

---

LONDON – APRALO General Assembly  
Wednesday, June 25, 2014 – 11:00 to 13:00  
ICANN – London, England

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: This is the English, testing, testing, 1, 2, 3. English. English testing, 1, 2, 3.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Ladies and gentlemen, please take your seats. We are about to start our meeting. Siranush Vardanyan for the record. Welcome everyone to APRALO General Assembly. It's wonderful to see so many people here. And it's really a great pleasure to meet all of our ALSs gathered together here in London.

We have an agenda set for today, but we have slight updates for that. So we'll talk about this later on. But before going into our stuff, I would like all of us to send our sincere condolences to one of our friends Amir, who had to leave yesterday because his father passed away. So we all want him to know that we are with him in this difficult time, and that Asia Pacific region is all mourning with him.

Let his father's soul rest in peace. Thank you. Yes? Yes, Fouad will do some small prayer for his soul.

Thank you Fouad. Okay. Welcome again. I would like everyone here to briefly introduce yourselves. Say your name, say your ALS name, and we will not be doing roll call but this will go to record, who is present here. So please, let's start from... Yeah, please do.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

TH SCHEE Okay. This is TH Schee, representing [Nee-pa] from Taiwan.

[JEROME]: My name is [Jerome], ICANN staff in the Asia Pacific, in the Singapore office.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: My name is [inaudible], I'm from Nepal, Internet Society Nepal Chapter. Thank you.

YANIS LEE: This is Yanis Lee from Net Mission in Hong Kong.

GUNELA ASTBRINK: Good morning everyone. Gunela Astbrink from ISOC Australia.

[KHAN]: Good morning everyone. [Khan] here, from [inaudible] ISOC.

JOHN: Good morning. This is John [inaudible] from [inaudible] chapter.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hi. [Inaudible] from South Pacific [inaudible] Society, Fiji.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible], Behan, ISOC.

---

[LANA GOLDSTEIN]: [Lana Goldstein], Internet Society of Armenia.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Good morning everyone. [Inaudible] ISOC [inaudible] ALS.

H.R. MOHAN: This is H.R. Mohan from the Computer Association of India.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ullrich, ICANN staff.

ARIEL LIANG: Ariel Liang, ICANN staff.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: It works. So here is magic. Whenever you click, you just cut off the other one's MIC, so please be careful with playing with this. Siranush Vardanyan, Armenia Association for the Disabled [Punic] from Armenia.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Quick], ICANN staff, based in Asia Pacific region.

---

MAUREEN HILYARD: Maureen Hilyard... [Laughter] Yeah, Maureen Hilyard, Pacific Islands Chapter Internet Society.

FOUAD BAJWA: Fouad Bajwa, from the Internet Research Project, Pakistan, and the ISOC chapter of Islam.

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche, Internet Society of Australia.

ELLEN STRICKLAND: Ellen Strickland, Internet New Zealand.

TAKAAKI HIGUCHI: Takaaki Higuchi, [inaudible] Japan, also ISOC Japan chapter.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Good morning everyone. I'm [inaudible] from ISOC Japan chapter.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hi. I'm [inaudible] working for [inaudible] Japanese telecom carrier, and also APNIC [inaudible] co-chair.

RAF FATANI: Raf Fatani, At Large community member.

SARMAD HUSSAIN: Sarmad Hussain. ISOC Malaysia.

---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible], New Zealand [inaudible] Internet Society.

YJ PARK: YJ Park from [Oceana].

PAVAN BUDHRANI: Pavan Budhrani, APRALO secretariat.

CHESTER SOONG: Chester Soong, ISOC Hong Kong.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Good morning. [Inaudible] Arab Knowledge Management Society.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible] ISOC JP.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible] from ISOC JP.

[SONNY LOU]: One more from this side. [Sonny Lou], Net Mission from...

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible] Internet Action Group.

---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hello? Hello good morning, nice to see you all. [Inaudible] ISOC Philippines.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible] Wong, AP Hong Kong from Beijing [inaudible].

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Good morning everyone. This is [inaudible] from [inaudible] India.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hello everyone. This is [inaudible] from [inaudible] India.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Good morning everyone. I'm [inaudible] and I'm from [c deck] India.

OKANA PRYKHODKO: Hello everyone. I'm Okana Prykhodko, European Media Press, Ukraine.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Yeah, hi, good morning everyone. This is [inaudible] from ISOC India.

SETH REECE: Seth Reece, observer.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Wow. Thank you very much. It's lovely to see also the representatives from EURALO coming and joining us and also observers. So, yeah. Quite full meeting today.

---

So according to our agenda, we have a couple of stuff to cover related to recent elections. But this is for Cheryl to do some final announcement, and we'll be waiting for her remotely. I just will ask staff whenever you see Cheryl coming online and Satish, they... Apologies because they are involved in NomCom, very difficult period of discussions.

So they will join us remotely, and as soon as they come, just let us know for them to jump in to discussion. But I would like to give the floor now to Kuek our vice president who is based in Singapore. Because Kuek needs to leave earlier, and we will cover a couple of topics about ALS participation and future activities. Kuek, the floor is yours.

YU-CHANG KUEK:

Thank you very much. And thank you for being so accommodating. We have 267 concurrent tracks this meeting, so we're all running from one place to another. If we can roll up the slides, I wanted to acknowledge the work that Michael [Lee] at the Singapore, the APAC hub in Singapore, Kelvin Wong, his work on this.

The premise of this is that, as you know, the Asia Pacific hub is working hard to drive across some strategic agenda across the region. At the same time, we also know that our friends here at ALAC, at APRALO, have very firm ideas about what are the strategic thrusts we have as a group. We wanted to make sure that there was a platform for us to work together, that as colleagues in this space, we are not going in different directions, and we will getting alignment on what are key priorities are, and that we can set them as an agenda upon agreement

---

with all of us, that this is what we're going to do possible in the next six months, in the next 12 months, or even in the next 18 months.

And based on that, we'll have something that we can showcase on our partners all around, that this is an example of the kind of collaboration we can have between APRALO as well as ICANN. So I'll quickly run into the next slide, just to show you some thinking we have on here. Maybe I should look at my, okay.

I'm a little shortsighted, so the screen is a little [laughter]. Oh, there you go. So I've gone through the background piece. So we are trying to think about whether or not we can temper ties away, that we can work together. And some preliminary thinking between the staff and some members of APRALO. This is something that we thought could be a methodology. And I'll go through this quite quickly because you'll have access to this deck, and I don't need to read out all of the details.

That I think, you know, at a starting phase, maybe we should set out what are the common focus areas that we have together. So, you know, it could be accessibility is an issue that this group wants to focus on. It could be expanding membership, and expanding the regional footprints that is a focus. It could be internationalized domain names, it could be IPv6 adoption. There really is an universe of issues that deserve our attention, but I think we're better off if we seek alignment, and then, you know, with that focus rather than having something that is very dispersed, with focus we might achieve something that is more specific.

So after setting out the common focus areas, we were hoping to determine some key priorities and deliverables. We are hoping that we



can articulate that, you know, by the end of six months, we want to have this or that. By the end of 12 months, we want to have this or that. So we have been listening very hard to what the community had to tell us.

And for example, one of the key things that we have heard is that language remains a barrier for more participants, more engagement from the Asia Pacific region. So for example, in response to that, we have come up with a language localization tool kit, and we are very happy that this thing will go live within the next weeks.

It's basically a deck with some materials that you can download from the web. It tells you that if you are going to go back to your community, and you want to do a roadshow with your community, this is something that you can just download, translate in your local language, and conduct a roadshow. It tells you the steps that, you know, if you want to conduct a session yourself, these are some of the things that you need to think about, run through that.

And so it becomes a plug and play kit, that all of our At Large structures, because you have such a fantastic network, across the region, can bring back to your communities to showcase the work we're doing here. And it could be, we haven't had this conversation yet, but it could be that if people around this table agree with the idea, then we can set ourselves some deliverables or some measures to say that, you know, we hope that within the next 12 months, we see this kit being adopted and used in eight markets, or in nine languages.

You know, this is something that we can set as a measure for ourselves, or even if we don't want to set this as a measure for ourselves, it will be

---

a way for us to have visibility on how well we are doing together. We can, at the end of six months, say that, “You know what? Ever since we’ve launched this program, this has been used 28 times, or something like that.”

And part C, of course, as a suggestion, there was a possibility that maybe we want to setup timelines and reporting updates, maybe on our monthly calls. We go around the call room to see who has done what, and people might even want to share that, oh, you know, we will roll this out over three months, or 18 weeks, or that kind of thing. If I can jump to the next slide.

So this is the way we think might be the methodology. If you look at the bottom of the slide, there, we talk about the focus areas for the APAC hub. And these are five key focus areas that we decided on, upon getting feedback from the community, that we shared at the Buenos Aries meeting, that these are the five things that we wanted to work on.

I think it would be great if... I have to confess that while I tried to get on the APRALO monthly calls, I haven’t been tracking all the different conversations as closely I have, but I am sure that within APRALO, there might be some focus areas that you guys are thinking of. And the idea is to match your focus areas with our focus areas, and there are still things that we can both agree on, that eventually will become the agreed key priorities of focus areas.

And obviously this might be a messy process. Different people will have different views. But I’m very confident that, you know, that within this room, we have had great track record of coming together and achieving consensus and agreement, that we will be able to come up with

---

something like this, that will guide us and serve as a benchmark or a North Star as we embark on our work for the coming months.

If I could move on to the next slide please, thank you Ariel. So this is how we think that, you know, we can go into this in detail, where when we have determined the focus area, for example, the focus area could be on increasing awareness, and the language localization tool kit is an example of how that supports the focus area.

And it goes into the process where we can identify and develop a supporting initiative. We can follow on with the actual implementation and delivery. And then we feedback into the process where we update each other, and hopefully we have a virtual cycle here. So it could well be that, you know, with the language localization tool kit that we put up, maybe the Dakar chapter for ISOC might decide that this is a great initiative.

We download it, our colleagues at, in Dakar translates the tool kit into Bangla, and then showcases it at [inaudible] in November, and then we can come back, again and update each other, why this worked, why this didn't, what was good, what were the learning points. I'm only raising that as a possible example because I was in Dakar very recently and I was very encouraged by what I saw there.

But this really is something for us to put on the table as a tool that ALSs to use and give us feedback on whether or not we're on the right track. If I can go on Ariel? Thank you. I think I'm coming to the end. So these are just suggested timelines possibly, and of course I defer to everyone around the table on whether or not this is something that you identify as something that you want to do.

---

We can use this time for, we have spent some time doing preparation, which is why this was shaded. We've had an initial discussion, with key select members of APRALO. We decided that it might be a good idea to open this up at the GA this time around, just to hear your ideas, whether you think it's a good idea or a bad idea, or whether you want to prioritize that.

And then hopefully we kick off a process where we identify some of the focus areas and the initiatives. And the next time we meet in London, we might be able to share an actual framework. And we are putting up as a question maybe this can be a timeline of 12 months, because I think you need to give it some time for you to actually to see the results.

And you don't want to be scampering around with new ideas and new priorities too often, otherwise you know, you have something that's very diffused. So thank you for listening to my monologue for the last 20 minutes. I don't know if Maureen, you want to add anything? Or Siranush, or...?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Thank you Kuek. It's really important to us to set those focus areas, and probably we may open the floor now for some brainstorming. And just remember that there is no bad idea while brainstorming. So please share your ideas, because this is important for each and every one of us to move forward with. And I have the queue, Raf, Fouad, [Leanna], Gunela, [Yannis], okay. And [inaudible].

---

RAF FATANI:

Thank you. Raf Fatani for the transcript record. First of all, thank you Kuek. Sorry? Talk into the MIC, okay. Yeah, I agree. I think there should be more cross-communication between what you're doing in terms of your engagement, and us as a way to a community and working with the cross-overs between what we both do.

But, I just wanted to ask a question that is slightly, while you're above this slightly. Thank you for being here. But I also wanted to put on the record there is another VP that maybe is or isn't aware that this is part of the remit. And I was wondering what sort of engagement there was with him? In terms of engaging what you've just discussed.

But then that raises another bigger question, is this RALO really too big in terms of a geographic location? In terms of the diversity that comes with that location? And I think the fact that we have two VPs, highlights this and then it kind of begs to ask the bigger question, is this something that we also need to look into?

Because if in terms of engagement at ICANN staff level, this needs to be divided up at such higher level in the hierarchy, is this something that we need to look into as well? Thank you.

YU-CHANG KUEK:

Thank you for that. This is Kuek for the record. Respond to this very briefly. There are actually not two VPs that are looking at this, there are four. So, and I was remiss in not mentioning this before. So obviously, there is a conversation that has already been ongoing with [Sa-vay], who takes care of Oceania.

---

There is also a conversation going on with [Ba-hair], who takes care of many of our friends here. There is also an ongoing conversation with Michael [inaudible], who takes care of the, exactly. So it's actually four and we have spoken to each other and we have gotten alignment on this project.

We are coming through this partly, and I'm leading this partly because this is something that is coming up from the Asia Pacific hub of the three hubs. So I fortunately or unfortunately become the face for this project, but I assure you that we've had this conversation before. The reason why they're not here today is because with all the concurring session tracks, they're not here.

But with regard to your larger question about whether or not the RALOs are appropriate, I guess I'll leave that off the table and we can have another conversation. But I want to give you that assurance.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks Kuek. Yeah, we are, forever want to know, we're really quite diverse region. And we are the largest region, not with the numbers of ALS maybe, but territorially. And so we have four VPs covering all of our regions. And I may assume that focus areas will be different based on different, region based, yeah. Sub-regions within Asia Pacific, so that's quite good to have different approaches. Fouad?

FOUAD BAJWA: Thank you Siranush. Fouad Bajwa. I had a small question about how the bridging might be happening, because for example, my country, Pakistan, is actually right now the bridge we're doing, let's say the

---

Middle East, and the adjoining country strategy, and then the Asia Pacific strategy.

So it's so far, we've worked on [inaudible] strategy, and we've been contributing as APRALO, myself from APRALO, responded building to the summer school. Raf was contributing to the school of Internet governance. Ali has been contributing to the planning of the whole program. So there is a lot of work which already APRALO has been contributing within the Middle East part of the work.

So how is it coming about? Because here so far we have not heard any working group being established, and then, you know, reviewing all of this. I know there is some working going on. There is planning happening in the Asia Pacific, but it's really not been coming out so far. So what are your comments on that?

YU-CHANG KUEK:

Thank you. So I think amongst the regional VPs we really don't want to draw a line in the sand to say that, okay, technically Pakistan on [Bahair] side of the house, but for example, Pakistan is a member of South Asia. And for South Asia, we are very lucky to have SS, security and stability resiliency resource that will, might go through the south Asia, not [inaudible] to give presentations.

And we're not saying that oh, because you fall onto the Istanbul hub, we're going to cut you off. So I think we're not making a conscious effort to draw a line. While we understand that there are different nuances and different objectives that the different regions will have. So

---

we have been trying to work together so that you don't have to choose either/or. Because the issue isn't only here.

For example, you will know that APTLD, for example, the Asia Pacific, okay. I know I shouldn't speak in acronyms, but the industry association, APTLD for example, has a geographical coverage that cuts in a different way, that is different from the regional Internet registry APNIC, or the Asia Pacific Network Information Center, for example.

So in response to that, I can only say that right now it's not in the signs, and we try to keep that coordination. And if there are, what we want to avoid is anyone between regions and falling into a crack. But if it's an overlap, I'm actually fairly happy if there is an overlap. I'm only worried if there is a crack.

And I hope that this group can remind us, if you do see a crack emerging.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks Kuek. [Leanna].

[LEANNA GOLDSTEIN]: Thank you. [Leanna Goldstein], Armenia. I want to say, I really support this initiative. This is a great, the idea. I just came here with the same question to raise here. Perhaps many of you have, might to come across to this book, that says, *Domain Names for Dummies*. Yes, and this is very interesting for all of those who are new who don't know what to say.



---

And I just wanted to say with this community, this is very important to have this kind of material. And all you suggested here for our community to share. And APRALO is really diverse not only includes, for inclusion of so many countries, but also for having so many local languages included in there. So I wanted to have all of this material really translated into local languages.

And here exactly, I'm very glad that you're already working on this initiative to have material to be able to download, and to translate, and to present for workshops and for everyone to share this. So I really support this idea. I'm glad that you're doing that. And if some kind of working groups will be called for working on this, I'll be glad to be with this and to translate all of these materials.

But, I want to also to say that sometimes it will be very difficult, to translate to have sources for this translation. If our colleagues from India, they are very many people working there. I can say the same for our chapter, for our ALS. We are not so much, we don't have so many members, and maybe a kind of support from staff, I don't know, can be useful here. We may collaborate on this. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

I think we are diverse not only territorially, but also language wise. And we need translation of some key materials into our local languages to share with the community. And I assume that will be, we are gathering the working group with the knowledge of those who are, came in some specific targeted languages, and together I would like to let you know that today we have translation in Chinese. So please, if you want to speak in your local language, in Chinese, feel free to do that.

---

We have, thanks to our translators here, we have that translation. Do you want to comment?

YU-CHANG KUEK:

Sure. I'll just quickly respond to that. I think that's a great intervention. And, you know, if we have something like *Domain Names for Dummies*, and we want to translate that, I think it would do so much in including people who would otherwise not be in the conversation, to draw them in. So the language localization tool kit that we have is a little bit like ICANN for Dummies.

I'll avoid that because it's not for dummies, it's for the uninitiated. But you hit on a great point here, because ICANN will never have the staffing resources to translate into all the languages in the regions. It will never happen. India itself has 22 official languages, and these are only counting the official languages.

I always run into an issue to say that, oh, you know, Japan is such an important market, how come it's only the six official languages? How come it's not in Japanese? And then when you do Japanese, I'm sure a question will follow, why not Korea? Why not [inaudible]? Why not Tai? Why not Vietnamese? Where do you draw the line?

And so we're really hoping that this becomes something that the community comes and partners us to work together, when we have the tool kit and at the At Large structures who are in region, and who may be individual can do the translation of some very basic materials can partner us, and there is a mechanism that makes it easy for you.

---

You wouldn't have to reinvent the wheel and draw through the website, or do all of this. So this is what we're thinking in that direction.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks. I would like to remind everyone before speaking, just name your, tell us your name because the translators need to know. So Siranush Vardanyan for the record. And the floor is yours Gunela. Am I right?

GUNELA ASTBRINK: Yes, it's Gunela, Gunela Astbrink for the record. Thanks Siranush. And yes, obviously, this particular region has a huge population, and the number of ALSs is probably not representative of the large population. I learned last night that in Canada, there is 13 ALSs, I think, which really surprised me.

So obviously there is a lot of outreach to be done. And Kuek, you mentioned the word accessibility, and every time I hear the word accessibility, I sort of spark up. And obviously accessibility has a lot of different meanings. It can be accessed to infrastructure, access to languages. In my community, accessibility as against access, means accessibility for people with disability.

And I'm not sure in what way you meant accessibility there. But certainly in languages are extremely important and are recognized in support that particular tool kit. But I'm also wondering if there is a possibility in this region to look at a model of outreach towards new ALSs applying from the disadvantaged sectors like disability, and how we can do that.

---

And it could be that we consider any documents to, online documents to follow the international web content accessibility guidelines, and look at venues when there are meetings in the region that they are accessible as well. So it's just looking at those aspects for full consideration. Thanks.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks Gunela. It's really very important topic, and I would like to everyone know that in Singapore, we initiated the new accessibility ad hoc working group. And Gunela is one of the members of this working group. Did a great presentation on accessibility issues. The chair of this working group is Cheryl. So we started then together with ICANN, together with support from ICANN's [inaudible].

So this new initiative will move forward to involve more ALSs, who are dealing with disability issues. So this is really quite important. And probably during one of our monthly calls, we will ask Gunela to make a presentation for everyone to know more specifics of how we can do more outreach to involve people with disabilities in our RALO. Next one is [Yannis] please.

[YANNIS LEE]: [Yannis Lee] for the transcript record. I just want to say that this kind of collaboration between the hubs and the RALOs is really good. And actually, there have been a lot of discussions about this capacity building over the two days that our thematic groups talked about, and how to make sure that ALAC members not burn out from their volunteering work.

---

And which we, in general there are many positive feedback actually about the capacity building webinars that we have done for this ATLAS II. So I think actually it would be good within our RALOs, we can map out like a series of issues that we would like to educate our members on, and to really develop their skill, I mean capacity and commenting on this kind of policy.

I think it would be good, the APRALO can help in organizing these kind of webinars, beside our APRALO monthly calls.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Good idea. For those who were able to participate in pre-ATLAS 2 webinars, that's good. But for those who are not able to be there, all of this information is posted online. So staff, please post also the link to those webinars. And I will really highly encourage you to go and to listen to, to find the time to listen to those webinars.

They are really, this is for the first time ever organized such big type of webinars for all ATLAS 2 members. So please go and check the information there. Reread, and start thinking about the future activities based on the information you gain there. The next, YJ please.

YJ PARK: YJ Park for the transcript record. First, I welcome this kind of initiative, but on the other hand, I wanted to look into some other kind of the dimension of the hub. For example, I'm not so sure how much resource you can depend on in implementing this kind of initiative.

---

I think one of the main, the challenge for our region is the participation, as you just explained. But not only users but also the business sector and government sector. And I know APAC has been working very closely with some business constituency. So I think that is a very good direction, but also, as the larger structure, what we want from now on, I think it's more like connections with other stakeholders.

So after Mexico, I think we achieved some kind of internal growth among ourselves. But, with this kind of the London ATLAS, I think from now on, ATLAS really needs to be influencing some policy development with other stakeholders. So far, we are kind of like internally isolated. We kind of talk to each other. We are not very good to talk to other constituency and stakeholders.

So maybe when we develop this kind of initiative, I think it might be better for us to be with other stakeholders, if that's possible. So rather than just APRALO and APAC, it might be more effective for us to be with other constituencies. I know you have a lot of challenge to reach out, those business sectors in Asia. I think that's really important, because as we all know, they are not here yet in this process.

And again, many governments are not here yet as well. So I think there should be probably like APACs, one of the priority, which we are going to support. But as an user, when you bring the other stakeholders, we wanted to work with them together. You know? So, I think from now on the At Large really needs to work with the other stakeholders and make sure we contribute to those policy development, rather than we work kind of internally among ourselves.

---

So hopefully you can sort of account this, you know, consideration in when you plan the further development. Thank you.

YU-CHANG KUEK:

Thank you. I think that was a very useful intervention, together with the other interventions we've heard. So I think right now we hear the bubbling of a lot of different priorities. For example, it could be capacity building. It could be accessibility. And then there is a need to define it and scope it. And also, this groups communications or alliances with the other stakeholder groups as well.

So, I just wanted to say that this was exactly what we were hoping for, that all of these can come together, can come to the table. And then of these, we agree on what we will focus on for the next 12 months. And then we can move that one step further to see how we can support the work. Because obviously when you talk about the needs on the table, you will probably will have infinite needs while you only have finite resources.

So I think this is a great start to that conversation, and I look forward to seeing what APRALO decides will be that list of priorities.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Siranush for the record. Completely agree, and that's why that was initially the purpose of opening this discussion for all of you who are here. And there is good news also that capacity building working group decides to continue the series of webinars.

---

So there will be a continuation of similar webinars, and we'll be keeping you in the loop, sending the information. So that's very good news. Holly?

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Siranush. Holly Raiche for the record. Just following on from YJ, and the ideas of the webinars, I think the focus of just whatever the priorities are, ICANN in its many, many, many little groups comes up with some very interesting policies. And I think finding your way in, and finding out what interests you, is always the challenge.

Yesterday, I sat in on the EURALO meeting. There was a lot of discussion about data retention and privacy. And it was news to everyone one of them that there is a thing called the privacy proxy working group. And then there was another big surprise in the expert working group.

So it was my having to say, "By the way, there is a lot of work going on right now, and there is a lot of interest in this area, in those issues, bringing people in and letting them understand." So yes, the webinars are there, but actually having maybe five or 10 minutes every monthly call saying, "These are the issues that are going on."

And if people have real interest in those areas, this is actually how to participate. Being a member of the working group is pretty arduous, but even getting in contact with somebody who is on the working group, looking at the webinar, understanding those policy issues, because ultimately that's what we do.



---

And ultimately we're going to make a difference because when policies are developed, the reason that we're at the center is that we have a voice and we actually have to use it. Thanks.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks Holly. [Inaudible]

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thanks. Kuek, just a quick comment. Is it okay? [Inaudible] ISOC [inaudible] ALS. Kuek just a comment that we do have 22 official languages in India, but primarily most of the government workers speak two, Hindi and English. And we have applied for six IDNs from India. So if we cover at least have the language tool kit work for this six or seven languages, I think we'll be covering most of the people from the India region.

The second point was with respect to the focus areas. So it is really a very big region, APRALO. And when you are deciding the focus areas, there has to be a sub-region focused also to be given. And then you can come up with larger focus areas. So just wanted to put on the cards that there has to be a sub-region focus as well, when you're deciding the priorities.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks [inaudible].

---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible] for the record. So, I must commend the work that has been done to sort of, to the work that has being done, not to outreach, to the ALSs, and then in terms of the capacity building that's been done. Clearly, with these kinds of actions, you are being more inclusive and get a wider participation, and the languages have obviously going to help.

I must agree with [inaudible] that the work that we are doing in APRALO is really big, and it's quite diverse. And what we need to be able to do is not to have focus groups for particular [inaudible], like for instance, just one specific example is the At Large webinars we were having.

They were excellent, excellent, tools for us to become aware and acquainted with all those technologies within the ICANN. And I really found it very useful. The only sort of, the one thing that actually would have kept our people from participating greatly, was the fact that these webinars were organized at the time of day where most of us would be catching a good night's sleep.

So only those who are dedicated, in fact I found so useful that I did not mind one, or two, or three AM, no, waking up and then attending this. But clearly, if the timing can be adjusted to reach out to the people who are, no, needs to be focused, I think you will have a much greater participation of the [inaudible], and much more effectiveness of the things that we want to be doing. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks. Timing is always an issue, especially for our region. And these webinars were supposed to be [inaudible] for all five regions. So it was

---

impossible actually for many of us to participate in all of them, that's why they are recorded and they are online. But the ones which we will be planning to open for APRALO, we will probably may try to find some decent time for all of us to be able to participate.

And I'm not sure which will be this decent time actually, I'm honestly saying. Sonny, please.

SONNY:

Thank you Siranush. This is Sonny from [inaudible] for the record. I certainly believe that capacity building is one of the first steps before we can engage in ICANN affairs. And I like the idea of those webinars being kept online so that people can access it at a later time.

I also know that within ICANN, there is an initiative called ICANN Learn. I'm not sure if there is any collaboration between these two initiatives webinars and ICANN Learn, or are they actually serving different purposes. Maybe you can give us a short response on whether these two initiatives are interrelated. Thank you.

YU-CHANG KUEK:

Sure. Thank you. This is Kuek for the record. So ICANN Learn is a platform that I would describe as being one of the many concurrent initiatives, that are meant to be complimentary and serve the same purpose. So if we managed to get something like the domain name for [dumas] out, this would be something that would be on ICANN Learn.

And ICANN Learn as well has a function where you can request for courses. For example, if you wanted something like names collisions for

---

dummies, this is potentially something that you can get from the website. When we do have the language localization tool kit out, we will also be putting that on ICANN Learn as well.

Just to close off on another point in terms of webinars, I don't know if everybody was in the room yesterday, but from the Asia Pacific hub, we do hear clearly the problem of webinar times. And the time that we found very useful is 11:00 Singapore/Hong Kong/Taiwan/Beijing, which is 8:30 Delhi.

I'm not familiar with Central Asian times. UTC.

UNIDENTIFIED:

It's 19:00 UTC. Sorry, sorry, sorry, reverse it. It's 3 AM UTC, 11 minus eight, it's 3 AM UTC.

Yeah, I'm very sure it's 3 AM UTC.

YU-CHANG KUEK:

We can in fact check this. But, you know, we can always shift it. The idea is that at least within the Asia Pacific region there should be a time, whether you move west or east, that can accommodate all of us. And what we're doing here is to give, to set the exact same time so that it is predictable.

I think we have every second Thursday in a bimonthly format where it will be the webinar time, and then the issues will change. I'll let Siranush moderate. I have to go for another session.

---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I just would like to thank Kuek, and say that we will continue this discussion of course via our mailing list, because this is really very important. And let's put a deliverable for us, that for the coming two months, we can set for ourselves the priority for cost areas. And we will send you, you will send your feedback to Maureen who graciously agreed to take notes today and will continue summing up all this information.

And we will discuss this with our VPs. All four VPs, I hope, will join also this. We will discuss and we will start putting into action all of those focus areas which are prioritized by the region. Can we agree on that? Any objections? Yes.

YJ PARK: Yes. YJ Park. Not objection, but I noted a little bit of the sensitivity to time. And I know we are very sensitive to the language translation issues, but I don't think we are really sensitive to the time kind of the identification. For example, for me, UTC, I have never really heard the UTC kind of the timeframe.

So whenever I notice UTC, I always have to Google or search something, how that translates into my local time. Sometimes I feel very nervous whether I missed right time or something. So maybe we can be a little bit more sensitive to our time zone as well. So when we announce those meetings, I really urge you to notice the other time zones as well, you know?

---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: We need to let Kuek go for now, and then we'll continue. Yeah, Maureen?

MAUREEN HILYARD: We are involved in heaps and heaps of meetings. And I can assure you that the UTC time, because it's a standard time, you know, globally. And I just know that, for example, when I see UTC I just deduct 10 hours from UTC and I know my time zone. So wherever you are, just work out what the thing is, and then whatever time you get, yeah. It makes it a lot more consistent, I tell you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Sorry, sorry, there should be a queue. Silvia please.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes, Silvia Vivanco, staff. I just wanted to mention that our invites have a link, and there you click and you will translate your local time. Over time, I also found when I joined ICANN, I found very confusing the UTC, but now after a while, I already know the times by heart. So you will...

YJ PARK: Thank you Silvia, YJ Park, but I think many times, somehow, the link didn't really work out. And that was the problem. And again, you know why? Why not we just sort of indicate other time zones as well? As much as we are sensitive to the translation, because probably a lot of you in this Asia Pacific region, at least some countries, we didn't really use UTC.

---

It's like sort of when people enforce English as kind of the, you know, the official language, this community kind of like enforces UTC as a more like a standard, which was not the standard in many parts of the Asia Pacific region. So I think we can really be sensitive, or also a little bit diversified the different time.

For example, if we know what's the time frame in either Beijing and Hong Kong, or Singapore, or Japan, then ICANN sort of late with those time zones, but with UTC minus whatever time, and it's very difficult to just envision what time zone I have to participate.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Fouad.

FOUAD BAJWA: I want to respond to YJ. YJ, whenever they send out any email, right in the third line or the second line of the email, there is a link for all other time zones. Please click this link. And when it opens up, you have one page at a time in the dot com, which has the exact timings with regards to your city. So I think it has been related [inaudible]. It might be the fact that, you know, with the overflow of the amount of traffic of emails in our accounts, we sometimes only tend to look at the subject and we might be missing it.

But really, that inclusion in all ALAC communication of the time zones is really helpful. It really is working out. So maybe it's just for everyone, whenever you get an email from APRALO or At Large for any webinar or any meeting, you will always see the second or third line for all time zones, please click here.

---

It opens up to the website called time and day dot com, and hopefully, against UTC, your times, according to your cities, it will convert it to all major cities of the world. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks Fouad. And just to let you know, ICANN works in UTC zone. So please try to find out for yourself what UTC are you, plus, minus, so... And it will be easier just to calculate. [Niro].

[NIRO]: Yeah, hi this is [Niro] for the records from [inaudible] India. I also face a lot of problem on participating on the monthly calls after these webinars. So I have two suggestions to make, and we can, move a motion is required for that. One is that the monthly call should be, currently it happens on the working day and the working hours.

It becomes very difficult for a lot of us to participate and attend them, bringing down the attendance on the working call. So if the group over here is fine, can we move it to Saturday? And the second suggestion is, on the webinars, can we have two times for webinars? Because we have a covering of a large area, so can we have two times for each webinar? One in the... So it suits all of the time zones.

So these are two suggestions, if it could be moved for the motion.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. Related to your first suggestion, Saturday and Sunday. It was discussed several times, but we should also rely on our ICANN staff, who is working all five days, so we can't ask them to work on Saturdays



---

and Sundays as well. So please, try to find this brief and small time once a month, at least, which can be available for the monthly call.

Because it's really difficult for staff also to come on Sundays and Saturdays to work. So changing the working date into non-working date, that means weekends, that's not possible. So, let's deal with that.

Someone catch my MIC.

Wait.

Yeah, but let me finish. Related to your second... No, stop doing that. Guys, we are not playing games here. So related to your second suggestion, let's go to that suggestion, we will probably think about having time zones covered, or two webinars covering the same topic. Yes, please, the floor is yours.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

I have a small comment. This is [inaudible] from Bangladesh. Everywhere of that data schedules comes from Google [inaudible], it's fine. But sometimes I found this data time zone [inaudible] Google format. It is a helpful Google calendar that comes from the Google format, date and time. Just click on this and [inaudible].

So it is helpful for all of us. I can [inaudible] Google format time schedule, that's really helpful for all of us.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Thank you. One question, I'll come to you. One question while we all are here as well, this is very good opportunity for all of us to find out, I

---

would like all those who are not subscribed to APRALO mailing list, raise their hands please.

Yes, [inaudible] you are not subscribed to the mailing list? Chester you are not subscribed? [Aris]? Sonny? So please, keep your hand raised. Staff, please take note who is not subscribed to the mailing list. From now on, this will not be an excuse for you that you didn't get an email from APRALO.

So staff, please make sure everybody is subscribed to APRALO mailing list, and they are informed what is being discussed, because a lot of discussion is going on through our mailing list. We can't meet every month in person. So mailing list is the only opportunity for us to be on the loop. There are monthly calls information, monthly report updates, there are a lot of stuff going on through email, consensus calls, nominations, different type of priorities set for the region.

So please make sure your name is being sent to staff, and staff will take care to include your names there. And there will be no excuse anymore that you didn't get that email. Okay? Thank you.

...names to Ariel, send your names to Ariel. Ariel, can you give your email address to those who are not aware?

ARIEL LIANG:

This is Ariel for the records. If you are not subscribed to the mailing list, just send an email to staff at At Large dot ICANN dot org, and indicate that you want to subscribe to the APRALO discuss mailing list, and I will add you to the mailing list.

---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Second question related to that. Is there anyone who has no access to wiki space? Wiki space? Because we have wiki space where we put all of our information online. So is there anyone that doesn't have access to wiki space? Holly?

HOLLY RAICHE: My comment is not that I don't have access, it's just that it's hard to find that we have a website that is not intuitive. So actually finding the bloody thing, frankly, is a challenge. So I will repeat, how many times that I have problems with that. And we actually have discussions, the way I always find where to go is I have to find the email, and then that has the link to the wiki space.

It's just too many links to too many spaces. They ought to all be gathered in one place so you can go to one place and find it. Now you can do that with the policy discussions, if you go to the ALAC policy, you do have access to all of the policy stuff, but getting stuff for ALAC, there are just too many wikis, frankly.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: So, I agree. But we tried to do little bits, we compiled a couple of files all together with for APRALO, and probably Maureen would like to comment on that.

MAUREEN HILYARD: I'm not quite sure whether you're meaning the ALAC stuff, APRALO stuff, because that should be actually quite easy, it's easier to find.

---

We've actually got... But if you're looking for anything, use the search, use the search engine. I mean, I use it all of the time because I can't find a lot of stuff anyway.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Actually APRALO's space, if you give search for APRALO on the left side, it's quite easy because we try to put, combine all the discussions on the specific topics. So current discussions, our monthly calls. Some specifics are really easy to find now. We did a really good job on compiling all of that information. We also have the space for ALSs. And there are new ALSs joined us recently. I would like to ask you to send your logo, and brief information about your organization to the staff, to post, or to me. Just to post on this wiki so we have all our information updated there.

And one request as well. Whenever there is a change of contact person, please let the staff know about this, because we need to have updated information at least in our wiki space. It helps us to keep on the look everyone. So if there is any person leaving their positions, leaving their ALS, just please, take the time to inform one of us. Thank you.

And yes, let's close the discussion. We decided that we will come up, if you have any suggestions for our focus areas, please send your suggestions during the coming one month, and we will compile this information and come back to you with that. And I want to give the floor to Maureen, who would like to speak about metrics, about new rules of procedures, and about our expectations of your participation, about your expectations of our involvement.

---

And I would like to highlight one point here. Whenever you have a need, you should speak out about that need. We wouldn't guess or wouldn't know what you need and what are your expectations for us to meet your expectations. So try to be participatory. So if you need something, let us know you need something. Otherwise, we wouldn't guess you need that and we wouldn't think of that, that maybe this ALS doesn't have this information or need this capacity building.

So please, let's make this interactive. Let's all of us be participatory in this process. Okay? Maureen, the floor is yours.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you. I'm just putting in a link for the rules of procedure. Right. Okay. One of the things that we've been doing for about a year now, has been coordinating a set of rules of procedure for APRALO. Cheryl and I spent a lot of time working on the ALAC rules of procedure. That took about a year and a half.

And so we were quite intimate with those rules. And so when we came to what we wanted to do in APRALO, we were really keen that the rules that we use for our organization actually select matched, what was the ALAC process. So, hang on.

One of them is to put the link in there so that you can actually refer to them as we're select going through. Could you just go up to the next...? Oh yea. Okay. So this is what I'm going to be going through. Using the rules of procedure, which you can flip through as we're going through them, to look at first of all the leadership team, how the leadership team is elected, and it's all in the rules.

And the membership of the leadership team. The role of ALAC structures, of the At Large structures. There is a section of the rules on that. And accountability of ALSs. Now this is where again, involved Cheryl and I, I don't know why I always end up with Cheryl. But, we're working together on the metrics for ALAC, and also we want to look at the metrics for ALSs, for APRALO.

But that's not for us to do, that's for APRALO to do. But the rules are actually in our rules structure. The second thing I want to talk about was accountability of ALAC members. Now we've got two, you've got two ALAC elected ALAC members, that's Holly and myself. Fortunately Rafid doesn't actually sort of like fed into this sort of like model, because he gets selected by somebody else.

But there is an accountability thing which we are also looking at for ALAC members. So I just wanted to explain that to you. The third item that I wanted to look at was, it's a new initiative, and I think YJ, it's the sort of thing that we're actually looking at. I'm the ccNSO liaison, as you know, and one of the things that we talked about in our last meeting was ways in which ALAC and the ccNSO could work together.

And in light of the fact that this was the ATLAS select summit, we sort of like looked at first of all, well just put our hands up. Show of hands here. Who knows... Or which ALSs in this room have a relationship with the ccTLDs in their countries?

Right. Okay. Well, there is not too many, but, and that's what we want to do. We want to actually build some knowledge about ccTLDs. And just as a starter, just as a starter with collaboration with another SO. So

---

I'll be explaining a little bit about what we're doing in that line. Okay. So the first thing, and if you're looking at, select the rules of procedure.

Just for example, going through the various sections. Section A is just the introduction. Section B looking at the, basically the role of APRALO, and its associated responsibilities. Section C looking at meetings, decision making, you know, like how, like the actual roles and responsibilities of members in relation to decision making. And then section D, which is an important section for us in relation to the election of our offices selections.

Now, one of the things that when we say we have elections, one of the important things about APRALO, and I think Cheryl mentioned it the other day, is that we work by consensus. It's very seldom we actually hold a vote. We do have a vote. If crunch comes to crunch, we do have a vote. But it's generally consensus. And so, I mean, it's not an onerous document, but it is a living document.

I mean we, sort of like assume, I mean, not just long after we sort of like put it together, we sort of like realized that we're missing... I think it was when we were going through the election, the selection of officers, because this was a new document and we obviously haven't taken everything into account.

So it's... And I think that as we go through things, as people identify things, this is what, you know, as Siranush said, this is where, if you identify something, raise it. And it's one of the things to, it's a good... One of the reasons we wanted to bring up these rules of procedure at this particular time.

---

When we've got everyone together, is that we want you to feel comfortable about raising things that are important to you, because if they're important to you, they're important to us. So, okay. I don't actually have that much time, seeing as, quick talk at all. So, we'll just move on. Can I have the next slide?

So you guys have got the rules of procedure. You know where to find it, you know, and just read them, you know, nighttime reading. Looking at the APRALO leadership team, recently selected, elected from within our organization, just sort of like outlining that, you know, the leadership team has the chair, two vice-chairs, and the secretariat. Those are the offices of APRALO, and that every year, you will be electing, and I think we've had elections for ALAC.

ALAC members. But you will be electing every year a member for the ALAC. My term finishes at the end of next year sometime, and Holly has just been elected to the, well reelected, for the ALAC. So she will have two years, and I will be, my position will become vacant at the end of next year.

But Rafid, I think his position, I think, is on... He's got two years. Yeah. And of course we've got, so we've got two new vice-chairs coming in, and of course this is where we wanted Cheryl, who is the sort of like the guru on sort of like the actual process, to come in and sort of like finalize that, so we'll leave that.

But anything to do with the leadership team, of course, is in section 5.5 plus, okay, in the rules of procedure. So that is important. Can I have the next one please Ariel? Right. Now, it might be an idea if you



---

actually have a look at your own 11.1, because some of that seems to have vanished.

But this is the section which looks at performance. And I think this is one, this is one of the key things that we wanted to raise today, is the importance of you as our ALSs to APRALO, why you are important. Okay? And I think that this section sort of like really does, this is the introductory section. And you know, like it says, you know, really that the APRALO can't operate effectively if you guys aren't being effective ALSs.

Okay. So that we'd really like you to, you know, to... Satisfactory performance is a concept, complex concept. And I mean, I've been involved in trying to sort of like devise metrics for the ALAC, and honestly, every single RALO had an idea, had a different idea of what they wanted, or what, they didn't feel that they didn't need to be, had their performance...

That they didn't feel like they were accountable anyone, even though they were, you know, they were on the ALAC, they didn't feel that they were accountable. However, the rules of procedure actually state that they are to be made accountable in some way. But what we've done is we lift the RALOs, we've left the actual assessment up to the RALOs. So what Siranush has got to do is, in working with you, I mean it's not for me to actually sort of like say how you're going to do it. But you, it is the responsibility of APRALO to devise, and to report to me actually collecting the data. Devise a way of ensuring that your ALAC meetings are meeting your, you know, levels of performance.

---

So, and that might need a working group or something, you know, to... But that's your decision, how you decide that. And that will go back to the metrics working group so that we can coordinate it all. So, but again, it will be something for you to read in that section 11 of the performance, the role of the ALSs. And I think that, can I have the next slide please?

When we're looking at sort of like accountability, I think it's sort of like mentioned in the, but we could be... But we're looking at, as for ALAC, we're looking at attendance, representation, and voting. Well, voting, more consensus for ALSs. And so, what we want to do too is we're looking at some sort of like metrics that might help us gauge effectiveness of some ALSs.

Just before we... Just before ATLAS 2, I think the ALAC voted on the un-accreditation. What do you call it? Decertification. Decertification of about three ALSs, because we had disbanded, they were ineffective, they weren't participating, or we hadn't been able to make contact with them for ages. So there is a set of criteria, and it's not as we sort of said ah, I haven't heard from these guys for a long time, we're just going to, you know, move them off. It doesn't happen like that.

There is actually, you know, a very straight process. Just as there is a very sort of like rigid process of getting people registered as an ALS, you know, the process is sort of like, it's quite strict. And so therefore, there is a lot of staff going through a lot of work to make sure that they've got all of the evidence, it says, that an ALS has not been effective.

And in fact, none, when it all boils down, I mean, the attendance, whether they're participating and working groups, and whether they've

---

actually sort of like participated in anything to do with ICANN, over a period of time, just, you know, like they log that in. And that sort of like contributes to it.

But you know like attendance at face to face and online APRALO meetings, we're keeping a log. We do keep a log of people who attend APRALO meetings. It's really important, as Siranush said, to, you know, that you actually come. The agenda is sent out early. If you've got anything to say, if you want to add another agenda item, just let Siranush know, and you can have your say.

Working groups, we really want you to at least be part, you know, like join at least one working group. And, you know, there is quite a lot of... There is a pile of working groups going. And Siranush will make sure that you know which ones they are. Next.

Okay. This is the ones that you guys are going to have to be working on. This is one that will actually will evaluate your ALAC members. Yeah, yeah. So we'll be trembling in our shoes. But, you know, the attendance, sort of like side of things, is basically taking care of by the staff. They attend all of our meetings and they keep a log of attendance.

But the sorts of meetings that we're involved in anyway, in every month, would involve, you know, like there is one ALAC meeting which can generally go for about three hours. The ALAC leadership team meetings, there is two of them a month, and they can go for a couple of hours. And of course, your APRALO.

---

But for representation for ALAC, of course, your contribution and participation is at a slightly different level. So, you know, you guys have got to take that into account. And the voting. There is regular voting. And, you know, if we actually... Our names are taken for votes. And if we don't vote, you know, for so many times, you know, that's noted.

Next. Must be nearly finished. Oh, right. Okay. This is to end it. ALS meeting. One of the things that we mentioned was the, as I mentioned, the ALSs and the relationship that they have with their country code top level domain. The managers. You know, like, I mean, maybe because, you know, ICANN is very much related to sort of like, to top level domains. And so therefore, a relationship with your country code, we felt might be quite appropriate.

So we're probably sort of like, we're looking at probably looking at, you know, some webinars, some of like training packages, that actually look at what ccTLDs are all about, how they work, how they're managed. We've been again, Cheryl and I, have been involved in a framework of interpretation working group, which has been looking at a paper that looks at re-delegation and revocation of top level domains, ccTLDs.

And they are... This particular paper has been worked on for six years. They have fortnightly meetings, for six years, and they have looked at every single word. This is really, really important this document, because it is, it actually sort of sets guidelines for managers to manage their, these ccTLDs. What happens is that once they have actually agreed, and we at one stage thought that we would have gotten it ready for this meeting, but a couple of weeks ago, a couple of the guys...

---

And the team is made up of ccTLD managers and GAC, and it's a multistakeholder group. And yeah, they disagreed with one section so they basically had to start all over again, on this particular one. So they've gone back... And so we've got a meeting on Thursday, hopefully we can get this resolved.

Once it's resolved by the group, then it goes to the Board, and the Board has got to endorse it once it goes to the Board, and the Board has endorsed it, then it goes to IANA. So that's the level, that's why it's taken six years. But, if, you know, like with this, you are going to find out, and in fact, if you get to know your ccTLDs, you'll actually probably get to read this document and get to know it intimately.

But this is just the start of a project. So we've only just initiated this. What I've actually sort of like, I have put online for each of the RALOs, is the first column that looks at the... It's got the ccTLDs, those ccTLDs are ones that are members of ccNSO. We you have got, for example Bangladesh, where I've got Bangladesh, Bangladesh isn't a member yet.

But so, it will be your job, [inaudible], to go in there and say, "Why don't you join ccNSO?" Go.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Sorry. Actually I'm already deeply involved with [inaudible]. I'm [migration] [inaudible]... update, I'm looking forward to work on this.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Sure.

---

FOUAD BAJWA:

Thank you Maureen. Fouad Bajwa. There is a small problem over here. The ccTLDs, some of the ccTLDs were established before ICANN, so they have a direct contract with IANA, but not with ICANN. So that's the kind of problem we have even for Pakistan. That you know you can really talk to them, maybe but with a personal link. But if you don't talk to them within terms of ICANN, it becomes like a, it's really hard to establish a relationship because they're not with ICANN.

They're from IANA, and it's their contribution if they attend ICANN meetings on their own.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

That's an interesting point because one of the things in the GAC meeting, when the ccNSO met with the GAC yesterday, one of the things that, because the ccNSO is going to have four members on the IANA coordinating group. And they're going through the process of, you know, selecting those four people. And one of the GAC members asked if a ccTLD that was not a member of the ccNSO, could actually be considered as part of the group.

And was, yeah. So I mean, it's that sort of thing. I mean, even though Bangladesh isn't, you know, a formal member of the ccNSO. You, like, I mean, you might have someone, you know, who would be really good. They would have to put their name forward or whatever. So, I mean, it was something that sort of came up which was quite interesting.

I think that's it. I've done my dash, and I'm just a little bit over 12:30, I'm so sorry.

---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Maureen. It's a very important topic. I would like also to let everyone know, and I assume that you all are aware, but APRALO is privileged indeed, to sign memorandum of understanding, official MOUs in Singapore with APTLD, Asian Pacific Top Domain Name, Top Domain Level, Top Level Domain. And APNIC, Asian Pacific Network Information Center.

So we have official MOUs with those regional leaders, and they both agree to support our ALSs in providing the information whenever they have any training available for us, whenever we can ask or go and visit there meetings, which they are taking, which they are holding three times, APTLDs are holding three times a year.

So, this is very important for us to take the opportunity out of that partnership. I have invited both representatives from APTLD and APNIC to our, today's general assembly, but unfortunately they were not able to join us. But there is really an open partnership, and I would encourage all of you to take the opportunity, to take the chance to use that opportunity.

And whenever they have a meeting, somewhere which is close to your location, take a chance to go there and to participate, and make sure they know that you are from APRALO and you will get a full benefit of our partnership with them. [Inaudible], you have your hand raised.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thank you. [Inaudible] from ISCO JAP. And I have just one quick question. So actually what you mentioned about the ccTLD, that is based on the country, or the economy, but also in the Asia Pacific area,

---

some of the data, the multiple such organization would including some of the multiple countries, or economy also. So such organization can also attend the APRALO or not. This is my question.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: You mean participate in APRALO what?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: For example, the [actor] that I'm attending here as one of the member of ISOC, ALS Japan. As for example, the [inaudible] in Asia Pacific area, so some organization involved, multiple countries. So in such case, they are based is not on the economies or countries, but there base is on the adjusted multiple... Such organization which is covering the Asia Pacific area.

So such organization can join this APRALO or not.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you for that. It's Maureen for the record. I think, like for example, my ALS is the Pacific Islands chapter of ISOC and there are 22 countries. So yes, you can belong a group that actually covers a wide range. So it's just the members, pick ISOC across the region.

So did you have an organization in mind?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Yes, actually I'm also working for the [inaudible] Asian Pacific network. This is sort of the research and education network of the Asia Pacific area. So actually, of course, they're just my ideas that this is not the



---

idea of this organization. But also this [inaudible] involves the multiple countries or economies inside the Asian Pacific area.

So that's just my idea.

MAUREEN HILYARD: They would just have to join... They could join as an ALS, if they wanted to.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Siranush Vardanyan for the record. Yes [inaudible], this maybe your first step to put forward outreach activities, and explain them who we are, and invite them to join APRALO.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: I will, thank you very much.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Yes, Fouad.

FOUAD BAJWA: Thank you Siranush. Fouad Bajwa. Coming back to the MOUs we signed with both of the organizations, APNIC and APTLD, maybe... First of all, I would like to sort of, this was missing, I forgot about this in Singapore. But again, I would like to congratulate the APRALO members who drafted both the MOUs and then who proposed all of the activities for that.

---

I think one thing I wouldn't want to lose those people back to the busy work that they've been doing, including Maureen and so forth. And somehow, maybe I propose a motion for the creation of the partnership working group, which actually takes the MOUs further and continues to keep the relationship alive with these TLDs.

And on monthly calls can come back and update the APRALO community. I don't know what is happening. And then this could also act as another center points for disseminating information about what the partners are doing, what meetings are coming up, who is available, who can get time off from their jobs, from their work. And they can actually go and contribute to this.

So this could be actually be a conjunction with the outreach planning and activities.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thanks Fouad. And this is really very important point, and I would like you to volunteer to take the lead on sharing the information with... Because after our Singapore meeting, I have sent several updates from APTLD and APNIC to our ALSs, but I would like from now on, it would be coordinated somehow, the information shared. So Fouad please, agree to lead that, to keep the pen, just be a pen holder on this, to share the information, what's going on in APNIC and APTLD, and share the information with our ALSs from now on.

FOUAD BAJWA: Thank you Siranush. Fouad Bajwa. Okay. I'll agree to chair the working group, with one, what you call it? Condition. That we will do it through

---

email. This working group will work through email. We will not call you on a monthly call. In fact, we will only report back to the APRALO meeting, which is the monthly meeting, because that would make it easier.

Because there is so many other volunteering, who are going on to other working groups, so I don't think we don't really want to put another one. But what we can do is we can update on a monthly basis, through the APAC discussion list, as well as through the monthly meeting. The opportunities available, point of view, and the monthly call can sort of act as well members of the APRALO community and the transparent and accountable manner can volunteer to join those activities.

Instead of somebody selecting them to go, right? So there could be actually, so that the whole thing just remains open. So I can coordinate reporting the terms and conditions laid out in the MOUs, with the partners, and keep the [inaudible] on the monthly calls as well as the community. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Siranush for the record. Thanks Fouad. And I think that will be really useful to come up with updates during our monthly calls, and share the information via mailing list. [Inaudible]?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thank you chair. [Inaudible] for the record. So my comment is in relation to Maureen's presentation on performance of ALSs and ALAC. If you look at it, when ALSs apply for certification within ICANN, there is one unified [inaudible] in terms of [inaudible] and one set of rules.

Therefore what values is that, when you're looking at evaluating the performance of the ALSs and even leading up to the registration. I feel that when that set of procedures should be uniformly applied across all of the RALOs. So instead of APRALO having its own set of rules and another RALO having their own rules to measure the ALSs, I feel that maybe it should be better and perhaps in the best interest that if all of our RALO leaders get together, and then come up with an unified terms of reference which is applicable to all ALSs, so that no, we don't have ALSs which are feeling a bit shortchanged, or not feeling that they have slightly different treatment just because they happen to be in one region. Just a thought.

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** Our initial thought with these metrics is not to measure how bad we are working, or how bad we are behaving, but to measure our successes. So, to highlight our successes and to share with everyone. So this is, we should look at this metrics from positive side, because we want to highlight positive aspects of those.

**UNKNOWN SPEAKER:** So in that regard, what I feel like, if you're looking at metrics like attendance of meeting, this is like a very, how to say? A very small level of measurement, not to say how much an ALS is performing just based on their attendance. Maybe high level concepts like KPIs, you know, for instance the implementation of the language toolkit in your region, could be classified as one milestones.

---

And if an ALS achieves that, that is something that you can measure. That's much more meaningful than looking, recording attendance, which people could easily [inaudible]...switch off your Adobe Connect and then go off to sleep. And you get [inaudible] ranked as being one of the most effective ALSs, when in fact you're not doing much. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: You are completely right. So the metrics will cover the real attendance is a very, very small part of it. They are really more deep measurement and highlights coming from you, which we all together should measure. YJ?

YJ PARK: YJ Park, transcript record. Well this ccTLD issue is very complicated one. So, I welcome those more engagement ccNSO, but on the other hand, our engagement with ccNSO needs to be very limited, rather than very extensive participation because as we all know, ccTLD in this space is treated as very special space, domains, as a large user like us, we do not have the substantial role for other ccTLDs.

So once our sort of the efforts to reach out to all those, the ccTLDs, or APTLDs, as an user, where we are not going to be recognized serious stakeholders in this space. And so I think sort of sum up, people like Maureen or somebody who can liaison with the ccNSO, they can update a little bit about their discussion. But as you all know, domain ccTLD policies are also very limited.

They don't talk about their ccTLD policies in development space, but they are talking about is how much they are going to contribute to ICANN. That's the main issue for them. And also some kind of the regional issue and delegation issue, which has been taking more than six years, which they are now going to finalize their outcome.

So they are the kind of domain issues. They don't really talk about those issues with ICANN. And what will be our role in their organization? And I don't think that they will seriously consider user as one of their stakeholders. We, ALS, we can do that kind of outreach without our counterpart the ccTLDs in the national level, but not regional or not global level.

So with our limited resources, I think it might be much more effective to concentrate on these gTLD spaces. Now we have a very interesting new agenda, like ccTLDs, right? That's not really ccTLDs, but that's kind of gTLDs, but a lot of those CT are 30 days, they are more like government. So this is the kind of the area we can contribute to as user, but not directly with the ccTLDs.

I don't think ccTLD will welcome our contribution. And under this kind of very complicated dynamic spaces like ICANN, which is continuously evolving like a ccTLDs, that's the kind of the space where we should contribute to. What are the ccTLDs? Are they similar to ccTLDs and other similar to gTLDs? Technically, they currently belong to gTLDs.

But a lot of those they applicants, they are governments. City governments, some of them they should be treated like ccTLDs. So that's the kind of very interesting area we, as users, have to contribute

---

rather than existing ccTLDs, where we don't have that much capacity, or the space. I think that's my ideas.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

I just want to respond just to that, about the differences. With the ccTLDs, ccNSO does not write policy for ccTLDs, because ccTLDs belong to the countries. The countries have their own laws, their own... The IANA... For example, the paper that one paper they're working on at the moment, has guidelines on how the managers manage it from the perspective of IANA.

But that's a sort of like, that's probably the only sort of like input they have. The way the ccTLD managers is according to the laws of the country. ccNSO doesn't have anything to do with it. GTLDs are a whole different ball game, okay? But I guess it's sort of like for us, it's... The reason why we're actually starting on ccTLDs is only because I happen to be the ccNSO liaison, and I'm with APRALO.

Alan Greenberg is the GNSO liaison, and he's in NARALO. So, you know, we could call him in later on, or no doubt, even if they set up a training program based on GNSOs, we might be able to walk into... I mean, it's something that we could work on with NARALO. But I just wanted to clarify that, yes...

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Thanks Maureen. And it's also important to know that if there is any expert whom you think will be very important to invite as a guest speaker for our monthly calls, please let us know. It would be easier to

---

organize, for them to share the information with us, for all ALS to be aware of.

So we've only 10 minutes left and we have a couple of topics to be covered. I want to give brief two minutes to [Yannis], to talk about APIGF coming up. [Yannis]?

[YANNIS LEE]:

[Yannis Lee] speaking. Yeah, we are... I'm working on the secretariat for the Asia Pacific regional IGF that is coming up, in this August in Delhi, which I want, which I will distribute this postcard to you. We will, it is from the August 3<sup>rd</sup> to the 6<sup>th</sup>. And we have line up, very good topics this time which covered the NetMundial discussion as well about the Net Neutrality, surveillance, issues, and also about the ICANN globalization, and also the IANA relationship transitions issues as well, such as that.

And so, we will also have capacity building event on the first day, which is Sunday the 3<sup>rd</sup> of August as well, which also covered some interaction about Internet governance. And we're inviting some speakers from the region to speak about different topics. So I highly encourage you to join us, to come to Delhi. And we also have remote participation available, which you can track on our website, AP RFGI dot Asia.

And also, our regional IGF is actually an open organization that we have, this multistakeholder steering group called [inaudible], and we welcome anybody, any other ALS in this RALO that are interested to join us, discussions or to discuss about other IG issues that are out of ICANN for scope, to join us on this group.



---

And also and to organize this future regional IGF together. So please take a look at the postcard, and if you have any questions about this, or you are interested our group you can contact me, or you can directly email to the email address on the postcard, which is secretariat at SCE at AP RIFG dot Asia. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Thank you [Yannis]. Please, at least those who are close to India can take the opportunity of participation, so this is really good opportunity for you. There are a couple of things I want to cover. And also... First of all, I want to thank all of you for yesterday, unanimous integration of all AP ALSs into our Fayre of Opportunities.

We were really united. We were really impressive. And we are the best, actually. I want to give the round of applause to all of us.  
[Applause]

And I want us to continue to behave in this way. We are, we serve as an example as a best practice for other RALOs, believe me. [Applause]

Thank you. [Applause]

The Chair cannot be effective if there are no supporters. I had really great supporters, Maureen, Ali, [inaudible] whoo-hoo. You know, by the way, I want to highlight this.

Staff is out of... So we will come to that at the end. But I would like you to know that this Fayre of Opportunities was almost conducted by AP members. The whole quiz session was conducted by [Pavin] for all of

---

our RALOs. I'm not talking about AP table. This was gorgeous. So thank you everyone who put their hand and supported for this initiative.

We should continue in this way. We cannot be effective without each other's support. So, please, always participate as much as you can. This will make us work together to effectively achieve the goals we will set for us. And yes, do we have [Satsesh], he can join us online?

Okay. Okay. So the last point I would like to cover, this is the result of a consensus call held in APRALO. As many of you know, our region is based, thanks God, to consensus, yeah. And sometimes we are discussing and arguing, what is consensus actually? So we came to a conclusion that a rough consensus is also very good for all of us.

So the result of our consensus, can you open the space? Ariel, the results? I would like, first of all I would like to thank outgoing leaders, but I am not saying they are outgoing from APRALO because we need your expertise, but and we need all of you to be with us.

I would like first of all to thank Fouad for the last two years, enormous efforts. [Applause]

Fouad we are looking forward for your support and for your expertise. You are really an experienced person in many aspects, so we are looking forward, yes. This recovery is most important, but you are doing great. So you can run with us, so that's a good point. And consensus on the support...

Is this the one? Yes. So, I will read this out, I will try to. Consensus on the support for the names of the proposed APRALO leadership team, APTLD members, listed below was gained during the May APRALO

---

monthly meeting teleconference, and further confirmed and supported by a full regional consensus, as a result of the online and to the mailing list consensus call agreed to.

And actioned immediately after that meeting ending at 23:59 hours UTC on Tuesday, 3<sup>rd</sup> of June. Thereby it has been established that by regional consensus, the following are confirmed as selected and supported to serve in the AP LTD by regional consensus, as of June 4<sup>th</sup> 2014, to serve the APRALO leadership team.

A formal induction into their roles in full capacity occurs today during our APRALO General Assembly in London at the ICANN 50<sup>th</sup> meeting. Whereby acclamation, all selected will cease acting in the capacity and fully take their seats in each leadership team role as listed below. Please go down.

Please. Down, down. Up, up, up. Yes. Holly Raiche, ALAC representative to November 2016. Your servant, Siranush Vardanyan, APRALO chair to November 2016. Ali [inaudible] APRALO vice-chair to November 2016. And [Satesh Babu] APRALO vice-chair to October 2015, [Satesh] we are sending our remote hugs to you and congratulations. Oh yeah, we have [Satesh] online, whoo-hoo. [Satesh]?

[SATESH BABU]: [Inaudible]

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Cheryl and [Satesh] are joining us. The floor is yours.

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you. I'm so sorry that [Satesh] and I can't be with you today. And at least we've timed relatively well for you to include him, induct him, amongst you [inaudible]. [Satesh] was most disappointed with me [inaudible]... He of course, he knew [inaudible], but is very, very keen to be in the APRALO General Assembly, and work with you all on this very pivotal moment.

As I was listening and desperately trying to get someone to get my phone number to dial out to, so consequently [Satesh] and I both [inaudible]... listening to, and in my case, I've also got a phone to the other ear, so I've got to slightly [inaudible] stereo. He and I have [inaudible] for a short while, and we [inaudible] such an amazing group of people. You are all going to do our region proud.

And it was the acclamation for all of you, which you are going to do [inaudible]... I just wanted to remind the APRALO members, the At Large structures [inaudible]... individuals to join APRALO now, so spread the word. That with the six people, there are six of them, six people, [inaudible]... and we have our secretariat with [inaudible]... and six people across the region who are leading you, and of course in combination with Rinalia [inaudible]...

...opportunity to be a powerhouse, and to make huge distances to bring the diversity and the voice of Asia and of the Pacific, into our [inaudible]. So I just wanted to say to all of you, all six of you, including you Maureen [inaudible]... congratulations, you guys are going to steer this ship in wonderful directions. And I for one am going to enjoy the ride. So anyone who has got the ability to turn the chamber around,

---

because I want to see everybody affording your new team [inaudible], your future, congratulations on you all.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Cheryl, thank you for joining. Thank you. And I also I would like to congratulate [Paven], who really was stayed with us, another term as secretariat, and your applause is to [Paven]. He is enormously supported. Thank you [Paven]. And I would like to thank everyone for your participation. Unfortunately, we have no time because people outside are waiting for the, their turn.

But I want you all to invite outside to have APRALO picture, as we are all together here. So please, come outside the, just in front of the door of this lobby. Cheryl and [Sateesh] we will miss you in the picture but you are in our hearts. Yes.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Leave a space and Photoshop us in.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Okay. And the meeting is concluded. Thank you very much once again.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**