

# Pilot Holistic Review Revised Draft Terms of Reference



Public Comment: Pilot Holistic Review Revised Draft Terms of Reference  
5 October 2023

# Holistic Review Public Comment #2 - Revised Draft ToR

The Public Comment proceeding on revised Draft Terms of Reference will be open from **28 September - November 27, 2023** - see [Public Comment page](#).

## What We Need Your Input On:

- Considering the potential implications on the ICANN structures and work, the Board is seeking input on whether the revised Draft ToR seems fit for purpose, and whether it sufficiently addresses the issues identified in the first Public Comment proceeding

## Guiding Questions:

- Do you support the Pilot Holistic Review Revised Terms of Reference as drafted?
- Does the Pilot Holistic Review Revised Terms of Reference sufficiently address the four primary issues identified in the first Public Comment proceeding?
- Does the Pilot Holistic Review Revised Terms of Reference sufficiently clarify the deliverables for the Pilot Holistic Review?
- Do you support the next steps for the Pilot Holistic Review (as noted on the following slide)?

# Revisions to the ToR

---

In response to community input provided during the first Public Comment on the Pilot Holistic Review ToR, the OEC reconvened the ToR Development Team to revise the document.

**Primary focus of revisions:** Address community questions and issues raised during the first Public Comment.

- Clarity of Holistic Review Scope
- Lack of independent examination
- Lack of identified dependencies
- Community's ability to support the pilot's work

## Revision of ToR structure

- More direct language and simpler, shorter ToR document
- Clarified deliverables

A full account of the ToR Development Team's process and reasoning was provided during its [21 August webinar](#).

# Pilot Holistic Review Next Steps

These steps are envisioned to guide the process from the Public Comment on the Revised Draft ToR to the initiation of the Call for Volunteers for the Pilot Holistic Review.

**Note:** the outlined next steps are contingent on the substance of the public comments and Board consideration thereof.

**1) The ICANN Board considers whether there is sufficient community support for the revised Draft ToR.**

- If there is not sufficient community support, the Board will determine a way forward.
- If the Board determines there is sufficient community support for the revised Draft ToR, the Board will proceed with the initiation of the Pilot Holistic Review.

**2) The Call for Volunteers will be published in line with the Operating Standards for Specific Reviews.**

**3) ICANN org will begin preparations for the start of the Pilot Holistic Review, currently targeted for FY25.**

# Resources

---

Pilot Holistic Review ToR Team working space on community wiki:  
<https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project>

ATRT3 Final Report (May 2020): <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/atrt3-report-29may20-en.pdf>

ICANN Board Resolution (November 2020):  
<https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2020-11-30-en>

CANN Board Action Scorecard (November 2020):  
<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/resolutions-atrt3-final-recs-board-action-scorecard-30nov20-en.pdf>

Letter from OEC Chair Avri Doria to ATRT3 Shepherds regarding the development of Terms of Reference (TOR) for the Pilot Holistic Review (February 2022):  
<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/doria-to-shepherds-02feb22-en.pdf>

Pilot Holistic Review ToR Draft (July 2022):  
<https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project?preview=/192220170/206143952/FINAL%20-%20Draft%20Terms%20of%20Reference%20for%20Pilot%20Holistic%20Review.pdf>

Letter from ICANN Board Chair to Chairs of Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees:  
<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/sinha-to-blumberg-et-al-03oct22-en.pdf>

Webinar wikispace:  
<https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Pilot+Holistic+Review+-+Revised+Draft+Terms+of+Reference+Webinar+-+21+August+2023>

# Resources

---

Pilot Holistic Review Draft ToR Public Comment proceeding (August 2022):

<https://www.icann.org/en/public-comment/proceeding/pilot-holistic-review-draft-terms-of-reference-30-08-2022>

Pilot Holistic Review Revised ToR Draft (July 2023):

[https://community.icann.org/display/atrr/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project?preview=/192220170/250710081/PHR\\_27JUL2023\\_Revised%20Draft%20ToR%20v.3.pdf](https://community.icann.org/display/atrr/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project?preview=/192220170/250710081/PHR_27JUL2023_Revised%20Draft%20ToR%20v.3.pdf)

ICANN Bylaws - See Section 4.6 for Specific Reviews: <https://www.icann.org/resouces/pages/governance/bylaws-en/#article4>

# Thank You



One World, One Internet

Visit us at [icann.org](https://icann.org)



[@icann](https://twitter.com/icann)



[facebook.com/icannorg](https://facebook.com/icannorg)



[youtube.com/icannnews](https://youtube.com/icannnews)



[flickr.com/icann](https://flickr.com/icann)



[linkedin/company/icann](https://linkedin/company/icann)



[soundcloud/icann](https://soundcloud/icann)



[instagram.com/icannorg](https://instagram.com/icannorg)