
JULIA CHARVOLEN: Welcome everyone to the LACRALO monthly call on Monday 17th March 2014 at 23:00 UTC. On today's call we have Fatima Cambroner, Jose Arce, Diego Acosta Bastidas, Aislan Vargas Basilio, Humberto Carrasco, Aida Noblia, Johnny Laureano, Alberto Soto, Carlos Dionisio Aguirre, Sergio Salinas Porto, Antonio Medina Gomez, Natalia Enciso, Javier Pallero, Carlos Vera, Franco Moya, and Oscar Garcia.

On the English channel we have Dev Anand Teelucksingh and Olivier Crépin-Leblond. From staff we have Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, and myself Julia Charvolen. Our apologies today are Juan Manuel Rojas. And our interpreters are Veronica and David.

May I please remind all participants to please state your names before speaking for transcript purposes, and for the interpreters to identify you on the other language channel. Thank you and over to you Jose.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. I was not able to hear the roll call. There was a very strange noise on the line, and I see Silvia.

SILVIA VIVANCO: This is Silvia Vivanco speaking. Yes, we have already started with the roll call. Julia has already started with the roll call, but there was a very strange noise that perhaps made it difficult to hear the roll call. So would you like us to repeat the roll call or would you like to start with the call directly?

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. I think we can just start, unless there is someone who would like to hear the roll call again. But, if there is anyone who is not connected on the AC room, well that person should send the apologies. So I think we can start at once with the call.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco speaking. Okay Jose, go ahead please. This is Silvia Vivanco speaking for the record.

JOSE ARCE: So welcome to this call on Monday the 17th 2014. This is the LACRALO monthly call. So welcome to the staff, the Spanish participants, the participants on the English channel. And I would like to say that we're facing difficult times for the community, because we are hearing news, or we know about news, that is difficult – you know, [?] has decided to start with a process so as to put ICANN and the IANA on – with IANA, and this is a very important challenge for the community to embrace this new process.

I've been talking and discussing with Fatima and Javier Pallero, and this is a very difficult challenge because we need to start this process, this is a very relevant process for the community, and we need to contribute substantially to this change. So I think this is one of the most important benefits. This has changed all of the agendas, even the agendas of Internet users and the Civil Society as well.

If we have time, we will deal with these topics today, but there are some other issues, important issues to deal with. First of all, I would like to speak about in this call, two very important topics, or two particular topics. One of them is the election for Chair and Secretary in our region. So I would like to speak about this topic at the very beginning of this call. And after that, I would like to speak about the election being carried out in LACRALO to contribute [?] as a region for the seat number 15 in the ICANN Board, because we have time – and I say we because this is a goal that we have, and this is often 9 PM Argentinian time, so this a time that, the frame that we have, or the terms that we have to vote.

So first of all, I would like to thank the staff for the hard work that they carry out every day for supporting our region, and all of the accredited user organizations, accredited in LACRALO, for their support. I think there was a mistake to have read on the list, there was... The voting system was programmed to be carried out anonymously, but you know, as you know if they receive the voting anonymously, we have no way or no form who will win the vote or the election.

So we have sent the apologies and we have decided to open again the process, to reopen the process from now onwards and to provide the same amount of space given for the previous voting. So, I apologize for this, this was a misunderstanding, a confusion and I hope that none of you have felt bad for this.

So if there is any comment or any question regarding this issue, you have the floor, and we will be solving this shortly. There will be a new period for the election. Not long ago, some minutes ago, I have already

received the credentials for the election of Chair and Secretary of the region. So, I will give the floor for some minutes, just in case you would like to make any comments about this.

Jose Arce speaking. I see nobody wanted to take the floor. I see Natalia Enciso saying that she has already received the credentials. Silvia is also apologizing. Sergio has already received the credentials. So we can finish with the topic here. I hear a voice. Is there anyone who would like to take the floor? I can some voice.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: This is Antonio Medina speaking. I am hearing you Jose.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Antonio, if you would like to take the floor go ahead please.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco speaking. I think we have already spoke on the issue of the echo.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: Antonio Medina speaking. May I take the floor Jose?

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay. This is Jose Arce speaking for the record. I am still hearing the audio very badly. Jose Arce speaking. I don't know if the staff can hear as well.

Interpreters apologize, but there is a strong echo on the Spanish line and we cannot interpret properly.

SILVIA VIVANCO: This is Silvia Vivanco speaking. I am checking my audio. Can you hear me? Yeah, there is still echo on the call. So just please bear with me for a minute.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Yes there is an echo, and I can hear Silvia speaking. There are two voices.

Jose Arce speaking. So while we are solving this audio issue, I see Gilberto Lara has joined the call, so Gilberto welcome to the call.

SILVIA VIVANCO: This is Silvia Vivanco. I think the audio issue has been solved, so you can proceed.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay. I hear no echo right now, so I think we can go on. So, I was telling you before, we have that problem with a system, the Big Pulse system, this is already full. I think all of you have received the credentials, so please if you have any friend or any colleague who is

not on the call, and we can speak to that person, let's try to see or find out whether they have received or not received their credential.

If not, please let us know. Me and Silvia, or someone from the staff, so that we can solve the issue of credentials as soon as possible. So, we ask you for your help. I will be in charge of checking if we all have already received the credentials, but perhaps many participants or many members may have not seen today's email. So we would cover an extra task to check if all of the members, or the persons, have received their credentials.

I have heard that Antonio Medina wanted to take the floor. Antonio, would you like to make a comment?

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: This is Antonio Medina speaking. No, Jose, I was going to mention that there was a technical issue, but this is already solved. So I have nothing else to say. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay, thank you very much Antonio. Let's go on. For today's call, I have some map, some plan, and Juan Manual sent his apologies. He was unable to deliver his or prepare his training cycle. So the idea would be to take 15 or 20 minutes or 30 minutes just to make an exchange of ideas regarding the voting for the candidate of seat 15, for the ICANN Board.

Yesterday, together with Dev and staff, I don't know if it was yesterday or the day before yesterday, I cannot remember well, there was a space

that was open, specifically devoted to the discussions about this issue. And I think that today, there was – there were many threads of conversation for many comments in favor and against candidates, and we were discussing about that.

We were discussing in favor of some person, and I think that this discussion has been very productive because with one opinion, we are able to see other points of view, and we can carry that dialogue. So I think we can devote 15 or 20 minutes and speak about this topic. I don't know what you think about this. Would you like to take the floor, express your opinion about this? I see Silvia has posted the link on the wiki page. Carlos Aguirre, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

Jose Arce speaking. Carlos, can you hear me? You have the floor, go ahead please. Carlos, we cannot hear you. Perhaps you might have some audio issues. Okay. He says that he will give the floor to other participant. Okay.

Jose Arce speaking. I see some Adobe Connect problems, or some problems with his Adobe Connect, his mic. So is there anyone else who would like to take the floor and tell us his or her opinion about this important topic? I would like to say that this is the first round where the five candidates – okay. It will be a selection of those five candidates, then we will have three candidates.

The second round will start very shortly. It is on March 23rd, so this is one of the main topics that we as a community need to carry out. I see Carlos with his hand up again. Carlos, go ahead please.

CARLOS DIONISIO AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre. Hello Jose. Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Yes, go ahead please.

CARLOS DIONISIO AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre speaking. Okay. Now I'm on the phone because I see I have some problems with my computer. Okay. I wanted to make a comment regarding, or about what you were mentioning about the election or selection. I was not able to get into details, because as you know, I am the only member of the region who participated in the BCEC, which is the Board Committee Election... Board Candidate, in fact, Election Committee.

And this was a committee in charge of selecting the candidates that we are now voting. Initially there were eight candidates, if I'm not wrong. And the whole group of the BCEC, we decided to choose five candidates, and these are the candidates that we have today. So, as I said before, I cannot in details. But, I think that among the candidates that we have today, all candidates are really very good.

And I think we only need to take into account who are the ones who represent those period of end users. I think this is the only comment I can make right now, because there are candidates who have other points of view, or they come from other layers, they come from other places. Not exactly the end users, they have other background.

So this is the only comment that I would like to make. And I will now close my mouth, because I cannot speak about this due to confidentiality issues. So Jose, you have the floor, go ahead please.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay thank you very much Carlos. Dev, you are the following speaker, so Dev you have the floor. Go ahead please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you Jose. This is Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. Just to elaborate further on the selection of the Board member from At Large. I was a member of the Board member selection process committee, or the BMSPC, another acronym that we have to learn. So just to give an overview of the process, the process for selecting the Board Director, sorry, selecting candidates from At Large to be on the ICANN Board, is trying in the ALAC rules of procedures.

I put a link in the chat, and the section is 19, which goes into detail what the procedures are in terms of, well what are the rules governing this process, so what is happened now is the first, as Carlos has said, the BCEC received applications. And the BCEC picked five candidates. The five candidates being Rinalia Abdul Rahim, Sébastien Bachollet, Alan Greenberg, Evan Leibovitch, and Jean-Jacques Subrenat.

And the electorate is the 15 member ALAC committee, and the five RALO chairs from each of the five regions. So the poll for the first round, which is called a preferential instant run off vote. These five candidates are ranked from one to five, and those candidates that are –

the three most preferred candidates are then carried over to the second round, which takes place in Singapore.

There was an email on the ALAC announce mailing list where the chair of the Board Member Selection Process Committee talked about the timing for each of these events, probably won't need to repeat it again. But that is in essence what the process is right now. Thank you.

I just one final comment. I noted some questions in the comments regarding the ALAC – regarding how the ALAC gets its direction. In the ALAC rules of procedure, specifically 19.10.4, which states, and I'll read it for the record, "ALAC members, or any individual selected to replace an ALAC member, for the purposes of the vote, are encouraged to consult with the RALO from their region. But voting however would be undirected, and votes must be cast in the best interests of At Large, the ALAC, and ICANN." So thanks, that is it.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce. Thank you very much Dev for sharing that link for the rules of procedure of ALAC in Spanish. They're saying these roles are the LACRALO area... I mean, in the LACRALO area there are also, we can also find these other roles, so you can see them there too, on the workspace.

Carlos took the floor, Dev did too. So is there anybody else who would like to take the floor regarding these very important elections for [?]. Sergio, I see that you are raising your hand, so please go ahead.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio Salinas Porto speaking. I agree. On the one hand, I would like to say that I fully agree with what Carlos says, with respect to some of the candidates to hold seat number 15 at the Board. And I wanted to express this because this is important in a context where there is a difficult time regarding who are being candidates. I also want to say, with respect to rules and procedures, and whether ALAC members may or may not ask for the opinion of the region, I'm going to try to be consistent with what I have always said since I have joined ICANN.

And even the rules do not say this, a consultation should be requested from the region with respect to what should and what should not be voted on. And even though the rules do not say this, from my own experience, I say this can be very important for a body, Internet users around the world, and even more so at this time.

This is something that the rules do not say this, and Fatima made a comment that I think was okay. I am going to try to read this. I think this is – on which we should go ahead, and this is a good exercise. I would like to celebrate the opening of the comments that the Chair said on this. I think this is something that we should really say. It was good to be able to open this for discussion for all of us. Thank you very much Jose for giving me the floor.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose speaking. It's very good to have your opinion. We apologize. We have very bad audio from Jose. Well, and this is... This actually makes you a leader in the region. I see Fatima in chat has raised her hand, please Fatima go ahead.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking. Can you hear me? We have

JOSE ARCE: We have noise, Fatima, listening to you. We apologize, there is still a lot of noise on the Spanish channel. This is Jose speaking. Fatima, would you like to try and see if this problem can be solved?

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: Fatima speaking now. Well...

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking. Now it has improved a bit.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking again. I'm going to try, otherwise you can just stop me.

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking. So I'm going to try to ask you to speak slowly so that the interpreters can do a better job.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking. I'm going to try. This is Fatima for the record. I wanted to make a very brief comment, with respect what Sergio has just said. I understand and I respect Sergio's position, with respect to

consulting the region. That is why I made a comment on the wiki, even though we are not obliged as ALAC, I think it is important to listen and reach the opinions that the region has on this very important issue for us.

Unfortunately, it is a bit late here. We apologize there is very, very strong noise.

Interpreters apologize there is a very strong and strange noise on the Spanish channel.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Silvia Vivanco speaking. They say that the strange noise comes from one of the AC rooms that is open. So please could you check that?

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you very much Silvia. I don't know if Fatima is listening to me, it seems the problem has been solved.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

Fatima speaking now. I don't know if you could hear that or if I should start again? Interpreters apologize, there is still a very strong noise on the Spanish channel.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking. Well, Fatima is asking if we can dial out to her.

SILVIA VIVANCO: This is Silvia speaking. Of course. We're going to dial out to her.

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking again. In the meantime, I'm going to raise Carlos's comment to see if we can lose some structure here. This is a very tense time and we can also give the floor to somebody else here who would like to make a comment on seat number 15 for the floor. Alberto Soto has just asked for the floor.

Jose speaking. Alberto, you have the floor. It seems Alberto's line has just dropped.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Oh dear.

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking. I see people are getting, are [?] to the AC room again. There is someone whose name is A. Would you please identify yourself?

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto speaking now.

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking. I'm sorry Alberto. I was just saying that somebody connected to the AC room and the name for that person is A. I just want the person to identify himself or herself. So now please go ahead.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Here is my comment. It is good to discuss and to see how things are being done. I would only suggest that we first review the procedures, and in this case, supporting someone who complies with this and that requirements. And those are the requirements that the group who has already studied them has appointed them as a candidate.

That we should read the questions, the answers, that are posted on the wiki. The wiki includes the issues for each of the five candidates. And by rating this, we can see who will appear to what we believe there is an ALAC representative. Even if they... I think Dev said something about this. There maybe someone who may have a conflict of interest who may not be able to include at a certain time.

If we read the – each of the candidacies, we can say what we like and what we don't like for each of those candidates. That if we read all of these applications, we see the generous characteristics, because they have already been selected by a committee. And we just have a look at what are the main issues that are contingent to our region. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking. Thank you very much Roberto. This is Jose for the record. We see Carlos, if Carlos Aguirre, so welcome Carlos to the call. We still need person A to be identified. So we are going to try to see if we can now give the floor to Fatima.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking now. Hello Jose can you hear me? Fatima for the record. I'm going to try to recall what I said before. I was saying that I understand what Sergio states, and I of course respect his opinion, with regards to consulting or not consulting the ALAC members for the seat 15 on the Board. And as a general comment, and not only referring to this issue in particular, now it's a bit late to complain that the new ALAC rules of procedure should say that the ALAC members should consult the region, because this work group has been working for more than a year, that is to modify the rules of procedure.

And there were no members in the region to consider our own interest, which may be different from other RALOs. So that's unfortunately what the rules say. And if we want as ALAC members to respect what the rules say, we should not go and ask the region directly. I just wanted to clarify this, because I know that this goes some confusion in the comments we saw on the wiki, and I hope that with the rules of procedure that we just shared, may be these situations was more clear.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you Fatima. Dev would like to take the floor. Go ahead Dev please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you Jose. This is Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. Just to also clarify the reason for the rules regarding ALAC members, are not – are able to pass their vote without consulting the region. It's not... The general thinking behind this rule, just to give you some idea, is that especially in the second and third round, which are going to happen at the face to face meeting in this case, in Singapore, is not going to be any time really to go back to the region, back and forth between those rounds.

So it's very.... And I think that what has happened is that when we see the final three candidates, it will have some time for the ALAC members involved and the RALO chair to really figure out, well which [?] again, as to who would be the best candidate to be the ICANN Board. So, and I mean, I appreciate again, and I thank Jose for creating the Wiki page. I'm grateful to see some persons commenting on it.

I do want... I would probably also want to say that I wish the timing was spaced out in terms of the time between the candidates were announced and the conference call with the candidates and so forth, but it was a very tough time schedule, and I think we have done the best that we could.

We have had a conference call with the candidates, we were able to ask questions and hear their input on these questions posed by the At Large community. We have also had a wiki space where persons could email their questions to all the candidates, and I see that the candidates

themselves have responded. So there is a lot of material to review and to look at. So that's it.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you Dev. Now Sergio you have the floor.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio Salinas Porto for the record. Two things. First, I insist that even though we only have these minutes to express ourselves, this is a very good beginning and I hope this continues as a practice within our region. And secondly, I want to say that aside from the rules of procedure, or the rules that ALAC may have, even though it is said that this [?] prevent us from taking input from this.

So I just want to reaffirm this in relation to what Fatima has just said. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking again. Thank you Sergio. It seems the echo is back on the Spanish line. While the echo is being solved, I see Alejandro has just logged in. He is one of the first members of the ICANN Board. Alejandro would you like to say something to the region with respect to this very important issue?

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro speaking. Jose can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Yes. Jose speaking. Yes please go ahead.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro speaking again. Thank you Jose. We have some issues listening to Alejandro. I think with respect to the appointment of the person who is going to be a candidate, we need to consider the organization of the succession of the role. The Board member always needs to consider the whole issue. We no longer hear Alejandro. We apologize but Alejandro's audio is choppy.

We also need to consider the representation of the LACRALO members. Of course, this is not very strict representation, and it does need to comply with all the sensibilities of the corporation. This does not prevent any person from making other tasks favoring this region in particular, or favoring the principle that region is striving. In this case, this is a very specific function, and the responsibility is the capacity to represent, which is very limited and it has been proved already by the different candidates in the different discussions.

We apologize, it's very difficult to understand Alejandro. The discussions have been going on for many weeks and we recommended that the vote will be in favor of Jean-Jacques Subrenat, and somebody mentioned the responsibility and the capacity that has been proved [?] of the Board. This is not the case with some other candidates that we have seen, especially in the case of Rinalia whose experience is very limited.

And there is a problem with [?], what is a conflict of interest with respect to the principles of our region defense. And in addition, we have seen that in connection with her activity with the very shallow knowledge of the international relations, and there will be languages and other stakeholders in place, and the level of her presentation that Jean-Jacques does have and she does not have.

Jean-Jacques has been a person that has been absent from the At Large debate. He has been one of the greater [?] documents that has been applauded by the region, this thing with Avrey. And we can say that he has a certain sensitivity. The report on ICANN's roll on the ecosystem, governance ecosystem, and the participation in other [?]...

We apologize, it's very difficult to understand Alejandro. This principles that we believe should govern, is a principle that calls [?] and it looks after the common goal, and is the standard in the sense that there is – it establishes who are the members of the community that ensure all the processes and the administration of the common goals for the benefit of the community, and not as others say, to do things to the detriment of others.

And I perceive that the capacity of the Jean-Jacques has been really proved, and we still need to see what are the capacities of the other participants.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose speaking. Thank you very much Alejandro. We are now going to give the floor to Fatima.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: Hello Jose. This is Fatima speaking. Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Yes, go ahead Fatima, please.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima, sorry I was muted. This is Fatima Cambronero for the record. I would like to correct myself because what I said before is not correct. What I said on my previous comment. One of those subgroups on the rules of procedure was actively working, and at the time, I was a member of ALAC and I wanted to make that correction. And another brief comment I would like to make regarding the previous comment, is that on the wiki page there were many general comments regarding the features, or general directories, feature or criteria, that the candidate should have for seat 15.

Particularly in my case, this statement of directories takes – criteria, was totally intentional because there is no possibility of advancing the vote in the wiki. So that is my comment, that is my clarification. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Fatima thank you very much. Carlos you have the floor, go ahead please.

Jose Arce speaking. Carlos, can you hear me?

Jose Arce speaking. Okay. I don't know if Carlos is connected on the AC room or on the phone. I cannot hear him.

CARLOS VERA: This is Carlos speaking. Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Yes, Carlos, go ahead please.

Jose Arce speaking. Carlos, we heard you not long ago.

Jose Arce speaking. Okay, Carlos. I don't know if you have any audio issue or any problem with your microphone, but we cannot hear you.

Jose Arce speaking. Okay, Carlos. Go ahead please.

CARLOS VERA: This is Carlos speaking. This is Carlos Vera for the record. I was reading Vanda's email, and I think this is very – her statement is very important and reasonable, and she has a good orientation regarding candidates. And it's a good statement to decide on the candidates. I'm concerned about knowing whether it is possible that the candidates or candidate, may know why we are working with that person.

I mean, for that, my current sometimes into a commitment with a region. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Sorry Carlos, I was not able to hear your question. Could you please repeat or rephrase your question?

Jose Arce speaking. Okay.

SILVIA VIVANCO: This is Silvia Vivanco speaking. I see Carlos has typed his question. So if I may...

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. I'm sorry Silvia, my computer froze, so please, go ahead.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco. Carlos says that if a candidate may know why we're voting for him, and what we did to ask him for a commitment with the region. And I do agree with what Vanda said regarding the support that Alejandro is providing or giving to this support of this position. So this is Carlos's comment. So go ahead Jose please.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay. Thank you very much Carlos for your comment and for your question. I see Dev is typing, and I don't know if he is answering or replying to Carlos. Dev, would you like to take the floor?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. This is Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. I just read what Carlos typed asking if the candidate may know who we are voting for and why we do it. I should mention that the votes are all secret in a sense that only the results are disclosed, but not who each person has voted for. I don't know if that is answering what Carlos's comment is about in terms of if the candidate knows that we are voting for. So that's all.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay. Thank you very much Dev for the clarification. Now let's proceed... Let's move forward with our agenda, because we have already devoted plenty of time to this topic, which is a very important topic for the region and I know this deserves further [?], but this is what we have now. This is the time that we can devote right now.

The next item on the agenda has to do with the Brazilian Internet Governance Summit. I don't know if Leon is connected, but please Fatima, let me know who is the other ALAC member who is working on the working group for the Brazil Summit, because I don't see Leon. I don't see Leon connected. So who can provide an update about this?

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima Cambronero speaking. Jose can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Jose speaking. Go ahead Fatima.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking. I typed that on the AC room. One of these members is Olivier, Evan, and Holly.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay thank you very much Fatima. Olivier, if you're on the call, could you kindly provide us with an update? What you are doing in this working group? I mean, if there is any change on the agenda of this working group. Could you please provide an update for that?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Absolutely, yes. Hello everyone. This is Olivier speaking. Can you hear me?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: We can hear you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay. Fantastic. Thank you very much. So, the cross community working group on Internet Governance has been working quite hard to put together a full statements that was then sent over to the Net Brazil meeting organizers. And it's one of the statements, one of the contributions, that the meeting will have.

It was a bit challenging because when you think of the cross community working group, it really is not only ALAC, but all of the other supporting

organizations and advisory committees. And we have very little time to be able to build the statement. We just had a few weeks to build the statements. It was very challenging in that respect, and so unfortunately the statement itself was, it was actually quite what we would say middle of the road.

It doesn't break any new ground. It's nothing special, but on the other hand, it is an accurate statement, and it focuses on two main things. The first one that it focuses on is the fact the – any future work on the evolution of ICANN needs to involve all of ICANN's community. And the other thing that it focuses on is that it is open to discuss the globalization of the IANA function.

That was a statement that was released before the US Department Commerce that the IANA function was to be globalized. So it came quite well in this, but it didn't make any proposition as to how it would suggest a globalization of the function. It just again reiterated the fact that all of ICANN's community needed to be consulted in a fully bottom up and multi-stakeholder fashion.

The statement really focuses on this. It was to be bottom up. It has to be multi-stakeholder. It has to involve everyone in ICANN, that includes also governments, that includes advisory communities, that includes the GNSO, the ccNSO, etc. That's the work that it has done. Now it has prepared for meeting that it will have on Monday in Singapore. It will be a public meeting, so we invite everyone to join. It's likely to happen in the main room.

Some of you may have heard there are some changes to the Monday's schedules, so it is not sure whether the cross-community working group public session will be in the morning or the afternoon. But in that session, it will ask the community if the statement that the working group has drafted is complete. Maybe it has forgotten anything, if there needs to be more messages that would be brought to the next [?] meeting.

And then it will also ask about the future of the cross-community working group. What should work on after the next [?] meeting? What happens next? These are some of the main questions that will be asked. And then there will also be a meeting of the working group itself, just the working group members.

It is an open meeting, but it will be primarily for the working group members on the Wednesday in Singapore, and that's where the working group members will take the feedback that they received on the Monday, at the public session, and they will make decisions and proposals to move forward for the next few months until we go to London.

There is also one thing that still needs to be done by the working group, and this hasn't been done because of the lack of time, and that's to create a charter for itself. A cross-community working group is not a cross-community working group until a charter has been agreed by all of the supporting organizations and advisory committees. Unfortunately, due to the lack of time, and the fact that it has to focus on the input for the next Montevideo meeting, the charter was not finished, and so the

working group will focus on this between the Singapore and the London meeting.

And that's my report. Thank you very much for asking.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay. Thank you very much Olivier for your comment. I see Alejandro Pisanty and I see that there are two other participants that have requested the floor.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro. Olivier has provided a very clear explanation of what the group is doing right now. Alejandro Pisanty speaking. Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Go ahead Alejandro please.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro speaking. Jose, thank you very much for the presentation. Olivier, thank you very much for your comment. I think that on this page any member taking part of this, particularly LACRALO, should focus on two things that Steve Crocker has requested in one of the discussion email list of One Net. And that is to say, we need to pay attention to the topic that is important, and the transition of the NCIA.

I think it is important to take into account that we have some delays regarding the follow up in our participation, because we need to

participate. If we want to participate, we want all of the community to participate, and we need to get organized regarding the way we are going to participate and we need to get organized in terms of accountability as well.

And we need to focus on the important topics for our community, and for all of the stakeholders in the region. So let's try to have a substantive participation, and as I said before, a participation that is oriented to these two important topics. We should be focused on the transition and on surveillance and accountability and transparency.

And we should also focus on the principles that we need to follow, and for that we also need to take into account the review and the analogies we have made for the strategic panel. These are important issues and topics for ICANN. Another important principle is that we have – it is a principle which is [?], and this has to do with a part – or it's a principle that has to do with the fact that all the parts of the system should not block any other part, because everyone should be accountable and everything is inter-related.

But sometimes these parts of a system have efficient characteristics, or are designed in a way that provide the capacity to report, and this is fundamental for us. We have seen a great deal of evolution during the last four years in ICANN, and this capacity should also be given to any mechanism used by us.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose speaking. Thank you very much Alejandro. Carlos, would you like to take the floor?

CARLOS DIONISIO AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre speaking. Everything Olivier and Alejandro has just said is very interesting. I just want to be very brief in my comments. We should not leave aside, and we should not forget, what were the principles that [?] does. And it is not casual to these news that has appeared from the US government, trying to relive the Internet to globalizing.

I think these are a reaction to a call from Net [?]. And I think we should not forget that, and we should not forget what are the principles that call upon these meetings in Brazil. Each of us can make his or her own conclusions, and that is actually my comment. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE: Thank you. This is Jose speaking. Thank you very much for your comment. And if there is nothing else to add, I would like to go through the most important news. Definitely the group and the important stakeholders can lead us to the following item then.

But I don't want to give, open the floor for other people who want to speak. The next item is the update of the group. We have our strategy group, and I know Fatima have been working very strongly within the strategy group. There is a communications group that has asked the list many times to provide help to identify some issues on some Excel sheets.

I really like those sheets because we can identify all of the existing materials in the different languages. So Fatima, I would like you to

remind us if we are okay with the dates or what are the next steps to go ahead.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

This is Fatima speaking. With respect to the communications group, which is divided into three subgroups, one of them is in charge of staff, and this refers to the region website for Latin America and the Caribbean, I think Dev can tell us about progress in that group. And I can talk about the collection of materials in the region, and what are the languages in which those materials exist in our region.

This is what we have done with the group, and I call upon the group members to be more active. And I also want to say that we have an estimated deadline, which was the end of February so that we could identify those materials and to see what were the languages in which those materials were written.

And we also wanted to identify the different stakeholder for those materials. We know that there are more than one stakeholders related to each of them, and focus on each of the different groups. Now for this stage, what follows is to determine what are the materials that we need to create from scratch, and which are the ones that we need to translate to the other ones which are in our region.

Some of them are in Spanish, other ones are all in English, and so this should be the next stage. This is the work in progress. It is not something that is completed because we constantly see new materials appearing in item. And so this spreadsheet will be open, and we will be able to add more material as they come in, and you can also tend them

to the communications group which has a specific mailing list so that we can update them, and we can cater to the needs that we have in the region, especially from the point of view of the users in the different stages.

Now there is a list of questions that has been pressed on the NCIA decision. It's in Spanish and I have sent it to the list, and we will put it on the ICANN website and in different languages, so that it could be reached by all of our regions. That's all from me for the time being.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose speaking. Dev, would you like to take the floor?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

This is Dev speaking. Thank you Jose. Just to add a little bit more about what Fatima... The basic structure of the website has been discussed. We haven't really progressed much through the actual design of it in terms of the actual layout of the page and so forth. But I'm certain after Singapore, I'll be working with mostly Alexandra to get that done, so by the time of the summit, you'll probably see such a sight.

I should also mention the newsletter, it has been completed, and I think the first one went out just last week actually. And I think it was also updated, as Fatima said, with the news of the NTIA decision, sort of like a frequently asked questions. So that part is done. I think that's it. I should mention that we do need more persons to be existing. Myself, and I'm certain Fatima will agree that we are all getting very busy here, so it is kind of hard for us to try to do the workload by ourselves.

So your input is always needed. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose speaking. Thank you Dev. We will now go to the next group, that's Sergio with the dot [?] group. The group by Diego Acosta, who will be the levelling group. I don't know if you want to exchange some ideas maybe on what you have progress on so far.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio Salinas Porto speaking. Thank you Jose. I can refer to the Governance group, or the GTLD group, which are the groups where – I am working with. Diego probably will be able to inform you on the levelling group. I don't know which one you would like to commence with.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose speaking. You can just choose any of them.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is Sergio speaking. Okay. So I'm going to start by the governance group. We have conducted a meeting that was through Skype, and the reason was some of our colleagues could not attend, and so because they could not attend, we prefer not to use ICANN funds and interpretation because they were not needed. So we held that meeting, and we managed to complete some tending issues, including finishing the aim of the work group that was tending and we needed to solve.

We worked on our goals and we managed to get a good result, so we have a primary and a secondary goal posted on the wiki. I don't think... I mean, I'm going to try to be brief because we don't have a lot of time. It doesn't really – all of the goals but I think we did a very good work with a very good input from Fatima, from Alberto Soto, and from Vanda.

We work together very smoothly, and we managed to get a good result. We also received from a subgroup from Vanda Leon, Fatima who works on... I apologize because I'm not very focused. The issue is the operating principle sense, and so we have been working on this, and there was a proposal to start to discuss it within the working group, and once this is defined within the group, and we can start discussing this because discussion will take some time.

We will be able to bring a proposal to the region so that it can be evaluated. But then in principle, those are the new. There was a sub metrics group, and another group dealing with rules of procedure, one is led by Jose and the other one is led by Dev, if I'm not mistaken. And I know very soon we will be able to reach a good end with all of these issues.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose speaking. Sergio, I was not able to participate in the last call, and I would like to know if aside for the delivery for the subgroup, if you have a deadline for the final report.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. We are going to be a bit tight for the deadline for the final report. If we have the possibility, we will try to do it before June, before the London meeting. We will try to have these already discussed within the region. Our first temporary benchmark should be... I mean to reach this before ATLAS II, and this is going to take some time because all of us in the group, we're going to have to work a lot to meet this deadline.

I don't know if this is an answer to your question. We don't really have a metric definition yet, we are expecting to have all of the components there, and we were waiting for you, for Dev, and for Leon. In your case, it was very important you here to discuss the metrics issue, but on the next meeting we will definitely need to find – we need to define deadlines and adjust ourselves to that.

So that is my answer. Is there anybody else who would like to ask another question.

JOSE ARCE: It's Jose speaking. Go ahead, Dev, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you Jose. This is Dev Anand speaking. Just to mention that I've been working on the ALAC metrics, and I was looking more at the technical side of things in terms of trying to simplify as much as possible the ability to retrieve and come up with, to document the metrics in terms of things like meeting attendance and so forth.

I should say that in terms of... I've discovered some ways to try and make it as easy as possible to collect the information, so well, you probably may see some of this during the presentation of ALAC metrics during the Singapore meeting. But I think definitely I would like to then... Well, I don't know when I'll find the time, because I know after the Singapore meeting there is a lot of things happening, especially with the Summit, but well, some of the techniques used for the ALAC metrics can then be used for the RALO metrics.

So that's it.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

This is Sergio speaking. May I go on? Okay. So we also had a meeting with a working group where we are six members who participated. Diego Acosta Bastidas, Jacqueline Morris, Aida Noblia, Aislan Basillo, Dev Anand Teelucksingh, and myself, Sergio Salinas Porto. We are the ones who are on the ccTLD group, and we have been defining the goals issue – we have defined the goals already, so we have progressed a lot.

We have primary and secondary goals. Silvia has just posted the links to each of the group of the working group. That we have mainly defined the goals and these goals, that have metrics, maybe the goal is already defined. There are two issues we are having a look at right now. On the one hand, there is the ccNSO issue with a deadline for June.

I don't know if Jacqueline Morris is there, they have already joined the working group. And there is another group dealing on these ccTLD model for Latin American and the Caribbean area. Aislan Basillo and myself are working on that group. And what we are going to do, if

we're going to have an active [mob?], not just a [mob?] saying that Argentina has the dot R domain, but actually the a map of the situations of how the gTLDs are working in each of the countries.

So that we can have something more concrete. We have also requested the staff, and Gisella Gruber committed to create a mailing list, and we will have our next call on the week of the seventh of April. We'll probably have those meetings, both the ccTLD and the Governance call will happen during that week, and this is because it is important that we have our colleague Dev, who is on both working groups, and we know what it is like to travel, etc.

So we have given the right framework so that both you and Dev can actively participate in these two working groups. In addition, the chair and vice-chair for the working group was chosen, were chosen. Dev will need to accept that he has been elected as VP by all of us, and I am the chair, and this is also related to the next meeting that will happen on the seventh of April, so I don't want to say anything else. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. While we see Silvia has a question for Sergio with respect to the ccTLD group, Diego Acosta says he has some issues, and he is informing the region that the result, and I'm reading, the results of the survey are on the website. I don't know if maybe you can have a link to this. At the time we are on a coordination state, and we're about to define the trainer for the issues identified on all of those inputs.

Is there anybody who would like to ask a question to Diego or to Sergio with respect to these issues? We are running out of time, and we still

have other pending items to deal with on the agenda. The other topic on our agenda is the activities, the LACRALO activities on ATLAS II.

I know Carlos is working, they are working on a newsletter. Carlos, could you please give us an update about this?

CARLOS DIONISIO AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre speaking. We are dealing with the communication working group, within the ATLAS II, we have different subgroups. One of them is our working group, and we have several volunteers from the region. We are coordinating this task with Natalia Enciso and Maricarmen Sequera from Paraguay, we also have as working leaders, Sergio, Franco Moya, Dev of course, and Juan Manuel as well.

So our task there is to produce a newsletter, and we believe that we will put out six newsletters before the ATLAS summit, and once we have the ATLAS, we will release one newsletter a day with all the documents produced during the meeting and comments coming out of the meeting. We're also dealing with the webpage, we're designing the webpage.

I think that tomorrow we will have a call, and tomorrow we will decide the template for the web page. And finally, we are also in charge of the welcome package memorabilia for all of the participants. So, we are proposing ideas to discuss these ideas so that all of the participants attending the meeting will have their souvenir once they get to London.

This is just a brief update. This is what I can tell you. We are working very hard, this is not an easy task. But I think we will get to the objective in time. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Okay Carlos, thank you very much for this update regarding your working group. I urge the other members of the community who would like to become members of this working group, because as I said before, the working group has many activities, and I don't know if you have plenty of members to deal with that amount of work.

So please, if there is anyone who would like to participate in this working group, please let Carlos Reyes know if the working group is already open.

CARLOS DIONISIO AGUIRRE:

Carlos speaking. Yes, of course, the work is open. Tomorrow we have a call, so if you would like to participate, you will be welcome.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Okay. Great. So if there is anyone who would like to participate on that call, you can do it. Okay. Carlos please let us know if there is any member in your working group. Now, let's continue with our agenda. We have very little time. I don't know if we have enough time to deal with all of the topics, otherwise we will keep that item.

We also need to deal with item number seven. We have the group for trusting the document, so I think is already done. We will organize, we will schedule a call with the members of that group so that we can produce a declaration of trust statement and deal with it.

Now regarding item number eight, this is ALAC news. Dev or Fatima would like to take the floor? Or would like to make any comment regarding this item on the agenda, and regarding what ALAC is working on right now.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

This is Fatima speaking. Hello Jose. I had many points to mention regarding on what we have been working on in ALAC. But please, I ask you not to leave this point at the end, we need to deal with this point at the beginning of the agenda, because there are many people who do not participate in ALAC, and it will not learn about this.

So, for the sake of time, I will copy and paste the information on the AC room, and the information regarding the topics we are dealing with and the public comments that are open right now. What I am pasting now, copying and pasting, is what we are working with during last days in February and in March.

So if there are any questions or any doubt or anything that you would like to ask or if you want to get details about this, please let us know on the email list because we don't have time to discuss this topic now. So there you have all of the information pasted on the AC room.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay Fatima, we still have five minutes, so perhaps you would like to take the floor and say something about this. This is one of the most relevant items on our agenda.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: Fatima speaking. I think that will be more relevant that Dev, that he knows which of these are open for public comments. So, Dev, could you please explain that? Would you like to explain that Dev?

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay, Dev, please, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. This is Dev Anand speaking. Well, indeed, I agree with Fatima, I think this needs to be further up in the agenda. Okay. But let's proceed ahead with this. I think some of the – one of the key things in terms of open statements is the input coming from the ICANN strategy panels. There is a wiki page already setup, and I'll place that link, and on that page there are four strategy panels.

One on identifying technology innovation, on ICANN multi-stakeholder innovation, the public responsibilities framework, and ICANN role in the Internet governance ecosystem. So, these four panels had a briefing call in early January, and in mid-February, they received their final report, and these have all been posted for public comment, and this will be the subject of much discussion at the ICANN meeting in Singapore.

One of the other things that also is going to be looked at, is let's see. There are quite a few policies. I would say another one that might be of interest for this region is the ICANN Future Meeting Strategy, and this strategy has also delivered a final – well, I would say a draft final report for public comment.

So we can make comments on this, and then the meeting strategy working group can take that into account and deliver a final report. There is some very interesting suggestions there as to the future of ICANN meetings and to the structure of ICANN meetings. Part of the things that will be happening during the Singapore meeting, and I'm hoping somebody from staff is going to post the actual link to the ICANN Singapore agendas.

I'm going to try to think of two key ones. One of the things would be to look at the – let me see which one. Ah, one of the things that will be looked at amongst will be something regarding the statement that is going to be put out for public comment. And this is with regards to the issue of policy advisory boards for gTLDs. So several members of the ICANN community [?] of public advisory boards, for a substantive generic top level domains that were targeted at regulated industry centers.

And I found the link, and I think I would just have to post the link here. I don't have to discuss every single aspect of this. I think I will stop there. And the At Large policy development page has the list of actual open statements right now. I should also mention, what also will be discussed regarding WHOIS.

I say there is a draft implementation plan for the WHOIS on accuracy reporting system. And that reminds me that one of the topics we'll be discussing with compliance is how the bulk WHOIS reporting tool for inaccurate WHOIS information is submitted to compliance, and how compliance treats those reports.

I believe if you've been following the ALAC list, Garth Bruen has been doing several key issues related to how compliance is dealing with these inaccurate WHOIS reports. I think I'll start there. I would say from the process side of things, there is a lot happening. The Board selection process, the ATLAS II Summit process as well, because there is a lot of work to be done to organize for the ATLAS II Summit in June.

So I think I'll stop there and again, echo Fatima's suggestion that this should be further up in the agenda so we can give more time to it. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Okay. Thank you very much Dev. We are now running out of time. This is the top of the hour, so I would like to thank all of the participants, staff. We will say these are challenging times for the Internet users community. This is my last call as chair, after three years, and I would like to say that in three years I've only missed one call, and I have given the best of myself.

So I would like to thank you all. I would like to thank the ICANN staff and the participants for all of the support, because you have been there to support me to advise me, Dev, Fatima, Carlos, Natalia, I mean, there are many people. This is at least my call, so thank you very much for

your support, and thank you very much for your participation in the different working groups.

I will participate in the working groups, but as an Internet user. I wish the best to Sergio. He will have a very important challenge. He will face interesting challenges, so thank you very much once again. And thanks to the interpreters. See you next week.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]