

---

BEIJING – At-Large Regional Leadership Meeting

Wednesday, April 10, 2013 – 12:30 to 14:00

ICANN – Beijing, People’s Republic of China

HOLLY RAICHE:

This is going to be the At-Large Regional Leadership Meeting, so if everybody is here for that purpose that is terrific, if not, it is an open meeting and you can sit here anyway. Are we ready?

Good Afternoon. This is the At-Large Regional Leadership Meeting. It is Wednesday, April 10th, 2013. It is 12:42 p.m. and we are in Function Room #6 of the Beijing International Hotel. Please go ahead and start your meeting.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you and thank you everybody. Before we go any further, could we just have a roll call? Could you just go around and say your names please for the records and after that then we will have an adoption of the agenda, which will be posted.

WOLF LUDWIG:

Wolf Ludwig, Chair of EURALO.

SALANIETA TAMANIKAIWAIMARO: Salanieta Tamanikaiwaimaro, APRALO.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

YJ PARK: YJ Park, APRALO Vice Chair.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Tijani Ben Jemaa, Vice Chair of AFRALO.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Fatimata Seye Sylla, Chair of AFRALO.

AZIZ HILALI: Aziz Hilali, Secretariat, AFRALO.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

MATT ASHTIANI: Matt Ashtiani, ICANN staff.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Dev Anand Teelucksingh, ALAC member from LACRALO.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Rinalia Abdul Rahim, ALAC member, APRALO.

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche, APRALO and ALAC member.

---

GARTH BRUEN: Garth Bruen, North American At-Large Regional Chair.

FOUAD RIAZ BAJWA: Fouad Riaz Bajwa, Co-Vice Chair, APRALO.

MAHMOUD LATTOUF: Mahmoud Lattouf from AKMS.

JEAN-JACQUES SUBRENAT: Good morning. Jean-Jacques Subrenat from the ALAC.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Yaovi Atohoun, AFRALO ALAC.

YASHAR HAJIYEV: Yashar Hajiyev, APRALO.

OKSANA PRYKHODKO: Oksana Prykhodko, EURALO.

PAVAN BUDHRANI: Pavan Budhrani, APRALO Secretariat.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you everybody. Now the agenda is posted, basically what we are going to be doing, if you haven't read it already, we are starting with a brief update of some key issues. The first is going to be an individual participation by Wolf, which we have actually started to

---

talk about earlier. We are doing possibly the rules of procedure working group. There have been about 75 versions so we are not going to go through all of those, we might not even go through any of them. The metrics working group is important and Tijani will be talking about that. The next thing is a really interesting way of how to make our RALO teleconferences more interactive, and Wolf will be talking about that, and we have also got contributions from Aziz, possibly Jose, and possibly Sylvia, and then Garth from NARALO will be talking about that. We are going to be talking about outreach and I would like to hear from everybody about how you are outreaching to other ALSes in your area and what's been successful. There will be some brief discussion on Capacity Building from Maureen, thank you, and possibly an update from her on how the sessions have been going with the Fellows so far. If we have time we are going to be just talking about the At-Large Summit planning for 2014, although we are already sort of 15 minutes behind so I am not sure we will get to it. Now one item which is a little bit of a newbie, we have come across a situation where there is an ALS that is down as an APRALO member and they don't exist. We have looked through the rules and we are not sure we have rules on how to get rid of an ALS that no longer exists, it's a matter that I think NARALO has got some thoughts on so if we have got time I would like to say what kind of rules of procedure do we have and should we have, to actually physically get something off on our list that isn't there. So anything else that anybody would like to discuss at this regional leadership meeting, anything else that should be on the agenda that is not, and that is an open question. If not, here we

---

go. Okay, Wolf, do you want to lead off on the topic of individual participation within the RALOs? Thanks.

WOLF LUDWIG:

The connection of participation of individuals at RALOs and the particular case at EURALO is a longstanding story and just to recall, EURALO changed its bylaws almost two years ago in May 2011 to allow a better and systematic involvement of individual members. They have always had over the years, almost from the beginning, some floating individuals who participated in monthly calls and around activities, individuals that even included into EURALO board but the restriction was they had no sort of voting rights and the question how ALS structures, organization and individuals could be balanced was a hot topic over some years and then after discussions with NARALO who has similar constellation allowing participation of individuals, we then modified the bylaws if EURALO by saying if individuals come together and create their own ALS at EURALO then they can fill in an application form to become an ALS for European individuals. Once this ALS will be certified by At-Large, they can be included like all the other At-Large Structures. This was approved by more than two-third of our members, as I said, two years ago. Afterwards, the ball was on the individual's side and unfortunately from their side there was not much follow-up on the issue. We repeatedly invited them but nothing happened. There was always a sort of expectation, a sort of need but no demand, and it came to doing certain formalities, drafting some bylaws etc. for this individual ALS. Finally I did it over the Christmas break, sent it back to them and in the meantime one of the individuals filled in the

---

application form, but to my knowledge it was not yet sent to At-Large staff, so it is a still pending story, I don't know whether it will happen, but that is in my opinion no enthusiasm behind the whole story and if they are not more pushing by themselves I think we from our side should not push it any further. If there is a need, I think we should create possibilities for better involvement, but if it is only on the level of permanent expectations and no initiative behind, just wait and see.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Wolf. A couple of questions are raised by that, number one, does it matter if an individual does not have voting rights, I mean how much business actually hinges on somebody voting or not. And second of all, do you find that individual participation does add, in which case does it matter and I guess that is my question.

WOLF LUDWIG:

Let's say we had some individuals who were very active from the very start and I always understood them saying, there are many ALSes who do not actively participate on the mailing list, who never show up for general assemblies except for face-to-face meetings, why they have automatically a voting right and I being a very active individual I don't have, I show up whenever I can to general assemblies, I contribute actively, I am involved in working groups etc. and I see this sort of injustice felt, that a lot of ALSes perhaps don't care and hyperactive individuals participate, but when it comes to the point of voting on an issue at a general assembly, they can't. And that was the reason why I pushed this whole issue

---

further. It was my initiative to prepare the At-Large steps and modalities for the bylaw modifications etc. to push the whole procedure by online voting through, and then we did it more or less for the individuals but afterwards the majority of the individuals, and we have around seven individuals who could be concerned, who now could create their own ALS electing one representative would afterwards at the next general assembly of EURALO in June in Lisbon, they could have a voting right, one representative among the individuals, but they are not pushing it anymore and therefore I say it is not my job as the Chair to prepare the bed and afterwards just jump in.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you. I think there are some questions raised. I would also like to hear from Garth if you could also talk about how you manage individual membership. Thanks. Fatima?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

I think Wolf partly answered one of my questions, was with the individuals get together and create an ALS and what will be the status of this. So it will be just an informal structure then because it would be registered somewhere I guess, and would accept this kind of structure, so that is one question. The other one was if individuals because the example you gave, Wolf, inspired me that one individual can just fill out the form and send it to ALAC, if that is the case why would there be an ALS, you know, a formal structure ask for accreditation if one individual can have voting rights by just submitting a form and being accepted. I mean if that is the case I

---

don't know why we should push for formal structures to request an accreditation from ALAC, because I would have. Well I just want to understand.

HOLLY RAICHE:

I think if you look at, and this is just a very brief response, if you look at the actual application form, you have to check a website, you have to check membership, I mean what is clear is if you are going to form a group, it actually has to be a group otherwise you can't fill out the application form, you go through a fairly long process. Now I think that still begs the questions that you have asked, but at least from the formal point of view and I think Wolf was going to make this point as well, an individual simply cannot.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

I am sorry I forgot to add in any other business, one issue which is what is the definition of an ALS because right now there is a lot of confusion and the understanding is not the same everywhere. Sala said yesterday that some ALSes are registrars, so I think this is something that we have to sort out. If we don't have time now, we can think about it later but we need to speak about it. My question now to Wolf.

HOLLY RAICHE:

I absolutely think maybe that instead of being at the end of the business is part of this question because if we are talking about what is an ALS and why do we need an ALS as opposed to individual membership, it is all part of the same issue.



---

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

So this question of individual membership was raised since more than one year and I got to our ALSes and proposed to them to think about this question and I was shocked because they did not want to hear about it at all. I think that we need to think about it, but we have to think about it very objectively, trying to find what is the interest of having those individuals and what are the problems that can be the consequence of having individual membership. I think that we cannot have the same thing in all regions. I am sure in Africa it will not work, but we can think about it together and perhaps we can find how it can be acceptable.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Wolf, did you want to reply to that before we go to Yaovi and Garth?

WOLF LUDWIG:

Well, of course. What is an ALS? There is not a 100% precise definition of it. To be frank, I don't name them here, I know ALSes they consist of two to three people. They have perhaps some more family members, there are some more dogs in the backyard, some more cats, whatsoever, but ALS is a very vague definition. There are other ALSes which are much bigger. I know examples from our ALSes and I can tell you I know all the 33 ALSes in Europe more or less by size, what they are doing, what they are not doing, etc. I think this is part of the job of RALO leadership to have more precise idea about what your ALSes are. If you have small ones, I don't know this may also happen in Africa, and then I do not understand why the representatives of ALSes are so strictly against the idea of

---

including individuals, but I think it is up to each region to define. It is not a must and it should never be a must. I think where there is the potential of active individuals, give them a chance to participate and to include them. If this is for any cultural, social, political or whatsoever reasons, not considered as appropriate, simply leave it. It should not be a must. It should be an opportunity, an option where it fits and where it needs to be done and we tried it in Europe, but it must not be for the other RALOs.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you, I think it is really an important issue. I don't think we are going to solve it here, but it is interesting to listen to what the various views are.

ALAN:

I just wanted to comment on what Wolf said, and as you know I am trying to pull the documents together to go along with the rules of procedure, which includes among other things certification of ALSes, so I have read the documents recently. Those of us who were in the ALAC and regional leadership about 6 years ago did an immense amount of work to come to closure on words we could use then. We will need the ALAC and regional leadership will need to look at those again and see if they still make sense. Changing them requires board approval, it's not a trivial exercise, but maybe we do need a rule, like you need 25 members or you don't count or something like that, and in terms of individual members, NARALO has them, it has not been particularly successful in that we don't have very many of them. On the other hand we have never really

---

tried to go out and get them. So some combination of those two makes sense. There is no point in my mind having 150 ALSes if we don't believe there is only 155 people behind them, that's not what we are trying to achieve, so it's a real problem, the ALAC and the regional leadership is going to have to look at it seriously and it will mean some of us will lose ALSes, but I think we will have a stronger organization behind it. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Alan. I think we are not going to solve this but it's really interesting to hear people's point of view. I think offline there is probably a debate and I think Alan is right, the first thing we have to do is start with the words that the board has approved because that's where we have to start.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

I cringe sometimes when we speak about the number of ALSes we have; I think it's not about the numbers, it's about the activity. If we are all active and the number of active ALSes that's a lot better than just the number of ALSes all together. Anything that can reinforce that would be really welcome, I am sure.

YAOVI ATOHOUN:

Yaovi speaking. I just want to be sure that I understand the structure of the individual situation in EURALO. Personally I was also thinking about this issue because it is real that we may have in a region people who are very active, they are users, they are end users, they are internet users and we have seen that At-Large is for

---

end users, and somebody can be in a situation where he cannot maybe join an ALS or structure, so there is another debate to talk about the work later, so my understanding is that these people were given an opportunity to have only one ALS within the region, this clarification I want to have to be sure that I better understand because the point is that they are not going to create many ALSes, send many applications, but individuals within that region are given the opportunity to create one ALS, is it clear? Thank you very much.

GARTH BRUEN:

As I was going to say, the question about how our individual membership works within NARALO and I guess Alan must have felt his ears burning because when he came in the room and then I asked him to sit at the table and I think he answered the wrong question while I was outside. Anyway, the unaffiliated membership is more or less a virtual ALS without being a real ALS, they get one vote regardless of how many individual members there are, and the way that I would like to structure recruitment in organization within my region is to bring people to our home page and ask them first do you already have an organization that could become an ALS? You are not affiliated with anybody? Does one of these organizations that we have in our ALS list interest you? Join them, and then you become represented. Failing that, become an individual member, but you have to promote all of your interests through this one member who is this ALAC person now in Greenburg who will instruct your vote.

---

HOLLY RAICHE:

It's pretty draconian, but thank you very much.

FOUAD RIAZ BAJWA:

Thank you Holly. Fouad Riaz Bajwa from APRALO. I guess the issue of individual membership it comes down to being a sensitive case when we are discussing APRALO. APRALO has a multidimensional, multi-diversity region frankly speaking, and the way the cultures and traditions and the way they affect the internet public policy and laws in those countries is just very different. If you are touching the Middle East, you have countries which have King rules, you have countries which have royal rules, the moment you step into South Asia there is a whole diversification of the way the governments operate, you will just find unlimited openness in one country, and you would find the most draconian laws in the other. And as you go down to the Asia Pacific, you would see very progressive internet policies, and all the way to Australia it's a whole different world, it's light years ahead. Frankly speaking, that diversity is there. When people used to bump into me when we were trying to do outreach, they used to ask this question; I can't be associated to a certain group, that happens with my ALS as well. What the Pakistan ICT policy monitored and now its internet form, we have a problem that our members are public policy makers, legislators, they can't be publicly associated with us because they are in the national assembly, they constitute the parliamentary ICT committee, they are members of political parties, and when you are a member of a political party you can be only one member of a party or one organization to that context. Then you have academicians, as part of their job they can do community service but they cannot be part

---

of an interest group which actually advocates policy, which actually influences policy, and then you need one person who can take up dissent in our part of the world, and when I say dissent I am the person who is placed in the media, I am the person who is sent to the ministry offices in Islamabad, I am the person who picks up the fight for policy improvement; those people will only provide the information to us for that to happen. Now that is a challenge and the challenge as far as the individual is concerned, there are people who don't want to associate themselves with anyone, but they are very few, and how are those few included. The most problem I think came from people who are interested from the Middle East, because over there in some countries you cannot make an NGO without royal patronage. I think our ALS from Bahrain also has a problem and there is a Crown Prince or someone from the royal family on the board of the internet society in Bahrain, so that's a real problem we have to deal with. What my proposal was somewhat on the lines of the affiliated and nonaffiliated idea, I hadn't gone through the NARALO idea then but my proposal, and this I'm talking is from previous meetings from 2010, that say that maybe we can sort of explore individual membership, one. One proposal was without voting rights, you could be in APRALO, you could have someone raise concerns on your behalf but that would not influence any ALSes voting, and they could vote yes or no according to their ALSes consent. The second option was the ALS approach, the virtual ALS approach, that all those people gather around one ALS, virtual ALS, but there is one problem over there; there will be a conflict of interest within the membership of that virtual ALS. How will that be mitigated is a very big challenge.

---

AZIZ HILALI:

I wanted to react after what was said about the ALS who are not active, who are formed by members of families of ALS or maybe people are not working among the members of the ALS. I think the RALO is responsible of that in the region because normally when you receive an application there is a process to evaluate, to assess this application. We have refused an ISOC chapter because we realized they didn't have a website etc, and it was a chapter which was getting formed, so we think that AFRALO had rejected 3 ALSes and ALAC as individual member I know that it is sometimes very difficult to accept the concept of ALAC, it is representative of the user so if we mix all that it is going to become something else, so I think it is better to have in the rule of procedures we need to reject some ALS which are not active or which doesn't represent the community, we have to reject them and an ALS has to represent its community, if not we have to change the ALAC concept.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you very much. This is a very valuable debate. I think Alan is right, we have to go back and look at what the documents are, we have to look at what we are as a group and how diverse we are and how we actually accommodate the needs of representing users fitting in with the structures that are here, but I think this is a debate that is going to far outlast this meeting and in fact we are way overtime, we have got two people to speak, I would ask them both to be really brief, and then we are going to have to move on to Tijani and metrics.

---

**SALANIETA TAMANIKAIWAIMARO:** Just going forward, one of the recommendations I would like or suggestion I would like to put forward to the RALO leadership would be to propose few representatives from various RALOs to be given issue papers that can be done offline to discuss some of the issues that are raised and sort of explore some of the things that should be considered for the purpose of current discussion.

**JEAN-JACQUES SUBRENAT:** Two or three remarks. The first is that we found out since the beginning of this Beijing meeting that ICANN geography becomes further and further away from real geography and the real world. This also has an impact on individual membership because our bylaws and our structures are thus made that we have to go through a number of structure like ALSes. I just want to underline the crucial importance especially from now on, of at least providing the real possibility of individual membership, individual membership with progressive rights perhaps. Right at the beginning maybe you don't want to give them individual voting rights, but let's look towards that. The crucial thing is their participation to begin with. So I have a question; what is to the best of your knowledge today, the number of individuals potentially who would really like to be active and who cannot for the sociological reasons which were given for instance by Fouad, that is very strikingly true, that in some places if you don't have Royal Charter stamped on your forehead there is no way you can be part of anything, so that's the kind of question we have to answer. What are the numbers we are talking about and when we have that answer I would like to suggest that if the numbers are not gigantic, I mean not in hundreds or thousands,



---

then we should allow individual membership in a rather flexible way. And my last remark is, never mind about bylaws and rules, they are made to be changed, be brave enough to come out with a written draft of proposed bylaw change if needed.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Jean-Jacques. I certainly think there is a lot to be explored, we won't answer it now.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much. AFRALO has raised the concern of the accreditation of ALSes and this of course is going to be an ongoing discussion and I wanted to tag on another question in there which is do you believe that you receive enough information in the staff implemented due diligence that is being made? Do you think there should be more? This would be really helpful. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Now we really do have to close the topic off. The next topic is rules of procedure. Can you do this in about 3 seconds Alan, because we really are completely out of time?

ALAN: I can summarize what the current status is. The rules have been approved and they come into effect when a number of other documents are accepted by the ALAC. Those documents need to go to the ALAC and they will go to regional leadership obviously and everyone else at the same time. All three documents are either

---

extractions of current things that already exist, and one of them for instance is ALS criteria which we can't change unilaterally, so it's just putting it into a document. There is the position description which has to have some clean up done because it is out of date, but it will not change subsequently; it should in the long run change substantively, it will not at this pass, and there is something associated with the board director selection and something associated with mailing lists, all four documents need to be approved by the ALAC, I am hoping that will be done within the next month or so, and you will see them as they come on, there is not a lot to discuss because we have generally agreed that we are going to take them with as little change as possible and fix them in later processes, so you will see that coming in the next couple of weeks and hopefully we will get it through in the next couple of months.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Alan. Delightfully short; not Alan, the talk.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Holly. In fact metrics for ALSes for RALOs there is not a working group yet, but we worked a lot about it as more than 100, and we didn't get agreement among all the RALOs about what we could accept was original framework that can be permitted by each RALO. What is the main element of this philosophy? It is how to measure the participation and involvement of the ALSes. You just said, Holly, that in APRALO there is ALSes that don't exist at all, so by this mean if we implement those metrics, we can say this ALS cannot be here because it doesn't fulfill those metrics. So first

---

element is evaluation of the involvement and participation of the ALSes and we need to define the elements of the criteria for involvement and participation. Second element is how will we split those ALSes; we can split them active, less active, standby, those are examples. The third element will be the definition of the threshold for those parameters and this is where each RALO can do its own parameters because it seems that what is really accepted in Africa for example is not accepted at all in Europe. So those parameters can be changed from region to another inside the whole framework and so I will not speak about parameters since they can be changed. And the last element is the treatment of the ALSes according to those metrics. So this is the general philosophy, I will not go further because I think we need to do it online, but the soonest we adopt it the better it is because we will solve our problems, we will know how to say this ALS is dead, how to say this ALS is active or is not active. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Tijani. I think that I have been involved in some of those debates. It's never easy, but it is actually a very important debate to have because it's very hard to point and say you are not pulling your weight if you haven't got the sort of well you haven't done this, this, this, or you have only done this and you haven't done that, so that's a very important debate to be had but I think you're right, it needs to happen online. Now Fouad you wanted to say something? I have to say the line is closed, we have 35 minutes and I would like to get through.

---

FOUAD RIAZ BAJWA:

Thank you Holly. Fouad Bajwa from APRALO, and I will try to be short. Number 1, the issue about the ALS which is dead is not potentially dead. Why I said that the process is sensitive for this whole accreditation activity is that the ALS that we recruit is an organization itself, which is following maybe an international organizations process. We were talking about the Internet Society of Pakistan. The Internet Society of Pakistan existed but it was not fulfilling the mandate that it had charted itself to fulfill under its bylaws. Therefore the internet community, the technical community in Pakistan demanded and requested ISOC to revive ISOC Pakistan and a new strategy be adopted that ISOC Pakistan would be eliminated, finished, and rejuvenated into city-based chapters and ISOC Islamabad is right now under formation with nearly 30 to 35 members and the request will be re-changed, and I think the issue has already been raised with Holly, and they have requested basically that as soon as they get the charter they will put in the formal application for change of reference, so ISOC Pakistan would actually become ISOC Islamabad Pakistan until the council of ISOC chapters in Pakistan is not created. So it's not actually a dead process. The second thing is sensitivity issue. If you leave an accreditation process, if we become the judge of organizations of members, their mandates may not require all of them to look at the registrar accreditation process. All of them would not require to public comment on nearly 100 documents that the ALAC is supposed to put its comments on. Every organization in their own community has their own set of targets and objectives and they might, yes, some of them might coincide, would be of interest to

---

our ALACs laid out charters and so forth, some might not. We cannot apply one formula for all.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

May I say one word? Fouad, sure, nobody will judge anyone, but for At-Large, for ALAC, if you want ALAC to be active, if you want ALAC to have an impact in ICANN you need people who are active and I am really tired to hear this. We are volunteers, nobody can judge us, yes, nobody can judge you, but you don't fulfill the criteria to be in the At-Large, that's all, you are an organization in your country, you are working, you work or you don't work it's your problem, but to give ALAC the necessary force we need people and we need organizations that are active, that are minimum active. Thank you.

WOLF LUDWIG:

Tijani once again, it cannot be said participation at RALO and ALAC can be the only measured criteria for ALS, active or inactive. As I repeatedly said before, if an ALS in Europe is 100% active in its country, in the media and has much more daily relationship with internet users we pretend to represent, then for me it's good. If this ALS has limited capacities to participate regularly at EURALO, but I know they exist and they are active and they are not pretending anything, they are proactive on the ground in the city or in the country or in the regional level in Germany in Switzerland etc., for me this proof of activity is essential and enough and if they respond to calls when we need them for consultations, rotations etc., then I am completely satisfied.

---

HOLLY RAICHE:

Wolf, thank you very much. We have got exactly 30 minutes and a lot on the agenda. So I am going to be particularly brutal here. What the agenda suggests are some pretty important things; initiatives to make RALO teleconferences more important and there are three people listed. There is outreach and in-reach and recruitment of new ALSes. Capacity building activities I think really is worth talking at least a little about that so what I would really like to fit in if we possibly can, is the things that actually will make ALAC and the RALOs more active and more proactive, so could everybody please be brief, but from AFRALO, Aziz, can you talk briefly about making teleconferences more active from your chapter experience, from your ALS experience, from I would say AFRALOs experience. After that by the way we are going to have either Jose and after that we are going to have Garth. This is all going to happen within 20 minutes. And I am going to be brutal.

AZIZ HILALI:

For AFRALO we have monthly teleconferences where about between 10 and 15 people participate regularly, that's people from ALSes. The issue here is how to get the ALSes to be more active and add to the conferences and so that depends on the agenda in general, so from what we have seen when the agenda includes activities that interest ALSes they do show up, such as the capacity building we had proposed at ICANN at AFRALO level after great success of the capacity building session, we organized at Dakar, we propose ICANN to have virtual training sessions, webinars which are being generalized, it has been adopted by all ICANN constituencies. And then when there are announcements that there will be a

---

summit of ALSes everyone seems to be interested, and we also try to get them involved in our working groups as we create them and we have people who don't necessarily belong to AFRALO officials group and they do participate in working groups and they are very active, that's what I wanted to say, and as regards to the other activities we organize at AFRALO, we have also created a Wiki page which works and we have asked all the ALSes to post their activities on this page so that we get to show that because of recommendation of Fadi, because he asked for ALSes activities to be published on the Wiki page and I think Dev's presentation will be transmitted to our ALSes so that they can be more active and further activities to be known throughout ICANN. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

I think that's a really important suggestion that we use the Wiki pages so that all of the ALSes can start to contribute what it is they do as well as to have a monthly report that will encourage us to learn about each other and I think that is terrifically important.

JOSE ARCE:

Hello, good morning to everyone. I will be very brief. Most of the things that are on the agenda has been already discussed in other sessions. LACRALO has been focusing on ways, we had our general assembly in Costa Rica and we had working sessions, we had four working groups. So to sum up, in Costa Rica, since that meeting, LACRALO has created four working groups based on specific working sessions, so we achieved greater participation in that working group. We also had capacity building program proposed by Fatima

---

and Natalia and we had that program during the first half an hour of our monthly teleconferences and we are also having other working group that is working on leveling issues and we are approaching these issues at all levels. Before they become ALSes we are working with the ALSes that are part of the community and we also try to achieve interaction among active and not so active ALSes. We have created many surveys to see the level of them and to see how to approach these issues. These were the main initiatives of our regions and we have outreach for this, and I would like to take 30 seconds to express my point of view, my personal point of view, about these particular sessions. We have been asked and discussing with Silvia. We have a long agenda and little time, so we said this before, or this has been said by other members, it is not good to have these meeting with so big an agenda because the calls of the meetings that leaders have, well we don't have many calls to interact together, at least LACRALO participates in one of these sessions so my proposal would be to be able to have more calls with leaders so that we can come to the meetings with a specific agenda, less items to debate, and not issues that are debated on the calls but practical proposals so that to be applied. So this is Silvia's and my point of view on those working in the region.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you, and I think that is an excellent suggestion. I too sometimes get overwhelmed by an agenda, and we have got 5 minutes to have an in-depth search of a very important issue and we can't do it in 5 minutes so, I understand that.



---

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. Just a point of clarification, traditionally the RALO Secretariats have a call one month prior to the ICANN meeting where they set the agenda, so again this agenda that you see today was developed or agreed to during a cross-RALO Secretariat call. So if you wish to change that please let staff know and we can go ahead and accommodate that.

HOLLY RAICHE: I think what happens when the agenda is set is everybody gets so excited that we can talk about all these wonderful things, forgetting that actually every one of them could take a whole session.

JOSE ARCE: Very briefly, we agree with you. I participated in the previous call and my proposal is to have, I don't know if monthly calls, but at least every three months we the leaders not only one month prior to the meeting, so I propose myself if it is that I continue being the Chair or otherwise I would give feedback to the other candidate in order to propose to have a shorter agenda so that we can come here and discuss practical issues and not the same issues that we have been discussing during previous calls, so because otherwise we are repeating discussions and repeating topics, or else to have more time assigned to these type of sessions. Thank you very much.

HOLLY RAICHE: We have got 20 minutes left, and we have to actually talk about NARALO with Garth. I would like to hear from Maureen on capacity building if possible. We'll have to keep it fairly short.

---

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

I just wanted to support Jose’s motion for there to be calls, maybe not periodic calls, but to deal with specific issues such as the nature of ALSes or the criteria of participation and it can only be solved that way because if we keep repeating the same thing then it is going to be solve nothing.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Tijani.

GARTH BRUEN:

Thank you Chair. This is Garth Bruen, Chair of NARALO. Yes we talk about diversity and we certainly have diversity not only in culture but in view points as far as the way that we approach the internet and internet policy, and unfortunately we only get to celebrate that diversity when we have these remote meetings and I decided that we should be celebrating our individual regional diversity on a regular basis. So what I have started within my region is what I have called the ALS Spotlight. Each month for each teleconference we invite one of our ALSes to give a brief presentation about who they are and what they do and why they are here, and several of them have supplied videos which we can then post on the website and other people can view. This does two things, the first is that it gets everybody to understand what everybody else is doing in a very good way. The second thing that it does is it gets the individual ALSes to talk and it lets them know that they can talk. As somebody who came on to At-Large I did not always know where and when I could speak, and we want to bring these people up and tell them you are here to talk, you are here to let everybody know what you

---

have to say, and this has actually become a very popular item for our calls and it takes away from the sort of stilted policy discussion that usually goes on, and I think that it is a success and it is something that I would love to see everybody adopt.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Does anyone have any questions of Garth, because I think that's a great suggestion? I trust you all know how to use the Wiki because not all of you were here this morning for the very enlightened discussion that we had.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you Holly. Just wishing to take 10 seconds to add that there have been very few of our APRALO ALSes taking part in the discussions here and I just wanted to remind for those who are in the room that they are very welcome to take part as well, I mean of course you are the Chair for this meeting, but in the At-Large meetings and so on they are very welcome to take part and a couple have, but don't feel shy, it's really good to get new input. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Talking about capacity building is a little bit sort of misleading and my involvement has actually been in looking at the ALSes who are coming to this meeting invited by APRALO, and we were looking at raising their awareness of what ICANN was all about, so we were filling in some knowledge gaps, so what I did was I did a survey first of all to explain all the different areas and to find out where the

---

knowledge gaps were, and then I worked with Janis, who I know runs an amazing fellowship program, I mean I have been part of that program twice and I know that that has really helped to raise my understanding of how the system works and I knew that if we could include our ALSes who are new to the system, who needed to get a little bit more understanding so they can actually participate more effectively as ALS members, I am sure we are going to enhance the quality of the input that we get from them. But I think too that following this meeting, they have been involved in the fellowship program and the newcomers program that was introduced for them, planned for them on Sunday, that following this we will do an evaluation and perhaps some sort of review of how we enable them to interact with us on our calls and I think that Garth's suggestion of having the spotlight and enabling them to perhaps give us all as APRALO an opportunity to find out more about what they are doing, and as you say, Wolf, there are people who are working really hard within their localities and I think though that we do have to sort of like realizing that the ALSes are part of the decision making that their contributions within the system itself is really important, so if we can encourage them to maintain what they are doing in their regions and their localities, but at the same time to bring back into the system their contributions towards the requests for contributions that are being asked for. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Does anybody have any questions about capacity building that's gone on that Maureen's been involved in with the newcomer's

---

team. And Maureen is there information that people can access if they didn't participate?

MAUREEN HILYARD:

I think what we can do and I am working with Janis on this, is perhaps to build more information into the Wiki?

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Maureen. And for those who were not here this morning for Dev's marvelous hour-long run-through of how to run the Wiki, how to actually participate, may I suggest that each RALO, but Dev is going to put together something that will explain to people how to use the website so you can participate in the issues, because something I personally asked for months ago to say you have to make it really easy for people starting with just the ICANN Home Page, to find their way into where the policy issues are, what's being said, how to find out further information and then how to participate, and I think that's possible. Dev?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

I think listening to the previous meetings there is a definite need for really to bring some content in terms of the skill sets of how the ALSes can use the Wiki and perhaps other technology tools and this has been an item that the Technology Task Force, which is a standing working group, is attempting to create. So we have got some good ideas in fact coming out of this morning's session and already some persons have approached me to join the Technology Task Force to really help make this happen. So I just want to say

---

that if you have any question please just ask. Any questions are welcome. So you can find me any time and you can also ask staff any questions, but look forward to some announcements very soon.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you Dev. And I would strongly urge people to say to your own individual ALSes this information is available, there will be a video, they can join the task force, but it is an easy way to participate, it is an easy way to find out about what is going in ICANN, it is an easy way to find out the background for issues and then it is an easy way to follow the debates because as some of you may have observed, there have been some pretty hot issues where in fact there has been a lot of exchanges on the Wiki page and it means we encourage your participation. I have managed to give us 10 spare minutes, is everybody happy with that? Do we want to talk about briefly the summit? It's the one item that we really haven't talked about. Is there anything anybody would like to raise, and if not we will talk about the summit?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

Fatimata Seye Sylla, AFRALO. This is a point of information regarding AFRALOs initiative to make the teleconferences more interesting. We have invited our ICANN regional Vice President, Pierre Dandjinou, to participate in our meetings and answer questions and that makes a lot of synergy and a lot of interest among the ALSes to come and participate and ask questions, get answers, get information about the African strategy and all that, so that was one point I wanted to mention.

---

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you. And that could be a suggestion for others. I think we all have content within the various relevant regions whether it's government or whether it's one of the NIC or RIR or whatever, and to actually have presentations on issues might be a way to actually attract people in and to listen.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Just an announcement. Tomorrow at 11 o'clock there will be a meeting of the stakeholder engagement, which is very important, and they invite all the regional leadership to attend it because it is a meeting inside which the strategy of ICANN in terms of outreach will be decided, so please come and contribute.

HOLLY RAICHE: Tijani, do you have a venue?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, it will be in Grand Hall A.

HOLLY RAICHE: So that's 11 o'clock tomorrow morning, Grand Hall A. Thank you all for your time.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: I thought it would be an appropriate time to thank the Chair of this meeting for conducting it so well and in time.

---

AZIZ HILALI: Just an announcement. We are going to have a meeting at 2 pm in this room. It's a joint meeting of African AFRALO and we invite everyone to participate at this meeting.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPT]**