YEŞIM SAĞLAM:

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to At-Large Regional Leadership call taking place on Wednesday, 14th of December 2022 at 13:00 UTC. On the call today, on our English channel we have Claire Craig, Seun Ojedeji, Natalia Filina, Amrita Choudhury, Alan Greenberg, Glenn McKnight, Augusto Ho, Jonathan Zuck, Sébastien Bachollet, and Greg Shatan, and on the Spanish channel we have Harold Arcos.

We have not received any apologies for today's calls. And I just would like to mention that Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong is joining us right now as well. From staff side, we have Heidi Ullrich, Adam Peake, Silvia Vivanco, Gisella Gruber, and myself, Yeşim Sağlam, presenting on today's call. We have Spanish interpretation providers, and our interpreters are Claudia and Veronica. However, just for information, the interpretation will only be available for the first 60 minutes due to the unavailability of the interpreters for the rest of the time. Apologies for the inconvenience.

And with this, before we get started, the final reminder is to please state your names before speaking, not only for the transcription, but also for the interpretation purposes as well, please. And with this, I would like to leave the floor over to Claire Craig. Thank you very much.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Good morning, good afternoon, good evening. My name is Claire Craig, for the record. I just want to start by welcoming everyone to this meeting, and to say that this is my first time sharing such a meeting, and

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

if I'm a little nervous, I am sure that your will give me whatever support I need. So without further ado, I know that we've been talking through the agenda a little bit, but I will just go through. My understanding is that based on what I just heard, Alan saying, we will start with a presentation by Alan talking about the rules of the individual membership, then we will get some feedback from all these RALOs.

I'm not sure how long Alan's presentation is, but this is supposed to be total of 20 minutes, all of that. And then Alan will give us a quick update on the individual mobilization implementation. Then, we talk about onboarding and welcoming of the ALSes and individuals, and this will be done by staff. We move on to talk a little bit about FY23 strategic plan. And then this is required to be completed and endorsed by the GSE team prior to applying for the CROP slot, and RALO discretionary funding. Then item seven, we move on to the FY24 additional budget proposals. And Heidi Ullrich will talk to us about that one.

We will first see the At-Large budget workspace and discuss possible Cross-RALO ABL. Item eight is the Cross-RALO plans for the ICANN76. And I'm really looking forward to hearing from you all some of the ideas that you may want to see happening for that discussion at ICANN76. Item nine, organization of the RALO coordination, and that'll be Sébastien, and then any other business from the RALO leadership. Is there anything else that anyone would like to see added to the agenda or is taken out or updated at this point in time? Okay, I'm not seeing any hands. So can we assume then that the agenda has been accepted?

Okay, we will go along with that. And I will ask Alan Greenberg to take the floor and speak to us about the rules of the individuals. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you very much, Claire. Okay, can I now have the next slide, please? The first At-Large review in 2008, among other things recommended that all RALOs have individual members at that point. Although the bylaws allow it individually, the ICANN bylaws allowed individual members only North America had at that point.

Next slide. The second At-Large review, which completed a number of years ago, it was a very controversial one, among other things, the original recommendations on the reviewers said that effectively, we should abolish all ALSes and focus only on individual members that was rejected by virtually everyone in At-Large for a number of different reasons. But there was also a recommendation, and in the end, it said we should refocus on ALSes and their members, not just representatives, and to strengthen and focus on individual members.

Next slide. A group was chartered to look at both issues or two different groups, and in particular, we're looking at right now at the individual one. It was a cross membership group, there were people appointed by the RALOs including RALO leadership, but certainly all appointed by RALOs, and ALAC member from each region. The report was issued in 2021, a long time ago, and for various reasons, very little was done on it for a while. NARALO has been the only railroad that has formally adopted the rules, and that was done in September this year, and that's the reason I'm here because I was the one who drafted those rules in accordance with the report.

Next slide, please. The criteria as set out and adopted was six different items. One is, they should have be an understanding and interest in support involved in ICANN. In other words, you're only here because you have some interests that ICANN and you're just reaffirming. Now we're not presuming that people have a knowledge, but they should have an interest. They must agree to follow the RALO rules, they must subscribe to the RALO mailing list, they must submit an At-Large statement of interest, must affirm his or her interest in learning about or participating in ICANN processes, and must not be a representative or leader of an ALS.

One minor complication is in Europe, the individual members are effectively members of an individual member ALS, and that is excluded from this. The intent is to not vote to hold to different role, hold a major role within a regular ALS. Next slide. Once you're a member, we have certain expectations, and they're not particularly onerous. You have to stay on the mailing list, keep your statement of interest up to date. If there is a potential conflict, such as membership and other within NCUC, within the GNSO, you have to declare it. There's no prohibition against having it, but it must be publicly not knowing that you have that potential conflict of interest. And you must, of course, abide by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior.

Next slide. In addition to that, individual members are encouraged to do a number of things, and I won't read them all here. But these are things that we'd like to see, this is essentially why we have members, but you can't force any given member to do any particular thing. Next slide. I'm doing this very quickly, because I'd like to leave as much time as possible for people to talk about where they are now. Now there's

two notable things that are not listed in expectations. And in some cases in the past history, they have been expectations of members.

One is there are no explicit participation of requirements. So we're not saying you must come to every monthly meeting of the RALO, or you must be a member of three PDPs or whatever. So we're being pretty easy. The next thing is, and this is one that elicited a lot of discussion in the working group, there is no prohibition against being a member of an ALS. Certainly, in some of the RALOs, maybe all, there was a rule saying if you're a member of an ALS, you can't be an individual member.

The rationale originally was essentially double dipping, you shouldn't be involved in two different ways. But no one could come up with their strong reason why that was the case and what harm one was trying to prohibit. There's a concept that in theory, you could be involved in voting through an ALS and as an individual member, however, number one, very few ALS does actually have voting of their members for ICANN relate to things, and number two, there's no prohibition about being involved in multiple ALSes. So there was never any rule thing I couldn't be involved in 12 ALSes within a region, and potentially voting all of those. So it just didn't seem to have any real substance behind it.

Next slide, please. The expectation is that these people are full members of the RALO with whatever rights are associated with being a member of an ALS, for instance. For voting, the presumption is that there will be a single vote for all of the individual members, essentially a virtual ALS, or if you have enough members, you could have multiple ALSes, that's a RALO's choice. And the detailed rules are up to the RALO. Normally, if you go to the ICANN website, the At-Large website,

you'll find this a list of individual members, and there is the right to say I don't want my name listed. And that's something I'll go over in a minute, but that's an interesting one.

Next slide. Now, there were a couple of things that the group did not talk about and should have, and this needs to be fixed going forward. One is, it's impractical to have individual members and have no way to contact them, and we need to make sure that we alert individual members that their contact information will be provided to the RALO leadership and individual representative, but they're not going to be published, but we need to be able to use them. And perhaps, and I know NARALO has such a thing there, there may need to be permission to be put onto an individual member mailing list.

Both these items were not covered in the report approved by the ALAC and the RALOs, and that needs to be looked at going forward. Next slide, please. Application process is the RALO identifies the specific rules embodying what I've just described, but perhaps other rules as well. The application form is submitted to staff, it's reviewed by staff for completeness, and then passed on to RALO leadership for final approval. And noting that rejections don't necessarily require a rationale to be given to the applicant at the time, but this is a formal process with appeals, and if there's going to be a rejection, it has to be some basis first. And that is all I have right now.

I have one more slide at the end talking for item number four, but I'll turn it back over to Claire Craig to clarify, and we can go to the railroads and see where we are now. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire Craig speaking for the record. Thank you on that comprehensive report, Alan. And do we have any questions, comments, or should we just hear from each of the RALOs just quickly, if there is anything? But I know there isn't anything implemented based on what Alan just said, but what is the plan moving forward? So we started with AFRALO, just a quick one sentence of where you are, if there is anyone there. Okay, can we have that-- okay, I'm seeing something from AFRALO. Who's going to be speaking to this? Seun. I'm not hearing anyone if anyone is speaking. Can someone let me know, please?

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Can you hear me?

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Yes, I can hear you now.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you, Claire. Hello, everyone. Seun, for the record. If staff can display the AFRALO operating principles. So when we began the process, when we were seeing the drafts of the original individual membership, as advised by ALAC, we [00:15:30 - inaudible] process at our end. Actually, we had individual memberships incorporated in the operating principles originally, but we needed to capture the new requirements, and coincidentally, we had already put in our rules that we need to review individual membership after three years, so that's worked for us.

And from section four, which is the membership up to section five is where we captured individual membership, and pretty much everything that Alan earlier mentioned in terms of membership, we have captured. So at the moment, individual members are voting members within AFRALO. Their vote is equivalent to a vote, and of course, they also appoint a representative.

I think at the moment, the representative is Abdulkarim, if I recall correctly. Well, I wouldn't say that worked very fine, because we actually have not done any voting; just like Alan had said, we are the votes within EURALO the [00:16:51 - inaudible], that mechanism is there. Whenever it's going to be used, it will be used accordingly.

The leadership of the individual membership is renewable every AGM, every ICANN AGM, and then next year, we will go to the normal election process as we used to do for AFRALO leadership. I don't know if there's any question, but I wouldn't want to go through the session four and five because I think [00:17:26 - inaudible] may want to also say something about your principal module. If there is any question, I'm happy to answer. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you so much. I think I called it Seun, please forgive me if I got the name incorrectly. Let's just move on just so that we can keep within the timeframe, and at the end, we can ask questions if we have sufficient time. Is there someone from APRALO who will speak on there. Yes.

**AMRITA CHOUDHURY:** 

Hi Claire. Amrita Choudhury for the record. So, I will be updating for the APRALO rules or procedures. Just to let you know, we have been working on the rules of procedures again, and Cheryl has been leading this discussion. There are some last final touches which needs to be done, but it's still work in progress. So if we look at our individual members, if we look at this, all the individual members together have one vote, and currently, Hanan Khatibis leading it. However, I don't think we have a separate individual mailing list for the individual members, they are incorporated into the mailing list of the APRALO.

And we had a debate earlier whether individual members can be part of the ALSes or not because there was some conflict earlier, but then again, we let it go; the only thing which was taken as they should not be in the leadership position. So in the end, that is about it. I would not want to speak more on it at this point because we are trying to align it with what is expected at this point of time. Thank you. That's it from me.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you, Amrita. Claire speaking. We move on to EURALO.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Thank you very much. Sébastien Bachollet speaking. Thank you, Claire. The documents you will see it's a bylaw of the EURALO sufficient with ICANN European Internet user forum. It was created in 2007, I guess, and we review this bylaw two years ago, something like that, maybe three. It's under the legal field, and it's why it's this form. Now regarding the rules of procedures, we are in a way to write it. But

regarding specifically the question of the individual members, as we have decided long time ago, that individual user must be all together in one specific At-Large structure.

It will be the bylaw of this or the wrap of this ALS will take care of some specific issue here for the individual user. Therefore, we will not see in too much detail [00:21:03 - inaudible] for the other RALOs. It's one amongst the other reason why we have decided to have one ALS for the individual user, it's easier to organize, there is no need to go up to twice, we don't make everybody that same level, and it's working quite well, and they are currently reviewing their own bylaws and rules, and as EURALO is doing too. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you so much, Sébastien. Claire, speaking. And for LACRALO, I am hoping that Howard will give us an update. As it is right now, my understanding is we do have individual members, but they are observers and do not have voting, we are in the process of implementing. Harold, would you want to speak to that, please?

YEŞIM SAĞLAM:

Hi, Claire, this Yeşim. I think we're still trying to reach out to Harold as he has recently dropped, and it seems like they are not able to get an answer from Harold yet.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Okay. All right, thank you, Yeşim. From my understanding, as I said, we are in the process of moving forward with this, and we do have

individual members. But the individual members, as I indicated, are currently observers and do not have voting rights. I think the model that we are looking at is the one where the individual users will form into one ALS, and they will select their representative.

But as far as I understand, we have not moved forward with that formally and are still looking at implementing that moving forward. So that's all I would say at this point on that. Are there any questions for any of the RALOs? Okay, it seems as if everything was quite comprehensive. So I will just move back, and to ask Alan to take the floor to give us his update on his last two slides on the presentation.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Would you like to do NARALO also?

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Oh, sorry. I thought... Just a few [00:23:59 - inaudible] NARALO because he had said it's implemented.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Yes, just for completeness, I did say that NARALO rules have been formally adopted, and yes, they aren't there, but I just want to make sure for completion, we didn't omit it here.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Okay. Yes. Thank you, Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG:

If Greg has anything to add, he certainly can. Greg has his hand up, I see.

**GREG SHANTAN:** 

Thanks. Greg, for the record. Just wanted to mention a couple of things. First off, the bobby ALS module, the individual members aren't organized into an ALS, the rules call for them to have a single voting representative, as well as two alternates, and that voting representative votes on behalf of the individual members in any case, where there is a vote, which, of course, again isn't often, but that does it for certain purposes.

And in our recent general assembly, we followed that same logic and in addition to having a representative of each ALS, we had a representative of the individual members, we also had other individual members who were there kind of wearing other hats, but that's kind of how we have dealt with individual members in a couple of specific situations. Thanks.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you so much for that report, Greg. So now I'm back to Alan to complete his presentation.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Yes, thank you. This is just a brief update of where we are. Next slide, please. Yes. As I noted, the two mobilization groups completed quite a while ago, and for various reasons, there had been very, very little action either in the RALOs or within the ALAC and staff on implementing

the ALS mobilization part of this. The ALS mobilization part has begun, and I'm optimistic that we'll see a number of the documents and webpages ready for publication over the next couple of months.

There is Board approval required to finalize the implementation, but hopefully, we'll be ready for that, or sometime relatively early in the new year. In terms of individual mobilization, again, there had not been a lot of action. However, now that NARALO has formally adopted the rules, we are in the process of gearing up and making sure that staff are in the position to actually follow the rules. So the process associated with individual members is being adopted, or integrated right now for NARALO, and as the other rules of procedure are updated, and as Sébastien said early in the meeting, this is really up to the RALOs to do, then staff will again, be in a position to make sure that the rules are being followed.

But it sounds like AFRALO may be at that stage already. Although I'm not quite sure. And that's about all I have to say. So things are in progress, they are moving. Hopefully. they will move relatively quickly. And we'll see the work that was done a long time ago actually put in place. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you so much for that, Alan. Yes, does seem as if there is work taking place across all the RALOs at this point in time. And so the hope is that it would move quickly. From what we've heard, there are some sitting problems from the different RALOs, everyone is at a different stage, but one step at a time, and we should get it done.

Are there questions or comments on this topic, or can we move

forward? I'm not seeing any hands.

JONATHAN ZUCK:

Hi, Claire. Jonathan Zuck. I've got my hand up.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Yes, Jonathan. Sorry, I can't see it. I don't know why. Go ahead, Jonathan.

JONATHAN ZUCK:

No problem. Thank you very much. Jonathan Zuck here for the record. Just for clarification, I guess this question is for Alan. The individual mobilization efforts, just discuss the individual members of RALOs, or go so far as to discuss the individual members of ALSes, as well.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Individual members of ALS as are covered under the ALS mobilization process, and that is a major effort and a lot of work. And we finally started the actual implementation of that. So as I said, you should see something early in the year. What the bulk of this presentation was, is just individual members, those who are members in their own right without an ALS, and of course, the fact that EURALO and possibly other RALOs in the future have organized their individual members into an ALS confuses the terminology.

So, anytime we say you may or may not be a member of an ALS, we're excluding the individual member ALS from that definition. Otherwise, we'd be in a position that the formal representative of the EURALO ALS for individual members could not be an individual member. So the terminology gets messy, but we will accommodate. There's no reason that we want the RALO to change its formal structure, because we have to write down the rules in some clarified way.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you for that response, Alan. I guess the thing about it is, as Sébastien said, it's up to the RALOs to do the implementation as best as it can be done in their region. But what we should probably look to ensure is that we keep it as simple as possible without too many complications. On that note, we move on, and we ask staff to speak to us about onboarding and welcoming of ALSes an individual.

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** 

Hi, everyone, sorry. Took me a little bit to find the unmute button. I wanted to raise this, over the last several general assemblies, and just looking at the rules and our processes over the last few months, we've noticed that some of the onboarding might need to be simplified, or more comprehensive in a way that some folks get ALSes within individuals are able to onboard smoothly, are welcomed into the community, into the RALO. So I just wanted to go over a little bit for our onboarding currently and we have a new ALS, we send out a welcome email from staff, and that's a very detailed.

It's one message that is quite detailed with all of the information about how to join calls, and where to find information, etc. For individuals, it's basically just a welcome email. So there really isn't a whole lot of information in that welcome email. So we were wondering whether you would like to work on a more of a process for onboarding and welcoming both ALSes individuals. Staff might be able to work on that as well with you, or present some information that we believe is welcomed or as needed by these ALSes individuals.

We also, in the past, some of the RALOs have had spotlights for new members, ALSes in particular, to where they are on a monthly column, they have a few minutes to introduce themselves, and the RALO members can also introduce themselves or welcome them in person. Also, we're not aware whether the RALO reaches out to new members when they join both, again, ALS reps or even individuals. So that's something we just wanted to play and perhaps have that discussion started on that. Thank you.

**CLAIRE CRAIG:** 

Claire speaking. Thank you, Heidi. Does anybody want to respond to that in terms of, or shall we just think about it, the next time we get together, we may have a response? Not seeing any hands? Yes, I'm seeing Sébastien, and then I'm seeing Amrita. So go ahead please, Sébastien.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Thank you very much, Claire. Just to say that, and maybe Amrita will say that they are working on that in APRALO, but different places where we

are talking about this welcome kit, and it was done badly, not finalized in the EURALO ALS individual user member, and we discussed this at the EURALO level. I feel that if we can have a combined work on that, I don't see too much differences to welcoming a member in APRALO, in AFRALO, NARALO, and so on and so forth.

And maybe it will be less work for each and every one and a better result at the end of the day. I know also that the outreach and engagement were discussing that. Therefore I suggest that in this type of meeting, we decide that a group can work collectively on that. It's just a suggestion. Thank you very much.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you, Sébastien. Sounds like a good suggestion. Let's hear from Amrita now. Amrita, sorry.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY:

Thank you, Claire. Amrita for the records. As in, I think it is important to welcome and introduce any individual or even ALSes coming into At-Large or any of the RALOs, and having a common, I will not just say toolkit, I will say an orientation process where the individual members or the ALSes are taken through the process, obviously, within the RALOs, there will be slight differences, not much, so, a basic overall uniform one could be there, perhaps every month, if we had some X number of individual members coming in or ALSes, they could be taken through the orientation process, because many times the sending mails does not help, it could also reiterate what we do, and what is expected from them and how they can contribute. Thank you.

**CLAIRE CRAIG:** 

Claire speaking. Thank you, Amrita. I see your hand, Heidi. Let me just quickly say, I think it really is a good idea to have a some type of welcoming as a newcomer to ICANN onto the ALAC, sometimes I really feel as if I'm drinking from a firehose. So Heidi.

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** 

This is Heidi. Thank you, Claire. What we are hearing is that we are by no means the only one, we are hearing that a lot of new members just seem overwhelmed, and that shouldn't be the case. We're doing a lot of effort to get the new members and then, we perhaps need to strengthen that process to actually orient and welcome them. So in the past staff had created a process to when there was a critical mass of new members across the regions, across the RALOs, that we would hold a series of webinars, welcome webinars.

The first one was just with staff, and the second one was with all of the RALO chairs, and I believe leaders, where everyone can just introduce themselves. So that's one thing that we could start again, or if this group wanted to think about perhaps a more streamlined process for the welcome/orientation, including a welcome kit, including some sort of welcome, where at least arrival leadership is there welcoming them, that would be perhaps a way to go. So we'll await your direction, then we can, therefore be able to help you with that. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you so much for that, Heidi. I am sure we could continue with this conversation, but we still have so much to cover and the time is quickly moving on us. So we would move forward to this other very important topic, which is the FY23 strategic plans. And we would have the RALO liaisons speak at this point. I don't know who would like to start.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

This is Seun. Can you hear me?

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Yes, sure. We can hear you.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Okay, I'm not seeing the liaisons for AFRALO on the call. I don't know whether the invitation was sent to him. But for us at AFRALO, our AFRALO engagement is in this draft stage. We're having a meeting with the GSC team from Africa tomorrow, and hopefully, we'll finalize it. I'm going to base the reference to our draft challenge in the chat so I don't take too much time.

The key part is that one of the things that has been a challenge for us was the previous ICANN ban for movements on travel, that has been [00:38:59 - inaudible] now, and I'm also seeing that the CROP will be activated to start next January. So that would actually help also. So we are looking to finalize on our strategy draft hopefully this week after our meeting tomorrow. [00:39:15 - inaudible]. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you, Seun. Amrita, you have the floor.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY:

Thank you, Claire. Just to update, we had some initial calls with the GSC team, and based upon our last call, we have sent them a proposal based upon what we have been speaking. The idea was to please take out one or two ALSes or individual members with whom we can work. We were looking at chapters in Indonesia and Pacific islands, also look for new potential ALSes in places we are not there like Myanmar, Vietnam, etc. Then focus on promoting the ideas and Universal Acceptance with the GSC team. We also plan to look at the DNS SEC, perhaps the ALSes could act as liaisons to actually local registries, etc, based upon their understanding.

Another topic which was identified where we can work together is DNS abuse. Obviously, ICANN policies, there was a discussion on IDN surveys etc. And obviously working on local events in the region, which we have therein ALSes or the team can work. We were also thinking that since resource material on IDN, so DNS abuse are not that much. There was a thought perhaps the APRALO team could work with the GSC team to create some of the material, which is interesting work with graphic designers to create some attractive infographics which can be used, possibly we can propose it for ABR, etc. So these are certain things which we have proposed. We still need to have more conversations to finalize them. Thanks.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Oh, Amrita. Thank you. Claire speaking. It seems as if you all are way ahead of the pack? Well, let me just say, of where we are at that APRALO, you've moved ahead with some suggestions, which is great. Sébastien, are you going to be speaking for EURALO? I saw you had your hand up initially.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

I had my hand up because the question of FY23 strategic plan, it's a big issue here. We are just talking about mobilization or the outreach and engagement, whatever we want to call that, and we are currently in discussion both internally within the EURALO Board and with the GSC team and the At-Large team to work on on that. It's a question of weeks, but we are working on that. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you, Sebastien. Greg or Jonathan. I don't know who wants to speak on NARALO.

**GREG SHATAN:** 

This is Greg Shatan, and I'll speak to NARALO. Jonathan has all of [00:42:31 - inaudible] and ALAC to run. So we are currently updating our Fiscal Year 23 Outreach and Engagement strategic plan. We have a working draft, we discussed this extensively at our general assembly in Hollywood, California, in October, got a lot of good feedback from our ALS representatives and individual members who were there. And we're meeting with staff on Friday to take the next step in getting our strategic plan done. So that's where that stands. Thanks.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you so much for that, Greg. From our point of view at AFRALO, we have been meeting with the GSC team, both Augusto and I have had a couple of meetings with the leadership of GSC in our region, and they have also sent us some table, a table with some of the various events that are taking place in the region so that we can formulate our strategic plan, as well as budget item, crop initiative.

We do have a monthly meeting next week Monday where we will be taking some of the ideas to our membership, and hopefully at the end of that, we should have some more concrete ideas to be able to put on the table moving forward. So we have a couple of ideas with respect to Universal Acceptance, but that's as far as we are at this point in time. So yes, thank you all. We now move on to-- unless there any questions, I'm not seeing any hands raised at this point. We've moved on to the update of the FY24 additional budget, and Heidi is going to speak to us on that.

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** 

Yes, thank you very much, Claire. This is Heidi. Wanted to just remind everyone, I know that I have been reminding people on the RALO monthly calls, but the fiscal year 24 additional budget request process is on underway, it has been for a while. All of you have your representatives on the ALAC finance budget subcommittee that should be working in your regions helping anybody with questions or promoting the ABR process.

This year, there are some ALAC [00:45:21 - inaudible] criteria for the request. Also, this is all in the workspace. This year, one new part is that the any requests coming from your RALO should be going through the RALO leadership, as well as being looked at by the GSE, your team there, we should all be working together on that. And the reason for that really is just to make sure that all the work that goes into an ABR request is going to produce a strong request with a good chance of being approved, or to point out that some of the requests being made already are able to be implemented just through normal support.

So that's the reason for that one-- some of the reasons for that was additional steps. And then also on this workspace is all the information from ICANN Finance and the policy staff. So all that information about the principal, there's one other new thing this year in terms of the process is that there is an online form; that link is on this workspace, but because of the additional step that At-Large has through that ALAC Finance and Budget Subcommittee where they will need to look at it and review it and possibly send it back to you, that we're asking that any additional budget request, please use that word version.

Again, there's a template on this page, please send that to your RALOs, to your GSE rep as you looked at it as well. And then once that's gone through that process, you can send it to staff. Another deadline for that is the 23rd of December. So that's when we need those proposals coming from either the ALAC or from the RALOs so we can start processing them, getting them posted for the FBSC to look at, that's that Finance and Budget Subcommittee. And so that again, the 23rd of December is the date. So that's the process.

And one other point I wanted to raise that I mentioned on a few of the monthly RALO calls was the idea of rather than having an individual RALO request that you might wish to consider developing a proposal for all of the RALOs, so something that you find particularly useful, that you would find useful for the RALOs and for your ALS and your individual members, that you could submit a Cross-RALO proposal. So I'll end it there, and feel free to discuss those proposals. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you for that, Heidi, and I am happy to see that we can all look at that deadline on the 23rd of December as for submitting our requests after we have consulted with our respective GSEs and going through some type of initial collaboration to determine what needs to happen. But since that deadline is so tight, I had this idea about us coming together as we lose with one proposal, we need to do that fairly quickly if it is that is something to consider. Seun, I see your hand is up. You have the floor.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Yes, thank you. Can you hear me? This is Seun.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Yes, I can hear you, Seun.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Okay. All right. Sorry, I wanted to confirm from Heidi. So if members are able to get the approval or endorsements now from the GSC team,

does that mean that is going to be the concentration at [00:49:18 - inaudible] is going to be less reverse? And does that give some level of guaranteed that-- let me also say this, from AFRALO, a couple of our members have applied in the past, and quite a number of them would [00:49:38 - inaudible] at the FBSC level. Yes, there is a possibility that they probably did not-- maybe there are certain requirements that is the expectation that is supposed to be met, but again, there are some of the applications that actually some of our members will refer us to other RALO applications, which was approved.

So I think it's very important to also clarify if they are able to do their proposal and then get the endorsement of the GSE from the region, what does that mean? Does that add any value to the FBSC committee? Will it actually service strong endorsement, and of course, which will now make the solution of FBSC to be much more thorough, and of course, [00:50:42 - inaudible] get approved. Thank you.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Yes, Seun, this is Heidi, thank you for the question. It basically means that it's a way of making sure that the proposals coming from the regions of the RALOs are added quality and in alignment with the principles of the ABRs with those that At-Large and the GSE are looking for. It's just to make the process more efficient and to also to help guide, if there's an early proposal that is shown to RALO leadership and to the GSE, they can work with those people developing that proposal to make sure that it is going to be as strong of a proposal as possible.

Because we do understand that this is a big process to-- a lot of work to develop under these proposals, and it's better to make sure that it's as strong as you can have it before the SBSC gets to it or looks at it, and then before it's submitted. So it's not really a guarantee of of being accepted. By any means, it's more of a way of making the more of an effective process.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you for that, Heidi, for that clarification. And I think we really need to work with our GSEs to ensure that they vet whatever it is that we're sending through. Not that, as Heidi said, that it would be accepted, but at least it sends some of the rigor so that it doesn't get rejected for some minor issue that could have been corrected. We are almost at the top of the hour, and I understood from the beginning of the meeting that the interpretation will just be for the first 60 minutes.

So we will continue because there are still a number of agenda items that we need to discuss, but I just wanted everyone to be aware that our interpretation, if I'm not mistaken, will no longer happen for the next 30 minutes. Yeşim, do you want to confirm that, please?

YEŞIM SAĞLAM:

Sorry Claire. I missed that. What would you like me to confirm?

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. I remember at the beginning, you said that interpretation was just for the first 60 minutes of the meeting, so I just

wanted to confirm that moving forward since we are the top of the hour, there would be no longer interpretation taking place at this time.

YEŞIM SAĞLAM:

Actually, it seems like they will be able to stay for maybe an extra 10 minutes, but I believe that's sharp.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Okay, but at some point in time, the interpretation will stop.

YEŞIM SAĞLAM:

Will stop, correct.

**CLAIRE CRAIG:** 

Okay. All right. Thank you so much. So let's move on now to the item of the Cross-RALO plan for ICANN76. As I'm sure all of you are aware, the LACRALO general assembly takes place at ICANN76, and it is on the Monday and Tuesday of the ICANN. I have so much in my head right now. I think it's the 11th and 12th of March. Right. We arrive on the Sunday and Monday full day of meetings, and Tuesday full day of meetings.

The good thing about this is that because of this happening during the ICANN meeting, we are trying to share the stage with [00:54:23 - inaudible] or ALS representatives may be able to attend some of the other sessions such as the opening reception, the board sessions, and some of those. One of the items that we are still in the process of

developing our program, and our team has been working, we've been meeting weekly to walk through and to get this [00:54:49 - inaudible], but it's taking us quite some time to get it going.

Can you scroll up a little more, please? So I think it is on the Tuesday and we are hoping to have have a-- right, there is it? Keep going. Tuesday. Yes. I know Sébastien had the EURALO GA introduced the Cross-RALO collaboration, and we wanted to ensure that we did some kind of Cross-RALO coordination at that meeting, where we come together, but I am looking for ideas from you all moving forward, what would you like to see, we can discuss it at this point in time, or you can send us ideas for some of the things that you would like us to work on together or any presentations that you may like to make at [00:55:42 - inaudible], where you would like to talk about some of the initiatives that may be happening in your region. So I'll open the floor now to get little feedback from some of you if possible. Yes, Amrita, you have the floor.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY:

Amrita here. I think what would be helpful is you understand your members, so you have individuals as well as ALSes, and you understand what the challenges are. If you want the other RALOs to come and share something on what-- how those addresses, not letting them know those are issues, but let us share anecdotal experiences of how those things have been taken care, perhaps that may help. Just an idea, rather than we just sharing something which we want to share.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you for that, Amrita. Yes, Sébastien, you have the floor.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Thank you, Claire. Sébastien Bachollet speaking. I wanted to underline, thank you for mentioning that it was very appreciated by the EURALO participant to the EURALO days and EURALO general assembly in Brussels. It was a participation of you, Claire, Greg, Sherman, Amrita, they were very interested by this section. And I feel that it could be the same for each and every RALO to know that we are part of a world, and yes, definitely we are organized at the regional level, and that's good.

But at the same time, there's something happening in other parts, and changing on that, it's good. As I made that suggest, it could be more what is your wish to ask us what to talk about? Because if we find a common topic, definitely, but what it's important, it's to answer your needs, your general assembly, the LACRALO general assembly, and it will be useful to answer your [00:58:12 - inaudible]. And if after we can have a common team of five RALO, great. Let's do it. But I will put that in your hands more than in our hands. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you for that, Sébastien. I really appreciate your support during this. Harold should still be on the call, and I know Augusto is also on the call, and Howard is part of the program committee, and they are meeting tomorrow night to continue to flesh this out. And so yes, we will be reaching out to you all to identify how you may be able to assist us or what we would like you to do at all

general assembly. But I'm sure that there will be a role for some of you to participate in this.

I think the initiative started with EURALO was a very good one, and I think it is something that we're not islands, and we face some of the same-- I learned that no pun intended, and we face some of the same issues moving forward. And so we should really talk about how we have overcome some of them. Heidi, I see your hand is up, so please go ahead.

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** 

Thank you very much, Claire. I just wanted to point out my what I've noticed in the chat is that, we've seen two of the general assemblies and now we're developing the third, and all of them have that theme of re-engaging after the pandemic, how do you reengage with your members, with the ALS reps, individuals, etc.?

And those sessions have been some of the most lively and really useful, they have lots of ideas on what they need to re-engage, what are some of the barriers, etc. So that might be one item that all of you can discuss, and that I think that the ALS reps would probably very much enjoy and contribute to as well. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you so much. Claire speaking. Thank you for that, Heidi. Like as I said, as time goes on, we would have a more full program, which we will be sharing with you. But some of the ideas, we are hoping to hold some type of cultural evening, and those things would be open to members of

the community to attend, because we you are in the RALO region, and so we would be opening up to share some of the things that happened here. We haven't had those kinds of experiences for a while because of COVID, and so we believe that once everything is okay with the rules for engagement, that we would be hosting something that should bring some enjoyment to our entire communities.

So I think I would leave this comment here until our team gets together with more ideas for the program, and we would come back to you with how we would like you to assist us in making our general assembly, something that is meaningful and valuable to our members. Thanks again. I think the next item would be the organization of RALO coordination, and that is Sébastien, you can take the floor to speak to us on that.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Thank you, Claire. No presentation, but it's a follow-up on some discussion we had with RALO Chair and with different meetings we have up to now. Therefore, I would like to put on the table, few elements who can bring us a better coordination. First of all, I think the name of this meeting must not be a secretariat meeting but RALO coordination meeting. And we may decide to have this meeting, I will say, each month as there is, I don't want just to compare that, as we have one at the ALAC level, I think it's important that we keep the momentum, and then be regularly discussing issue.

The second point of view, it's about how we lead this group, and I know that I put a proposal to have a chair for more than just three or six

months between two ICANN meeting but my colleague, chair of the other RALO says that it was too heavy and they didn't agree with that. So I would like to come with another suggestion to help going through from one meeting to the other because usually they are split and it's take two months for the next chair to take on, and it gets the job.

I would like to suggest that we ask three persons, the chair of the previous ICANN meeting region, the chair of the region of the ICANN meeting, and as a charter next ICANN meeting region to get together and like that we will be moving to last one, we'll keep, and the third one will be on board, and so on and so forth. And it's one way I think will enhance the coordination of the RALOs in the future and how we keep the momentum and keep the idea without reinventing or relearning everything at each time we change region for an ICANN meeting. And it's a way to have more participation and more diversity.

The third item, I would like very much that we, and that's good that Jonathan is with us. I think ICANN meeting is, and this time more particularly than before, as there is RALO General Assembly for LACRALO during the ICANN meeting, it's that source meeting to organize the participation of At-Large, could be chair both by the ALAC chair, and by the RALO chair of the place of the meeting. It also give a more comprehensive way, and it's reminds us that there it's not just ALAC within At-Large, but ALAC and the RALOs.

And my, I hope, last suggestion, it's that we had EURALO meeting yesterday, and we discuss how to finance our meetings at the RALO level. And we would like to suggest that as each RALO put a lot of effort in some monthly call or even maybe not each month, but with meeting

with a specific topic, and very often those topics are very interesting, not just for the region itself, even when EURALO organized the meeting about the law at the European level, in fact, a lot of other regions are interested and participants from other origin are interested.

Therefore, we would like to suggest that we try to find a way that each RALO organizes a meeting, but is organized for the whole RALOs. Like that, the time we spend to organize it will be worth with a better participation than if we keep it just at one RALO level. And it will also decrease the work of each leader of the RALOs as we will have less meetings to organize, but at the end of the day, for the members, individual members of ALSes, or individual members of the RALOs will be the same, because they will get the same level of proposals and topics to discuss and participate in.

That's some of the suggestions I wanted to put on the table today, and really, it's for discussion with you, and it will not be done in one day. But I feel that it could be a good way to enhance, and as we put in ATRT3, it's continuous improvement program, and that last proposal is meant to be on the continuous improvement program. I'm happy to have any comments and questions, everyone, but also disagreement. It's okay. Thank you, Claire. I give you back floor to lead this meeting now. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thank you, Sébastien. I definitely have a lot of food for thought from what you just said, and I'm hearing a number of different things coming out of it. And I am going to take the liberty as chair to

speak to some of the suggestions that you made. I like the idea of the monthly coordination call [01:09:00 - inaudible] to begin the name change, the coordination rather than secretariat, the monthly call because it helps to keep the rhythm. So when you have bi-monthly you have to start to think, did we meet last month and that kind of thing, so I like that.

The rotating of the leadership with the previous ICANN meeting, the current, and future, back in my days of programming, I think we called it grandfathering so that you always had that type of leadership role over from whatever. And so that seems to be a good idea. I hope that to me should not be as onerous as having everyone to rotate the leadership. So I like that idea. And the other thing that I wanted to talk about was our monthly regional call, which was your fourth item.

Again, why reinvent the wheel? It's being done every month by five of us, and so it seems, we are all busy, we are all volunteers. And therefore, if we could find ways to work smarter and help each other, I think that may be a good way to go forward and collaborate and participate in what is being done at the various regions. So that's my input on what you've just said, and I now see that Amrita's hand is up, so, I will give her the floor. So, unless you want to say something to Sébastien.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY:

Thank you, Claire. Amrita for the record. Sébastien, I think a coordination call between the RALOs is important so that we can exchange what we want to discuss perhaps, we should be able to frame

the discussion in the call, that's one. Two, about rotating leadership, I think as I mentioned it earlier also, we should keep it simple, if we are having a meeting in one particular region and that particular person is leading, that's great. And out of five, there are three people who are leading in timezones, etc.

So, I think if we can keep it simple, but I go with whatever everyone agrees upon. That's second. Third is when we are talking about-- I think your third point was about not duplicating things. So monthly meetings, obviously, of each RALO is different, but if we can create a calendar of events, who is doing what, we can remove the duplicity. And for timezone issues, perhaps we can have the call recorded and shared, because many times, the timezone may be a challenge, at least for Asia Pacific, most of the time it is.

So I think, a common calendar, if we can have it a bit, well in advance, we can just say, okay, if someone doing that, we will not do, or if you want a speaker from the different regions, we give it a more global flavor, that is also great. So this is it.

And I think I would like to raise another thing is, perhaps even when we physically meet in a meeting, in an ICANN meeting, I think there should be a RALO leaders meeting or even people from the RALO so that we can actually brainstorm shared best practices as Augusto was mentioning, because I think the RALOs, apart from Zoom calls, needs to speak to each other to learn from each other, take things ahead. So these are my points, hope I have been able to respond to most of your suggestions. Thank you.

**CLAIRE CRAIG:** 

Thank you, Amrita. I like the idea of engaging because some of the different regions, and reaching out and bringing them together. Yes, Natalia, you may take the floor.

NATALIA FILINA:

Thank you very much, Claire. Natalia Filina speaking. I would like to thank Sébastien for his suggestions, and Amrita, I'll join you. But I would like to see about a little bit non-formal things, which we can do together. So when we're talking about our Cross-RALO interactions, and work together, we can start to think about very simple things. So as Heidi said, something is already done, or we already have these regional leadership calls, that's great, and we can discuss different approaches to organization of different aspects of our work, but some things we didn't do.

For example, we wanted to get together for one call, and it was proposed to discuss the result of the IGF in perspective of ICANN issues or anti-user interests. I understand that it requires to separate the thoughts from staff, to organize, to create an agenda, to gather speakers, and to identify topics for this call, but in fact, we didn't do that. But I think it's very important because the many, many of our members were involved in IGF mainstream.

So another example. During the ICANN meetings, I think we should put more attention to our regional events. So we understand that it's difficult to find the time but for example, if we can be together and participate in discussions during African meetings, so it will be great. I

thought about it, I am telling you about it because, we saw not so full room during such meetings and it is not a good showcase of our interest to our interaction. And, yes, our current project as our welcome package, which we will do together, I hope will be excellent Cross-RALO initiatives. And we all should remember about our capacity building webinars.

As you know, our capacity building webinars team already invited experts from all RALOs, from different ALSes or organizations to present expertise on some issues; that is a way to be together and to attract more people inside of our community. Thank you very much.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you, Natalia. Greg, take the floor, please.

**GREG SHATAN:** 

Thank you. Greg Shatan for the record. I think it's important in these proposed RALO coordination calls, or rather leadership coordination calls to keep our focus consistent with the primary purpose of the RALOs, which is to deal with outreach and engagement issues and enroll issues that relate to that such as capacity building, and not to become a kind of shadow ALAC, and discussing matters of policy.

We can certainly coordinate also on webinars and presentations, which, I view as being part of outreach engagement capacity building, and certainly, avoiding the duplication of effort where we can share resources and outputs would be great. But at the same time, I think our focus really needs to be rightly on outreach and engagement. Thanks.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Claire speaking. Thanks, Greg. I like the whole idea of capacity building. Sébastien, you'll have the last comment as we draw closer to the end of this meeting. I'll let you take floor.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Thank you, Claire. And, Greg, if my suggestion was not aligned with what you say, it's my fault, but I totally agree. And if I can push a little bit what you say, I would like very much that coordination, that outreach and engagement must fall under our purview in this type of call, and it will be definitely the type of thing we need to do. I hope that all my suggestion was not to replace the CPWG or the OFB working group.

It's really to talk about outreach and engagement coordination to learn about what's happening in each and every RALO, and to better work together. And once again, thank you very much for your time and discussion on that issue. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Thank you, everyone. Thank you for this rich discussion. Is there any other business? I don't think we've identified anything at the beginning, but I'm not sure if anyone had something burning that they wanted to share with us? No, so I'll turn the floor over to-- okay, our next call. Natalia, yes.

NATALIA FILINA:

Thank you very much, Claire. Just for a minute. So, I would like to suggest that we can get together not because we have a scheduler for our leadership goal, but maybe when we have certain topics. For example, we were discussing a lot in-person topics relate our individuals in different RALOs, so we are here for discussing it. Or, for example, we will have some differences in understanding of our common startegies. Maybe it is our way not to leave in scheduler, but to leave in some questions on that. Thank you.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

I understand Natalia, I don't know if Augusto would like to say anything as we close the meeting. I know there is no interpretation, but I'm not sure-- is Augusto [01:21:11 - inaudible]. Okay, go ahead, Augusto.

AUGUSTO HO:

Thank you, everybody.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Claire, I'm sorry, I'm trying to raise my hand.

CLAIRE CRAIG:

Sorry. Go ahead, Silvia.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

It's Silvia. Thank you so much. Just to wrap up this this call, I would like to get the action items confirmed. So we are hearing that you wish to

hold a monthly call, right, coordination call? So that would be one first action item. Is that the monthly?

**CLAIRE CRAIG:** 

That was the general consensus, but I don't know if he would want to take a poll after or something just to find out if everyone is on the same page. As you know, you tend to hear the ones who are more outspoken.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Right. So if everybody is in agreement with the monthly idea. I don't see any hands up, so I guess the silence means okay. And then, Heidi, [01:22:23 - inaudible] that we should start in January, right?

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** 

Sounds like a plan.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Right. So monthly beginning in January, and then the idea is to have a rotation schedule, if that's okay with you to accommodate all time zones and to establish a set time, perhaps the last week of the month would be a good idea if that is okay, perhaps to do that. And so we will, then that triggers an action item, because we need to run one zero with one zero to set the first time and establish a schedule, of course. So I think that's the main takeaway from this call. Correct?

CLAIRE CRIAG:

Yes, Silvia. I think that at least that's the start, and I know with LACRALO with all weekly meetings, we're going to have to try to find a way to facilitate this monthly call. But we need to go further, if that is the general concern. I think the other thing that came out of this is that we could probably look at some general topics that we may want to speak on, and maybe we can calculate something. I don't know if that was an action item, or if that is what will come out of the call.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay. So perhaps that's a suggestion that can be included when the call is organized, right? So that can be added there. So I'm taking notes of the staff to establish a call, a monthly call on a rotation schedule. I don't know if the idea of the grandfather rotation, including the leaders of the previous meeting, location chair, I think that was also there was an opinion that perhaps should be a simple process. So I'm not sure that was actually agreed by everyone, the grandfather idea.

CLAIRE CRIAG:

But someone said at least it should be two. So I don't know if the point would be the past and present or the present and future. From where I sit, I think there is value to having the past and present, and at some point in the future should come in so that you can pass some information on to that person. But maybe that's something that we can discuss some more at the next meeting, or the chair would be rotated.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay. So that's noted for you all to discuss my duties perhaps the first time, but for now we'll keep it as the tradition was to hold the host of the next item for the meeting will chair the call, then we will take LACRALO as the chair of the January call, and perhaps this idea of the grandfather can be further discussed later. So that's the main action item there, so stay tuned for that doodle to set up the first call the last week of January, and then move forward the last week of each month. We will work with you, Claire and everyone, to set up the call and agenda. Thank you. Thank you for clarifying, Claire.

CLAIRE CRIAG:

Claire speaking. Thank you so much, Silvia. Thank you, everyone, for attending, we know that your time is very valuable, and making this effort especially across the different time zones, we do appreciate it. We look forward to continuing these discussions with you and seeing you in other meetings. And for now, I don't know that we may be able to converse like this until next year, so enjoy your holidays, stay safe, and all the best all of you. Take care staff and to the interpreters. And thanks, everyone for attending. Bye-bye. Enjoy the rest of your day.

YEŞIM SAĞLAM:

Thank you so much, Claire and everyone. Happy holidays.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Thank you everyone. Bye-bye.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Bye-bye.

YEŞIM SAĞLAM: Thank you all, this meeting is now adjourned. Thank you all.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]