

**AFRALO General Assembly – Mexico City ICANN At-Large Summit  
(Held March 3, 2009)**

**Notes**

This meeting was conducted almost entirely in French. Therefore, the following English transcript is mostly a record of the English interpretation service offered during the meeting. Because of this, all words attributed to a speaker – except when marked as [English] – are not the speaker's own words, but rather are translations as spoken by an interpreter.

Also, because we could only faintly hear the individual voices of the meeting participants in the background of the recording, it was often not possible to identify the individual who is speaking with certainty. Because of this, it should be understood that the attribution of words to any specific meeting participant is usually based on context, and therefore is at times rather speculative and/or uncertain.

**Legend**

Name: First name of member of group

Name?: If we think we might know who's speaking but are relatively unsure.

Male: Unsure of who's speaking, but know it's a male.

Female: Unsure of who's speaking, but know it's a female.

Unknown: Unsure of who's speaking, and unsure even of whether it's a male or female.

[English] We will put “[English]” directly after the speaker identification and before the transcribed speech when the identified speaker's words are their own, and not a translation from French provided by the interpreter.

Name: [French 00:29:52 - 0:31:06] We will identify a foreign language in square brackets with a time code for the beginning and end, so that you can quickly identify those passages.

Interpreter: When the interpreter makes a comment that appears to not be a translation (e.g. when the interpreter says “No microphone” when a meeting participant is speaking with their microphone off), it will be noted as “Interpreter.”

[cuts out]: Audio cuts out for less than 2 seconds. We may have missed something. We do **not** put this if it's just natural silence where no-one is speaking. We only put this if we can hear that there was briefly a technical problem with the phone line and/or the recording which resulted in temporary loss of sound.

[-ation] If we believe that all we missed was the beginning of a word because the audio cuts out, we will just put the end of the word that we can hear. If we are very sure from context what the whole word is, we'll just put the whole word, to make it easier for the reader. However, if the word could be a variety of different things, then we will show only the part of the word we could hear or thought we heard.

\*\*\*\*\*

**List of Participants**

**Important Note:** Please note that this should not be considered to be an "official" list of the attendees. This is just a list of the participants that we were able to identify during the transcription. There may have been others present that didn't speak and some people may have participated that were not on the official list of attendees published on the internet.

- Atohoun, Yaovi
- Ben Jemaa, Tijani
- Bombambo, Gabriel
- Burnette, Stacy (ICANN - Director, Contractual Compliance)
- Ciza, Victor
- Dandjinou, Pierre
- Diakite, Hawa
- Gruber-White, Gisella (ICANN Staff)
- Hilali, Abdelaziz
- Jouhari, Rachida
- Kasole, Didier
- Koubaa, Khaled
- Laabidi, Mondher
- Langdon-Orr, Cheryl (ALAC Chair)
- Mulenda, Arnold
- Scartezini, Vanda (ALAC Vice-Chair)
- Schombe, Baudouin
- Seye Sylla, Fatimata (AFRALO Chair)
- Tchonang Linze, Michel

\*\*\*\*\*

Fatimata: ...start, we've already exceeded more than 20 minutes' delay. I think that everybody that's here speaks French, is that right? Does everybody speak French?

Yes? So I believe the interpreters could wait until the English speakers arrive, or is it for the report?

[silence – 00:25 to 00:49]

Fatimata: Well then, we start and... I have been asked to announce that in order to prepare the closing session, there's a film, a video that is being made and photographs have been taken throughout the At-Large program and activities.

Therefore at the end of the session, three individuals from our group will be filmed or taped to highlight the outcome of the General Assembly, of the work groups, and the thematic groups. Therefore the individuals that will be chosen, these three of us will have to wait here a few minutes after the session so that these statements can be taped.

I have also been requested to announce that there are headsets... I don't know how you call that in French. Oh, headphones... Oh, there is one headphone that is missing, so please check in your bags whether somebody accidentally took the headset. It's going to cost a pretty penny for ICANN to replace. It's this part. This... This item that was used at the opening session. It looks like a telephone and then you would... It's like a small receiver, and it could be in a pocket or in a bag. It looks like a cell phone. So all of you who were at the opening session, do check and make sure that you did not accidentally take one of these receivers which do cost a lot of money.

There are four documents that are for the briefing of our members on the At-Large meeting, Alameda 6. I didn't see but, well, I guess that Gisella will be able to give us the document. She will be providing us with the document. Thank you, Gisella, in advance.

Now for those of you who would like to participate at the GNSO meeting – it's not a meeting, it's a luncheon being organized by the GNSO at 1 o'clock – there will be a shuttle leaving from this hotel at 12:30 and then another shuttle leaving at 12:45 and then a third one at 12:55 in order to go to the Sheraton hotel from here. And we have been told not to forget to register on a yellow sheet that is being circulated.

And I believe that is all. We will be wrapping up our session at 1 o'clock, and after that we will have a series of work subgroups that will be meeting and for lunch, lunch is on our own, everybody has to pay for their own lunch.

And that is all. I would like to thank you, and we will now start our meeting proper.

The agenda for this meeting that you have in front of you... I believe everybody has received it. Is that correct? [cuts out] ...a very brief welcome address, introduction of participants, and I believe that we will start off by adopting the agenda – that should be the first item.

Yes, we should be adopting the agenda, which is not considered here, and it has also been suggested... And then we go on to the next item. We're not going to read the agenda, which you already have received. So first of all I would like to welcome...

It's really a pity that we don't have a quorum, that not all of the members that should be here in attendance are here. Gisella, is everybody here? Is everybody in Mexico? Of all the members, is everybody here?

Interpreter: (No microphone, no microphone.)

Gisella: Apparently everybody has come, except this one person. I don't know why they're not here. The information was circulated well in advance, since our arrival.

Fatimata: Thank you, Gisella. Yes. Khaled, you have the floor.

Female: Aren't we going to have the introduction round?

Fatimata: Is it a point of order?

Khaled?: Yes, regarding the quorum. I believe we don't have minimum number specified in our bylaws, in AFRALO's.

Fatimata?: We can work with whatever number of participants is present.

Khaled?: Yes, I simply mentioned it.

Fatimata?: This will not impair or block our activities because of a lack of quorum. Yes, it is true there is no regulation in our bylaws that specifies a given number of attendees. So the welcome, we've all met and seen each other, and I believe that with this introductory round we will have a chance to better understand what everybody does.

And let's kick it off. We start with Didier.

Didier: I am Didier Kasole. I represent [the interest 07:25] of the Democratic Congo, an ALS since 2001. Thank you.

Khaled: I am Koubaa Khaled. I represent the Internet Society in Tunisia, and it was not mentioned that the secretary of AFRALO... And I'm here as a

representative of AFRALO, of the AFRALO committee, and I am happy to entertain any question you may have.

Mondher: Hello to everybody. I am Laabidi Mondher. I'm the Vice-President of the association in Tunisia, the Tunisian chapter, and the ALS chapter in Tunisia.

Tijani: I am Tijani Ben Jemaa. I am a new ALS. I represent a new ALS. Only last night we got a confirmation. What is wrong?

Female: [inaudible 08:36]

Tijani: Oh, I'm sorry. You can't hear me? So I'm Tijani Ben Jemaa... The microphone is not working? You can't hear me?

Unknown: Would you please repeat?

Tijani: Can you hear me like this?

Unknown: Yes, please repeat again.

Tijani: Now? Any better? Okay now?

Okay? Okay?

Now? Okay, okay. Is it okay? Testing, testing, testing.

So I am Tijani Ben Jemaa. I repeat, I am Tijani Ben Jemaa. I represent a new ALS...

Unknown: No, it's still not working.

Tijani: Maybe... Is it this one? Can you hear me like this?

Female: Maybe if you speak up until they fix the problem?

Unknown: No, it's because of the recording that...

[silence – 10:16 to 11:53]

Male: Okay, okay, okay.

Unknown: Okay, still testing. Testing.

Male: One, two, three. Testing.

Female: [French – 12:04]

Male: I hope this is our last test. Okay, I'll wait.

[background voices, voices testing out the microphones, and silence – 12:16 to 14:58]

Fatimata: Please. Please, I would like to resume. We'd like to move on with the issues of this morning.

Male: Please. Would you please take your seats?

Fatimata: Please, would you be kind enough? We need some silence here so that we can reconvene. Please, everybody.

Female: [English] Please write it down...

[silence – 15:26 to 15:45]

Fatimata: Very well, Tijani.

Tijani: So... [pause] Well, we can start by looking at this. Okay. My name is Tijani Ben Jemaa. I represent a new ALS called the Mediterranean Federation of Internet Associations.

Fatimata: Please, we need some silence. Please.

[English] Sorry. Okay.

Tijani: [French – 16:22]

Fatimata: [French]

Tijani: [French]

Fatimata: [French]

Male: [French]

Tijani: [French]

So I will repeat. I represent the Mediterranean Association of... or Federation of Internet Associations that was just accredited as an ALS. The President of this association is [Aziz 16:44] Hilali, and I am the Executive Director.

Fatimata: Good morning. My name is Fatimata. I am from Senegal and I'm President of the Bokk Jang / Bokk Jef NGO that was recently created and was established as one of the newest ALS organization.

Abdelaziz: Good morning. My name is [Aziz 17:09] Hilali. I represent Morocco, a chapter of ISOC, since 1995.

Hawa: Good morning. My name is Hawa Diakite, member of the committee in Mali, and elected member of ALAC, AFRALO, to represent AFRALO before ALAC. Thank you.

Michel: Good morning. Michel Tchonang, and I am the General Coordinator of the CAPDA NGO – that is the Consortium for the support of Actions for the Promotion and Development of Africa, and it is the first time that I participate in these gatherings, which maybe means that we would just accept [that as a not 18:01] At-Large member.

Victor: Victor Ciza, I'm President of ISOC Burundi.

Rachida: Rachida Jouhari, President of ACSIS, the Moroccan chapter.

Gabriel: Gabriel Bombambo, President of the Congo Associations of Internet Users.

Arnold: Arnold Mulenda. Responsible for training in the Centre for the Promotion in the Democratic Republic of Congo.

Pierre: Good morning. Pierre Dandjinou, President of ISOC Benin.

Interpreter?: I'm sorry. No microphone.

Pierre: President of ISOC Benin.

Yaovi: Yaovi Atohoun, Secretary General, ISOC Benin.

Fatimata: Then thank you. We've introduced everybody sitting at the table, so we will move on to the formal adoption of the agenda. Can we put the agenda on the screen? Can we show the agenda, please? Can we do that?

If not, we each have a copy of the agenda before us, so... It seems to me that what I should do is ask whether there are people who would like to amend, add, delete items from the agenda.

Khaled: Thank you very much, (says Khaled), Madame Chairperson. In fact, I have questions that have to do with the discussion on the establishment of an AFRALO executive committee and the adoption of guidelines in the election of members of the committee, which is agenda item 3. What is the procedure in order to nominate candidates for this committee? What is the mission of this committee? And what are the guidelines that will be adopted? It seems to me that these are questions that should be discussed before we move on to the election of members of the committee. So I would like to talk about the strategy that should be implemented for the organization of our AFRALO instead of going directly into the establishment of an executive committee.

From my point of view, we already have people that are responsible for this task, which are the two officials and the secretary. So we have two officers and a secretary already in the committee. So if you think that we have to establish a different type of structure, what is the shape that will be given to that structure? Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you, Khaled. Tijani?

Tijani: Well, it seems to me that already in agenda item 3 it is a discussion on the establishment. We're not going to establish, we're just to discuss the establishment of the executive committee.

Fatimata: Yes, Hawa?

Hawa: Thank you, Fatimata. When I proposed this program, was for amendment for everybody to submit, but people did not react to this agenda. It was corrected by Fatimata and Mohamed when I submitted this proposal. And the ideas that we talk about the structure, what shape will it be given and how many people will make up the committee? These are brief questions that have to do with the strategy that have to be defined. The election of the committee, we're not compelled to do it today but it is something to ponder upon and to establish so that we can have it in line for the future.



Male: In connection with this point, I don't know whether we can get information on the other regional structures that would enable us to be better organized in how to organize this as regards the structures. In connection with this also, it seems to me that this will enable to us to better find a better organization. Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you. I would like to say something before I give the floor to Hawa. I believe that we're now currently discussing item 3, and we shouldn't move into 3 because we should look into the amendment of the agenda, which is now being introduced. Number 1 is welcoming and 2 should be the adoption of the agenda, and it is precisely there where we're at right now. So all the discussion that you are undertaking leads us to point 3, so it means that it is valid. I believe that we should keep it from what I see.

I'd like to hear suggestions on the agenda. Do you have points to delete, points to point to add, anything to amend to the agenda? I'd like to hear comments specifically on that.

Gabriel?

Gabriel: As this is the first meeting where we're all physically gathered, maybe we can add another point, "Miscellaneous." I don't know whether we will have miscellaneous issues to discuss.

Fatimata?: Anyone would like to add items to be discussed under Miscellaneous?  
[pause]

Very well. We should add an item at the end for "Miscellaneous." Very well. Any other comments? Any other comments?

Very well. We then move on to item 3. Item 3, agenda item 3, which... No, it now becomes 3 because 2 was adoption of the agenda. So this one becomes 3.

So what we used to have as 2 now becomes 3. It is the "Welcoming of Three Newest ALS Organizations," so we wish to welcome you, to these new ALS organizations that were created and then simply enlarges the family of ALS organizations in Africa. And we'll give you two minutes to tell us a little bit about your structure, your organization.

It is Bokk Jang who should start this morning. That organization should be the first one, but... CAPDA will be first, then the Mediterranean Federation, and Bokk Jang will be the last one. So CAPDA, first CAPDA. CAPDA, please.

Michel: CAPDA. You should be used to pronouncing it correctly. CAPDA.

Okay. CAPDA is a local NGO that was created in Cameroon and that is located in Douala. We have one antenna in Chad, we have one in Togo, and recently we established one antenna that we're trying to establish in France.

I do not want to concentrate on things that have nothing to do with internet, because in fact we're working for the formal sector, [with the 25:36] decentralized cooperation. We participate in the establishment of relations between local communities – South cooperation, or South to North cooperation. And I refer to this because in fact the [TIC] constitutes an element nowadays of links and cooperation between peoples and local communities perform an important role, even though in our country things are not up to par.

As regards information and telecommunication sciences, we would like to inform, to create awareness, and to inform people in such a way that local populations can really take ownership of this tool. From my point of view, we believe that we should be precursors to the use of this tool in our environment. We also work before public authorities at the state level, in the government, so that they will be interested in this activity. We are all Africans, [thanks God 26:38], and we know that policies really have to do with saying things and not doing things. It is up to the civil society to go into the practice side of things, to do things, and that's a role we're attempting to play.

One thing is to draw the attention of the international community and those that are involved in these activities so that together we can be accompanied in the process of implementation and work on these matters. This is in a nutshell what we're trying to do and we're organized on a regular basis putting together forum-... international fora that have been taking place for three or four years. And this year we will have our seventh forum on ITC. So I would invite you to attend the forum from the 6th to the 9th of July 2009 in Yaoundé. Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you, Michael. We should applaud because in fact it is worth of an applause.

And I now give the floor to Tijani to introduce the Mediterranean Federation.

Tijani: Very well. The Mediterranean Federation of Internet Associations is a very young organization. In August 2007, it was created, and it is a federation that brings together Internet Associations of all countries in the Mediterranean.

So the major project of this federation is to create a Mediterranean digital space that will be an essential support for economic spaces, academic and cultural spaces in the Mediterranean.

This project, the major project comprises two major pillars. The first one is the creation of a TLD for the Mediterranean on the DNS, [the .MET 28:42] DNS. We will start working on this point and we're awaiting the opening of the next round of nominations for the TLD in order to submit our nomination. It is a project that is not easy and which calls for a great deal of effort and support. We are working hard and I hope our request will be accepted.

This second major pillar in order to build this Mediterranean digital space would be the mutual recognition of electronic signatures in the Mediterranean region, which is to truly promote the economic exchanges in the region – and not only economic, but also cultural exchanges and of all sorts. This second axis on which we're working, we must say that we're at the very beginning of the work that is being done on this and I believe that 2010 will be the year when the project will be really picking up in the Mediterranean digital space.

So this is in a nutshell our presentation, our introduction of the Mediterranean federation, and it's a project, short, medium-term projects and I hope that in future then we will have a lot of activity in the At-Large committee.

I have one suggestion, a small suggestion. Last night, I received an e-mail letting us know that we had been accredited, and they send me words of congratulations. I replied but I didn't bring the e-mail because I'm not authorized to have access to the list. So I kindly ask you to send the necessary e-mails in order to ask for the required authorizations, but I'd like to know if there are people present who deal with the list, because it would be urgent to authorize us to have access. Thank you.

[group applause]

Fatimata: Thank you, Tijani. It is my turn now.

The NGO Bokk Jang / Bokk Jef. “Bokk” means “together,” “Jang” means “learning,” and “Jef” means “reacting”... “acting.” So it is learning together and reacting or doing things together. And [DBJ 31:16]. Instead of that, I said [DBA], 2B1, “to be one,” to turn everything into one single body. So it is an NGO that was created in 1998 with the objective of using internet and the information and communications technologies in order to strengthen the capabilities of young people that dropped out as well as women dropped out of school, and women. So the age group is since the age of 10. The young people who were excluded from the school because they didn’t have the means to pay their schooling, what are we going to do in order to provide them access learning with ICT? And also to train women in order to recruit them so that we can also generate and create activities which in turn generate revenue for these women.

And in order to do that, 15 excellence centres were created by the NGO. And the excellence centres are in fact one cyber centre together with a training centre. It acts with a dual purpose. How do we do? Well, we attempt to have material and equipment with the partners, we create the centre, we train the local community. We are with them during six months and then they take over the ownership of the excellence centre for the activities that generate resources.

Bokk Jang was recognized by UNESCO, that gave a financial contribution to support Bokk Jang within these excellence centres, and also benefited for the USAID support because several young people were selected in order to establish a digital framework, administrative, in Senegal, a three-year program that was using ICT and internet in order to support the private sector in Senegal.

Also, Bokk Jang has piloted another project, [those you ran 33:26], the Association of Free Internet, in order to support the organizations of civil society in Senegal through the E-Riders Project. And so there was a structure that was create, an independent structure, which is the civil society, [known Xam Xam Africa 33:46].

Recently, Bokk Jang was the ambassador of the African Foundation of Free Software to organize the African Conference on Free Software, which is called [ALDLO] version 3, which was held in March, this last March, 2008.

So this is in a nutshell of Bokk Jang, and we will continue to support these structures, local structures, youth in order to use internet for development. Thank you very much.

[group applause]

Fatimata: Thank you. Do you have any questions vis-à-vis this presentation?

Michel: Not a question, but it seems to me that the fact that we're getting together already constitutes a network. It is a network that brings together information on this type, different structures, different associations, and I'd like to address this to Tijani. When he speaks of projects for the establishment of the Mediterranean digital environment, I would ask you to [resort to the 35:06] French cooperation. I will see if I can find the name of a person, a resource of an advisor that was appointed by the [liaisée] who has to deal with this issue. You know very well that this is a priority of President Sarkozy. And I will also send you the address because there was a summit last year in Malaga which was in fact made up by people from the Mediterranean to define and to see what can be done. I participated therein and to the extent possible, I will provide my assistance.

[group applause]

Fatimata: Thank you, Michel.

Very well. I'm sure that this is going to work, but I give the floor to Pierre.

Pierre: I simply want to thank our friends, and I would have liked to hear a little bit about what pushes our friends, what presses our friends to join ICANN. We've heard what you wanted to do, but why be here? And I apologize for asking the question, but I was at the basis of the At-Large, so it would be interesting to know why you're interested in joining.

Fatimata: We're going to answer, Michel, then Tijani, and finally myself. I think that everybody should answer. Everybody. All ALSes should say why they are

interested in joining ICANN. I think it's important. It's a very important question.

Michel: Well, I must say that, be it Fatimata or Tijani, at the very onset of the World Summit on the Information Society, that we started pondering upon this matter. Today we speak a lot about internet governance in a strategic manner and I think that we cannot fight against somebody that is outside. You have to be within in order to understand the situation, and when we see what is happening, what is going on, ICANN is still the basis for internet all over the world, in governing this entity. And we said that instead of being on the sides, we wanted to understand what ICANN is all about and make a modest contribution to this whole process. Because I remember the first time I was at [a precon 37:51], nobody really knew where we were headed for and there were many, many issues raised. We spoke about internet governance only in 2005, and although we started meeting in 2000. And we said that the world of internet still needs more structure, and personally I thought that it was necessary that I try to make a modest contribution from Africa, as an African, and also to not only allow myself but to give the chance to others to know what is going on in these structures and what the future has in store for us.

And yesterday this really fulfilled my expectations, this whole discussion about participation. It seems to me that ICANN, as opposed to what one could believe, is a very democratic institution and we have democracy in internet and we should all participate. And it is in this context that I am very much encouraged and motivated, and this motivation allows us to meet around a table with so many different people to share experiences and build together. We cannot fight against this digital era in Africa, and we have to do so together because there are no longer any secrets. It's not like a library where the information would be hidden away. On the internet, everybody keeps abreast of what is going on and I believe this is my motivation in being in this organization.

Fatimata: Yes, thank you, Michel. I give the floor to Tijani.

Tijani: Well, the first ICANN document I ever had in my hands underscored the importance of final users, the end users of internet to have an influence and a say in ICANN in the decision-making processes. And the first meetings I attended, everybody, all the friends that work in ICANN advised me to be in

the At-Large because it's the only way of having some influence in the governance of internet and ICANN. We should not forget that ICANN is a corporation that manages internet. We can like it or not, but they are in charge of the internet. And finally, I was very much impressed by the bottom-up system, which prevails in ICANN and which is something very unique. I hope that in joining the At-Large, we will be able to truly have our voices heard and have some influence and a say in the decision-making processes.

Fatimata: Thank you.

Speaking on my own behalf, it might seem strange that I first joined ALAC as a member of the board without having requested joining the organization that exists since 1998. [I was fond of 41:18] the whole process and with the debates that I really witnessed, I thought that an NGO really couldn't have a role in ICANN. In all of the debate and discussions, there's always been a problem of access, and when you discuss with ICANN, when you speak about access, they say, "Well, that's not our problem. We simply manage the IP addresses and the numbers." Therefore, this is an impediment, an obstacle. But when I joined the system through ALAC, I saw the role that my NGO could play in being an ALS.

As Michel said, we work, we all fight against this digital divide so that more and more people can access internet for development. And I think that it is for us to have an influence in ICANN and to go in one direction or the other, because after all ICANN is an association of end users. If there are no end users, there will be no registrants and registrars and there will be nothing to manage, there's nothing to be governed. And that really pushed me, that drove me. As an ALS, we could have an influence and have our voices heard in ICANN, if this is really a way of showing up the capacities to grant greater and further access and which is our main concern in Africa.

I now give the floor to Aziz.

Abdelaziz: Yes. I'd like to start off with a comment on what you said and then make a small proposal.

Fatimata?: Yes.

Abdelaziz: Today we have the chance to answer the question posed by Pierre. And to be here present as internet users in representing our local users and to have a say in this organization, in 2003 when this was first proposed in Tunisia, it was with that intention and it's the users first. And as Fatimata already said.

And the proposal I would like to put forth is there are three new ALSes and it's the very first time that all ALSes meet, which is very commendable. I would like to congratulate the new participants. But we should give everybody a few minutes to introduce their organizations, to tell us of what they do in their own countries, to build this network and to see what we can share with others in terms of experiences other ALSes. I think that really should be important.

Fatimata: Thank you, Aziz. Well, this is once again the problem of communications because we spoke about... we discussed this agenda online for a long time. There was this proposal and we said if we're going to do that, we're going to spend all of our time on that and we will never be done with our agenda. Now what we could do is that whenever somebody takes the floor for the very first time, to very briefly outline in broad terms the objectives of their ALS. But if we do this with a full introductory round, we will not be able to make any headway. This was accepted and we shouldn't really revisit that.

Yes, Pierre?

Pierre: I don't whether I can second this, whether this is a support, but I think that in our agenda we shouldn't add anything new. Everybody can introduce their own organizations briefly when they take the floor, but we should stick to the agenda because we have to manage the limited time we have.

In the same regard, those that are connected in the chat can provide a small, detailed presentation.

Fatimata: That's an excellent suggestion. Well, should there be no further questions regarding the third item on the agenda, then I believe we could proceed on to the fourth item. But I have a question for Tijani regarding his ALS.

And especially in regard to the suggestion made by Michel, as an African I am fearsome. Are we going to be divided once again? Are we going to divide and split ourselves? Is it only for Africans or for what country or...?



Tijani: Fatimata... No, actually, when I was told that our application for ALAC and AFRALO, I thought, "Well, Asia Pacific and the Asia Pacific RALO would also be included." The Mediterranean area has African countries, European countries, and Asian countries. And I can... I don't know why they decided to include us in AFRALO as an African. I'm very proud because it is true that my federation is Mediterranean, but as an African, I prefer to be in this domain, in the African domain. A Mediterranean action would never divide Africans. Africans should be everywhere and Africans have to be wherever they can, provide and receive more knowledge and know-how. This is a regional federation that is not African but that in Africa has a major role. Thank you.

Fatimata: I think, I believe that this could be a lengthy debate. And personally I don't share that view and there are other hands that are raised. So I will just give 30 seconds to each one of you on this item before we move on, and later on we can discuss this online because it's a debate that could be very lengthy. Michel and then Victor.

Michel: Yes. I would like to thank you, Fatimata, for the question, which is a very sensitive issue. I remember the Malaga meeting. I was the only one from the Northern African region, everyone else was Mediterranean, and I did pose that question and I really never got a concrete answer. It was a policy that was headed by France and we see this in decentralized cooperation matters. And I would like to close in telling my brothers from the Mediterranean that they should bring the others into the deep Africa region and to organize this simply is a possibility of inviting the rest of the African countries to partake in this process, and that is the most difficult issue. We should never lose sight of the fact of something that I have said and that you know – that these are organizations that are branched out in various interests. And Morocco, for example, threatens to join the European Union... Well, I should say things as they are and this could maybe be a hindrance or an obstacle. But, well, anyway...

Victor: I also wanted to take the floor on this issue – the different subdivisions of organizations that are starting to crop up in our ALAC structure, in the [ccNSO 50:28], and ICANN in general. There's a redefinition of geographic areas and I believe there's a certain number of countries in the Middle East that for example are building another region. And I think that this is because of language reasons and people that speak Arabic, and maybe we should

endeavour to see how Africa can profit from these various and different structures that will originate and that we should maximize the advantages that this offers, these new structures offer. It is true that those that are in the periphery, on the sidelines or on the borders of Africa, have received many requests, so we should try to control this instead of just being passive onlookers.

Fatimata: Thank you. As I said, I think we should stop this debate here and that we continue with our agenda because time runs out and we haven't made much headway. We should leave this room with three subjects covered and we haven't really started with the basic issues.

So if you allow me, I would like to propose something regarding the agenda. Item 4 – could we put this item for a later time? At the very end? At the very end maybe? We should leave it as a last item?

Mondher: Laabidi. As was said at the onset, maybe we should first discuss the strategy then go into the election issues.

Fatimata: No, well, that's not what we said, but anyway, shall we agree that we leave this for the end? Everybody agrees with that? Yes? Good.

So then we proceed on to the next item, the participation of AFRALO ALS in the decision-making processes and policy issues regarding the various policies.

Yes, yes. We are going to first speak about identifying the problems and solution outlines. Regarding this item on our agenda, I would like to remind all present that the participation of end users in general, the end users in general has been the object of a work group that I had the honour of presiding. And maybe we could very briefly describe what were the resolutions arrived at in this group and see if there is something more specific for Africa that we could add. What is your opinion? Would agree with this?

Would you like to take the floor?

Pierre?: I'm sorry. Yes. Yes, just know what the group arrived at and then go on.

Fatimata: We give the floor to Hawa.

Hawa: Do you have the document, since you worked on that chapter, general participation of end users? Otherwise I do have the document if you don't have it with you.

Fatimata: There were several amendments introduced into the document, but at least...  
Good. There's a general work group entitled...

Interpreter: There are several microphones open at the same time.

Fatimata: Yes, the document has not yet been published, but I can tell you what the decisions were since I was a chairperson of this work group. So the work group, number 1 work group worked on the engagement of the At-Large community within ICANN, and there was a first chapter called the General Participation of End Users, and it was seen that there was a lack of participation, effective participation of the At-Large community within ICANN. And I will just focus on the recommendations – not go into the reasons, but go directly into the recommendations.

We already said that there were several ways and means to participate, effective ways to participate, and these means include, amongst others, teleconferences, discussion chats, wiki, blog, the fora, meetings, face-to-face meetings. And it was also recommended... I apologize as a speaker I'm checking my notes. And it was recommended that 4 levels of participation be included within IDN and policy activities. IDN is the name of the international domain structure. At that level, it was said that it was important...

I'm translating and trying to understand at the same time because there were so many changes and I don't have the latest version.

Regarding the different scripts that are used, the scripts pose an obstacle for participation for all regions of the world. IDN could maybe... Well, we had briefings, especially yesterday we had briefings on the international domain names regarding Arabic and other languages or scripts, and the issue of scripts and the diversity of individuals.

Then there's another level which is participation of local communities. We said that we are aware of the need of having summarized documents in "user-friendly" language – whatever you call that in French, "user-friendly"

language – in plain language, to be translated into the United Nations languages so that the local communities can better understand and have access to said documents issued by ICANN.

The third item was GNSO participation, and in this regard we said in view of the highly technical nature of the problems related to GNSO and the impact and the impact they have on users both as users, regular users and registrars, the community At-Large in GNSO matters calls for more time and better knowledge of participants. And we believe that the development of problems on GNSO are highly specialized problems, should therefore provide us with the best possible answer, the optimized answer.

And it was also recognized that the GNSO together with ALAC put forth a proposed bill of rights of registrants. How do you say “bill of rights” in French? Yeah, help me out please.

[group laughs]

Fatimata: “Bill of rights” in French, please? “Bill of right of registrants.” Okay. Let’s leave it at that.

Could the interpreters maybe tell us what “the bill of rights of registrants” could be in French?

[very faint voices in background – 1:01:10 to 1:01:27]

Interpreter: No microphone, no microphone. A microphone please. Now it’s off. Now it’s completely off.

Male: Yes, I was trying to settle this question with Fatimata, that is all.

Male: Okay. It is a charter, a bill of rights of the registrants. They are entitled to some rights. They are providing good money for the registration and they should know what they’re entitled to, what their rights are.

Fatimata: And then the fourth item on participation is the possibility of participating in ICANN’s meetings. In this regard, it was decided and proposed to facilitate attendance and it was also recognized that there have been recommendations made by the At-Large and the Board of ICANN and that some of these recommendations were not heeded at all. Well, obviously we

also spoke about the fact that there were problems related to travel and participating at a distance from such meetings, problems related to the fact that several different languages are being used. All of these problems were highlighted. I don't have the final wording of those paragraphs, I don't have the latest version, but that is basically what was mentioned. And speaking about participation and, for example, travel support. We've also spoken about the global outreach, how to allow the community to participate and to have local communities participate, and it was suggested that the ALSes could play a role in forming and creating an awareness at the user level and that ICANN...

We also even spoke about subcontracting the ALSes through the RALOs to attend even from the remotest area. It was also recommended that yearly regional meetings be held to discuss problems that affect the ALSes at a regional level with the participation of other constituencies, the other constituencies of ICANN at a regional level. For example, if there is a group of GNSO members in Africa, when an African ICANN meeting is going to be organized, the other structures, the other ICANN structures that are present in Africa also participate in order to participate in the debates of such problems.

Regarding travel expenses, the issue of visas was also highlighted – visas being a major recurring problem. And in that regard, it was proposed that the countries that are chosen abide by a certain selection criteria, that the stated host country commit itself to provide attendees with the necessary visas. And we usually know who is supposed to attend such an ALAC meeting and that tickets be bought well in advance and also hotel arrangements be made well in advance to... And also that the hotels be close to the venue or that transportation be provided by means of shuttle buses.

And I don't know whether I really covered everything, but we really spoke about many, many things.

Male: Fatimata, just a sideline. At the end of this amendment, we should not forget the issue of the invitation. It's a basic issue, the invitation letters.

Fatimata: Yes, that's true. Somebody else in that group could maybe fill in any gaps I left. That this is a first draft, there were many changes and amendments, and I can't just read it so quickly. We spoke about the issuing of the tickets, the

visas, the hotels, and we even had one proposal for a yearly summit, but we didn't even dare put that in writing in the last draft because we thought that we would have to wait for an answer from ICANN with other proposals and respond to the proposal and then negotiate.

Now regarding translation, translation of documents, it was also requested to work out for the ALSes what their participation in translation efforts could be and to decide what are the most important documents that should be translated for the various regions.

Yes, Didier... [cuts out] ...Khaled.

Male: I would like to refer to this point that has to do participation at two levels. The first level has to do with remote participation online. It is important to have remote participation between all ICANN meetings in order to make known the point of view of each ALS on the important points under discussion, and that's very easy to do. I believe that we have a major problem in connection with this because you yourselves have witnessed this, Didier, Khaled – several people. We really do not have a participation of African ALS in teleconferences or videoconferences, in the mailing list, in these sessions of comments that are open on each document published by ICANN. This is important and should be mentioned because before speak of travel or face-to-face meetings or other forms of participation, it seems to me that we are all people who work online and we should continue promoting the work online, and we should continue promoting the work online. That's the first thing.

The second thing has to do with my position regarding the Nomination Committee. I believe it is very important for the ALSes to be included, that they participate in the nomination of people from Africa for open positions, for Africa, this year and next year, because any form of participation of the ALSes has to do with the participation in the At-Large but also in the recruitment of people from our region in order to participate in the policies of other constituencies that are in the [Board 1:09:48]. So as African ALSes, you have the responsibility of doing outreach work in order to recruit as many Africans as possible for them to be valuable candidates for the positions that are open. So I truly invite all people from Africa to come back to this after this meeting in Mexico and to attempt to recruit the largest number possible of

candidates in order to be also efficient at other levels of participation, not only at the level of the At-Large committee. Thank you.

Fatimata: Didier, you are to submit the report? The preparation of the report of this meeting, is that up to you? Have you taken notes?

Didier: No, I didn't know that I had to take notes.

Fatimata: You are the Secretary.

Didier: Well, I don't know what you call it. If you call it the Secretariat, I didn't know that... I wasn't the secretary. I wasn't aware of the fact that I had to take notes.

Very well. I will take notes as of this minute. But be careful, the Secretariat... Okay. I'm not the coffee provider, I'm not taking care of the coffee break. I didn't say "Rapporteur," I just said "Secretary." If you are the rapporteur of this session, it is not necessary the Secretary of the AFRALO. We can have other people who would be assigned this task. If there are other people who can nominate themselves as candidates for that position.

Fatimata: Is there anyone else who would like to prepare the report?

Didier: No, I will take notes. I will take notes.

Fatimata: Thank you, Didier. Thank you for volunteering. Thank you.

Now Hawa, and then Yaovi.

Hawa: Thank you. Also in connection with participation, I'd like to complete Fatimata's ideas as well as Khaled's comments. Fatimata just gave us a detailed description of a participation, how we see the participation of the At-Large community in the activities of ICANN. It seems to me that we should speak also within the framework of our region, Africa – that is very important. It is essential that all ALSes that are present and absent and know that there are going on discussions on specific matters that are taking place online and physically that are open, that anybody can access and express their views on the topic of interest we have, the development of policies, we have GNSO, we have IPv6 – all the different subjects out that are debated within ICANN that are available, and you can easily access, it's open to the participation of

everybody. You can all register to participate in any matter that might seem of interest to you and to attempt to give contributions. I call on all our ALSes as of the meeting in Mexico that they take a more visible role on this matter and that they offer comment and that they participate actively. Thank you.

Yaovi: Thank you. I do know if for this meeting we can have a summary prepared or how to move people to participate, because every time I'm under the impression that we're not accusing ICANN, but it is up to us to participate and we need a lot of voluntary work. For example, if you wish to participate in one of our discussions, you need some free time during the week so that you can participate in teleconferences and I participated in one of these groups that held discussion for three months. So I'm wondering whether we can still do something. How can we prepare a one-page document for people to participate, particularly as regards this issue? Because if you're not coming to a meeting where we're discussing this issue and you don't understand a thing, you don't participate. So we have to know how to participate, we have to read. We really need voluntary work and we need to read a lot and we need to sacrifice ourselves, because I realize that it is only during these meetings that we need and we start realizing what there is to be done.

So we have to speak, the ball is in our court, so it is up to us. We see colleagues and to push things, people who offer to be volunteers, and particularly if we don't speak English, we have to be informed and find a way of being influent. If you participate in a working group, you need the command of the two languages. There are people in Africa who understand at least these two languages, and these people within their communities must return and pick up the points of view of the members of their communities. Those of us who come to these meetings, we have to go back to find what the view of our community is and express and make this known. So we do have that side of our volunteers, we have availability to read everything. Everything is for free. It is open. We must read a lot so that we can really participate. Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you. Pierre?

Pierre: Thank you. Since what I wanted to say has already been said, but I just would like to add two words. After several years, we did everything possible in order to promote participation and the message we're trying to get across is not to



ICANN. Africa participates very little in the development of policies. We know that. We don't send a lot and we don't expect a lot from Africa, and we won a name, we won in quantity, through four people. Now we have more than that. But as has already been said, the question is not for ICANN as such. You have ICANN that has established its committees and the scholarship. In order to have more people come and attend these meetings, the major issue is what do we do within ICANN? What is expected from us and what can we do?

One of the conclusions that I draw, the major question is that we really don't have an industry as such, an internet industry in Africa as such. We are simply resellers. And ask yourselves why do people come here? Many of the people that come here are not sponsored. Why? But just try to figure that out. Why do people come without being sponsored to attend these meetings?

And they're not really prepared, so we have to stay within Africa because we have to find the necessary means in order to bring operators and nowadays telecoms, of cell phones, mobile phones that use what is offered by ICANN. So we need to be interested. We have to do work at a local level so that these people can be assisted from a financial point of view, that we can have meetings and the preparation before even thinking to come to ICANN. Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you, Pierre. Didier, and then Baudouin. Khaled, did you raise your hand? No? Okay. And Michel. In that order.

Didier: I believe that Yaovi and Pierre pointed out rightly the problems we have to face. What is to be done? This is due to the fact that the interest is very weak. We don't have an industry, we're not very interested. I'm a cocoa farmer and I don't know what internet represents for me, so I really don't care about it. The fact that we don't have an industry makes us not be interested. So the problem is that we're not up to par, we're not aware of what goes on nowadays. We have to find the means to inform people, to find a way of informing stakeholders. I believe that we have 53 countries in Africa and perhaps there are only 4 that participate. So it is possible that many countries in Africa are not even aware of the fact that the GAC exists and that you can express your views through the GAC. So I believe that this has to do with the problem of lack of information, people are not aware of what goes on, and we

should entrust someone this task of informing our governments, our operators, our users, and keep them informed about all these issues, and then we will have more participation.

Fatimata: Baudouin?

Baudouin: I'd like to say right away that it is not that the information does not go through. We can say that more or less 12 years ago, we started dealing with this situation, and Michel can attest to that. There's a lot of information that I've transmitted on ICANN but we have [five lists 1:19:18] of exchanges in Central Africa, and in my own country – we send every information, everything that has to do with ICANN. We never keep the information, everything is sent. We had working sessions with the ISPs. I gave them all the necessary documentation. We have digital information, we have electronic information. We gave them everything on these working sessions and nothing happens. So I believe that as regards circulation of information, I don't know what is to be done in order to solve this problem, but at that level the information is not going through. People are sending the information all the time but the problem is that within the young people that we have in our working group, the problem is not really passing on the information but the question that will be addressed will be to find out what are the replies and the responses that are given to their concerns. So that's more or less how we see things in order to vote them to participate in all these sessions.

Fatimata: Thank you, Baudouin. It seems that it is true that information does circulate, but people don't know what we're talking about. For example, if you send information on certain aspects of GNSO and the readers don't really understand and don't really know what this means. They don't see how this can be useful. Are they going to invest in order to find out what the GNSO does if they don't understand how this can be useful? We have to circulate the information, but also beyond that we must do more than that in order to inform, to create awareness. It is not only sending information when ICANN sends information on such a problem and that we include it in the list, it is not then necessarily that the person who knows how to fill out the forms will take the time to read and to attempt to understand things, etc., because the young people that address this question, whether their concerns are taken into account, have they said what their concerns are so that these can be duly be taken into account?

I believe that the proposals that were made here always tend to lead us to see that there's work to be done in order to involve more these people.

We had Michel, and then Didier once again.

Michel: Thank you to all the other speakers, Pierre... I have to thank Baudouin once again for the work he's done in circulating the information within Central Africa.

I must say that one of the concerns of our countries, as we know very well here, is the fact that we don't have the culture of reading, of finding out, of being involved. We are also victims of the strategy, of policies taken by our countries. The plan of action... And this is where I was interested in what Pierre was saying. The Tunisia plan of action. If we had implemented something concretely, I believe that the flow of information would come easily as one more contribution in the process. We spoke a lot about the question of industrialization, of the ICTs in Africa. And if I recall correctly, the first thing is that in Senegal, Senegal has undertaken commitments from an intellectual point of view, the creation of universities. And the other countries obviously have to deal with other things.

As regards our discussion, I was wondering whether what we should consider should be the question of knowing whether the techniques at our disposal in our countries truly favour the participation of actors and stakeholders that we are. If we have to collect information from users or from stakeholders on the field, do we have the possibilities and the means to do that? That is my question.

Fatimata: Didier, very quickly. I believe that we're going to attempt to be more specific on these major ideas that have been submitted here to reflect them in the report and that we'll move on to the next item.

I give the floor to Didier, then Tijani and Khaled.

Didier: I do not wish to concentrate on this point. I want a dialogue, but the information is not only to be given to Africans. I believe that ICANN will do it. I've asked those who do it, ICANN organizes a poll in the US to see how many people know about ICANN. We will have figures and I would be very surprised if 10 out of every thousand people know what ICANN is. It is up to

you to check this and you will realize that in France maybe 10 knows that ICANN exists. So we cannot deny the lack of information, I'm just saying that interest... that is interested is informed... all people in France and the US who are interested know that this exists, and African professionals don't even know. They don't know how to participate, what to do in order to participate. No training is provided in all African countries on this matter.

And I go back to the ALSes. Here when the ALSes show up, I realize that the ALSes don't really know what the whole thing is about and what ICANN does. If the ALSes themselves don't know what ICANN does, how do you want these ALSes to go back and let people know what the whole thing is about? They haven't filled out the form, they've only filled out forms for just a few. There's only one that hasn't filled out the form. If you haven't done that, how can you publish the information? How are we going to use and disseminate the information? And I apologize for that.

Fatimata: Tijani and then to Khaled very quickly, and then Gabriel. And after that we must come to an end.

Tijani. Yes. I have one point. The first one was brought up by Didier. Information is essential, but interest in the situation is much more important. When people are not interested, it is much more difficult to attract them. It is true that in Africa we don't have a lot of people that are acquainted or that are interested in the activity of ICANN. You gave the example of a cocoa... They don't give a hoot about the internet. The problem is that in their heads this is the situation. So the first point would be how do we attract that interest, if you attract interest and you don't participate? We have to inform these people and then to attract their interest.

Secondly, I read the title of the fifth point which is participation of ALS in the process to develop norms, guidelines in the election of members of the committee. We don't know what the participation is about. It is the participation in the adoption of positions for the development of our guidelines. Then participants having to come here, to listen, to participate, they have to participate in the development of guidelines and there's a huge difference in only coming and not participating and then participating in the development guidelines. We have to be clear on that.

Fatimata: Yes, we have to summarize in order to move on to the next item. Item 4 and item 5 are not very distant from each other, and we could save and truly work very quickly on these two points. So I quickly give the floor to Khaled and to Gabriel. Rachida, I hope that this will go in the same direction so that progress can be made, because sometimes we're repeating ourselves and if the person who takes the floor is to support what the other one is saying, that's not worth it. We take the floor to say new things. If not, we give the floor to someone else so that we can speed up things.

So Khaled, please.

Khaled: I simply wanted to say that we've concentrated on questions that have to do with the position of Africa, the position of ICTs in Africa and internet in Africa, but we haven't replied to this with the identification of problems or difficulties based on the fact of ALS participation and finding solutions. You here have to depict the problems and what are the solutions so that you can participate, so that we can all participate in the process. That is the question that we have to reply to and not to speak of the rest. I know that there are many topics that are important, but I don't think this is the time to speak of ICTs in Africa.

Fatimata: Thank you, Khaled.

Gabriel?: I had one problem. From the point of flow of information that comes from ICANN to the ALSes, if there's an event such as the one that took place in Africa in February and will take place again next year, who is informed? Who knows about this? From those sitting around this table. Thank you.

Fatimata?: The question is, he's saying that on ICANN's site we can read that there will be an event in Africa in February next year. But I'm thinking about the rotation of meetings of ICANN, and then Africa, there's one country in Africa that should offer to host the meeting in Africa in February 2010. I believe this is what they're announcing. The country is not specified – is that it?

Gabriel?: Okay. For the other continents, they're just saying that they're looking for the country that will volunteer to host it but then nothing is said about Africa.

Fatimata: To respond to this, I will give the floor to Pierre, then Rachida. Victor... But...  
[pause]

Pierre: Last year it was said that Kenya was going to host this meeting, but then there were post-electoral events, and I believe that currently there are no proposals submitted by Kenya to host this summit.

Fatimata: Yes, thank you. Now to give the floor to Rachida.

Rachida: It is simply to respond to the points raised. They said that it's not worth it to inform when you're not interested, and I fully agree because information is to awaken interest. The people should be interested. We all have our problems, our daily problems, our obligations, professional obligations, private, family, personal, etc., and these information ought to awaken that interest. So we are going to look and this is a work that is done by all militants in civil society. They have to inform, create awareness, awaken interest, because internet users, people who use internet, they don't really ask what is behind everything, what is done. Saying that there are perils that they face, dangers that they encounter, and this is where we have to act as strongly. The militants of civil society – that's us – have to awaken the interest of all internet users and we couldn't find anything better than the ALSes because the ALSes are the spokespeople for civil society and the spokespersons of the end users directly. They don't go through the builders, through the registrants, through government representatives, so they represent directly the end users.

Fatimata: Thank you, Rachida. We've taken note of this.

We're going to stop here and to save a little bit on the ideas because several ideas have been put forth here. So we spoke of participation, participation of ALSes. We said already... No, it is only a summary of what we have done so far, and with this you can react. This is what I wanted to say because I've listened to your comments and I simply want to make a summary.

We spoke also of our problems. Why don't we participate? And I believe that this is important. We're not participating, we've already said this on several occasions. When we have demands for participation, for information on a specific problem, it is not only on this agenda, there's no participation. We didn't have any participation in connection with this agenda. And we're all here to say, "Yes, we're here present." We want to say, "We don't participate at the grassroots level. We have to do this, we have to do that." So we have to change our own behaviour.

And we have the list first of all and then we have the videoconferences. Who participates in videoconferences? What are the African ALSes that participate today? If we were to do this today, we realize that there are only a few and it is always the same people.

Interpreter: I'm sorry, but the mic is gone.

Fatimata: No, I'm sorry, Rachida. Rachida, please do not speak. Please, you do not have the floor. Please, I don't want any disorder in the demands for the floor.

I'm only quoting the problems that we're facing and we have to find strategies precisely to better participate. What are we going to do in order to have a better participation? We know that the problem was not only ICANN's fault. There are things that we can ask ICANN to do and the recommendations offered by the working group, I believe that this also holds value for us. If you agree, the recommendations made by the working group on participation hold value for us. I wonder whether these recommendations are valid for us too. As AFRALO, are we to take these recommendations that are made from the all the RALOs? If that is the case then the other major problem is us.

Now we made our diagnosis. We've already established what the problem is. What are the recommendations that we can make in order to improve our participation as the African RALO?

Khaled... Hawa, Khaled, and Rachida. And I would truly ask you that you be specific, that you speak to the point that we make recommendations and that we do not start discussing and debating other situations. We've already discussed things, we offer a diagnosis, we've already said where the problems are and what is not working, so now we have to say what proposals are made and what recommendations so that we can improve things.

Khaled, Rachida, and please turn off the mic – and as soon as you finish, please turn it off. Thank you.

Hawa: Thank you, Fatimata. You went directly to the core of my proposal, is that each one of us says what is needed, what do they need in order to participate in a videoconference or a teleconference or that they participate in an e-mailing list. Messages are sent, we don't get any replies. The appeals are made and we don't get any replies. Those of us who are here representing a

community, could each one of us say why they don't participate in a videoconference or a teleconference?

Khaled: I sincerely recommend that we establish a working group on participation and refer to all the ALSes of ICANN. I recommend that we within AFRALO establish a working group internally within the African region so that first and foremost we can identify problems, because we cannot identify our problems and push people and work with them in order to attempt to push people to participate, to motivate them. And not in all conferences, because they participate in the monthly videoconference, it is a passive participation. We're also trying to participate, but what we want is to be active in the [eemaloo 1:36:20] list, to provide comments on the documents that are published. That is the participation that we want. We cannot participate every month in the videoconference, that is of no use if you don't perform in offering comments that are truly the point of the view of the community, that reflect the point of view of the community with which we work every day and which in fact draw great interest on DNS, DNSSEC connectivity and all the other problems. That is a participation that we need. So I recommend that we establish a working group within AFRALO, and I offer, volunteer for that. If you want to join me, we can create a working group in order to push people to participate actively.

Fatimata: Okay. Okay, we'll take note of your proposal, but there is something I would like to say about the monthly meetings. The monthly meetings for myself are very useful because it's a coordination meeting. It will allow us in the work group to pick up on activities and get the input of the other members, and I think it's very important to have these monthly meetings and participate actively.

Rachida has the floor.

Rachida: The problem of participation at the teleconferences is not a problem for AFRALO, it's for everybody. We are all volunteers and we don't have all the time available to devote to these matters. It takes half a day for these monthly meetings and we have to find time to be there and have to make all the arrangements and decide whether it's in the morning or afternoon. It's a half-day that we devote to this teleconference. It's a whole organization. If you have a meeting that starts at 9 and ends at noon, we can't have a teleconference in the middle of our meeting.



Okay, just tell us what you need to participate. The problem that I find is that we all are affected, the issue of interest. There's nothing new so we have to find a new sense, new individuals who are still curious, who care, who ask questions, who are more interested. Usually it's always the same people that meet over and over again, and every year and every time there's an ICANN meeting, we see the same faces. What else can they contribute? What new contributions can these people make once again? So we need to attract more people, more ALSes. How many people do we have on our list? It's always the same names. So what will these individuals bring as a new contribution.

Fatimata: Rachida, that's true. What you said is true, and that's exactly what we're trying to do – a very concrete, down-to-earth proposal for you to participate more. What do we need for you to make a larger contribution? We need very concrete, precise recommendations, not something up in the air.

Rachida: But Khaled said that to entice participation, it's not a policeman, a cop that will bring in the people to participate. No. No, we are not going to force anybody to answer and write in and participate. That recommendation was not taken note of. What we said, that there's a work group that he volunteered to head, that was taken note of.

Khaled?: I apologize. This was just in brackets.

Rachida?: It's simply to create this personal awareness.

Fatimata: Rachida, I want something very concrete. Something complete, please, Rachida. And I give the floor to Arnold.

Arnold: Okay. I will second Khaled's ideas. I will gladly join the group, I'll be the first to join the group. And there is a problem, a serious problem, a motivation problem, a lack of motivation. Now when do we get motivation? When we understand what we want to do, when we are well acquainted with a topic. In our work groups, I haven't been able to speak about this but I've seen that when Rachida says it's always the same individual, it's always the same issues that crop up, not only the same individuals. So... Well, I would like to propose that in Khaled's team there be somebody that before a meeting explains, a facilitator that will explain the terms...

Fatimata: Arnold, but we are going to go into how the group is going to work later on. First, proposals. If you don't have a proposal, I go to a next... I have to be dictatorial, but time is running out.

Yes, Tijani and then Aziz and Michel. Thank you. Michel?

Tijani?: Proposal. First, we support the recommendations put forth by Fatimata's work group. Second, I also support Khaled's suggestion, I'm willing to participate in his work group. Third, if the focal points in the ALSes supposedly participating in work meetings are not available, don't have the time, well, they will change, that they change the focal points in the ALS, that they delegate to somebody else. In the ICANN system, the focal point not necessarily is the head of the organization.

Fatimata: Thank you. Thank you. Good suggestion. Yaovi?

Yaovi: Well, I would like to propose... I don't know whether in this workshop, but there was a presentation on the whole process to develop policies. Otherwise those that could find the linkage to do this. There was a presentation on how to develop policies and that the members are better informed and that we not always have the same people. I don't see how we can force anybody to participate. We should encourage participation, but it's on a voluntary basis. We have to understand this. This is voluntary work. So I propose that everybody upon when we return back, that we read a lot, that we inform ourselves. We can't force anybody to participate. We need somebody who is well acquainted with a topic, that is interested. We need to find the time to read and familiarize ourselves with the issues. And the teleconferences, yes, sometimes have only one-hour participation, but you have to prepare yourselves, check and review the documents and read.

Okay, concrete proposal. As I said, we need to read a lot, participate a lot, and I propose that if on the PDP, on the policy development process, how can we encourage people to read or do something? Well, we have to tell them. It's a matter of saying it. And for this meeting, the three teleconferences we had, even amongst ourselves, it was difficult to get participation. There's nothing to be done. We're always going to say the same things – every single time, the same thing.

Fatimata: Okay, no proposal?

Yaovi: Yes, it is a proposal.

Fatimata: No, the proposal, what do we have to do to get to where we want to get? A proposal, a concrete proposal that we... Yes, that we all share more information.

Michel and then Aziz. No? Michel first? Was it Michel first? No, Aziz. I'm sorry.

Abdelaziz: Just to enhance and add something to what Khaled said, also linked to the discussion on the executive committee, I think that that committee be made up of individuals who are really up to par and are abreast and informed on the various topics, be it GSNO... [so it will be 1:45:21] that they prepare the work, and for a teleconference, that they work in advance, that they send out and circulate whatever paper was drafted to the ALSes to have a more constructive discussion. Because I have attended the first ALS meetings when I could, then things changed, it was at another time.

Fatimata: So what is your proposal, your concrete proposal?

Abdelaziz: That the executive committee, the liaison executive committee, that we all work on different issues and topics and make a proposal to all ALSes for the upcoming meeting. And secondly, personally the time that was decided should be checked so that the teleconference really has enough available individuals and to maximize the number of individuals on the teleconference. When it was at 2 o'clock, I was able to be there.

Fatimata: Is that something else?

Abdelaziz: No, that's it.

Fatimata: Otherwise, let's go on. Yes, a recommendation. Yes, a recommendation fr... Aziz's recommendation... I'm reformulating. Aziz's recommendation is that the At-Large staff implement a new system to decide on timetable that is most convenient for all people. Are you in agreement with that?

Abdelaziz: Yes.

Fatimata: Okay, we're going to... Yes, we're going to reformulate, we're going to reformulate it. And then the second proposal, that a liaison individual be

appointed for each topic – IDN or GNSO, etc. – and that this individual whenever that issue's going to be discussed will put online the documents regarding that topic. I would even say that this individual will try to summarize, with the help of the At-Large staff to summarize the problem and to put it online prior to the meeting. How many days prior to the meeting? One week at least, one week prior to the meeting, summarizing.

Is somebody taking notes, because Didier's not there? Didier, did you take note? Oh, you heard everything? The liaison and also the new system?

Interpreter: No microphone, no microphone.

Fatimata: One week ahead of time, and the summary.

Interpreter: No microphone, no microphone. No microphone.

Fatimata: No, please, please. No. No, no, no, (says Fatimata). Please don't forget at the end of the meeting we have to come out with three topics. We only have one for the time being. Or do we have two? I only have the work group that Khaled proposed. Is there a second workgroup?

Male: Aziz's recommendation is also implicit in mine.

Fatimata?: Yes. Yes, he said it. Yes, that works.

Male: To...

Fatimata: Once again please, who's taking the floor? Who wants the floor for a second recommendation – concrete, precise, to-the-point recommendation? Michel on my speaker's list, then Hawa, and then Rachida, and then [Laabidi 1:49:16]

Okay. Okay, yes. That's right.

Interpreter: No microphone.

Michel: Well, I see two proposals. The first one is somewhat sensitive because when we speak of participation, there is one basic aspect which is the technique. We can have the will to participate online but the technology, all the equipment just isn't working. I don't want to dare go into more details, but I could propose that we strengthen the institutional aspects unless the focal

points receives some support to have something more sound and better-working in the focus points. Second, to strengthen the capacities, to shore up the capacities at the focal points level. Representatives that are there... It was something just in addition to what already had been said. Yes, reinforcing and strengthening capacities, the institutional capabilities and capacities.

Fatimata: Yes. Would you propose be the leader of the group?

No, I think it's something else. I think this is something different from what you proposed. So you keep your group and there is going to be one group working on institutional strengthening and capacity building, and we have Michel as the leader of that group. Okay? Good. Second group.

And now the word goes to Hawa, and then Rachida and then...

Yes?

Male: Please, we are running the risk of doing too many thing too many things at a time. We have the idea of the work groups. With a single work group we could then define subgroups. Otherwise we would have first to define who exactly who is going to do what and not get scattered.

Fatimata: Work groups, do you want to subdivide the work groups and participation?

Male: No.

Fatimata: No, we are searching for three topics, three issues. We already have two. You think that is too much already?

Male: Yes, because we are going to have subgroups.

Fatimata: No, groups and subgroups is two different things. If he wants a subgroup, that's okay, but we want three major areas, thematic areas.

Hawa first, and then you're on the list.

Hawa: Thank you. I would like to come back to my original proposal, that all ALSes first make a summary of what they need in order to participate. And what we're trying to do to encourage participation, what do we need in order to better organize this global participation in Africa, that everybody specify

exactly what they need in order to actively participate – mailing list, meetings, what have you.

Fatimata: Okay. So Hawa, we could maybe consider this not as a topic but an activity, a work that you are going to be in charge of coordinating in order to compile by e-mail everybody's proposal and list of needs. Yes?

Hawa: Yes, yes, yes.

Fatimata: Okay. So she will be in charge of that, of compiling that list of needs?

Hawa?: Yes. And then for the topics.

Fatimata: And now Rachida, for one minute.

Rachida: It's really a question.

Fatimata: No, no, no, no, no, no. No, we are working on proposals. You said you wanted the floor for a proposal, a recommendation.

Rachida: Yes, to coordinate the workgroup that we are creating. We are creating a work group. So is it the Secretariat that will charge of coordinating the activities?

Fatimata: Rachida, let us first finish with the workgroups, okay? And then you can put forth your proposal. Okay? Thank you. Thank you.

Didier, do you still want the floor? No longer?

Didier: I think there is a problem at the meetings. This morning I agree with the chairperson, but Khaled wanted to put for the proposal, I wanted to have a better grasp, and then we got into the working groups without really understanding what it's all about. I think at all meetings we do the same thing. We want to do something, we should let people explain a little and elaborate on their ideas. And the solution is just working groups? But we really haven't had any major exchange. In a working group, we go from one meeting to a next without much happening, but I would like to see a further debate and that we hear more about how this is going to work. And not that we say, "At the end of the meeting, you're going to do this and that and that."

Fatimata: Please, please, we've received... Each RALO received objectives for this General Assembly. The goals would be three topics. As I said at the outset of the meeting – maybe you weren't here yet – that is the purpose of this meeting, that is why we're here. It's not a matter that we just pull out of the thin air. This is a meeting in which we had a document to work on and to explain that the purpose of this General Assembly is to have three topics. And we should adjourn at 1 o'clock. Do you know why the sense of urgency and why I'm working at such a fast pace? Yes, it's when you're late, you're always wrong, right? You didn't hear that at the beginning? Well, I'm sorry, but I did say it at the beginning. Did the others hear it? Okay, good. So thank you.

Khaled, is this another proposal, another recommendation? A clarification? Okay.

Khaled?: It's not my working group, really. It's not my working group. It's a working group for everybody and I would invite Khaled and Aziz to work with us because those two ideas definitely are a part of the mission of a working group that tries to identify and find solutions for participation, and you made two excellent proposals.

On the other hand, for Michel, to enhance the capacities, that's exactly what it's all about. This is the right time to get ICANN's approval for a summit, and that's something that really required a lot of effort. And it's still the same goal, to build capacities, strengthen our capacities. Here in Mexico, we want to enhance as much as possible the capacities of your own institutions or organizations and we should take advantage of this opportunity and occasion. Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you, Khaled. But I still think that there's still some merit to this point. It's valid. I already heard Arnold yesterday, that he said that he leaves the meeting with a lot of ideas in his mind. And that was really the intention, but there is still many, many things to learn at ICANN because ICANN is a very dynamic institution and we always have new things to learn – working groups and new things and developments.

Tijani had asked for the floor.

Tijani: Yes. I would like to remind you all once again that we're supposed to see how the ALSes and AFRALO can participate more actively in developing norms

and standard, and we were discussing proposals to enhance participation of ALSes in AFRALO, but also we should ask ourselves how can we have a greater influence.

Fatimata: Yes, yes. Tijani, do you have any concrete proposal?

Tijani: No. No, I don't have any concrete proposal.

Fatimata: I think that Aziz put forth a proposal that in my opinion went exactly in that direction, to serve as a liaison.

Yes, please. Yes. But something very concrete, and then don't tell me afterwards that "I didn't give you a proposal," okay?

Tijani?: Okay. I apologize. But Fatimata is right. It's 11:30. We only have an hour and a half and we are not through with our agenda and we should leave the meeting with concrete proposals. So please, please, stick to the point.

Male: I want to make something very, very concrete. Something related to what Khaled said. We don't have the time, we don't all have the time to read everything that is going on in internet. Starting on myself, I don't have the time for that. So what I said, that individuals that are interested in a given area – Khaled or somebody else interested in GNSO – if there is someone in Africa, an African resource, an expert in that area could brief us and provide us some insight on what is happening in the internet in that regard. And that individual will represent AFRALO and be the resource person on that topic. Internet governance, somebody could work on something else and whenever there's a teleconference... I've been at several teleconferences and I've been quite disappointed – I don't hide that – because we just discuss and discuss and we never get down to something very concrete and precise.

So that's my concrete proposal. For the teleconferences, the resource person will come with a document drafted and prepared and will report and brief on what happens in that given area and this will reflect everything that he's read or she's read and this will give us a viewpoint vis-à-vis ICANN on a given topic. This is somebody from Africa, an African individual that will tell us what's going on with that topic. And I think as a group, a group, an executive committee, a working group, or whatever you want to call it, what is important is that we have people that will draft and prepare briefing documents to



facilitate the debate and discussion in the teleconferences, for the chat, and for all other purposes.

Fatimata: Yes. You've worked it out and we've taken note.

Now I really would like that we have a concrete proposal. So if I understood correctly, what we need is to appoint small groups on different topics regarding ICANN's problems. Any objections? Khaled?

Khaled: I would propose... The model already exists at the GNSO level. There is a liaison model, not by topics but by constituencies, in you have a liaison individual with SSL and ccNSO, in all of the various groups. And they are all volunteers. So liaison individuals by constituency, not by topic, because they can touch upon different topics. The same individual touching on different topics.

Fatimata: Okay. We can get that organized right away. Yes?

Didier?: He's spoken on something that fascinates me, the volunteers. As he said, individuals, we're encouraged to speak up, but we can't force individuals. We know that in Africa there are many volunteers and there are people that are interested.

And then something else I wanted to say in answering his question. We can send somebody to ICANN and the whole Policy Development Process, there's a document drafted on that, and to serve as a link, a liaison, and to introduce us into the topic and the process. We ask ALAC to give us the document to read in about this matter and then better participate. I don't know whether this is clear.

Fatimata: I think it's a proposal that already had been made and that had been taken note of. Yes. So on a practical basis, we should go on to ask for volunteers for the constituencies group, is that it? Is that it, Didier?

Didier: At-Large already has a liaison with all constituencies. Instead of replicating or duplicating roles in that regard, we should use already existing liaisons and not repeat or reinvent be it somebody from Africa, [inaudible 2:04:13] or whatever will do his job and will make a contribution on a given topic.

Interpreter: There are several mics on at the same time.

Didier?: Yes, it's on the liaison persons. I think we should use already existing individuals, and we also need a self-assessment system and to enhance ALSes' participation. Self-assessment would help us to assess and evaluate our participation on the basis of certain criteria, either above or below the criteria.

Fatimata: Yes. Yes. Thank you for that proposal. I think that it's an excellent proposal, to use already existing resources in ALAC. But it's also good to have volunteers that are willing to work with those liaison resources because this is taking advantage of their capacities and it would be excellent that we also have Africans that have a good command of the topics to... For example, if we're going to have regional meetings, if that is accepted, it would be excellent that we have experts, regional experts on the various topics. So I think it's an excellent proposal and it's always good to have volunteers.

So this means this will help us. Even if we don't know much about a certain topic, that's what comes to mind, and this is a liaison resource by constituency, somebody working with ALAC will be our focal point resource.

Unknown: Yes. On the first proposal that was made... [pause]

Male: [I was 2:06:25] waiting for her to finish. I want to say that there already are liaison resources, but we should prepare and work on an African position.

Didier?: No, no, no. You spoke about liaison resources to keep everybody abreast and informed on certain issues and that people that are going to attend a meeting be informed, and then we're going to go into the decision issues.

Male: Yes. But the individual that will prepare an African position, an African stance.

Didier?: We have to do that together. But we simply have to be informed and that everybody be informed about what we're going to speak at a meeting. And the individuals will... these liaison individuals, the ALSes already participate. When we were asked to fill out a form for the topics, there were at least four African ALSes that never received it and they said, "No, I didn't even know about it." So we, the ALSes, first have to make sure that we can participate, and if we think that we can't participate... Well, I didn't follow that issue and I dare say no I can't speak on that issue. And maybe somebody else can.

Fatimata: Didier, thank you. Thank you. I think we really should wrap up this issue. So what are we going to write in our notes? To use already existing resources in ALAC and that we also have volunteers that will work in contact with these resources so that the volunteers introduce the debate and have a common African stance. Everybody agrees on that? Yes? No?

Male: No, because we cannot move right away to the conclusion. We have these people to do what? The decision will be made collectively.

Fatimata: The decision will be made collectively, but we will have one person responsible for each constituency. We will have the ALAC decision. They will give us the information. The link with ALAC will give us the information. There will be one person who will say, "This day of the meeting, I propose that we speak of the GNSO," and we will not necessarily have to ask... If for example we want Alan, if Alan is not available, then the person will be there present in order to introduce the debate and that we discuss this together. They will moderate over the discussion and it will be the promotion of capacity building so that we can come to decisions and to further strengthen the participation. Do you agree? Most of you, I want to know if you agree with this.

Who is in agreement? Who agrees with what was just said? The definition of someone who is going to work... We have to appoint someone. This is what we're saying, where someone can offer to be volunteer in order to work with the ALAC as a link by constituency – one link by constituency.

So we will have the constituency AFRALO that will work with ALAC in order to not reinvent the wheel, in order to come or work with us for capacity building.

Your comments, do they have to do with this?

Interpreter: No microphone. I'm sorry, but they're not using a microphone.

Khaled?: We are discussing the details that can be discussed within the framework of the working group.

Fatimata: Khaled, we have the possibility of holding a face-to-face meeting today and I would like to take advantage of this opportunity in order to move quickly on these decisions and not to leave them until you discuss them in your group.

Okay. Yes, if you want. But for us, as well as for everybody else, it is important and maybe we should continue?

Male: In one or two minutes, Didier, we can speak of these links because as I was saying, we'll make a decision within ALAC, or within [GAC 2:10:48], and we don't really understand what is going on. Didier can speak of one of these links, saying that maybe it is not necessary to have volunteers who will no longer be volunteers. I want Didier to explain a little more how this is going to affect us.

Didier: Here it was said that we will hold meetings or sometime we attend meetings and we don't know what goes on. It is very serious and today we come here and Pierre has asked us why we have these ALSes, why we come from the ALSes. I don't know whether he's pleased, but it seems to me that we should put things in black and white [inaudible 2:11:28]. If people are not informed, in order for them to be informed they should read. If you don't know how to read, then you leave. You learn how to read a minimum of readings and you find out what this whole thing is about. After that, if you don't understand what the whole thing is about, then the ALAC link can make a brief summary on the topic. I don't find the usefulness of creating bureaucracies. There are problems in civil society as well call them, they are words that we love to [inaudible 2:12:01], but it is precisely on these words that we get lost and we don't know who and what.

But I will take it a step further: What is our legitimacy here? What are our credentials here? We can hear what each one of the members has to say and that's the most we can do. Each one represents your own association. So let us try to be efficient and to do things that can't be done without extending things too much, because the way things stand now, they don't work. If our volunteers are not working today, how do you want them to work tomorrow?

Male: Well, simply to respond to Didier, I agree with you, but we're not trying to create new positions or new seats or new constituencies within the framework of AFRALO. We're trying to designate people who would be the links with the constituency, but I don't think that the current liaisons [very like 2:12:58] or will be interested in giving their time to AFRALO. Sincerely, we cannot ask the liaison of ALAC, GNSO for example, to give from their time more time to work with AFRALO more than foreseen. The liaison, when one is appointed a

liaison, you act as liaison for ALAC, not for your continent. So the liaison works with everybody and the links that they have. AFRALO is part of ALAC.

Didier: Okay, that's what I was saying. We have to clear as to what the whole thing is about and I'm hearing that the ALAC will prepare a report for everybody. They will prepare a summary on the situation and then we will circulate the summary.

Fatimata: Thank you, Didier.

Currently we are discussing how AFRALO can provide inputs vis-à-vis the PDP. That's in fact the issue at stake and we're trying to see what is the way to be followed in order to get there. We speak of monthly meetings and we spoke currently of how to proceed with the monthly meetings. We said that we were going to do that by topic, by theme... Okay, and we're going to do that by consensus. And let us assume – and I gave you an example previously – I agree in taking documents that have already been prepared by the liaisons, that we read them, that we prepare. And, for example, if we are to designate someone that will take care of the problems in order to come, work, and be the lead so that we can get to know the inputs and put them together, that's what I'm proposing – to simply put the inputs together. I understand your point – you're saying that we don't need these volunteers or that volunteers simply offer to do that.

Male: We're not taking volunteers. I'm just saying... I'm asking myself... Because this is good, let's take a look at the past. What have we done so far? Well, you said [there's a 2:15:05] [inaudible], you mentioned specific things, and to do things that can work. But it seems to me that we're not making very significant progress as regards the monthly meetings. [Rachida said 2:15:18] that it was very simple. These monthly meetings, we said simply imagine having them once every two months because everybody else has their own concerns and activities, and preparing the meeting is much more expensive. Sometimes it takes you half a day to prepare a one-hour meeting.

I would ask that we don't make things much more heavy, that we have simple things, that we try to be efficient with simple things. When one tries to be efficient with simple things, then we avoid trying to complicate things more.

Fatimata: What are you proposing specifically?

Male: Well, what I'm proposing in connection with the meetings is that we, each one of us should read what takes place in connection with the meetings. That's all.

Fatimata: No, I'm asking, the problem that we have nowadays is how to bring in our point of view to the PDP.

Male: Well, in order to contribute that, we have to read what goes on, simply contribute with your point of view as to what goes on with the PDP.

Fatimata?: The PDP does not participate in the conferences. I'm asking for a specific recommendation in order to give our point of view so that we can work together. The recommendation that you're making is simply that of saying "Let's use the document that are created by the ALAC links and that we're going to read the documents." We know that this is not going to work.

But wait, no, we know that there's a problem. We know that there are a couple of problems and we're attempting to find specific solutions in order that problem. That's all. And what you're proposing is okay. We all agree in saying that this is an excellent idea, and we modified the proposal by Aziz in connection with this, but this doesn't go all the way to the end. No?

We have Pierre that has been raising his hand for some time, so we have other speakers who want to refer to this and I'd like to hear them because it's always the same who speak.

Pierre?: I was waiting, Madame Chair, to make my comments. It is not a proposal as I said previously, and I understand why they have difficulties in proposing, when we're waiting and people just say, "Well, this will not work," and I think they're right. We had a lot of African meetings within this framework, and where do we go? And therefore we had people responsible who were appointed, who were self-appointed, and that's why they're trying to come back to this proposal.

It seems to me that... Pierre and others have said it, we have to do our homework. Why is this not working? We've said already at the level of each [SLA 2:18:08], what do we need in order to continue? Do this work, first and foremost. Yes, we do have links and we have liaisons. We're going to create other levels of links and that is going to work, and that is why they said we have to read. Everything is on the site, on the website of ICANN. Everything

is very clear. They've made efforts in order to include it in French and the different languages. It is just a matter of reading things. That's why it is important.

The proposal perhaps could be that we establish a bureau of people who are a bit more knowledgeable about these affairs.

I don't believe in only taking the African position. Things are very simple. The individuals who understand, who are involved in this field, they're interested and then they propose. But if we restrict this to the Africans, there are people who know more than others, who are more knowledgeable about this than others, and then they can articulate a position very quickly. But what you're saying in establishing liaisons, that's quite heavy I believe.

Fatimata: Pierre, you made a comment. You did not make a proposal.

Pierre: I don't have a proposal to make. I believe I was clear with that.

Fatimata: Well, who's going to make the proposal?

Pierre?: Well, I'm going along the same lines as Didier. It is a proposal. I didn't finish what I was saying. Didier is going to send the list of e-mails. Didier is going to send us by e-mail the contact of these liaisons. This is a work that I'm asking him. So he's going to send us all the contacts of these liaisons, and once we have that information we are going not to ask for volunteers, we're going to appoint people who will be efficient. Each one of us will receive a list and then we will ask for volunteers or for people who want to support that work. Who do we propose as volunteers in order to support that work within the framework of AFRALO? That is my proposal.

Fatimata: Is this proposal accepted? It is not clear?

Pierre?: It is not clear. I want to clarify, thanks. This means that if we go to the site of ICANN, we can do that, but since we have time restrictions, then by e-mail, Didier is going to send us an e-mail with the contact information on those liaisons. Once we have that contact information and once we find out the different liaisons that we have, then if I find that we have these liaisons and then there's a constituency that is of interest to me, I will support that

constituency within AFRALO, saying that I will be volunteer, and then the group will react on this. That is my proposal.

Fatimata: Yes, that's very well. Gabriel?

Gabriel: Thank you. I apologize for going back to this, but when our friend spoke of the working group, this has to do with a question that was raised by Pierre, and if we don't have a good command of a lot of things in ICANN then we have to establish working groups in order to deal with this before acting as a liaison. Well, a liaison proposes to ICANN, but the other members from Africa, how do we deal with this situation? I believe that we can have groups that cannot propose to ICANN but have a good command of the situation at our level, we can establish working groups. And someone might take a topic so that others can have a good command of this, and that is vis-à-vis independently with ICANN you have a good command of the situation to start pushing things in Africa.

Fatimata: Yes, I believe that this is what we said. There are those who did not agree, but now there's a sort of compromise solution, and this takes me back to the suggestion that I made previously in my summary. I go back to the proposal made by Didier, and people who would be volunteers, Didier is going to send us a list with the ALAC contacts, people who would like to be volunteers in order to work on these issues and have a capacity-building. This is what we have.

So I will summarize. Now we have three working groups, if I dare say. One working group that is only Hawa, I believe, only made up by Hawa. We'll come back to this. And there's another working group. Yes, it is sort of a participation in general that people self-criticize themselves. And the other is [is the 2:23:12] [inaudible] Khaled group and another one with Michel for capacity building. In parallel to this, we will have the work that Didier will begin by sending the list of contacts, and on that list give us the information of people within ALAC that can act as liaisons. Do we agree?

And I have one announcement before I give the floor Khaled. There's Stacy who is here as a member of the staff, the ALAC staff, because on this point we included AFRALO people, At-Large, a discussion on the means.

Interpreter: No microphone, no microphone.



Female: It is information by the person responsible to look after this respect by the office, registration office. When I received this note for me, it was Stacy, our Stacy from the staff who should address us as to the means that should be put in place in order to strengthen participation. I believe that we've depleted more or less at this point, we've exhausted this [conservation 2:24:28] of agenda item 4, what became 4, 4 and 5 of our agenda.

And I will now give the floor to Khaled before we go on to the following session. But perhaps we will need for an introduction of this item before we give the floor to Stacy.

So Khaled has the floor.

Khaled: I simply wish to remind you that Didier made a significant recommendation which is that of creating an assessment system, an evaluation system for ALSes for that participation, and we should take it into account because in fact we do need a matrix that will assess the participation of each ALS. If not, we will never be able to assign responsibilities to the different people if we cannot assess them.

Fatimata: Thank you. Didier offered this recommendation. We should do that the staff to include the Doodle so that we can come to an agreement on the meeting that will attract the largest number of members, and Africa was already done. But since we've expanded the number, perhaps we will ask them to use the Doodle system. This is one.

And secondly, since the assessment will be done online, we will also ask them to provide us a system in order to create an evaluation of the participation or to have a different idea.

Male: Yes, I'd like to recall the two points that you mentioned. One is capacity building and Khaled's proposal, Khaled's working group which is on participation.

Fatimata: That is on participation. In fact, it is a participation of ALSes, AFRALO in decision-making. So it is participation. That is the way we summarize it. ALS participation. And then we have Hawa's working group, so we have three working groups.

There's something that we have to discuss later on and it has to do with the topic... Not a side-conference, please. No side-conferences, please. So Michel and Hawa. Yes, please.

Hawa's working group. What is your group is about?

Interpreter: No microphone for Hawa.

Fatimata: What prevents each ALS from participating? What do they need in order to participate?

Michel?: Each one has to [comment 2:26:58] their difficulties. What are the difficulties in order to participate? Each one has to describe what they're facing, the difficulties they face.

Fatimata: Yes, the report will be prepared later on and everybody will see it. That will be very helpful.

Tijani?

Tijani: We should support the recommendation of the working group on involvement or participation. What do you call it? Participation. And involvement as well.

Fatimata: Didier? That we support the recommendations of the working group on participation. In agreement?

Gabriel, and after that we will give the floor to Stacy. Stacy, first of all, let us give the floor to you, Stacy.

Well, we're saying welcome, Stacy. We'd like to thank you for being kind enough to join us this morning.

Male: If you need interpretation, if you need headsets before Stacy speaks... Stacy will speak in English so you need headsets, so please...

[French – 2:28:09 to 2:28:25]

Fatimata?: ...[-hamed] is not online. We have Nick.

Female: Please get some headsets. You need headsets for the interpretation. Nick is online, he's also on the chat. It is [inaudible]... Nick. Oh, Nick. Matthias is recording Nick. Okay? Okay?

Female: No, we have one English speaker, so she will do it in English. One person has the headset.

Gisella?: [cuts out] ...speaking French, speaking English, the interpreters are going to be speaking French but we're going to put it on loud. And George, if you can just use your...

[French – 2:29:03 to 2:29:13]

Fatimata: [English] Let's try.

Gisella: [English] Okay.

Fatimata: [English] And if it doesn't work, we just, we'll take the [inaudible 2:29:17].

Interpreter: It would be better if you take headsets. Headsets is much better. It will create feedback.

[French – 2:29:23 to 2:30:01]

Gisella: [English] Stacy, how long is this going to be?

Stacy: [English] 15 minutes.

Gisella: [English] Okay.

[French – 2:30:05]

Fatimata: [English] 15 minutes including Q&A? Hello?

Stacy: [English] I'll make it short.

Fatimata: [English] Alright. Thank you.

[French – 2:30:14 to 2:30:29]

Female: [English] Yes, so let's start. Stacy?

Stacy: [English] Ladies and gentlemen, bonjour.

Thank you for having me. My name is Stacy Burnette, and I am the Director of Contractual Compliance for the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers. Today I am going to speak to you about ICANN's contractual compliance program.

Is translation taking place?

Fatimata: We cannot hear the translation into English. Everybody... Yes, everybody should be wearing headsets.

Interpreter: No, there would be feedback. There would be feedback if it goes through the speakers.

Stacy: [English] Shall I continue?

Fatimata: [English] Yeah, go ahead, please. Thank you.

Stacy: [English] I am going to speak to you briefly about ICANN's contractual compliance program. As most of you know – I'm sure all of you know – ICANN has agreements with registrars that offer domain name registration services, and ICANN has contracts with over 950 ICANN-accredited registrars to offer domain name registration services.

And so I want to share with you what the Contractual Compliance department does with regard to those entities that offer domain name registration services. As I said, there are approximately 950 ICANN-accredited registrars, and 16 registries, and we have contracts with all of these companies. And it's the Contractual Compliance department's responsibility to ensure that these entities comply with their contractual terms. And so to do that, we conduct contract audits, we manage a complaint system – and the complaint system is a huge source for ICANN to determine what community members are reporting as noncompliance concerning these contracts. We also manage a Whois Data Problem Report System where the public can report Whois data inaccuracy. And Whois information is very important in determining who has registered a domain name and if you want to contact that person or entity to report some problem with a website, you need the Whois information, and it is important that that information is accurate.

And so some of the things the Contractual Compliance department has been doing over the past two years since its inception, because it's a very new department within ICANN, is to redevelop our Whois Data Problem Report System, which is the system the public uses to report Whois inaccuracies. We've also reached out to registrars all over the world to try to assist them in understanding their contract terms. And we've hired additional staff to help us carry out our responsibilities.

Oh, I'm going backwards. I'm sorry.

And what I wanted to share with you was this graph that depicts where most of the registrars are located in the world. And as you can see, for the African region, there are only three ICANN-accredited registrars currently operating. One is in South Africa, one is in Senegal, and I just tried to e-mail my colleague to find out the country where the other registrar... No?

Male: Burundi. [inaudible 2:34:26] Burundi?

Male: [inaudible]

Female: [inaudible]

Stacy: [English] Is it Burundi? [cuts out] Okay.

And so what this depicts... I think it would be great if more registrars became accredited in the Africa region, because if people are interested in buying domain names and starting websites in the Africa region, you think they would want to use an African-located registrar. And so it would be important to have more registrars located in this region.

And what we're trying to do is conduct outreach so that parties interested in becoming an ICANN-accredited registrar can learn what can be done so that you can become accredited and offer registration services. And it's my understanding that an upcoming ICANN meeting will be held in 2010 in the Africa region, and we're going to have a workshop on how to become an ICANN-accredited registrar at that ICANN meeting in 2010 so that we can increase the numbers in this area.

And so some of the other work that we are working on right now includes other measures to ensure that these parties comply with their agreements,

and we recently published a Contractual Compliance Report that details all of the work that the Contractual Compliance department has done over the past six weeks... six months, and I would encourage you to go to this website. I will forward these slides to the Chair and she can share it with your entire group, and at your leisure you can review our Contractual Compliance Report to get valuable information and perhaps share it with parties that you know of that may be interested in becoming an ICANN-accredited registrar.

So that concludes my presentation. If there are any questions...

Fatimata: [English] Thank you very much, Stacy. Very brief and very good. Excellent. Thank you.

Questions: Khaled, Rachida, Pierre.

Khaled: [English] Do you want questions in French or in English? [laughs]

Stacy: [English] I would prefer English.

Khaled: [English] Okay. In fact, I have two questions.

Stacy: [English] Okay.

Khaled: [English] One of them related to the introduction of new gTLD. What are the expected compliance process that you will [do 2:37:15] to have after the [inaudible] of the expected thousand or more of new gTLD? This is the first.

Stacy: [English] Can I answer that one first and then we... [overtalking]?

Khaled: [English] Yeah, please.

Stacy: [English] Because we're not sure how many applications will come in to ICANN for new gTLDs nor are we sure how many will be approved – it could be between 5 and 5000 or more – and so the Contractual Compliance department realizes that we will need to increase our staff and increase our computer operations to handle the compliance work that's needed to ensure that those registries comply with their contractual obligations.

And so right now we're conducting an analysis to determine how many more additional resources we'll need if we get 1 to 50 approved applications, 50 to 100, 100 to 500. And depending on the number of applications that come in,

we're going to make decisions immediately about how many additional people to bring in. Does that answer your question?

Khaled: [English] My second question is related to your outreach activity to get more interest from the region. I have been involved with many times in evaluating some business models for registrar in the region, and we found that the registrar model actually is not a very good business for our region because the barrier, the financial barrier to enter to the registrar activity is very high, first of all. Second, the industry is already very highly [concurrential 2:39:09]... competitive. [I say] that any registrar from the region will not [as sufficient] and as [performant] to be competitive [to good ID] and to sell domain names as [lowest non good ID]. So I think that the number of three registrar from the Africa region is not a factor that we say that we need to increase it. So in that sense there is no need to have more registrars from the region.

Stacy: [English] That sounds like a comment as opposed to a question.

Fatimata: Rachida?

Rachida: Well, just... Just to follow what Khaled said. In the current economic context, is ICANN considering reviewing its rates? Because that is precisely the obstacle, why there are only three registrars, because the rates are way too high. Ten thousand dollars as an admission, an entry fee, and then royalties and what have you – it's huge in view of the volume of business that registrars have on a daily basis. It's almost undoable. It's way too high.

Fatimata: Pierre, thank you.

Pierre: [English] [I will ask 2:40:31] [inaudible] my questions [inaudible] to the one by Khaled. At the entry level and how much money that you have to pay, and that was an issue for the Africans and in the past actually. I'm quite glad that you will be conducting some outreach, you know, activities in Africa in 2010. Is there any way one could eventually have an idea of how the two or three or African registrars have been behaving in terms of applying to the [inaudible 2:41:04] contractual compliance? I don't know whether that's something you can just tell us about. You know, how have they been really behaving in that regards? And I just...

Stacy: [English] Shall I answer that?

Pierre: [English] Yeah.

Stacy: [English] We haven't had any contractual compliance issues with the African registrars that we have right now.

Pierre: [English] Okay.

Stacy: [English] So that's good news.

Pierre: [English] Is that a diplomatic...?

Stacy: [English] That's the truth. That's the diplomatic response and that's the truth.

Pierre: [English] [laughs] Okay.

Stacy: [English] Sometimes those are two different things. [laughs]

Pierre: [English] Okay. Let's stick to the entry level, not kind of the 50K at some time that you have to disburse at one time or whatever. If...

Female: [inaudible 2:41:38]

Pierre: [English] Okay. So if the new sort of regime we are having, the new sort of [TLDs] we are going to have, is that going to make any difference? Is this going to, I mean, bring down, you know, the entry level, because this is an issue for us?

Stacy: [English] I have not heard any discussions regarding the entry fees for becoming an ICANN-accredited registrar coming down. However, it is my understanding that as of June 2009 any official ICANN stakeholder group can initiate a PDP, a Policy Development Process, regarding any issue, and perhaps that's an issue that this group should raise. There are barriers to entry for certain registrars located in certain regions, and perhaps some type of lower entry fees should be considered based on hardship. That's an idea.

Fatimata: [English] Thank you very much. I think that's a good idea, and I think... I would ask for the... for...

[group applause]

Fatimata: [English] ...to thank Stacy.



We are a little bit running behind time and we have the pleasure to have Cheryl, Vanda, and who else, again?

Female: [inaudible]

Male: [inaudible]

Fatimata: [Robert 2:43:14]...

Gisella: [English] [Vanda and Heggy], they're on their way.

Fatimata: [English] They're on their way? They're not yet here?

Okay. So I think we should now go on and work on our program. Stacy, thank you very much.

Stacy: [English] Thank you so much for having me.

Fatimata: [English] And if we have any further questions, then we will send you e-mails, and I hope it will be possible for you to send us a reply. Thank you very much. Bye.

[French] Coming back, I'm going back into French. I think this was an interesting proposal we just heard. That is quite appropriate. Pierre, could you maybe work on that? To develop a PDP in order to lower the entry fees to have new African registrars admitted?

Pierre?: No, just a moment, just a moment. I'm carrying an economic study, an assessment on this market as it stands today. The market is so competitive that the added value for African registrars, there is no added value because the name of a domain at minimum price is for registrant. So to compete with all of the entailed costs, added costs will not offset any activity. It's not going to be offset by the activities. So in my opinion, this is not a true problem, it's a false problem.

Fatimata: Thank you. You're right. Maybe today. But maybe you're somewhat too pessimistic regarding Africa. I don't think that the number of users will stop there and the number of applications be stagnant. No, let's allow others to speak on this. Didier and who else? Who else? Yes, Didier.

Didier: I think there are two new registrars, but they did go through great pains in order to meet the conditions. Kheweul started two or three years ago and they started because there is an interest, and if we want to find out if there's more interest in the region, if there is no interest, well, that's it.

Male: Well, that's the issue. It's still worthwhile. Even if we don't think it'll work out, well, try out the waters. We know that there are many problems for registrars, but we have to try it out. We should make some sort of an assessment, an evaluation or something.

Fatimata: Well, thank you. Thank you very much.

We... I can't see where we are right now in the agenda. Yes, this is a continuation. Where... Well, there's one item that we skipped, but that doesn't show on the end.

Male: It's further up, where?

Fatimata: No, it's number 7 now.

Male: It used to be number 4 and now it's 7.

Female: Yes, 7.

Fatimata: Yes, it's become 7. Very well then. We're then on item 7, to discuss forming an AFRALO executive committee, and Khaled has the floor.

Khaled: I remember that we discussed this at one of the teleconference and we said we should have something for AFRALO and guidelines. And before we appoint an executive committee, we should start with the bylaws, a document that somehow organizes our institution. I already have a draft that I would be happy to send you right after the meeting, a draft for bylaws. I didn't have a chance to do so before. I apologize for this omission. As Yaovi said, I just took examples from other RALOs and others that already much more ahead in organizing themselves.

In getting to organized, first we have to decide two things: to have bylaws and then decide on whether we're going to register as an independent organization or not. These two issues are linked to each other and will call for a work strategy that is different from what we are doing at present. If we are

going to be a new organization, then we need bylaws that state that we will have an executive committee and the executive committee in turn will have to find financing sources, meet once yearly in an independent way from ICANN. And if we decide that we don't need an independent organization and register as such, then it's something else and the bylaws would then have to specify that.

So I think that first we should agree on the principal issues and then decide whether we want to register or not and what are the stages we have to go through. And it's up to you, the decision is up to you.

Fatimata: Thank you. Who wants to take the floor? Didier and Yaovi.

Didier: Thank you. I think that in terms of organization, and Khaled has raised two issues, I'm in favour of the second alternative, that we keep the existing formula with ICANN and to specific very exactly what AFRALO expects from the existing committee. And if we go for the second alternative, we could have a little bit more progress.

Fatimata?: Seconded.

Yaovi?: When could we have your draft document? When do you think you could send it?

Khaled: Today. Today.

Fatimata: Anything else? Any more questions? Hawa?

Hawa: I definitely support Didier's position.

Fatimata: Is there any other proposal or counterproposal?

Female: No. I really think we should define what is the description of the mandate of all of us within the scope of the current structure.

Yaovi?: We have three members in the ALAC, and since we have these three members, the three members and the Secretariat could maybe specify more precisely what has to be done and there would be some progress. If we want to register the AFRALO organization, we can do so with a recognized formula that ICANN has for this purpose. Sometimes there have been some problems

of how to work with recognized structures and so maybe we could benefit from the experience of others and to be have an effective model that will help us.

Fatimata: Well, maybe we need to be a little more mature.

Unknown: We need to grow up, maybe.

Fatimata: No, no, no. Mature in terms of activities. Yes, we've been around for two years. Yes, please, please, please, one single meeting if you please. We were created as an organization, but today we've all noticed that we are not as effective as it should be. And when I speak about maturity, that is what I refer to, that everybody be involved, engaged, and make a contribution and keep abreast of what is happening and going on in ICANN.

Tijani?

Tijani: A question. Is there any interest in getting us registered as an independent organization? Is anybody interested in that?

Fatimata: Khaled?

Khaled: Well, the only interest, the only benefit in organizing and registering as an independent organization would be to recover some funds, to obtain funds outside of ICANN. It's up to you if we're going to have any activities beyond what ICANN finances. To meet once a year as the AFRALO organization, we would need financial resources, and to get that sort of financial support we need a minimum of organization. But if you say, "No, we don't need to meet once a year and let's just stay as we are under the umbrella of ICANN and depend on whether they will organize a meeting every two years or three years," do you have any idea of when the next general assembly of AFRALO will be? You don't have an idea?

We'll never know because we're not able to organize ourselves. So the question is are we going to get organized? Or we organize ourselves as an independent organization within the framework of... We in truth don't exist. We only have the Memorandum of Understand to fall back on that was signed with ICANN, and that is the document that is the basis for our existence within

the ICANN space. But outside of ICANN we don't exist. We don't have the possibility of discussing with any other interlocutor other than ICANN.

So these are just ideas and it's up to you to decide what is best for us, what is fitting for us and what we don't need.

Fatimata: Very well, Khaled. I think that is quite a fitting description, and with the bylaws and everything else, new ideas will surely crop up and we will be able to go in one direction or the other.

Khaled?: But the bylaws cannot switch from one strategy to another. If we're going to get organized as an independent organization, we need a different set of bylaws.

Fatimata: Yes. Yes, Pierre?

Pierre: I think this is a very important issue, and Khaled, we need your document. It would be great to have your document. It's a very important aspect that was raised. We also have to resort to other sources of financing. Every time we speak of a meeting, we have to be dependent on what ICANN does, but we should do something at the African level and we should have a clear idea if whether we want to be independent or not and whether we need to work further on this. And I would also like to get involved in this matter.

Fatimata: Thank you. Yaovi... And I just want to clarify something together with you. Who will represent us? I believe it's known. No, who will represent the working groups with Khaled and Michel and Hawa? Yes, those are three. Those are the individuals that will be doing everything.

Well, yes, three topics. And then we have the other topics too.

So very quickly because we already have guests that are waiting and we don't want to keep them waiting.

Yaovi?: There's one issue where maybe we could continue sharing ideas. When we speak of members of At-Large... [pause] So when we speak of members of At-Large, we say that this is a users' community, but the At-Large community is ALS. In this one, I wanted to speak about this, but then we adopted a common stance. I wanted to revisit this. Maybe we should keep it in mind for the future, that we consider and ponder on the quality level of AFRALO

members. Now we have the chapters and individuals that also are members. Should we consider, in the future maybe, there will have in AFRALO individual members. It's simply food for thought, for future consideration. I come back to this idea. It's a structure, and do we have to always through structures or could we have individual members? It's just a suggestion.

Fatimata: Yes. Thank you. Didier?

Didier: Initially there were no structures. We only had individual members. It didn't work for five or six years and that is why we fell back on the structures.

Fatimata: Yes. And I think we now give our floor to our Chairperson. Cheryl is here – a very effective chairperson, elegant, and with a lot of flair.

[group applause]

Fatimata: So five minutes to tell us about the budget, Cheryl, all yours. You have the floor.

Vanda, yes, she's here. Vanda, Vice-Chairperson of ALAC, and she's joined us with Cheryl to speak about budgetary items, right? You have the floor.

Who will start off? Is it Cheryl? You've got the mic in your hand, right?

Cheryl: Thank you.

[English] That's all I can say. That's my limit...

Fatimata: [English] That's enough. Thank you.

Cheryl: [English] ...I can say "thank you." I always believe at least if you can say thank you, you're getting somewhere in any community.

It really is only a five-minute advertorial from both Vanda as not just Vice-Chair, my Vice-Chair in the ALAC, but as someone who's got a great deal of experience coming from Board in the budget and finance committees and the audit committees that we want to introduce. Can you step in front of all of us? Are you going to be offended if I do that? I just like the spotlight, what can I say. [laughs]

This document, which you should all have had copies, in English and – I'd go down on bended knee, but I couldn't get back up – I am sorry on behalf of all of us that it is only in English. It will be coming in French. Or it is in French? If French is here, thank you, thank you, thank you, thank you, thank you. That is so important that these important documents come out in languages which are useful to us all. And you know that people like Vanda and I and the staff are constantly fighting for that. Me in particular because I don't even speak English.

Now in this document is a wealth of information, none of which will tell you how much money is spent on us. [laughs] Go figure. We will continue to ask, pursue, beg, plead, bang tables to get those breakdown figures, but we don't have them yet. So this is an opportunity. All problems are opportunities, are they not? We're just going to take advantage of this. And it is our opportunity right now, not only as ALAC but as EURALO, AFRALO, APRALO, NARALO, every RALO to look at this and say, "Great. Where can my region benefit by putting in a request or a suggestion?" Look at how they break up the money and say, "Well, regional funding, which we [could get with 3:00:25], can we have?" [inaudible] list. Do an "ICANN should" list. Okay?

Take that lower. You might have a group of ALSes that would have a subregional activity that they might be interested... You might want to have your subregional or regional IGF equivalent. Put your requests in now. Make your statements about travel now. Then we'll try and fight and find exactly where they fit in to whose budget. Okay?

It's just an advertorial to say that it is something that each ALS should be responding to. When these things come out, they put them out for everyone to read. It's our job to make sure you know they're there, but it's your job to respond. Okay?

Vanda?

Vanda: [English] Yes. Well, I just got like you the same paper, so I'm not deeply involved on that. But it's very interesting to spend some time going through the old budgets to understand what the money comes from and where it is spent. And most important is to take a look, what the programs are they intend to expend.

If you got the page 17, you're going to have point 9, "Global Engagement and Increased International Participation." So if you take a quick look on that, the only acronym that we will find is "GAC." So we need to make some suggestions on ALAC, on At-Large community in this kind of issue, because the budget is defined exactly where they are. We need to have a clear explanation, especially for the audit committee, where they intend to spend the money and then afterwards where they have spent the [money planned 3:02:40].

So that's one good opportunity to discuss with the ALS and think about programs that inside the ICANN mandate should be done to global engagement and increased international participation. So it's one suggestion, you can go deeply on that and find out all the places where... all the programs that you, you know, get some better conditions for your community to participate could be add in any of those amounts of money, all those items in this program.

So this is budget, and one more issue. It's let's remember that the last two years, we had growing figures, about 27-28% a year. [Due to the crisis 3:03:49], the planning budget, it's about 5 or 6-7% only. Do they expect it not to grow during the international crisis?

Second, this budget is not considering the new gTLD, so maybe you're going to have in the next semester or fiscal year starting in January, we're going to have probably a 1 or 2% more in the budget. Okay?

This is just an overview. We haven't had time to go deeply on that, but please do and give some advice to include that. Thank you.

Cheryl: [English] And remember, that advice can come up as a piece of RALO advice, it can come to the ALAC to become part of our ALAC advice. And remember, the ALAC advises the Board. Alright? You get to advise ICANN in total. There is an advantage. And your ALSes can go directly with the comments... The public comment period is now open. The community comment period is now open. So you get three bites at the cherry. I only get one. Make good use of that.

Be on notice though, for the current travel planning budget that we will now live with, I agree with the principle that all of the Supporting Organizations and



Advisory Committees should be treated equally. What is disappointing is they – and we are the smallest committee, of 15 – they have not used us as the lowest common denominator. They have said you can have half of your constituency number and all your NomComs. Which means we have to decide from now on which two ALAC members can't be funded to travel.

So it's important that we comment on things. Now we're like to get that changed. I'll also be organizing for a purpose to discuss the budget call with Doug Brent and with Kevin Wilson, and I will take the advice of your executive as to whether you would want that to be just a regional or whether you want to have it part of a larger, multiregional meeting. But decide that and get back to me.

Yes, and I'll take a question from Khaled and then Hawa. Go ahead.

Khaled: [English] Thank you, Cheryl, for that, but I'm also happy to know the constituency support breakdown [a lot 3:06:28], because I would be happy to know [this 6.8 change] from 2009 to 2010 to each constituency [will go]. Naturally it will be for the ALAC constituency.

Cheryl: [English] [laughs] You and me both. Can I indulge myself, just to make my life easier, quite simply? Rather than relying on my reasonably good memory to remember to bring that up with our meeting with Doug, can I get you to put that in perhaps as a formal list once you've had your discussions? Because these are exactly the questions we can give Doug to say, "Come with the answers because this is what you're going to be asked."

Go ahead, Hawa.

Hawa: Thank you, Cheryl, for this presentation and for giving us a chance to participate and make comments on the budget. I wanted to know until when can we send in our comments? When is the deadline to receive comments and feedback?

Cheryl: [English] It would be 30 days from yesterday or the day before. It might...

Vanda: [English] May 17.

Cheryl: [English] May 17. Thank you. Thank you. I've got my own voice so loudly in my own ears, I couldn't hear everyone else speaking to me. I'm going to hand

back to Madame Chair, but I might remind Madame Chair that the day ticks on and perhaps Madame Chair might need to be more forceful with her gavel. [laughs]

Thank you for your indulgence and do have a very good rest of General Assembly for the regional. Thank you.

Fatimata: Thank you, Cheryl. Thank you, Vanda. Bye-bye.

Okay. So we come back. Now we come back. Yes, back to French. Yes. And the budget issue. Yes. Goodbye, au revoir.

Okay. Let's first finish what we have still pendent. I think we already reached a first consensus, that is. We decided that Khaled will send us the draft bylaws that he had written and Khaled will also kick off the discussion. That's something you should have done since a long time ago. You didn't get punished, but it's pending, right? Didier, just punished you right. [laughs]

Yes. So Khaled will send the draft that he prepared and this will be amended and I hope that everybody will pitch in with a contribution and feedback, and that it not be like in the case of the list, something that will not be provided any feedback or input. We need to get to a final draft. And also in due time we will discuss any new opportunities.

Yes, the next teleconference. Yes. I have an announcement under various matters.

Tijani?

Tijani: I would like that in these draft bylaws and that we see precisely what all of the implications are for each alternative so we know exactly... Yes. Yes, in order to reach a decision.

Male: No, no, no, no. I'm sorry. Khaled will do what he said he would do, and if there's anything that we think should be added, we can add to it.

Tijani?: Yeah, we need a basic document to work on, right? Like a baseline.

Interpreter: Several comments are not being into a microphone.

Khaled?: Yes, I can do that [inaudible 3:10:29], no problem.

Fatimata: Very well then. We also took note that we need to define the role of each member. Yes, of the team, the team. Yes, of the current team.

Yes, that's it, precisely.

Male: Of the executive committee taking turns or whatever on a yearly basis.

Fatimata: Now regarding the definition of tasks, is anybody volunteering to send in a draft? I believe that in Khaled's draft, the functions will already be contained and described, so I believe we've done with that chapter. Yes?

Male: Yes, all of this based on the documents of other regions. I wanted to know simply whether it's possible to get the other documents and maybe we could have the link to those other documents so that we can look into them.

Fatimata: Yes, I think that's a good question. Michel, you had something else?

Michel: It seems to me that in this regard of this decision, there are two questions that come to mind. Do we want to formalize a process outside of ICANN or within ICANN? And we need to decide that. In order to facilitate the drafting job, we should first decide whether we want to do it within or outside.

Fatimata: Okay, you have the floor. But I thought we already started the discussion. Please. So please, I thought that we already had started the discussion. I gave my own opinion and then when Khaled said why he is proposing what he is proposing, I said it was a good proposal. Then Pierre seconded this opinion. Some gave their opinion. If there is any different opinion, but I think that everybody was in agreement. What we could do, as Tijani had said, that we speak more about the proposal, the draft that will be sent to us, but if you can give some feedback prior to that, okay, and otherwise online.

Male: I recommend two things. I will send a draft today that has to be discussed before the next teleconference, and secondly I could see if we can create a small working group just bringing together two or three people that will agree on the thoughts of, say, what are the advantages, the objections in registering, and what are those of not registering, and to have a comparative table on both the situations, the pros and cons. And then AFRALO to meet in a teleconference and decided whether yes or no, we're going to be in favour or not of a certain situation. I believe we need a comparative table.

Pierre has already volunteered to deal with that, and I would also like to offer my services to deal with that.

Fatimata: I would like to work with Khaled on the bylaws, but since it's already done, we don't have any problem with that.

I believe that we can now move on to Miscellaneous, unless there are no other proposals on 7.

Yes, Tijani very quickly, and then Hawa.

Tijani: I'm just an amateur, I'm just [a new starter 3:14:29], so I cannot give in my point of view on [where there is a void] or not. I would like to see the documents or the links to the documents, the necessary documents that would enable me to understand how this works. If we are an organization, a separate organization, if we can be at the same time a separate organization and still belong, to be in contact with ICANN so as not to have the problems that the Europeans had, if we have the source of the information, the origin of the information. The link, please, and then I will log on to that link.

Male: I will have it here.

Interpreter: Some comments are made without a microphone.

Tijani?: Very well, thank you.

Fatimata: Hawa?

Hawa: Thank you. (Hawa says). Before we conclude our consideration of this issue, this is a very important point, I would ask everybody to be active online so that we can continue our debate because we notice that when we leave, when leave Mexico, the list is dead. So I would urge you to be active as you've been active at the organization of this trip.

Fatimata?: Are we going to appoint someone to move the list? To push and to move people to do something, perhaps we can have someone who can trigger the whole process and just start moving the issue.

Khaled, please.

Khaled: In fact I have just one announcement. I don't know whether we should do it now or when we come to Miscellaneous.

Interpreter: No microphone.

Fatimata: What ALS...?

Pierre?: ISOC Benin. Very quickly, for this usually I can do it. I can get organized to be... to put my name on the list.

Fatimata: Yes, you can give your e-mail address to him and they will put it on the list.

Yes, it is under Miscellaneous. We're under Miscellaneous now already. So it is Khaled first, then Rachida, Hawa, Gabriel.

Khaled: It is an announcement that has to do with the position of the representative of AFRALO before the Nominations Committee, because in fact I was a member for two years, 2008-2009, and I don't have a right to nominate myself for a third term. So I invite people to be interested in being represented, to express their views now, and I'm here to give all my support in order to succeed in that task, because in order to be efficient with the Nominations Committee, we must have a good period at the very beginning to understand the system and understand how it works. So if anyone here wishes to take that position, to occupy that position, well, please say so now so that everybody here present can support you.

Fatimata: Yes. Yaovi, Hawa are candidates.

Male?: Hawa cannot do it.

Fatimata: Because she's already ALAC. Who else wants to be a candidate for that position?

Didier?: It seems to me it is quite complicated, but if Yaovi wants to do it, I'd be glad to support him for this. I was a member of the Nominating Committee in 2003 and it takes a lot of work. It takes a lot of work and you should be ready to spend four hours a week at least.

Fatimata: For the time being, well, yes, we will have Yaovi. Do we have any other candidate? The one here, the new ones who want to be trained, it's a good school.

The date is when?

Khaled?: We don't have a date, [etc. 3:18:44], or deadline, but we conclude our work during the meeting, ICANN's meeting in Sydney. So my last meeting with the NomCom will be in Sydney. After Sydney, they will announce that it is AFRALO's turn to announce the recruitment of new representatives. But since we're all here, then we could hear expressions of interest to start working on that, so you have the time to get trained.

Fatimata: Well, think about it. For the time being we have Yaovi. Do we have anyone else?

Khaled?: I can respond to whatever questions on how this works, that it be now or after our meeting later on. I have no problem in giving you my assistance.

Fatimata: We will move on to other Miscellaneous issues. Rachida asked for the floor.

Rachida: Yes, it is an idea that you just expressed on moving the list. Can we drop a list and for the mover of the list to be done by turns? Every one of the members can move the list for one month and then they will give a hand to the next one, and we can drop the list right away. I know who the first one is, the second one, and then we don't have any doubts as to who the moderator or the mover of the list will be, if we follow the order and then take turns.

Fatimata?: And so we have someone who will encourage and move the list and bring up matters of current interest, move the debate, push it, and that would be the role of the moderator. And then those who are not that active, we'll ask them to be more active, etc. I think this is a good idea. What do you think?

Rachida?: No, they're not policemen... If we're all policemen just trying to do things better, that's not bad. [cuts out]

Yes, I learnt the lesson of what Didier has said. I don't have a lot of time available. I will appoint one person that will represent the Moroccan structure. He speaks a lot, he has the gift of gab, so he's available, he's very efficient, and he can do a good job.

Fatimata: Well, so much the better. Thank you. And with this, with statistics and everything, he will throw stones at the garden of those who do not wish to participate. Very good, very well. That's very well. So we keep that idea. Very well. That's supported. Thank you.

You had another proposal, Gabriel, under Miscellaneous?

Gabriel: Under Miscellaneous, I'd like to go back to the three working groups that we decided to establish. I would like to hear that we are really committed and that each working group meet to decide how they're going to do their work, that we meet here before we leave. Those who are in the same working group. Others will join later, but those who are here, that we establish formally the groups and we start defining what is to be done physically. Later on we can already start the group, but take advantage of the possibility that we're here. That's all.

Fatimata: Very well. I think that the leaders of the working group can already start looking for candidates and start working right away. I don't want to organize that, you're here, you're present. That's good. That is already something that we can ask, for the work to be done.

Interpreter: No microphone.

Fatimata: Yes, in fact that completes what you said, what you proposed was to accept. And I said that the leader of the group should take advantage before leaving Mexico, and this way this will be completed because some people are not present and they could join working groups later on. So we're not excluding your proposal, simply strengthening what you said.

Any other issues under Miscellaneous? Very well. Oh no, we haven't finished. We haven't finished.

Thank you. Thank you for your words. I don't like being a policeman, but this is the only way we can arrive at results in Africa, unfortunately.

[laughs] So for the next meeting, usually the next meeting is when? Wednesday, tomorrow. But I believe that it will not be possible, unless you think otherwise, to hold a meeting tomorrow. We just held one today. Are we going to schedule the meeting for next month and that will give us sufficient

time to decide on these issues and to have things ready vis-à-vis the working groups and to really have the content? So we're going to prepare the agenda online, and once we post it we can say what we want to say. We'll have feedback from the various working groups if there's something that has already been done, etc.

Yes, I see that there's interest in that. I would suggest that we vote on the discussion after the teleconference.

Unknown: That was done already? Okay. Because I left the room for a minute. Okay. So that was done.

Fatimata: And if you don't like it, you won't see the Doodle.

Male: I voted for this second one, the one I liked, but that was not supported, so I bend to democracy.

Fatimata: Unfortunately that is always a situation, but at least one of the two...

Male: I run every day at the same time. I don't get any holidays. Is it every Wednesday?

Fatimata: Can we hold the meetings in the evenings? I was going to propose in the evening personally because I will be in the office. We said in the evening.

Interpreter: No microphone. People don't use a microphone.

Male: We don't have the pressure of work, we're relaxed, and I believe that the evening is a good idea.

Fatimata: 8-9 PM, that's a good idea. Would that be okay with you?

Male: It is almost 1 in Nairobi, or 11 o'clock in Nairobi.

Male: 8 o'clock would be 11 o'clock in Nairobi.

Female: But it is once a month.

Unknown: We can analyze the timelines in the African countries.

[overtalking, competing voices in French – 3:26:11 to 3:26:22]



Interpreter: I'm sorry. Several people at the same time, nobody using a microphone.

[overtalking, competing voices in French – 3:26:26 to 3:26:31]

Fatimata: Please, let's bring things back to order. Yes, Tijani?

Tijani: What we're trying to do is what they should do. We're going to decide online and that's it. We could simply discuss things now.

Fatimata: No, I believe this is not the right thing because we each have our limitations and that's good, it is important. Now we're going to say 8 o'clock or 9, we simply have to check. We see that 8 o'clock is dinnertime, it might be a difficult time for us, but we have to bend a little bit. We make sacrifices once a month, 8 or 9, we have the Doodle and establish communication, and then we have the invitation that will be launched automatically.

Hawa?

Hawa: When the Doodle will be launched, we have the possibility of posting comments, and if you do that, [the... there's 3:27:26] will be aware the constraints or limitations that we each might have.

Fatimata: [Hawa], do you have any other comments or any other issues to raise? I believe that I already made the announcements.

Interpreter: No microphone.

Fatimata: Yes, I already made the announcement. Do you... Any one of you is going to have lunch with the GNSO?

I don't know, maybe Gisella can tell us. Is lunch open to everybody, with the GNSO?

Gisella: It's not a real lunch, it's sandwiches from what I understand.

[group laughs]

Interpreter: No microphone for the comments.

[overtalking, competing voices in French – 3:28:15 to 3:28:21]

Gisella: It is not a big lunch. It is only a buffet.

Unknown: Yes, so we can rest a little bit.

Fatimata: So, I hope that those of you have posted your names on the list, the yellow page... Have you all placed your names on that, registered on the list, the yellow page?

[French – 3:28:49 to 3:29:00]

Fatimata: George, you haven't put the name on the list? Victor, have you done that?

Interpreter: [cuts out] ...microphone for this speaker.

Fatimata: Everything is recorded. Everything is recorded.

You took the notes, we could simply amend the notes. We have the time to draw up the minutes. If there's something that should be posted on the wiki before, please do not hesitate to do that. I will let them know.

They will send the Doodle just to be sure, because I saw images that were circulating regarding AFRALO next week at the 11th, the 11th of March. If I understand correctly, we do that and yes, we take the next date, which was April 3rd. Maybe not the 3rd. I think that it's the second Wednesday in April, the second Wednesday every month. That was what was decided. We're going to set the date also online.

I believe that if you don't have any further comments, any further points to raise, then I'd like to express my gratitude to all of you for your patience, for your tolerance of a President that can turn into a dictator when she wants, for your support, for your contributions, detailed contributions. I believe that we did excellent work today. I didn't even propose to have a coffee break. There's some that went and had some coffee. That's good, but that enabled us to concentrate into work and to truly diagnose our problems openly, frankly, and I believe that that's a huge step that we took today.

I would also like to express our gratitude to ICANN for enabling us to meet within the meeting, a meeting such as this one, a face-to-face meeting, and to having discussed what we couldn't have done online.

So thank you.

[group applause]

[French – 03:31:08 to 03:31:40]

**[End of Audio]**