SINGAPORE – At-Large - NARALO Monthly Meeting
Monday, March 24th 2014 – 07:00 to 08:00
ICANN – Singapore, Singapore

UNIDENTIFIED:	Okay. This is the interpreter, translating into the English channel. Can you hear me on the English channel? This is English into English. This is the Spanish interpreter in the Spanish booth speaking into English. Can you hear me?
	This is English channel checking audio from the English channel.
UNIDENTIFIED:	And now English, okay. This is the English/Spanish booth speaking English. And now, who is checking? Somebody over there? Can you hear me? Nobody saying anything, or waving, no. Hi. Hello. This is the Spanish/English booth and I am speaking in English. It's clear. Hi. Can you hear me? It's okay. Okay.
GARTH BRUEN:	I would like to get started in about four minutes. If everybody could get whatever they needed to get and sit down.

[PERSONAL CONVERSATION – OPEN MIC]

GARTH BRUEN:	Soon as Eduardo is seated, we'll get started. If staff is ready?
	If everyone is ready? And staff can begin the meeting? Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED: Recording on please.

GARTH BRUEN: Good morning. This is Garth Bruen, chair of NARALO. Welcome to the NARALO monthly meeting here at the ICANN meeting in Singapore. Meeting number 49. If we could quickly have the secretary, Glenn McKnight, review the agenda for today's meeting. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Good morning everyone. Glenn McKnight for the record. We have an item here, reviewing of our action items, but we don't have it on the list today unfortunately. We're going to be 3.1, the tour in alternative DNS. 3.2, the accessibility taskforce; 3.3, other sessions of interest. We will be discussing in CROPP; 4.1, the updates in recruitment; 4.2, new recommendations; 4.3, municipal gTLD application group; five no NARALO spotlight today is beside me, Anthony Niiganii, he'll be speaking about tele-communities an ALS with us.

Six is community is working group records, ALS business, ICANN functions and ongoing compliance issues, domain hijacking and other business. Thank you.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. This is Garth Bruen again. If we could have a quick roll of the room, and then all of the remote participates. Let's start with Senor Eduardo Diaz.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Eduardo Diaz from ISOC Puerto Rico, present.

LOUIS HOULE: Louis Houle, ISOC Québec.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Evan Leibovitch, ALAC member, Canadian Association for Open Source.

ANTHONY NIIGANII: Anthony Niiganii, from Winnipeg Manitoba. I'm part of the mentorship program.

GARTH BRUEN: Garth Bruen. NARALO chair.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ullrich, ICANN staff.

ARIEL LIANG: Ariel Liang, ICANN staff.

ALAN GREENBERG: Alan Greenberg. ALAC member and unaffiliated NARALO member.

EN

CHRIS: Chris [?], [?] ISOC.

RON SHERWOOD: Ron Sherwood. Dot VI. I'm the liaison to ALAC from the ccNSO. Alan has invited me to be an individual member of this NARALO. I'm not sure whether he meant it.

GARTH BRUEN: Which VI are you from?

RON SHERWOOD: That is the ccTLD dot VI which is in the U.S. Virgin Islands.

GARTH BRUEN: This is the U.S. Virgin Islands. That's what we were looking for, British or U.S., because that makes all the difference. Welcome.

RON SHERWOOD: Thank you. That's a long way to go.

GARTH BRUEN: We've actually, as part of our recruitment efforts which we will go into, we've been trying to find some groups within the Virgin Islands that we can contact, and I've just been having a little bit of difficulty finding some groups, so maybe you can help me out with that. Thank you.

Okay. We are here in Singapore, where it is 7:16 AM and the sun is just coming up. And we've already had a very, very interesting action packed ALAC Sunday yesterday. It was a very, very long, long busy day, and there is quite a few quotable moments from the day. Let me ask staff quickly, do we know when the recording will be available and posted for yesterday's session?

HEIDI ULLRICH: This is Heidi. I believe it should be ready. Let me just follow up with Gisella and we'll get back to you.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. That would be wonderful. So some things that are coming up during the meeting. Today we are going to have a special session that was recommended and developed by At Large on TOR and alternate DNS. And these are subjects which have not really been discussed at ICANN meetings as of yet, in public sessions.

There certainly have been various private discussions about them. The Security, Stability, Advisory Committee has issued some reports about these topics, but I feel like the community needs to discuss it out in the open, and we need to have a robust dialogue about it, and people need to know more about these topics.

We're also going to have a meeting today with the Accessibility Taskforce. This is also something that has been driven from At Large, in very much from within our ranks and NARALO. We want very, very much to reach out to the disabled community and ensure their

representation, make sure that they have the access, at least the quality of access, that is promised by ICANN.

If ICANN wants to have everybody on the Internet, and have one Internet that everybody shares in, we need to make sure that we reach everybody. And I personally met, and many of you know, with a blind user group in Massachusetts. And they have some fascinating, innovating ways of using the Internet. And one of the things that I want to propose, and hopefully we can get done, maybe even we can nail this down at this meeting, I mean not this, NARALO meeting this morning but while we're in Singapore, is to have someone demonstrate the blind technology with the Internet in London at the summit.

And hopefully this can be a keynote presentation. So, excuse the pun, the rest of the Internet community can see how blind people use the Internet. I think that this would be very important and we can all learn from it. We of course also want to reach out to everybody with disabilities, different kind of disabilities, and the blind community is just one.

We should also note, and this is important, that one of the original architects of the Internet, of the early ARPNET, Ken Harrenstien, is completely deaf. He no longer works for ICANN, he worked for the organization that preceded ICANN, but I'm hoping to have him appear at the Los Angeles ICANN meeting because he does live in the LA area. I've been encouraging Steve Crocker to reach out to him and have him give a presentation at the LA meeting.

And I think that if we can keep this going where we actually have people at ICANN meetings with disabilities showing us how they use the

Internet, we can all benefit from it, and it would give them the chance to experience the meetings as well. There are a number of other sessions going on this week in Singapore, actually later today at 12:15, we have the ALAC and ccNSO meeting here in this room.

Then even later on C-W-G on Internet governance, that's not in – oh, that's a different room, Padang. In this room, at 2:00, as I mentioned, accessibility taskforce. Later on, at 3:00, At Large roundtable registration, directory services, that's the EWG, this is the different discussions about the way the Internet should be functioning in the future, and among that is the expert working group replacement or enhancement for WHOIS, whatever you want to call it.

And then of course, there is the At Large and TOR discussion, TOR and alternate DNS discussion later on. Then at 6:00, we have the At Large leadership with the GAC, also in this room. So another very, very busy day. Does anybody else have anything coming up that they want to mention? Alan? Please. I mean, I'm sorry, Evan.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Thanks. This is Evan. Although I don't remember the exact time and date, I want to draw everyone's attention to another session. It's a cross-community session on consumer metrics. It's relevant because one of the things that At Large has been pushing forward is related to the TOR and DNS session, in the sense that one of the things At Large has been driving, both through the TOR session and the consumer metrics, is trying to make sure that ICANN is aware that when we're talking about consumer trust and choice, this is not simply between different TLDs.

But literally between domain names and other ways for consumers to get at information. So this is related to TOR and DNS alternatives. And also it means that when we're talking about getting ICANN to measure the success of the program, that this is not just saying, well, are there more TLDs than there were? Or is there more choice? Well, that's kind of obvious. Far less obvious is the question of, is consumer confusion from the expansion of the TLDs actually causing more confusion and driving people away from the DNS and domain names in general?

That's a question that has been very, very resisted by some corners of ICANN, and At Large has been very, very insistent in making sure that this is part of the equation. So there will be a session later this week on the consumer metrics working group, and I invite everybody to please listen. Thanks.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. I mean, these are interesting topics conceptually and market wise and policy wise. The Internet runs on numbers, at its core, and the domain name system is a layer, it's technology that sits on top of the numbers that makes them easier for us to access and it's an improvement over just using numbers. And what we've developed, or what technology has developed since, is almost like a third layer, you know? We have Google, Facebook, every kind of portal which then sort of sits on top of domain names.

And people look at Internet content without using domain names except for the single domain name that they're using as a portal to get the rest of the content. So, I mean, and these are all serious questions

about, how much time should we spend talking about domains? Or are they even going to be important eventually?

And should we think about things differently? Any other intercessions? Yes, Alan, please.

ALAN GREENBERG: I just want to make a little follow on comment on that one. One of the curious things is we talk about it as if less confusion is better than more confusion. Yet people we know very often, and are almost forced to by current browser design, pick search engines, which by definition… Here is a bunch of confusing ones, pick the one you think is best. And often you don't first time around.

The psychology there is not well understood is all I'm saying. The answers aren't always intuitive.

GARTH BRUEN: Any other intersessions? No? Okay. All right. We will move on. Next agenda item is number four, outreach and CROPP. You know what I just realized is that in the roll call we forgot to say who was on the remote, who is remotely connected. Yeah in this session.

Yeah I heard a few different voices, just can't… All right. Okay, thank you. We'll come back to it, but if the remote participants do have a question, if they do wish to speak, please let yourself be heard in the chat, and we'll make sure that you get, you get it. Okay. All right. Okay. Thank you. Okay. Good.

Agenda item four, outreach and CROPP. These are some of our very, very aggressive efforts to expand interest in At Large and expand At Large membership. And these efforts so far have been very, very successful, and we're going to have an update on some of our recruitment. We want to talk about what CROPP is so everybody understands, and what some of our membership have used CROPP for.

And just recently, Glenn McKnight and Evan Leibovitch just returned from a CROPP trip before coming to Singapore. So I'm going to turn it over to you to discuss CROPP a little bit. Thank you Glenn.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. I'll be really quick. We had a very successful event. It's a non-for-profit event that's called NTEN in Washington. We managed to do a birds of a feather, which is a discussion, it was an impromptu session because the CEO of PIR was talking about the new gTLD program, at the morning session, so we had a session talking to not for profits of the importance of dot NGO.

We also, Evan and I and Andrew Mac, were on non for profit radio, talking about ICANN and the gTLD program. We saw over 100 booths, 2,200 delegates. We gave out hundreds of brochures, and also the NomCom brochures. So I'll turn to my colleague to add anything else. Evan?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: No. We just, we made the rounds, but actually I find that there is actually [?] person outreach in the opposite direction. Just as we were finding potential ALSs, we actually need to become part of this group,

and encourage ALSs to be part of this group.   NTEN is an association of technology people from nonprofits around the U.S.

There is a smattering of Canadian involvement as well, but it's a very useful organization. I can't think of an ALS that would not benefit from participation in this.   There was too many sessions that were good, many at the same time. In terms of getting more aware about IT issues, obviously, DNS and domain name issues are some of it, but it's a very, very good place.

I would encourage At Large ALSs, and in fact, we're going to encourage ICANN itself to probably be more involved in this association. There is ongoing recruitment both ways, I think, is actually going to be useful here. Thanks.

GARTH BRUEN: All right. So, I mean, as I wrote to the list yesterday and on Skype, the recent turn of events with the Department of Commerce planning to release the contract, and the world looking to the global community to provide leadership and guidance and policy development, it is more important than ever that we in At Large reach the entire Internet community, and use our access to do this right, and make sure that ICANN stays on course.

In the last month, we have received four additional ALS applications, and we have many groups that I've spoken to directly who are going to, at their Board meetings, their upcoming Board meetings, going to discuss the application or maybe apply soon. As I mentioned before,

one of the groups is the visually impaired and blind vision group, VIBUG. They've submitted an application.

We also have the Internet Society for Disabilities and Special Needs chapter, based in Washington, D.C. They submitted an application. We have the Open Media Canada… [CHINESE] …the channels on the Internet and making sure that free speech is preserved, and that people have access to information and have access to post-information. They have submitted an application.

And then we also have Native Public Media, which is in the U.S., a Native American group that focuses on broadcasting Native American content not only through the radio but also on the Internet. And of course, as anybody knows, radio is transformed by the Internet, and radio content is available globally on the Internet in a way that it never was before, unless you had a short wave radio, and even if you had a short wave radio you could probably only listen to something on the other side of the planet for about an hour each night.

Now you can listen anywhere at any time. Some of the other groups that we have met with and spoken with directly, is the American and Soma Community College. They're very interested. And we don't have anybody from America Soma, I mean this is one of the major areas that I wanted to focus on in our recruitment areas, is reaching the farthest corners of what is North America. While Soma is way, way out there, it's not even the furthest place out there.

There are even further places that are technically under U.S. governance, and Palau is one of those. Palau is actually technically in Asia, but it is a U.S. commonwealth. So we want to make sure that

everybody has the same access, and everybody has access to At Large. We've also been in discussions with the Better Business Bureau in the United States.

I've had several discussions with the National Sexual Violence Resource Center in the United States. They're very, very concerned about sexual assault material on the Internet, and people's privacy being exposed on the Internet without their permission. This is something that is going on more and more and more. They're very interested in getting involved.

You also have the Online News Association. They're also going to put this to a vote at their next Board meeting. These people represent online journalists throughout the world. And they're very, very concerned about the way that journalists are being treated throughout the world. One of the topics that has come up since we've been here is the ban on Twitter in Turkey.

Especially considering Turkey now has an ICANN outpost. So, if we want to live up to this idea of being a global community, we truly have to be a global community and do what we can to help people. We've also got, I see on here we have highlighted the [?] in [?]. Is that you Eduardo?

EDUARDO DIAZ: This is Eduardo for the record. The Institute of what?

GARTH BRUEN: [Spanish]

EDUARDO DIAZ: Oh. They said they sent their application finally.

GARTH BRUEN: No, no, no. I'm asking you. I haven't seen that application.

EDUARDO DIAZ: No, okay. This is Eduardo again. I have been working with this group for about a couple of years, just to come, you know, trying to get them more with ICANN. They're just, you know, part of the engineering profession and college. They have – they are divided by institutes and I have been trying to get them involved with that. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I would like to add, I was [?]… Glenn McKnight for the record. When we were in Washington, Ariel took us out for lunch and Evan and I are grateful of that, but we did meet with Joe who works with Chris Modini for outreach for North American. And he wants to do the table tops at universities. Very interesting connecting with you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: This is Eduardo for the record. Yes, I did Skype with him.

GARTH BRUEN: Okay. And then… So Joe is on the call. Does Joe want to speak or text us something? I'm sorry, what was that Charlie? Okay. Doesn't have a MIC, okay. All right. Well text away, and then when the text appears, we'll make sure that it gets read out. We also have contact with the

Consumer Counsel of Canada, I believe, that Glenn you had a phone call with them? Can you brief us on that?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yeah, they're very excited. They think it's… Their membership is very keen on getting involved with us, and we're hoping to be part of a Canadian Internet forum in the fall with us as well. But they will be sending in an application.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you Glenn. This is Garth Bruen, Chair again. We also… Was it… It was Monique [?]. Louie? Do you know anything?

LOUIS HOULE: Yes. She's been added a few names. Connect Québec, Accessibility Web, and a few other ones we've been discussing that together. We will tend to outreach those guys that we already know. Some more news to come, and also get in touch with the rest which is an education and technology center that is serving Internet since its inception in Québec.

                          And many members can be, well groups could be [?] tomorrow morning, so some outreach to do on that. Thank you.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you Louis. It's Garth Bruen again, Chair. So, do we also… Murray, are you in the chat room? Are you able to speak? No? I was hoping that Murray would be able to give us an update on his

EN

recruitment activities. No MICs? Okay. That's fine. But if you have anything, feel free to text it and we'll get it read in the room.

So these are the groups that we have had applications from, or we have had direct contact with. We have over 60 groups that are on the list who have received recruitment letters from myself, and we'll continue to follow-up with them. I mean, this is hard work, but the hard work pays off. And that we get these people at the table and we're all going to benefit because of it.

And I want to have diversity, not just for having diversity sake, but then when you have different people, you get different ideas and different solutions to problems. Yes? Oh, Charlie. Okay. Did you want to read it. Oh, are you on the line? Can you ask your question?

I'm sorry, if you can text the name of that group that would be wonderful. It was hard to hear what you're saying Charlie. So, also, a recommendation from Tom Lowell, he wants to create a working group of different municipal gTLD applicants. People who have applied for new gTLD strings that represent different communities around the world.

In order to support Tom's efforts, I'm reaching out to the cities in the United States, and I don't know if there are any Canadian ones. Are there any Canadian municipal applicants? No, okay. But we have, in the United States, we have dot Boston, we have dot Vegas… NYC is already a member, well, yeah, sort of. And dot Miami. So I'm going to be reaching out to them.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Sorry, Garth. This is Evan. I don't know if this would be applicable, but dot LA which is actually a cc code…

GARTH BRUEN: No. The government of Laos, I believe, wants their TLD back, I think. Yeah. Anyway. So these are some of the efforts that we're working on, and we're making really good progress. As part of these efforts, we've also been reaching out to our Native American communities, or Indigenous, First Nations, go by many different names. And we have with us, we have the pleasure, we have Anthony with us, who is going to tell us about his ALS and his work. Welcome to the meeting and thank you very much.

ANTHONY NIIGANII: Great. Thank you. Once again, my name is Anthony Niiganii, and I'm one of the recruits in the ICANN pilot mentorship program. So this is my first meeting. It's a great honor to be here, and to be able to talk a little bit about the work that I'm doing. When… I work for the Manitoba E-Association in Winnipeg Manitoba. We're a not for profit organization that facilitates the adoption of innovative e-solutions in collaboration with individuals, communities, organizations, and businesses.

Next slide please. And so when we do our work, we work with the people. We ask them to come to us. And one of the programs that we do annually run is a youth internship program. Industry Canada used to run what was known as the Community Access Program, and part of that program was the Community Access Program Youth Internship, which is now known as the Youth Internship Program.

And part of this program is to give youth experience in working in technology, teaching technology as well as gaining valuable, employable skills. And as part of that program, at the end of their term, they submit a success story, and I've shared one of the success stories on the screen up there. And this year, for the first time, I've incorporated a piece that I call e-stories, which I'll touch on a little bit later.

And so this internship, this year, we work with over 23 sites throughout Manitoba and employ over 43 youth. And each youth gains so many valuable skills and experience that they can take back with them, into the workforce, or move on into the technology field that is of interest for them. Next slide please.

And some of you are already familiar with this project, The Road We Travel. I do believe my [?] colleague Darlene did a presentation on this project that we did a couple of years ago. In this project, I was able to submit two stories. One story in particular is people with disabilities in technology. So using social media for those that live with complex disabilities and are sometimes isolated in their own home.

In particular, for my wife, she has a severe form of arthritis, so she is sometimes confined just to our one room at the home. And I had to find a way to help bring her out of that and be able to connect with other people. And we started out with movie streaming sites. This kind of helped pass the time when she is in pain and the inflammation is high, and so she was able to spend some time just watching movies.

After a while, that kind of became a little tedious for her, and so then we progressed to the next level, which is interaction on streaming movie sites. And so she started interacting online with people as they

watched movies with broadcasters who broadcast movies in genres that she really enjoyed to watch. And so as she became more and more involved in that, she started to connect with other people who were in the same chat rooms, living with the same type of disability.

So in essence, she started to become part of community that started to connect as a result of social media and live streaming movies. This really helped her, because being isolated at home, and you're not able to connect or talk with anyone or go out in public, she was able to make a community and connect with the community online. To the next point, which was she came across a lady in Texas, who started a project called The Faces of Anklylosing and Spondylitis. And as a result of that project, this lady, her name is Cookie, gathered 1,000 stories over two years, of people living with AS, Anklylosing and Spondylitis, which is the most severe form of arthritis.

And so, in the story, I talked about the benefits of social media for people with disabilities, and the value it has in helping them maintain a healthy lifestyle. Though they cannot physically connect with people, they are able to reach out virtually and find somebody that understands what they're going through. Next slide.

And so a little bit about what tele-communities are. I'm relatively new to tele-communities, and it's exciting to see that the [?] Canadians are able to participate in community based communications and electronic information services, but promoting and supporting local community network initiatives. Now the beauty of being part of tele-communities is Manitoba-E is limited to the province that we work in based on our mandate. Same thing with my colleague Darlene Thompson and NCAP.

She is limited to the territory that she lives in. So by connecting with tele-communities, we're able to extend the reach of our mission beyond our boundaries through partnerships and collaborations. So over the next year, I'm looking forward to connecting more with the tele-communities, community and see what kind of projects we can come up with.

So I'm looking forward to seeing what evolves over this next year. Next slide please. I touched a little bit on Youth Internship about e-stories. New technology is changing the way we film. It's enabling us to get fresh new images and tell brand new stories. Within the [?] community, we are an oral based traditions, means we did not have any written form of communication historically, so we shared stories.

We are storytellers.   And it is through stories that we transmit knowledge, wisdom, blessings to the future generation.   Technology now allows us the ability to capture our stories, to share our stories, and to extend our wisdom to the next generation as well as add to the library of oral tradition that can be preserved, over time, through the use of technology.

So e-stories takes the age old process of storytelling and combines it with 21st century technologies to create a story that somebody can share with the globe. Now just within our communities now, we are able to extend to the global community.   And e-stories can be in whatever format that they choose, whether it be a video, a PowerPoint, a narrative picture show. It has so much value for them.

And as the [?] community begins to see the value of technology, we're starting to see that now is a perfect opportunity to start bringing them

into the ICANN fold. And in order to do that, we need to listen to their stories and hear what they're saying, because it is through their stories, that they'll be able to provide the perspective of the world around them.

Next slide please. And one example in the stories that we collected in Darlene's project is, this young man, his name is Derek. And he is a very close friend of mine. And he found a way to start preserving aboriginal languages by using apps. Developing language apps. He took the app development and created a workshop for youth to learn how to develop apps, and then started to show people that they can preserve, transmit, document their languages through technology.

And he started this app in 2010, and I was excited to see that again. Now, he has extended his reach, not just in Canada, but into the American tribes, and we're working with them in Las Vegas to start creating apps. And youth are starting to learn how to be part of the e-commerce. They create their own apps and start to generate revenue through e-commerce.

Next slide please. And so, as you can see, Derek is an entrepreneur, and he's a very successful technology entrepreneur. He sees the value of it and wants to share that value with the youth and our future generations, and create leaders in the technology field, specifically in the mobile apps. Next slide please.

And so with that, in my language, we say… Which means thank you to each and every one of you.

[APPLAUSE]

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you so much Anthony. That's great. The kind of work that your friend is doing is exactly what we need to hear more of. Those are the kind of projects that we want to hear about that people are using innovative technology to do these things. When I was a kid, my father told me about a project to save dying languages around the world. That just captured my imagination. That was 30 years ago. And we need to bring that stuff here to At Large. Did you have a point Evan? Yeah.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Sorry. In addition to helping [?] and NARALO, Tony, I've got a question for you that is very, very ICANN specific in what you can bring into the organization. There is a lot of focus within ICANN on trademarks, on names and reservation of names, and appropriation of names. And I don't know if this is something that has been a concern of yours until now, but one that has been brought to the attention of ICANN previously by other countries First Nations, is the fact that conventional Western concepts of trademark and intellectual property, are not necessarily totally compatible with a lot of First Nations concepts of how do you use names, how you pass names down, and how – and the ethics of the appropriation of names.

And in fact, that there is a lot of… One of the proponents of that, his name is [?], from New Zealand, who I don't know if it's shared in your community, but he was saying was amongst the Maori, there was a big concern that there were names that were being improperly appropriated, but because the communities there did not do trademark registration of their common names, there was a concept of

conventional wisdom that was passed down from elders to the community.

And it was done this way, and conventionally frameworks weren't used, and because of that, ICANN wasn't recognizing us in the same way that it was recognizing trademarks and other things when it was talking about well, do you have name collisions? Are you appropriating names? And so on. Is this something that's of interest to you? And I say that because within the ICANN specific interests, this is going to be…

There is a very, very big gap of knowledge here. [?] was on ALAC, he has come back, but this kind of voice, this kind of perspective is absolutely lacking in this organization.

ANTHONY NIIGANII: Yeah, that's a big question. And it's something I would have to go back to the communities to find out what they want to do, because each Indigenous group has their own languages. And within their languages, there is also multi-cultural. So when we talk about, say, one word, like my last name, Niiganii, is translatable of three of the aboriginal languages of Manitoba.

And each language is so unique, but the meaning is the same, when it's translated into the language. So, looking at possible name collisions, I can see that happening, but it can also be communities looking at very specific ways to trademark the name within their dialect. So we would have to leave it up to the specific dialect as to how they would like to approach that.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. We'll leave it at that. Going forward, we'll probably need to see how ICANN mechanisms like the UDRP can cope with this kind of thing, or not.

GARTH BRUEN: Okay. Moving along, but thank you so much, this is an important discussion. Want to go to Eduardo and then Louie for a quick working group updates, ATLAS, and then NonCom. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you. This is Eduardo for the record. In the ATLAS groups, things are moving along very well thanks to the help of many people that are collaborating. And just when I was aware of two ATLAS meetings this Wednesday, Glenn is talking in one of them. He is in charge of the coordinating the Fayre of Opportunities. So I encourage you to come and bring your ideas and get involved. Anthony, please, yourself. Thank you.

LOUIS HOULE: Louis Houle for the record. So the NomCom has been meeting in February. You just probably all received report card a few hours, or a few days ago. Still on the same line, we are – the subcommittee, the bylaws subcommittee is still working on two different issues. The first one is [Dan Pot?] representation on the NomCom. And the second one is two year terms for the members of the NomCom being taken into consideration.

The fact that during the first year, NomCom members are building experience and one year term is considered as being not sufficient. The SOI revision subcommittee has terminated its work, which could be, will be probably discussed in a couple of hours from now, during the NomCom meeting today. So that's it.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you very much. We also have the surprise pleasure of having ISOC Colorado represented here at the meeting. Do you have interesting projects, anything you want to relate to the group? We'd love to hear about it.

UNIDENTIFIED: No I apologize, I don't have anything prepared, and we really don't have anything to mention right now.

GARTH BRUEN: That's okay because we don't have any time. I'm going to go right to ALAC. Alan and Evan, do we have any ALAC business?

ALAN GREENBERG: There is an election going on. There are so many things going on in ALAC, I don't think I want to try to excerpt on the fly. We're working on a bunch of statements, many small but I think, that are important. The one that's still in place, the ATRT comment that is, I think, is of crucial importance. I mean, I sat on the ATRT, so I have some inside information, or in depth information, perhaps is the right word.

We made a bunch of recommendations that are going to be A) difficult to implement; B) controversy, controversial and have gone unnoticed but won't go unnoticed, they're going to be implemented, and they have heavy impact on groups such as ours. Specifically, focusing on making sure we get involvement from people who aren't paid to be here. Involvement from people whose languages are different and things like that.

I think the more positive comments we can elicit on these kinds of things, the more likely, the more difficult it's going to be to squirm out of it, if I may be blunt. So, but there is lots of stuff going on. I didn't come prepared to summarize them. I'm sure I haven't done justice.

GARTH BRUEN: Evan, anything?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Thanks. So I'll try to be quick about this. But in my mind, probably one of the hottest topics that At Large is advancing, has to do with the public interest commitments component of the TLD program. At Large, general dissatisfaction, in fact, coming to the point that they're generally useless. We have put out a public comment period, only the third in the history of At Large, that is currently out for public comment. What is significant about this is this is a concept that has been put forward to the Board for comment, the Board rejected it, the community has come back and ALAC has now put this out for public comment anyway.

I think this is a significant test of the bottom up process within ICANN, and to see whether or not something that is resisted at the top but pushed from the bottom actually has a chance of succeeding. So, this is something that is going to be interesting to watch. There is a lot of work that has been done so far. There is a session on it happening it here, and I encourage NARALO to keep following it. Thanks.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you Evan. Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG: There is an underlying aspect of this which normally Evan doesn't like me to mention but I will anyway. It's not clear what is being put out for comment is being proposed is going to fly for a whole bunch of reasons. It would be nice if it did. On the other hand, even if it doesn't, it has refocused the issue on the poverty of the pic design and the pic implementation.

And hopefully this kind of activity, and bottom up is one of the few things that is truly bottom up, hopefully will go at least partway if not a long way to address the issue. So we're really hoping that it doesn't just sit there and die and three people make a comment saying yeah. Nothing we can do about it. I don't think comments from our side are going to change the situation a lot.

We've already moved heaven and earth to get the comment put out there, but it should be interesting to watch.

GARTH BRUEN: Okay. Thank you Alan. Garth Bruen. Just to be clear on what the issue is, is it that the pics as written maybe unenforceable? Is that what the major problem is?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: It's way too complex to even begin to demonstrate in the rest of this meeting. Certain parts of the pic that are built into the agreement, and those seem to have some teeth to them but there is a concept of optional pics that are meant to serve the community that is being addressed by the TLD, that's where the problems lie.

And by the way, Chris I've noticed that you have had some comments on the issue, so I want to talk to you off line afterwards to see if we can address them.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. Garth Bruen. This does… Chris, you have something to say? No? Okay. This does roll into the next topic which does concern the ongoing compliance issues. We're dealing with an issue about WHOIS, and whether or not the WHOIS provisions of the contract are either enforceable, or not being enforced properly. I mean, this is an ongoing thing that we spend a lot of time discussing yesterday.

The other topic, it concerns the UDRPs and whether or not the UDRPs are enforceable, and whether they've been enforced properly. This is also an ongoing issue and we're still digging up information. This is going to be very, very interesting. But I want to keep analyzing this and collecting all of these cases. And another topic that I really want to crack open is domain hijacking. Because this is something that is a

direct relationship between ICANN and the domain customer. And what I keep hearing over and over again, from people who have had their domains hijacked, is ICANN dismisses the complaints as a registrar customer service issue, which is not covered by the contract.

To me, I think it's much more serious than that, and there are a lot of things that ICANN can be doing. Sometimes it does concern a very, very specific violation of the contract. And a complainant should not be turned away just because they don't understand the issues. So we're going to be developing the agenda around this. So, moving on to any other business as we start running out of time.

There is just one thing that I want to address… What's that? There is one thing that I want to address with staff and that's just a clarification about translations and the elections. We had said last year that we wanted to make sure that all of our election information was in English, Spanish, and French. And then there was a question that came back that well, if we get the actual wording of the election early, we can translate it. And I just want to clarify, what I'm looking for is the standard language that goes along with all of the election emails that's the same every time, especially instructions on how to vote, should be in English, French and Spanish.

And then in terms of the elections themselves, we pretty much have the same election every year for the same officer slots. So I think that all we have to do is swap up the names, many times, and we don't have to worry about changing the actually wording. And so that language, which can be in English, French, and Spanish, you know, static. So that's really what I want to focus on.

If we need to deliver specific messages to people in Spanish and French, we can handle that ad hoc. I'm just talking about the standard instructions, and I hope that's clear.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah, thanks Garth. This is Heidi. Yeah, we can certainly go ahead and do that. Just the standard language, if there are only two people running against each other, it will be standard. But if there will be others, if there is like, it's a preference vote, if there are more than that, we need to change. But yeah, we can do that.

GARTH BRUEN: I know. This recent election cycle has been incredibly complicated, and it hasn't been easy for anybody. Glenn has also raised an issue concerning the timing of the elections this year. That the elections are going to come right after, or they're going to be going on during ATLAS. Glenn just wants to know if there is wiggle room to change the timing of the election. I personally don't think it's necessary.

I think that we should just stick to the normal schedule, maybe Glenn has a comment about it.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yeah, sorry about that. Yeah, I just noticed that I have not organized the ALAC election, just going back to the previous one. Darlene has done them in the past. So I noticed that the email communication went out in June, because of the ATLAS event, we're going to be pretty swamped. I just want to know if we have to do any procedural

notification for this election. Whether we should do it before, or after ATLAS.

I'm just bringing that to the table for discussion.

GARTH BRUEN: This is Garth Bruen. I'm wondering maybe if we can do it in July or if that violates our procedures at all. Alan? Yes.

ALAN GREENBERG: I don't believe it violates our procedures, although I have to check. The pressure last time was to name the ALAC members, the replacement ALAC members in time prior to the nominating committee naming theirs. And this is a year where there is a North American NomCom person being named.

You know, quote, so they can balance diversity and whatever. I personally find it somewhat of a red herring. But we may or may not be bound by it, I don't know.

GARTH BRUEN: Okay. Thank you. Before I close the meeting, under any other business, do we have any other business? Eduardo, por favor.

EDUARDO DIAZ: This is Eduardo. I just… So what's the result of the election in question? I'm not sure… Oh, we don't know. Okay. Thank you.

GARTH BRUEN: Still open for discussion. Okay. Staff has noted an action item for it to be checked. Thank you. Any other business? Going once, going twice… Anything from the chat rooms? Anything from our remote participants? Ariel, anything from the remote participants? Okay, okay. Thank you very much. Thank you for attending the meeting. Enjoy the rest of your week. Bye-bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]