
TERRI AGNEW: Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. This is the AFRALO ROP Working Group call on Friday the 15th of August, 2014 at 14:00 UTC. On the call today we have Mwendwa Kivuva, Philip Johnson, Pastor Peters, and Didier Kasole.

On the French channel, we have Tijani Ben Jemaa, Aziz Hilali, Fatimata Seye Sylla, Didier Kasole, and Michel Tchonang

We have apologies from Hadja Ouattara.

From staff, we have Silvia Vivanco, Gisella Gruber, Kathy Schnitt; and myself, Terri Agnew.

Our French interpreters today will be Claire and Camilla.

I would also like to remind all participants to please state your name before speaking for transcription purposes. Thank you very much, and back over to you, Aziz.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Terri. I just have a short comment. Didier Kasole was stated as being on the English channel, even though he is on the French channel.

TERRI AGNEW: I will fix.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, thank you. So if we're ready to start, we have a lot of work to do regarding AFRALO's Rules of Procedure. On the agenda, as it was sent, I should remind you the purpose of these meetings of the working group on the Rules of Procedure for AFRALO. We shall have 35 minutes. Why is it 35 minutes for this part? It's because this meeting that brings us together today should help us decide together what the general framework and the structure of this working group will be, so that we can reach the results we expect. I don't know how we're going to go about it, but that is what we have to decide today.

If you want to take the floor at any time, please raise your hand on Adobe Connect to let me know that you wish to intervene. Did you wish to take the floor? Is that you? Who is speaking?

DIDIER KASOLE: No, no, I'm sorry.

AZIZ HILALI: So in the agenda you have before you, we first have the adoption of the agenda, then the selection of the working group chair. Then we're going to go through the reference documents that will be necessary in order to perform this task correctly. And then we're going to try and put together a calendar for the next call, and before that of course we're going to deal with the working groups, too. Is there anything to be added at this point?

There seems to be consent, so we're going to straight through to the selection of the working group chair. As you already know, the group

started and I think – or I should expect – that everyone at this meeting has already attended our General Assembly meeting in London. This matter was among the subjects we had to discuss at the General Assembly meeting. Someone had to make a presentation on this subject, but unfortunately we did not have the time to see to it at the meeting. That is why we have convened this teleconference today, but [inaudible] created this working group.

So I'm ready to hear from you if you have any [inaudible] as to who should be the chair of this working group. You have the floor. Please feel free to take it. Doesn't anyone wish to take the floor? I'll go on in that case. Oh, there is Tijani who wishes to speak. Go ahead, Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Aziz. As you say, we shall need a chair and a vice chair. It is someone who should be the one drafting the document. It will be the pen holder for this new Rules of Procedure. I could propose myself as a volunteer in order to carry out that task. I would mainly need at this point someone who commits to every single meeting. This person would be the one drafting, or rather putting together, every proposition that we shall receive.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Tijani. So we have [inaudible] yourself to be the chair of this group. May I remind everyone that Tijani has in the past already been a member of ALAC Rules of Procedure Working Group. There's [time] and there is metrics that he has already worked with. I see Fatimata raising her hand. Go ahead, Fatimata.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Hello, everyone. I'd just like to propose as Tijani just suggested that he chairs the working group. We've always got a hard time having a chair who's not an English-speaking native, so should there be someone who's native in English in order to co-chair the group with him? Pastor Peters I think should be our pen holder. [inaudible] agree with me. Can you hear me?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, we heard you.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you. That's all I had to say then.

PASTOR PETERS: [inaudible] speak.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Let them know.

PASTOR PETERS: No, I'm just asking. I mean, I'm not asking the floor. I thought I heard my name mentioned.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yes. Fatimata just proposed you to be the pen holder [inaudible] Tijani.

PASTOR PETERS: If she propose, I better do it.

UNIDENTIFIED: He is wondering whether you're willing to be the pen holder. That's what Fatimata asked.

PASTOR PETERS: That is as the secretary to the committee or as what? I don't mind any role that the members want to play. I am prepared to play any role given to me to do.

MICHEL TCHONANG: Aziz, can I take the floor?

UNIDENTIFIED: It's the network that's making it harder.

UNIDENTIFIED: I've already met a number of the people participating here in this discussion and pretty clearly the people who have been proposed.

INTERPRETER: Tijani speaking, but we cannot hear him. He's repeating, he says. What was said at the beginning was clear and what was said at the end was

clear as well, but then the middle of his intervention was inaudible. I was asking Michel to please repeat what he said.

It is very hard to whether [inaudible] not being any members of staff on the French channel. Aziz has apparently dropped and I think so has Michel.

SILVIA VIVANCO: We will check who has dropped off the call. Give just one minute.

TERRI AGNEW: Michel has dropped, but we're reaching out to him. And Michel is back on.

INTERPRETER: Michel is back on and Tijani is asking him to be brief.

MICHEL TCHONANG: I was saying that the [inaudible] is too choppy and it was dropped, but I'm back now. So I was saying that Aziz should have proposed me as chair to the working group.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you, Tijani. I would just like us to be more clear about the different roles in this working group. It was not clear to me. There is to be a chair, and then a vice chair who will be the pen holder? I don't think that's equal work. I think the pen holder will be taking notes of the

meeting, and then there's going to be a drafter who will be drafting the actual document.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Fatimata. We haven't exactly agreed on a structure for the group yet. If you wish, we could have a pen holder. It wouldn't be a problem, but he should be accountable for attending every meeting. He should be responsible to that and be committed. We cannot afford to not record the conversations and the discussions we've had. If I am to be chair, I should work together with co-chair. I think it's taking too long.

MICHEL TCHONANG: I would like to agree with Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you.

INTERPRETER: I think we heard half of that. Have we reached Aziz yet?

TERRI AGNEW: Aziz just joined back on the Adobe side.

AZIZ HILALI: I was disconnected because my computer went off. It had restarted. So we were saying Tijani has volunteered for chair and then...?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Please ask Adigo to call you so that you have both Adigo and Adobe Connect because the meeting is interrupted when you disconnect.

On the other hand, I have a comment on what happened. Pastor Peters agreed to being pen holder and Michel proposed himself as a drafter. So Fatimata, who will be the person writing the draft, whether it is the pen holder or the drafter? And I said we have not agreed on a structure for the group yet, but personally I would agree with the structure such as the one she mentioned, but the pen holder as well as the chair of course should have to attend every single meeting. This is a requirement that can only be [inaudible]. That's all I was saying.

AZIZ HILALI:

So we're ready to move on to the next item, because I see that Silvia has already taken down the notes as to what was discussed. So we have now the reference document. May I remind you that the working group should have to decide what the new Rules of Procedure for AFRALO are to be. So we should go over this matter with a [view] to reviewing the number of ALSes per country, and then what's important in order to work seriously because this will have a great impact on AFRALO are the parameters that we have.

We have all ALSes. Some are very active and some are not. Those are the metrics we should deal with, to see what the level of their activity is. And then I would like everyone present here to consider what was done or what is still done elsewhere in the other RALOs. That is why with Silvia, with her help, we could get our hands on those documents. I'm

going to show them to you on the screen. And that's [for the] LAC TLD, NARALO, LACRALO, APRALO, and ALAC. So any comments on this reference document? Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Aziz. This reference document allows us to see what the trend is at ALAC and at the other RALOs. I think these Rules of Procedure [inaudible] the proper working of AFRALO should follow the other RALO rules and ALAC rules as well. It is not compelling that we should have it. It's not compulsory that we should have the same rules as them. But we should follow the same way they have taken.

I don't think it is desirable that we should have very different rules from ALAC, but I think we should compare to what they have. During the London meeting, we worked on rules which were only actually a suggestion because they're not restraining as to what could be done. They are merely examples of what could be discussed I think are the basis of those discussions and contributions. We may touch up on different subjects. So we should compare to [inaudible] other regions or within ALAC.

It is very important to us to have rules that are updated, that follow this working stage we're at presently. So the more we work towards the future, the better. We should not think of matters that are in the past and that stop us from going into the future. We should have rules that are more effective. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani. Would anyone like to add a contribution or comment in the views expressed by Tijani or else on the reference document? Fatimata, you have the floor.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you, Aziz. I wanted to endorse what Tijani just said. I know he's the one working here. He's the one who chairs this group. As for the different discussions had online and on the [basis] of a different link that we have received, we could say we're different, but I don't think our rules should be opposite to everyone else's.

They could differ in any event. We could say AFRALO members have worked online and have come up with the following rules.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Fatimata. So if I'm not mistaken, what you say is that [as per] Tijani's intervention the working group's members – okay, Didier, you can take the floor. Fine.

[AZIZ HILALI]: My advice is that you should read all these documents, all these rules and operating principles from the other RALOs before making suggestions.

DIDIER KASOLE: Tijani said something, Aziz, [inaudible]. The other RALOs do not wish us to make copies of their principles. It's not what we have to do. That is my first comment.

But then what I wanted to add is [inaudible] the evaluation of different ALSes and their metrics. What is the strategy that was adopted at the other RALOs? What is the strategy we should adopt in order to assess our ALSes?

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Didier. Let me ask, instead of Tijani. I think we should consider what we used to have in the past, and I think participation has already increased. The strategy as to how to engage, to get more ALSes involved. We said in London we should discuss where we don't have ALSes yet and we accredited different ALSes in three different locations. Three ALSes which are about to be certified, so that leads us to about 40 ALSes which is a huge number for our RALOs.

So the question is how can we keep them participating? How can we [foster] the ALSes to be active? I don't think that is what we should discuss today. I see Tijani is asking for the floor. Go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Aziz. Didier, to me it's not very clear what you just said. When you speak of ALSes and of metrics, it is not a matter of increasing participation. I've worked a lot on metrics for ALAC. We're still working on metrics at ALAC. Our work is not done.

And there is the monitoring going on at present in order to see who participates at teleconferences. Who is excused or sends apologies when they cannot participate? [inaudible] they don't understand the text because it's a language or whatever it is. They are always welcome to say, "I'm sorry, I was working," or "I am working at that time. I would not be able to attend the conference." Still, they send an apology and that is an act of engagement. If there's a vote, even if they don't have a right to vote, they participate in discussions and they contribute their views.

That is what is important. That's what we're monitoring and that's what will give us an idea of the participation of AFRALO's members. It's not about judging our members. It's about seeing people who are members of AFRALO but who do not have the time or who do not wish to participate. And that's all very well, but they should say, "I'm sorry, I cannot attend this teleconference." Those who do not wish to attend the teleconference will not reply at all. That's what we're monitoring.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani, for all those explanations.

DIDIER KASOLE: Sorry. Can I take the floor please?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes, go ahead.

DIDIER KASOLE: I am very happy about what we've done and what we've achieved, but we could do better and there's ALSes with a single member and there's associations that's two or three. We cannot work with a committee that's an executive committee that's made up of this size of ALSes.

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. Tijani, do you wish to reply?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: It is not an answer, Aziz. It's just to say that it is exactly what we want to have with this work. It is what we said about the metrics, etc. So it is true that some ALSes have been certified and then they disappeared and some other ALSes are not working with [us]. We do not know who is working in those ALSes, so it is not a good sign for those ALSes and it is an element that we need to take into account, that we need to control to know who are the people participating in each ALS. There are some people we know, but we need to make a control of that.

The participation and engagement is not only a question of sharing the ALS or having some responsibility. We need some contribution. We need some participation into the discussions. This is the meaning of an ALS with people working in the ALS and we need to know who is the executive committee of this ALS of each ALS and what are the changes made in those ALSes, etc.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani. I think we are going to close that item. And for your information, I want to tell you that each ALS asking for accreditation are

presenting a report on their ALS so we know who they are. We have tried before the London meeting and before the Durban meeting, too. We have tried to ask all the representatives of the ALS to update their data, their information, we had on their ALS and also the activities they organized, but it's difficult to obtain that.

So I think we need to work on the ALS of which we have more information. We have to control them. They are not a lot [inaudible]. If there are no other interventions...

Okay. They are telling me on Adobe Connect that we have talked about the voting questions for ALS. For example, for the countries with six ALSes and for the country who have no ALSes, we have suggested that each country had only one vote. So I think it is an important point, an important issue, and we have to work on that. The working group has to work on that issue. If there are no other interventions, if nobody wants to take the floor, we are going to move to the next item. I think it's the last one.

Okay. I'm happy to see the important number of people volunteering for this working group. I know that there were 14 persons. Today we're nine. 14 persons were interested to work in that working group. Today we are nine. So Tijani was right. At least people who know that they are not going to assist to the teleconference, please send a mail to the staff. Send a mail to the AFRALO chair or vice chair to tell them that you are not going to assist to that teleconference, excusing yourself, etc.

So it is important the members of this working group – Beran, Hadja, Tijani, Pastor Peters, Philip, Mwendwa, [inaudible], Michel and myself. It

is the working group that is half made with French-speaking people and half made with English-speaking people, so I think it's okay. We have a good working group and I ask the staff to please organize the teleconference with the interpretation, with the translators. It is very important. You have understood that there will be – you thought that there was going to be translation only for that meeting [inaudible] for a two-day meeting, but I'm asking the staff to consider the possibility to have interpretation for each meeting of this working group.

Then we are going to create a mailing list to tell everybody what is the work that we have done. And then Silvia was proposing to organize a page for the working group, for the group, for the work of this working group. [inaudible] following on translation. And if you have any propositions or suggestions to make, go ahead. You can always contact Tijani. Tijani is asking for the floor. Go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

First I'd like to insist on the fact that each teleconference of this working group need some interpretation from French into English and vice-versa. It is a need. It is not a choice. It is not an option. If we don't have that service, we can't work. It is very important for us to have interpretation services. I can tell you that we had the promise – the clear promise – from Christina Rodriguez, the chair of languages in ICANN, that for each working group if there are more than three persons asking for another language than English, we are going to have interpretation. So we have six persons who don't understand French and we have eight person who don't speak and understand English, so we need interpretation. It is a very important item or issue here.

Then about the Wiki page, I propose to make a [child] page of the page that we have that contained the organization document of AFRALO, so as to have a direct link in the page. It is a [child] page of a page that already exists.

Okay, I'm finished.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Tijani. Interpreters have problem with my line.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Silvia also told me that we are going to have interpretation, no problem. Staff are asking to know when the teleconference is going to take place to organize interpretation services. Then Silvia also wrote me that we are going to make a child page and we are going to create a mailing list, too. Are there any other proposals about the working tools with which we are going to work? If there are no other proposals, we are going to move to the next item of the agenda. That is to say the next call, to organize the call.

PASTOR PETERS:

Hello.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Just wait a minute. I'm going to tell Aziz [inaudible] take the floor. Just a minute.

INTERPRETER: Okay. Pastor Peters, they are going to give you the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Aziz, please ask for a telephone connection with Adobe. For the next meeting in the calendar, I propose to have a meeting every two weeks, every 15 days, every two weeks. Okay, every two weeks. And I propose to work on Friday at this time of the day. Is there other proposals? They are welcome, of course. This will allow us to have regular meetings. If there are some oppositions to my proposal, if you can't be available in this hour of the day because of your work, please tell us now. We can find another time in the day, but important here is that everybody will participate to this meeting.

Okay, Aziz, you have the floor.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani. [inaudible] to give the floor to Pastor Peters.

INTERPRETER: Just a minute, Pastor Peters. Aziz is speaking. Just a minute. They are going to give you the floor, but not now. Just a minute. Sorry.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. Pastor Peters, you have the floor.

PASTOR PETERS:

Thank you very much. Three quick ones. First, I thank Fatimata for the nomination. Secondly, I want to say [inaudible] for us totally works. I find it very easy and clearer to work with Adobe Connect than the telephone [conversation], but unfortunately on Adobe Connect we only have the French channel, so my request to ICANN secretariat is [inaudible] can have an English channel also for Adobe. That is number one.

My second [inaudible] has to do with the proposal by the chair, Mr. Tijani, on the date of meeting. I am not opposed to the frequently. It could be weekly or two-weekly. I don't have any problem with frequency of meeting. But my only concern is I will try as much as possible to attend all meetings. I work as a nurse and nurses run shift duties. So there are days I could be on afternoon [inaudible]. Like today I am not working, so [inaudible] by this time. But nonetheless, if [inaudible] consensus is for us to meet at this time every Friday, I will work towards making myself available but sometimes I am unable to [inaudible] because I do not have full control [inaudible] working. But I will do my best. That is number two.

Number three, this working group, we do not have a time limit as to how long is this working group going to last. That is, are we going to work months, weeks?

Then in line with this is I [inaudible] believe that whatever we come up with as a working document will be made available to all the [inaudible] AFRALO ALSes for their input and then for their own contributions. So I think in that way, we will be seen as [inaudible]. I think those are the three quick interventions I want to make. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Pastor Peters. Can you hear me?

PASTOR PETERS: Yes.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. I'm on the phone. Is it better?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Well, not really good, Aziz. On Adobe Connect the quality of the sound is good, but choppy. Now the quality is not so good.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Pastor Peters, for your contribution. Now about the Adobe Connect, I don't understand very well why there is not an English channel on the Adobe Connect. I don't understand that issue.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Hello, Aziz. [inaudible] regarding the sound in Adobe Connect. Technically, the sound has to be in one language. So we have to choose either it comes out in French or it comes out in English. That's how the Adobe Connect system is set up technically. That's the limitation we have. That's why we have these two matters. One, we have the Adobe Connect and we have the conference, the bridge, to speak. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: I didn't understand very well, but maybe Tijani can explain the technical issue.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Fatimata is waiting to have the floor and I will speak after Fatimata. Fatimata, you have the floor. But I will tell you Adobe Connect has only one channel. There are not two channels. There is only one sound channel, so you can only have one language on Adobe. For our working group, according to the number of persons speaking English or speaking French participating to the working group, we are going to use the French or the English channel according to the number of people working into the group and the other persons are going to work with interpretation.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, I understand. Now Fatimata you have the floor.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you very much. Part of my question was asked by Peters. It's about the timeframe of our working group or approximation, approximately the time of our working group.

And then I would like to speak about the time of the day. I'm not a member of the staff, so it is not my issue. If the meeting doesn't last too long, it's okay for me, but sometimes I need to be somewhere else. Maybe at this time of the day it won't be possible for me, but I'm not a member of the staff, so it's not very important.

Now I'd like to say that Pastor Peters won't be available sometimes. It's okay. Now, can we do a switch? For example, Michel will be pen holder and Pastor Peters will be vice chair, because as Pastor Peters won't be available for all the meetings [inaudible], because Pastor Peters will be the vice chair, and as a pen holder we will have Michel who will always be participating to the teleconference.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Fatimata. I'm going to give the floor to Tijani. Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Aziz. About the last thing on our teleconference. I don't think it is a good idea to say that. We can speak about some limits no later than the month. Why do I say that? Because you will see that it is not easy. There are some items that are very complicated and that will take time for discussion and then to have consensus in the group and then we may need to present a report for AFRALO and to adopt this report. AFRALO needs to adopt our report.

So it's a long process. And then AFRALO will present some comments, I imagine. So I think we can have a limit in the time as July 2015 is good timing. I don't have any more fixed idea. It can be longer, too.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani. How long did the other working group last? In the other RALO, how long did this working group last?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I don't know.

AZIZ HILALI: Does anybody want to ask for the floor? Okay, Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Aziz. There is a person who says that he won't be available to participate to the meeting at the time of the day on Friday, so we need to choose another day. We can ask staff to do an action item about that.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. Please, Tijani or the staff, could you put online a Doodle poll to choose the time of the day and the day of the week to organize our teleconference? Okay. And are you agreeing about the frequency? Once every two weeks is okay or do you prefer once a week? What do you prefer, once a week or once every two weeks?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: My proposal is once every two weeks, because if we work every week, we don't do our work between the meetings and our personal work is very important before the meeting to prepare the next meeting.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. I'm going to try to summarize. We need to decide the time of the day and the day of the week. We are going to do a Doodle poll about that. Then we decided that we will meet every two weeks.

There is only one item on which we need to take a decision and it is the proposal of Fatimata to have Michel as pen holder and Pastor Peters as vice chair. What do you think about that? Michel and Peters, can you please tell us what you think about that? Pastor Peters?

PASTOR PETERS: Whatever will make the group work fine is okay by me. I don't have any problem with that.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. So Pastor Peters, you don't have a problem. You agree with that, and Michel too. Tijani, do you want to have the floor? Fatimata, too? Who wants to have the floor first. Tijani, okay, let's go.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I'm going to speak first and say that I agree with Fatimata that the pen holder needs to be in every meeting, so if he's not available for some meetings, it's a problem. So if there are meetings in which he won't be able to participate, Pastor Peters is not a good pen holder. So Fatimata is right and I think – I hope – that Michel is going to accept. Okay. Silvia, please can you write down Pastor Peters is going to be the vice chair and Michel is going to be the pen holder. Fatimata, you have the floor now.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Well, you have proposed a Doodle. Okay. So we can maintain the proposal made Pastor Peters vice president and Michel pen holder, but if we do a Doodle and that the first proposal can be [done], it's okay. But if not, if there are some problem of availability for Pastor Peters, we can state that Pastor Peters is vice chair and Michel is pen holder.

Okay. Michel is not here, so we have to ask him what he thinks about that. He's not with us.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Fatimata. Okay, we are reaching the end of our meeting. Do you want to take the floor? Okay, nobody wants to take the floor, so thank you very much for your pay attention. Thank you, Silvia, Terri, Camilla, and Claire for your help. See you for the next teleconference.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Aziz. Thank you, everybody. Bye-bye-

PASTOR PETERS: Bye-bye.

TERRI AGNEW: Once again, this meeting has been adjourned. Thank you very much for joining. Please remember to disconnect all lines at this time.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]