GNSO/GAC Facilitated Dialogue on Closed Generics 11 September 2023 Meeting Notes

During this meeting, the Closed Generic (CG) Dialogue participants discussed alternative text options pertaining to two parts of their draft Outcomes Report. The group discussed the revisions put forward by participants and staff, and came to agreement on updated text. Potential revisions in the Outcomes Report concerning the joint letter to the Board will be revisited once the letter is finalized and delivered to the Board.

Participants discussed the following:

- Whether the Outcomes Report should include quotes from the feedback submitted by community groups or rather remain at a high-level without attribution. Some participants reiterated concerns from their previous meeting that including quotes from some community groups and not others may be unfair and/or unfit for a summary document.
- Whether certain concerns and disagreements expressed in the community's feedback should be highlighted in the Outcomes Report, namely the competition/markets and human rights concerns noted by the GAC, as well as the ALAC's concern about system bias. The group discussed four alternative text options proposed by participants and one text option proposed by staff.
- Whether another participant-proposed revision sufficiently clarifies that even with additional effort, it is possible some issues noted by the community's feedback about the Draft Framework may not be reconcilable. No participants expressed objection to including this amendment.
- Whether the community's feedback should be included in the Outcomes Report as links to the wiki or as attached documents in their entirety.

Participants generally came to agreement on the following:

- The group agreed to update their draft Outcomes Report to note the community's concerns of "the potential for system bias" and that "the concept of a closed generic gTLD was raised by the GAC as a significant concern for market/competition and human rights protections".
- The group also agreed to clarify in their Outcomes Report that "it is possible that even with additional efforts, these [fundamental] issues might not be reconciled".

ACTION ITEMS:

 Participants will revisit the Executive Summary portion of their Outcomes Report once the joint letter from the GNSO, GAC, and ALAC is delivered to the ICANN Board.