DURBAN – APRALO Monthly Meeting
Wednesday, July 17, 2013 – 08:00 to 09:00
ICANN – Durban, South Africa

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Good morning ladies and gentlemen. Just a test. We're going to open up the Adobe Connect room for you now. Welcome one and all. Holly is just opening her computer while I filibust. I could do a song and dance but because there's no video… Oh, I could get to the video and you could see me but not until the Adobe Connect room is open.

Today we're meeting here in the ICANN 47 meeting in Durban. This is our normal Asia Pacific Regional At-Large Monthly call. And I know we do have some callers on the line. So as Carlos desperately tries to type in the right name and password – I do hope it wasn't his name he got wrong… It was his name he got wrong. This bodes well for us here today ladies and gentleman.

The Adobe Connect room is opening. A little bit of housekeeping because I've got the mic and I may as well do it before we start: please remember that this call is recorded. You are requested to say your name before you speak for the transcript record. And to that end I believe Holly is cued and ready to go. Over to you, Holly.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thanks very much Cheryl. I'm just waiting for a very sleepy computer to wake up and let me in. But in the meantime we've got some people in the room who we will introduce. Most particularly I'm going to… There we go. Am I in yet? We have a slight change of Agenda. We originally

---

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

EN

were going to start with Rinalia, who has just arrived, but I'd like to actually introduce [Kwek? 00:04:01]. And I'm not going to say your full name because I'm likely to actually get it dreadfully wrong. He's our new Asia Pacific person and he's based in Singapore.

We've just had a very interesting conversation with him but I think we'd like him to introduce himself while Rinalia gets her computer out and ready to talk. [Kwek?], go ahead.

KWEK: Thank you Holly. Thank you for the very warm welcome that I've received from the community. My name is [Kwek?]. I started with ICANN on August 1st and I'm really very excited to be taking on this role. I think the Asia Pacific region has many exciting dimensions to it and I think what I've described – at least in the early part of the meeting that we had here in Durban – is to describe what I think would be meaningful as early activities in this role.

And as I was describing, there is a key tension that I have to resolve when I come on board. The key tension is this: I think that there needs to be more listening and more consultation as I try to understand the region better, and this is one priority that I have. At the same time, concurrently, there are already commitments that are being made. There are plans underway and I'll be making sure that these get implemented in a timely fashion.

And for the existing processes that we already have, APEC gets a voice that is recognized and also the ALAC gets that due recognition as well. I know you have a full Agenda and that's why I don't want to talk too

EN

much but I hope this gives you a good sense of how I'm thinking about this as a start. I look forward to the opportunity to get to know everyone a little bit better. I'm also going to make a plug for the APEC strategy project that we're going to work on.

I think that there are a lot of things that we should think about as a group: how we want to structure it, what kind of methodology we should use… The Middle East and Africa already have a plan but I think it's better to go through this in a thoughtful and inclusive fashion and make sure that we come up with a good product.

We're going to kick off the strategy process itself at the Asia Pacific IGF but preparatory work is already underway, as I was describing to Holly and everyone else. And I really look forward to working with APRALO to make sure that we get a good baseline to work off on. So that's my hogging of the air-time finished. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you [Kwek?]. And I would pick up on what he's said there: there will be the development of an Asia Pacific strategy. What I would expect in the next APRALO call or the one after would be some input from all of you to say these are the things you should be thinking about, because the strategy is very much going to be something that we contribute to, that we own in the sense that we and Kwek, together, have come up with at least part of a strategy that includes ALAC.

Now, thank you for that time. Rinalia, are you ready? And now we're going to go back to the… Cheryl would like the floor. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: The reason I was tapping my card – and I haven't opened up my computer because I'm going to be elsewhere for the rest of the day – was I thought I would just ask you and make an assumption that you would be saying yes. If any of our Membership who are online happen to have a question or enquiry, if Staff could collect those and then you could take those on notice and get back through Staff? That might be a good way to get you into a conversation with your communities.

I'm assuming you'll agree to that but I just wanted to put it forward. Thank you.

KWEK: Your assumption is right.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you very much. Now we'll go back to the original Agenda and Rinalia who will be talking about the IGF and the rIGF update. So over to you Rinalia.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you Holly. Carlos, could I have the document up please? There is a link there. I'm going to talk about the IGF because I have taken the lead role in organizing the APRALO Workshop at the IGF. On the rIGF I think I would have to defer to someone else around the table. Perhaps… Cheryl Langdon-Orr has agreed to do it, or Edmon.

This workshop that we are doing at the IGF in Bali is quite special. It is the first time that a RALO and ICANN are collaborating in a workshop.

Typically a RALO would have its own workshop but in this regard the topic is quite crucial. It is an innovation in the world of Internet and we are quite excited about it. The topic is about IDN and the introduction of IDN variant TLDs at the root level.

If you can get the document up I'll give you an… In terms of the organizing aspect my collaborator in ICANN there are two leading Staff Members. One is Baher Asmet; he is the Vice President for the Middle East and North Africa. And also on the IDN Team in ICANN itself it's Naella Saras. And we've collaborated very well and we've put together a very good program on cutting-edge process that is starting in ICANN right now, on the label generation rules for the root zone.

So what this workshop will do is introduce to the IGF participants what that process is, and we'll have some expert from the panel to talk about what the security and stability implications are of that and what the implications are for several key language scripts for the Asia Pacific region, specifically Arabic, the [hanscrip? 00:11:35], which applies to Chinese, Korean and Japanese and Indic languages, which includes Devanagari and others.

I think in the Indic languages there are 22 languages and 15 scripts altogether. And the innovation with regard to this workshop is that we have the expert panel but we also have a panel with representation from end users. And the end users will state the issues, concerns or aspirations that they see from the community on what they would like to have, in terms of linguistic diversity at the root and in IDN TLDs and IDN variant TLDs.

And the panel of experts will respond to that in terms of what is possible, what is not possible, and why. And I think it would be a good thing because the workshop will hopefully have a constructive dialogue in terms of what this new innovation means for the world, what can be achieved and what expectations need to be constrained to ensure that the domain name system is secure and stable for everyone – because the root zone is a shared resource for all Internet users.

I see that the document is still not up but I think that it should be accessible on the Agenda itself for participants. And I'll stop there. Thank you Holly.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Rinalia. At this stage what I'd like to do is, first of all… Rinalia, do you want to talk to that now that it's up?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you Holly. If you could just scroll to the list of speakers so I can show who's involved that would be really good. Now, is this visible Carlos to remote participants? I'll run through the experts list. On the panel of technical experts we have Ram Mohan, who is the Chair of the ICANN Board IDN Variants Working Group. We have Patrik Fälstrom, who is the Chair of the ICANN Security, Stability and Advisory Committee.

And then we have [Saramat Hussein? 00:14:03], a Professor from Pakistan, who is an expert on the Arabic script. We have Raymond Doctor, who is an expert in Devanagari, from India. Of course we have

EN

Edmon Chung, who is famous and an expert in the [laughter] [Hanscript? 00:14:17]. He is an expert in everything.

And in terms of the panel of Internet end users we have Mohamad El Bashir, who is from AFRALO, but because the Arabic script is used in the Asia Pacific region it's relevant and we have invited Mohamed to be on the panel. We have Hong Xue, who comes from China and who will talk about the [handscript?] and we have Satish Babu from India, who will comment on the Indic languages.

So this is the panel of experts and end user representatives and I think the IGF MAG Members are excited because somehow this is quite new in the IGF itself. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Rinalia. The next Item on the Agenda is… Edmon has his hand up.

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you Holly. I was just wondering if I could ask a couple of questions? I think we asked for funding on this and it's not going to happen as I understand. What's the status on that?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: The funding has been approved. We have funding for three people from APRALO and between Holly and myself we've done a consultation in terms of who will be funded. I will be funded as the workshop organizer and representative from APRALO. Hong would be funded and Mohamed

El Bashir would be funded. Because Satish is self-funding and the panel of experts are either self-funding or funded by ICANN. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Do you have any more questions Edmon? Okay, onto the next Agenda Item. At the last meeting we talked a little bit about Beijing but Pavan had not had an opportunity to gather some of the input from the survey done from Beijing. If you remember there… Well, it was actually more than that. It was a survey that asked participants and… Edmon, you want to…? Okay, go ahead.

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you Holly. Edmon here again. I think we should talk a little bit about the regional IGF as well before we jump.

HOLLY RAICHE: Go ahead, sorry. Go ahead.

EDMON CHUNG: Perhaps Cheryl can start and then I can add because I want to get a little bit of water.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Cheryl Langdon-Orr, for the record I'm only going to do a very brief start Edmon. As you know, Edmon and Yannis and myself and many others in the Asia Pacific region but not from our own APRALO as such although some of them may have relationships to our ALSs are very

busy and involved in the planning for this year's APrIGF, which will be held in Seoul.

Having been part of this from the very beginning along with Edmon and the team, I must say that I think we're quite ahead on the planning for the facility and we are very pleased with what's been happening. We're just seeing the work from the program subcommittee come to fruition now but I think we had a record number of – correct me if I'm wrong Yannis – it was 22 or 24. Low 20s if not mid-20s workshop proposals including one from ICANN.

Now, hopefully Edmon has got his glass of water and I can stop fillibusting and toss back to him on this because of course Yannis and her team have been acting as secretariat for the regional IGF Coordinating Committee. Thanks Edmon.

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you, Edmon here again. So I think that's a very good introduction and in terms of this APRALO here, I hope that we'll get more participation here. I think Yannis, you probably have a better idea that we have more than 25 proposals that we eventually selected 25 to be on the Agenda so it's now growing into its fourth year if I'm not mistaken? Yes, fourth year and it's grown quite a bit and we're quite excited about it.

It's traditionally… Not all the ALSs come and we'd like to try to get more of the ALSs to come. And of course there should be some more interaction with APRALO and the APrIGF as well. So I guess that's the area where I wanted to raise the discussion and see if Holly or

[Saranush? 00:19:56], what's the plan on being there and in terms of logistics – if you're interested – Yannis can probably add to that in terms of that. I don't remember the exact dates and venue but Yannis probably has much better [inaudible 00:20:15].

HOLLY RAICHE: Help him Yannis.

YANNIS LI: So actually the RHF will be from the 3rd to the 5th of September in Seoul, Korea and you can always check our website to know more about information. Or just come to me if you have any questions about it. Thanks.

EDMON CHUNG: This is Edmon again. So just adding to that there's… One of the general discussions at the APrIGF is the kind of participation. I'll have to admit that it's very driven by the industry and not that there are no governments or no civil society but both of which are less represented so far.

We're hoping that as the RHF grows we could be able to do that more. And this part of it is getting ALSs involved and part of it is getting the governments involved as well. That has been… I think that's important to let more people from the community know and try to bring the people in.

HOLLY RAICHE: Do you want that to be an Agenda Item for the next meeting where we could actually talk about APRALO involvement or more broadly civil society and government involvement in the regional IGF's. I think there was probably a tension between… We sought funding and the funding actually was seen to go to Bali and it was not seen to go to South Korea. It became a kind of either/or thing so maybe that's something that we can talk to Kwek about.

KWEK: I think the Board is going to approve the budget.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Kwek. Moving right along, one of the things that Pavan got together as a result of the Beijing meeting. He did an interesting survey of the people who were able to participate and I was very pleased at the number of people we actually had there. He came up with about four themes and I think they are important to actually inform, how we actually inform ourselves and how we meet. Now [Surnish? 00:22:56], my Vice-Chair if you want to talk to that.

SURNISH VARDANIAN: We have talked a little bit about the list of suggestions came from Pavan and I'm very thankful that he could some up with this list. Out of all those suggestions and we decided to start a couple of things to make participation of ALSs in APRALO more inclusive, more active. And one of the first steps that we are going to do is using our mailing list more

actively and the first step towards all ALSs will be the call to subscribe to all APRALO mailing lists.

So especially for our specific APRALO mailing list where we usually send all the information, all the requests, all the suggestions so this will be the requirement for all our ALS coordinators to start network. And we also are going to start… Actually it all ready has been started here and had been noted by Heidi yesterday that the process has been started of getting more information about the ALSs.

Each and every ALS will have their own informational part in the website, the ICANN website and they will be recorded. Those people, step by step, the process of recording is started here already so the representative from ALSs will be recorded and it will be available for all other people to go and to learn more about those people.

And we are also planning to have to send via APRALO mailing list for gathering the information about APRALO ALSs for that website. Some kind of template to all ALS representatives to fill in and sent them back. And probably we'll ask all our Staff to support with coming up with the template because maybe there will be some pictures. What size of pictures we will need for the website, what kind of videos may be needed.

So some specific instructions for people to fill it, that would be really helpful for all of us to come up and I will make sure I also take the initiative to follow up with that initiative and to remind all ALSs to do that because we want to also - in that sense - connect with the working group of metrics to measure the active participation from our ALSs.

Because we know that there are time differences. We know that there are difficulties to enter to participate in our cause but it can be once, twice or three times.

It can't be forever so we are trying to at least keep all of those ALSs who are active, to provide some incentives for those people. And we will be measuring also the participation of ALSs in different activities. So I'm just telling this all for everyone to be aware that behind the stage we are going to also do that kind of activities from our Chair part and my part with the support of all of you, of course.

And then other Action Item which we are going to do is to take into consideration one of the suggestions came up with the list by Pavan to provide the floor for ALSs to present themselves and during one of each of our meetings. We are going to do that and today the pioneer of this first step in that sense will be Satish Babu. So we are going to also hear about his organization and probably before every call we are going to inform one of the ALSs to be ready to present about their own ALS. Not more five or ten minutes during our monthly calls so that is much for now. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: There was a couple of more points that Pavan came up with that I think we have addressed. The first was: people were a little bit overwhelmed by the terminology. If you spend any time at all on ICANN, you find that you are speaking a very strange language and if you go outside of the bounds of an ICANN meeting, people think actually they don't understand your language, which is probably correct.

The meeting guide that was within our pack when we arrived, in it last pages has got a glossary and I just think that's a very useful document for everybody. Is it possible to get a soft copy out to the people Heidi? Of just the meeting guide with a glossary in the back. Okay. It was a very useful document.

The other very useful document and again it was responding to what Pavan was finding and that is: there's a lot of discussion about the policies that get debated around this table. What we don't realize who are sitting around the table is that not everybody else is in as deep as we are which is probably a good thing because possibly it comments on our own insanity.

What Matt has pulled together is a draft, a beginner's guide for ALAC and it actually has some very good descriptions of what policies we're talking about, what they mean – it's devoid of all the terminology – and it's very useful. Basically, I think… What stage is that at? Sorry.

HEIDI ULLRICH: That beginner's guide is currently in the draft form. There's a PDF, I'm going to put a link to that up. If there are any major changes at this point we'll still make them. But in the next few weeks that's going to close, that period and then it will be printed in at least the three languages if not the five.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Heidi. I can commend the document to you. A number of us have contributed to make things a little bit clearer, a little bit easier to

read and what it means is when we are asking for input that is the place to start because it's an explanation of what the issues are about. Cheryl.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: And I do want to compliment the work that Matt in particular, but obviously community members as well, have done on that document. I think that's going to be a benchmark document for other parts of ICANN as well. So that's a, "Yeah team," and I look forward to a very prompt publication of it but the soft copies that you'll have access to – even in draft form – I believe your At-Large structures would make extremely good use of.

The reason I wanted to raise my hand was actually to pick up on point that Siranush was making in her part of the report on this. I'm looking forward to these showcase-in-micro - these little moments with each of the ALSs. I think it's probably time we reminded the ALSs and we ask them to perhaps to put some of the content they present – even if it's just the mp3 from what they're telling us over the phone connection - onto the dedicated web space that ICANN has provided for each and every At-Large structure.

At the moment every single one of us has got a place and space in the Wiki. We have Wiki that we can therefore use for our own purposes within reason. So you can create sub-pages but most of them have a name and a logo if we're lucky. It's a piece of greenfield real estate and it seems to me that this is the right time. So Satish as your first cab off the rank I'm going to ask for an Action Item to make sure you are sent the link to this real estate. And then in the follow up at our meeting

after your presentation, you'll have all ready prepared that real estate and we can do a Ta Da – look what you can do, too. That would be fantastic. Thanks very much Holly.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Cheryl. You beat me to it. I had a look last night as to the list of ALSs and the description and I realized our own link is out of date. I think now that we have new members, we have changes in membership, we have new applications.

I think one action item on every ALS has to be to go find the link to your site. Have a look at it. If it needs updating please let Matt and/or Heidi know so that we can actually have a complete list and we know who… No? Cheryl's upset, Heidi what would people like to do because…?

HEIDI ULLRICH: I've just put the link to the APRALO Wiki page that has all of the separate Wiki pages for each of your ALSs. Please do - again you have rights to edit that Wiki – please post any information, photos, videos, etc. Given what the body's initiative of having this interactive ALS booklet or e-booklet, I'm not sure what we're going to be calling it.

I'm not sure whether this is going to be in addition to it. I think it's probably going to complement it. It will definitely be linking this to anything that we produce so go ahead and do that. If you do need staff assistance, we'll of course be able to support you on that.

SURNISH VARADIAN: Just one clarification for the record as we talked that we are going to send a template for people to fill in. There is no need. So we can send

EN

the link and they can go to Wiki and just put the stuff there. Thank you.
Good.

HOLLY RAICHE: But the Action Item on everyone is to have a look at what's there and to
make corrections so that in fact we all have correct information about
ourselves which would be very helpful. And that's an Action Item on you
and me Cheryl. Thank you.

I'd like to change the Agenda just a little bit. I'd rather have Satish have
a bit of time and then we can review what is actually occurred in the
ICANN meetings so far just to keep you up to date. But that's perhaps
less important because I can put that in a report and it will be on the
website anyway.

So Satish and Carlos can we get his presentation up?

SATISH BABU: I'm going to make a very brief presentation on the current status of the
ICANN Meeting Strategy Working Group which I have been put into by
APRALO.   This particular presentation is a preliminary presentation
because the group has just started its work. It might take another three
to six months for it to complete its work.

I'm going to be touching upon the charter and composition, the
subgroups, the deliverables and the current status. Next, please. The
charter is basically to discuss and propose strategy for the structure
purpose and locations for ICANN public meetings and conferences from
2015. So basically this is beyond London and is two years from now.

The composition: ALAC has five, ASEC two, GAC 2, GEN 4 and the gender breakdown is males nine and females seven. I mention this because there was a very conscious effort taken by ICANN to ensure these kinds of balances. Next.

We have divided ourselves… I mean the group basically kicked off at Beijing and we have divided ourselves into three groups, three subgroups of three, chaired respectively by volunteers Paul and Michelle. Each of us were allowed to be part of multiple groups, one primary and one secondary. This is the big bunch of people. Next.

Now here are the actual – the scope for each of the subgroups: subgroup one is working around what should be the scope of these meetings, subgroup two on how to organize or what are the best practices in organizing these meetings and subgroup three, engagement and support.

I am helping out Michelle here. Michelle is actually a very well known photographer so that actually talks about the diversity of this group. And we've been having kind of weekly and fortnightly calls. And you can see the kind of the points and the topics we've been discussing. They are quite a lot and we've been struggling to converge to a small bunch of priority areas and leave out the rest as kind of secondary priorities. This has not happened fully but we're working at it. Next.

The deliverables, provide matrix Santish talking about metrics so there are various metrics being proposed around the effectiveness of these meetings and of different aspects of these meetings and analyzing our current requirements maybe through survey, maybe other

methodologies, compile the various studies and feedback collected. In the meeting so far, Satish's idea to enhance the organization of future meetings and for his report, that will be discussed by the community and there will be several opportunities for the community to provide feedback on the proposals that will be put out. And then finally make our recommendations. This is roughly the deliverables, next.

Current status: kickoff meeting was in Beijing. We have weekly, fortnightly calls. We had a group exercise yesterday here in Durban. We have the public meeting of the Meeting Strategy Working Group scheduled for 18 July at 9 and we will be putting out the initial document and I would like to request the entire APRALO to go through this document as it comes out and provide us with more feedback on… I think we lack original organizations are perhaps the largest in terms of numbers of people attending.

We are not actually enumerated this in terms of a bunch of tables but it is a feeling we have. And we also are most diverse. In fact our people, perhaps our people who do not travel very frequently, they have different kind of problems as opposed to the other constituencies.

Therefore I would say that our community needs to provide the most amount of feedback on account of our diversity. So I'd request everybody to go through this document and provide their feedback as it comes out. Next.

That's it. Our open meeting is scheduled for 18th, that's tomorrow, 9:00 a.m. at Hall Six. Please participate if you have anything to add to this and if you would like us to take up anything. Thank you very much.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Satish. Are there any comments or questions? Rinalia.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you Satish for the presentation. I would like to suggest that when the document comes out we organize a webinar or a meeting for our region where you walk us through the main points of that and the community can provide comments.

My concern is that if you let everyone take a look at the document in their own time, sometimes there is a mis-synchronization and you won't get the meaningful inputs that you are looking for. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Rinalia and I notice Heidi is writing down very furiously. Thank you Cheryl. Satish?

SATISH: I think Rinalia's point is very valid. We will organize in consultation with holding a webinar whereby we will kind of walk through the report and present it so that people can meaningful respond. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Satish. Now we can go back to…

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Sorry Holly, can I have that recorded as an Action Item please?

EN

HOLLY RAICHE: Pleasure. Rinalia, could you actually state that as you wish?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Here is the proposed Action Item: webinar to be organized where Satish Babu will present the outcome document of the Meeting Strategy Working Group and for the APRALO community to provide feedback.

SATISH BABU: Can I make it a preliminary outcome document?

HOLLY RAICHE: Everybody's laughing because we know that is the beginning of a very long process. The question I was going to ask Satish is: once we have the meeting which is tomorrow, what is the process from there? What are the steps that you envisage will happen before changes are made in response to the report?

SATISH BABU: Thank you Holly. We are not yet very clear about the next steps because we have been following a certain pattern all along the last three months and yesterday we have taken a completely different direction. A new group exercise which is not exactly continuous with what we were doing earlier.

                           Now we have to kind of converge these into a single stream so [Sebastien? 00:43:22] – who's heading the group – has suggested that two weeks after the Durban we'll have the next meeting where we will weave these two streams together into one.

EN

And then prioritize and maybe in another month or maybe six weeks have a preliminary document ready. So that is what we have on the horizon right now that might well change. It's going to go past [inaudible 00:43:48] eyes in most cases and that's what we think.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Satish. Where we're up to now on the Agenda, we're going to go back to where we should have been. Sorry, our fearless Chair is here.

What I'd like to do is the updates from the meeting so far. What we – being the people who are here or the people who have been following – have gone through and what are some of the issues that have been raised.

I've thought about doing in chronologically and then I thought, "No, no, no." We'll just identify the main issues that have been raised generally about ICANN and generally about the processes. And then a couple of words on the issues that are ones that have been raised within ALAC generally and possibly within our area specifically.

We've had a meeting with the Board. It was very useful. There was a great deal of dialogue about how they actually appreciate our advice, how we give our advice. One of the fun things was that they actually ended up arguing with themselves. I thought that was positively delightful.

But there was a lovely impassioned speech from one of the Directors who is actually leaving who just said when he came eight years ago. ALAC was…

He's leaving? Kwek, thank you very much for your time. We will look forward to your participation in the next meetings.

Anyway he basically said eight years ago ALAC was a bit of window dressing. That's it's now regarded very differently and taken very seriously. It was very useful to hear. One item that was also mentioned is in the issue of – now let me get this straight – with the introduction of the new generic top level domains there has been some work over time to ask the question and it was a question that the Board put to a joint committee saying, "We'd like to understand if there is actual benefit from new generic top level domains."

And the question was raised under three headings: has consumer confidence improved, has consumer trust improved and has competition improved. And the joint working group which included ALAC and the GNSO came up with a number of metrics. We had a long discussion about those metrics over the board. We asked how they are, where they are up to and where they are up to is actually compliance is now looking as to how to implement those metrics.

It includes things like: is there consumer confusion about the new gTLDs, the level of complaints, how many new gTLDs are there and if there are new gTLDs is it defensive registration or is it actually a new product. A range of things… I don't think we need a link to it. That was the other issue that was raised.

Another meeting that was really about ICANN generally was with the members of the ATRT 2, which I will translate. The Accountability Transparency Review Team, they are set up to… They were required under the affirmation of commitments and is set up to actually review the transparency and accountability of ICANN.

So they're meeting with all of the stakeholder groups with the Advisory Councils in the supporting organizations. And we had an interesting meeting with them. I don't think I'm going to go into the details but it was a very useful conversation and I think I'm looking forward to their report. I think they're going to report it, I think they are going to report it in Buenos Aires.

In terms of the issues – and I will open the floor to others who've participated but the issues that have been of I would say top priority for ALAC. One has been and it was raised in the multi-stakeholder panel that Rinalia organized, which was very successful. That was on the new gTLD's and the metrics.

That transcript will be available, that recording will be available. I think that recording will be available but all of the issues that I've raised about the metrics were raised in there. That was a very interesting discussion. We've had further discussions on the IDN variance and I'm not going to talk about them. Is there anything you want to talk about with IDN variance?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you Holly. Just an addition to what Holly said about the multi-stakeholder round table, the topic was on consumer and public interest

concerns and the metrics that Holly mentioned is a subset of the broader concerns that other stakeholder groups and perhaps shared by the ALAC as well, have. On the IDN and IDN variance, the SSAC is currently in discussion to find consensus on their report on IDN variant TLDs. And we are eagerly awaiting the publication of that report because that will help guide us in our discussion on what's possible and what is not possible.

And I think the target is to have that by Thursday morning if SSAC reaches a consensus. This afternoon around 4:00, the IDN Working Group will convene and we will address some of the outstanding issues regarding IDN's and any other concerns or issues that the community would like to table.

I think that the trademark clearinghouse and IDN variant support management issue is still open and we are still looking for solutions to that and we've begun a conversation with the Board Variant Working Group, the Board the New gTLD Program Committee to try to find our way forward on the issues that our community has identified as problematic and Edmon may want to add on that as well. Thank you.

EDMON CHUNG: Actually no, that's a pretty good summary of the situation and I'm glad that we opened the conversation. I think it's a show of two things: one is the importance of the issue itself and the other is the importance of it from APRALO and through ALAC how that is starting to make an impact.

On the substance of which I guess I wonder if Hong wants to add a little bit more to it to add some of the issues that are outstanding and so let our community understand it a little bit more.

HONG XI: Thank you Chair, [inaudible 00:51:49], Edmon and others. It's quite amazing that many Board members and leading Staff are willing to spend three hours with us to talk about this quite specific issue. With a large community there's very positive development. And We really go to the substantive issue. This is not ceremonial, it's a work session so it's good.

For the solution, it's not available so far but discussion, absolutely. If it could be solved technically it would be perfect. If there's no solution technically timely because we have pressing need and [inaudible 00:52:38] are going to be launched. This is more pressing that the Variance TLD. This involved all the TLDs even the [ASCII? 00:52:46] TLD they open for IDN variance registration and you see Holly is a lawyer, she understands the user confusion. The trademark wars so I save that part for her briefing and so that the concern is still there. Now we kick the Board and I have it, the response that I get from this issue.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Hong. I still think there are still plenty of issues to be addressed. I think that there was some very real progress in terms of the Board actually meeting with the Committee and trying to get its head around what some of the issues are. And I think there are some next steps that have to be followed. I hope they will be.

One issue that is a policy issue that is - I suppose - front and center important simply because it's open for comment. And the issue is huge relates to what's called WHOIS information and that is the information that's required under the registrar's contract with ICANN.

This information is required to be publicly available and it's attracted a lot of issues in a lot of ways. A lot of the issues are about the accuracy of the data. A lot of the issues are about whether this should be made public. What are the privacy rights? What are the law enforcement rights to access the data? Lots of issues. For those who haven't been following there's a huge amount of material on the policy page.

There have been major changes that ALAC has been supportive of that were passed by the Board at the end of June but what has happened more recently is the Board has convened what's called an Expert Working Group. It has made some very significant proposals about the data, about where it is stored, about who has access to the data, who does not have access to the data. And the possibility of some very different ways of managing both privacy rights and access.

Right now there is not very much on our policy page but there certainly… If you go to ICANN's policy page it's there. We will be looking… There are a few of us looking at this in detail. What is lovely now is that we've got the beginner's guide that does explain at least the beginnings of the issues.

So for those who are interested and want to participate, there's a really good background description of the WHOIS issues. And the comments are due. It's a new process that's been followed by the Expert Working

Group. They have not worked out the details of what their proposal looks like.

It's simply saying, "We are conceptualizing a new way to actually manage the information of the registrar," the person who has the domain name. We want to know you as a community, as an ICANN community, what you think of this and whether we should proceed. It's a new process. We're trying it out. I'm sure that ALAC will be coming up with a statement and anybody that wants to get their heads around it are most welcome to.

Other policy issues – bless you Heidi – have you put a link to the policy page? Heidi's put a link to the policy page. I was really going to go through what's on that policy page. I won't now but by all means please have a look at what's on the policy page, where we're up to with the various statements.

There are a few things that do require input and one of the issues raised by Pavan is we really do need ALSs to participate in trying to understand what the issues are and provide feedback. So I think I'm going to put an Action Item on myself to draw people's attention to the page and to draw people's attention to the need to look at some of the policy issues. Familiarize yourself with them and start to think through what we as ALAC should be saying.

I'd like to – just before we close – for Yannis and Sebastian and Satish and Edmon, is there any other policy issue you think we might mention now that hasn't been mentioned in terms of the policies that ALAC's looking at? Have I covered it? Good. Sebastian?

SEBASTIAN BACHOLLET: Just as input for your discussion, this Expert Working Group will have a report. I'm not sure it's yet the time for ALAC to put something because my feeling is that if all ready ALAC has a body. I'm not talking about [inaudible 00:58:13] I'm really talking about ALAC is putting a statement now. It's maybe…

I think it's better if ALAC waits for the final report to do something. But I suggest strongly that the RALOs do something and eventually coordinate an answer but it's not exactly the same thing if RALO say something and the ALAC say something. It's my thinking and just as a personal thinking. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thanks Sebastian and good advice. I have the feeling that there has to be some comment because I was sitting in a – here I go – in a Generic Name Supporting Organization. gNSO meeting and was hearing a lot of disquiet from registrars about the proposal so I suspect there needs to be a countervailing voice that says, "Look, this is just a concept at this stage but we think you should proceed and we think it needs a lot more work on these details but don't stop now on this.

This is a very important aspect that may actually address some issues." I'm just very fearful if we don't say something that it may be killed. That's the feeling I got.

Anyway look, this is something that ALAC will have to talk about. I think what I would like to do… Two things that came out of Pavan's recommendations: one is that I would like to have each ALS have a look at the policy page and see what interests you and start to put your hand

up in terms of you'd like to get your head around a particular policy issue so that we as APRALO can go back to our members for feedback.

So I'll probably be sending out an e-mail saying, "Okay, these are the things we are looking at. What interests you? Where do you need to go to get more information? Where do you need to go for more help so we can start to have some backup of ALS support. The other is for the next meeting I want to start the process of having a presentation by one ALS to describe who they are and what they do.

Now has anyone around the room want to start? Satish just put his hand up so the next APRALO meeting we're going to hear from Satish. Thank you but after that we are going to go around so that everybody will put their hand up. We can listen to each other as to what we do. Now we're just on time. Heidi would like two seconds.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. Again, many thanks Satish for volunteering. I have put up the link to the NARALO ALS spotlights and again they were the first to do this and it is a great initiative so I do welcome that APRALO is going to begin this as well.

Yesterday during one of the policy discussions there was sort of a round table from each of the RALO's to how they're going to increase their RALO policy making. And there was some discussion as to how APRALO could do that and I just wanted to remind everyone that a couple of years ago you requested a policy development page Wiki which is now up into the AC chat.

EN

And if you take a look at that, great initiative but you'll see that it remains to be started. That page is empty at the moment. So again, as you begin to look At-Large policy development page and see issues that are of particular interest to the APRALO region and wish to contribute to that as a region, you can begin developing those policies on that page and then it will be drawn into the larger At-Large policy development. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: So there's Action Items on all of us. Given that it's now 9:02 and we're two minutes over, I will declare the meeting closed and thank you all for your participation. And we will be meeting online soon. Thank you.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you everyone. For those… The next meeting is actually on now. We're a little bit late for it. It's the meeting with GAC, that's in 4AB so if you could please make your way there. I think they're all ready probably beginning. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]