GISELLA GRUBER:

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the Board member selection process committee call on Wednesday, the 29th of January at 15:00 UTC. On today's call we have Tijani Ben Jemaa, Maureen Hilyard, Dev Anand Teelucksingh, Oksana Prykhodko, and Roberto Gaetano. We have apologies from Baudouin Schombe, Rudi Vansnick, Eduardo Diaz, Heidi Ullrich, and Olivier Crepin-Leblond.

From staff we have Silvia Vivanco and myself, Gisella Gruber. If I could also please remind everyone to state their names when speaking for transcript purposes. Thank you over to you Tijani. I have already put the first document up on the Adobe Connect and have the others waiting for when you're waiting. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Gisella. Good morning, good afternoon, good evening. This is our first BMSPC call alone, because we did a meeting together with the BCCE. As you know, the BCCE has already issued the slate of five candidates, and now we have to work, our committee has a job in hand now. So we need today to more or less see where we are and what we have to do.

So first of all, you have the agenda on the screen, do you agree with it? Is there any amendment of the agenda you need to do? So if there is not, I would consider it as adopted, and we'll go to item number three of the agenda which is the BMSPC operating procedure. The BMSPC

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

didn't draft specific procedure, operating procedure because everything is in the document that are listed below.

We would not do anything which is not according to the rules of procedures of the ALAC, and everything is inside. So we didn't adopt any further operating procedure because we do not need them. Is there any comment on this point? Okay, don't see any comment any hand, so we go to point number four, which is [?] documents.

All our work will be done according to the following documents: rule number 19 of the rules of procedure of ALAC, where you have the whole procedure for the selection. We have a recent modification done yesterday, which more or less covers something that wasn't covered, which was how to do if one of the elector members is absent, cannot vote, ill, or died, or anything.

And this modification gives the RALO the ability to appoint a replacement for the absent elector member. The third document will be adjunct number three which is more explanation than rules. So you can go through them and you'll see that those, this adjunct is only to clarify to give the modification regarding all the rules, but what changed in this amendment that we did in the rules of procedure.

This was the purpose of this adjunct document. And finally the timeline. And the timeline, we defined it together includes... You remember, we adopted it together in Buenos Aries and we are working according to this timeline. And I have to thank the BCEC because the BCEC respected exactly this timeline, even if it was difficult to respect it because there

BMSPC - 29 January 2014 EN

was a period, the season's holidays, and they worked during these holidays to achieve their work and to be on time.

They released yesterday the slate. Yesterday was the deadline to release the slate. So and those are the relevant documents, they are there, please take them, please copy them. They will be our bible. They will be our tool for work. We don't have to do anything which is does not conform with those rules. Now since we have today Roberto Gaetano here, I will give him the floor to announce, you have it, the announcement was done, but he can do it for you to announce the list of the five candidates that we put on the slate for this election.

So Roberto if you are here, if you don't mind, please read this list.

ROBERTO GAETANO:

Hello. This is Roberto for the transcript. Can you hear me?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes please, yes we hear you.

ROBERTO GAETANO:

Yes, so thank you Tijani. In fact, we have a tight deadline, but the good will of everybody, members of the community, and staff, and so on, so we made it. And [?] situation out of the [?] submissions of candidates here. We have the record now of five [?] the best ones [?]... by ALAC, and so those the people [?] in this slate of candidates are, and I clarify what I'm going to mention them in alphabetical order by the last name.

Rinalia Abdul Rahim, Sebastian Bachoulette, Alan Greenberg, Evan Leibovitch, and Jean Jacques [?]. There were other three candidates who was [?] past the minimum requirements, but we have not included in the slate of candidates because in our opinion, their qualifications and experience were lower than the first group of five candidates.

And I do not know, Tijani if you need me to mention those names or not, Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Please, Roberto, please, yes, please.

ROBERTO GAETANO:

So the other three candidates are David [?]... I believe that these three candidates can still be put in the final slate of candidates by a vote of ALAC and specially by, if they have the support of three regions. But I think [?]... I will refer to Tijani for the explanation of the further process. I'm just saying that these are, so for us the five candidates that we have put in the slate were, in our opinion, in our evaluation of the facts, above the average, and surely above the average of the three additional candidates. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much Roberto. Very important what you said. For your information, any addition to this slate by the RALOs have to come from the three persons that were not selected by the BCEC, but who were submitted to SOI, to the BCEC. This is clear. Okay. So I would stop here and ask you if you have any questions, any comments. Okay. Dev.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Thank you Tijani. This is Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. Roberto, thank again for the summary. My question is regarding the three candidates that were not voted by the BCEC, is there information [?] information will be posted onto the Wiki? And where would that information be posted? So that RALOs themselves can review these candidates and make these decisions?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Dev. It is a part of the SOI which is public. Another part is not public, which is private, which is confidential. And the public part I think are public on the BCEC page, and I want that Roberto to confirm. Roberto please.

ROBERTO GAETANO:

Yes. I think that the... Actually, I understand that there have been discussions because, how can I say? There have been some inconsistencies of the accessibility of the website. In [?] the candidates to the more members of your committee, and to the members of ALAC. That I have to make a decision. But I understand that we have some problems in terms of accessibility of some of the page that are now being looked at by staff.

So what I can say is that in principle the candidates are accessible by these people. If this is not the case physically now, it is because the problem of the organizations to access the pages is being fixed right now.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Roberto. I would like to [?] that it is not only these committee members and ALAC members who need to have access to the public part of the [?], it is the whole public, everyone can access it. It is something which is public. What is confidential, only BCEC members can access it. What is public, anyone can access it, including information about the three remaining candidates that are not on the slate.

Does that respond to your question Dev?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Yes it does, thank you. This is Dev speaking. Because I notice the announcement didn't have a link to a website where we can see the whole candidate list, or to the other applicants that submitted an expression of interest. So I was wondering about that, thanks.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay thank you. Thank you very much. Any other questions? Any other clarifications? If there isn't, so we covered issue number five which is candidate slate issued by the BCEC, and there was also point number six which were possible addition to the candidate slate. As I said, any addition can be done from the three names weren't selected by the BCEC, but that who submitted their AOI to the BCEC.

So, what's next now? Now, the first step now is for the RALOs to consider adding names from those three persons. And this will take 14 days according to the timeline. Gisella could you please put the

timeline on the screen? So we'll have 14 days for that, for the RALOs to decide if they want to add candidates on the slate.

And the deadline will be on the 21 I think, or something like this. I have to open my timeline. One moment please. Okay. Gisella, if you can please put it on the next. It's for me now, so. Okay. So normally, on... Yes, Gisella. Gisella?

GISELLA GRUBER: Sorry to interrupt Tijani. It's Gisella here. Is that the correct document?

I just had an outing in my audio, I just wanted to confirm that that was

the correct document?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Timeline? The last one...

GISELLA GRUBER: The timeline is coming, it's coming.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, thank you. This is what I am asking for.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you Tijani. My apologies.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

No problem. So... So BCEC announce the slate on 28th of January, can you make it bigger Gisella please? [?] And we will have, the RALOs will have 14 to add any addition, and then they will have 10 days to, how do you say, the support for those names because any name asked to be added has to get the support of at least three RALOs. So this is more or less a period for the RALOs to think, and to decide, and to support.

What we will do, we will try to make a joint meeting between all the RALOs, and we will try to explain to them what is needed, what are the rules, and what are the deadlines. This call should be done, I don't know, perhaps we can do it on 10th of February at the moment. No not 10th. 7th. We can do it on 7 February. This call will be important because it will be more or less, we will give them the procedure, give them the possibilities, and the dates.

So I propose that we do this call on 10, not 10, 7th of February, Friday 7th of February. Is there any objection for this date? Why I say 7th is because I will be travelling until the 6th, so 7th I would be in Tunis and I will be unable to participate in the call. Okay, Maureen please.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you Tijani. This is Maureen for the record. Just to be clear, so [?] the 7th, [?] timeline of 14 days for the RALO candidates to be identified, is that not cutting it pretty fine to have the meeting to explain on February the 7th? Also just to clarify one other thing, with the candidates, you mentioned that the candidates had to be among from the three people who missed out?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes, yes.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Is that the case?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes, exactly.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

They can't actually nominate anyone else? It's just that I was reading through the APRALO message that came from [Surinash], and she [?] said that are there any other candidates to be nominated? And I just wanted to get that clarified because I think the RALOs need to, RALO leaders need to really understand who these candidates can be.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Maureen, that's why there is at least one of the RALO member of this committee. In fact, there is two from each RALO. But unfortunately today, there is not a lot of attendees, and I'm so sorry for that, but I count on you to transmit the message. The choice cannot be done from elsewhere, it is only from those three persons who already submitted their EOI.

And they passed the preliminary assessment, so that means that they fulfill, how to say, the conditions, the criteria. So those are the people who can be added to the slate. And for sure, it is not, I don't think we need all of this time to do that, but it is good to have time now that

people already received the name of Heidi, in which everything is

explained, everything.

Even the addition to the slate is explained in the mailing. So they have time to think about it. And we in the middle of the period, we will come back to them, and one moment please. Okay. 7, 11. We will come to them and have a teleconference to explain to them everything, to give them all of the elements, and to explain to them that any addition and

to have the support of at least three of the RALOs.

So we can do it earlier, but earlier I would be traveling and I don't want to make it on short notice, so that people, all people come, all people be on the call. Perhaps also make a [Doodle] so that we will know which is the best time for this teleconference, to have the maximum of participation. And so, it is I think the earliest date is 7 of February. Today we are 29th, so short notice it is not possible, and then I will be

travelling, so 7th, I think 7th of February will be good.

Okay. I have two hands. Maureen is it old hand or do you ask for the

floor a second time?

MAUREEN HILYARD:

I'm sorry. It is an old hand, I'll just put it down.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay Dev please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. Thanks Tijani. I have no problem with having the single purpose multi RALO call on February the 7th. Two concerns. One, well, one is that well as – we are five regions here, and finding a time where all the regions can effectively participate maybe a challenge. The first question is, is one call sufficient? Or do we do it like how ICANN does webinars, we choose two different times, two different webinars, two different times to suit all the regions?

That's my first question. I have a second question. I have a further question, but...

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Okay. Second question. After the call on February 7th, the deadline of the RALO addition of the regional candidates is on the 11th. My concern is that, well, we need to have transcripts of the call at least available, at least for all of the RALOs, because not everybody who is going to be on that call. So the information on this call needs to be transcribed and made available to all of the RALOS, because then they can review that, and make the decisions as to what candidate they want to support, and also whether they wish to add an additional candidate from the three applicants [?].

So my concern is, when would those transcripts be available, and would that, and you know... Because I want to have those transcripts available

so that the RALOs can then make their choices, the best choice possible. That's it for now.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Dev. For your first question, it's a very good idea to have two calls so that everyone can participate in the teleconference. For your second, and I understand it very well, it should be 24 hours, but we will be facing a weekend, so it will be 24 hours after the weekend, so that means that to be perhaps after the deadline. I would like to say that everything is written in the mail of Heidi that has been sent yesterday.

The teleconference is only to make things more clear. And we give two times so people have to attend. And if they don't attend the first one, they can attend the second. I don't think that we, because if you want to have all the good conditions, and I understand, I would like to do it, but I don't know how to do it. I don't know how to, because I don't want to make a call on short notice, we will have less attendance if we do a longer one, let's say, a reasonable time.

Second, because I cannot do it before 7th since I am coming back home on the 6th, so I don't know. If you have any idea how to do it, tell me. But again, I say that everything is already explained, first on the rules of procedure. Second, on the email sent widely by Heidi. And third, there will be two teleconferences 12 hours apart so that everyone can attend. Dev, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Okay. This is Dev. I'm trying to look at the schedule here to try and figure out how to make sure the availability of transcripts in time for the RALO deadlines. But another question that's coming to mind, that's probably needs to be clarified, the multi-RALO call. These are all the five candidates that have been selected by the BCEC, or do they also include the three candidates that submitted their AOI but were not selected byt eh BCEC?

My question is, the three applicants that submitted their AOI, will they be on this call on February the 7th?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

No. No, it's not a [?]... It is a meeting to clarify, to explain, to make things clear to every member of [?]... That's why we do this call. When they decide to add someone, when the slate is completed, in this case, everyone can do, it's complete, we are not yet there.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

This is Dev. Thanks.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay. Thank you. Any other questions please? So I don't see any other questions. I would like to ask you all please to report to your RALO, to your region, the content of this teleconference, especially the addition, how the addition can be done, from where we can pick people, and what are the deadlines. Okay? So the next step, I say again, first the teleconference across RALO teleconference, which will be programmed for 7th of February, which is a Friday.

We will do a double to define the best two times, we'll do it in two times, and we will see what are the two best times so that everyone can attend. Action item, staff [?]. This is the first step. And when this call is done, then the RALOs will have until the 11th, I think, one moment. Okay. The 11th of February to define the names to be added, and to the 21st of February to have the support of three RALOs.

And then 21st of February we will be almost at the election period at the election, since we have only two days to start to have the final slate. And if we have the final slate, we can begin the election phase. The first one is to begin not later than 16th of March. Okay? So you have the timeline and everything is explained in the timeline. If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to ask me.

Yes, I have two hands. I have first Dev.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Okay. Thank you Tijani. This is... Thanks Tijani. This is Dev speaking. Just looking at the initiation of the first round which has to happen by the 16th of March. I mean, the odd thing is, I believe, starting on the 21st. So is it that, how should I put it? Well, I guess my thinking was like my questions, why not do the actual voting thing at the ICANN face to face meeting?

Or is it not considered a good...? Why does it have to happen before the ICANN meeting in Singapore?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Dev for the question. [?]...but not for the first round because we will have to do it in the two rounds. The first round we will make the slate made of three candidates only. So the first round is to drop two of the five. And this will be done [?]. I hope there will not be five, and I hope that everything goes smoothly so that we can do the second round in Singapore.

I am planning to do it in Singapore because it is better, if there is a time we can do it live. And when it is done live, nobody will complain. Did I respond to your question?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Thanks Tijani. This is Dev speaking. Indeed. I suppose one thing that comes to mind then is that well, if you put it for the successive rounds that could happen during the ICANN face to face meeting, we have to make sure that remote participation is available, especially for those, well, for those – how should I put it? For those who are part of the electorate [?]... vote on behalf of the RALO. So, those alternates, they have to first be able to travel, then would have to have remote participation into those... That's it.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay. Thank you. Normally the whole electorate would be in Singapore, since they are – the ALAC members and the RALO chairs. So normally they would be all in Singapore. If someone is not there for any reason, they can do it remotely and we have the means to do so. We would vote to do it for all people, we will do it face to face for the

maximum, and if there is one or two remaining they will do it remotely, as we do normally.

Okay? [CROSSTALK]

SILVIA VIVANCO: ...I would like to ask a question?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I see the hand of Oksana. I don't know if Oksana would like to tell

something before I give you the floor Silvia. Oksana?

SILVIA VIVANCO: I think Oksana wants to speak, but...

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, that's it.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yeah. But I don't know if she can, she can't speak so she post her

question on the chat. [?]

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I can't speak, she said, I can't speak. Yes, I see.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

So if you allow me, I can read her question for the record. Oksana said, in RALO we have to [?]... our current regional ALAC members, especially involved [?]... Is there any procedure for this?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes. Yes, Oksana. There is a procedure for that, and it is on the rules of procedure, rule number 19. That was displayed at the beginning of this call. Everything is addressed. This case is addressed. And it is up to the RALO to choose a replacement, and they have to do it according to their rule of procedure, their own rule of procedure. They have to do it properly with the vote, etc., but according to their own rule of procedure.

Oksana, did I answer your question? Okay.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Tijani, [?]... one clarification if I may ask you, so I noticed that this conference call will be on Friday, the 7th of February, second call to be determined. Is that okay?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

No, no. Both will be on Friday, but 12 hours apart.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

12 hours apart. Okay.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Do you understand?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: If we do the first at 8:00 in the morning, we'll do the second at 8:00 in

the evening.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Got it. Okay.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: And we will not decide on the timing now, we will make a [Doodle] for

that so that we will see where, what are the times, where we have the

maximum of participants.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, got it. Thank you. I note it, thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: So, a [Doodle] for both. A [Doodle] for the first, a [Doodle] for the

second. What we can do is, but for the whole period, the whole day.

And according to the availability of people, we will pick two times.

Okay?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay. Consider it done.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, thank you. Any other questions?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Tijani, this is Maureen speaking. Just to let you know that I actually

don't have Adobe Connect excess again, but I can hear you so I'm still

here.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, thank you very much Maureen. So, any other questions? So if

there is not other questions, I will adjourn this call. We will not decide on another call for the BSMSPC. We will have a call on 7th of February, a

call two times on 7th of February, and then we will decide for the

BMSPC. Thank you very much and have a good night. Bye-bye.

[Various people say thank you and goodbye]

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]