

---

ICANN76 | CF – ccNSO Council  
Thursday, March 16, 2023 – 13:15 to 14:30 CUN

SUSIE JOHNSON: Can you hear me, Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: Yes, we do, Susie. Very well. Thank you. We can even see your picture.

SUSIE JOHNSON: Better than live.

BART BOSWINKEL: No, come on.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Check. Check one. Check, check. Channel two, channel two. Channel three, channel three. Room audio check. One, two. Check, check. One, two.

KIM CARLSON: Susie, would you like to test your audio? Can you read the script that's on the screen?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hi, everyone. This is Claudia. I just want to say hi before we begin.

---

**Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.**

---

KIM CARLSON: Claudia, thanks. Sean, do you see the script on the screen? Can you read that for an audio check, please?

SEAN COPELAND: Hello. My name is Sean Copeland and I'm participating during the session in a speaking role. I am? I am testing my audio and my speaking pace to confirm whether all the language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you.

KIM CARLSON: All good. Thanks, Sean. Alejandra, would you like to test your audio for us, please?

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Sorry, Kim. Here I am. Hello. My name is Alejandra Reynoso and I am participating during the session in a speaking role. I'm testing my audio and my speaking pace to confirm whether all language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you.

SUSIE JOHNSON: Hello, interpreters. This is Susie and I'm testing my audio to see if you can hear me. Hello, and welcome to the ccNSO Council Public Meeting. My name is Susie, and along with Kim and Claudia, we are the remote participation managers for this session.

KIM CARLSON: Susie, we haven't started yet.

---

SUSIE JOHNSON: No, I was asked to test my audio.

KIM CARLSON: Can you read the script on the screen?

SUSIE JOHNSON: Oh, that script.

KIM CARLSON: Thank you.

SUSIE JOHNSON: I cannot see the screen. Okay. One moment, please. Hello. My name is Susie and I am participating during this session in a speaking role. I am testing my audio and my speaking pace to confirm whether all language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you. Kim, did that work?

KIM CARLSON: All good. Thank you.

SUSIE JOHNSON: Cool. Thanks

JORDAN CARTER: Hello. My name is Jordan Carter and I'm participating during this session in a speaking role. I'm testing my audio and my speaking pace

---

to confirm whether all language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you.

No, but at least it's less Australian than Bruce.

KIM CARLSON: All good. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Hello. This is an audio check from the Spanish booth into the English channel. Can you hear me, Oliver?

LILIAN: Hey, this is Lillian again checking the English channel. Is it okay, Oliver? Great.

SILVIA: Finally, this is Silvia from the Spanish booth testing the English channel. Can you hear me, Oliver? Thank you. We'll go back into Spanish.

KIM CARLSON: Biyi, can you see the script on the screen? Can you test your audio for us please? Do you have a mic up there?

BIYI OLADIPO: I need to put on my glasses to see it. Okay. So it says hello, my name is Biyi Oladipo. I am participating during this session in a speaking role.

---

I'm testing my audio and my speaking pace to confirm whether all language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you.

KIM CARLSON: Very good. Thank you. And Stephen, once you're settled, could you test your audio for us as well, please?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Testing. Hello. My name is Stephen and I'm participating during the session in a speaking role. I'm testing my audio and my speaking pace to confirm whether all language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you.

KIM CARLSON: Stephen, can you get a little closer to the mic?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Directed at me?

KIM CARLSON: Correct.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Yeah. Is this any better? Do you want me to run through it again?

KIM CARLSON: One moment, please. Keep talking.

---

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Okay. I have to think of things to say that are witty. That's usually very difficult.

KIM CARLSON: Go ahead and just read the script one more time.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Hello. My name is Stephen and I am participating during this session in a speaking role. I am testing my audio and my speaking pace to confirm whether all language service providers are able to hear me clearly. Thank you.

KIM CARLSON: Good. If you could slow it down just a little, please.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I'll do my best.

KIM CARLSON: Thank you.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: And don't hesitate to yell at me.

BART BOSWINKEL: Kim, can we start the meeting? It's quarter past.

---

SUSIE JOHNSON:

This session will now begin. Please start the recording.

Hello, and welcome to the ccNSO Council Public Meeting. My name is Susie, and along with Kim and Claudia, we are the remote participation managers for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior.

During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will only be read aloud if you put in the proper form. As I've noted in the chat, I will read questions and comments aloud during the time set by the chair or moderator of this session.

Interpretation for this session will include English, Spanish, French, and Arabic. Click on the interpretation icon in Zoom and select the language you will listen to during the session. If you wish to speak, please raise your hand in the Zoom Room. And once the session facilitator calls upon your name, kindly unmute your microphone and take the floor. Before speaking, ensure you have selected the language you will speak from the interpretation menu. Please state your name for the record and the language you will speak if speaking a language other than English. When speaking, be sure to mute all other devices and notifications. Please speak clearly and at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation.

This session includes automated real-time transcription. Please note this transcript is not official or authoritative. To view the real-time transcription, click on the closed caption button in the Zoom toolbar.

---

To ensure transparency of participation in ICANN’s multistakeholder model, we ask that you sign in to Zoom sessions using your full name, for example, a first name and last name or surname. You may be removed from the session if you do not sign in using your full name. With that, I will hand the floor over to Alejandra Reynoso, chair of the ccNSO Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you very much, Susie. Hi, everyone. Welcome to the ccNSO Council Meeting 193 on the 16<sup>th</sup> of March 2023 at 18:15 UTC. Thank you. May I ask Kim if we’re a quorum?

KIM CARLSON: Can I defer that question to Bart, please?

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Sure. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: It looks like a quorum.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Okay. Thank you very much. So we have a very interesting agenda today. We will have chair and vice-chair elections. We will go through the roles and responsibilities for the councilors. We have milestone regarding ccPDP3 and Review Mechanism and the role of ccNSO with Universal Acceptance, plus any things that we gather through the ICANN meeting. Finally, I will ask all the councilors to please sign in



---

into Zoom Room. And while doing so please remember to put ccNSO Council or something similar to your Zoom ID so we can see you for the voting.

With that, I'm moving to item number two, that's the relevant correspondence. So there is the submission of the ccPDP3 Final Report Review Mechanism to Council. And there's the invitation for the chair of the GAC to provide input. This is required under the policy development process. And just so everyone knows, according to the Bylaws, the ICANN Board will also have to ask the GAC for opinion or advice after they receive the policy.

Moving along to item three, minutes and actions. All action items have been completed. And are there any questions or comments from councilors? I don't see any hands up.

So moving along to item number four. We have some intermeeting decisions since our last meeting in February. Those are the appointment of additional members to the IGLC, Beth Njao and David McAuley. Thank you so much for volunteering to this working group.

Moving along, we now go to updates and Q&A. So most of these updates are written updates or were taken during the ICANN meeting, but still we will go through them through the agenda.

So item five is update on the ECA, CSC, and CSC Review Team. And for this, the review team has completed its work. We as Council should be expecting a final report shortly. Please, may ask the secretariat to put an item on the agenda for discussion and adoption on the next Council call, please.

---

With that, let's move on to the updates of the working groups. Is there anything that anyone thinks we should know from these working groups right now? If not, we take them from the meeting. Yes?

ALI HADJI: Okay. Thank you, Alejandra.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Move closer to the mic, please.

ALI HADJI: Okay. Thank you, Alejandra. I just wanted to say about the TLD Ops meeting, a small meeting, met on Sunday, March 12. They told about the grant plan and started to develop a go forward strategy, including recruiting to more understanding. But that I will say today that our TLD Ops wide action about this because it's needed to replace Abibu who has left off his ccTLD. We needed to add someone else from Asian region to make sure that all actions will drive well. Okay. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Yes, Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: Do you want a general call for volunteers? Or do you want to look yourself to find a candidate? What is the preferred way forward for the TLD Ops? Because it's very focused, I would say.

---

ALI HADJI: Now we identified someone, volunteers, for example, from Cote d'Ivoire. I think we have another one from the Asian region. But I think the chair of this group will send an e-mail just to know how we can plan well.

BART BOSWINKEL: Would it be possible that for the April meeting, you come up with suggested candidates? So we put in on the agenda for the April meeting to appoint new members to the TLD Ops? Or is that too early? You prefer the May meeting?

ALI HADJI: I think that we can do. I adjusted to the chair of this group. I invited him to be contacted with secretariat to know how we can set up this well.

BART BOSWINKEL: May be noted as an action item that the secretariat reaches out to Jacques, the chair and vice-chairs for the preferred method for finding candidates. And that as soon as with clarity, we inform Council, and then we take it forward whenever needed. So the next time the Council afterwards will see with new candidates. Something like this. Okay. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Thank you very much, Ali and Bart. With this, I'm moving on with item number seven, it's updates from IDN ccPD4. We are taking that from the presentation during ICANN76. The update from

---

the liaisons in item eight, also written updates. I just want to make a note that there is a reference to item 13 in the agenda but that dragged a bit from last agenda. So this reference is incorrect. So just for the record. Yes, Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL:

One comment relating the update from the GNSO liaison. One of the action items that you may have seen is the call for volunteers. We were supposed to do this before the ICANN meeting, it will now happen after the ICANN meeting. Replacement for Maarten.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thank you, Bart. Item nine, it's an update of the ccNSO website redesign, but we will defer this for the next meeting for the sake of time.

And then we move to item 10. It's update from chair, vice-chairs, councilors, regional organizations, and secretariat. Here we have an invitation to participate in the trend exercise together with the SOPC. This will come our way soon around April. This invitation is also not only for councilors but the full SOPC. So it will be a combined session and it's a very interesting one. So when we get the exact date, please mark it in your calendars to attend that session.

Now we're moving to the next item, and this is the chair and vice-chair elections. So for this, let me explain the procedure first, and then we can move through it. As you recall from past elections, we elect the chair first. For this step, a councilor needs to nominate a candidate and another councilor needs to second that nomination. Afterwards,

---

the nominated candidate needs to accept the nomination. There can be more than one nomination. And after the conclusion of the nominations, we will go for a vote by the councilors. If there's only one candidate, then the vote is public. And if we have more than one candidate, then we vote by a secret ballot.

The vice-chair elections will follow the same procedure with one exception and it's that the vice-chairs need to be from a different region than the chair and from among themselves. So for the chair election, I will hand over to Jordan to run this part. At the conclusion of the chair election, he will hand back over to me to run the vice-chair elections. Jordan, are you ready?

JORDAN CARTER: Yes, I am. Thank you, Alejandra. Good afternoon, everyone. Alejandra set up the procedure. So I'd like to call for nominations for the role of the ccNSO Council chair. Do we have a nomination? I see Sean Copeland's hand. Sean?

SEAN COPELAND: I would like to nominate Alejandra to continue as chair.

JORDAN CARTER: Thank you. Is there a seconder for Alejandra?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I'll second.

---

JORDAN CARTER: Stephen Deerhake. Alejandra, you get to choose whether to accept this nomination or not. Will you accept?

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: I do accept. Thank you.

JORDAN CARTER: Thank you. So we have one qualified candidate. Are there any other nominations? It's very hard to see the whole table but I think the answer is no. We will need to do this vote. We will have a vote now in the Zoom Room. So, councilors, please get your Zooms ready. Please, if you are in favor of the election of Alejandra Reynoso to the ccNSO Council chair—no, we're not doing the resolution. This is the actual voting on the decision. Yeah. Please raise your hands or green ticks. Please put your hands up. Only councilors vote, please. Thank you.

Have you got a count, Bart? My Zoom says it's hot. Okay. Please lower your hands, everyone, once we're done. Is there anyone who is not in favor of the selection? If you're not in favor now, please raise your hand in the Zoom Room. I saw his hand up before. Yes. Thank you. None there. And if there's anyone who is abstaining, please put your hand up. No hands up.

Okay. So that is a declaration that the councilors elected you I think pretty much unanimously to the role of chair, so congratulations, Alejandra. Just before we had the back, we'll do the formalities. We'll do the decision resolution, which I think will be on the screen. But I'll start to say it anyhow.

---

In accordance with the procedure to elect its chairs and vice-chairs as included in the guideline ccNSO Roles and Responsibilities adopted on February 26, 2018, Alejandra Reynoso was duly nominated and seconded as chair of the ccNSO and accepted her nomination. And the ccNSO Council elects Alejandra Reynoso to serve as its chair starting at the end of the Council meeting of ICANN76 until the end of ICANN79. The secretariat is requested to inform the ICANN secretary accordingly and post an announcement on the ccNSO website.

That's the draft resolution. I need a mover for that. Tatiana. Then I need a seconder. Stephen? Stephen's hand was up first. So is there any discussion or questions about that resolution? There appear to be none. So I will move it. This time we'll use the ticks and the crosses in the Zoom Room. But we might just do it using our hands and applauding. All those in favor, please applaud. Thank you. I think that concludes the formalities. That is passed. The decision is made. Alejandra, I hand the chair back to you. Congratulations.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thank you. Thank you very much for Jordan. And thank you, everyone, for trusting me with this again. I'm very happy to continue. Now we need to elect our vice-chairs. So I was thinking if there are no objections, if we can do both positions at once, as in here in the nominations and secondments for both positions, and then move forward. What do you think about that? Does that work? Yes, Ai Chin?

AI CHIN LU:

I think I would like to nominate Jordan Carter as the vice-chair.

---

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Very well. Does he have a secondment?

JAVIER RUA-JOVET: We'll second.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Sorry, it's very complicated to hear everyone in this big long table. So we have a nomination and a secondment for Jordan. Jordan, do you accept your nomination?

JORDAN CARTER: Yes, I'll accept. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. We need at least one more nomination. Do we have more nominations? Yes, Ali?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I'd like to nominate Biyi.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Stephen is nominating Biyi. We need as a seconder.

ALI HADJI: I will second nomination for Biyi.



---

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you, Ali. So you're seconding Biyi's nomination. Biyi, do you accept your nomination?

BIYI OLADIPO: Yes, I do. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Well, thank you very much. Do we have any more nominations? I don't see any more nominations. Okay. So with this, I would like to go through the formal step already.

So may ask for a mover for the two resolutions. So I see Sean, and I'm going to look the other way for this seconder. Tatiana is seconding. Thank you very much.

So the resolution, it's for both. In accordance with the procedure to select its chair and vice-chairs, as include in the Guideline ccNSO Roles and Responsibilities adopted on 26 February 2018, one will say Biyi Oladipo was duly nominated and the other will say Jordan Carter is duly nominated and seconded and accepted his nomination. It is noted that the chair and vice-chairs are all residing in different ICANN regions. The ccNSO Council elects them to serve as vice-chairs starting at the end of the Council meeting of ICANN76 until the end of ICANN79. The secretariat is requested to inform the ICANN secretary accordingly and post an announcement on the ccNSO website.

Now we will need to vote on these decisions. Are there any questions or comments first? Seeing none, so please use your green ticks in case you're in favor, or red crosses in case you object or abstain.

---

BART BOSWINKEL: No red ticks.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Okay. Thank you very much. Congratulations to both of you. Let me lower my green tick and everyone else please because we will use them later.

Okay. Now, moving along for the roles and responsibilities of councilors. As you remember, we agreed to start the process of developing as a succession planning. Last Sunday, we agreed in the workshop that, at a minimum, this process should review all existing roles of councilors and ccNSO appointees to other communities. We reviewed to understand the roles, understand if they're needed currently or in the future. So we also need to look at the capabilities required per role and then start identifying potential future candidates for roles critical to the ccNSO. During the workshop, we started to review some of the current roles of councilors and concluded this needed additional work. From this perspective, it does not make sense to assign roles right now for the upcoming year, but to continue the current assignments and to defer them to ICANN77, to the next ICANN meeting.

Are there any questions or comments regarding this topic? I will look for the Zoom hands for this thing. I think it would be easier. I don't see any hands up. So we have a draft resolution here. May have a mover? Jenifer moves. A seconder? Ali seconds. I know it's hard for me to see

---

the whole table. So if you use Zoom, I think it would be easier. Thank you.

So I'll read the decision. The ccNSO Council decides to maintain the 2022 scheme of assigned roles and responsibilities until the formal Council meeting during ICANN77. The ccNSO Council requests its chair to take on the responsibility to oversee the membership application process until a new councilor is assigned to that role. The ccNSO Council requests its chair, Irina Danelia, Sean Copeland, Biyi Oladipo, and Chris Disspain to continue the review of the current roles and responsibilities in key areas for the ccNSO and present their findings during a Council session during ICANN77.

Any questions with respect to the resolution? I don't see any hands up. So let's vote using Zoom Room again. Use your green ticks if you're in favor, or your red crosses in case you object or abstain. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: Only green ticks, no reds. But you better ask them to be safe.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Okay. Just for good measure, is anyone objecting or abstaining?

BART BOSWINKEL: No response. Okay. Thank you very much. So this has passed.

We move along to item 13. This is the updates and adoption of ccNSO internal procedures we heard from the governance session. We have an update there for the SOI. There's no role for the Council yet, but I

---

would like to ask Sean or anybody else if you think there's something else that we should be aware of from this part.

SEAN COPELAND: From my perspective, Alejandra, no. I think we're good.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Okay. Thank you very much, Sean. So, let's move on. We have item 14, it's the update Charters, Terms of Reference. For this particular Council call, we don't have any Charter or Terms of Reference to approve.

So we'll move on to item 15. It's appointments to working groups and committees. As we can see here, there will be a call for Expression of Interest for membership of the second IANA Function Review Team in April. We as Council will be expected to select three members from the ccTLD community, which can be members and non-members of the ccNSO. If you remember in the past, having this particular issue of finding a non-member was an issue but it's no longer anymore. This requirement is not needed. But we do need to reach out to the whole community, whether they're members or not of the ccNSO. So this will come our way. Are there any questions or comments regarding this topic? Okay. No, I see none.

So now we will move to some appointments that we have. Okay. Sorry, I got lost in my document. So here we have a list of appointments for various ccNSO committees and working groups that we will take in one vote. Are there any questions or comments on this topic? Yes, Tatiana?

---

TATIANA TROPINA: I'm very sorry. I wanted to ask if it's too late to add my name to the GRC appointment together with Pablo. Thank you.

BART BOSWINKEL: Do it online as well, whatever you want. More important is that you are subscribed. We failed in doing this.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: I would say it's never too late. That can always happen.

BART BOSWINKEL: If you want, I can add the name because I'm editing right now.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: I'm fine with that. Are we all okay with that? I don't see objections. Yes. So it will be added. Olga, I see your hand up.

OLGA CAVALLI: Thank you, Alejandra. It's just a comment I have requested a while ago to be part of the DASC. I have not received e-mails, and if I could be added to the e-mail list. I already talked to Bart but maybe this is the moment to remind that I expressed interest. I think it was approved in an online meeting. Thank you.

BART BOSWINKEL: It's an admin matter.

---

OLGA CAVALLI: Thank you so much.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Noted. Thank you. With that, may I have a mover? I have Jordan from this side as a mover. And seconder, I see Pablo on that other side.

So with that, we have a resolution. The ccNSO Council appoint the following persons. For the DASC, Marianne Georgelin; for the IGLC, Tamara Zylbersztejn, Sabrina Wilkinson, and Pablo Rodriguez; for the GRC, Pablo Rodriguez and Tatiana Tropina. The secretariat is requested to inform the respective chairs and appointees accordingly and take all steps necessary to subscribe the new members to the working groups.

Any questions or comments with the resolution? I see none. So let's go to the vote. So please use your green ticks if you're in favor, or red crosses if you abstain or object. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: Green ticks.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: All green ticks. Just for good measure, is there anyone abstaining or objecting? I see none. So this has passed. Thank you very much.

Next item. It's item 16. Council Deliberations and decision on recommended policy for a review mechanism (ccPDP3). So with this, well, we have a very extensive resolution in front of us. This whole

---

process started in 2010 with the Delegation and Redelelegation Working Group. This working group report several gaps and issues were identified in the IANA policies and practices with respect to ccTLDs and a need to address them. If you think about this, it is the reason why the ccNSO was created in the first place 20 years ago. The first areas among others were issues with respect to RFC 1591 and related documents. These and other issues with the RFC 1591 and other documents were addressed in the framework of interpretation which was adopted in February 2015.

Another area that was identified by this working group at the time was the lack of a ccTLD retirement policy and potentially the need for a review mechanism. As you all know, in 2014 the discussions around the IANA Stewardship Transition started and became the main focal point of the ccNSO and others as a result of the transition specifically Work Stream 1 of the Accountability group. The independent review procedure was restructured. However, the ccTLD community made the choice to exclude all disputes and claims with respect to delegation and re-delegation of ccTLDs form of this process, with a commitment to develop later, an alternative review mechanism acceptable for the ccTLD community. Only after the transition was successfully completed, the ccNSO could refocus its attention on the main policies with respect to ccTLDs. So in 2017, the Council launched the ccPDP3 which resulted first in retirement policy. This policy was adopted by the ccNSO in 2021 and by the Board in September 2022. We are now at a point to finalize the policy to introduce a review mechanism for specific disputes relating to ccTLDs. If this policy gets adopted by the ccNSO on the Board, we will have come full circle and

---

all the issues identified by the Delegation and Redefinition Working Group will have been addressed. So this is quite a milestone.

So with this, may I ask Stephen or others, if you would like to speak on this topic or you have any comments or questions?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE:

Thank you, Alejandra. It's been a long time coming with regards to the review mechanism. It actually has been 39 years since Postel specified in RFC 1591 a review board for IANA decisions. So we're finally there assuming the Council approves today, and the community approves it, and the Board approves it.

I just want to thank the working group members. We met over 60 times on the review mechanism alone, probably something close to that on the retirement. I also want to thank our incredible staff for all their work. Kimberly, Joke, Bart, and Bernard are able scribe. I hope to get hope to get your vote today. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thank you very much, Stephen. Anyone else would like to comment? If not, we do have a draft resolution. May I ask for it to be displayed in the separate document in the agenda? Thank you very much.

For this, may I have a mover? I see many hands. Irina? Thank you. May I have a seconder from this other side of the table? Nick? Thank you very much.

I will go to the decision. The ccNSO Council adopts the Recommended Policy as contained in the Final Report of the ccPDP3 Review



---

Mechanism Working Group section 2-6 and section 9 and as submitted to the chair of the ccNSO Council on 03 March 2023. The adopted recommendations shall be conveyed to the members of the ccNSO as the Council Recommendation to vote upon. The ccNSO Council Recommendation addresses the issues pertaining to the introduction of a Review Mechanism as identified in February 2017 as adopted by the ccNSO Council in March 2017. The issue manager is requested to compile the Members Report taking this resolution into account. In accordance with the adopted timeline, the members vote on the Council Recommendation will start on Tuesday 18 April 2023 at 00:01 UTC and end 09 May 2023 at 23:59 UTC.

The ccNSO Council appoints Joke Braeken as voting process manager, and requests her to take all steps necessary to organize the members vote and report on the result of the ccNSO members vote to Council at its May 2023 meeting. The ccNSO Council wholeheartedly thanks the members and other participants of the Review Mechanism Working Group for their hard work and prolonged effort to and propose the review mechanism and conclude the ccPDP3 policy endeavor. In particular, the Council thanks the chair and vice-chair of the working group Stephen Deerhake and Eberhard Lisse and Bernard Turcotte, Kimberly Carlson, and Joke Braeken—and I would like to add Bart Boswinkel—for their unwavering support and hard work. The secretariat is requested to inform the working group membership and broader community.

Any questions or comments with respect to the resolution? Yes, Bart?

---

**BART BOSWINKEL:** Two comments. One is why I am not included yet, and the second is why the working group has not closed. I start with the second one. This is the first step. And the working group—we hope it may not happen—but there might be a situation where there will be a request for a supplemental recommendation by the Board. It would be unwise, in my opinion, that’s why it’s not included in the proposed resolution to close the working group and we started again. So that’s why it’s not closed. Related is my role. I’m the issue manager. I still have to do this and keep on doing this. So in that sense, it’s not done yet. So that’s why I’m not included. I will not include myself. Thanks.

**ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:** Okay. But still, thank you very much for all your work. Thank you, Bart. As you all know, it’s a big step and we need to have a special voting this time. We do need to have at least 14 votes in favor from the Council to pass this. So the way we will do it is that I will call you individually. And when I call your name, please unmute your microphone and say whether you’re in favor, object, or abstain. I will start with Ali.

**ALI HADJI:** In favor.

**ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:** Thank you, Ali. For the rest, please speak closer to the mic. Biyi?

**BIYI OLADIPO:** In favor.

---

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Do we have Souleymane remotely?

BART BOSWINKEL: Souleymane is online. Souleymane, if you're able, please speak up if you're in favor or not in favor of the PDP. If you can't unmute, please check your green tick or type in chat.

May I suggest that we revisit Souleymane later on? I'll take note of it.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you, Bart. Let's move on. Ai Chin?

AI CHIN LU: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you, Ai Chin. Do we have JianKang remotely?

BART BOSWINKEL: I don't see JianKang.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Okay. I'll move then. Jordan?

JORDAN CARTER: In favor.

---

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Do we have Chris online?

CHRIS DISSPAIN: Yes, you do.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: And your vote is?

CHRIS DISSPAIN: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you very much, Chris. Irina?

IRINA DANIELIA: I'm in favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Nick?

NICK WENBAN SMITH: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Pablo?

PABLO RODRIGUEZ: In favor.

---

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Sean?

SEAN COPELAND: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Stephen?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Javier?

JAVIER RUA-JOVET: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Olga?

OLGA CAVALLI: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Tatiana?

---

TATIANA TROPINA: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Demi?

DEMI GETSCHKO: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Jenifer?

JENIFER LOPEZ: In favor.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: I will go back to Souleymane to see if he's online.

BART BOSWINKEL: Souleymane, if you hear us, can you open your microphone and say if you're in favor or not? Or check a green tick. Or red tick if you're not in favor. I don't see anything. Go ahead, Souleymane.

SOULEYMANE OUMTANAGA: Hello, everyone. I absolutely agree with this resolution, and I do approve it. Thank you very much. I'm in favor.

BART BOSWINKEL: Thank you, Souleymane.

---

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. My vote is in favor as well. So with this, we have passed this resolution. May I ask for a big applause for such a great work?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Thank you all.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you very much.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. Well, with this, we need to move on to the next item. So we go to item 17. That it's the adoption of the roadmap of the ccNSO and Universal Acceptance and next steps.

As you know, various stakeholders requested the ccNSO Council to initiate the discussion on the role of the ccNSO in Universal Acceptance. We started the discussion on the potential role with the community in Kuala Lumpur. And there were two workshops. We had a discussion on the topic during our last call in April. Yesterday the Ad Hoc group presented the results to the broader community, and there are some observations that I would like to share with you. One of them is that it appears to be a general community support for the proposed activities and willingness to participate at various levels. Also, there were relatively a lot of participants who we normally do not see. So it's something to take into consideration. Also, during this session, people were asking if they could become members as IDN ccTLD. So this is something that we should strive to communicate a little bit further. Do

---

any of the rest of the members of the Ad Hoc group have any additional comments like Biyi, Ai Chin, if you wish?

BIYI OLADIPO:

The only comment I just want to add to it is the fact that there have been quite a number of people who followed the proceedings and the work of the Ad Hoc group, and I have a couple of people who have asked me that if we are creating a committee that I should actually put their names in and they were willing to work with the committee to achieve the roadmap. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thank you, Biyi. Let's keep those names at hand when we go forward with the next steps. Are there any questions or comments regarding this topic? Yes, Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL:

May I advise the Council, if you go to the decision—can you scroll down? Scroll up a little bit. As you can see, something went wrong in the transition from Word documents to Google Docs and vice versa, and it's only one line. That we take a decision on this specific topic online, because what is lacking is that the ad hoc will be asked to define the Terms of Reference for the committee. That's a critical step going forward. And then present this to the Council either the April/May meeting because that will enable the Council, etc., and the community to launch a call for volunteers, etc. So the critical step of drafting the Terms of Reference for the committee is lacking from the



---

resolution. So may I suggest that you take the decision on this specific topic of online following this meeting? Thanks.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Do we agree on this? Any objections? Okay. Let's do an online decision then. Thank you, Bart.

With that, it's time to move on to the next item. It's the start of the 360-degree review of councilors. So as you will recall, we recently adopted this 360-degree feedback process. And in a few months, the Council election process starts again in August/September-ish. The NomCom cycle is underway as well. So to initiate the cycle of reviews, it is proposed to start with the peer review of the NomCom appointee whose term ends at the AGM, and the councilors whose term ends in March of 2024. This initial review will kick off the process.

Do we have any questions or comments regarding this topic? Okay. I see none. We do have a draft resolution. May I have a mover? Jordan, thank you. May have a seconder? Irina, thank you.

So the decision is in accordance with the Guideline ccNSO Council 360-degree feedback process, the ccNSO Council launches the process of the 360-degree feedback for each of the following ccNSO councilors elected by the ccNSO members: Ali Hadji Mmadi, JianKang Yao, Irina Danelia, Jenifer Lopez, and Sean Copeland. The ccNSO Council will also launch the process for the feedback for Javier Rua-Jovet. The ccNSO Council appoints Bart Boswinkel as feedback process manager. The chair of the Council and feedback process manager are requested to take all necessary steps in accordance with the aforementioned

---

Guideline, with the goal that the councilors subject to the review will be debriefed by the end of ICANN77.

Are there any questions or comments with respect to the resolution? Okay. I see none. So it's time to vote. So please use your Zoom tools. Green ticks in favor and red crosses if you abstain or object. Bart, do we have any red crosses or just green ticks?

**BART BOSWINKEL:** No red ticks, only green. And your name will be correctly spelled, Irina. For whatever reason, I consistently have an issue with it.

**ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:** Just for good measure, may ask if anyone is abstaining or objecting?

**SEAN COPELAND:** I'm just abstaining because I'm in the motion.

**ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:** Okay. For the record, Sean is abstaining. With this, this has passed. Thank you very much.

Okay. So we are in item 19, ICANN76. Do we have anything from the assigned people to assist to certain sessions during ICANN76? Is there anything that the Council should be aware of right now of the discussions during ICANN76? Please, Jordan?

---

JORDAN CARTER:

Thanks, Alejandra. I just want to relate out of the whole or plenary on the WSIS+20 review. There's something that all ccTLDs can do in response to that upcoming UN process, which is to make sure it's on the agenda nationally in your Internet communities, whether it's with government or with events like the national regional IGF. It sounds like a bit of an obscure process, but it's happening and it could affect the underpinnings of the multistakeholder Internet governance model. So I'd really encourage people to get involved in the IGLC if they want to talk with other ccNSO members about it. The government engagement people at ICANN published a little short paper, only four pages on it on their website. During the week, you can take a look at their notes from the plenary session, but it's something to be conscious of. And if it's just a label, do a little bit more digging. I would encourage you all to learn a bit more about it.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thank you, Jordan. Anybody else? Okay. I don't see any more hands up. So let's move on. Item 20, Any Other Businesses. Anyone have any other business? Okay, seeing none. Please note that next item is next Council meeting. So we have our meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup> of April at 18:00 UTC.

With that, I will go to the second to last item in our agenda, that is the thank you and welcome. This is one of my favorite parts because we get to say our gratitude to all the community. Thank you to NIC Mexico, to both Ernestos, [inaudible], Alejandra, Mario, all the Mexico team for such a wonderful ccNSO cocktail to kick off the ccNSO 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary celebrations. We felt a warm welcome to the Latin

---

American and the Caribbean region and to the beautiful country that is Mexico. So thank you.

Thank you to Souleymane Oumtanaga for your contributions as ccNSO councilor from the African region. Thank you, Souleymane.

With this, I want to welcome Molehe Wesi elected by the African region to the Council. Molehe will take his seat at the end of this meeting. He is joining us right here. So thank you.

Thank you to the Meetings Programs Committee, the Internet Governance Liaison Committee, the Tech Working Group, the PDP working groups, the Universal Acceptance Roadmap Ad Hoc Committee, and the DNS Abuse Standing Committee for organizing the sessions at ICANN76.

Of course, thank you to the secretariat for your incredible efforts and support before and during this meeting. Without you, nothing of this would be possible.

Two more to go. Thank you to the interpreters for your hard work and for allowing more participants to engage in the ccNSO activities.

And finally, thank you all for participating either in person or remotely. Without your voluntary activity, this will not happen at all. So thank you so much. This meeting is adjourned. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**