

GISELLA GRUBER:

Thank you Veronica, Gisella here. I'd like to welcome everyone on today's LACRALO monthly call on Monday, the 19th of August at 23:00 UTC. On today's call we have Jose Arce, Sylvia Herlein-Leite, Luis Martinez, Wladimir Davalos, Alfredo Lopez, Juan Manuel Rojas, Aida Noblia, Adrian Carballo, Erick Huesca, Leon Sanchez, Diego Acosta Bastidas, Fatima Cambronero, Carlos Aguirre, and Jonny Laureano.

Gilberto Lara will be joining us a little late. We have on the English channel Dev Anand Teelucksingh. And we are hopefully going to have Garth Bruen joining us shortly. Apologies today noted from Olivier Crépin-Leblond, Natalia Enciso, Alberto Soto, Sergio Salinas Porto, Humberto Carrasco, and Javier Jose Pallero.

From staff today we have Silvia Vivanco, Heidi Ulrich, and myself Gisella Gruber. And our interpreters are Sabrina and Veronica. Happy birthday Veronica. And if I could also please remind everyone to state their names not only for transcript purposes, but also to allow the interpreters to identify you on the other language channel, and also to speak at a reasonable speed to allow for accurate interpretation. Thank you and over to you Jose.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Thank you very much. This is Jose Arce for the record. So welcome to the monthly call in August. I'm really very happy to see so many participants on this call. And while we wait for Garth to

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

be connected we will start with the agenda. Based on what we have this [? 0:02:34] in our last conference call, today we can participate on an equal basis.

And one of the topics that we had on the agenda last month was the topic related to the conference, the calls and if they should be chaired by different members. So... I would like to know if there is anyone who would like to chair this call. I also see Juan Manuel Rojas, perhaps he can be the leader, he can proceed with the call today.

I notice Juan Manuel can give us an answer.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Jose. Thank you for giving me the opportunity of helping you with the agenda, and to chair at least the agenda of this call so that we can all participate. I believe that we're still waiting for Garth to be connected. So while we are waiting for him, we can start with the action items if you all agree.

Perhaps we can start dealing with the action items on the agenda. And then we will give the floor to Garth when he is connected. So. Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. So we have the action item related to the working groups update, and we have 10 minutes for that issue. The first topic has to do with the governance working group that was created in Costa Rica. So who is the chair or the leader of this group? So that person can speak about the group or perhaps we can do what Jose has proposed.

Now I open the floor, so Jose please go ahead.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you very much Juan. This is Jose Arce for the record. The idea of this item is to continue with the work proposed in previous calls, and seeing the – not so much or not so much movement and advances of this working group, that it would be to close the working group and perhaps we can discuss all together the benefits of doing this.

There are many people who believe that if we close the working group, now we would open the doors for a new working group with a new agenda, so that would be a positive aspect. And other benefits would be for example, monthly – be waiting for the complete result of that working group.

I would like to say that the only working group... This is the only working group that has not delivered any complete result, not even a first delivery of a draft. So this is the issue with this particular working group. And the task of this working group is not a minor issue because a governance working group is important. We need to extract the main guidelines so as to direct our regions. So perhaps we can now discuss our opinions whether you believe it is good to go the working group or not.

So if you want to make a comment, the floor is open.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. We would like to know if there is any comment. I see Antonio Medina in the call, but I don't see him in the list of participants. So perhaps Antonio may have something to say about this. Carlos, you have the floor, go ahead please. Carlos?

CARLOS VERA:

This is Carlos speaking. Hello? Can you hear me? Thank you very much Juan Manuel. I apologize. I was muted. Regarding what you were talking about, and regarding Jose's comment regarding closing the governance working group, well I was not participating in that group so I think the best option is to go deeper into the task of that working group.

I was reading the final report, I think it is a very important document, very interesting document. So that we can go deeper and so that we can deliver that to those who do not have a concrete idea about the governance issues. So that I think instead of cancelling or closing the working group and start from scratch with a new working group, we can perhaps renew the participants or update the members so that we can give them a new part. Thank you very much.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you very much Carlos. Silvia Vivanco has posted a [leaned 0:09:20] regarding the governance working group. And I see now Fatima Cambronero has raised her hand. Fatima, go ahead please.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO:

This is Fatima Cambronero speaking. Thank you very much Juan Manuel. I share my idea with Carlos, I have some different [thoughts 0:09:41]... At the very beginning we have said that the objective of this working group was to review the operating procedures and the objectives of LACRALO. And we were discussing and working with that, and we – so there was a need to change this or amend some of these points.

So I believe it would be a good idea to reformulate the working group with new objectives and goals, and see if we can review the task. I am not suggesting the fact that the working group should modify this, but perhaps we should perform a survey so as to see which points should be modified, and then we can submit it to LACRALO then to decide if we should change it or not.

This is my suggestion. Thank you very much.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you very much Fatima. Is there any other comments regarding this issue related to the governance working group? Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Well there will simply be no other comment regarding the governance working group. So Jose you have the floor. Go ahead please.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you very much Juan. So this was just to have a concrete action so as to proceed. So what we can do now is to agree on what we are going to do. What Fatima suggested is also very important. We can post this perhaps on the Wiki. We can redefine the objectives, and we can devote a week for participant for people to express their views regarding or to see if they are in favor or against.

And once we finished with this, we will be able to reformulate, or change, or amend, or whatever regarding the governance working group once we have this interaction finished. And then we will decide –

we can close the working group or not, and I think that we can move on with the other items on the agenda.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. There is an email from Natalia, I don't know if Silvia saw it. So she suggests forming small working groups, focus on policy discussions because this was the original idea for this working group. So I think that email from Natalia is focused on other issues but we can take it into account so that we can proceed.
Juan Manuel Rojas speaking.

So if there is no further comment, I think we can now proceed to open the Wiki. And now we will speak about the strategic planning working group, and the task of work done by the group led by Alejandro Pisanty and the discussion regarding the sort matrix. Alejandro, can you hear us?

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro Pisanty speaking. Can you hear me?

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas. Yes go ahead please.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro Pisanty speaking. So perhaps you can present this point and then I will make my contribution.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Alejandro, please, proceed with your comments regarding the matrix discussions. You have been working on this, and there is a pending discussion regarding this topic. So please go ahead.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro Pisanty speaking. So last call, the working group, the strategic planning working group presented the final report. There was a discussion about this report and we had some comments. The comment was posted for reference one month ago, and the chair and the secretariat should discuss this so that we can take the recommendation and thank you very much.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you very much Alejandro. Is there any other comment? As Alejandro was pointing out, this topic is open for discussion. So is there any other comment regarding the strategic planning working group?

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Juan, Jose has his hand up. This is Jose Arce speaking. I would like to reaffirm what Alejandro has said, because he requested that in the last call. So this final report was posted for comments, that there was no interaction on the part of the participants of the community. So I would like ask you all, would you like to leave this for another week so that you can provide feedback? Or otherwise

we can proceed with the need steps in case we decide this was a final document.

So I would like you to post your comments on the AC room in the chat. That is to say, if you would like to have this document another week for consideration or not. Jose Arce speaking for the record. I see someone in the chat and that person is saying another week. So I think we can devote an extra week to these documents so that people can provide corresponding and receive feedback because the working group has made other efforts to create this matrix so there would be to have input from the community.

So we will be sending some kind reminders for you to provide feedback. So this is the end of my intervention. Thank you very much Juan Manuel.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you very much Jose. So we have this request for an extra week and we can close this topic. The next topic has to do with leveling course for the ALSs. Diego Acosta Bastidas, so this is your turn. Diego you have the floor, go ahead please. Diego, can you hear us? Diego, are you on the call? Diego Acosta?

It seems that Diego has some issues with his audio, so please... Diego, could you please check your audio so that you can proceed with your presentation?

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Diego perhaps you are muted.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. He seems to have some audio issues, and some issues with his connection. Well he says that he has an audio problem with the computer. Sometimes the audio in the computer does not work. So if you agree, while Diego solves his issue, we can proceed with the next item on the agenda.

So this is item number four. This is until Diego can solve his issue.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro Pisanty speaking. Please let's proceed with the following item on the agenda.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. The next item on the agenda is a draft agreement with the RIRs, that is to say the agreement between LACNIC and LACRALO. That item, that topic was presented by Jose Arce, so Jose go ahead please you have the floor.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Thank you very much Juan. This is Jose Arce for the record. I see that Silvia has posted the link to the draft of this agreement. So a brief summary. The last item meeting in Durban, we had a specific meeting with the leaders of the RIRs. The idea was to transfer the links among them, and our RALO with the corresponding RIRs. And we have different and many topics arising.

LACRALO has already signed a memorandum of understanding with this RIR, LACRALO submitted to this as in... And based on that draft, we

should draft our loaned document. I personally was able to speak with people in the LACNIC Board, and the only thing that we need to do is to agree on the content of this memorandum of understanding so that we can submit the document to them. So that's why I posted the draft as it is, as it was drafted by the African region so that we can have a template.

So today we have some comments. They were not [substantial 0:22:08], but we had some input. So if you would like to use this page to provide your ideas, well that would be more than welcome. The idea to be work with this during this week and perhaps next Monday we can post the document so that we can have the document finished. Alejandro Pisanty would like to take the floor please.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Okay. I see Carlos with his hand up.

CARLOS AGUIRRE: Carlos Aguirre speaking. Thank you very much Juan Manuel. This is Carlos Aguirre for the record. I was reading the model of the template of the memorandum of understanding hosted by Jose, and I also saw some comments in this regards. So Jose, I would like you to tell me if the comment provided by [? 0:23:32] has, let's say some reality or some ground in terms of the test of the MIU, and if that is the case, could you please shed some light on that? Thank you very much.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Carlos...

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Perhaps we can now give the floor to Alejandro because Alejandro was requesting the floor, and then once you answer that question we can then proceed with Alejandro.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. [? 0:24:21] posted I think three questions. In one question he is asking about the funding [? 0:24:33] and the administrative issues. And we have the original MOU of the RALO of AFRALO. And I made a comment, a clarification, when I posted that. This is the draft, as it is, or as it was drafted by AFRALO. So perhaps that's why we are somehow confused about this.

The [? 0:25:04] members of the community may say, "This is useful for us, or this is not useful for us." Then we can proceed based on that, because of course the reality of AFRALO is not the same as our reality. We discussed in Durban in the plenary session, we discussed that. And the other RALOs for example said that their realities, for example the reality of the RIRs providing economic support...

Well that is not going to be possible for the other regions or RALOs. So the idea is that LACRALO may have support by its RIRs. So perhaps these words that you may not understand is because they belong, or they apply to other RALO. So this is a kind of lack of understanding because we aren't understanding what we are reading, so that's the main issue here.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you very much Jose. Now the next speaker is Alejandro Pisanty. Go ahead please Alejandro.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro Pisanty speaking. Thank you Juan. I think that [Sergio 0:26:31] has good reading skills, so the comment made by Jose is unfair I believe, and I will further speak my point. But Jose, the question is, or since we have many options related to the reality of AFRALO, what is your proposal particularly speaking? Should we ask for financial and economic support from LACNIC or not?

Second, when we speak about administrative support, to what extent should we adapt or adjust your proposal? And what is the support that we are now receiving from ICANN staff? Is it enough? Is it timely, efficient? What is... What we are not receiving from ICANN staff, and what is what we need from the staff of LACNIC?

So I would like to know your analysis about the extent or the concept of expanding the mission, and the provisional difference services. So I think this should be a mission creep, and this has to do with the address manager. So I would like to say that RALO should not be focused on the domain name system, but different aspects of ICANN.

That is to say to pay attention to the protocols, the DNS, the IP addresses. We also need to control the independence and the freedom of different issues when we need to discuss the different policies. And we also need to take into account and know the official position of LACNIC. This might create obligations that might affect that independence. So these are my questions.

This was my intervention. I am Alejandro Pisanty. Thank you very much.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Alejandro. I don't know if Jose would like to reply back to you.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Yes of course. Thank you very much Alejandro. I would like to make some clarifications. First, what I say regarding the lack of [readings 0:29:19]... Well this was just a comment, and I believe that good will people will understand this. I think that participation would be more favorable if we are read more...

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Sorry for interrupting you. This is Alejandro Pisanty speaking. But that is not the point.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. Okay, well, but you are now being disrespectful with that and I am not doing, or I am not behaving in that way. So I think that your questions have to do also with the lack of attention to what people say or what people were told on email.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Alejandro Pisanty speaking. I will leave this call right now.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. So I will repeat so that we can agree on this. This was made to reinforce the relationship between LACRALO and LACNIC. There was... At any time, we spoke about substituting any function or any relationship that our region may have with ICANN. So this is something totally independent.

So we can see a clear difference, [? 0:30:32] knew that we had find with ICANN and the new MOU that we want to, or find our RIRs. And we have particular reasons for this. And what are these particular reasons or issues, these are the ones related to LACNIC. That is all. So I hope now it much clearer, the end assign this MOU with LACNIC.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you very much Alejandro. I see Diego is ready for his intervention. But I would like to ask Diego, would you like to make any comment regarding this – Dev. Sorry Dev, would you like to make any comment regarding this issue or this topic?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: This is Dev. Yes. If I can ask the question. Is anyone hearing me?

UNIDENTIFIED: Go ahead Dev, you have the floor.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thank you very much. This is Dev Anand speaking. So I'm just trying to understand this. So this is a draft taken from the AFRALO's

proposed MOU with AFRALO and AfriNIC. So this has not been circulated to LACNIC, this draft has not been sent to LACNIC for approval or anything that sort as of yet. That's one question. And the second question is, well I think Alejandro has touched on it.

I guess, in my mind, what exactly does administrative services to LACRALO mean? And I'm a little bit not clear as to what that, what does that mean. What sort of administrative services that has not been provided from ICANN? That's it.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Dev. I believe that Jose can take the floor to reply to Dev's questions at this point in time.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Yes of course. Thank you Dev for your questions and I will apply to them now. First of all, as you said this is a draft document. Nothing has been shared with LACNIC so far. What I can say, at this point in time is that people from LACNIC last week contacted me, and they know that we are working on this draft.

And they – their basis for this as per the Durban meeting is the MOU signed by AFRALO. That is what they are using as a basis. So LACNIC is waiting for our final draft, but we haven't sent anything yet. Regarding your second question, as I've said, our administrative services – well, our particular... Fatimata when she is talking about AFRALO, she did not go into detail, and many of the people on this call were also present at

the Durban meeting when Fatimata said that they receive financial and administrative services.

I repeat, we do not want to replace a service currently provided by ICANN. We should speak with Fatimata, and I will send her an email so that she can explain what it is that they understand when they say administrative services. I don't know if it will be beneficial or not, because what we have to agree on is – we have to agree on what we want to sign, the document we want to sign with LACNIC.

But of course I take up this commitment. I will send an email to Fatimata and I expect a reply by tomorrow or the day after.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Jose. I see that Carlos Vera would like to take the floor. Carlos if you would like to add any points regarding this topic in particular go ahead please. This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking again. Carlos Vera, if you can hear us, you can please go ahead and take the floor, if you have any further comment regarding this topic in particular.

Oh, excuse me. We cannot hear you Carlos. And Diego was asking for the floor before that. So Diego, if you have a comment on this topic please go ahead. It is my understanding that you had your hand up because you wanted to speak about the prior topic that was the leveling course.

DIEGO ACOSTA BASTIDAS: This is Diego Acosta Bastidas for the record. I coordinate the leveling core working group. I had my hand up on Manuel because I wanted to join, or re-join the call. So first of all, can you all hear me?

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Yes, Diego we can hear you. But now we're discussing the draft MOU. As soon as we finish with this topic, we will go back to the topic that you want to address because I believe that Fatima, Carlos, and other participants have more comments to add on this topic. So once we finish this topic, we will go back to you so that you can address the topic that you had to address.

DIEGO ACOSTA BASTIDAS: This is Diego Acosta Bastidas speaking. Of course, no problem at all. Sorry for this interruption. Please go ahead with the topic that you are addressing right now.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Diego. So Carlos you have the floor, go ahead please.

CARLOS AGUIRRE: This is Carlos speaking. Carlos Aguirre speaking. I am the last speaker requesting the floor.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. I mean Carlos Vera from Ecuador. Carlos Vera from Ecuador, you have the floor. And in the interest of time, may I please ask you to be brief because we still have other topics on our agenda that need to be addressed. So Carlos Vera you have the floor, go ahead please. Okay. I see that he is typing in the AC room. He's got no audio. So he says that at some point clarification are needed. So he is going to type what his point of clarification.

So in the interest of time, Fatima you have the floor, go ahead please.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima Cambronero speaking. Thank you Juan Manuel. I have a question to shed some light on this issue of this MOU with LACNIC. The question is of the participants of the meeting. I would like to know if we have the possibility at the region, if we do not want to sign the MOU with LACNIC, if we see that it is not necessary or timely or relevant at this point, well, I would like to know if this is possible.

I need some clarification regarding this point.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Fatima. Jose you have the floor now.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Okay. Thank you. Of course we do have that possibility. We are not forced to do anything. At the time when we held this meeting, we spoke about describing the way in which each

region was working with their regional internet registries. They work on an informal basis in a collaborative fashion.

And people from the registries believed that it was better to have a framework that would formalize this collaborative effort or work, and maybe include more or less obligations for each of this parties. This is something that the region has to define, it is not for me to define it. That's why we are discussing it here.

If anyone is against this, you can express this on the Wiki. And of course, the best way to do so is to provide a rationale for your comment. So of course, you are all invited to post your comments on the Wiki.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you now Carlos Aguirre has the floor. Carlos go ahead please.

CARLOS AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre for the record. Thank you Juan. First of all, I believe -- I mean I'm going to play both roles, or I will step into Jose's and Alejandro's shoes. Several things need some clarification, or maybe there are many people that did not participate in the conference calls, or did not read the emails.

That's why we have some doubts or questions here, or else posted on the Wiki. So I see that the message does not get through, does not reach all the intended recipients, or else the intended recipients did not take care of that. Now regarding Alejandro's irritation or aggravation, I

believe that stems from another reason. I think that he left the meeting when – at the point at which we were trying to agree despite our different opinions.

I believe this deserves further discussion. Personally I believe that the MOU is a very good starting point because it will enable us to cooperate with the regional registry, and they can cooperate with LACRALO. I believe that this relationship can be, or can come to fruition and can generate very interesting synergies. Thank you.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Carlos. Jose I don't know if you would like to add anything at this point in time.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. I see a comment posted by Dev, he is suggesting a poll, a vote or a poll to ensure ALSs would agree to this. To make sure that we want a MOU or not. So whether we proceed to a vote, we can still decide to continue.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Okay. Thank you Jose. I believe that this topic is still at a very preliminary stage, and we have the Wiki and the email exchange list for further discussion because we are only beginning to address this point. So maybe we can satisfy or make it clear whether we want a MOU with LACNIC or not, and if we're going to have the MOU, we can agree on the points to be included in that MOU.

So we can devote more time and have more active engagement and participation at a later date. So if there are no further comments on this point, then we could review the item that was pending our agenda. So Carlos Vera if you are not going to take the floor, kindly put your hand down in the AC room thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking, Juan Manuel. Jose Arce speaking. Just a brief comment. I would like to comment on what Fatima said. Fatima says that maybe some people do not want this MOU. And we have to respect everybody's views. If you believe a vote is appropriate then we can proceed to a vote and see whether the majority of the region does want a MOU, sorry.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Do you mean a vote right now?

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. No maybe it can be an action item for a later stage.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Yes maybe it can be an action item for a later date. So we can then conclude with this item on the agenda, and we can address the capacity or the leveling course working group. The working group that deals with the leveling course for the ALSs, coordinated or chaired by Diego Acosta Bastidas.

DIEGO ACOSTA BASTIDAS: This is Diego Acosta Bastidas, the chair or coordinator of the working group. Cognizant of the delay, and aware of your patience, may I please explain that this delay stems from the fact that we have to include a specific module regarding the anonymity of a poll that will enable us to have a knowledge base, or a baseline, that we need for this leveling course.

Fortunately, and on the basis or based on the inclusion of engineer [? 0:45:24] that is an expert on IT here in Ecuador and also an expert in Moodle platform. Well thanks to that, we have achieved this anonymity. And we're very pleased to inform LACRALO that tomorrow, we will be sharing the corresponding link with the list with a basic and simple instructions so that you and the LACRALO community can participant in an anonymous way.

You can participate in this poll. And the poll will enable us to focus the – or to focus on the topics that are most required or requested in terms of the leveling course. So we believe that we have moved into action now, because actions speak louder than words. And this should be constantly seen in LACRALO's judgment or criteria.

We believe that the objective of the leveling working group will always be in unison or harmonized with the desire to go back to information and to turn information into a more easily usable tool for the community, but mainly for all the people that are interested in strengthening the demographic representative capabilities within LACRALO in general. And specifically in terms of the users, of the internet users.

So having said this, I have to thank you all for your patience because of this interruptions in my participation of this call. And from tomorrow we will have the specifications needed to continue working towards the creation of the course that will result in the strengthening of our regions. Thank you.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Diego. Okay. I see, sorry. I see that Heidi is confirming that Garth will be joining us shortly. So we would like to check if Garth is already on the call. Is he on the call?

GARTH BRUEN: Yes I'm here.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Okay. So this is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking again. Okay. So I now give the floor to Garth.

JOSE ARCE: Oh, okay, excuse me. This is Jose Arce speaking. I would like to take the floor. Thank you Juan. Jose Arce speaking. Thank you Juan. I want to thank Garth for joining us today on this call. Fatima, Natalia and I invited him to join us. Fatima and Natalia are in charge of our capacity building imitative, and Garth accepted promptly.

So after speaking for a little while when we met in Durban, we believe it is really appropriate to have a more fluent interaction with other regions. And Garth was in line with that idea and he accepted to join us in this call in order to let us know in the way in which NARALO works. And surely, we will kindly participate in his region so that we can find points in common and work together. So welcome Garth and thank you for joining us on this call.

GARTH BRUEN:

Thank you Jose. Thank you for inviting me. I apologize for being late. I had the time wrong in my calendar. I had it at 23:00 hours in EST. I keep forgetting to think in terms of universal time [laughs]. I like to think that we are all not so different and that we are facing many of the same problems wherever we live in the world.

Even though people in the United States are seen as maybe having better access to the internet than some other parts of the world, we still have people who, for various reasons, don't have equal access. And certainly in terms in policy, we are in a constant struggle to be recognized and to have our issues discussed at ICANN and other meetings.

And I like to think that there are many ideas, many concepts that we can all share throughout regions, and there are things that I can take away from LACRALO and bring back to NARALO, and vice versa. One issue... A project that I've initiated since becoming chair, is what we call the NARALO spotlight. The NARALO spotlight is a very, very brief video

introduction which is produced by the representative of each At Large structure within the region.

And they inform the rest of the members in the region of what kind of projects and what kind of goals they have within their own At Large structure. Unfortunately, because the ICANN meetings are constrained in many ways -- one in terms of time, two in terms of content, and three in terms of travel access – this is a real opportunity for everybody in the region to understand better what the work is of each one of these structures and to see the people behind it, and not just the officers who attend the various meetings around the world.

It is also very important that people see that the At Large is about people. That ICANN isn't just about numbers, that it really does impact people, and that people should have a say in the way that the internet operates. And that when I watch a video, if I were to see a video of Jose or a video of Silvia, I would see that the internet is people and not just numbers and not just anonymous names.

We read many policy documents with a number of names behind them, and we never really get to see the real people behind them. And what we end up with when everybody does their videos, is we have this mosaic, this collage of participation within our region. And we can put that on the front page of our RALO website. So if people come to visit the website, they see that it's actually people.

They don't just see the static text, and links to various documents, and historical information. They actually see that this is real people and they can also get their own voice added to that. We include each one of

these brief videos within our monthly meetings. So each ALS gets a turn at presenting their own issues, their own structure, and that way the calls themselves also become more dynamic, more interesting, and more personal.

And hopefully, I haven't taken up too much time after being late. And I'm certainly willing to talk more or answer any questions. But I think this has been one of our best ideas recently.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Well, as Garth's intervention has been very brief. We will now open the floor for any questions for Garth, and then we will continue with the rest of the agenda. Jose you have the floor, go ahead please.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. I see Fatima has raised her hand, so I will give the floor to her for now and then I will present with my intervention.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Okay, Fatima you have the floor. Go ahead please.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Fatima, we are not hearing you. Can you hear us?

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima Cambronero speaking. Hello? Can you hear me? Thank you very much Juan Manuel. Yes. I have a question for Garth. Thank you very much Juan Manuel. A question for Garth. I would like to be brief, but [? 0:56:44] reply will be brief. I would like him to tell us basically, how are you develop the rolls in your RALOs? The present undersecretary, the chair and the secretariat. Because in our RALO, for example, we have a lot of workload for the secretary and for the chair.

So I would like to know the experience of other RALOs to see how they organize in this regard.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. This is Garth Bruen in response. This is also a problem for us, and one of the initiatives that I started is searching out working groups within ICANN that don't have representation from NARALO, or have under representation from At Large in general. And I find volunteers within our community to join these working groups and then report back to the region.

And this has a few effects. The first effect is that if we can get certain people into working groups that have travel funding, we can also get these people to meetings where they have not been before. We also have better representation from within the At Large community at ICANN. I also find ways for people within At Large structures to address their own personal or At Large internet policy needs within the work that we do.

So if somebody, for example, has an At Large structure which is focused on getting access say for the elderly, or dealing with privacy issues, I try

and find somewhere within the organization where their work will be most useful. And when the work... When the general work for At Large shows itself when we get assignments, I try to find people within the region who are best suited for this type of work and encourage them to volunteer to do certain types of work.

Because I think that everybody has some sort of value. Sometimes it's just a question of finding that value. I hope this answers your question.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Fatima... Okay. Is there any other questions for Garth? Jose Arce you have the floor, go ahead please.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Garth, I would like you to tell us when you have initiative, own initiative so as to empower people to participate in policy discussions. For example, we have a serious problem because we cannot find a way to obtain greater participation in the development of policy issues.

So we are stuck in that issues because we do not have participation, or we have certain administrative issues to solve in the middle. So I don't know if you have that problem in your region, and how you help people to participate in policy development.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you Jose. This is Garth again. I start by asking people, "What's your problem? What bothers you? What are you concerned about?" And then I see my role as acting as an intermediary to help them find

the policy avenue where they can assist the rest of us with their own work.

And I show them that your problem can be addressed through working with the policy, and helping the rest of the group on similar agendas. So I used to work for an elected representative here in the United States, and his philosophy was one that I carried with me for the rest of my career.

He saw his position as an elected representative as someone who was there to help his constituents, or the voters in his districts, help them navigate the bureaucracy. And when I started working on various internet policy projects, that became my model. I deal with internet end users who have problems with the internet, mostly abuse issues, spam, viruses, and other types of abuse. And I see my role as helping them navigate the policy.

They don't understand it. They shouldn't have to understand it. There should be somebody out there who is able to help them with their problem and navigate the complexities of the internet. So in terms... And I brought the same concept to dealing with At Large. I ask people in ALSs, "Well what's bothering you about the way that the internet operates? What's bothering you about the way that ICANN operates?"

And then I search out for places where they can fit in, and get their issues addressed, and then get issues addressed for the community at the same time.

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you very much Garth. So I see Carlton Samuels, go ahead please.

CARLTON SAMUELS: Thank you Chair. This is Carlton Samuels for the transcript. I want to go back to the issue of participation and policy making. The fact is that the structure that we have tends to determine certain activities that would be useful. In the first place, the policy advice comes from the ALAC, and the policy advice that ALAC sends is largely determined by the membership, and that membership that usually are in a position to contribute to determining what the advice should be, or people who are participants in working groups.

Working groups, I still believe is the best and useful and productive way for members of LACRALO to become directly involved in developing policy advice. And there is no alternative to it. It seems to me that replicating structures when you have standing working groups where you can participate and you can almost at the same time, in the same breath, be educated by others around you, as well as influence in direction by your own contributions.

It is so obvious to me that I am always amazed that we are trying to replicate structures that don't seem to – the enduring benefit of the community. Here is the thing. We are not going to be always totally out there, totally conscious of all of the issues. And like Garth says, the first thing that you have to do is to show an interest, and then find ways to attach yourself to a working group where you will become immersed.

And in very short order, you will find that you can start acquiring knowledge, and acquiring a sense of what the issues are. And because

we are all accomplished individuals in our own personal professional lives, I have no doubt that we can make a contribution there. I still think it is a worthwhile way to approach participation. I do not see the development of line, an alternative models as quite as important as direct involvement in the working group that exist today. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. I see Carlos wants to make a comment. Carlos would like to ask a question to Garth?

CARLOS AGUIRRE: This is Carlos Aguirre speaking. Yes thank you very much Jose. I have two questions for Garth. First question is this, whether the NARALO has – or is carrying out outreach for the community, and how they perform that? And my second question is the following, whether the NARALO has any MOU with their own RIR or the RIR in the region? And what is the result that they have obtained? And if not, do you believe that it would be an interesting to have an agreement or an MOU with the RIR? Thank you.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you Carlos. This is Garth again. I'll answer the second question first. We do not have an agreement with Aaron, but we are going to have discussions with them and discuss it. We're going to be sending some NARALO members to their upcoming meeting in North America, and we're going to continue to have an open relationship with them.

I think it would be a good idea. In terms of the first question on outreach, yes. We have started a much more aggressive outreach

campaign. And we started actually in Toronto at our last regional meeting or general assembly. And I asked everybody, all the attendees, to bring me a list of ten organizations that are not represented here in Toronto. And then we had to figure out why they are not here and we have to find a way to recruit them.

The list I came up with personally focused on what I considered to be underrepresented members of the internet community. Most specifically, the disabled, the blind, and people who I guess who we would call home bound, people with mobility issues, who spend much of their time on the internet. And using the internet is really the way that they experience the world.

We're not hearing their issues, we don't really understand their issues. I don't see many disabled people or blind individuals at ICANN meetings. And the question I always have lingering in my mind is how do blind people use the internet, and I know that they do use the internet. So I find a series of organizations. And I have started contacting them directly.

I have list of addresses. I have prepared a standard form letter that can be modified. And I actually put this in the postal mail, and I also send them emails, and I call them. We also focus geographically. So I reach out to potential ALS members that are close to me, that are nearby to where I live. And I encourage other ALSs to do the same thing. We've made a list of all the state in the United State, and all the provinces in Canada, and all the outlying US territorial islands which do not have an ALS.

And we are currently searching within all of those regions to find potential groups to recruit. So we can have full participation from different members of the community, and also a geographic representation. And hopefully, we can double or even triple our membership at ICANN meetings and get more voices at the table.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: This is Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Thank you Garth. Okay. I believe that we can thank Garth for joining us today on the call. I don't know if Jose would like to thank Garth as well before we proceed with our agenda. The next item has to do with the capacity building initiative led by Fatima and Natalia.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking, Juan.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Juan Manuel Rojas speaking. Go ahead Jose please.

JOSE ARCE: Jose Arce speaking. I personally want to thank Garth for joining us on this call, so thank you Garth. Thank you very much. We hope that we will continue engaging in this type of dialogue not only with me and with Silvia, but with all the members in our region. I hope that we can all engage and exchange or interchange ideas with you and with the other regions.

So once again, thank you very much for having joined us this evening. And then, I would like to put forth a motion, we have less than ten minutes left and in order to be respectful to our interpreters and to staff, I believe that there certain specific topics that need further definitions. One of these topics is the setting up of the committee for the next meeting that will be in charge of events during the next meeting.

I believe that before we conclude this meeting, we have to bring this point to a close and be very attentive to our next meeting. Silvia Vivanco has posted a link in the AC room, so I invite all of you to visit that link and contribute your input, your ideas, or contribute, or suggest, or propose resources so that we can get things done and get things going.

So I really wanted to touch on this point that is really important we are getting closer and closer to the meeting in Buenos Aries, and this is a very important point. So I open the floor at this point, in this call, for any comments, ideas, or suggestions.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

This is Silvia Vivanco speaking. Jose if I may, I would like to say that, as you said it would be great to have a working group or committee to focus on the organization of these events, that is LACRALO events in Buenos Aries. And the sooner we do that the better, so that we can engage in meetings or conference calls where we can address these topics or ideas.

So of course, feel free to contact me so that staff can support you in organizing these committee meetings.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. Yes of course, thank you Silvia. Surely this will be an action item. I see that Juan Manuel has dropped, and they're dialing out to him again. But anyway, yes. The idea is to have this committee or group defined during the course of this week. So your participation and your input is welcomed.

I don't know if Silvia Herlein-Leite is still on the call. Silvia, if you would like to take the call at this point, go ahead please.

SILVIA HERLEIN-LEITE:

This is Silvia Herlein-Leite speaking. Yes, thank you Jose. I really wanted to remind you all about our ALS data, or ALS information update campaign. I have posted a link in the AC room. As I mentioned before, in our email exchange list, this is a space for each ALS to post or to populate the space with information on what you're currently doing to post your logo.

This is a space available for all of you, and it will be very useful indeed when we start organizing the showcase. As you know, in the showcase we do showcase what happens in the region. We are the largest RALO within At Large, and we have grown a lot. So it is very important to have updated information. Maybe if you have information that dates from the time you joined LACRALO, please may I kindly ask you to review that information and to update it.

You can do so by sending an email either to me or to staff. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

Jose Arce speaking. I don't know if Juan Manuel is back on the call. But I have a comment. And I have another action item to suggest so that we can keep going and moving on. I think that Natalia's email is kindly indeed, and I have replied to that email, and I said that the ICANN raised, or the point raised there should be an action item. So for the record, Natalia's or the points raised by Natalia will be action items.

Jose Arce speaking again. I don't know if Juan Manuel is back on the call. If he's not, I will continue. We had an outstanding point or item to address that was the capacity building program. A short time ago, Fatima shared an email on our list. She introduced this program. This program is quite successful. And the idea is that any of you can carry out or implement this program.

Juan Manuel replied affirmatively, or positively, it doesn't mean that only one person has to take over this responsibility or take care of this. I don't know if he and Fatima and Natalia will agree on how to address this issue or this topic of the interchange or exchange in terms of organizing the different capacity building title.

I just couldn't find the word. I don't know if Juan Manuel is back on the call, and Fatima maybe you would like to take the floor and say something regarding this program before we move on to our next item or point in the agenda.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima speaking. Please, let us move on with the other items on our agenda. We have circulated the invitation in the LACRALO email exchange list. So feel free to join us whenever you want.

JOSE ARCE: This is Jose Arce speaking. Okay thank you Fatima. Excellent. Item seven on the agenda has to do with LACRALO policy issues. This was proposed by Fatima and Alejandro, and we have a new confluence, or Wiki confluence page. Fatima collected information, data, and documents so that you can contribute your comments or input.

JOSE ARCE: Okay. Fatima, go ahead please, you have the floor.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: This is Fatima Cambronero speaking. Thank you Jose. I want to highlight what Natalia was mentioning in the second email she circulated on the list. I believe it's important to make a difference. On the one hand, we shouldn't be interested in all of the topics at the same time and we shouldn't all be trained or have the capabilities or capacities to participate in all of the topics at the same time.

But we need to get more capacity building in terms of policies. There are some open issues or open topics, some of these topics or issues will be closing shortly. For instance, the public comment period and the period to post comments on the ALAC policy statement. I believe this is a very timely opportunity to get involved, to get engaged.

Natalia was wondering what topic we are most interested in so that we can get together and cooperate and contribute input. We need to produce more statements to make our voices heard at the RALO meeting ALAC. I believe that this invitation is open to everyone. As I said in my email, we have 42 ALSs with an average of two members ALS. So that makes a total of 84 people. Somebody must be interested in these topics at least, so of course I volunteer my help.

Feel free to contact me for any help that you may need. And I want to urge you all to participate. Thank you.

JOSE ARCE:

This is Jose Arce speaking. Thank you Fatima. I see that we are reaching the end of our time available for this meeting. I see there is a comment posted by Carlos on the list. Carlos Vera, it has to do with an email. Juan Manuel said that we should make comments on substantial or substantive policy issues should surely, there wasn't any bad intention or – in that comment.

If you took it the wrong way, I do apologize. It wasn't the intention. And of course, Carlos if you want to make any comment please feel free to take the floor. Of course, I apologize. There isn't any bad intent or intention at all. Maybe some things come up as arbitrary, but of course the intention or the intent is never a bad one. We all know each other by now, and our intent is always to work together and to help each other.

And maybe... Of course, nobody is perfect. I have plenty of defects or flaws even as the chair, so respectfully, as I said, this was

misunderstood. I said this respectfully. We have to see what each of us needs to improve on a personal basis and also as a region member, as a member of the region. So I invite you all to participate. Thank you for your comment, and I apologize for this misunderstanding.

Having said this, I would like to greet the interpreters. I would like to greet staff. Veronica has been, our interpreter has been working on her birthday, so I want to greet her as well. And I want to thank Garth. Our list is open. I look forward to your comment on our discussion list, and I look forward to our next meeting in September.

So thank you all very much. Thank you Carlton for your comments as well. So thank you all once again. Good evening and good bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]