

JULIA CHARVOLEN:

Hello and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the AFRALO call on Wednesday the 4th of December 2013 at 1800 UTC. On the French channel we have today Olivier Crépin-Leblond, Dr Alioune Badara Traore, Fatimata Seye-Sylla, Pierre Dovonou, Etienne Tschichimbi and Tijani Ben Jemaa. On the English channel we have Phillip Johnson, Mohamed El Bashir, Pastor Peters, Mazaoe Anderson, Otunte Otuneh and Evan Leibovitch. From Staff we have Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, Yaovi Atohoun and myself, Julia Charvolen.

We have apologies from Baudouin Schombe. Your interpreter for today will be Camila. Please state your name before you take the floor for transcript purposes and speak at a reasonable rate to make the job of the interpreter a lot easier.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Julia. This is Aziz for the record. I am very happy to lead this call, in my position as new Chair of AFRALO. I would like us to begin with the first Item on the Agenda, which is the thank you note to AFRALO departing officers. We intended to add this Item to the Agenda to thank the former responsible people; both Fatimata and Tijani. I had the luck of working with these two people as Secretary of AFRALO.

Throughout these three years, thanks to you, AFRALO became what it is today. It is the RALO most active within ALAC and it is an example to the rest of ALAC. Fatimata was an exceptional leader. She worked very much for AFRALO since its creation in 2009 and as regards Tijani, I don't

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

know if he's on the call yet, but I cannot begin to explain the extent of which his work was important to AFRALO. He's a person who works a lot; whether it's for AFRALO or for ALAC.

I will not spend a lot of time on this subject. I would like to thank them infinitely for what they've contributed to AFRALO and I'm sure they will go on contributing with the same force and importance so that AFRALO will remain the region that represents Africa within ICANN. To conclude this Item I'd like to introduce to you – though I think you already know them – the incoming Directors of AFRALO.

We have Mohamed El Bashir, who's here with us. He's the Vice President for AFRALO, and Phillip Johnson, who comes from ISOC Liberia, who is the new Secretary. Would you like to add anything regarding this Item? Just let me know. Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Aziz. I have just heard what you were saying and I would like to thank you. I appreciate that comment very much. I think you overdid it a little but I'm still very happy. I was one of the three musketeers who let the work of AFRALO and guided that work to this stage. I am very happy that one of our musketeers is today the President of AFRALO, the Chair of our group. I think we always want to improve, so I'm sure that AFRALO will profit from this will that Aziz has.

I would like to say that Mohamed is a very wise person. He's very knowledgeable and he has the know-how we need. I'm sure he will help

Aziz as the Chair of AFRALO; Mohamed being the Vice Chair, to continue to foster our work. I'm sorry, actually, I would like to mention Phillip's great contributions as well, but from what I've seen to this day I've seen a man who's ready to work and who also tries to do so, and I'm sure he'll do a great job in his new position.

Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Tijani. Are there any other comments? Great. Now we're going to move onto Item #3, which is open public comments. Olivier's here with us today. I have tried to translate the different statements, which were adopted recently. I would ask Olivier to correct me if I'm wrong, but we first have – [inaudible 00:06:06]. The first of the statements is the Thick WHOIS Policy Development Process, which was about this.

Then we have a statement on the second Accountability and Transparency Review Team, which is ATRT 2. There have been many discussions on this topic and those who are interested should try to follow the different statements and discussions that are led on this subject. All we need to do is go to ICANN's website to reach those.

The third statement is the Policy and Implementation Working Group, which was also adopted. Item #4 is ALAC correspondence on the [MGBC? 00:06:55] response to the ALAC statement on community applications, which was submitted. Lastly, we have the revised Public

Interest Commitment Dispute Resolution Procedure, the PICDRP. Regarding the statement for endorsements currently being developed, reviewed or voted on by the ALAC, we first have the ccNSO FOI Working Group's Report on Revocation, then the proposed final changes regarding the Technical Liaison Group. ALAC is currently drafting a statement for the first item.

Thirdly we have the protection of IGO and INGO identifiers with all gTLDs, which is a [big? 00:07:41] recommendation for Board consideration. We are also drafting a statement within the framework of the new generic sub level domain project. Then we have [inaudible 00:08:01], who is [with you? 00:08:03] and ICANN's draft mission and focus area for a five-year strategic plan.

That is all we have to say regarding Item #3, which is open to public comment. I'd first like to give the floor to Olivier, because I know he always has something to add regarding public statements.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Pastor Peters, very quickly, we have muted your line until Aziz calls on you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you for the floor Aziz. First I'd like to commend you on your position. I think you did very well summarizing which were the currently open public comments, and in translating them as well, I think you did a wonderful job of doing that. Thank you for doing that. It is much easier

to follow. Two of these statements are quite important and they are underway of addressing – the first of which is the ccNSO FOI Working Group’s Interim Report on Revocation.

Revocation is actually when a country-code or the organization which leads a country-code transfers that code to another organization or to another government, or the government, or to another body in general.

This is a great matter of discussion actually and there’s a certain struggle with some operators or country-code names, which started a couple of years ago – very long ago indeed – who had to face countries who do not know why there is a third party operator in charge of their country-code, when in fact it should be the country itself who’s in charge of that country-code.

I think it would be important to at least find out about what’s being discussed. The second great discussion is the proposed bylaw changes of ICANN regarding the Technical Liaison Group. This Technical Liaison will deal with the NomCom and the Board. There are several people who have worked on this and to this day we haven’t concluded on a statement.

We think it’s a good idea to first address the Technical Liaison Group within the Board, and for it to be a group in the Board. We think it’s a new decision so we think we should see what the best solution could be. The other three statements or endorsements currently being developed are only at their beginning, so if you are interested in one of these three subjects, or in all three, it would be wonderful if we could have someone

from AFRALO participating in drafting the statement, so that we could have a penholder from AFRALO.

I am trying to find a word in French. I am sorry, I got confused. So, if you have any questions about what I just said, please do ask me. Thank you Aziz.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Olivier. We keep repeating or asking the different ALS meetings to follow and address this activity and this discussion. It's very important to eventually have the voice of Africa heard. I think Peter is asking for the floor.

PASTOR PETERS:

I'm quickly going to make a response to the Chair's opening remark, and that is to say that on behalf of my ALS and others from my country, I welcome Aziz, I welcome El Bashir and Phillip on Board as the new leaders of AFRALO. I once again repeat what I said at the last meeting, by thanking Fatimata and Tijani and Aziz for their previous roles as leaders of AFRALO.

My comment would be that now that they are new and they are on board, I want the present leaders also to receive with an open mind any comment or contributions from any ALS, no matter how critical it may be, because all of us may not agree on the same point of view at any single point in time. So, if and when leaders are criticized or opposed in a way, it should not be seen as something that is detrimental to our

qualitative goal; it's to be seen that, yes, we're working towards one good goal and that's to make the voice of Africa heard within ICANN.

So, we're prepared to do our bit to support this leadership and we also appreciate that the present leadership appreciates the contributions of every ALS from all over Africa. Once again, I congratulate all of you in the leadership and I want to work together as we move on.

Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much Pastor. Thank you for your kind words. I'm sure, as we say in Africa, we'll hold each other's hands and work wonderfully together. I think there's a lot we can do for our region within the Internet community. Now, if there are no other comments we can move onto Item #4, which is reports. Is there anyone else who wants to take the floor?

All right, we'll move onto reports then. We tried to do something different here. You'll see that we'll try to add current topics to our report section, whether it is by someone from AFRALO or someone from outside our organization, or someone from ICANN, so that we see the different topics, which are important to the community.

For today's call we have a classic to us, which is recent and due to the upcoming activities of ALAC. Tijani will take the floor now to briefly tell us about ALAC's activities.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Aziz. I think to sum up ALAC's activities during this period, we could say that ALAC's big points of interest are to... On the one hand we have the London Summit and the appointment of a Board Member who's chosen by ALAC. During this period we worked very much on these two matters. Regarding the Summit, as you know, we sent out a survey and almost 95% of ALSes filled in that survey, which is very good. Now, only those ALSes which filled in those surveys will be able to come to London.

Seeing the results of that survey, which we will be analyzing tomorrow and the day after that, we will start to certify which subjects will be discussed during that Summit and establish the Agenda.

After that we'll try and see in which zones or regions ALSes need training so that they can properly follow the activities for the Summit and be active during those activities in London. We're going to try and establish a training program, which will train them prior to the Summit, so that when those ALSes come to London they will be real, active participants and not just observers.

I think that quite sums it up as regards to the Summit. Now, there are many people in the Summit Working Group and they did many other activities and complete other tasks, but that is the main task. Now, as regards to the appointment of a Board Member who will be chosen by ALAC – we created two Committees. In each Committee there are two members of each RALO. We have Fatimata and Mohamed in BCEC and in the BMSPC, myself and Baudouin Schombe.

Work is underway. That was presented in Buenos Aires. We published the timeline during that meeting; the schedule for the different activities that are going to take place. The official presentation to ask for avocations for candidates will begin. It is the BCEC who is in charge of that. I am not a member of that Committee, so I am not in the position of telling you where they're at, or when the date indeed for the presentations of AfrICANN is.

I think it is very important because there is a lot of work going on and we should follow the rules and the regulations so that we do not have any issues. I note that this will be a lot of work for ALAC. That is our great [axis? 00:20:15] of work, but there is also work on the metrics, which is how we measure participation for ALAC Members. In that regard, the Working Group on Metrics, to which I belong, has been working.

Our work is quite advanced at this point, but we're trying to find the point of view of the different ALSes, to find out what it is they think as regards what we have done. Once we've concluded our work. That will be published. We also presented a draft of the work that we've been doing, with different speakers and metrics, which could define the way we go on.

We now have asked all ALSes and all RALOs to consider that and to contribute with their point of views, so that when this is adopted, everyone will be aware of what we've discussed – no one can come and say that it's not fair.

It is a way of seeing the participation of ALAC Members, because as you know, ALAC cannot participate if there isn't a forum. ALAC cannot make decisions if people do not participate at our meetings. We are trying to see what their level of participation is. We should enhance that participation.

If people do not come and vote and they don't express their opinions, and there's no forum, we can't discuss and include everyone. There are lots of metrics, as you will see in the document we're preparing, and we're trying to add objective metrics so that in the end we'll be able to say who's more active, who's less active and who doesn't participate at all.

After that we'll try and find a procedure to get people to be more active; so if they don't want to participate, we won't bother in trying to find out what they think. That's all I will say.

Oh, I forgot, I had something else to say. ALAC, being a Member of ICANN, is an Advisory Committee. We've discussed and considered in great detail with the rest of the Members of ICANN, the statement from Montevideo and the meeting that will take place in Brazil. These matters will affect the future of Internet governance and ALAC was quite active in that regard. We've participated in the panel that took place in BA, which dealt with that matter.

We also work with the NCSG, which is the Non-Commercial Stakeholders Group. They belong to the gNSO. We have joined them, to work together, and that is the beginning of a Working Group, which is cross-

constituency. That is something that encompasses different parts of ICANN. That is all. Thank you Aziz.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you Tijani. You were very accurate in your detail. As you say, there are several different activities, but we try to discuss during this call whatever's in regards to our region; namely the London Summit, because all the ALSes will be there. Olivier said there will be 180 or even 200 ALSes in London, and they will be representing our region.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Aziz, we cannot hear you anymore. Can you hear me?

JULIA CHARVOLEN: Yes, we hear you.

AZIZ HILALI: I am back. For the appointment of a Member to the Board, as Tijani mentioned, that's something that's of great interest to us, because each RALO will have a voice for the appointment of the member who will represent our region within ALAC, and then ALAC refer the Board. I am now going to give the floor to Mohamed to speak to us about the Strategic Panel.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much Aziz, [inaudible 00:25:48] Panel. I'd like also to thank Pastor Peters for the kind words and [inaudible 00:26:04] actively work with the AFRALO community. Just to give a background and show you all the Members [of? 00:26:12] ICANN Durban, ICANN President and CEO, Fadi Chehadé, has announced the creation of the new five ICANN Strategic Panels, that will [active? 00:26:28] ICANN and its community in terms of developing the strategic approach to some of the issues.

The first Panel includes member experts from outside the community. In Buenos Aires the Panel Chairs had sessions with their members in producing the Panel with the community, and talking about what the Panel's objectives will be. I'll give you a briefing on what's happened in that regard. The first Panel is a Strategy Panel on Technology Innovation, which is chaired by Paul Mockapetris, who is developer of the DNS.

In that Panel, an objective is to develop the technology role for the DNS and how DNS could evolve, and what are effectively the security issues. He introduced his Panel to the community. The second Panel is a Strategy Panel on the Internet Governance Ecosystem, which is chaired by Vinton Cerf.

You'll all know him as the "father of the Internet" and that Panel should work on how ICANN will be [inaudible 00:28:15] with other [technologies? 00:28:15] Internet governance atmosphere. Its work is really important. From Africa, Adiel Akplogan, who is the CEO of AfriNIC, is already a Member of the Panel.

Then the third Strategy Panel is the Multistakeholder Innovation Panel, which is chaired by Beth Simone. That Panel will look at how best to evolve the multistakeholder model, and how this model can have mutual [platform? 00:28:57] enable the community to engage more with ICANN and in the ICANN decision-making process.

Our [inaudible 00:29:14] in Africa, Nii Quaynor, is chairing the Strategy Panel for the Public Responsibility Framework, which is looking at ICANN's role and public mandate and mission, and what ICANN could deliver on this.

Then we have the fifth Strategy Panel, which is the role of ICANN in the Future of Internet Governance, [which are going to be? 00:29:56] identified. Those are the five Panels and at the Buenos Aires Meeting just gone, there was a joint session between all the Panel Chairs and the ICANN CEO introduced the Panel Chairs to the community and there was interaction with them, and then there were individual sessions.

Some of the communities [inaudible 00:30:29] of the community, members there, there was emphasis that the Panels should ensure that they are taking on board different constituencies and the support of different organizational input on the process, as well as taking input from our side of the ICANN community.

In the comment period we will see output from the Panels, which is why we need public comments or public consultation. As AFRALO we're likely to organize this and also contribute with all sorts of input to the five Panels. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Aziz, are you there? Can you hear us?

AZIZ HILALI: Hi, can everyone else hear me? I'm sorry, my call was interrupted once again. I'd like to thank Mohamed for what he said. I would like to say that there might have been an issue with the sound between Mohamed and the interpreter, because there was quite some delay in translation. I'd like to ask everyone to speak very clearly and at a loud volume so that the interpreter can do her job properly.

Now, Phillip has been asking for the floor for a while. Phillip, do you want to take the floor?

PHILLIP JOHNSON: Yes, I would like to take the floor. Just a little comment from a presentation that was just made by Tijani. That is [wholly? 00:33:15] what was conducted [inaudible 00:33:14] in the Agenda, but a survey was conducted and this survey is supposed to select those that will be participating in the ATLAS II in London.

I already started receiving some comments from our ALS of, "How have you selected somebody already to go to the ATLAS II in London?" We are regional leaders that are going to work on it. Very shortly we'll be coming up with a final list. We have not made a selection, so I would like [Fadi? 00:34:06] to elaborate a little bit on the survey, and those that are going to participate in the ATLAS II Summit in London. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

I'm not sure if I understood properly. Are you asking about the vote to appoint a person, or on the Board, who will be a Member that the ALAC appoint? This will be an Item on the Agenda of another teleconference and we will agree there on the person who will represent AFRALO for the vote before ALAC. That will either be voted on during the teleconference, or else via email. Is that what you asked?

I'm not sure whether I replied to your question properly, but there is also Item #3 on the recent and upcoming activities of AFRALO Members, so maybe someone would like to speak about their ALSes. Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

This is not regarding the activities. This is about what Phillip was just saying. He was saying that once the schedule is established, ALSes should be able to comment so that their comments can be taken into account, but the schedule will be prepared on the basis of what ALSes already added to the survey. That schedule will be established according to what the ALSes want and asked for.

Now, as regards the Board Members that will be appointed by ALAC, there will be ALAC Members that will be voting, but there will be three people voting, so there will be three people voting for an ALAC Member, and Aziz, who's the Chair of AFRALO, will be voting. Our vote from AFRALO could actually be discussed so that ALSes can express their points of view.

That is a possibility that our bylaws and now rules give us. As Aziz was saying, perhaps we could have a special call to discuss that matter and to agree on a candidate that Aziz could vote for.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Tijani. We're now going to move onto Item (c), which his recent and upcoming activities of AFRALO Members. We have already said on this Item that ALSes should post on the Wiki what their activities have been, and to announce them. If they did not know how to post on the Wiki, they could send Phillip, Mohamed or myself their information so that we can post them on the Wiki. Would anyone else like to take the floor regarding this Item?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA:

Good evening everyone. I just wanted to discuss the recent and upcoming activities of ALSes. Last time we had agreed on discussing whether we wanted to copy other RALOs and ask one specific ALS per call to present their activities. That would be one ALS a month.

Because although we asked ALSes to update the Wikis with their activities, I have to say, that wasn't a great success. We discussed the possibility of asking one ALS to present their activities every month, and we hadn't achieved a decision on that point. That's what I wanted to say.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you Fatimata. You're completely right. We had indeed agreed to have one ALS on the spot every month. After [the officers? 00:40:03] should know in advance who that should be, so that we can add them to the Agenda and give them the floor. It is just the way you're saying.

We agreed on doing this during the different monthly teleconferences, and it's interesting actually, because it gives the other ALSes the possibility of showing their example to the others, so that one ALS can follow the example of someone else.

In my ALS for example, we're going to try and do something that Tijani did regarding gTLDs, and what they did in regards to the different companies and organizations in other countries. Does anyone else want to take the floor? Etienne? Go ahead.

ETIENNE TSCHICHIMBI: Thank you Aziz. I had a question to ask. Given that we're discussing ALSes, we had thought about creating an ALS together with a group of friends, but how was I to know whether to apply at the ICANN level? Do we have to be recognized by the law of our country, or else can we just apply and be accredited afterwards by the law?

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you for your question Etienne. I would like to let Tijani ask this because I'm sure he knows the answer to that question.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Aziz. In the application there is a point that says that you should be recognized or accredited by your country, so that is actually compulsory before you apply to ICANN. [interference 00:42:12] ... currently great debate and that is another question; another request. Two regions had problems recently; that's Europe and North America, and they each solved them their own way.

I remember I had asked AFRALO about a year or two ago and the answer was no. So I'm ready to hear comments in this regard. Thank you. Aziz, can you hear us?

AZIZ HILALI:

Yes, thank you. Fatimata raises her hand.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA:

Thank you Aziz. I actually think we should once again reconsider this matter of individual members, and I think we should try and see how we can group them in one ALS. It is true that we will have this issue with legal accreditation, so those who are interested in being individual members – and I think Etienne is at that stage – should try and find a way to create an individual way ALS; something that is recognized somewhere, with the criteria of the region.

If they have been recognized by one country, AFRALO could accredit them as ALSes, but they won't be grouping individuals. So whenever we present an initiative, those individuals can access our discussions via that ALS of individuals. I think we could discuss it further and someone else

could decide on this, but Etienne, I would be ready to help you if you need any help. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Etienne and thank you Fatimata. Silvia has posted a link on the Adobe Connect, on the application process of ALSes. I see that we have Evan here currently and he is a Member of NARALO, so we would like to give him the floor now that he raises his hand.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Thank you very much. Greetings from Toronto. I raised my hand mainly because I was involved in the original work within NARALO to create a mechanism for enabling individual users, and I welcome the initiative within AFRALO and I offer my own assistance, if that is necessary. The way that we did this within the North American region was to create a virtual ALS. This ALS is not legally constituted the way a regular ALS is, however we essentially have our individual members.

There is a criteria for them joining the RALO as individuals. When they join as individuals they become members of this virtual ALS. This virtual ALS has its own leader. That leader polls the individuals and then votes on their behalf any time we have a vote amongst our ALSes. So, even when it came time to have elections for the regional leadership, our individual leaders, collectively between them, had one vote – as much as any other ALS.

We had essentially two votes. We had one vote between the individual members, to pick who their preference was, and then when that was decided that was entered into the regular election as if it was a single ALS participating.

This method is not perfect, however it has satisfied most of the individual members, that they have the ability to participate and vote. It also ensures that nobody is left out of the process simply because they're not part of an ALS or they're from a country that doesn't have an ALS. So I welcome the initiative.

I hope you may be interested in doing that kind of model. The model that EURALO did was slightly different, but it accomplishes basically the same thing – that individual users collectively have the status of a single ALS, and within regional votes they participate that way. I'm delighted to know that you're interested in doing this initiative, and I offer any assistance, if I can be of any help, based on the experience within the North American region. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Aziz, are you there?

AZIZ HILALI:

Yes, thank you Evan. Mr. Peters, please hold. Tijani, I know you're raising your hand, but I have Pastor Peters on the English channel and I have Fatimata on the Adobe Connect and Pierre, who's asking for the floor too. Tijani, do you want to make a comment or a point of order?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I wasn't asking for the floor, I was making sure you were still with us.

AZIZ HILALI: Great. Mr. Pastor Peters will now have the floor.

PASTOR PETERS: Thank you very much Aziz. On this issue of individual membership of AFRALO, I've just listed to Evan and I want to call for caution here and also raise some questions, because there are so many individual members and so many that are involved with the Internet usage all over the world. ICANN is structured in such a way that you have various groupings, of which there's ALAC and then the RALOs and the ALSes.

My question is this: for countries without an ALS, one could understand that yes, those countries will want to participate, and if we have members from those countries who want to be involved in the ICANN process, and they're popular and they actually want to be part of what the ICANN initiative is, I don't see anything wrong in forming an association or a club, and then reaching out to all the interested groups within their countries; the different ISOCs in different countries.

If [inaudible 00:50:35] they could also form an organization and then start that process, [inaudible 00:50:42] from that process. Now, if while they are doing that, [inaudible 00:50:50], both countries could accept the [membership? 00:50:54] or give [a call? 00:50:55] associate members or honorary members, or can participate in meetings but

would not have a right to vote, nor nominate, nor contest elections until they have a formal body or are an ALS. That is one way of looking at it.

Another way of looking at it is for countries where you have ALSes and there are individuals who want to be involved with [accomplices? 00:51:29], if they do not have an ALS they belong to, what stops them from becoming members of an existing ALS in their country? I see this... If you believe in a cause and want to be a part of the process, then you have to follow the rules.

I am not opposed to anybody getting involved with the ICANN process, because nobody can monopolize what ICANN is, but we must be able to encourage people who want to be part of ICANN, to follow the existing structures and protocols. In that way we'll also be encouraging [collectivity? 00:52:17].

A time will come when, if we begin to encourage individual membership, before we know it the various ALSes will lose relevance and the individuals who believe they are more technically equipped more than the ALSes, in terms of the technicality involved with ICANN, will begin to override those ALSes who have structures, who have members.

I would say that; 1) this issue needs to be discussed widely, and; 2) [inaudible 00:52:56] and then; 3) we also need to follow what is already on the ground in terms of the ICANN structures, legally. If people are seriously interested in becoming part of... Are interested in participating in the ICANN process, there is [something? 00:53:24] to be done for

becoming a part of any existing ALS in their country. Or [we create?
00:53:29].

They can be part but they cannot vote, they cannot nominate... They cannot have the same rights and privileges of an existing ALS. That is our position.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Mr. Peters. I would like to let everyone know that time actually goes quite fast. We have already been speaking for an hour and we are discussing a matter that is not in the Agenda, so can we please move onto the following Item. Fatimata is asking for the floor. Evan is also asking for the floor. Would you like to comment on this subject? If so, you have one minute to do so. Fatimata?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA:

Actually, I just wanted to thank Evan for that proposal that he made. I think it's a wonderful thing that he did. Perhaps if we work together we could foster our work on this issue and try to improve or solve it, if we could share what we did, we could try and get ALAC to accept that virtual ALS and its creation. I think that might be something we should work together on.

Personally I think... Can you hear me? I was just saying that I wanted to thank Evan and say that we could actually work further on this to get those virtual ALSes represented in our discussions. Thank you. That is all.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you Fatimata. Evan, you now have the floor please. You have one minute.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Thank you very much Aziz. I will keep my comment short. It is a quick reply to Mr. Peters. That is to say that first of all, the operation of having individual members has been in place for some time within other regions, and it has worked well. I invite you to look at the examples that are being set there, and I would simply mention, in terms of the ability for people to join other ALSes, sometimes this isn't possible for either personal, political or other reasons.

I would simply suggest that it is our goal, I believe, within ICANN and At-Large to try and be as inclusive as possible, to reduce the barriers for personal participation and having individual membership goes a significant step towards reducing those barriers for participation. I will leave it at that and I look forward to engaging everybody. I appreciate your comments Fatimata. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. Now, if you agree, I would propose that Phillip, our Secretary, could start a discussion on the mailing list of AFRALO's, so that we can discuss this item. Having gathered all the different points of view, we can add this to our Agenda so that we can discuss it over a teleconference. Do you agree? If everyone agrees, we can then start the discussion. Phillip, please start this discussion on the mailing list.

PASTOR PETERS: May I say something?

AZIZ HILALI: Fatimata agrees. Maybe we could start that discussion. Tijani agrees as well. Silvia, please –

PASTOR PETERS: Pastor Peters.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Let me tell him that you'd like to speak, because I think they're rushing for time now.

AZIZ HILALI: Phillip, you will now have the floor to give us a report on the Niger...

PASTOR PETERS: Pastor Peters, please.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Pastor Peters, we're letting him know, but I think we are over the time, so I think he's rushing to finish the Agenda.

PASTOR PETERS: All right.

PHILLIP JOHNSON: Hello?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Hi Phillip, we hear you, yes.

PHILLIP JOHNSON: Okay. Since the time has [inaudible 00:58:49] from the ICANN 48 Buenos Aires Meeting, I just... The African Regional At-Large Organization, AFRALO, attended and participated in a series of ALAC Working Groups, amongst others, including some policy discussions on hot ICANN topics. We had a meeting with the Board of Directors and there were joint meetings with other ICANN constituencies, such as the ccNSO.

We also attended the public discussions, representing the community at that meeting were... You know Madame Fatimata sat as a Chair. Tijani Ben Jemaa formed the Vice Chair and Mr. Aziz is now Chair. Madame Hadja Ouattara [inaudible 00:59:58] African representatives to ALAC. The highlights of these meetings were as follows:

We [had? 01:00:06] ALAC Metrics Sub-Committee. The discussion in this section was a review of the last meeting Action Item; ALAC Metrics Working Group, which [was heard? 01:00:19] of November 2013, followed by an update from the Working Group. [Other teams?

01:00:32] brought forward concerns with regards to the Agenda and these issues were discussed in an interactive mode.

Each discussion commented on the relevance of a metrics to measure the performance of ALAC Members and At-Large representatives in ICANN activities. I'll briefly go through the second meeting. We had another meeting; an ALAC and Regional Leadership Working Session.

In this Working Session we had a report by Fadi Chehadé, the President and CEO of ICANN. He commended ALAC and the Leadership and the RALO Leadership for their good ideas – not just within the ALAC but across the entire ICANN community.

The CEO also used this occasion to inform participants that the new gTLD program is up and running, and he promised the launch of a new gTLD program. Briefly we went onto... I am giving this update on the series of meetings we had. We attended the At-Large [Future Planning? 01:02:01] Workshop. This session called for a need for ALAC to rectify its [statement meeting? 01:02:09] effectiveness, and ICANN published a response to it.

Then we had ALAC meetings with the ICANN Board, and this discussion focused on two main questions: policy implementation with regards to the gNSO [2013? 01:02:27] and all interpretation of issues. Then there were several other ALAC policy discussions. [inaudible 01:02:40] updated by the WHOIS and the Expert Working Group. There were several presentations made followed by questions and answers.

The Academy Working Group have announced the completion of its Capacity Building Program, and the Outreach and Technology Taskforce [all thought for valid? 01:03:05] on their own activities. We went on to have several meetings with the ATRT – the Accountability and Transparency Review Team. Then we had an AfrICANN Strategy [inaudible 01:03:27]. A presentation was made by our volunteers on the activities since Durban.

There were several projects and the biggest project is that they are doing some [recruiting of? 01:03:42] more people, such as getting managers who will be [on the ground? 01:03:47], engaged in the job, in the African regions. We continued with several other meetings. We also had a meeting called the AFRALO/AfrICANN joint meeting. This was chaired by Madame Fatimata Seye Sylla, who [welcomed some participants? 01:04:11]] for joining this meeting.

A statement was issued, discussed and adopted with [multiplication? 01:04:18]. This statement was with regards to the [DSOC? 01:04:24] issue, for participants at ICANN meetings. If you go to the link onto our Wiki, you can get more details of this update there. Then we had another meeting called the Joint ATLAS II Capacity Building Working Group, for discussions concerning the capacity building of ALSes that will be participating in the London Summit.

We had a wrap-up with several timelines and these can be found on the Wiki. That's just an update of the meetings we attended. There were several others. This was the update on the meetings we attended.

[inaudible 01:05:17] do a [leaflet? 01:05:21] and they will be distributed to all of you. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you Phillip for this detailed report. Are there any questions regarding Phillip's update? [pause]

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Aziz, we can no longer hear you.

PHILLIP JOHNSON: Is Aziz connected?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Does anyone want to...? Mohamed, do you want to Chair this call whilst Aziz comes back?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: I will Chair until Aziz is reconnected. We're currently on Agenda Item #5 – Items for information. We have the AFRALO AfrICANN scorecard, but Fatimata and Aziz – Fatimata, please update us.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Thank you Mohamed. I'm going to try and keep it short because I think Phillip has somehow mentioned the scorecard already. What this was

actually was that we put together every statement we ever wrote. We wanted to do the follow up to see if ICANN had anything to say regarding these statements; if our expectations had been met.

We put together every statement we ever wrote and submitted that to Sebastian Bachollet, so that he can submit it to the Board officially, because what had been asked for during the Durban meeting, and what was on our Agenda, was to ask what had been done regarding the different statements that we've presented successively. There were actually ten already, by Durban.

That is a brief summary of the scorecard. If you want to see the content of that statement I suggest that you go to the Wiki. That is all. I think I have finished now. I think Aziz is back?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you Fatimata.

AZIZ HILALI: Now I am back. Where were you? Fatimata, you just mentioned the scorecard, right?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes.

AZIZ HILALI: Now, can we speak of the joint AFRALO/AfrICANN meeting in Buenos Aires?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: The joint AFRALO/AfrICANN meeting in Buenos Aires dealt with our meeting strategy, the ICANN meeting strategy. As you know, ICANN is considering whether we should change the strategy regarding the different cities chosen in all five continents. Now, given the issues on the lack of adequate infrastructures that is adequate to the size of ICANN's meetings, they have considered to stop holding meetings in Africa.

That is what was discussed and worked on. That was the subject that we chose. In our statement we asked not only to keep recurrent rotation, but we also spoke about visas, because there are some countries who host ICANN meetings who will not issue visas to some members. In general, African participants are the ones that most suffer from these issues. That was one of the items that we also discussed and addressed in our statement.

We could ask ICANN to follow the diligence that they should, so that participating and organizing countries can issue visas to all participants. There were important members from our group, such as [Baudouin? 01:12:01], who has been appointed to ALAC, who could not participate at the meeting, because his visa was denied.

This issue was our main point. I think of the ALAC community mostly because it's the one that I know most. I think we shall find a new solution to this issue. We shared a draft version of the statement. We discussed it, and we made some amendments in the drafting and explained some of it, but there was a more broader, general discussion on what we presented after that.

If you want to access the last version, the most updated version of that work that we're doing with [Mahi Douma? 01:12:50], from Nigeria, who had made some suggestions, then view the last version presented. If you have anything else to add, please do so. That is all I have to say. Thank you. Aziz, I'm done. [pause] If Aziz is not here then I will say Mohamed, I'm done.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much Fatimata. Now we can talk about the Brazil IG Global meeting. I'm sure you're following up on the discussions and debate about the plans around the IG Meeting that will take place in April next year... Go ahead Tijani.

AZIZ HILALI: Tijani has asked for the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I'm sorry Mohamed, but I have something to add to what Fatimata said regarding the ICANN meeting strategy.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sure, go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: If you will, it's not that they had the purpose of not coming to Africa anymore, it's just that they wanted to hold less meetings in Africa because there aren't as many countries that can welcome as many people. Another point that we discussed, which is also important, is the different meetings that overlap, and the sessions at ICANN meetings are actually a lot more than they used to be, so the solution they found was to have them overlap.

The AFRALO and AfrICANN communities discussed this overlap also. That's what I wanted to add. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you Tijani. We have very serious connection issues. I hope everyone can hear me? Where are we? Is it 5(c), the Working Group on the ATLAS Summit II? Tijani, you have the floor now.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you Aziz. I will not take your time on this because I already mentioned ALAC activities a while ago, so I think, Aziz, you can go directly to the following Item.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much Tijani. This actually saves us some time. I would like to discuss the IGF in Brazil. Mohamed, you have the floor to discuss this with us.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much Aziz. As you know, you might have followed the discussion and debate about the new Internet Governance meeting that is planned to be held in Sao Paulo, Brazil, in April next year. The meeting will be organized by the Brazilian Government, and it's got the blessing and support from the ICANN Board and President.

Actually, it was one of the topics that was discussed a lot in ICANN Buenos Aires, because some of the community members thought that the approach to this meeting and accepting it, was a put-down decision and there was no community consultation in this regard. The ICANN President has held a community meeting to discuss the meeting and which issues are to be tabled in this new Internet Governance Forum.

There was also a development that needs to be noted, this Montevideo statement on the future of the Internet Corporation, which is basically the RIRs, ISOC, ICANN, and the [Internet tasking force? 01:18:09]. [WCIT? 01:18:11] has put together and produced a statement, which was generally talking about ensuring the Internet to be one fragmentation of the national level.

It also expressed concerns about the region's spy and surveillance issue that has been raised. So there's lots of debate and discussion about

what the Agenda of the coming Brazil meeting is, and I think it's important that we follow this closely. At some point, maybe AFRALO needs to offer some sort of statement of what we need to see in this meeting and our views to go forward.

I think it's important we discuss this with the mailing list. This is going to be an important topic in the coming months. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Mohamed for updating us on this. I know you didn't have a lot of time to discuss this, but I know this meeting brings up a lot of discussion between this meeting and the following Forum on Internet Governance. The purpose is to see which countries, such as Brazil, aim at, and as you say, you're right – I think we should discuss this with ALSes.

We await proposals from the different ALSes to see how AFRALO can contribute to that statement. What I know is that ALAC has already drafted a letter that was addressed to ICANN in dealing with this matter. I see Fatimata is raising her hand. Fatimata first, then Tijani. Because Fatimata is a woman, she will have the floor first.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA:

Thank you Aziz and thank you Mohamed. Aziz, I think you have already considered what I wanted to say, but I wanted to second Mohamed's proposal, which is to draft an AFRALO statement. There should be a

Working Group working on this and I think we should work to say what our points of view on the multistakeholder model are.

We should also say what we understand by that model; what our expectations are on the basis of ICANN's model, how we see that model, what we think would work best, and maybe – if everyone agrees – we could have a call for volunteers so they could populate that Working Group. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Fatimata. We will take up your proposal after Tijani's says what he wanted to say. Tijani, you have the floor. [pause] Tijani, are you there? I think you've been disconnected. In the meantime I would like to say that I personally agree with what Fatimata has said.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you. Aziz, I wanted to add that we started with the Montevideo statement, with those five points of recommendations. After that, this Brazil meeting was created. I'd like to say that ICANN launched this movement, as they called it – but I think it's an initiative – which is ONE-NET. In doing so, they created a mailing list to discuss, and I think we're all on that list at this point.

This initiative shouldn't be related to the Brazil meeting, and from my point of view shouldn't be, because regardless of the output of the Brazil meeting, we should go on. I think in the future we should still adhere to

the multistakeholder model. I think we should follow this, because this deals with the future of the Internet governance model.

This matter will be discussed and I think there should be an initiative from our part. I discussed this at the beginning of the meeting. As members of the ICANN community, of the civil society – for the most part, between us – I think we have to give our points of view. We should follow the discussions that could take place in this regard. We should speak up and give our points of view.

The first thing to do would be to join this ONE-NET network and to join the mailing list to follow the discussions that take place. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Tijani. We will send the information to the different ALSes on the mailing list, so that they can join. Now, regarding Fatimata's proposal, if everyone agrees, there should be a small group who at least follow the preparation of the Brazil meeting. I would like to know whether anyone would like to volunteer to work with Mohamed? I think Mohamed is in this group, with us. He is saying so. Fatimata?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA:

I would like to be a part of the group, of course. I think Pastor Peters would also like to be a part of the group.

AZIZ HILALI:

Great! We have Fatimata, Hadja –

PASTOR PETERS: Yes, I'd be interested.

AZIZ HILALI: Is there anyone else? I nominated Hadja and Pastor Peters.

PASTOR PETERS: I accepted.

AZIZ HILALI: I know. [French 01:26:07] You now have the floor to speak about the ICANN/AfrICANN strategy. I remind you that Yaovi was appointed as ICANN Staff and that he currently works for Africa, together with Pierre Dandjinou. Yaovi, you have the floor.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Thank you all. For those who are on the Adobe Connect room, I have a presentation but I'm trying to get it where it should be. In the first place, regarding the AfrICANN strategy, I would like to say that we have much more participation in Africa for the future of the Internet. That is our aim also; to improve it. We try and foster this work in the continent so that everyone can access the Internet.

Most of the projects that were presented dealt with the development of the Internet in Africa. Ever since this was created, the strategies started.

In Durban we held a forum on the DNS. Then we had another project called the DNSSEC Roadshow, which allowed for one advisor to visit a country during the first stage of this project. Likewise, there was an award in Durban, which sought to recognize the important people to the DNS in Africa. I was recruited to work for Africa and I am in charge of interactions, since I was appointed.

Then we have [Bobby Shee? 01:28:37], who was also hired, and he is in charge of fostering the participation and the engagement of stakeholders in Africa. We have 11 projects, the first of which is to promote DNSSEC, and then to study the ccTLD management in Africa. We're about to start the second phase of this project.

The DNSSEC will conclude in June 2014 and the ccTLD study is underway, but we know that there are many issues with management and the level of delegation and redelegation in Africa. That is why we have asked for this study.

The third project is the implementation of an observatory on the DNS industry. The purpose is to have information about this project regularly and to create this observatory so we can keep up with it. Then we have a program to develop exchanges with DNS industry leaders. This exchange program with DNS members or with industry leaders, seeks to encourage Africans who would like to join this sector, who work there, so that they can seek the knowledge of others.

The fifth project is [is there actually? 01:30:37], because we want to have more African countries in [reserves? 01:30:45]. One of our projects

was the deployment of Anycast [inaudible 01:30:50]. We think this should be done in countries where there could be such servers. We will choose four countries and our aim is to encourage these countries to have root servers.

The sixth project is to have a workshop to raise awareness on the link between domain name issues and trademarks. That is a workshop on WHOIS, trademarks and for African ccTLDs. There will be law sessions simultaneously to raise awareness among users at the domain name level. We should work to raise awareness on such issues.

One of the concerns that we had was about the insurance cost and agreements with the different registers, so we also had it as a point #7: a support program for African registrars. They are also travelling with engagement missions to discuss what ICANN is with people. As part of this outreach initiative we were in Niger and we planned to go to Liberia. We will try and keep in touch with AFRALO and with the local ALSes throughout this process, so that we can communicate their activities.

The ninth item is international events, which is the outreach for participation during international events. We're going to discuss AFRALO. Many people are interested in this. Now, we have redelegation issues that I just mentioned, so for point #10 we have .tg, .gm, .gw. There are issues in Liberia, so at a national level we're trying to promote consensus to do local workshops regarding policy advice for ccTLDs.

Then lastly we have the purpose of implementing a DNS incubation program. We're trying to draft a concept paper to explain this process. We're going to finish this process on June 30th 2014. We're going to try and build this entrepreneurship program and implement this. This is all I have to say. Thank you for your attention.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Yaovi. I think everyone is delighted to hear that you have 11 programs for the sake of Africa. We hope they will all be a success. We're ready to help you and we would like to thank you for thinking of AFRALO and working for AFRALO. Are there any questions for Yaovi?

Okay, I have one Yaovi. This regards the latest development with the ccTLD of the Democratic Republic of Congo. I heard that the country was completely disconnected at the .cd level?

YAOVI ATOHOUN:

Yes indeed. There is currently an issue because of the governmental level. That government wouldn't like to have the delegation of that management. I couldn't say whether the issue is related to that conflict. That conflict has the Ministry of Technologies for Congo intervening. At the ICANN and IANA level, they're working with the registrars to try and solve this.

At the staff level we have been in contact with them and we said that we should work at a national level to solve this issue with their ccTLD. I think it has been solved now but I do not have any further information.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Yaovi. If there are no other questions we can move onto the following Item. This is Item #6 – items for discussion. We have new applications for ALSes. We have three applications, the first of which is the [Comuren? 01:36:16] Consumers Association, and the second is ISOC Kenya. The third is the [Digital Age Numeric? 01:36:28] from Ivory Coast.

Phillip, would you like to discuss these items? If you do, please speak away from the microphone but loud enough for me to hear.

PHILLIP JOHNSON:

Okay. Usually, the first thing we have to do is... The various organizations have to meet up with the requirements of becoming an ALS, and they are the procedures, the [hype? 01:37:00], the rules and regulations, in the [state of ? 01:37:03], then we can also discuss this on the mailing list with other members of the ALSes, who will review their applications and pass comments on whether they should be accepted or not, and why.

[The usual? 01:37:22] procedure in the accreditation process, well, I'm new to the system. Perhaps you could give a more detailed explanation on how AFRALO goes about – in the accreditation process – an ALS becoming a member of AFRALO? Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much Phillip. I would like to thank you all. I would like to thank Camila. I know that we have exceeded our time by 15 minutes,

so I'd like to apologize to the interpreter and I would simply ask you for another two minutes, because Tijani is asking for the floor. After that, I promise no one else will be speaking. Tijani, you have the floor, but please be brief.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Aziz. Regarding the three applications that you see, the first was approved by AFRALO and it is now on board ALAC. The other two are undergoing the due diligence; so they would be ISOC Kenya and [Ash Numeric? 01:38:36], but we have not yet received the information that was needed, but they are following the appropriate procedure.

As regards to the way we deal with these applications for ALSes, I think all members on the leadership of AFRALO should closely read applications and the due diligences, so that after that they can give their advice and opinions regarding that application. Regarding the accreditation procedure, this matter was also raised with ALAC and we're thinking about it. We might review this procedure. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Tijani. Thank you everybody for having participated. It was a wonderful call. I think the meeting was quite rich. We have exceeded our time so indeed that shows how much activity we have had. I would like to thank Camila for her activity, her work and her know-how. We would like to apologize on a personal level to Heidi, Julia and everyone else.

Thank you all for having participated; even Evan, who isn't a part of AFRALO, and Olivier, who were here with us today.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, this was a wonderful meeting, Aziz. Thank you very much.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Congratulations.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Indeed, yes. Congratulations to the entire team. Thank you Aziz.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Goodbye everyone.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]