

ICANN Board Resolutions Review

During the years 2011 to 2013, the ICANN Board of Directors held a total of 40 meetings of the full Board (not including individual committees, etc.) and passed 158 substantive resolutions. In an attempt to complete this review in the most effective and methodical manner, this review concentrates on the more substantive resolutions, excluding Committee or Board employment assignments and resolutions relating to property leasing and locations of meetings.

This review of the ICANN Board Resolutions focuses on three (3) overarching criteria in order to determine the quality, readability, and transparency of such decisions and whether they can be easily understood by those unfamiliar with the ICANN process:

1. Does the Board provide a clear explanation of its decision? Are there substantive actions to be taken to further improve the ICANN process?
 2. Does the Board provide a clear and reasonable rationale for its decision?
 3. Does the Board provide an explanation of how it took into consideration public comments (if any)?
-

Summary

	2011	2012	2013	Total
Number of resolutions	71	59	28	158
Clear Decisions	56	55	27	138
	79%	93%	96%	87%
Clear Rationales	62	54	25	141
	87%	92%	89%	89%
Clear Indication of Comments	40	38	25	103
	56%	64%	89%	65%

A review of the ICANN Board resolutions and rationales for 2011-2013 shows marked progress, while further steps could be taken to improve the clarity, readability, and transparency of the Board's decisions.

In the early stages of the reporting process, resolutions are at times overly detailed, technical, and difficult for someone unfamiliar with the ICANN process to understand. For the 2011, 2012, and to some extent 2013 resolutions, the full name of the ICANN body/organization is written out each time the name is used—as opposed to using the full name of the body/organization only the first time and then referring to the acronym thereafter—making the document much more cumbersome to read.

Throughout the Board's reporting of decisions and rationales, the usage of bullet points, numbered series, and Q&A formatting vastly improves the readability of the document.

In early 2012, the Board begins indicating when Board members or other personnel have been excused from meetings due to a potential conflict of interest regarding the gTLD Program. This is an important marker in the transparency of the ICANN Board meetings in that while previously, Board members would simply indicate whether they had any conflicts of interest regarding the Program, the reporting process never explicitly stated until early 2012 what actions had been taken to address those conflicts.

Beginning with the 3 October 2012 Board meeting, the rationale section of each resolution indicates clearly in its own line whether or not public comments were required and/or sought in the decision-making process. This practice improves readability and transparency as the reader is quickly able to glance at this line to see how public comments were accounted for in the decision. However toward the middle of 2013, this practice appears inconsistently, appearing in some resolutions but not others.

Suggestions:

1. In each resolution, only provide the full name of the body/organization the first time it is used, then refer to the acronym thereafter.
2. Consistently report in a separate line of the rationale how public comments are considered in the decision-making process.

2011

25 January 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1d. Approval of Revised Charter of the Finance Committee

- Clear decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale provided that indicates the positive benefit of the decision
- No indication of public comments

1i. Approval to Track Global Policy Process for IPv4 (Internet Protocol version 4) Post-Exhaustion

- Slightly convoluted though eventually becomes clear, beginning explanation too wordy, too many acronyms, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale addressing financial and budgetary impacts of the decision
- No indication of public comments

1j. Approval of the RSSAC Review Implementation Plan

- Clear decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale indicating financial impact
- Final Report was posted for public comment, no comments received

1k. Approval of Proposed Bylaws Amendment to Create a Non-Voting Chair-Elect to the Nominating Committee

- Convoluted decision that relies on intimate understanding of the ICANN process, actionable steps to be taken
- Rationale language unclear, slightly confusing
- Posted for public comments, no comments received

1m – 1s. Approval of Redelegation of the .BF, .CD, .SY, “Hanguk,” “Singapore,” “Sourya,” several Indian ccTLDs

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format, though somewhat long and drawn out
- Public comments to be posted

Main Agenda

2. Approval of Proposed Bylaws Amendments Changing Term Ending Dates for Supporting Organization and At-Large Selected Board Members

- Slightly confusing decision requiring knowledge of ICANN, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale assessing the financial impacts of the decision and how the decision will improve the efficacy of the ICANN Board
- 1 public comment received supporting the decision

3. Approval of TELNIC RSEP (Registry Services Evaluation Policy) request for release of numeric-only strings except for single-character labels

- Clear, succinct decision, appropriate actions necessary for decision’s implementation
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format, though somewhat long and drawn out, assessment of financial impacts
- Several comments posted by relevant stakeholders and issues were addressed in order to approve the decision

4. Rationale Documents

4a. Economic Studies – adopting rationale

- Clear decision addressing adoption of Economic Studies document, decision requires no further action
- Rationale to be provided in Minutes of the meeting
- No indication of public comments

4b. Cross-ownership – adopting rationale

- Very short, vague decision, no action necessary
- Rationale to be provided in Minutes of the meeting
- No indication of public comments

5. Board/GAC Consultations

5a. New gTLDs

- Clear list of issues to be addressed at upcoming meeting, Resolved explanations are somewhat convoluted requiring intimate understanding of ICANN process
- Clear, succinct rationale that addresses necessity of the decision and substantial financial impacts
- No indication of public comments

5b. ICM

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps to be taken by stated date
- Convoluted rationale involving ICANN bylaws, requiring intimate knowledge of ICANN process
- No indication of public comments

6. Report on AOC (Affirmation of Commitments) Reviews including ATRT Recommendations – Next Steps

- Clear decision to adopt resolution, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale explaining the necessity of continued transparency and substantial financial impacts of the decision
- Public commenting in process, to be taken into consideration

18 March 2011 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors – Silicon Valley

1. Consent Agenda

1.3 ccNSO (Country Code Names Supporting Organization) Review – Receipt of Board WG (Working Group) Final Report and Dissolution of the WG (Working Group)

- Clear, succinct explanation of the decision, proposed action for next steps
- Clear, succinct rationale for immediate action
- No indication of public comments

1.4 Approval of Revision of Bylaws re: Implementation of SSAC (Security and Stability Advisory Committee) Review Working Group

- Somewhat convoluted decision requiring intimate knowledge of ICANN process and relevant bylaws
- Succinct rationale though still a bit confusing, again requiring better understanding of ICANN process
- No public comments received

2. Approval of the 2011-2014 Strategic Plan

- Clear explanation of the decision and adoption of the Strategic Plan
- Clear rationale explaining need to adopt the resolution and how the public will benefit from stated action
- No indication of public comments

3. Process for Completion of the Applicant Guidebook for New gTLDs

- Mostly clear, though becomes confusing with the ICANN bylaws, explains decision of new gTLD Guidebook
- Rationale to be posted in Minutes
- No indication of public comments

4. AOC (Affirmation of Commitments) Reviews, Including ATRT Recommendations

- Clear decision, actions to appoint relevant staff and develop appropriate metrics
- Clear, succinct rationale for continued improvement of ATRT process
- Public comments accepted from various stakeholders and reviewed to influence the decision-making process

5. Approval of ICM Registry Application for .XXX

- Somewhat clear explanation of the decision, at times unnecessarily detailed (describing email chains), action steps to be taken
- Rationale posted in separate PDF, excessively long (20 pages) though the Executive Summary of the rationale is clear enough
- Public commenting process utilized throughout the decision-making process

6. Approval of Expenses Related to Board-Directed Activities

- Clear, succinct explanation of the decision, clear action steps indicating exact dollar amounts for budgetary issues
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial impact on ICANN
- No public comment indicated

7. TLG Review – Actions Based on Independent Reviewer’s Final Report

- Mostly clear, at times opaque in the description of the process, clear action steps
- Short, succinct rationale explaining the decision
- Posted for public comments and addressed issues in decision-making process

8. IDN ccTLD (Country Code Top Level Domain) Fast Track Review

- Clear decision, actionable steps unclear
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format, though somewhat long and drawn out, assessment of overall impact of the decision
- Public comments received for several months and addressed in decision-making process

9. Approval of Verisign RSEP (Registry Services Evaluation Policy) Request for Release of Numeric-Only Strings for .NAME

- Clear, succinct explanation of the decision
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format, though somewhat long and drawn out, assessment of overall impact of the decision
- Several public comments posted and specifically addressed in the rationale explanation

21 April 2011 | Special Meeting of ICANN Board of Directors

2. Consent Agenda

2.4 From the BGC – Input on Academia Representation on NomCom

- Clear decision, no action steps
- Though clear enough, rationale does not make practical sense (removing a bylaw because the Board has been unsuccessful in achieving its previously stated goal)
- Decision posted for public comments

2.6 From the SIC (Structural Improvement Committee) – Approval of ccNSO (Country Code Names Supporting Organization) Review Implementation Actions

- Unclear description of the decision, requires intimate knowledge of the ICANN bodies and process
- Succinct, clear rationale explaining need for immediate action
- No public comment indicated

2.7 From the BFC – Formalization of Planning Committee for existing employee retirement savings accounts (401K)

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale
- No indication of public comment

2.8 Approval of Redelegation of .KP (Korea, Democratic People’s Republic)

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format, though somewhat long and drawn out
- Public comments to be posted

2.9 Approval of Tracking of Global Policy Process for IPv4 (Internet Protocol version 4) Post-Exhaustion Allocation Mechanisms by IANA (Internet Assigned Numbers Authority)

- Slightly convoluted though eventually becomes clear, beginning explanation too wordy, too many acronyms, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale addressing financial and budgetary impacts of the decision
- No indication of public comments

Main Agenda

3. From the BFC – Approval of Increase of the Registrar Accreditation Application Fee

- Clear decision, action necessary to implement
- Clear rationale presented in Q&A format, very effective in explaining reasoning behind the decision, easily readable
- Public comments posted and taken into consideration in the decision-making process

4. From the SIC (Structural Improvement Committee) – Approval of Charter for Board Technical Relations Working Group

- Decision somewhat clear, requires knowledge of different working bodies in ICANN
- Clear, succinct rationale
- No public comments necessary, comments to be taken in upcoming decision-making process

5. Review of Vertical Integration for Existing gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Registry Operators

- Clear, succinct decision, action steps necessary
- Clear rationale for immediate action given upcoming gTLD process, presented in helpful Q&A format
- No indication of public comments

6. ATRT

6.1 Board Management of ATRT Recommendations

- Clear, succinct decision to follow ATRT recommendations, action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale
- No indication of public comments

6.2 Estimated Budget Implications of ATRT Recommendations for FY2012 Budget

- Clear, succinct decision involving detailed dollar amounts involving the budget
- Clear, succinct rationale allocating stated amount of funding for decision
- No indication of public comments

7. IDN ccTLD (Country Code Top Level Domain) Delegations

7.1-7.3 Delegation of “Al Jazair,” “al-Maghrib,” “srb”

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format, though somewhat long and drawn out
- Public comments to be posted

20 June 2011 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board – Singapore

1. Approval of the New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Program

- Entire meeting focused on approval of gTLD Program so the decision explanation is long, though relatively clear
- Rationale provided in separate PDF, pending final approval (at the time), incredibly long (121 pages) though somewhat understandably since the gTLD Program is a major initiative
- Public comments involved in various stages throughout the development of gTLD process

24 June 2011 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board – Singapore

1. Consent Agenda

1.2 Approval of ALAC-Related Bylaw Amendments

- Decision regarding amendments unclear, requires deeper knowledge of ICANN bylaws
- Clear, succinct rationale indicating impacts on financials and DNS
- Posted for public comments for 30 days, no relevant comments received

1.3 Approval of ccNSO (Country Code Names Supporting Organization) Review Implementation Plan

- Clear decision, actionable steps to be taken by Staff
- Clear, succinct rationale indicating importance of immediate action, no impact on security of DNS
- No indication of public comments

1.4 Approval of Permanent Charter for GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization)’s Commercial Stakeholders Group

- Clear decision regarding CSG
- Somewhat convoluted rationale, no budget implications
- CSG will post charter for public comments

1.5 Proposal for a Not-for-Profit Operational Concerns Constituency in the GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization)

- Clear decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale explaining financial and DNS impacts
- Public comments accepted and favorable toward proposal

1.6 Approval of Permanent Charter for GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization)’s Non-Commercial Stakeholders Group

- Long, though relatively clear decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale explaining significance of this decision in the larger ICANN context
- Posted and any future amendments will continue to be posted for public comments

1.7 Approval of New GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization) Constituency Recognition Process

- Clear decision, easily spelled out in numeric format
- Clear rationale, easily spelled out in numeric format, describes financial and DNS impacts
- Posted for public comment and comments considered in decision-making process

1.10 Academia Representation on NomCom

- Clear decision
- Clear rationale, though seemingly non-sensible (removing a bylaw because no process has been formally established yet)
- Posted for public comments and comments taken into consideration

2. ATRT Recommendations

- Long though clearly spelled out decision addressing ATRT, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Long though clearly explained rationale addressing important aspects of the decision, addresses financial and DNS impacts
- Posted for public comments and comments duly considered in decision-making process

3. Whois Review Team Budget for Consumer Research Study

- Clear, succinct decision regarding budgetary needs and approval, actionable steps needed
- Clear, succinct rationale
- No indication of public comments

4. Renewal of .NET Agreement

- Clear decision, actionable steps to be taken as necessary
- Clear rationale presented in Q&A format
- Public comments accepted with much feedback that was then considered in the decision-making process

5. Internet Number Certification (RPKI) Program

- Decision heavily couched in ICANN standards bodies, requires knowledge of different bodies and their functions in ICANN process, confusing
- Short rationale, yet still requires knowledge of ICANN bodies to make full sense of the reasoning
- No indication of public comments

6. FY12 Operating Plan & Budget

- Clear and straightforward decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale explaining process of budget approval
- Public comments and consultations considered in decision-making process

25 June 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors – Singapore

1. At-Risk Component of President and CEO Compensation

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- No rationale provided
- No indication of public comments

28 July 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1.5. Approval of Redelegating of .om Domain Representing Oman

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale presented in Q&A format
- No indication of public comment

2. Receipt of Security, Stability & Resiliency Framework for FY12

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, useful rationale explaining importance of decision
- Public comments were overall in support of the decision

25 August 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1.2 Approval of Recommendation of GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization) Council on IRTP (Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy) Part B

- Confusing decision, requires knowledge of various ICANN bodies and bylaws, CEO directed to take actionable steps
- Rationale quite long, very technical and somewhat confusing, presented in Q&A format, addresses financial and DNS impacts
- Public comments taken into consideration in decision-making process

1.3 Approval of Receipt of Report from TR-WG

- Clear, succinct decision of approval
- Clear, succinct rationale explaining need for immediate decision on this issue, addresses financial impact
- No indication of public comments

3. Approval of BGC Recommendation re Reconsideration Request 11-1

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear and straightforward rationale
- No indication of public comments

4. Process Steps for Consideration of Board Remuneration

- Long, in-depth yet clear decision, clear action steps to be taken
- Clear rationale for Board compensation, assesses financial and DNS impacts
- Decision will be posted for public comments

5. Single Character IDN Update

- Long, technical explanation of decision requiring working knowledge of ICANN bodies and processes
- Long, technical rationale requiring knowledge of ICANN bodies and processes, assesses financial and DNS impacts
- Posted for public comments

17 September 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Approval of Investment Manager Selection

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, assesses financial and DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

2. Approval of International Banking Relationship

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

11 October 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

Approval of Delegation of .CW (Curacao), Transitional Arrangements for Netherlands Antilles (.AN)

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary

- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

22 October 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Membership of Board – Governmental Advisory Committee Working Group

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale assessing financial and DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

8 December 2011 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. New gTLDs

1.1 Applicant Support

- Clear decision, specific dollar amounts, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, detailed rationale, including specific dollar amounts and reasoning
- No indication of public comments

1.2 Batching

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear legal rationale regarding the decision
- No indication of public comments

2. Consent Agenda

2.4 ccNSO (Country Code Names Supporting Organization) Amendment to the Fast Track

Implementation Plan

- Mostly clear decision, requires familiarity with past Board actions, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear but technical rationale, assesses financial and DNS impacts
- Public session held in March 2011

2.5 New Annex A/GNSO Policy Development Process

- Unclear what the decision was, opaque, requires extensive knowledge of ICANN bodies and past decisions, too many hyperlinks that make reading cumbersome
- Rationale opaque and confusing, overly long and requiring extensive knowledge of past ICANN decisions
- Public comments received and considered

3. ATRT Recommendation 5: Board Compensation

- Clear decision indicating specific dollar amounts and details of the decision, albeit a long explanation
- Clear but long rationale describing the process that it has taken to arrive at current decision, significant financial impact but no DNS impact
- Public commenting throughout the process

4. Board Member Rules on Conflicts of Interest for New gTLDs

- Clear decision, specific guidelines, easily readable bullet points
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

2012

7 February 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1.2 Redelegation of the .BY domain representing Belarus to Reliable Software Inc.

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

2. Delegation of the “kaz” domain representing Kazakhstan in Cyrillic

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

3. Public Comment Posting: Further Bylaws Changes for Revised PDP (Policy Development Process)

- Clear, succinct decision regarding further action on PDP, actionable steps necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- To be posted for public comments

4. Reaffirmation of second round of applications in New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Program

- Clear decision and actionable steps; any Board members and other liaisons identified to have a conflict of interest were not in attendance at the meeting
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

14 March 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Board Member Conflicts of Interest – New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Program

- Confidential materials, decision appears out of context without access to confidential documents
- Short, yet still vague and uninformative rationale given the confidential nature of the resolution
- No indication of public comments

14 March 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Approval of New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Service Providers

- Clear, succinct decision; indicates that Board members with conflicts of interest have been excused from the meeting
- Clear rationale explaining need for expediency, financial but no DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

16 March 2012 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors – San Jose, Costa Rica

1. Consent Agenda

1.2 Approval of IRTP (Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy) Part B Recommendation #9, Part 2

- Long, technical, unclear decision requiring in-depth knowledge of ICANN process and past decisions
- Long, technical and drawn out rationale that does not make sense to outside observer
- Public comments received and considered in decision-making process

1.3 Bylaws Changes for New GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization) Policy Development Process

- Clear though technical decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale assessing financial and DNS impacts
- Posted for public comments

1.4 Engagement of Independent Auditor

- Clear, succinct decision, action steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial but no DNS impact
- No indication of public comments

1.5 Approval of Contracting & Disbursement Policy

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

1.6 Approval of the DNS (Domain Name System) Risk Management Framework WG (Working Group) Charter

- Clear, succinct decision and explanation, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

1.7 Approval of Redelegation of .BH

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

28 March 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Batching of New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Applications: Secondary Timestamp

- Clear, succinct decision and explanation, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, detailed rationale and explanation of decision, presented in numbered format making it easy to read and understand
- To be posted for public comments

10 April 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Establishment of New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Program Committee

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

6 May 2012 | Special Meeting of the Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1.1 Ratification of Global Policy Proposal from ASO (Address Supporting Organization) for Post Exhaustion IPv4 Allocation Mechanisms by the IANA (Internet Assigned Numbers Authority)

- Clear decision albeit confusing title, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale expressing need for expediency
- Published for comments, no comments submitted

1.2 .CAT RSEP (Registry Services Evaluation Policy) Request to Allow Whois Changes

- Clear decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale describing the decision-making process
- Public comments received and taken into consideration

1.3 Compensation Committee Charter

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

1.4 Overall Compensation Framework

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, easy to read rationale, financial but no DNS impact
- No indication of public comments

1.5 IRTP (Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy) Part B, Recommendation 8

- Clear, though lengthy explanation of decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Long, technical and drawn-out rationale requiring in-depth understanding of ICANN bodies and bylaws
- Public comments received and taken into consideration

1.6 Approval of Strategic Plan

- Clear, succinct decision, action steps to be taken
- Clear, easy to read rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments received and taken into consideration

1.7 Conflict of Interest Review

- Clear decision, no action necessary
- Clear, easy to read rationale, recognizing need for less legalistic language, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments received and taken into consideration in decision-making process

2. Main Agenda

2.1 Ratification of Decisions of Conflicts & Ethics Subcommittee

- Clear decision, no action necessary
- Clear and simple rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

2.2 Update of New gTLD Program Committee Membership

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

31 May 2012 | Special Meeting of the Board of Directors

1. Election of Fadi Chehadé as ICANN (Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers)'s President and CEO

- Long but clear decision with detailed explanation, actionable steps to be taken
- No rationale provided (though could be understood in explanation of the decision)
- No indication of public comments

23 June 2012 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1.2 Delegation of “Oman”

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

1.3 SSAC (Security and Stability Advisory Committee) Report on Dotless Domains

- Clear decision and explanation , actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale regarding implementation of TLDs, no financial impact, but positive DNS impact
- No indication of public comments

1.4 Ombudsman Regular Meetings with Board

- Clear decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

1.5 GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization) Improvements Program Wrap-Up/June 2012

- Clear decision, no action necessary
- Clear albeit long rationale, sub-headers make for easy reading
- No indication of public comments

1.6 NomCom Transparency Guidelines

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale expected to improve ICANN community
- No indication of public comments

1.7 .POST RSEP (Registry Services Evaluation Policy) Request

- Unclear decision involving technical details, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments addressed in decision-making process

2. .COM Renewal

- Clear decision, actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale in Q&A format, no financial, but positive DNS impacts
- Large number of comments received and taken into consideration in decision-making process

3. Adoption of the FY13 Operating Plan and Budget

- Clear decision, actionable steps to address public comments
- Clear rationale with clear financial impact, no DNS impact
- Public comments received but not all responded to at time of writing

5. WHOIS Policy Review Team Final Report

- Clear decision, actionable steps necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale
- Public comments considered throughout the reporting process

28 August 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board

1. Consent Agenda

1c. Request for Delegation of “Maleesya” domain representing Malaysia in Arabic

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

1d. Redlegation of .RW

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

2. Main Agenda

2a. BGC Recommendation on Reconsideration Request 12-2

- Clear, succinct decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Relatively clear rationale though a bit muddled toward the end
- No indication of public comments

3. Executive Session

- Minimal information regarding confidential session of the Board

13 September 2012 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1b. Security, Stability & Resiliency of the DNS (Domain Name System) Review Team Final Report

- Clear decision accepting the Final Report, several actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale
- Public comments received and considered in decision-making process

1c. Response to SSAC (Security and Stability Advisory Committee) Letter of 2 July 2012

- Clear decision with detailed bullet points and clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial impacts and positive DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

1d. Alignment of Board Terms

- Clear decision with clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, positive financial impact, no DNS impact
- Decision to be posted for public comments

2. Main Agenda

2a. Criteria for Determining Chair Compensation for Non-Standing Board Committees

- Clear decision including specific dollar amounts for compensation, presented with bullet points allows for clarity of decision
- Clear rationale, nominal financial impact, no DNS impact
- No indication of public comment

2b. Redlegation of the .MO domain representing Macao to the Bureau of Telecommunications Regulation (DSRT)

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, methodically spelled out reasoning in Q&A format
- Public comments to be posted

2c. Election of Fadi Chehadé as President and Chief Executive Office, effective 14 September 2012

- Clear decision regarding election of ICANN CEO, no action necessary
- Clear rationale, positive effect on ICANN community, financial impact, no DNS impact
- No indication of public comments

3. Executive Session

3a. Officer Compensation

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps necessary
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts

- No indication of public comments

3 October 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board

1. Consent Agenda

1b. Registry Stakeholder Group Charter Amendments for Posting

- Clear, succinct decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale
- Clearly indicated that no public comments sought

1d. Contracting and Disbursement Authority for Audit Program Service Provider

- Vague explanation of decision, includes redactions that contribute to the lack of clarity
- Technical and legal rationale that is difficult to understand
- No public comment required

13 October 2012 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors – Toronto

1. Consent Agenda

1c. Revisions to Board Governance Committee Charter

- Clear succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No public comment required

2. Main Agenda

2a. Approval of Proposed .NAME Renewal Registry Agreement

- Clear, succinct decision, appropriate actions to be taken
- Clear rationale presented in Q&A format, no financial or DNS impacts
- Requires public comment, comments received and addressed

18 October 2012 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors – Toronto

1. Main Agenda

1a. Approval of Revised Process for Handling Requests for Removal of Cross-Ownership Restrictions on Operators of Existing gTLDs

- Short yet unclear decision, no action necessary
- Clear, potentially overly detailed rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comment sought

1b. Approval of ICANN (Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers) Language Services Policy and Procedures

- Clear, succinct decision, appropriate actions to follow
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial impacts to be considered during FY2014 budget discussions or DNS impacts
- Public comment required

1c. Revised Governance Guidelines

- Clear, succinct decision, continued action necessary
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments not required

1e. Security, Stability & Resiliency of the DNS (Domain Name System) Review Team Final Report

- Clear, succinct decision, clear action steps to follow
- Clear rationale presented in Q&A format, minimal financial impact and no DNS impacts
- Public comments required

8 November 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Main Agenda

1a. WHOIS Policy Review Team Report

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps to follow
- Exceedingly clear though long rationale, easily understandable
- Public comments received

20 December 2012 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1d. Root Server System Advisory Committee (RSSAC) Bylaws Amendments Posting for Public Comment

- Clear, succinct decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear succinct rationale, no financial impact
- No public comments required

2. Main Agenda

2a. GNSO (Generic Names Supporting Organization) Council Recommendations IRTP (Inter-Registrar Transfer Policy) Part C

- Somewhat clear decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Rationale clear and presented in bullet points and Q&A format, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments received and considered

2b. Board Term Alignment

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments received and addressed in decision-making process

2c. Accountability Structures Expert Panel Recommendations

- Clear decision, clearly spelled out actionable steps
- Mostly clear decision, financial impact, no DNS impact
- Public comments received

2e. New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Funds Investment Policy

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial impact, no DNS impact
- No public comments required

3. Executive Session

3a. Approval of Compensation Supplement for Akram Atllah's Service as ICANN (Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers)'s President and CEO

- Clearly spelled out decision with relevant regulations
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial but no DNS impact
- No indication of public comments

2013

2 February 2013 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1b. Registry Stakeholder Group Charter Amendments

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, minimal financial impact, no DNS impact
- Public comments received

1d. Engagement of Independent Auditor

- Clear, succinct decision, action steps to be taken
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial but no DNS impact
- No public comments required

2. Main Agenda

2a. Multi-Stakeholder Meeting Strategy Working Group

- Clear decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, minimal financial impact, no DNS impact
- No public comments required

28 February 2013 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

2. Main Agenda

2b. Redlegation of the .ML domain representing Mali

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, marked change from past when redelegation of ccTLDs included long Q&A rationale
- No public comments required

2c. Delegation of the domain representing Ukraine

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, marked change from past when redelegation of ccTLDs included long Q&A rationale
- No public comments required

11 April 2013 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1b. RSSAC Bylaws Amendments

- Clear decision, action steps taken as necessary
- Clear rationale, no significant financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments received

1d. Accountability Structures Bylaws Effective Date

- Somewhat confusing decision regarding ICANN bylaws, actions to be taken as necessary
- Somewhat confusing and long rationale
- Public comments received

1e. .CAT Cross-Ownership Removal Request

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear rationale in Q&A format

- Public comments received

1f. Confirm Process Followed Regarding Redlegation of the .GA (General Assembly Mailing List) domain representing Gabon

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, much shorter than previous domain name delegations
- No public comments required

1g. Change to Public Participation Committee Name

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No public comments required

1h. SO/AC Fast-Track Budget Request

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Community input received

2. Main Agenda

2a. IDN Variant TLD (Top Level Domain) Root LGR (Label Generation Rules) Procedure and User Experience Study Recommendations

- Clear, succinct decision, clear action steps to be taken by specific deadline
- Clear rationale in Q&A format, no financial or DNS impacts
- No public comments required

2b. PIA-CC Application to Form New Constituency

- Clear decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- Public comments received

18 May 2013 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1b. FY2014 Budget Approval Timing

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No public comments required

1d. ACDR Proposal to be a UDRP (Uniform Domain-Name Dispute Resolution Policy) Provider

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Complex and confusing explanation of rationale, minimal financial impact, no DNS impact
- Public comments received

2. Main Agenda

2a. SSAC (Security and Stability Advisory Committee) Advisory on Internal Name Certificates

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps to be taken
- Clear rationale in Q&A format, no financial or DNS impacts
- No public comments required

2b. SSAC (Security and Stability Advisory Committee) Budget Request

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, financial but no DNS impact
- Community input received

3. Executive Session

3a. CEO At-Risk Compensation

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, significant financial impact, no DNS impact
- No public comments required

27 June 2013 | Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1c. Approval of AROS Contract Agreement

- Clear, succinct decision including exact dollar amount of funding, action steps as necessary
- Clear rationale including exact dollar amount, significant financial impact, no DNS impact
- No indication of public comments

2. Main Agenda

2a. Update to IDN ccTLD (Country Code Top Level Domain) Fast Track Implementation

- Clear decision, clear actionable steps necessary
- Technical and lengthy rationale, confusing, financial impacts, no DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

2b. Approval of 2013 RAA (Registrar Accreditation Agreement)

- Clear, succinct decision, action steps as necessary
- Clear, but incredibly long rationale and explanation, presented in bullet points and Q&A format
- Public comments received

17 July 2013 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

1. Consent Agenda

1a – 1c. Redlegation of .ID, .EE, .MOH

- Clear, succinct decision, action steps as necessary
- Clear rationale in Q&A format
- No public comments required

1d. CRM Implementation Project

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No indication of public comments

1e. Approval of President & CEO FY13 T3 At-Risk Compensation

- Clear, succinct decision, no action necessary
- Clear, succinct rationale, significant financial impact, no DNS impact
- No public comments required

18 July 2013 | Regular Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors

2. Consent Agenda

2b. Competition, Consumer Trust and Consumer Choice Metrics for the New gTLD (generic Top Level Domain) Program per AoC Review

- Clear decision, clear action steps to be taken
- Clear rationale
- No public comments required

2e. Budget Approval Timing

- Clear, succinct decision, actionable steps as necessary
- Clear rationale, no financial or DNS impacts
- No public comments required