Accountability & Transparency Review Team 2 (ATRT 2)
Durban Face-to-Face Meeting
Thursday, 13 July – Thursday, 18 July
PRELIMINARY REPORT

Review Team Members
Alan Greenberg
Avri Doria
Brian Cute
David Conrad
Carlos Raúl Gutierrez
Demi Getschko
Fiona Asonga
Heather Dryden
LIse Fuhr
Lawrence Strickling
Michael Yakushev
Olivier Crépin-Leblond
Steve Crocker
Stephen Conroy
Xinsheng Zhang

Apologies
Jørgen Abild Andersen

Invited Participants
Feng Guo
Fiona Alexander
Paul Diaz

ICANN Staff
Alice Jansen
Charla Shambley
Denise Michel
Larisa Gurnick

Recordings and transcripts may be found on the wiki at:
https://community.icann.org/display/ATRT2/Durban+-+12+July-18+July+2013

The Accountability and Transparency Review Team 2 (ATRT2) undertook the following during this session:

1. Agenda & Preliminary Reports

The Review Team adopted the proposed agenda on day 1 and resolved to refer to a revised version on day 2.

The Review Team resolved to adopt the following preliminary reports:

- Call 07 - 20 June;
- Call with Commercial Stakeholder Group - 1 July;
- Call 08 - 8 July.

2. Declaration of Interests & Conflict of Interest Policy

The Review Team called for any updates. None were raised.

3. Independent Expert

The Review Team invoked the Chatham House Rule in order to discuss proposals received to date in response to the Request for Proposals issued on 2 July 2013. Following internal discussions, the Review resolved to postpone the submission deadline to 19 July 2013 – 23:59 UTC with a view to providing bidders with sufficient time to submit their proposals.

The Review Team elaborated a set of criteria and selection methodology and reiterated their intent to conduct the selection based on a scoring sheet comprising the criteria.

4. Confidential Input

In order to allow for individuals to submit feedback in agreeable conditions, the Review Team resolved to remove Lawrence Strickling, Heather Dryden and Steve Crocker from the confidential input email list. Stephen Conroy also requested that his name be removed from the confidential input email list.

5. Meetings with ICANN Staff

The Review Team met with the following ICANN Staff Members:

- Denise Michel (VP, Strategic Initiatives – Advisor to the President & CEO) and Larisa Gurnick (Senior Director, Organizational Reviews) to discuss accountability and transparency metrics & benchmarks.
- Tarek Kamel (Senior Advisor to President) walked the Review Team through ICANN's governmental outreach effort;
- Amy Stathos (Deputy General Counsel) addressed the Review Team's questions with respect to the ICANN Whistleblower program & Board Reconsideration Process;
- Margie Milam (Senior Director, Strategic Initiatives), Christopher Gift (Vice President, Online Community Services) and Steve Sheng (Senior Technical Analyst, Policy) gave a presentation on the progress made in the implementation of WHOIS Policy Review Team recommendations.
- Patrick Jones provided the Review Team with an update on implementation status of the Security, Stability & Resiliency of the DNS Review Team (SSR) recommendations;
- Sally Costerton (Senior Advisor to President – Global Stakeholder Engagement), David Olive (Vice-President, Policy Development), Christina Rodriguez (Manager, ICANN Language Services) and Christopher Gift (Vice-President, Online Community Services) updated the Review Team on the status of the ATRT 1 Implementation pertaining to the public comment process and multilingual strategy.
- Marika Konings (Senior Director, Policy Development Support) took the Review Team through the GNSO policy development process and shared her feedback with the Review Team.

6. Meetings with ICANN Community (ICANN SO/ACs, Stakeholder Groups, Constituencies) & Ombudsman

As part of its data gathering process and effort, the Review Team invited the ICANN SO/ACs, Stakeholder Groups, and Constituencies that form the ICANN Community to hold sessions in Durban in order to gather their feedback. The Review Team prepared questions to help focus attention on particular areas of interest and to structure the discussions. To view the questions, please refer to: https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=41886752). The ATRT2 emphasized that any input was welcome and invited the Community to continue the dialogue via two avenues:

- input-to-atrt2@ican..org - the feedback submitted on this list is publicly archived;
- confidential@atrt.info - Review Team Members only have access to the content published on this list.

The following outreach sessions were conducted:

- Session with Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO);
- Session with ICANN Board of Directors;
- Session with Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC);
- Session with Security & Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC);
- Session with Nominating Committee (NomCom);
- Session with Not-for-Profit Organizations Constituency (NPOC);
- Session with At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC);
- Session with Registries Stakeholder Group (RySG);
- Session with Non-Commercial Users Stakeholder Group (NCUC);
- Session with Registrars Stakeholder Group (RrSG);
- Session with Country Code Names Supporting Organization (ccNSO);
- Session with Root Server System Advisory Committee (RSSAC);
- Session with ICANN Community.

Recordings and transcripts of these sessions will be posted on the wiki at: https://community.icann.org/display/ATRT2/Durban+-+12+July-18+July+2013

7. Work Streams

The Work-Stream Chairs provided the Review Team with a progress report of their respective work-stream activities including difficulties and challenges encountered, achievements and goals set on the road to the next Review Team meeting Los Angeles. The Work-Stream reports allowed for the Team to feed into the potential recommendations discussion.

8. Potential Issues for Recommendations

The Review Team walked through the public comments received and assembled preliminary conclusions reached in work streams with a view to teasing out a set of potential issues for recommendations (see below). The Review Team Chair prepared a template for the Review Team's consideration (please refer to: https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/41884178/ATRT2+templates+-

+Revised+18+July+2013.docx?version=1&modificationDate=1374147758000) which the Team resolved to adopt and to use consistently throughout the analysis phase. The Review Team Chair requested that Team Members assigned to an issue submit their completed template by 9 August, as part of the preparation for the Los Angeles meeting. The issues were mapped out according to the work-stream memberships and mandates.

- GAC participation in policy processes (WS1.b) – Lawrence Strickling;

- Publication of yearly statistical reports on transparency (whistleblower) (WS4) – Avri Doria;

- Cross-constituency work – Alan Greenberg, Avri Doria;

- Reconsideration (WS1.a) – Carlos Gutierrez

- Public comment process (WS1.c) – Brian Cute

- PDP (WS1.e) – Alan Greenberg

- Communications for the Board (WS1.a) – David Conrad

- Communications for the GAC (WS1.b) – Stephen Conroy

- Review process (WS4) – Brian Cute, David Conrad

- Multilingual Quality (WS4) – Lise Fuhr, Fiona Asonga

9. **Potential Issues for Recommendations**

The Review Team resolved to change its meeting to enable Heather Dryden's participation in the Los Angeles meeting and drafting session.

10. **Update on Letters & Outreach to Senior Government Officials**

Staff provided an update and informed the Review Team that the GAC Chair will distribute the letter from the ATRT 2 to GAC members at their meeting in Durban. Staff will supply the Review Team with a list organized by region and country of all contacts made to date and contact information assembled. ATRT 2 members were invited to supplement the list with any additional information they have for their respective regions.