ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project: Final Report

A. Introduction

This Final Report of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project outlines the activities and accomplishments of the ALAC and At-Large in completing this project. Specifically, it highlights the steps made by At-Large Improvements Work Teams and the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce toward the full implementation of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Recommendations.

As illustrated in the table below in Section D, and more fully in the Appendix, the At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Taskforce has completed the implementation of the Recommendations and Action Items. This completion consists of concluding finite activities or allocating responsibility to bodies of the ALAC and At-Large community, including the ALAC Executive Committee, At-Large Working Groups and Regional At-Large Organizations and their individual At-Large Structures, for activities requiring continuing monitoring and oversight.

B. Background of ALAC/At-Large Improvements Project

On 9 June 2009, the Final Report of the ALAC Review Working Group on ALAC Improvements was published, incorporating input from two public comment periods. In its 13 Recommendations, the Final Report identified key areas of needed improvement, focusing on At-Large's organization, effectiveness, participation, and relationship to other ICANN entities.

On 26 June 2009, the ICANN Board resolved to direct ICANN Staff to assist the At-Large community in developing a proposed implementation plan and timeline for the Recommendations in the ALAC Review Final Report (excluding the Recommendation to provide At-Large with voting seats) and to submit these to the Structural Improvements Committee (SIC) for review and Board approval.

At its 19 June 2010 meeting, the SIC acknowledged receipt from Staff and the At-Large community of the implementation plan and timeline, entitled ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Plan, dated 7 June 2010, and resolved to recommend it to the ICANN Board for consideration.

At its 25 June 2010 Meeting, the Board resolved to direct ICANN's President and CEO to provide the Board with a summary of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Plan dated 7 June 2010, for consideration at the next Board meeting, if practicable.

At its 5 August 2010 Meeting, the Board resolved to approve the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Project Plan and directed ICANN's President and CEO to take action according to the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Plan and report back on the progress at the 2010 Annual General Meeting.

On 10 December 2010, during ICANN's 2010 Annual General Meeting, the Chair of the ALAC provided an update on the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Plan in her Chair's Report, prepared in collaboration with Staff.

At its 23 October 2011 Meeting, the SIC acknowledged receipt from Staff of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Project Milestone Report dated 9 October 2011, which provided an update on the

implementation of the Recommendations in the ALAC Review Final Report and transmitted it to the ICANN Board.

During the Board Meeting of October 28, 2011, the Board resolved to acknowledge receipt of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Project Milestone Report and recognized the substantial amount of work done thus far by the ALAC and At-Large community toward implementing the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Recommendations.

At the SIC meeting on 11 March 2012 that took place during the 43rd ICANN Meeting in San Jose, Costa Rica, the SIC reviewed the At-Large Improvements Status Update Report (2 March 2012) and Appendix (2 March 2012). These documents showed the current status of the ALAC/At-Large Recommendations as outlined in the Final Report of the ALAC Review Working Group on ALAC Improvements (9 June 2009) and further defined in the At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Plan (7 June 2010). The Status Update also provided the status of the series of Action Items aimed at implementing each of the Recommendations as developed by the four At-Large Improvements Working Teams between September 2010 and March 2011.

C. Activity of the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce between ICANN's 42nd and 44th Meetings

The At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce was established by the ALAC during the 42nd ICANN Meeting in Dakar. This Taskforce consists of members from each of the five At-Large Regional At-Large Organizations.

Between November 2011 and February 2012 the Taskforce held weekly meetings, in which it systematically reviewed the remaining Recommendations and Action Items for their implementation identified by the At-Large Improvements Work Teams. The Taskforce assigned the remaining Action Items to already-existing At-Large Working Groups and established timelines for their completion.

On 13 March 2012, during the 43rd ICANN Meeting that took place in San Jose, Costa Rica, the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce held a half-day workshop to discuss remaining implementation activities. On 15 March 2012, members of the SIC met with members of the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce to discuss the Status Update Report and the actions necessary for the completion of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Project.

Between April and June 2012, the Taskforce held monthly meetings to implement outstanding Action Items and ensure all Recommendations were concluded. Activities included informing the ALAC Executive Committee, At-Large Working Groups and Regional At-Large Organizations and their individual At-Large Structures of the tasks that they have been asked to implement or monitor. The ALAC ratified the ALAC/At-Large Vision Statement on 24 May 2012.

The ALAC ratified this ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project: Final Report on 8 June 2012. The result can be independently verified under:
https://www.bigpulse.com/pollresults?code=2483MVcimBMsGzMUdUeNBraP

D. ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation: Status of Recommendations

ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation: Status of Recommendations				
Recommendation	**Status (% Completed)**			
	25%	**50%**	**75%**	**100%**
Rec 1: ICANN Bylaws				
Rec 2: Board Member[i]				
Rec 3: ALS-RALO-ALAC Structure				
Rec 4: ALS Education & Engagement[ii]				
Rec 5: Strategic & Operational Plans				
Rec 6: Cost Models				
Rec 7: Communication Tools				
Rec 8: Public Comment Period[iii]	https://community.icann.org/x/DYD7AQ			
Rec 9: Translation Processes[iv]				
Rec 10: Home of Individual Internet Users				
Rec 11: Board Statement Regarding Rec. 10				
Rec 12: Input from Consumer Representatives				
Rec 13: Policy Advice Mechanisms[v]				

---

[i] The Recommendation of the ALAC Review Working Group Final Report was accepted in its entirety by the ICANN Board, with the exception of the Recommendation that there should be two At-Large appointed, voting Board Members. The ALAC and the At-Large Community, while respecting the Board's decision on this matter (see: 22-June-2009 and 27-Aug-2009 ICANN Board Meeting minutes), discussed at length the merits and preferred options of having two Representatives on the ICANN Board. Moreover, the ALAC retains the hope that this will be reviewed in the future.

[ii] Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, and the Director for At-Large.

[iii] The Director for At-Large has consulted with the ICANN Staff responsible for the implementation of the Public Comment Enhancements regarding Recommendation 8 of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project. Following discussion between the Director for At-Large, the ALAC Chair and the Chair of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Taskforce, the ALAC confirmed its understanding that the guidelines for Public Comments recognize flexibility in extending the Public Comment period beyond the minimum requirements. The ALAC may, on a case-by-case basis, request extensions of 5, 10, 15, 21 or 30 days (in exceptional circumstances). Such requests will be made directly to the Staff person responsible for the specific Public Comment period thereby notifying them that the ALAC intends to submit a comment. The ALAC further requests that a Staff response to such requests for an extension to a Public Comment period be granted or denied in an expeditious manner. If the request is denied, the ALAC may use its right to submit advice to the ICANN Board as per the ICANN Bylaws. We note that the ATRT implementation process includes the following relevant text:

16. Public notice and comment processes should provide for both a distinct "Comment" cycle and a "Reply Comment" cycle that allows community respondents to address and rebut arguments raised in opposing parties' comments.

17. As part of implementing recommendations 15 and 16, timelines for public notice and comment should be reviewed and adjusted to provide adequate opportunity for meaningful and timely comment. Comment and Reply Comment periods should be of a fixed duration.

The ALAC and its Improvements Taskforce established that the ALAC Chair, the ALAC Executive Committee and the Director for At-Large will continue to monitor this issue and will provide input to the Senior Director for Participation and Engagement and the Board PPC.

[iv] Allocated to the Executive Committee.

[v] Allocated to the ALAC/At-Large Policy Review Committee standing committee.

Monitoring of On-Going Activities

The monitoring of ALAC/At-Large Implementation Project activities identified as on-going have been transferred to the ALAC, bodies of the ALAC or the At-Large community, or the Director for At-Large. A system similar to the ICANN Affirmation of Commitments Responsibilities Inventory Tracking and Brainstorming Interactive Chart will be developed for this purpose.

At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce Activities and Metrics

The membership of the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce consisted of a globally diverse group of ten At-Large members, two from each of the five At-Large Regional Organizations. Cheryl Langdon-Orr served as the Chair of the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce. Between November 2011 and March 2012, the Taskforce met weekly followed by monthly calls between April and June 2012. As recommended by the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation project, metrics have been prepared for purposes of tracking of member participation in the regular calls of the At-Large Improvements Implementation Taskforce.

Appendix

The Appendix, which forms an integral part of this Final Report, includes tables of each of the 13 Recommendations as outlined in the Final Report of the ALAC Review Working Group on ALAC Improvements (9 June 2009) and further defined in the At-Large Improvements Implementation Project Plan (7 June 2010). The Recommendations are listed individually in the order of the ALAC Review Final Report recommendations.

Each Recommendation table consists of the following information:

- The number of the Recommendation;
- A summary of the Recommendations within the ALAC Review Final Report;
- The Action Items developed by each of the At-Large Improvements Working Team in order to implement that specific Recommendation;
- The status of each Recommendation and Action Item – that is, whether they have been completed are require on-going monitoring by bodies of the ALAC and At-Large;
- Notes that further clarify how the Recommendation or Action Item has been implemented and any on-going action required.

The Appendix has been designed to be primarily wiki-based. However, the tables have also been included in this document.

ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project: Final Report Appendix

Rec.	Sub-Task	Implementation Task	Status	Notes
1.1		**Amend Bylaws Article XI.s2(4)(a) to clarify purposes, as proposed.**	**Complete**	
	1.1(a)	Submit to the Board the following revision to ICANN Bylaws XI.2.4.a, drafted in collaboration with Legal:	Complete	The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) is the primary organizational home within ICANN for individual Internet users. The role of the ALAC shall be to consider and provide advice on the activities of ICANN, insofar as they relate to the interests of the individual Internet users. This includes policies created through ICANN's Supporting Organizations, as well as the many other issues for which community input and advice is appropriate. The ALAC, which plays an important role in ICANN's accountability mechanisms, also coordinates some of ICANN's outreach to individual Internet users. See: ICANN Bylaws VI.2.1.e See: ICANN Public Comment - Proposed Bylaws Amendment to Add Voting Director from the At-Large Community to the ICANN Board of Directors See: ICANN Public Comment - Proposed ICANN Bylaw Revisions Regarding the ALAC
	1.1(b)	Submit to the Board the following revisions to ICANN Bylaws XI.2.4.j, drafted in collaboration with Legal:	Complete	The ALAC is also responsible, working in conjunction with the RALOs, for coordinating the following activities: 1. Making a selection by the At-Large Community to fill Seat 15 on the Board. Notification of the At-Large Community's selection shall be given by the ALAC Chair in writing to the ICANN Secretary, consistent with Article VI, Sections 8(4) and 12(1). 2. Keeping the community of individual Internet users informed about the significant news from ICANN; 3. Distributing (through posting or otherwise) an updated agenda, news about ICANN, and information about items in the ICANN policy-development process; 4. Promoting outreach activities in the community of individual Internet users; 5. Developing and maintaining on-going

					information and education programs, regarding ICANN and its work; 6. Establishing an outreach strategy about ICANN issues in each RALO's Region; 7. Participating in the ICANN policy development processes and providing input and advice that accurately reflects the views of individual Internet users; 8. Making public, and analyzing, ICANN's proposed policies and its decisions and their (potential) regional impact and (potential) effect on individuals in the region; 9. Offering Internet-based mechanisms that enable discussions among members of At-Large structures; and 10. Establishing mechanisms and processes that enable two-way communication between members of At-Large Structures and those involved in ICANN decision-making, so interested individuals can share their views on pending ICANN issues.
1.2		**Review proposed IIC/post-JPA accountability mechanisms to ensure congruence with the noted recommendations.**	**Complete**		**See: ICANN Accountability & Transparency**
1.3		**ALAC engagement in ICANN Structural Improvements Program.**	**Complete**		**See: Review of the At-Large Advisory Committee - Final Report of the ALAC Review Working Group on ALAC Improvements** **The ALAC has a continuing purpose in the ICANN structure. This continuing purpose has four key elements:** • **Providing advice on policy;** • **Providing input into ICANN operations and structure;** • **Part of ICANN's accountability mechanisms;** • **An organizing mechanism for some of ICANN's outreach; and** • **The section of the ICANN Bylaws that deals with the ALAC should be changed to reflect this purpose.**
1.4		**Extend the term of the ALAC Chair to two years.**	**Complete**		**This function will be adopted from June 2012 on, once the Rules of Procedure Review WG has begun.**

	1.4(a)	This review should include consideration of the role, selection process and term length of the ALAC Chair & Vice Chairs.	Complete	As noted above, any change of the term length of the ALAC Chair, as suggest by Recommendation 1.4, would require a change to the ALAC's Rules of Procedures.
2.1		**Identify all the steps required to implement the addition of one voting member appointed from the At-Large Community to the ICANN Board.** **The Recommendation of the ALAC Review Working Group Final Report was accepted in its entirety by the ICANN Board, with the exception of the Recommendation that there should be two At-Large appointed, voting Board Members.**	**Complete**	**See: At-Large Director Candidate 2013 Workspace** **At-Large selected ICANN Board member has been completed as Seat 15 is now occupied by an At-Large selected voting Director. However, the ALAC and its Taskforce have determined that the ALAC ABSdt and the ALAC BCEC will need to reconvene for future appointments on this issue.** **The ALAC and the At-Large Community, while respecting the Board's decision on this matter, discussed at length the merits and preferred options of having two Representatives on the ICANN Board. Moreover, the ALAC retains the hope that this will be reviewed in the future.** **See: Board Meeting - 22 June 2009** **See: Board Meeting - 27 August 2009**
2.2		**Submit the final selection process to the Board via the SIC for approval.**	**Complete**	**See: 2.1 Notes section**
2.3		**Implement or confirm related Bylaw changes.**	**Complete**	**See: 2.1 Notes section**
2.4		**Once approved, begin selection process, in a careful and systematic manner, within the At-Large Community.**	**Complete**	**See: 2.1 Notes section**
2.5		**Endorsement of selection choice by the ALAC.**	**Complete**	**See: 2.1 Notes section**

2.6		Approval of selection choice by ICANN Board and seating of Board member.	Complete	See: 2.1 Notes section
2.7		Consider options regarding the At-Large Liaison to Board vis-à-vis a new Director.	Complete	See: 2.1 Notes section
3.1		Ensure existing structure does not present obstacles to community operation and development.	Complete	
	3.1(a)	Establish a Working Group (WG) to ensure that the At-Large information already available is organized properly and easily accessible by end users.	Complete	Allocated to the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC, the ALAC, and Regional Leadership.
	3.1(b)	Introduce to the ALSes selected information-dissemination, communication and collaboration tools (such as Posterous, Twitter Tweets, mobile-device compatibility) and provide training.	Complete	Allocated to the At-Large Technology Taskforce.
	3.1(c)	Promote further use of the At-Large Calendar to ALSes.	Complete	Allocated to the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC, the ALAC, and Regional Leadership.
	3.1(d)	Create and distribute a brief orientation/ instruction package about information dissemination, communication, & collaboration tools introduced to ALSes.	Complete	See: ICANN's e-learning page. Additionally, the ALS Starter Kit already includes some of this information. Please click one of the links below to download the ALS Starter Kit in one of the six UN Languages. English, Español, Français, Русский, 中文, العربية

4.1		**External Education.**	**Complete**	**Allocated to the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC, the ALAC, Regional Leadership, ALSes, and other relevant parties to ensure that the system is interactive with ICANN wide activities.**
	4.1(a)	Establish the ICANN Academy, an annual training program for new At-Large ALS members, modeled after aspects of the ICANN Fellowship and Diplo Foundation.	Complete	See: At-Large ICANN Academy Expanded Working Group Workspace The intent is to establish a Pilot Program during the ICANN Meeting in Toronto in October 2012.
4.2		**Internal Engagement.**	**Complete**	
	4.2(a)	Establish an engagement program for existing At-Large ALS members, to be conducted year-round and modeled after certain aspects of the Diplo Foundation (specifically, this is the At-Large Capacity Building Program).	Complete	See: LACRALO Capacity Building Budget Request See: AFRALO Dakar Events See: LACRALO San Jose Events Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, and the Director for At-Large. The intent is for this program to start (be funded for) FY2012.
	4.2(b)	Make available Confluence pages for communication with ICANN.	Complete	See: RALO Confluence Pages • AFRALO ALS Confluence pages • APRALO ALS Confluence pages • EURALO ALS Confluence pages • LACRALO ALS confluence pages • NARALO ALS confluence pages
	4.2(c)	Make available to ALSes the use of an Adobe Connect Room.	Complete	See: RALO Adobe Connect Rooms • AFRALO ALS Adobe Connect Room • APRALO ALS Adobe Connect Room • EURALO ALS Adobe Connect Room • LACRALO ALS Adobe Connect Room • NARALO ALS Adobe Connect Room
4.3		**External outreach and recruitment.**	**Complete**	
	4.3(a)	Request that selected At-Large members be funded to attend non-ICANN meetings	Complete	The ALAC made this request in FY11, FY12, and FY13. FY11 and FY12 requests were not accepted; FY13 request is still being evaluated.

		(e.g., the IGF, the Consumer Electronics Show (CES), etc.).		This request is supported by the fact that At-Large should constitute an essential part of ICANN's global outreach process.
	4.3(b)	Request that the ALAC be invited and funded to participate in all outreach programs launched by ICANN.	Complete	In accepting such invitations, the ALAC should be given the option to send At-Large members as representatives who are located within the region of the specific outreach event. This request is supported by the fact that At-Large should constitute an essential part of ICANN's global outreach process.
	4.3(c)	The aim of the At-Large is to have at least one ALS in every country.	Complete	Allocated to the At-Large Outreach Sub-Committee. To accomplish this task, the At-Large will use outreach items such as teleconferences, webinars, promotional materials; and invitations to various meetings and events.
	4.3(d)	Recommend that each RALO start an individual member program.	Complete	Allocated to the Director for At-Large and the RALO Leaders.
	4.3(e)	Continue collaborating with ICANN Communications on Beginner's Guides devoted to topics relevant to At-Large.	Complete and ongoing	See: ICANN's e-learning page

Allocated to the ICANN Communications Department, ALAC Chair, Executive Committee, Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders.

The goal should be to produce one Guide for each ICANN Public Meeting.

In close collaboration with ICANN Communications, At-Large has already co-produced a Beginner's Guide to Domain Names and Beginner's Guide to Internet Protocol (IP) Addresses.

Future Beginner's Guides include "Participating in ICANN" and "CyberSavvy." |
| | 4.3(f) | Recommend to the RALOs that they formalize their outreach/"inreach" role in whatever way each finds appropriate (e.g., by including in their Rules of Procedure). | Complete and ongoing | Allocated to the Director for At-Large and the RALO Leaders. |

4.4		Explore whether additional measures need be taken to involve individual Internet users in At-Large work, where they wish to contribute in their personal capacities.	Complete	**Allocated to the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC, At-Large Rules of Procedure Working Group, Regional Leadership, RALOs, and other relevant parties to ensure that the system is interactive with ICANN wide activities.**
4.5		Internal leadership engagement and development.	Complete and ongoing	
	4.5(a)	Increase significantly the ALAC's creation of "inreach" materials aimed at leadership engagement and development throughout At-Large (including brochures, radio programs, podcasts, webinars, and online videos).	Complete	For purposes of encouraging continued engagement of ALSes, this task has been allocated to the standing committee of the ALAC on Inreach
	4.5(b)	Create job descriptions for ALAC members, liaisons and other At-Large leaders that include qualification requirements, responsibilities and objective criteria for performance evaluation.	Complete	Allocated to the At-Large Rules of Procedure Working Group and the At-Large Metrics Working Group.
	4.5(c)	Create and implement a transparent sanctions process for nonperformance of ALAC, RALO, and ALS members.	Complete and ongoing	Allocated to the At-Large Rules of Procedure Working Group and the At-Large Metrics Working Group.
	4.5(d)	In collaboration with ICANN's Nominating Committee (NomCom), create a	Complete	Allocated to the At-Large Rules of Procedure Working Group.

		process for the midterm replacement, both of NomCom appointments to the ALAC and of ALAC appointments to the NomCom.		
5.1		**Identify barriers within ALAC processes used to contribute to strategic planning and propose follow-up.**	**Complete**	Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders.
	5.1(a)	Ratify the strategic planning process reflected in the flowchart titled "Figure C-1: Proposed At-Large Strategic Planning Process."	Complete	See: At-Large Policy Development Page See: Figure C-1
	5.1(b)	Review and amend the ALAC's strategic planning process yearly, in line with annual amendments to ICANN's overall Strategic Plan.	Complete	See: At-Large Policy Development Page See: ICANN Strategic and Operating Plan Process
	5.1(c)	Conduct periodic "SWOT" (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) analyses of the At-Large strategic planning process, in conjunction with the RALOs and compare the results of these analyses to identify areas that have improved or deteriorated.	Complete	Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders. See: At-Large Work Team C SWOT Analysis 1-3 Workspace

	5.1(d)	Articulate the ALAC's and At-Large's vision and mission.	Complete	See: ALAC/At-Large Vision Statement See: ALAC vote results endorsing the At-Large Visions Statement as Proposed by the At-Large Improvements Taskforce.
	5.1(e)	Use appropriate metrics to ensure that the ALSes are diverse, effective and well informed.	Complete	See: ALAC Metrics Sub-Committee Allocated to the Metrics Sub-Committee and the ALAC as a whole. • The Global Diversity of At-Large ALSes is clearly shown through this map: http://www.atlarge.icann.org/maps/ • RALO ALSes: AFRALO ALSes, APRALO ALSes, EURALO ALSes, LACRALO ALSes NARALO ALSes • RALO Brochures: AFRALO Brochure, APRALO Brochure, EURALO Brochure, LACRALO Brochure, NARALO Brochure
	5.1(f)	Initiate, develop and maintain an institutional knowledge management and retention system for At-Large.	Complete and ongoing	Allocated to Policy Staff in support of the ALAC and At-Large Members as past and present Members of the ALAC and At-Large Community and will be required to integrate with required future ICANN wide systems.
	5.1(g)	Encourage the five RALOs to coordinate their outreach and "inreach" policies in order to facilitate the search for new skill sets needed within At-Large.	Complete and ongoing	Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders.
	5.1(h)	Continue actively pursuing At-Large growth, for ICANN's overall benefit.	Complete and ongoing	Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders.
	5.1(i)	When requesting ALAC outreach project funding, the ALAC emphasizes their role not only as a strategic resource benefiting the ALAC and RALOs but also as part of a wider	Complete	Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders.

		ICANN legitimacy process.		
	5.1(j)	Continue to encourage ICANN to prioritize & increase funding for outreach.	Complete and ongoing	Allocated to the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders.
5.2		**Identify barriers within ALAC processes used to contribute to operational planning and propose follow-up.**	**Complete**	
	5.2(a)	Ratify the operational and financial planning process reflected in the flowchart titled "Figure C-3: Proposed At-Large Operational and Financial Planning Process."	Complete	The ALAC has determined that, for this action item to be effective, it must be performed on a recurring schedule. The item has been completed previously in February 2012. Each January, the ALAC and Policy Staff in support of the ALAC have will consider when it should be next repeated by the At-Large community. See: Figure C-3
	5.2(b)	Acknowledge and encourage a continuation of the better collaboration between the ALAC and ICANN's Finance Staff seen in preparing the FY2012 Budget.	Complete	This proposal is in addition to the fact that most At-Large operational planning is done by Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.
	5.2(c)	Conduct periodic "SWOT" (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) analyses of the At-Large operational and financial planning process, in conjunction with the RALOs (as WT C did), and compare the results of these	Complete	See: At-Large Improvement WT C SWOT Analysis In the first SWOT analysis conducted by WT C, the main barriers to operational and financial planning were identified as the ALAC's being slow to react; translation processes being slow, and translations not being available for all documents; the ALAC members' potential conflicts of interest; a lack of travel funding, putting At-Large in a second-class tier; and not enough informational materials for the ALSes.

		analyses to identify areas that have improved or deteriorated.		
	5.2(d)	Formalize the process by which the ALAC collects operational demands from the RALOs and includes them in its operational plans.	Complete	See: At-Large Policy Development Page
	5.2(e)	Clearly estimate and document the time required for the ALAC's operational processes (e.g., responding to a call for Public Comments) and use these estimates to formalize its operational processes.	Complete	The Director for At-Large has consulted with the ICANN Staff responsible for the implementation of the Public Comment Enhancements regarding Recommendation 8 of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project. Following discussion between the Director for At-Large, the ALAC Chair and the Chair of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Taskforce, the ALAC confirmed its understanding that the guidelines for Public Comments recognize flexibility in extending the Public Comment period beyond the minimum requirements. The ALAC may, on a case-by-case basis, request extensions of 5, 10, 15, 21 or 30 days (in exceptional circumstances). Such requests will be made directly to the Staff person responsible for the specific Public Comment period thereby notifying them that the ALAC intends to submit a comment. The ALAC further requests that a Staff response to such requests for an extension to a Public Comment period be granted or denied in an expeditious manner. If the request is denied, the ALAC may use its right to submit advice to the ICANN Board as per the ICANN Bylaws.

We note that the ATRT implementation process includes the following relevant text:

16. Public notice and comment processes should provide for both a distinct "Comment" cycle and a "Reply Comment" cycle that allows community respondents to address and rebut arguments raised in opposing parties' comments.

17. As part of implementing recommendations 15 and 16, timelines for public notice and comment |

				should be reviewed and adjusted to provide adequate opportunity for meaningful and timely comment. Comment and Reply Comment periods should be of a fixed duration. The ALAC and its Improvements Taskforce established that the ALAC Chair, the ALAC Executive Committee and the Director for At-Large will continue to monitor this issue and will provide input to the Senior Director for Participation and Engagement and the Board PPC.
	5.2(f)	Continue requesting face-to-face funded general assemblies (GAs) for each RALO every three years and an At-Large Summit.	Complete	See: At-Large Event Roadmap The Events Roadmap has been submitted to ICANN Finance for their review.
	5.2(g)	Continue to assist the RALOs in completing their annual ICANN requests for funding, as needed, in terms of writing, packaging and advocacy.	Complete	The item has been completed previously in February 2012. Each January, the ALAC and Policy Staff in support of the ALAC have will consider when it should be next repeated by the At-Large community.
5.3		**Review ongoing Policy Staff in support of the ALAC levels and budget allocations and increase support as provided throughout this project, consistent with the recommendations in Final Report.**	**Complete**	**Allocated to the ALAC Chair and the Director for At-Large.**
	5.3(a)	Continue to monitor its level of needed Policy Staff in support of the ALAC and ICANN's commitment to and progress in filling open positions.	Complete	As of September 2011, all allotted positions for Policy Staff in support of the ALAC had been filled.

	5.3(b)	The ALAC and Policy Staff in support of the ALAC should develop an annual support agreement	Withdrawn	This task is no longer relevant due to the following changes within ICANN in recent years (i.e., since submission of the ALAC Review Final Report). An increase in Policy Staff in support of the ALAC (as of September 2011, all allotted positions for Policy Staff in support of the ALAC had been filled.
6.1		**Review of additional At-Large information that would be useful, subsequent to improvements in financial reporting.**	**Complete**	See: ALAC Subcommittee on Finance and Budget
	6.1(a)	Encourage the same high level of input into ICANN's annual financial planning from ALSes & RALOs.	Complete	
	6.1(b)	Continue to encourage ICANN to increase its level of detailed disclosure regarding the process of financing the ALAC and At-Large.	Complete	Allocated to the ALAC Finance and Budget Sub-Committees Working Group.
	6.1(c)	Continue to assist the RALOs in completing their annual ICANN requests for funding (writing, advocacy, & packaging)	Complete	The item has been completed previously in February 2012. Each January, the ALAC and Policy Staff in support of the ALAC have will consider when it should be next repeated by the At-Large community.
6.2		**Regarding meeting accommodations, ensure that At-Large representatives are given treatment equal to that of other funded communities.**	**Complete and ongoing**	
	6.2(a)	Continue to monitor the accommodations given to At-Large members at Meetings to ensure	Complete and ongoing	Allocated to the Executive Committee.

		they are equal to those of others.		
7.1		**Review of communication and collaboration needs considered unmet by ALSes and RALOs globally.**	**Complete**	**Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.**
	7.1(a)	Introduce to the ALSes selected information-dissemination, communication and collaboration tools (such as Posterous, Twitter Twibes, mobile-device compatibility) and provide training.	Complete	See: At-Large Technology Taskforce Tools Workspace
	7.1(b)	Conduct a survey of ALSes regarding communication & collaboration tools.	Complete	See: At-Large Structure 2010 Survey Workspace
7.2		**Review of technologies used by At-Large and across ICANN that could fill all or some of the 7.1 needs of the ALSes and RALOs.**	**Complete**	**Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.**
	7.2(a)	Establish a Technology Task Force (TTF) of community members that will periodically review the appropriateness of available technology, train RALOs/ALSes in new technologies, and possibly staff a help desk.	Complete	Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.
7.3		**Review of available technologies not already used by At-Large or**	**Complete**	**Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.**

		elsewhere in ICANN that could fill the 7.1 needs of the ALSes and RALOs.		
7.4		Create and conduct implementation plan for training ICANN's IT Support in the 7.3 technologies (and, as needed, in keeping IT Support current in 7.2 technologies).	Complete	Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.
7.5		Based on At-Large's choice of the communication and collaboration tools to best fill its needs, make needed recommendations for use, or not, of these tools across ICANN.	Complete	Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.
7.6		Create and conduct implementation plan for the periodic identification of technologies, either newly introduced to the market or updated, that can better fill the 7.1 needs of the ALSes and RALOs than those technologies currently being used.	Complete	Allocated to the Technology Taskforce, its continuous progress will be supervised by the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC.
8.1		Develop an ALAC process for requesting extended consultation window.	Complete	The Director for At-Large has consulted with the ICANN Staff responsible for the implementation of the Public Comment Enhancements regarding Recommendation 8 of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Implementation Project. Following discussion between the Director for At-Large, the ALAC Chair and the Chair of the ALAC/At-Large Improvements Taskforce, the ALAC confirmed its understanding that the guidelines for Public Comments recognize flexibility in extending the

				Public Comment period beyond the minimum requirements. The ALAC may, on a case-by-case basis, request extensions of 5, 10, 15, 21 or 30 days (in exceptional circumstances). Such requests will be made directly to the Staff person responsible for the specific Public Comment period thereby notifying them that the ALAC intends to submit a comment. The ALAC further requests that a Staff response to such requests for an extension to a Public Comment period be granted or denied in an expeditious manner. If the request is denied, the ALAC may use its right to submit advice to the ICANN Board as per the ICANN Bylaws. We note that the ATRT implementation process includes the following relevant text: *16. Public notice and comment processes should provide for both a distinct "Comment" cycle and a "Reply Comment" cycle that allows community respondents to address and rebut arguments raised in opposing parties' comments.* *17. As part of implementing recommendations 15 and 16, timelines for public notice and comment should be reviewed and adjusted to provide adequate opportunity for meaningful and timely comment. Comment and Reply Comment periods should be of a fixed duration.* The ALAC and its Improvements Taskforce established that the ALAC Chair, the ALAC Executive Committee and the Director for At-Large will continue to monitor this issue and will provide input to the Senior Director for Participation and Engagement and the Board PPC.
	8.1(a)	Ratify the process reflected in the flowchart titled "Figure D-1: How the ALAC Should Request an Extension to a Public Comment Period."	Complete	See: Figure D-1

	8.1(b)	Request that extensions to Public Comment periods be allowed of any length up to 30 additional days (see "A" on Figure D-1).	Complete	See: Figure D-1 See: 8.1(a) Notes Section
8.2		**Develop ICANN Staff and Board process for implementing extension requests.**	**Superseded**	
	8.2(a)	Request that any extension to a Public Comment period be granted or denied within an expeditious manner (see "B" on Figure D-1).	Superseded	See: Figure D-1
8.3		**Review of Public Comment processes.**	**Complete**	
	8.3(a)	Recommend the establishment of a Policy Scheduling Team (PST), consisting of ICANN Staff, to coordinate the opening of Public Comment periods.	Complete	The ALAC will be reviewing its policy scheduling policy to include a Standing Committee as opposed to a PSC. The PST should: •Be comprised of an ICANN Staff member assigned to each SO/AC and the Language Services Manager; and •Maintain a publicly available Policy Comment Schedule (PCS), which tracks upcoming Public Comment periods, in order to (a) avoid many such periods opening around the same time, (b) allow the ACs and SOs to better plan their time and (c) allow better planning for needed translations. (For each upcoming Public Comment period, the PCS should Include the policy name, a synopsis, the responsible AC or SO, and tentative opening date.)
	8.3(b)	Establish a standing committee, the ALAC/At-Large Policy Review Committee (PRC), responsible for advising the ALAC of actions needed	Complete	See: Figure D-2 The ALAC will be reviewing its scheduling policy to include a Standing Committee as opposed to a PSC. The specific responsibilities of the PRC should include advising the ALAC as early as possible of: • ALAC comments needed in response to upcoming

<table>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td>regarding upcoming PCs policy issues, as well as policy issues not on the PCs but of At-Large interest.</td><td></td><td>Policy Comment periods;

• At-Large community briefings, documentation or translations needed for upcoming Policy Comment periods;

• The degree of interest that the RALOs and ALSes have in the ALAC's submitting comments during Policy Comment periods;

• Issues and other concerns relevant to end users that are *not* on the PCs but that RALOs and ALSes are interested in bringing to ICANN's attention.

In order to perform its function, the PRC should be comprised of:

• The Chair and Secretariat of each RALO;

• At least two more members from each RALO;

• The ALAC Rapporteur; and

• The ALAC Liaisons to the various ACs, SOs and cross-constituency WGs.</td></tr>
<tr><td>**8.4**</td><td></td><td>**Review measures to make policy development activities across ICANN's communities more accessible. Propose measures for community review.**</td><td>**Complete**</td><td>**See: 8.1 Notes section**</td></tr>
<tr><td>**9.1**</td><td></td><td>**Interim measures (near term).**</td><td>**Watching Brief**</td><td>**This task is no longer relevant due to improvements in ICANN's translation services since the ALAC Review Final Report and the imminent release of ICANN's new Language Services Policy. Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.**</td></tr>
<tr><td></td><td>9.1(a)</td><td>Build into At-Large's consideration of ICANN policy issues (open Policy Forums) more and earlier translation of relevant materials.</td><td>Watching Brief</td><td>This task is no longer relevant due to improvements in ICANN's translation services since the ALAC Review Final Report and the imminent release of ICANN's new Language Services Policy.

Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.</td></tr>
</table>

9.2		Adoption of a Translation Policy.	Watching Brief	See: **ALAC Statement on the DRAFT - ICANN Language Services Policy and Procedures** See: **At-Large Policy Development Page** **Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.**
	9.2(a)	Review ICANN's new Language Services Policy (once available) and request that Policy Staff in support of the ALAC do the same, focusing on At-Large needs, particularly related to ICANN policy issues.	Watching Brief	See: 9.2 Notes section
9.3		**Implementation of Translation Policy (by Public Participation Committee).**	Watching Brief	See: 9.2 Notes section
10.1		**The ALAC is the primary ICANN home for the voice and concerns of the individual Internet user.**	Complete	See: ICANN Public Comment - Proposed ICANN Bylaw Revisions Regarding the ALAC The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) is the primary organizational home within ICANN for individual Internet users. The role of the ALAC shall be to consider and provide advice on the activities of ICANN, insofar as they relate to the interests of the individual Internet users. This includes policies created through ICANN's Supporting Organizations, as well as the many other issues for which community input and advice is appropriate. The ALAC, which plays an important role in ICANN's accountability mechanisms, also coordinates some of ICANN's outreach to individual Internet users.
	10.1(a)	Submit to the Board the following revision to ICANN Bylaws XI.2.4.a, drafted in collaboration with ICANN Legal.	Complete	See: 10.1 Notes section

11.1		**Statement from the ICANN Board that clearly recognizes At-Large as primary ICANN home of individual Internet users and clarifies relationship between the ALAC and GNSO's User Home.**	**Complete**	The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) is the primary organizational home within ICANN for individual Internet users. The role of the ALAC shall be to consider and provide advice on the activities of ICANN, insofar as they relate to the interests of the individual Internet users. This includes policies created through ICANN's Supporting Organizations, as well as the many other issues for which community input and advice is appropriate. The ALAC, which plays an important role in ICANN's accountability mechanisms, also coordinates some of ICANN's outreach to individual Internet users. See: ICANN Public Comment - Proposed ICANN Bylaw Revisions Regarding the ALAC
	11.1(a)	Submit to the Board the following revision to ICANN Bylaws XI.2.4.a, drafted in collaboration with Legal:		See: 11.1 Notes section
	11.1(b)	Submit to the Board the following revision to ICANN Bylaws XI.2.4.j, drafted in collaboration with Legal:	Complete	See: ICANN Public Comment - Proposed ICANN Bylaw Revisions Regarding the ALAC See: 1.1(b) Notes section
12.1		**At-Large outreach to consumer representatives.**	**Complete**	See: At-Large Consumer Document 2012 Workspace which includes a copy of the document entitled "ICANN and the At-Large Community: Join us to Help Protect Consumers on the Internet". Allocated to the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC, ALAC, Regional Leadership, ALSes, and other relevant parties to ensure that the system is able to cope with the changing landscape of the consumer issues
	12.1(a)	Create and maintain a consumer outreach document for use by At-Large in its outreach efforts aimed at getting consumer organizations involved in ICANN.	Complete	See: At-Large Consumer Document 2012 Workspace See: WT D's proposed consumer recruitment document, Defending Consumers on the Internet.

12.2		**GNSO outreach to consumer representatives.**	Watching Brief / Ongoing Interaction with other ICANN Processes	**Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.**
13.1		**Review the ALAC's/At-Large's Policy Advice Development processes and propose measures to reduce barriers.**	**Complete**	
	13.1(a)	Ratify the process reflected in the flowchart titled "Figure D-1: How the ALAC Should Request an Extension to a Public Comment Period" by which the ALAC could request that a Public Comment (PC) period be extended.	Complete	See: ICANN Public Participation Committee See: Figure D-1 Establish a standing committee, the ALAC/At-Large Policy Review Committee (PRC), responsible for advising the ALAC of actions needed regarding upcoming PCS policy issues, as well as policy issues not on the PCS but of At-Large interest. The working of the PCS is depicted in the flowchart titled "ALAC/At-Large Complete
	13.1(b)	Request that extensions to Public Comment periods be allowed of any length up to 30 additional days (see "A" on Figure D-1).	Superseded	This sub-task was superseded as it subject to change in ICANN's Public Participation Committee. See: Figure D-1
	13.1(c)	Request that any extension request to a Public Comment period be granted or denied within 24 hours (see "B" on Figure D-1).	Superseded	This sub-task was superseded as it subject to change in ICANN's Public Participation Committee. See: Figure D-1
	13.1(d)	Recommend the establishment of a Policy Scheduling Team (PST), consisting of ICANN Staff, to coordinate	Complete	The Policy Staff provide one another with weekly updates on the policy updates of the ACs/SOs that they each support. The PST should: • Be comprised of an ICANN Staff member

		the opening of Public Comment periods.		assigned to each SO/AC and the Language Services Manager; and • Maintain a publicly available Policy Comment Schedule (PCS), which tracks upcoming Public Comment periods, in order to (a) avoid many such periods opening around the same time, (b) allow the ACs and SOs to better plan their time and (c) allow better planning for needed translations. (For each upcoming Public Comment period, the PCS should Include the policy name, a synopsis, the responsible AC or SO, and tentative opening date.)
	13.1(e)	Establish a standing committee, to be known as the ALAC/At-Large Policy Review Committee (PRC), which will be responsible for advising the ALAC of any and all actions needed regarding upcoming PCs policy issues, as well as policy issues not on the PCS but of At-Large interest.	Complete	See: At-Large Meeting with ASO See: Figure D-2 The working of the PCS is depicted in the flowchart titled "ALAC/At-Large Policy Review Committee (PRC)" (see Figure D-2). The specific responsibilities of the PRC should include advising the ALAC as early as possible of: • ALAC comments needed in response to upcoming Policy Comment periods; • At-Large community briefings, documentation or translations needed for upcoming Policy Comment periods; • The degree of interest that the RALOs and ALSes have in the ALAC's submitting comments during Policy Comment periods; and • Policy issues (and other concerns) relevant to end users that are *not* on the PCS but that the RALOs and ALSes are interested in bringing to ICANN's attention. In order to perform its function, the PRC should be comprised of: • The Chair and Secretariat of each RALO; • At least two additional representatives from each RALO; • The ALAC Rapporteur; and The ALAC Liaisons to the various ACs, SOs and cross-constituency WGs.
	13.1(f)	Ratify the process reflected in the flowchart titled "ALAC/At-Large	Complete	See: Figure D-3 See: Figure D-4 See: Figure D-5

		Policy Advice Development (PAD) Process" (shown in Figures D-3, D-4 and D-5), by which the ALAC could systematically respond to Public Comment periods.		This flowchart represents a comprehensive, flexible, systematic process that would replace the At-Large Policy Advice Development process currently in use. If the final comment is ratified, the ALAC requests the Policy Staff in support of the ALAC, to transmit the comment to the ICANN Staff person responsible for the Public Comment period.
13.2		**Strengthen policy-development processes within the SOs and ACs for requesting and considering the ALAC's input.**	**Superseded / Watching Brief**	• **As part of the GNSO's review and revision of its Policy Development Process (PDP) during the last year, it now regularly requests and considers the ALAC's input;** • **The standing ALAC Liaison to the ccNSO and the ccNSO liaison to the ALAC now ensure that the ALAC's input is regularly sought and considered in the ccNSO's PDP; and** • **The ASO PDP, via the RIRs, is already open to public input.** **Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.**
	13.2(a)	Review current processes in each of the ACs/SOs.	Superseded /Watching Brief	Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.
	13.2(b)	Develop recommendations to make relevant changes for community consideration.	Superseded / Watching Brief	Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee**.**
13.3		**Processes between SOs, ACs and the Board need to be developed/ strengthened to provide feedback on how the ALAC's advice has been considered and used.**	**Superseded / Watching Brief**	**This Recommendation is no longer relevant as:** • **A strengthening of AC/SO communication, including a mailing list and regular AC/SO call.** • **The actions of ICANN** • **Growth in Cross-Community Working Groups such as the DSSA** • **This task is already specifically addressed by Recommendation 7 of the Final Recommendations of the Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT).**
13.4		**Ensure the GNSO PDP incorporates measures which guarantee ALAC**	**Superseded / Watching Brief**	• **As part of the GNSO's review and revision of its Policy Development Process (PDP) during the last year, it now regularly requests and considers the ALAC's input.**

		input is requested, included, and considered integral to the process.		Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee.
13.5		Ensure the ccNSO PDP incorporates measures which guarantee ALAC input is requested, included, and considered integral to the process.	Superseded / Watching Brief	The standing ALAC Liaison to the ccNSO and the ccNSO liaison to the ALAC now ensure that the ALAC's input is regularly sought and considered in the ccNSO's PDP

Responsibility for this watching brief has been allocated to the Executive Committee. |
| 13.6 | | Ensure the ASO PDP incorporates measures which guarantee ALAC input is requested, included, and considered integral to the process. | Complete | The ALAC and its Improvements Taskforce established that the ongoing responsibility for this task will be disseminated amongst the ALAC Chair, the Executive Committee, the Director for At-Large, and RALO leaders. |