

ICANN 75
ANNUAL GENERAL
KUALA LUMPUR



Pilot Holistic Review Update

**Pilot Holistic Review Update and Draft Terms of Reference
Public Comment Proceeding**

Reviews Support & Accountability Department, GDS



Agenda

1

**What is the Pilot
Holistic Review?**

2

**Public Comment
Proceeding**

3

**Upcoming
Activities**

What is the Pilot Holistic Review?

Background

- The Third Accountability and Transparency Review (ATR3) examined if ICANN Reviews function effectively, issuing several recommendations addressing their number, frequency, duration, and nature.
- ATR3 recommendation 3.5 is about introducing a new Specific Review, the Holistic Review.
- The Board approved recommendation 3.5, “subject to prioritization and available resources” and directed ICANN org to initiate the first Holistic Review as a pilot, “...pursuant to community-agreed Terms of Reference and relevant elements of the Operating Standards for Specific Reviews.”
- A subgroup of the Organizational Effectiveness Committee of the Board (OEC), including its chair, solicited the ATR3 Shepherds and former ATR3 members to help draft the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the Pilot Holistic Review to expedite the pilot, enabling work to occur in parallel with the Planning Prioritization Pilot.
- Recommendation 3.5 was classified as a top priority (P1) for implementation by the ICANN community in May 2022. An implementation plan is currently being designed, including for implementation of the Pilot Holistic Review.

What is the Pilot Holistic Review?

Key Objectives

ATRT3 recommendation 3.5 sought to create the Holistic Review to achieve the following objectives:

1. Review continuous improvement efforts of SO/AC/NomCom based on good practices.
1. Review the effectiveness of the various inter-SO/AC/NomCom collaboration mechanisms.
1. Review the accountability of SO/ACs or constituent parts to their members/constituencies (this will include an in-depth analysis of the survey results).
1. Review SO/AC/NomCom as a whole to determine if they continue to have a purpose within the ICANN structure as they are currently constituted, or if any changes in structures and operations are desirable to improve the overall effectiveness of ICANN as well as ensure optimal representation of community views (but taking into consideration any impacts on the Board or the Empowered Community).

What is the Pilot Holistic Review?

Board-identified information gaps to be addressed by the pilot

- Guidance as to how Holistic Review teams should determine and prioritize its work areas in order to ensure effective review outcomes within the recommended 18-month timeframe.
- Proposed methodology for gathering and analyzing data to inform fact-based findings and recommendations.
- Articulation of necessary skill sets for Holistic Review team members required to achieve review objectives, which will later be included in the Operating Standards for Specific Reviews.
- Estimate of resources and budget required to complete the review effectively.
- Suggestions as to how various ICANN structures would be held accountable for implementing the recommendations coming from the Holistic Review, if directed to entities other than the ICANN Board or org.
- Determination of how future Holistic Review teams would measure the success of implementation and the success of a future Continuous Improvement Program.

The proposed ToR includes actions and deliverables designed to address the identified gaps.

What is the Pilot Holistic Review?

Key Components of the Pilot Holistic Review

- The primary goals of the Pilot Holistic Review will be to address the information gaps identified by the Board that will help operationalize the review in the future and to set the stage for future Holistic Reviews.
- The Pilot Holistic Review Team will work to **create a Holistic Review Program to develop the principles and criteria for evaluation by future Holistic Review Teams.**
- To ensure the different principles and criteria for evaluation are practical and relevant across the structures, the Pilot Holistic Review Team will collaborate with the SOs, ACs, and NomCom in their development.
- SOs, ACs, and NomCom will then participate in a future Holistic Review via self-assessment, giving the future Holistic Review Team the necessary objective information to complete the comprehensive evaluation envisioned by the ATRT3.

Public Comment Proceeding

- Public Comment on Pilot Holistic Review Draft Terms of Reference - see [Public Comment page](#)
 - **30 August - 20 October**
- Implications for various community structures and groups
 - Community time and attention
 - Potential changes to how the various structures are organized and evaluated in the future
- **Seeking your input:**
 - whether the Draft Terms of Reference seems fit for purpose, and whether it is tailored to the community's expectations based upon ATRT3 recommendation 3.5.
 - Pilot Holistic Review scheduling and timing in light of other community and stakeholder work.

Upcoming Activities

- Following the close of Public Comment, ICANN org will analyze the comments and present them to the ICANN Board, through the Organizational Effectiveness Committee (OEC), for consideration.
 - Depending on the nature of the comments, the process may include informing the ToR Team of the comments received and engaging on the comments as needed.
 - The ICANN Board will then coordinate through the OEC to determine and initiate the path forward.
- A Call for Volunteers will follow the closure and assessment of Public Comments.
- Pilot Holistic Review Team members will be selected by the SOs and ACs, following the process outlined in the Operating Standards.
- The Board will nominate a Board liaison for the pilot.
- ICANN org will assemble relevant materials and make operational preparations for the review.
- Inaugural Pilot Holistic Review Team meeting.

Resources

Contact Review Support & Accountability: rsa-coordinators@icann.org

Pilot Holistic Review Draft ToR Public Comment proceeding: <https://www.icann.org/en/public-comment/proceeding/pilot-holistic-review-draft-terms-of-reference-30-08-2022>

Pilot Holistic Review ToR Draft:

<https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project?preview=/192220170/206143952/FINAL%20-%20Draft%20Terms%20of%20Reference%20for%20Pilot%20Holistic%20Review.pdf>

Pilot Holistic Review ToR Team working space on community wiki:

<https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project>

ICANN Bylaws - See Section 4.6 for Specific Reviews: <https://www.icann.org/resouces/pages/governance/bylaws-en/#article4>

ATRT3 Final Report: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/atrt3-report-29may20-en.pdf>

ICANN Board Action Scorecard: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/resolutions-atrt3-final-recs-board-action-scorecard-30nov20-en.pdf>

ICANN Board Resolution: <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2020-11-30-en>

Letter from OEC Chair Avri Doria to ATRT3 Shepherds regarding the development of Terms of Reference (TOR) for the Pilot Holistic Review: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/doria-to-shepherds-02feb22-en.pdf>

Engage with ICANN – Thank You and Questions



One World, One Internet

Visit us at icann.org



[@icann](https://twitter.com/icann)



facebook.com/icannorg



youtube.com/icannnews



flickr.com/icann



linkedin/company/icann



soundcloud/icann



instagram.com/icannorg