source document meaningful and simple to access by the community. The draft is in the final stages of development and should be published in April 2016.

As the logging project proceeds, ICANN continues to improve its briefing material design, including more intensive consideration at the outset on the need for inclusion of materials that may require redaction.

Implementation Notes

Given that ICANN has posted Board Briefing Materials since 2010, we anticipate that a regular redaction re-evaluation path will only be for more recent materials on a going-forward basis. A successful re-evaluation process requires more in-depth tracking at the time that redactions are applied, an effort that is now underway.

ATRT2 Recommendation 6 Implementation

GAC Operations and Interactions

31 December 2015

Implementation 6 Timeline



July 2016
Complete

Recommendation 6 Implementation Description

ATRT2 Recommendation 6 advises that the Board work jointly with the GAC to consider a number of actions to make GAC work methods, agenda, activities and deliberations more transparent and better understood to the ICANN community. This project is intended to map the progress in the implementation of ATRT2 Recommendation 6.

Some recommendations concern GAC internal matters and have been addressed by GAC working groups. The BGRI Working Group is addressing recommendations 6.4, 6.5 and 6.7. The Working Group on GAC Working Methods (WGWM) has addressed ATRT2 recommendations 6.1, 6.2, 6.3 and 6.6. The GAC Joint Working Group on Government Engagement (JWG/GE) has addressed ATRT2 recommendations 6.8 and 6.9.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
6.1 Increased transparency of GAC-related activities	GAC	July 2016
6.2 Formally adopt open meetings policy	GAC	✓
6.3 Develop and publish rationales for GAC advice	GAC	June 2016
6.4 Develop and document formal process for GAC advice	BGRI	✓
6.5 Bylaw change, requiring a Board supermajority to reject GAC advice	BGRI	On hold
6.6 Implement initiatives to remove barriers for participation	GAC	✓
6.7 Regularize Senior Officials meetings	BGRI & GAC	✓
6.8 Develop government engagement guidelines	JWG/GE	✓
6.9 Develop goals for stakeholder engagement by GSE	JWG/GE	✓



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.1 Implementation

6.1 Increased transparency of GAC-related activities

31 December 2015

Implementation 6.1 Timeline



July 2016
Operationalized

6.1 Sub-project Description

Sub-project 6.1. is focused on increasing the transparency of GAC-related activities and in so doing improving on community visibility into, and understanding of, GAC work methods and processes.

The Working Group on GAC Working Methods (WGWM) has been implementing this recommendation, which contains eight sub-recommendations that are at varied stages of implementation by the GAC (six of the eight have been implemented).

The GAC Technology Task Force is addressing recommendation 6.1.c on improving the GAC website, with ICANN and ACIG staff.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
a Convening GAC 101 information sessions (Sweden lead)	GAC	✓
b Publishing agendas and minutes for GAC Meetings timely (WGWM lead)	GAC	✓
c Improving GAC website (existing website and new website in planning)	ICANN staff and ACIG	July 2016
d Considering whether and how to open GAC conference calls	GAC	✓
e Considering how to structure GAC meetings to better engage with community	GAC	✓
f Establishing agenda-setting calls for the next meeting	GAC	✓
g Providing clarity on GAC leadership roles	GAC	✓
h Defining process to give opportunity to present to the GAC prior to deliberations	GAC	July 2016



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.1 Implementation

6.1 Increased transparency of GAC-related activities

31 December 2015

Project Status

6.1a Convening GAC 101 or information sessions for the ICANN community: This recommendation has been implemented by the GAC through GAC Open Forum sessions at [ICANN 50](#), [IGF 2014](#) and [ICANN 51](#). The GAC has discussed the experiences to date and considered further refinements of the approach. The GAC has agreed on the need for at least one Open Forum per year and for arrangements to align with the new ICANN meeting structure from 2016. 6.1a has thus been implemented by the GAC. The next GAC Open Forum is planned for ICANN 56 in Panama.

6.1b Publishing agendas and minutes for GAC Meetings timely: Until 2015, GAC agendas with session topics were made available online on the ICANN meeting website about one month before each meeting. In January 2015, the GAC started to publish its agenda for [ICANN 52](#) on the GAC's public website, well in advance of the 7-day time period recommended by ATRT2. Agenda publishing within 7 days of the meeting is thus complete. Additionally, during the meetings, the GAC agenda on the public space is updated with all documents from the sessions. The GAC interprets the recommendation to publish meeting minutes within 7 days of its meetings as aiming to clarify GAC advice as early as possible after it is issued. Official meeting minutes approved by the GAC are now published within 3 weeks of the meeting. The GAC publishes a negotiated, official record of its meetings at their close, in the form of the GAC Communiqués. The GAC is continuously working on improving the clarity of the Communiqués, for example through the inclusion of annexes where relevant. Furthermore, since recordings and full transcripts are made publicly available within 7 days for all sessions, this aspect of the recommendation is implemented in reality. Hence, 6.1b has been implemented by the GAC.

6.1c Improving GAC website: The existing GAC website at <https://gacweb.icann.org> has been revised to improve access to relevant information, including correspondence, to increase the amount of information available on the public website, to make Working Group information publicly available and to streamline the site's navigation. Audio recordings and transcripts of all GAC meetings (except for communiqué-drafting sessions) have been made available online since ICANN 47 in the six UN languages as well as Portuguese. In parallel, a project to establish a new website began in March 2015, conducted by ICANN ICT staff, ICANN GAC staff and ACIG under the guidance of the GAC Technology Task Force with Tracy Hackshaw, former GAC Vice-Chair, as lead. The new more collaborative and user-friendly GAC website is expected to be launched in the second half of 2016.

6.1d Considering whether and how to open GAC conference calls: GAC conference calls have generally been concerned with agenda setting for physical meetings, rather than with decision-making on substance matters of GAC advice. The GAC determined at ICANN 52 that liaisons to GAC from other SO/ACs can be invited to observe and participate as appropriate and the appointed GNSO liaison to the GAC has participated on GAC calls since April 2015. The implementation of this recommendation is thus concluded.

6.1e Considering how to structure GAC meetings to better engage with community: This recommendation is implemented by the GAC through a significant increase in the GAC's inter-sessional work, open GAC working group sessions, participation of GAC members in both GAC working groups and PDP and cross-community working groups, initiatives such as the GAC Open Forum (6.1a) and the new ICANN meetings strategy. All face-to-face GAC meeting sessions are open, except for the communiqué drafting sessions. Working groups such as the Public Safety Working Group (PSWG) have been holding open sessions of notable interest to the community.

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.1 Implementation

6.1 Increased transparency of GAC-related activities

31 December 2015

Project Status (Continued)

6.1f Establishing agenda-setting calls for the next meeting: This recommendation has been implemented by the GAC. The GAC has a session at the end of each ICANN meeting to prepare for the next meeting, and holds a conference call in the middle of the period between ICANN meetings to set priorities for the next GAC agenda. If need be, a second agenda setting call is organized closer to the next meeting to refine the schedule.

6.1g Providing clarity on GAC leadership roles: This recommendation has been implemented with the publishing of a fact sheet about the GAC's Chair and Vice Chairs. The enlargement of the GAC management team has been followed up by a revision of the GAC Operating Principles at ICANN 53, formally stating that the GAC can have up to five Vice Chairs.

6.1h Defining process to give opportunity to present to the GAC prior to deliberations: The GAC has been considering this recommendation. The topics of Geographic Names, Human Rights, Public Safety and International Law are examples of areas for which the GAC is actively reaching out, in particular through its Working Groups, to the rest of the community to gather information and input ahead of decision-making, which can serve as case studies to help define a process for the GAC to give entities the opportunity to present, as well as be regarded as an implementation of 6.1h in practice.

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.2 Implementation

Formally adopt open GAC meetings policy

31 December 2015

Project Status

This recommendation is implemented by the GAC. All GAC meetings since [ICANN 47](#) in 2013 have been **open**, except for the Communiqué drafting sessions. At ICANN 46 in April 2013 and prior to that, most GAC sessions were partly open and partly closed.

The **exception** to open meetings remains the Communiqué drafting session that is only accessible to representatives and advisors of GAC Members and Observers, as well as to GAC support staff and Secretariat. The Communiqué drafting session takes place towards the end of each meeting, on the Wednesday afternoon: it is about a half day of inter-governmental discussions and negotiations on the 'GAC Communiqué'. The Communiqué represents the formal negotiated outcome of the meeting, including the GAC's advice to the ICANN Board and therefore the discussions are open to members only to facilitate frank exchanges. A second exception to open meetings is the GAC agenda-setting conference call that is for logistics and scheduling, not substantive decision-making. Finally, the GAC may in the future need to hold a private meeting if the topic of discussion is a sensitive and purely internal matter (although the need has not arisen since mid 2013).

In terms of formalization, the GAC practice of Open Meetings is explained on the GAC website on the [GAC Meetings page](#) and in Fact Sheets for new GAC members ("[Attending your first GAC meeting](#)").

It should be noted that Principle 50 of the [GAC Operating Principles](#) (last amended in October 2011) still states: "*The meetings of the GAC shall ordinarily be held in private. The Chair may decide that a particular meeting, or part of a particular meeting, should be held in public.*" A proposed amendment to the Operating Principles is part of the ongoing review of the operating principles and would reverse the text to specify that GAC meetings are ordinarily held in public, and that the Chair may decide that a particular meeting should be held in private. This text will be updated in due course, as an administrative formality, when the GAC revises the entire Operating Principles.

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.3 Implementation

Develop and publish rationales for GAC Advice

31 December 2015

6.3 Develop and publish rationales for GAC Advice



June 2016
Complete

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Consider, decide on and implement successive steps to provide rationale for GAC Advice	GAC	June 2016
Improving the GAC register of advice	ICANN staff and ACIG	✓
Include in the advice register a record of how the ICANN Board responded to each item of advice	ICANN staff and ACIG	June 2016

6.3 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.3. is focused on the GAC developing and publishing rationales for GAC Advice at the time advice is provided; recording such rationales in the GAC register; and including in the register a record of how the ICANN Board responded to each item of advice.

The Working Group on GAC Working Methods has addressed the implementation of this recommendation.



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.3 Implementation

Develop and publish rationales for GAC Advice

31 December 2015

Project Status

The implementation of recommendation 6.3 is a gradual development, discussed most recently by the GAC at ICANN 53 in Buenos Aires in June 2015.

Improving the GAC register of advice: Improving the GAC Register of Advice to make it more user-friendly and comprehensive of GAC input and Board feedback is part of the review of the existing GAC website that began in February 2015. It is also a major component of a project for a new revamped GAC website. It should be noted, as well, that the ICANN CTO and Board Operations division are developing a register of advice to the Board and that there are likely to be significant synergies possible.

Developing and publishing rationales for GAC Advice at the time advice is provided and recording rationales in the GAC register:

The GAC interprets this recommendation as aiming to clarify GAC advice. In practice, the rationale for GAC Advice is being made clearer through continuous efforts such as ongoing restructuring of the Communiqué format, improving the wording of the Communiqué itself, including attachments where appropriate, holding open meetings by default, and publishing transcripts and minutes. The GAC also notes that other initiatives, such as holding GAC Open Forum sessions and opening GAC sessions to non-members, helps to explain the aims and procedures of GAC advice. In fact, the GAC is considering holding open forums upon release of the Communiqué to explain the background to its advice to the wider ICANN community. The level of detail in the minutes from the GAC meetings has also been enhanced with a view to facilitate a greater understanding among the community. The GAC is likely to consider further options to clarify the rationale for its advice, while considering 6.3 to be implemented by the above listed actions and practices.

Implementation Notes

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.4 Implementation

Develop and document formal process for GAC Advice

31 December 2015

6.4 Develop and document formal process for GAC Advice



June 2016
Complete

6.4 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.4. is focused on the Board, working through the BGRI Working Group, developing and documenting a formal process for notifying and requesting GAC Advice.

The BGRI Working Group is in charge of implementing this recommendation.

The draft process is considered adopted from the GAC perspective.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Develop draft "Timeline for Board requesting GAC Advice."	BGRI	✓
Adopt or amend 'Draft Timeline for Board requesting GAC Advice' (evaluating current shortcomings / enhancing process).	BGRI	✓
If necessary, formal adoption of process by Board, posting online	BGRI	June 2016



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.4 Implementation

Develop and document formal process for GAC Advice

31 December 2015

Project Status

In its London Communiqué of June 2014, the GAC “agreed to implement this recommendation with the BGRI processing the recommendation by documenting the current process and seeking comment on options for improvements.”

It was noted that Board requests for GAC advice are very rare, with only one such request issued during the last five years and the Board will address ATRT2 I 6.4 in 2016, following a delay due to not wanting to be in conflict with the IRP also involving GAC advice.

At ICANN 50, 51 and 52, the BGRI discussed the draft of a formal process for notifying and requesting GAC advice. The draft process has been circulated twice to the GAC. No comments having been received, and the document is considered approved from a GAC perspective. The BGRI, meeting during ICANN 53, found it advisable to prepare for Board adoption of the process, foreseen to be concluded by August 2015. The process was detailed and documented for Board approval for that date, but by coincidence an IRP case involving GAC advice made it advisable to defer the Board handling of this process to avoid confusion and misunderstanding by the community.

Implementation Notes

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.5 Implementation

Bylaws change, requiring a supermajority for the Board to reject GAC Advice

31 December 2015

6.5 Develop and document formal process for GAC Advice



On hold





6.5 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.5. recommends that the BGRI implement a Bylaws change, whereby the Board would need a supermajority vote to reject GAC advice.

The BGRI Working Group is in charge of this recommendation.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Public comment period	Staff	✓
Amend ICANN bylaws, to require a Board supermajority to reject GAC advice.	BGRI	On hold, pending CCWG-ACCT work

	Complete
	Planned/In Process
	Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
	Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.5 Implementation

Bylaws change, requiring a supermajority for the Board to reject GAC Advice

31 December 2015

Project Status

ATRT1, ATRT2 and BGRI advice led to a proposal to set a bylaws threshold at 2/3 for the Board to reject GAC advice.

At their meeting together at ICANN 51 in October 2014, both the Board and the GAC noted that [public comments on the proposed bylaw change](#) had been almost unanimously negative, although many comments had seemed to be based on a misunderstanding of the purpose, status and timing of the proposal, conflated with accountability issues. According to a presentation during the BRGI session at ICANN 51, public comments were made around several themes: i) the poor timing of the proposed changes, which should have been considered after the IANA Stewardship Transition process, or as part of the enhancing ICANN accountability work; ii) concern that the threshold for rejecting GAC advice would be different than for other SOs/ACs; iii) concern that changes could remove any incentive for GAC involvement in policy development; iv) Lack of transparency in the selection of GAC members; and, v) changes would create even more problems should GAC advice move from consensus to voting.

In October 2014 the Board said that for these reasons the issue would be put **on hold, to be revisited in the future in the broader context of other changes across the ICANN community**. The GAC, in its deliberations during ICANN 54 (See GAC Communiqué at <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/gac-to-board-21oct15-en.pdf>), saw a potential connection between this provision and what has been referred to as “stress Test 18” and now embodied by the CCWG-Accountability Working Group in its Recommendation 11, i.e. the possibility of the GAC amending its operating procedures to go from consensus decisions to majority voting for advice to ICANN’s board.

The CCWG-Accountability discussions on this topic seem to include a proposed compromise on this issue, whereby the Board will be required to reach a 60% threshold to take an action in contravention to GAC advice. See the CCWG-Accountability Proposal at <https://community.icann.org/x/8w2AAw>.

Implementation Notes

If the CCWG-Accountability Proposal as provided to Chartering Organizations on 23 February 2016 is adopted, this recommendation will be implemented through the Bylaws revisions that will follow.

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.6 Implementation

Increase support and resource commitments of governments to the GAC

31 December 2015

6.6 Increase support and resource commitments of government to the GAC

Status of Deliverables



December 2015
Complete

6.6 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.6. is focused on increasing support and resource commitments of governments to the GAC and to identify and address barriers for participation, to improve procedures and to develop best practices.

The Working Group on GAC Working Methods (WGWM) has contributed with implementation steps for this recommendation. Several of the points made in ATRT2 Rec 6.6 overlap with, and have been addressed by, activities under other sub-projects.

The GAC has implemented this recommendation.

	Responsible	Due Date
Identify initiatives that can remove barriers for participation	GAC	✓
Implement initiatives that can remove barriers for participation	GAC	✓
Improve GAC procedures to ensure more efficient, transparent and inclusive decision-making	GAC	✓
Develop GAC engagement best practices	GAC & BGRI	✓



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.6 Implementation

Increase support and resource commitments of governments to the GAC

31 December 2015

Project Status

Identify and address barriers to participation in the GAC: There has already been significant progress in overcoming language barriers to participate in the GAC, with the Communiqué, fact sheets, minutes and transcripts being made available in 7 languages and interpretation available for meetings and conference calls. A more extensive use of background briefing documents has also worked to reduce participation barriers, as has the increase of the number of travel support slots for participants from developing economies. Surveys of the GAC following ICANN 52, 53 and 54 included rating of various initiatives to encourage participation in the GAC <https://gacweb.icann.org/display/gacweb/GAC+Meeting+Surveys>. Providing access to more relevant information was viewed as an effective way to encourage more active participation in the GAC. Providing more outreach was viewed as important, and providing better information on the ICANN model was viewed as being helpful. However, providing more translation and/or interpretation was not widely viewed as helpful. This aspect of 6.6 is linked to recommendation 6.9 and the implementation thereof by JWG/GE and GSE staff.

Improve GAC procedures to ensure more efficient, transparent and inclusive decision-making: This generally worded recommendation serves as a principle for continuous improvement efforts, as addressed in 6.1 – 6.3, where a number of proposals and initiatives have been launched to promote inclusiveness and active participation by GAC members and observers in its discussions and to enhance efficiency, effectiveness and the timely provision of decisions and advice. The use of GAC Working Groups to address particular topics has increased, which also serves to fulfil this recommendation.

The BGRI working group should develop GAC engagement best practices for members: The GAC considers, with regard to GAC engagement best practices for members, that some issues, such as making “adequate resource commitments” for supporting ICANN-related work, are matters for the judgment of individual governments rather than for standardization. The suggestion for a Code of Conduct led to discussion during the GAC’s Buenos Aires meeting and was mentioned in the Buenos Aires Communiqué, which noted that each member already operates within his/her own government’s code of conduct framework.

The GAC is, however, implementing and investigating ways in which members can be supported to engage most effectively, complementing measures to remove barriers to participation. This includes elements mentioned by ATRT2 such as local stakeholder consultation and coordination on multi-dimensional issues such as Internet governance. For example, the GAC Open Forum session always features presentations of how individual governments prepare for GAC meetings at the national level, including consultations with local stakeholders. These presentations serve as useful models for other GAC members, in addition to informing the wider community.

Implementation Notes

The Working Group on GAC Working Methods (WGWM) has contributed with implementation steps for this recommendation, noting that the second section of the recommendation, “Consider how the GAC can improve its procedures to ensure more efficient, transparent and inclusive decision-making,” is already covered by previous recommendations (Recommendations 6.1 – 6.3). Implementation of the recommendation is of an ongoing nature and has reached a level justifying closure.

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.7 Implementation

Regularize Senior Officials meetings

31 December 2015

6.7 Regularize Senior Officials meetings



March 2015
Complete

6.7 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.7 is focused on regularizing senior officials' meetings by: asking the GAC to convene a High Level meeting on a regular basis, preferably at least once every two years; inviting countries and territories that do not currently have GAC representatives to these meetings; and taking stock after each High Level meeting.

The GAC has implemented this recommendation.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
GAC agreement to convene regular, High Level meetings	GAC	✓
Establishing practice with High Level meetings in Toronto 2012, London 2014 and (in preparation) Marrakech 2016	GAC	✓
Approving and publishing guidelines for GAC High Level Governmental Meetings	GAC	✓



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.7 Implementation

Regularize Senior Officials meetings

31 December 2015

Project Status

GAC agreement to convene regular, High Level meetings: In its London ICANN 50 Communiqué, the GAC agreed that “regular high-level meetings are beneficial, and (that it) will examine ways to maximize their benefits and continually improve the way they are arranged and scheduled.”

Establishing practice of holding HLGs regularly: The GAC established the practice of holding High Level meetings by doing so in Toronto in 2012, in London in 2014, and is now preparing another for Marrakech in March 2016.

Approving and publishing guidelines for GAC High Level Governmental Meetings:

At ICANN 52 in Singapore, the GAC approved a set of guidelines for GAC High Level Governmental Meetings. The guidelines specify that, ideally, a host GAC member would self-nominate and inform the GAC one year in advance. The guidelines articulate expectations on host GAC members before each High Level meeting, during the meeting, and after the meeting. The guidelines are published in the 6 UN languages plus Portuguese on the GAC website at <https://gacweb.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=38502480>. The GAC agreed to consider it as a living document to be updated as needed and reviewed regularly as part of a stocktaking process after each HLG.

The implementation of 6.7 by the GAC is thus complete.

Implementation Notes

Complete

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.8 Implementation

Develop government engagement guidelines

31 December 2015

6.8 Develop government engagement guidelines



April 2015
Complete

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Enhance monthly GAC/ICANN leadership conference call format	ICANN Staff	✓
Enhance monthly GSE/GE related activities report	ICANN Staff	✓
Develop and publish government engagement guidelines	ICANN Staff	✓

6.8 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.8. is focused on developing guidelines for engaging governments, both current and non-GAC members, to ensure coordination and synergy of efforts between the GAC and the ICANN GSE team.



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.8 Implementation

Develop government engagement guidelines

31 December 2015

Project Status

The GAC Joint Working Group on Government Engagement (JWG/GE) was formed at ICANN 50. ICANN Staff and JWG/WG members engaged in discussions and proposed several initiatives at ICANN 51 in Los Angeles in October 2014. Actions that were agreed on and have now been implemented are:

- An enhanced format for the GAC/ICANN leadership conference call: these monthly calls now involve more relevant GAC members (notably the GAC Vice Chairs and GAC support staff including the ACIG Secretariat).
- An enhanced monthly GSE/GE related activities report – the new format has been implemented and is distributed to the full membership each month. Monthly reports are published on the GAC website at <https://gacweb.icann.org/x/r4FLAg>
- Finally, the GAC and GSE/GE team have finalized approved Guidelines for coordination between the GAC and ICANN's Global Stakeholder Engagement/Government Engagement Teams at <https://gacweb.icann.org/x/r4FLAg> and in so doing completed the implementation of recommendation 6.8.

Implementation Notes

The guidelines have been completed, accepted and are now being implemented through staff work nationally, regionally and with IGO activities. The guidelines are a working document that can be amended as communities request additional communication or methods of working together.

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.9 Implementation

Develop goals for stakeholder engagement

31 December 2015

6.9 Develop goals for stakeholder engagement



December 2015
Complete

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
a. Develop goals for engagement with GAC and non-GAC member countries including database of relevant Ministers	Staff	✓
b. Utilize tools to better track ICANN response to GAC advice	Staff	✓
c. Make ICANN's work relevant for stakeholders in parts of the world with limited participation	Staff	✓
d. Develop and execute for each world region a plan to allow local enterprises and entrepreneurs to fully and on equal terms use of ICANN's services including new gTLDs (all regional plans by July 2016 but implementation work on going)	Staff	✓

6.9 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 6.9. is focused on developing, with community input, a baseline and set of measurable goals for stakeholder engagement. Once the baseline is established and these goals are set implementation will be ongoing. At the Buenos Aires meeting the GAC agreed that no database was necessary as it would be too expensive and labor intensive to maintain due to the normal frequent changes in the governments of the world regarding portfolio or office holder.

Other work under 6.9 fits into the overall Rec 6 ongoing system enhancements and improvements



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 6.9 Implementation

Develop baseline and set of measurable goals for stakeholder engagement

31 December 2015

Project Status

Per Recommendation 6.9, the Board should instruct the GSE group to develop, with community input, a baseline and set of measurable goals for stakeholder engagement that addresses the following:

a. Relationships with GAC and non-GAC member countries, including the development of a database of contact information

for relevant government Ministers: The relationships with GAC and non-GAC member countries have been strengthened through staff interactions in regions. The engagement work occurs within regions in capitals, with regional intergovernmental groups and in Geneva and New York through engagement with the relevant IGOs and IOs. GAC discussions in ICANN 53 have clarified that the objective with having a database of contact information for relevant government ministers has been achieved through other means and should not be pursued. 6.9 a is thus completed.

b. Tools to summarize and communicate in a more structured manner government involvement in ICANN, via the GAC, as a way to increase the transparency on how ICANN reacts to GAC Advice (e.g. by using information in the GAC Advice Register): in development : currently, regular webinars and briefings are held; as well as distribution of educational materials; hosting of DNS regional forums, one to one meetings, regional commissions and ministerial meetings, etc. This is also closely related to ongoing implementation activities for other recommendations regarding website improvements. The improvements of the current website are completed. In addition, a new website is expected to be launched by June 2016. For further detail see 6.1c.

c. Making ICANN's work relevant for stakeholders in those parts of the world with limited participation: In practice, GSE/GE implementation in the regions is according to community priorities as expressed in the community driven regional engagement planning and prioritization (regional strategies) and at GE team in Geneva in accordance with stakeholders preferences and global work. The webinars, visits, trainings and other related activities are implemented and this has translated into GAC membership rise to 155 MS and 34 IGOs as of December 2015. Completed.

d. Develop and execute for each region of the world a plan to ensure that local enterprises and entrepreneurs fully and on equal terms can make use of ICANN's services including new gTLDs: ongoing –four regions have strategies that have been developed by the multistakeholder regional communities, including participation from Governments in those regions, whether ICANN GAC members or not. One DNS entrepreneurship center has been started and is working in Egypt, serving the Middle East and Africa region. Other regions are looking at it and the prospects of replication look good in developing regions. Completed

Implementation Notes

Implementation of the tools under 6.9 is completed The engagement work is ongoing and expressed in the regional engagement strategies and the work of the regional communities. Regional DNS forums have been launched; all regions have regular webinars that include government participation or are specific to Governments; in Geneva and NY regular briefings and technical presentations educate the diplomatic staff from the missions about the relevance of the DNS to their country's economy and to gain a better understanding of how the Internet works and therefore why what ICANN does is relevant and worth their participation. Communication has been followed up with a push strategy to get additional materials to those entities that request briefings. The GAC Communique and information on membership (including how to contact the GACSEC) are distributed and GAC membership and participation in ICANN are encouraged. The regional engagement plans can be found here: <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=35521555>. GSE and GE have planned the FY16 work to identify and prioritize those activities for the coming year. Part of that planning process is the further development of the community wiki space to encompass the metrics, forums and the regional projects.

ATRT2 Recommendation 7 Implementation

Public Comment Improvements

31 December 2015

Implementation 7 Timeline



December 2015
Completed

Recommendation 7 Implementation Description

ATRT2 Recommendation 7 identified various mechanisms to improve public comment periods through process modifications and the use of new tools. The Board specifically instructed staff to create and implement a process to enable those who comment during public comment periods to request changes to staff synthesis reports in cases where commenters believe the staff incorrectly summarized their comments.

The Recommendation 7 improvements have now been fully implemented, operationalized and assessed. Staff is establishing a multi-department team to investigate further evolution of the organization's community input capabilities and processes with an eye toward interfacing with future community review efforts (e.g., ATRT3) as needed in the future.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Centralized public comment page live on icann.org	Staff	✓
Enhanced visual timeline for public comment live on icann.org	Staff	✓
Ability to "follow" public comments on icann.org	Staff	✓
Eliminate Reply Cycle/Expand Comment period	Staff	✓
Create Staff Summary Report Inquiry Process	Staff	✓
Snapshot of public comment data 6 months after implementation	Staff	✓
Publish Report for Community	Staff	✓



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 7 Implementation

Public Comment Improvements

31 December 2015

Project Status

This project had both short term and long term components. ICANN staff mapped out specific tasks, milestones, deliverables and dependencies to implement all aspects of the ATRT2 Rec 7 recommendations. The Rec 7 recommendations have been fully implemented as the following short term improvements have been realized:

- Centralized public comment page live on icann.org (see <https://www.icann.org/public-comments - open-public>)
- Elimination of Reply comments mechanism and expansion of public comment period to 40-day default time frame (see announcement <https://www.icann.org/resources/newsletter/policy-update-2014-11-21-en>)
- Enhanced visual timeline for public comment live on icann.org (see e.g., <https://www.icann.org/public-comments/rpm-review-2015-02-02-en>)
- Ability to “follow” public comments on icann.org
- Stricter staff expectations and processes to produce summary reports in a timely manner (default two weeks)
- Creation of process and mechanism for community to confer, challenge, correct, complain about staff summary reports. (see <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/report-inquiry-2014-10-21-en>)
- Improvements Information shared with Community and Staff (see <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pagelD=51417227>) and (see <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pagelD=51418375>)
- Report on ATRT Rec 7 Enhancements (see <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pagelD=56987496>)

Implementation Notes

This project is now complete, but the evolution of how the ICANN organization requests, receives, processes and evaluates public input is ongoing. The 16-page staff assessment report published regarding the Rec 7 enhancements provides a summary of the six specific operational and process improvements implemented by the staff and confirms the value of those changes. While no specific key performance indicators have been established for the public comments infrastructure, staff will continue to monitor and measure fundamental aspects of the public comments environment on an annual basis - including the number of public comment proceedings, the number of comments filed and other relevant statistics. Staff is establishing a multi-department team to investigate further evolution of the organization’s community input capabilities and processes with an eye toward interfacing with future community review efforts (e.g., ATRT3) as needed in the future.

ATRT2 Recommendation 8 Implementation

Multilingualism

31 December 2015

Implementation 8 Timeline



December 2016
Operationalized

Recommendation 8 Project Description

The recommendation states: To support public participation, the Board should review the capacity of the language services department versus the community need for the service using Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and make relevant adjustments such as improving translation quality and timeliness and interpretation quality. ICANN should implement continuous improvement of translation and interpretation services including benchmarking of procedures used by international organizations such as the United Nations.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Create a Languages Services Department	Staff	✓	✓
Conduct focus groups with community for feedback on improving the Glossary and Terminology Database	Staff/ Community	✓	✓
Create a summary report detailing what content types will be translated on icann.org	Staff	Dec 2016	June 2015
Set a process for translation/localization of icann.org	Staff	Dec 2016	June 2015
Build an internal language portal	Staff	✓	✓
Update ICANN Languages Services Policies and Procedures	Staff	March 2016	June 2015
Develop standard tracking and reporting mechanisms	Staff	✓	✓



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 8 Implementation

Multilingualism

31 December 2015

Project Status

We have been actively working to allow an inclusive public participation; erasing language barriers to expand the outreach for the community. Accomplishments to date include:

- 1.The creation of the Language Services Department including hiring one language expert for each of the languages supported by ICANN (Arabic, Russian, Chinese, French, Spanish) and a Localization Program Manager.
- 2.Glossary and Terminology data base – over 25K terms, all translated into the 6 UN Languages + PT – along with an interactive application for the community, [Quizlet](#), this project was called “ICANN In Your Language”. Other languages are being added to support the regional offices and to broaden the outreach towards non-English speakers (Korean, Japanese, Turkish). This was the subject of the first Focus Group.
- 3.The LS Department has signed MoUs, the first one with Korea Internet and Security Agency (KISA), later with Japan Network Information Center (JPNIC) and Japan Registry Services Co., Ltd. (JPRS) and very recently with Thailand's Electronic Transactions Development Agency (ETDA). Under this agreement, ICANN and the two parties mentioned above will coordinate and collaborate to identify and translate ICANN materials into Korean and Thai for the local community.
- 4.On June 2014 the second Focus Group was conducted where we discussed methods of translation for all material including the approach to localize icann.org. The focus group consisted of a diverse set of 27 participants from both ICANN staff and community, representing over 15 languages, and nearly 20 countries. Five virtual meetings were held to discuss current website translation approaches at ICANN, and to produce a set of recommendations.
- 5.ICANN Community Wiki (<https://community.icann.org/category/ls>) was launched in June 2015. This new space includes material to aid community in understanding what the Language Services Department is responsible for and working on. It also includes a full library of translated outreach material with access to download translated documents such as Beginner's Guides, Brochures, Info-Graphics, Fact-Sheets, etc.
- 6.A translation projects master is updated and shared every first Monday of the month via ICANN's Community wiki (<https://community.icann.org/display/ICANNLS/Translation+Master+File>) to provide transparency into the work and output of the translations team as well as a source to quickly view what has or is in the process of being translated.
- 7.Language Services Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) are in the process of implementation as part of ICANN's Dashboard project. This information is targeted for publication in December 2015 and will be linked to this update in the future. Nevertheless, while ICANN is working toward an improved understanding of community's usage of language services resources based on data, various dashboards are already available providing initial measures and trends. Please visit <https://www.icann.org/progress> for 1.1: Further globalize and regionalize ICANN functions. The dashboards include Number of Sessions with Live Interpretation at ICANN Meetings, Number of Timely Delivery of Translation Requests, Percent Compliance with Proactive Translation Policy and Percentage of Growth in Engagement On Social Media in Languages Other than English.

ATRT2 Recommendation 8 Implementation

Multilingualism

31 December 2015

Implementation Notes

- Crowdsourcing w/ ICANN community select content. Regional Toolkit already in plan. Support current framework for Toolkit. Other content needs a framework, processes and tools to support. This was also included on the LS Community Wiki: <https://community.icann.org/display/ICANNLSLT/LOCALIZATION+TOOLKIT>
- Benchmark Proposal - a first assessment to begin the Language Services Benchmark exercise has been completed. The actual Benchmarking exercise will be conducted and reported on by ICANN56 (June 2016).
- KPIs – as part of the organization-wide effort to measure performance, Language Services is engaged in developing means of measuring its performance over time, against defined standards or targets. This work is still evolving.

Additional Notes

June 2015 Delivery postponed to December 2016

1. Create a summary report detailing what content types will be translated on icann.org

2. Set a process for translation/localization of icann.org

This milestone changed from the original plan date of June 2015 due to the fact that the task requires for the LS Team to work together with ICANN's Communications Team and Web Development Team in order to obtain accurate results. Completion of our part has a dependency on the completion of the work mainly done by the Digital Engagement Team. Digital Engagement Team plans to have the related projects completed by December 2016.

June 2015 Delivery postponed to March 2016

3. Update ICANN Languages Services Policies and Procedures

This milestone changed from the original plan date of June 2015 to March 2016 because the scope of work handled by the ICANN by LS changed drastically since the document was created. We provide interpretation support more sessions during ICANN meetings, and at the same time we now provide this support to additional regional meetings, ICG meetings, etc. Our provision of teleconference interpretation support has increased from 6-8 calls per month to more than 20 calls per month. The volume of translation, from the time we produced the ICANN Languages Services Policies and Procedures document, increased more than 60%.

We will need to include a PCP in the process, after the update of the actual Policies and Procedures, thus the final document publication needs to be rescheduled for a later time.

The additional time needed to deliver the above is directly related to the fact that we are now working in collaboration with Communications and Web Development where the research and material to review for points 1 and 2 has changed, thus for point 3 the results of 1 and 2 are interrelated and at the same time much is still in development and needs to be accounted for to include in the updated Language Services Policy and Procedures document.

ATRT2 Recommendation 9 Implementation

Decision-Making, Transparency and Appeals Processes

31 December 2015

Implementation Timeline



July 2016
Recommendation
Operationalized

Recommendation 9 Implementation Description

Recommendation 9 includes recommendations of commitments of how ICANN will consider Advisory Committee advice, a requirement that ICANN initiates another review of its Accountability Mechanisms, that ICANN convene a review of the role of the Office of the Ombudsman, as well as commissioning a review of the Anonymous Hotline to assure that it meets with best practices. The Recommendation also specifies areas that ICANN should regularly report on regarding transparency.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
9.1 Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice	Staff	July 2016	October 2015
9.2 Review Accountability Mechanisms	Community (CCWG)	Not applicable (n/a)	March 2016
9.3 Review Ombudsman Role	Staff	June 2016	March 2016
9.4 Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting	Staff	April 2016	December 2015
9.5 Review Anonymous Hotline	Staff	February 2016	November 2015



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.1 Implementation

Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice

31 December 2015

9.1 Implementation Timeline



July 2016
Operationalized

9.1 Subproject Description

The 9.1 subproject implementation focus is on the proposed Bylaws change recommended by the ATRT2 to impose a requirement on the ICANN Board to acknowledge advice arising from any of ICANN's Advisory Committees.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Community consultation to develop Bylaws amendments, including issues of workflow and definitions	Staff	No Longer Applicable	June 2015
Bylaws amendments provided to Board to approve public comment posting	Staff	March 2016	July 2015
Open public comment on Bylaws amendments	Staff	April 2016	August 2015
Board approval of Bylaws amendments	Board	July 2016	October 2015



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.1 Implementation

Bylaws Amendment Regarding Advisory Committee Advice

31 December 2015

Project Status

While the final Bylaws language has not been formally approved yet, ICANN has made significant strides in assuring that the advice from all Advisory Committees is acknowledged and tracked. There has been significant effort into the development of an AC advice tracking tool, which will house a listing of all advice received, when it was acknowledged by the Board, and also provide tracking information so that it is easy for all in the community to access what ICANN did with that advice once it was transmitted. ICANN's commitment to developing this tool serves as a concrete commitment to not just saying that ICANN will acknowledge advice, but also putting into practice how advice will be tracked. The completion of the Bylaws amendment would just be final capstone in making this work an obligation of the organization.

The Cross Community Working Group on Enhancing ICANN Accountability has identified the language recommended for inclusion in the Bylaws through this Recommendation 9.1 as language that should be adopted as part of the Bylaws necessary to be in place for the transition of the stewardship of the IANA functions. The formal Bylaws text will be considered as part of that package, that is still under development. The timeline for those Bylaws amendments to be completed is tracking to the timeline for all Bylaws changes necessary for the transition, which are now anticipated for completion prior to July 2016. The CCWG-Accountability proposal was provided to Chartering Organizations for consideration on 23 February 2016. <https://community.icann.org/x/8w2AAw>.

The former Board Advice tool, currently on icann.org, will be phased out. We are in the process of finalizing the development of a new back-end tool for staff to process Board Advice. Once this new tool is implemented, we will remove the Board Advice page currently on icann.org. There will be a new outward facing page on icann.org that will be a searchable database of Board Advice cases, populated with data from the new tool. The new tool has been developed on the Salesforce.com platform. We are currently testing it by processing pilot cases — of actual Board Advice from ICANN's various Advisory Committees. Once we are through this testing phase, planned for completion by no later than May 2016, we will launch the system for broader use. The system will, at that time, also include legacy cases of advice received prior to development of the new system. The inclusion of the legacy advice will allow reporting out of the new system to include information on legacy advice cases in addition to new ones added going forward.

Implementation Notes

In advance of Bylaws being formally adopted, the Board has been actively committed to maintaining a comprehensive advice register (currently at <https://features.icann.org/board-advice>) that for all Advisory Committee Recommendations, and to follow a formal process to confirm that advice is considered and tracked. This tool is being refined, and is a key part of the operationalizing of this recommendation. The advice register will track how advice is acknowledged and acted upon.

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.2 Implementation

Review Accountability Mechanisms

31 December 2015

9.2 Implementation Timeline



March 2016
Operationalized

9.2 Subproject Description

The 9.2 subproject implementation focus is to review ICANN's existing accountability mechanisms through a community-comprised group.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Confirm that CCWG-Accountability is reviewing the Independent Review and Reconsideration Processes as part of their work.	Community (CCWG)	✓
Continue regular monitoring of CCWG-Accountability work to confirm that 9.2 is still addressed within their work	Staff	✓
Assess outcomes of CCWG-Accountability work to confirm if further work is needed to meet 9.2	Staff/ Community	✓



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.2 Implementation

Review Accountability Mechanisms

31 December September 2015

Project Status

The Cross Community Working Group (CCWG) Accountability work is addressing reviews of the Independent Review and Reconsideration Processes. Prior to moving forward with the composition of a separate community group, it is important to allow the CCWG work to move forward. If it is determined – through consultation with the CCWG – that the work called for in Rec. 9.2 is not being fulfilled by the CCWG, then ICANN will need to move forward with a separate implementation plan. ICANN will maintain regular dialogue with the CCWG to confirm that work is progressing toward this recommendation.

March 2016 - If work is not operationalized by this date, will revise to a new date

Implementation Notes

This work will be closely coordinated with the CCWG work. The CCWG work can be followed at <https://community.icann.org/display/acctcrosscomm/CCWG+on+Enhancing+ICANN+Accountability>

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.3 Implementation

Review Ombudsman Role

31 December 2015

9.3 Implementation Timeline



June 2016
Operationalized

Status of Deliverables

9.3 Subproject Description

The 9.3 subproject is for the implementation of a review of the Office of the Ombudsman, the role within ICANN, and whether the duties/scope of the Ombudsman should be expanded or changed in line with suggestions from the ATRT2.

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Identify expert to review current Office of Ombudsman structure and consider modification of role	Staff	On hold pending CCWG	October 2015
Expert review completed, and results socialized with the Board and Community	Staff	On hold pending CCWG	October 2015
Bylaw changes (if needed) posted for public comment	Staff (dependent on Board approval)	On hold pending CCWG	January 2015
If extensive modifications identified, allow for further community discussions at an ICANN public meeting after sufficient time to consider recommendations.	Community	On hold pending CCWG	March 2016
Board Approval of Bylaws changes	Staff	On hold pending CCWG	June 2016



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.3 Implementation

Review Ombudsman

31 December 2015

Project Status

An expert was expected to be retained and to perform a review of the Office of the Ombudsman by June 2015, with work expected to be completed by October 2015. Because of the unique nature of the Ombudsman role within ICANN, there have been challenges in identifying a proper independent expert to undertake this review.

As ICANN was conducting a search for this review, work continued in the Cross Community Working Group on Enhancing ICANN Accountability on modifying the role of the Ombudsman. In addition to the changes to the Ombudsman role that are already proposed in the CCWG-Accountability proposal sent to Chartering Organizations on 23 February 2016 (<https://community.icann.org/x/8w2AAw>), the CCWG-Accountability also noted that it will do a broader review of the Ombudsman role in its Work Stream 2 efforts that are expected to kick off in March 2016.

To avoid a duplication of effort, the review of the Ombudsman role should be aligned with the community considerations of the different types of work that the community wishes for the Ombudsman to perform. Assessing the current role of the Ombudsman as considered in the ATRT2 recommendation as a separate effort seems counter to the community work ongoing. ICANN will support the CCWG WS2 efforts to align with the spirit of this ATRT2 recommendation.

Implementation Notes

As the CCWG work evolves to consider the role of the Ombudsman, implementation of this recommendation and the running of the review will closely align with the CCWG as necessary.

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.4 Implementation

Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting

31 December 2015

9.4 Implementation Timeline



Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Publish initial transparency statistics in FY14 Annual Report	Staff	✓
Develop more fulsome set of statistics for FY15 and operationalize full set of statistics for annual reporting	Staff	April 2016

9.4 Subproject Description

The 9.4 subproject implementation focuses on developing a full set of statistical data that will be published annually with each Fiscal Year Annual Report



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.4 Implementation

Develop Transparency Metrics and Reporting

31 December 2015

Project Status

As the ATRT2 Final Report was approved at the end of FY14, the full component of statistics recommended for tracking within the recommendation was not operationalized for that year. ICANN published an initial set of transparency statistics in its 2014 Annual Report, available at <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/annual-report-2014-en.pdf>. Work is already underway to track statistics on a broader basis for future annual reports that will be more specifically focused on transparency efforts.

There are also other reports already in existence that help meet the recommendation, such as the annual report on the usage of ICANN's accountability mechanisms that is published every year on the Board Governance Committee page following ICANN's Annual General Meeting. https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/annual-reports-2012-02-25-en?routing_type=path#reconsideration-requests

Once this full set of data is identified and cross functionally reviewed it will be published. Given planned changes to the ICANN annual report, we are in the process of developing a report dedicated more fully to accountability and transparency benchmarks and tracking, and plan to have a first report available in April 2016, to be developed and established as a standard operating procedure.

Implementation Notes

The first set of reports will focus on the DIDP statistics and the use of ICANN's Anonymous Hotline, as the tracking of those items is already underway. There are also other reports already in existence that help meet the recommendation, such as the annual report on the usage of ICANN's accountability mechanisms that is published every year on the Board Governance Committee page following ICANN's Annual General Meeting. https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/annual-reports-2012-02-25-en?routing_type=path#reconsideration-requests

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.5 Implementation

Review Anonymous Hotline

31 December 2015

9.5 Implementation Timeline



February 2016
Operationalized

9.5 Subproject Description

The 9.5 subproject implementation will conduct a review of the Anonymous Hotline policy and processes, implement any proposed modifications to policy and publish a report on results to the community.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Re-plan Date	Original Due Date
Identify expert to review existing policy and processes	Staff	✓	✓
Expert report completed	Staff	✓	✓
Complete implementation of modifications to policy	Staff	February 2016	December 2015
Publish report to community	Staff	✓	✓



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 9.5 Implementation

Review Anonymous Hotline

31 December 2015

Project Status

An expert has been identified and contracted and the initial work was completed in December 2015. The report was finalized in January 2016, and ICANN is coordinating internally across appropriate departments to implement the policy changes.

Implementation Notes

ATRT2 Recommendation 10 Implementation

Cross Community Deliberations

31 December 2015

Implementation 10 Timeline



June 2016
Operationalized

Recommendation 10 Implementation Description

This project captures a number of initiatives that are addressing the components of Recommendation 10 in relation to improving the effectiveness of cross community deliberations such as the [GNSO PDP improvements](#), [GAC-GNSO Consultation Group on Early Engagement of the GAC in Policy Development Processes](#) and the [Community Regional Outreach Pilot Program \(CROPP\)](#).

In the meantime a couple of other activities have been initiated that may not have been directly in response to the ATRT2 Recommendation #10 but which are expected to contribute to achieving the goals set out by the recommendation #10 such as the stakeholder journey, which focuses on how can ICANN get more volunteers to be more meaningfully involved, the Leadership Training Program and the ICANN community mentorship pilot program. Furthermore the GNSO Review Final Report of the Independent Examiner also identifies a number of recommendations that focus on similar areas as the ATRT2 #10 recommendation.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Appointment of GNSO Liaison to the GAC	Council	✓
Identify and document additional recommendations for GAC Early Engagement in GNSO PDP	GAC/GNSO CG	ICANN55*
Implementation of CROPP	Staff	Complete**
Document milestones and goals for the GNSO PDP Improvements	GNSO/Staff	ICANN55***
Implementation of facilitated PDP F2F WG meetings pilot project	GNSO/Staff	Complete **

- * GAC & GNSO Leadership to discuss timeline shortly – due to workload issues, the Consultation Group has had to reduce its meetings but is expected to make progress on its remaining work items by ICANN55.
- ** Project planning is complete. It is now an ongoing pilot program which is expected to be reviewed in the near future.
- *** Status updates are provided to the GNSO Council at each ICANN meeting. See the latest [update](#). The GNSO Council is expected to conduct a final status review by ICANN55 and close out the project.



- Complete
- Planned/In Process
- Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
- Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 10 Implementation

Recommendation Name

31 December 2015

Project Status

Work is actively under way in relation to most of the recommendation components, although the work of the GAC-GNSO Consultation Group has faced some delay due to workload issues. Nevertheless, the GAC and GNSO agreed to continue the GNSO Liaison to the GAC Pilot Project for FY16 and the consultation group has mapped out its activities post-Dublin which include a review of the GNSO Liaison to the GAC as well as the implementation of the 'Quick Look Mechanism' to facilitate early engagement of the GAC in GNSO PDPs.

Furthermore, further progress has been made in relation to GNSO Learn which is part of the GNSO PDP Improvements (see <http://learn.icann.org/courses/gnsso>) which now has a full curriculum that has been developed in co-operation with the GNSO community. Another PDP F2F meeting was held in conjunction with ICANN54 as part of the GNSO facilitated PDP WG F2F meeting pilot program which is expected to be evaluated later this year.

CROPP FY16 provides a framework in which each of the At-Large RALOs and GNSO Non-Contract Constituencies have been allocated 5 regional (3-day) outreach trips. The specific processes and guidelines for how these resources are to be made available are set forth on a redesigned [CROPP FY16 Program Elements page](#). For FY16, eligibility for the CROPP program depends on the ability of each participating ICANN structure (i.e., RALO, GNSO Constituency) to create a brief, but clear, **Outreach Strategic Plan** explaining its FY16 outreach goals and planned expectations so that any selected CROPP activities can be coordinated with the appropriate ICANN Regional Engagement teams. GNSO Constituencies have the additional option, on a pilot basis, to select either (a) the five standard CROPP travel authorizations or (b) to host, co-host, or sponsor a targeted community Outreach/Engagement Event at one point during the fiscal year (US \$10,000 target support limit). One community has already selected and utilized the "event" option. The program will be monitored throughout FY16 to assess the effectiveness of its improved processes and to determine if future allocation of resources (in FY17) will be appropriate.

Additional initiatives have been launched recently by ICANN Staff in close co-operation with the ICANN Community such as the Stakeholder Journey and the Community Mentorship Pilot Program which, although not specifically launched in response to the ATRT2 recommendations, are expected to contribute to the objectives of recommendation #10.

Implementation Notes

The implementation of this recommendation requires substantial involvement from stakeholders, and volunteer fatigue and prioritization efforts must be considered. Furthermore, several of these initiatives are implemented as pilots. The pilot results will be evaluated relative to project goals and adjustments or alternatives will be considered, as needed. Finally, the importance of diverse and global participation in the policy development process is also reflected in more detail in the [Final Report](#) of the independent examiner of the GNSO Review, including many of the 36 recommendations. The importance of implementing ways to track and measure various improvements has been highlighted by the independent examiner and once implemented, this will assist with ongoing monitoring of effectiveness of implemented improvements. GNSO Community is evaluating the feasibility of these recommendations and proposing prioritization. The Board is expected to take action on these recommendations in the early part of 2016.

ATRT2 Recommendation 11 Implementation

AoC Review Process Effectiveness

31 December 2015

Implementation 11 Timeline



November 2015
Complete

Recommendation 11 Implementation Description

Recommendation 11 addresses ways in which the AoC Review process can be improved to make subsequent reviews more effective.

Using lessons learned, recommendations and observations from the Review Teams, the Board, stakeholders and staff, ICANN has proposed and began implementing improvements to make the AoC Review process more predictable, consistent and efficient.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
11.1 AoC reviews fed into strategic activities	Staff	✓
11.2. Timely review process completion	Board	✓
11.3 AoC review team appointment and work	Board	✓
11.4 Implementation Report	Staff	✓
11.5 Resources and Budget	Staff	✓
11.6 AoC Recommendation Communication	Staff	✓
11.7 Timeframe of Implementation	Staff	✓



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.1 Implementation

AoC Reviews fed into Strategic Activities

31 December 2015

11.1 Implementation Timeline



September 2015
Complete

11.1 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 11.1 purpose is to ensure that the ongoing work of the AoC reviews is fed into the work of other ICANN strategic activities.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Promote ethics, transparency and accountability	Staff	✓
Ensure AoC reviews are a staff priority	Staff	✓
Improve AoC pages on icann.org	Staff	✓



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.1 Implementation

AoC Review Process Effectiveness

31 December 2015

Project Status

Under the Strategic Plan for fiscal years 2016-2020, this subproject has been included as goal 5.2 "Promote ethics, transparency and accountability across the ICANN community", with Key Success Factors defined as "Demonstrated accountability and legitimacy of ICANN through the evolution of the Affirmation of Commitments and implementation of review mechanisms."

The Strategic Plan is posted at: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/strategic-plan-2016-2020-10oct14-en.pdf>

AoC Reviews and resulting recommendations are a priority for staff, Board and CEO as evidenced by the Strategic Objective and the Dashboard. The Board Governance Committee and the Organizational Effectiveness Committee have the oversight responsibility for AoC and Organizational Reviews to ensure that Reviews continue to be an effective accountability mechanism and to ensure that implementation of Improvement progresses as planned. Important lessons learned from recent Reviews have been summarized and shared with the Community, with concrete actions underway to make improvements in future Reviews (more information [here](#)).

AoC Review web pages on icann.org have been improved for transparency and clarity – the new pages went live in August 2015 and feedback is being gathered in preparation for further enhancements, to be done as part of standard operating procedures. This is the responsibility of the Strategic Initiatives team. Link to revised web pages: <https://www.icann.org/resources/accountability>

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.2 Implementation

Timely Review Process Completion

31 December 2015

11.2 Implementation Timeline



July 2015
Complete

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Socialize review schedule at ICANN52 and 53	Staff	✓
Review schedule approved by Board	Board	✓

11.2 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 11.2. is focused on the coordination of the various review processes to ensure all reviews are completed before the next ATRT review begins, and with the proper linkage of issues as framed by the AoC.



Complete
Planned/In Process
Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan
Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.2 Implementation

Timely Review Process Completion

31 December 2015

Project Status

Proposed AoC review schedule and activities were socialized at ICANN52. The materials presented can be found at: <http://singapore52.icann.org/en/schedule/mon-aoc-org-reviews/presentation-aoc-org-reviews-09feb15-en.pdf>

In order to finalize the AoC review schedule and activities, the Board asked staff to post the proposed schedule and process/operational improvements for public comment. [Public Comment](#) was opened on 15 May, due to close on 2 July and extended to 8 July to provide community with additional time to comment. The Board considered feedback received from community at its July meeting (24 July 2015) and endorsed modified Review schedule. See Board Resolution - [2015.07.28.14](#)

Additionally, the Proposed Review Schedule and Process/Operational Improvements for AoC and Organizational Reviews were socialized at ICANN53. The materials presented can be found at: <https://buenosaires53.icann.org/en/schedule/wed-aoc-org-reviews>.

At the direction of the Board, ICANN has engaged in a dialogue with the NTIA, a signatory to the AoC, regarding the changes to the AoC Review schedule endorsed by the Board, and brought these discussions to conclusion in January 2016. Note that the start of the third Accountability and Transparency Review has been changed to January 2017, 6 months earlier than the date in the Board resolution.

Implementation Notes

The CCWG Accountability process is considering recommendations to include the AoC Reviews into the ICANN Bylaws, which may adjust the timing of Reviews, if needed. Discussions are currently underway to include in the CCWG-Accountability Draft Proposal ICANN's commitment to publish operational standards that lead to workable reviews.

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.3 Implementation

AoC Appointment and Review Team Work

31 December 2015

11.3 Implementation Timeline



Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Develop a predictable review schedule	Staff	✓
Socialize review schedule at ICANN 52 and 53	Staff	✓
Final review schedule approved by Board	Board	✓

11.3 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 11.3 ensure that AoC Review Teams are appointed in a timely fashion and have sufficient time to complete their work.



Complete

Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.3 Implementation

AoC Appointment and Review Team Work

31 December 2015

Project Status

The AoC Review web pages went live in August 2015: <https://www.icann.org/resources/accountability>

Proposed AoC review schedule and activities were socialized at ICANN52. The materials presented can be found at: <http://singapore52.icann.org/en/schedule/mon-aoc-org-reviews/presentation-aoc-org-reviews-09feb15-en.pdf>

In order to finalize the AoC review schedule and activities, the Board asked staff to post the proposed schedule and process/operational improvements for public comment. [Public Comment](#) was opened on 15 May, due to close on 2 July and extended to 8 July to provide community with additional time to comment. The Board considered feedback received from community at its July meeting (24 July 2015) and endorsed modified Review schedule. See Board Resolution - [2015.07.28.14](#)

Additionally, the Proposed Review Schedule and Process/Operational Improvements for AoC and Organizational Reviews were socialized at ICANN53. The materials presented can be found at: <https://buenosaires53.icann.org/en/schedule/wed-aoc-org-reviews>

At the direction of the Board, ICANN has engaged in a dialogue with the NTIA, a signatory to the AoC, regarding the changes to the AoC Review schedule endorsed by the Board, and brought these discussions to conclusion in January 2016. Note that the start of the third Accountability and Transparency Review has been changed to January 2017, 6 months earlier than the date in the Board resolution.

Implementation Notes

The CCWG Accountability process is considering recommendations to include the AoC Reviews into the ICANN Bylaws, which may adjust the timing of Reviews, if needed. Discussions are currently underway to include ICANN's commitment to publish operational standards that lead to workable reviews in the CCWG-Accountability Draft Proposal.

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.4 Implementation

AoC Appointment and Review Team Work

31 December 2015

11.4 Implementation Timeline



March 2015
Complete

11.4 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 11.4 ensures an implementation report is prepared, including benchmarks and metrics, to be ready by review kick-off.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Document project management approach	Staff	✓
Develop progress reporting template	Staff	✓
Modify progress templates for Board Oversight	Board	✓



Complete



Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.4 Implementation

AoC Appointment and Review Team Work

31 December 2015

Project Status

The project management approach to implementation is documented on [icann.org](https://www.icann.org)

<https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2-2015-01-30-en>

Progress reporting templates have been developed and progress has been published regularly

<https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2-2015-01-30-en>

Progress reporting templates have been modified to reflect Board oversight and were [published](#) in May 2015. Subsequently, quarterly updates have and will continue to be published. Links to the latest updates and archives are available in the Reviews section of the [icann.org](https://www.icann.org/resources/reviews/aoc): <https://www.icann.org/resources/reviews/aoc>.

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.5 Implementation

Resources and Budget

31 December 2015

11.5 Implementation Timeline



November 2015
Complete

11.5 Sub-Project Description

Sub-project 11.5 ensures the allocation of sufficient resources for Review Teams to fulfill their mandates and make the budget and rationale available at the start of the review. This should include, but is not limited to, accommodation of Review Team requests to appoint independent experts/consultants, if deemed necessary by the teams.

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
AoC budget process	Staff	✓
Develop budgets for the next round of AoC reviews	Staff	✓
Prepare to publish budgets and rationale	Staff	✓



Complete



Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.5 Implementation

Resources and Budget

31 December 2015

Project Status

A standard process for budgeting for AoC reviews has been established via a budget worksheet.

Developing budgets for the next round of AoC Reviews has been completed as part of the FY16 Operating Plan and Budget which was approved by the Board in June 2015 and is currently underway for FY 17.

Budgets and rationale will be published at the start of each AoC Review, starting with the next AoC Review to take place, CCT, which began in January 2016. This step has been incorporated into the standard operating procedures and is the responsibility of the Strategic Initiatives department.

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.6 Implementation

AoC Recommendation Communication

31 December 2015

11.6 Implementation Timeline



October 2015
Complete

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Document accepted recommendations	Board	✓
Document process by which Board will address the review team recommendations	Staff	✓

11.6 Sub-Project Description

Subproject 11.6. Ensures that all AoC Review Team recommendations are addressed in a clear and unambiguous manner, indicating to what extent they are accepting each recommendation.



Complete



Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.6 Implementation

AoC Recommendation Communication

31 December 2015

Project Status

Acceptance of ATRT2 recommendations is documented at

<https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2014-06-26-en#2.d>

Documenting the process by which the Board will address AoC Review Team recommendations in a clear and unambiguous manner will be impacted by some of the process improvements being implemented as the result of Board Resolution - [2015.07.28.14](#). This will be updated and posted publically.

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.7 Implementation

Timeframe of Implementation

31 December 2015

11.7 Implementation Timeline



April 2015
Complete

Status of Deliverables

	Responsible	Due Date
Implementation timeframe	Staff	✓

11.7 Sub-Project Description

Subproject 11.7. Ensures an expected time frame for implementation is provided



Complete



Planned/In Process

Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan

Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted

ATRT2 Recommendation 11.7 Implementation

Timeframe of Implementation

31 December 2015

Project Status

An implementation timeline has been provided and status against this timeline has been reported on beginning with ICANN52

<https://community.icann.org/display/prgrmatrt2impl/Implementation+Program>

Implementation Notes

None

ATRT2 Recommendation 12 Implementation

Financial Accountability and Transparency

31 December 2015

Implementation 12 Timeline



June 2017
Operationalized

Subproject Description

Recommendation 12 identifies the need to establish a firmer basis for discussing with the community how to continue developing ICANN and prioritize its work to the benefit of participants within the multistakeholder model. Such a discussion will entail three key elements: 1) revenues; 2) expenses; and 3) the prioritization of ICANN's work.

The recommendation states:

- 12.1 & 12.5 Board to improve participation of SO/AC in planning process, including sufficient time for interaction.
- 12.2 Board to take into account the correlation of revenues and expenses in the long term when planning.
- 12.3 Board to benchmark operations every 3 years, and publish resulting analysis.
- 12.4 Annual budgets to be based on multi-annual strategic plan. SO/AC budgets to be specified.

Status of Deliverables

	Respon- ible	Re-plan Date	Due Date
12.1 & 12.5 - The FY16-20 Strategic Plan, Five-Year (FY16-20) Operating Plan and FY16 Operating Plan and Budget were posted for public comment. The commencement date for FY16 Operating Plan and Budget was moved up to allow for sufficient time for interaction between the community and staff. This interaction resulted in improved clarity on the public comments submitted by the community, which ultimately informed ICANN staff's amendments to the final document adopted by the Board.	Staff	✓	✓
12.2 - The correlation of revenues and expenses in the long term was enabled through the development of a 5-year financial model included in the ICANN strategic plan.	Staff	✓	✓
12.4 – The FY16 Annual Operating Plan and Budget was derived from the Five-Year Operating Plan following community input.	Staff	✓	✓
12.4 – The FY16 budget by SO/AC group will be finalized in the course of FY16. A draft of the process to specify the FY17 budget by SO/ AC group will be presented at ICANN 57 for community consultation and input. The FY17 budget by SO/AC group will be finalized in the course of FY17.	Staff	FY16/ FY17	May 2015
12.3 - Implementation relative to benchmarking requires continued evaluation as to whether the current Executive Dashboard process can be a reasonable vehicle for implementing the spirit of the recommendation.	Staff	FY17/ FY18	Target ICANN 53



Complete



Planned/In Process



Behind schedule, expected to recover within original plan



Behind schedule, original plan to be adjusted



ATRT2 Recommendation 12 Implementation

Financial Accountability and Transparency

31 December 2015

Project Status

12.1 & 12.5 - The Strategic Plan, Five-Year Operating Plan and FY16 Operating Plan and Budget processes allowed for input from the ICANN community during their development stages via working groups and public comment periods. The commencement date for FY16 Operating Plan and Budget was moved up to allow for sufficient time for interaction between the community and staff. This interaction resulted in improved clarity on the public comments submitted by the community, which ultimately informed ICANN staff's amendments to the final document that was adopted by the Board on 26 June 2015.

Public Comments and Community Calls

ICANN received a wide range of comments on the Draft FY16 Operating Plan and Budget from nine organizations. ICANN staff and Board Finance Committee (BFC) members participated in calls with the organizations that submitted comments. The purpose of the calls was to ensure understanding of the comments so that the most clear and relevant responses possible would be provided. The comments and feedback from the community calls were reviewed by ICANN staff and BFC members and used to amend and improve the final document.

Community Calls: <https://community.icann.org/display/projfinadhocws/Public+comments+submitted+on+the+Draft+FY16+Operating+Plan+and+Budget>
5-year Strategic Plan Public Comment Response Report: www.icann.org/resources/pages/strategic-engagement-2013-10-10-en
5-year Operating Plan Public Comment Response Report : www.icann.org/public-comments/proposed-opplan-budget-2016-2020-2014-11-11-en
FY16 Operating Plan & Budget Public Comment Response Report : www.icann.org/public-comments/op-budget-fy16-2015-03-18-en

Working Groups

On 25-November-2014 UTC 1500 - 1600A, ICANN hosted a call during which staff and community members discussed the ICANN Draft Five-Year Operating Plan and FY16 Operating plan and Budget Calendar. On 09-February-2015 at ICANN 52 in Singapore, ICANN staff hosted a small working group to review and define budget assumptions relative to revenue, priorities, initiatives, expenses envelopes for FY16 Operating Plan and Budget.

<https://community.icann.org/display/projfinadhocws/FY16+Budget+Planning+Process>

The successes achieved for FY16 have been leveraged and implemented into the FY17 process. This includes a number of working groups and community calls to that were held to enable interaction between the community and staff on the draft Five-Year Operating Plan update and draft FY17 Operating Plan and Budget. Both documents will be posted for public comment on 05 March 2016. ICANN staff will continue its interaction with the community via a face-to-face working group in Marrakech, a high interest topic session in Marrakech and calls with community members that submit comments on the documents.

ATRT2 Recommendation 12 Implementation

Financial Accountability and Transparency

31 December 2015

Project Status cont.

12.2 The correlation of revenues and expenses in the long term is enabled through the development of a 5-year financial model included in the ICANN Strategic Plan (FY16-20).

www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/strategic-plan-2016-2020-10oct14-en.pdf

12.3 One of the cornerstones to ICANN's financial transparency and accountability is the process of providing operational and financial performance results on ICANN's deliverables on a regular and timely basis. This has been enabled through ICANN's Quarterly Stakeholder Calls, Quarterly Financial Reporting, Audited Financial Statements and the KPI Dashboard (please see links below). Implementation relative to benchmarking requires continued evaluation as to whether the current KPI Dashboard process can be a reasonable vehicle for implementing the spirit of the recommendation. ICANN has done a multiyear roadmap for the Dashboard project and it is ICANN's intent to share/publish the KPI Dashboard (containing Goal level KPIs) with the Stakeholders a monthly basis. ICANN is continuing to evolve its Strategic Goal level KPIs with defined targets, trends and where applicable benchmarks. One example of this is our 3.1 Operations KPI on % of staff voluntary attrition trailing-twelve-month trend - which has the Radford Survey Benchmark.

<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/quarterly-reports-2014-11-13-en>

<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/governance/financials-en>

<https://www.icann.org/news/blog/icann-beta-kpi-dashboard>

12.4 The Adopted Five-Year (FY16-20) Operating Plan includes: a five-year planning calendar; strategic goals with corresponding key performance indicators, dependencies, five-year phasing, and list of portfolios; and a five-year financial model. The Adopted FY16 Annual Operating Plan and Budget was derived from the Adopted Five-Year Operating Plan following community input and includes data on all projects to be carried out by the organization during FY16, and displays all costs categories for each project. Each project is also mapped to one of the 5 objectives of the strategic plan, through the hierarchy of portfolios and goals, making the rationale for each project and activity clear and transparent. A process to specify the FY16 budget by SO/ AC group is currently being defined. ICANN staff intends to review the process with the community groups for input and recommendations and finalize the FY16 budget by SO/ AC group in the course of FY16. The due date for the budget by SO/ AC group for Recommendation 12.4 was changed from May 2015 to FY16 to allow more time for community consultation on the model and assumptions.

www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-opplan-2016-2020-26apr15-en.pdf

www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-opplan-budget-fy16-25jun15-en.pdf

ATRT2 Recommendation 12 Implementation

Financial Accountability and Transparency

31 December 2015

Implementation Notes

The Adopted FY16 Operating Plan and Budget is the collective achievement of the ICANN community and the multistakeholder model, that transformed the goodwill of collaboration into the reality of successful output. FY16's process is a solid platform to build on for future even stronger achievements. ICANN staff is reviewing the lessons learned from the FY16 process to ensure the improvements implemented are sustained as well as future improvements are considered.

ICANN has finalized the FY17 Operating Plan and Budget process and timeline. ICANN staff met with the community on 22 Sep 2015 and 18 Oct 2015 (recordings can be found at the link below) to:

- review the planning process and calendar
- consult the community on revenue and expense assumptions for FY17 and
- work with the community to establish the structure of the ICANN/PTI Operating Plan and Budget

ICANN staff will continue to have multiple interactions with the community on the FY17 Operating Plan and Budget process throughout FY16 per the process and timeline.

<https://community.icann.org/display/projfinadhocws/FY17+Operating+Plan+and+Budget+Process>