
GISELLA GRUBER:

Thank you, Silvia.

Good morning, good afternoon and good evening to everyone on today's LACRALO monthly call on Monday, 20 January 2014 at 23:00 UTC.

On the Spanish channel today, we have Jose Arce, Sylvia Herlein Leite, Adrian Carballo, Raul Bauer, Aislan Vargas Basilio, Carlos Aguirre, Aida Noblia, Johnny Laureano, Alberto Soto, Marcelo Telez, Sergio Salinas Porto, Antonio Medina Gomez, Fatima Cambronero, Diego Acosta Bastidas, Leon Sanchez.

On the English channel, we have Dev Anand Teelucksingh, Olivier Crépin-Leblond, Carlton Samuels, and Cintra Sooknanan. Cintra and Carlton may only be on the Adobe Connect.

We have apologies noted from Humberto Carrasco, Natalia Enciso, and Alfredo Lopez.

From staff today, we have Silvia Vivanco and myself, Gisella Gruber. Our interpreters are Sabrina and Veronica.

Could I please remind everyone to state their names when speaking, not only for transcript purposes but also so to allow the interpreters to identify you on the other language channel. Thank you very much, and over to you, Jose.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you. This is Jose Arce for the record. Thank you and welcome, everyone, to the first LACRALO call this year. So happy new year, everyone. Happy new year to the participants on the Spanish channel, on the English channel, Silvia, Gisella, staff.

Happy new year, everyone. I hope that this year is full of blessings, full of projects, personal and family projects. I hope you can fulfill all your goals, and I am really pleased because I see we have a high turnout for this call. Really, for the month of January, to start the year, to kick off the year with this high turnout that we see not only here but also on the e-mail exchange list, well, it's really very, very rewarding, so thank you all very much for this growth, for the growth in our region. This is because of the daily commitment that is on the increase all the time, a commitment from all of us. I believe this year is going to be very positive.

Let us proceed with the agenda. Item number two, as usual, is our capacity building cycle. Juan Manuel Rojas was in charge of arranging this capacity building session. I don't know if he is on the call because I cannot see him, but Carlos Aguirre is going to be speaking about participation and engagement that is a recurring topic in our region because, as you know, we have been insisting for focusing upon this for a long time now.

It was the starting point for all the capacity building sessions from Costa Rica. We believe that it is necessary to reinforce, and I repeat this, we believe that is necessary to reinforce this so that we can keep advancing capacity building and so that we can work together in unison and LACRALO can have even more participation.

So let me introduce and welcome Carlos. Carlos, if you will, I now give you the floor, but before that, I want to thank you for your commitment with our region. Thank you, very much.

CARLOS AGUIRRE: Thank you, very much. First of all, let me check the audio. Can you all hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Yes, yes. Go ahead, please.

CARLOS AGUIRRE: Okay, perfect. Let me reiterate what Jose was saying regarding the new year. I mean the new year's wishes. So happy new year, everyone. Let us focus on making this year the best for our region because we have important challenges ahead.

Let me go straight to the point that we are going to address today. First of all, although most of you know me, I would like to tell you that I have been teaching for 25 years now at the school of law at the Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, National University in Cordoba. I hold undergraduate and graduate teaching positions in different universities in Latin America and Argentina.

In terms of Internet governance, I have been an ALAC member twice, elected by the region and in my last term – that was 2011/2012 – I was elected by the NomCom to serve a term as the GNSO.

Today we are going to focus on participation and engagement. This is a topic that has been affecting us for a long time now. ICANN has tried to address this topic in several ways and, in most cases, ICANN has not been very lucky about that. It is only now and after many years that we can see some type of result and we start seeing interesting instances of participation.

This presentation I will be delivering today is based upon some prior presentations as Jose said at the Costa Rica meeting in 2012 and before that in the Nairobi meeting. At the time, I was the chair of participation and engagement within ALAC. I thought about preparing a sort of set of notes, if you will, so that if you intend to actively engage and be committed in Internet governance, you can use these notes. Mainly, the idea is to help our friends in the region of Latin America and the Caribbean.

I believe that we can start with the following. You should remember and memorize a set of words, six keywords. These keywords, in my view, are knowledge, participation, commitment, outreach, capacity building, and leadership. These six words, we believe, indicate the road ahead towards committed participation in Internet governance, in LACRALO, in ICANN, in ALAC, and in every committee where we are going to be working.

When we say knowledge and we think about knowledge in the first place because without knowledge, if we have no knowledge of something, we cannot participate because participation entails exchanging ideas, expressing our view against somebody else's. Within that discussion, within that participation, within that confrontation of

ideas, we will find or reach the best solution, the best result, that we are looking for in order to solve a specific or particular situation.

After we participate, we become committed. We take up that commitment because once we get engaged in an informed discussion, we get further and further or deeper into that discussion and we take up a commitment. However, that commitment is not something that pertains only to ourselves because we ourselves alone are not the organization. On the contrary, the organization is nourished or fed by several people's contributions around the world. So we need these other word, outreach.

But in our region, we made up a word, we coined a word, that was in-reach. That is to reach people not only outwards but also inwards. This leads us to the next word, that is users' capacities, ALS members' capacity or capacity building.

And finally, we end up with a leader because, at the end of the day, a leader is someone that knows, that participates, that is committed, that engages in outreach, and that also builds capacities and helps build capacities. That's why we say that these six words are keywords, and I was asking you at the beginning to memorize these words.

Now, let us focus on the situation that we find within our region. This is nothing new. We have been seeing this for a while now, but to be honest, in the last month I have seen a slight change. Let us focus on the situation.

What is the situation? Lack of commitment from ALS leaders and some end users with different backgrounds, with different knowledge or

different capacities. But something they do not positively apply to the region or to the discussion. In terms of the situation that I see, I also see that there is lack of knowledge, which entails different aspects.

First of all, this lack of commitment that I was referring to, but also the complexity of the Internet governance mechanism and complexity of the ICANN-exclusive mechanisms.

Now, within this topic we have another sub-topic. That is the language issue because even though in our meetings we do have these wonderful and effective and very well performed, simultaneous interpretation, the truth is that we do not have interpretation services in all the committees, or maybe we have translations that reach us at a late stage. We have documents that are translated by other committees or supporting organizations, and sometimes when they reach us it is too late, many times when the topic is no longer being discussed or when we are no longer able to participate.

The third aspect that I see in terms of the situation in our region is precisely this lack of knowledge due to the fact that it is very time consuming to understand ICANN's processes mainly for the individual end users, that is ourselves because we earn a living. We have jobs to earn a living, and we do not earn our living because we're on the Internet industry. At least, that's the case for most of us.

So we have to dedicate volunteer time because we're interested in this, because we like doing it. We take up a commitment; however, sometimes activities are performed in a different language. Sometimes activities or topics are definitely complex.

Let me tell you a story, a side story. Today I was chatting. I was in a chat with the GigaNet organization – that is the Internet governance organization par excellence on a global – and somebody in Europe was complaining about how difficult it is to teach this.

There are acronyms, plenty of acronyms. It is very difficult for an end user – an Internet end user that on top of that does not speak English or who speaks English as a second language – it is very difficult for that user to find these million acronyms. Every day, in every committee, in every working group, new acronyms are being created.

So I think this deserves certain discussion, and we need to start thinking about how to solve this because it is not only the case for us Spanish speakers. English speakers in Europe also have this problem.

Also within this scenario description, the other topic or issue that I see is that before we can make our own contributions, before we can participate, before we can be members of this informed participation, we need to invest – rather than spend – plenty of time in order to become acquainted with these processes, acronyms and to become acquainted with what is it that people are discussing.

These topics that I have mentioned are all part of the complexity, of how complex it is for the end user to participate. However, we are not going to stay with the situation as it is. We are going to do our best. We feel like participating. We feel like contributing. So we have to get going. We have to get moving. First of all, we have to participate. We have to become informed participants because if not, obviously, it's impossible to get involved if we have no knowledge.

Please bear with me for a second. Thank you. I'm just checking my notes, my presentation. The presentation in Costa Rica. This is in our records. It's available. It's part of our records.

Anyway, who is responsible for our participation within the organization? Well, we are responsible. We are the ones that have to get training, have to seek that knowledge when the organization doesn't give us or impart that knowledge.

At this point, I need to go further into a key item or a key point. In my years at ALAC and at the GNSO, I found something difficult. I found it difficult to participate because I didn't speak perfect English and in order to participate, in order to be within, unfortunately, you do need to speak English.

There's a very popular joke that is "What do you call somebody that speaks two languages? Bilingual. And someone that speaks three languages? Trilingual. And somebody that speaks more languages? A polyglot. And somebody that speaks one language only? American."

Of course, no offense meant, but English has been imposed upon us. For today, the English language within this organization is very important. So our leaders, apart from being committed to becoming acquainted with the complexity of the organization, also have to take up the commitment to speak the language of the organization.

This is not, of course, what I like the best, if you will, because I have always been an advocate and supporter of multilingualism. However, this is the scenario, this is the reality and we have to play by these rules.

Another problem is the budget. This has always been a problem. However, when we are short of money, we have to compensate that with ideas. I have put forth several ideas, submitted ideas to the Board on a personal capacity to other leaders within the organization. But the truth is I haven't been paid that much attention. Maybe my ideas were not good.

However, we stumbled into another problem, and I go back to what I was saying a little while ago. If you do not speak English or if your English is not perfect, than your ideas are bad, as well, or are not good either. It shouldn't be this way, but this is the way it is, unfortunately. People do not listen to you if you do not speak good English.

Going back to ideas then, you do not need that much money. I have spoken about this with the regional VP in terms of capacity building for the region that is in the making because we have to work with the leaders we have in every location so that they engage in capacity building and they teach these complex mechanisms.

We do not need to go to five-star hotels. We can speak with the universities, with professional associations, and maybe they can kindly lend us their facilities, technical resources, etc. And we do not need to take a plane to reach a destination within the region. In some places within the region, we can use less expensive means of transport. I believe that we can do far more outreach that way. We can build far more capacity with more ideas and less money.

However, as I was saying, this commitment is something that we all have to take up. And to conclude, I think you have understood this. This

is basic. This is essential. So to summarize as a conclusion, our first conclusion is that we have to work together because we are all responsible for building user capacities, the users that we say or believe that we represent. So outreach and capacity building is the most important point.

What we have to achieve is the following. We have to get more people within our ALSes involved in governance topics because these topics are many and very complex, and our leaders have to be a little bit more responsible.

Why am I saying this? To summarize, to round off, there are many leaders in our region that aspire to better positions in every election, and if we see their track record we have seen them in some working groups or if that happens, rather, we need to celebrate. We need to get them involved in the working group. There are plenty of working groups within ALAC.

And, I walk the talk. So right now, I am working. I am a member of the finance working group, the working group that is selecting members to become Board members, appointed or designated or elected, rather, by ALAC. I am also a member of the ATLAS II Summit working group that is going to take place in London. And also, or obviously, I am a member of the capacity building and the ICANN Academy working groups.

I say this because, I repeat, we are all responsible. We have to be members of the working groups. We don't need to participate in all of them, but becoming a member of any working group does not entail just being on the list and sitting in on meetings or during meetings. We

have to participate. We have to contribute ideas. We have to debate those ideas that we do not like. That makes a responsible leader. Thank you for your attention.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you very much, Carlos, for these minutes that you have devoted to the region. I believe that the most important thing to highlight here is that you are showing and sharing part of your experience as a founding father of LACRALO. So Carlos, thank you very much for your participation and your speech.

I would like to say that that capacity session, the capacity building session, that training session that was delivered by Carlos and Carlton in Costa Rica was a very fruitful and a very rich training.

But I think it is important to refresh that information so that a new member participating in the region, the new ALSes that are participating right now, that is someone who has applied to become a member of our region. This is Luis Sergio [Valle Sejas]. We will speak soon, but at least thank you very much for your participation. So these new members are aware of the facts in our region.

Now, we'll give the floor to Carlton for a question.

CARLTON SAMUELS:

Thank you, Jose. I hope you're hearing me. I want to thank Carlos for that presentation and, of course, outlining some of the things we are certainly agreed as important for capacity building and some of the steps we need to take for increasing the participation.

I just want to caution one issue with respect to the local capacity building initiatives that involve travel. I'm saying this in context of the realities of inter-island Caribbean travel. If I am going from Kingston, Jamaica, to the Eastern Caribbean, it takes me a day to get to three countries: Antigua, Barbados and Trinidad and Tobago. At the moment, every other country requires two days of travel.

To put it in further context, if I leave Kingston, Jamaica, at noon on any given day, I can get to Los Angeles, California, in time for dinner before I would get to Port-of-Spain, Trinidad. That's the first reality.

The second reality is it is not cheap, inter-Caribbean travel. The average cost of a ticket to get to any of the three destinations that I can reach in one day is about \$500 United States. And if I have to overnight to get to St. Lucia or Grenada, then you have to add another \$300 for airfare plus accommodations for the night.

This is the reality of Caribbean travel. So in our instance, having automated and technological means for outreach is probably more important than not. That is a reality.

Secondly, I want to endorse what he said about joining established working groups. It bears repeating. The policy development business of ICANN evolves in working groups. Whether they are chartered by the GNSO, which is a support organization from whence policy emanates usually, or from the ccNSO or the ASO.

So the solution to become more involved and become more acquainted with the policy development process in ICANN is to drive interactions and integration with established working groups.

We have some challenges, and it's mere sense for us to acknowledge them. In the first place, most working groups are English-only. That is a problem for LACRALO, and until that is addressed in some way you are not going to get the deepest participation because of the language considerations of most persons.

I totally agree and acknowledge that it is very important and there is a level of comfort in working in the language that you speak as a native tongue. I believe that it is only reasonable for every means to be made to make that possible for further participation. I truly believe that that is necessary.

The second thing though that you need to remember is that participation in the working groups is one level, but it also includes a lot of time devoted to reading materials. While the reading materials are now translated fairly effectively – Christina and the language services group, they've been doing a really bang-up job on getting a lot of this done – it behooves everyone to know that you cannot effectively participate without a lot of preparatory work, and that takes time and effort.

So the investment in time and effort is more than just going on the working group calls. It involves lots of other numbers. I just wanted to underscore that. Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you very much, Carlton. Thank you very much to both of you because both of you delivered that presentation, the training course, in Costa Rica. It was amazing to have you there sharing your experiences.

And I believe that this participation and these words, you are the ones posting and encouraging members to read documents that perhaps are written in other languages and not to get afraid and to ask for help. So thank you very much for that.

Before going to the next item on the agenda, I would like to ask if there is any other questions and I would like to highlight the fact that outreach is important. That is something that you mentioned before.

Last year, Alberto Soto by himself organized a program that was filed or presented for the 2014 budget in order to incorporate new ALSes in countries where no representation is available, and that request was rejected. That request made by Alberto was rejected. Now we have a new opportunity. So, Alberto, thank you very much for that proposal that you prepared last year.

Now, going back to the agenda, item number three has to do with two topics, and I would like to ask Sergio Salinas Porto to speak about these. One has to do with the comments by the metrics subcommittee. Thank you very much, Sergio, for the summary you have sent to the list. The other topic has to do with the different progress made by the governance working group. Sergio, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

Before I give the floor to Sergio, I haven't seen Olivier. Olivier, you have the floor. Sorry for that.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much. I'm sorry to be putting my hand up so high so late, but I just wanted to add a couple of more words regarding the capacity building.

I think that the efforts in LACRALO to do local capacity building have been really pioneering with regards to other RALOs also looking at what this RALO is doing for capacity building of its members.

I totally understand the problems of language, which other continents are also faced with, and to me it is a tragedy that ICANN doesn't have the unlimited funds needed to be able to work natively in the five UN languages. The funding is a huge problem for this because it costs an enormous amount to work in multiple languages. I just wish that sometime in the future this will be possible, but it would require a budget that is several magnitudes larger than the current budget that is there for ICANN to make use of.

With regards to capacity building, as you know, we've got the At-Large Summit that is coming up in June. I wanted to say that there is going to be an increased amount of pressure on the RALOs to do capacity building of its At-Large structures leading up to the summit.

Then, with a complete week in London, I really hope that this will make all of our ALSes, well, first all of our ALSes will arrive being very, very eager to learn more and to be able to discuss all of those topics face-to-face. Then, that when they leave the ICANN meeting at the end of the week, it will have been an incredible experience for them to experience first-hand what a international multi-stakeholder model is in Internet governance.

I hope that some will continue afterwards in taking on more leadership positions and follow in the footsteps of Carlton Samuels and of Carlos Aguirre, who as far as when I arrived in At-Large I saw as some real examples of people that have made a real difference and that continue to make a difference. I hope that we will all be able to continue following in their footsteps, myself included.

That's all. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you very much, Olivier, for your kind words and for your comments. If you all agree now, I would like to give the floor to Alejandro because I know that he has to leave. I would like to skip to one item on the agenda and go to item number six and give the floor to Alejandro because he will speak about the role of Internet in the governance ecosystem. So, if everyone agrees with that, I would like to give the floor to Alejandro for him to speak.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

Thanks very much, Jose. Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE:

Yes, Alejandro. Go ahead, please.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

I am here and in a place which is quite noisy, so I will try my best to speak. As you know, we have four strategic panels. One of them has to

do with ICANN's role in the governance ecosystem. We have some members participating there. We had two webinars last week, and we had very good participation by LACRALO.

I will send once again the URL for you to see what we have done up to now and for you to see the presentations. In those presentations, you will find two slides regarding or related to these organizations and new organizations participating in the governance ecosystem. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE:

Okay. Thank you very much, Alejandro. Carlton, I don't know if you would like to add any other comments or if you would like to make a comment.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ:

Sorry for interrupting. I would like to make a question for Alejandro. I would like to make the most of Alejandro's participation for him to tell us about the possibilities LACRALO representatives have to attend the Brazil meeting. Up to now so far, the ones who are participating in different lists have been sharing a certain type of information, but I think it would be very important to have that information and to know if there is any strategy for ALSes to attend or participate.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

I will briefly reply to your comment. The little information I have is what I know. I do not participate in 1Net and in the organization of the event, so whatever I can tell you is what I can infer as a committee member.

The organizations will have or do have the ability to participate, but there is no mechanism already established in terms of the number of organizations that will participate. And I know there are different criteria being applied. One is the merit criteria, and that is what I know up to now.

JOSE ARCE: Okay, Alejandro, thank you very much for your reply. I would like to add something else and tell Antonio there is an item on the agenda, which is item number five, where we will address this point in particular. So I would like to move forward with the agenda, and once we reach that item I will let you know what happens or what has happened in this regard and regarding the different LACRALO requests to participate in this meeting.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: Jose, thank you very much for your comment. So let's move forward with the agenda, and once we get to item number five we'll discuss that point.

JOSE ARCE: Thank you very much. And Sergio, thank you very much for delivering, for giving Alberto the possibility to speak.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Can you hear me? Can you hear me better now?

JOSE ARCE: Yes, we hear now better.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Let me see now the order of the [briefs]. Very briefly and very quickly, not long ago I sent a request.

Sorry, I will start again.

Not long ago, I sent a request to the list with the hope of having the region involved in the metrics issue. I sent a report – a four- or five-page report – regarding what is happening within the committee. I have been participating in the committee. I participated in the Buenos Aires meetings, and I offered myself to be the pen holder for that report. I think that I said that in the previous call, but I wanted to reiterate that.

I was not able to participate quite a lot during last year because I had several personal problems, so it is a pleasure for me participate now and to participate in a list of people who are involved in the topic. But it was not fair to me to participate in that list or to keep on subscribed to the list because I was not able to participate during the year.

All the topics that we have been delivering and working with will impact the different ALAC members. That's why I sent that document, so please if you didn't have the time to read the document, please do read it. You can participate on the wiki page. You can post your name and post your comments, your views, if you will. And you can also subscribe to our mailing list. I will read all the comments, and I will post those comments on the wiki as well.

The next thing, I think, would be to produce a document with the views of LACRALO about this. If I'm not wrong, I think it was Fatima, Antonio, and Carlton, we were talking about this issue and we were discussing about how to generate interest for our RALO.

We have already discussed some of the metrics, and the idea is to share our views. Sometimes some of us perhaps have different point of view. Some others were perhaps more flexible, if you will, in terms of the different context. But the idea is already created and it would be good to have all that information, all those ideas posted or written in one document because this document has to do with the responsibility that ALAC members do have when they work and they represent the region.

JOSE ARCE:

Okay, Sergio, I think you have dropped. While we wait for Sergio to be reconnected, we will continue with the items on the agenda. Then, when Sergio is back, we will give him the floor again for him to continue with the governance working group because I know he has been working quite a lot.

The next item on the agenda has to do with the ALAC news. I don't know if Fatima or Dev would like to take the floor?

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

Jose, can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE:

Yes, Fatima. Go ahead, please.

FATIMA CAMBORNERO: I have an echo. I hear an echo on my phone. I would like to start and then if Dev wants, he can continue with the explanation. I will try to be brief because these items for these topics were already circulated on the list and everyone has the corresponding information.

Shall I go on, or should we give the floor to Sergio?

JOSE ARCE: I think we will give the floor now to Sergio for him to finish with the governance working group, and then we will go back to you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Jose. When it comes to the governance working group, we have made some progress. We [inaudible] meeting on the 23rd and we produced a document, which is just the transcription of more than 26 pages. So this is something very good.

We have the necessary materials to start discussing the different topics. We based our work on a definition that was provided by Dev in terms of governance. We are now moving forward. We have discussed four items out of six, and next time we will discuss the remaining items. On the 27th we will have our next meeting – this is next week – we will have our next call for this governance working group.

We're making progress, and everything will depend on the different discussions that we will have because from Costa Rica up to now, things

have changed. The reality of LACRALO has changed and, of course, we have changed some scenarios, so we will discuss that.

I don't know if this is enough or if there are any other questions.

JOSE ARCE: Thank you very much, Sergio. If you will, we can send you the different questions by e-mail so that we can move forward with the agenda.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes, of course, Jose. I said that before, I would be willing to answer any questions.

JOSE ARCE: Okay, thank you very much, Sergio. And, before going back to Fatima, I would like to thank the participation of a member who has applied recently to become a member of the region. This is Luis. I don't see him connected. Yes, he is already participating. He is Luis. I will post on the AC room the Web page of his organization. He comes from Bolivia, and I believe or I think in the next call we will have some time to ask him some questions and for him to participate. So, thank you very much, Luis, for your participation in this call.

Fatima, would you like to start with you point right now?

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: Thank you very much From Dev, the next item on the agenda has to do with the new ALSes. I will copy and paste that information on the list on

the AC room. These ALSes were approved by ALAC between December and January.

When it comes to the Internet Society in Kenya, the vote was suspended due to an issue with the Web page. So until that problem is solved – that problem appeared after they had applied to become an ALS member – until it is not resolved or solved that situation the vote will not continue. These are the ones, the ALSes that are approved, divided or classified into the different RALOs.

When it comes to the policy issues being discussed in ALAC and discussed in the RALO, I will copy and paste on the AC room all the information regarding those statements. There is a mistake on the agenda, which is not a TLD but a gTLD. These are the statements which ALAC has written a statement, and I have collaborated and participated personally on some statements.

We have been discussing regarding the geographic regions within the RALO and the TLD and the WHOIS Misuse. These are the statements that have been voted between December and January in ALAC.

I think that this is enough information but if Dev would like to add any further information, he is welcome to do so. Thank you, Jose.

JOSE ARCE:

Dev, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. I just wanted to remind you of one of the items up for public comment and that is the – I will just bring up the page right now – this is ALAC statement on the ICANN draft vision, mission and focus areas for a five-year strategic plan. I'll post the link right now. Currently, there is a draft ALAC statement there, so this is something that we can look at. That's probably one of the key things.

One of the other issues that's regarding the – I'm just trying to pull up the links here so forgive me. What is also out for public comment is the draft criteria and process for selection of a multi-stakeholder Ethos award pilot program, and I'll post the link in the chat here. Those are two of the policies that are out for public comment at this time.

I think that that's it. Those are. I'll stop there. Thanks.

JOSE ARCE: Dev, thank you very much. I see Olivier. So, Olivier, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much. I just wanted to add a couple of more words to those two current bits of public comment. With regards to the draft vision, mission and focus areas for the five-year strategic, Tijani Ben Jemaa has put a draft up today.

It's a very short amount of time we have for comments. There is no reply period to this, unfortunately. I guess we have started a little bit late into drafting this, but the finance and budget subcommittee has had some discussions already on the contents of this proposed

statement. We only have until the end of the week to be able to comment. Please comment on it, and then we will have to launch the vote.

Now, the Ethos award pilot program is something which has been thought of by ICANN – I gather, I imagine by ICANN senior staff – to respond to some of the comments that were made in the community that often the chairs of supporting organizations, advisory committees, the people on the actual councils and committees often get a lot of accolades and thanks for all the work, but really a lot of the work gets done not at that level but at working group level, much, much more down at the base of the pyramid.

Some people have been involved in many, many different working groups and have worked on a lot of programs, sometimes chairing the working group but sometimes just as working group members, doing the bulk of the drafting, of reports, etc. And yet, they are very, very rarely mentioned or thanked or recognized by ICANN. I think it's a really, really good program to have thought of this Ethos award, which will be awarded to someone who satisfies the condition that they've worked in a lot of working groups and have really made the difference in their parts of the community.

The call for comment in there is basically asking for what is needed of someone who would be a good candidate for receiving this award. There is a list of the characteristics of the type of person that could receive this that are given on the Web page.

Really, what the public comment period is asking if you have an idea of what else would be needed of someone like this. Does it have to be someone of impeccable ethics? Does it have to be someone who has, I don't know, a very wide range of knowledge from technical to non-technical? It's a very open thing at this moment so, if you have an idea, please put in on the wiki page, at the bottom of the wiki page, put your ideas about this.

That's all. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE: Thank you for your comments. I don't know if anyone has any questions?

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: Sorry for the interruption. I would like to make a comment at this point.

JOSE ARCE: Yes, go ahead, Antonio.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: Thank you. I would like to congratulate Fatima and Dev for the work they have been doing so far.

I would like these links to be posted also on the wiki – I mean the links posted now in the AC room – because maybe I'm the only that has this problem, but after the call when I want to have a look when I want to access the AC room again and see what took place during the meeting, I

cannot access it. So it would be interesting to post this also on the wiki.
Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Okay. Thank you, Antonio, for your comment. I believe that Fatima and Dev will have no problem at all with this. And if not, Silvia or myself will be sharing the links and posting the links on the wiki or we'll be sending you the links.

I see that Olivier would like to take the floor. Go ahead, Olivier. You have the floor.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you very much. I was just going to suggest sometimes after a conference call, and it hasn't happened in our community always but it does happen in some other parts of ICANN, sometimes after a conference call a quick summary of the call is sent out with the links for the agenda of the meeting to just remind people and, therefore, people who have been on the call are then able to access.

The actual Adobe Connect room usually gets closed after the end of the meeting, and this is why you can't access it, but the agenda on the wiki remains there. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you, Olivier, for that comment. But again, ICANN staff is doing a wonderful job, a great job. So if maybe one or a couple of days after the meeting, if you click on the link to the meeting agenda, you also have

the transcripts and the recordings, so that's wonderful. And Silvia Vivanco says that we have a 48 timeframe to get the transcript and the recording and you can access that through the same link to the agenda.

So Antonio, thank you very much for this reminder. It's a good reminder to all of us. Sometimes we do not know where to retrieve the information, and it's just there a link away. So thank you. Thank you for that reminder.

Okay, going on now with the agenda, if there are no further comments at this point, our next item on the agenda is the Internet governance meeting that will take place in Brazil this year. Leon, I don't know if you would like to take the floor. Go ahead, please.

LEON SANCHEZ: Good evening. Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: Yes, go ahead please.

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you, Jose.

We have held several meetings in this group, and I want to be brief so as not to take up a lot of time of your agenda. Fadi Chehadé joined us in our last meeting, and we spoke about the objectives for the Brazil meeting. Fadi said that it is not expected to be a decision-making

meeting but a consensus-building meeting based on the multi-stakeholder model for Internet governance.

We are focusing on new mechanisms that will entail the collaboration of the different stakeholders involved. We spoke about 12 countries that will be co-organizing this meeting. This list has not been made public yet. The NCUC is organizing an Internet governance meeting in Singapore in March, of course, prior to the ICANN meeting.

INTERPRETER: The interpreters apologize, but there is an issue with Leon Felipe Sanchez's audio. Once again, the interpreters apologize. We cannot receive Mr. Leon Felipe Sanchez's audio correctly.

LEON SANCHEZ: There is an ongoing public consultation for the community to make comments. We're seeking community comments. The idea is to get community input.

INTERPRETER: The interpreters apologize again. We cannot receive Mr. Sanchez's audio properly, therefore we cannot interpret him properly. We apologize.

LEON SANCHEZ: In the group, we continue working on drafting a charter, and we will continue with these discussions on our list. Work on the charter is not

yet concluded, but we expect it will be concluded as soon as possible.
Also...

INTERPRETER: The interpreters apologize. We cannot interpret Mr. Sanchez's message due to problems with his audio.

JOSE ARCE: Leon, if I may, I will interrupt you. Leon, can you hear me? Okay, I believe Leon has dropped. He has disconnected. So in the meantime, can staff please confirm whether Leon has dropped? Has he disconnected? Oh, I see that Gisella is informing us that Leon is only on AC. So Leon, if you can hear us, and if you could please continue? No. Okay. So I will take the floor and since Olivier is on the call, I would like to tell you about LACRALO's participation in terms of these initiatives.

LEON SANCHEZ: Can you hear me?

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose speaking. I believe Leon has never stopped speaking, actually. Leon, if I may, I will interrupt you for a second.

INTERPRETER: The interpreters apologize, but we cannot interpret his message because his audio is choppy.

JOSE ARCE:

Leon, can you hear me? Oh well, I see that Leon continues speaking but he cannot hear me, so I don't know what we can do about this? I don't see Leon connected on the call. However, he continues speaking. Can someone please reach him directly and let him know. Leon, hello? Can you hear me? Okay, now that my voice and Leon's are not overlapping, let me continue.

As I was saying, LACRALO right from the beginning was very much involved in the question in this topic of the Brazil meeting. Right from Buenos Aires, LACRALO issued a statement focusing on certain points and certain items. We continued working in order to see how we can participate, not only ALAC but also our ALSes.

Fatima and I got in touch with Olivier to explore these possibilities because we saw certain obstacles because only the NCUC was participating, somewhat representing the civil society. There was a call for a vote within this organization, and there are certain people that can represent civil society. So we got in touch with Olivier and we told him that we also represent the civil society.

When I say “we,” I don't mean At-Large. I mean any person that is trained, qualified to attend the meeting and engage in these discussions. Some ALSes can also participate, but always within ICANN's remit.

Initially, we didn't get many replies from ICANN to these requests. As time went by, we realized that At-Large does not have a place as part of ICANN within this meeting. Olivier communicated absolutely everything,

absolutely all our messages, so I want to thank Olivier because he had to read all our e-mails, all our messages, and he focused on the need for us being there. But we didn't get a satisfactory reply from ICANN so that At-Large can represent the civil society during the Brazil meeting. So only the NCUC will be there.

On January 17, the group held a conference call. I was unable to attend. I was able to attend the prior one, and there were some discussions in that At-Large is not only civil society. I don't think that is a valid argument. Well, this is all the information I can give you at this point. I want to listen to other voices. I see Fatima and then Olivier. Fatima, go ahead please.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: Thank you, Jose. I also want to thank Olivier because he conveyed all our concerns right from the start about why we didn't have a space.

JOSE ARCE: Excuse me. Leon, we can still hear you.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: We have asked many people. We have asked Fadi why At-Large does not have a space within the meeting. In the last cross-constituency working group call, [Theresa] participated and she said that At-Large has to participate through the stakeholder group it belongs to because some ALSes are considered members of the technical community so they should participate as members of the technical community.

ALSes that are members of the civil society should be part of the civil society community and so on and so forth. So we believe it's important that we somewhat participate. This working group is doing a very good job, so congratulations on that.

Since Olivier is on the call, I have a question of him. Initially, we said that we were interested in being members of this group, and they told us that only four ALAC members could participate. Olivier, clearly, was going to be there. So Leon, Holly, and Evan also participate and then we have Rafid from the NCUC.

Olivier said that we can participate in our capacity as observer members. Now, what does it mean? Can we make questions? Can we complete the Doodle post for the calls? Do we have to apologize if we do not attend the calls? Because I have seen other ALAC members that are not members of the group and are doing these things. So how can we participate? Is there anything else we can do? Do we participate through our ALAC representatives? Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you, Fatima. Olivier, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you very much, Jose. You're absolutely correct. Yes, there are four participants from ALAC. It's myself, Evan, Holly, and Leon Felipe. We are full participants in that we can attend calls. We, of course, have to supply apologies if we're not able to make it on a call, and we're able to post to the cross-committee working group mailing list.

Now, the mailing list itself is actually open for everyone to be able to subscribe to. If you subscribe to the mailing list and you are not a listed participant but you are an observer, you are able to read all of the messages but you will not be able to post to that mailing list but you can receive all the messages.

If you are an observer, you can attend all of the calls, except of course if the call is a closed call. But so far all of the calls have been open calls. But you will not be given the ability to speak on the call. If you wish to channel input into the cross-community working group, then I would suggest that you ask one of your four ALAC representatives, and I guess Leon would be the perfect person to channel your input into the working group.

The reason for this is because it is a working group that has people from all over ICANN. If you look at the link that I put a little bit earlier on the chat which is entitled ICANN Community Preparation for the Multi-stakeholder meeting in Brazil home – you see it just a little bit further up, CCWG Internet Governance – you will see that the list of participants is already huge.

Everyone has decided to have the maximum of four participants per supporting organization, advisory committee, and actually per stakeholder group. Because, as we know, the GNSO has a lot of stakeholder groups and so we have a limit of four participants, four people that are able to fully participate. That's the cross-community working group itself. And thanks very much, Fatima, for providing us the details and on the work that is being done there.

Now, I have received an e-mail via other channels that as far as the Brazil participation is concerned there has been a selection made by the Brazil committee of the different people who are at the moment going to sit on the various committees.

I know that the NCSG had put forward a number of names. The list, let me see, how can I cut and paste it? The list has actually been supplied, and it doesn't seem to be having a lot of people. I've looked at it quickly, and it doesn't look as if there are anybody from NCSG specifically.

As far as civil society is concerned, you have High Level Committee which has supposedly 26 members, and from civil society there is Jovan Kurbalija, Stephanie Perrin, and Louis Pouzin. Then, there is an Executive Multi-stakeholder Committee with 17 members, and from civil society, there is [Carlos Alfonso], [Christobal Enriquez] and that's it. Then there is also representatives from the global multi-stakeholder community and two from each community, and for civil society there is Adam Peake and Marília Maciel. And that's it for the time being.

Those are the ones that have been announced and the whole huge number of discussions that took place on the 1Net discussion that yielded a lot of volunteers wanting to be on these committees but very few being chosen.

That's all. Thank you. And I think that, yes, Fatima, I think that must be the right message. Let me just check. I think that's the that one you put in the chat just now. Indeed, yeah, that's the list so far. And that's Hartmut Glaser who sent that list over.

I don't think that there is any opportunity at the moment to have any additional people on any of these committees. However, as was very clearly said, the cross-community working group on Internet governance is going to be developing the ICANN input into this conference. As you know, ICANN is one of the main sponsors and originators for this conference along with the other iStar organizations. So I have full confidence that our voice will be heard.

And I can say that the members of our community have been quite active on this. I would like to see them actively involved all the way into forging and putting together the ICANN input into this conference because I think it will be very important and, certainly, in our community we have an enormous amount of experience into multi-stakeholderism, so it's important that we get that experience shared with the participants. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you very much, Olivier, for your comments. I see Carlos Aguirre with your hand up. Carlos if you have any comment that you would like to make.

CARLOS AGUIRRE:

Yes, Jose. Well, I just wanted to say that participation apart from what you have mentioned is also related to the financial aspect. I see that in our agenda today, you will speak about this later on, but the term ends March 1, and there is a form for filling for anyone who would like to participate in that meeting. That's my comment. Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you very much for your comment. Yes, the CROPP is another item on our agenda, so we will talk about this. But before that, I would like to make a comment. I personally made a request in one of my e-mails I sent to Olivier to have ALAC or for ALAC to make a statement if the ALAC members believe this is important because ALAC is not considered a representative of the civil society.

I think we should have one representative of the civil society, and I believe we have several people who are capable of doing or performing that role of representing the civil society, so that was one comment.

I also asked how ICANN sees us and what we represent? Because in that call, we discussed what we represented. There is no understanding, in fact, within ICANN regarding the representation. So if this is not so, if we cannot understand who we represent, well, that is something which is not good. We have to produce a statement asking ICANN how At-Large represents or how At-Large is seen as a representative. Then we will have to discuss why the 70% of the ALSes being part of ALAC are ISOC chapters and see if we can address this point.

I mean, I am just thinking aloud and imaging how the discussions will be. There is a general comment, in fact, within the community. You have to ask someone who is involved in different groups, and if you ask that person, "What is At-Large?" "Well, At-Large is the remaining part, the part which is outside the other parts." So we need to keep on involving and, if we do not act, we will have many people thinking or considering

At-Large as the leftovers of a community, so we need to define who or what we represent.

Now, if there are no further comments on this point?

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: I have a question.

JOSE ARCE: Go ahead, Antonio.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: I would like to insist on the question I made for Alejandro Pisanty. I participate in several lists, and as Carlos Aguirre said, this is a challenge to know other scenarios, other acronyms. But my thinking is that within those lists, there are a few people coming from Latin America and the Caribbean. That's why I say that, on one hand, we should [inaudible] the issue of participation, having one representative on the event agenda. But also we should have a paid for support for those who will make the effort to attend the Brazil meeting.

We need to pay attention to that because we should avoid the fact that [inaudible] merit criteria, well, we may have certain people with greater experience. But something which I believe is important and that was already mentioned by Carlos Aguirre is the fact that within this discussion the Spanish language is not present. Everyone speaks English and we, as a region, are leaving aside 600 million people speaking, and this is a very important region for Internet development.

JOSE ARCE: Okay, Antonio. Thank you very much for your questions and for your comments. We do not have much time so we will take our time and the time to send you a very clear reply, but we need to keep on moving.

Now, I would like to give the floor to Olivier and Fatima. And then after that we will finish or we will bring this call to an end. Olivier, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much, Mr. Chairman. I am going to be very quick. So when I was asked to send a letter out to Fadi, a statement as such, I sent it out as a correspondence. And I've given you the link in the chat for that correspondence. You can read it. I did not receive immediate reply from Fadi. I followed up, and there was a copy of that correspondence going to Adiel Akplogan, who is the CEO of AFRINIC and who also is the person leading the 1Net initiative.

The reply from Adiel was that we should apply if we wanted to apply, but the selection would be made by the Brazil committee. And the selection was made by the Brazil committee, and that resulted in the e-mail which you have read, which is accessible there from Hartmut Glaser.

Now, with regards to our own participation, I'll say it again. The response was we should participate in bringing forward an ICANN input into this conference, and the way to do it is via the cross-community working group.

You have to understand that ICANN is already present at that meeting as an organization. Having a component part of ICANN – and the ALAC and At-Large is a part of ICANN – also be present via other channels is something that, politically, is very, very, I'm not going to say dangerous because it's not dangerous, but we would be criticized and we are being criticized by being so present on many different levels. Criticized by people who are not part of ICANN, who don't take part in the ICANN processes and some of whom, actually, don't like ICANN at all.

So because this conference is not an ICANN conference, it's very difficult to bring more people there or to push for more people who are part of the ICANN sphere – and At-Large, I repeat, is part of the ICANN sphere – to take part independently. If your organizations are able to be present – and this is where I sent a follow-up message to the At-Large list and to the RALOs – if your organization is able to participate independently into that meeting, that would be great because it would be an additional channel for us to be there. But participating officially under the ALAC or At-Large banner is going to be very difficult and very politically sensitive. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Thank you, Olivier, very much for your comment. Fatima, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

I will be brief and I would like to add some comments to Olivier's comments. The Brazilian event is made through invitation. We have 550 invitations or places, so we need to take this into account because not

everyone will have a physical place to attend. That's why we are requesting remote participation for those who are not able to attend because this will be a really important meeting.

Another important point that I would like to attach on is that 1Net is born, and of course we are very confused about that, but 1Net was supposed to be a channel to organize the meeting in Brazil, and the candidates would be taken to the committees through 1Net. The way 1Net is [posed], we have four stakeholders and the users are not recognized as stakeholders different from the civil society or the technical community or different stakeholders.

Regarding what you said, Jose, in terms of the comments regarding At-Large is the registered constituency of ICANN. Well, from my point of view, this might be at the very beginning but with the passing of time At-Large got evolved and specialized and now At-Large is representing the users.

Perhaps in this meeting, this meeting is not for individual organizations or representatives. It is addressed to different stakeholders. So I think this is a very important point or topic to discuss in the 1Net list because this topic is quite confusing. These are not substantial topics for the meeting, but perhaps I think we can address this issue on that list.

I know that the agenda will be based on the future of Internet governance, on the principles of Internet governance, and I believe that we as end users have a lot to contribute too. So we can participate as stakeholders, or we can participate as representatives of our own organization.

Sorry, I will be very brief. When it comes to cost and the funding of the participation in the Brazil meeting, we have already discussed that in the call. And I believe we can use that because we are the only region who fulfill or comply with all the requirements. And we will have to do that before June. Sorry for taking that time.

JOSE ARCE: Carlos, you have the floor. You have one minute, but before that I would like to thank the interpreters, the staff, and all participants for this call. Thank you very much for your participation, and welcome back to this new year. Carlos, you have the floor. Be very brief.

CARLOS AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre speaking. The ALAC candidates to the Board, the chair of the BCEC, I already said that. There is no candidate representing our region. The region has until the 28th to present a candidate.

JOSE ARCE: Carlos, thank you very much for your comment, but we have run out of time. Antonio, sorry, but I cannot give you the floor because we are exceeding the time.

ANTONIO MEDINA GOMEZ: Could you please listen to me.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Antonio, sorry for that, but we will bring this call to an end right now. We will keep on discussing this item on the list. Thank you very much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]