

Holistic Review ToR Team

Chat Transcript

Telephonic Meeting, Thursday, 2 June 2022 @ 14:00 UTC!

Proposed Draft Agenda

- Welcome and Attendance - 5 minutes
 - Review of Comments - 5 minutes
 - 1. *Composition of the review team,*
 - 2. *Consultation of experts,*
 - 3. *Budget,*
 - 4. *Timeline*
 - Review of Action Items - 5 minutes
 - Complete first review of [ToR \(starting w/ Definitions on pg. 14\)](#) - 15-20 minutes
 - Start second review of ToR - 30-35 min
 - Update on Logistics/New Action Items/Next Steps/AOB – 10 minutes
-

07:00:57 From Jason Kean - ICANN Org to Everyone:

recording started

07:03:53 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

All good

07:04:41 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

you tried Seb :-)

07:07:51 From Osvaldo Novoa to Everyone:

Sorry for being late, had a problem with my internet connection.

07:08:20 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

No worries Osvaldo, welcome

07:08:33 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

No

07:12:13 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Yes the "normal" pattern seems the right approach for this but agree re composition needs to be before the clock starts and I originally argued the Leadership Team decided upon could be pre 'start' of the year as well.

07:14:54 From Larisa Gurnick - ICANN Org to Everyone:

(A)Each Supporting Organization and Advisory Committee participating in the applicable review may nominate up to seven prospective members for the review team;

(B)Any Supporting Organization or Advisory Committee nominating at least one, two or three prospective review team members shall be entitled to have those one, two or three nominees selected as members to the review team, so long as the nominees meet any applicable criteria for service on the team; and

(C)If any Supporting Organization or Advisory Committee has not nominated at least three prospective review team members, the Chairs of the Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees shall be responsible for the determination of whether all 21 SO/AC member seats shall be filled and, if so, how the seats should be allocated from among those nominated.

(ii) Members and liaisons of review teams shall disclose to ICANN and their applicable review team any

07:15:11 From Larisa Gurnick - ICANN Org to Everyone:

<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/governance/bylaws-en/#article4>

07:17:09 From Sébastien Bachollet to Everyone:

Not sure about the link?

07:17:11 From Maarten Botterman to Everyone:

Agree - we have a practice (in place - as used) - if there is a reason to change that, lets consider that - and lets have that reason ...

07:17:47 From Maarten Botterman to Everyone:

without a reason no need to consider change?

07:19:40 From Maarten Botterman to Everyone:

no harm referring to relevant bylaw articles

07:19:49 From Vanda Scartezini - Brazil to Everyone:

agree cheryl

07:20:42 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

it is an **If Required** usually done by the Team itself

07:21:18 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

again citations are the way to go

07:21:38 From Vanda Scartezini - Brazil to Everyone:

some one to help to writing things done as we already had in some other WG i believe helps

07:22:28 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

indeed a writer (of appropriate experience and skills) is a boon

07:23:14 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Again yes treat it with the same Costs management expectations as previous RTs

07:23:38 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Yes the system works IMO

07:25:59 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

The flexibility for application to additional expenses is outlined (though ATRT3 did not require any additional costs to be covered :-)

07:26:15 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

flexibility

07:27:11 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

and the spanning of 2 budgets is not an issue then - just to confirm @Xavier

07:28:20 From Patrick Kane to Everyone:

Xavier - would you ever see a situation where the future budget year would require reallocation of resources to address urgent items that review teams are "paused" or is the multiyear project funding considered to be untouchable for future years?

07:31:58 From Patrick Kane to Everyone:

thanks

07:34:01 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Time check: 25 min left

07:38:33 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

as defined in the bylaws perhaps

07:39:49 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

but each entity his defined including where Individuals are recognised

07:40:48 From Maarten Botterman to Everyone:

I like refering to the Bylaw for as far as it defines "the Community"

07:41:41 From Vanda Scartezini - Brazil to Everyone:

I believe cheryl suggestion cover the issue

07:41:44 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

bylaws seems the benchmark to me

07:42:30 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

another citation perhaps

07:46:18 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

all good Thx @Jason

07:49:02 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

OK for me

07:51:18 From Herb Waye Ombuds to Everyone:

Hi folks... hopping in from the I74 meeting that just ended.

07:51:20 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Time check: 10 min left

07:51:32 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

welcome @Herb

07:51:32 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Hi Herb, welcome

07:54:17 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

is it approval or endorsed

07:54:34 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

commentary seems the right level I agree

07:54:38 From Osvaldo Novoa to Everyone:

I support the previous approval by the SO/AC, I'm ok with Patrick proposal

07:56:28 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

so just removal of the words in redline of "and approved" does that

07:59:19 From Patrick Kane to Everyone:

consider

08:01:22 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

it is the consideration of significant matters option that needs articulating here

08:02:37 From Maarten Botterman to Everyone:

Maybe we can invite the RT to reflect on the public comments, in one document, that is subsequently also provided to the Board to take into account in its considerations (final report, public comments, and "reflection on public comments by RT

08:05:38 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Makes sense to go the list or chat on this works Yes @Jason Thx

08:05:48 From Osvaldo Novoa to Everyone:

I agree with Avri, there should some previous reaction to the report from the AC/SO before the report goes to the Board.

08:06:46 From Vanda Scartezini - Brazil to Everyone:

my suggestion is- prior the final report to be sent to the board, ac/so shall evaluate and send relevant issues back to review team to address.

08:06:49 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

I am now in another call as well, so if I look like I am talking on mute it is deliberate (probably)

08:07:36 From Herb Waye Ombuds to Everyone:

Haha

08:07:45 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Herb to the rescue ;-)

08:08:44 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

cite the Ops

08:09:29 From Herb Waye Ombuds to Everyone:

Maple cookies cure all

08:11:59 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Time check: 11 min over

08:12:05 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

noting my preference for use of Leadership Tems so Co-Chairing model

08:13:45 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

not over

08:14:28 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Clean copy distribution and final toilet stgs

08:15:06 From Xavier to Everyone:

Need to leave for another meeting. Thank you.

08:15:15 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

as in Enders End Game ;-)

08:15:31 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Yup

08:15:39 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Time check: 15 min pass the hour

08:17:29 From Osvaldo Novoa to Everyone:

I have to leave now. Thank you all. Bye

08:17:39 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Thx @Osvaldo

08:17:50 From Herb Waye Ombuds to Everyone:

Take care all... hope to see you in The Hague

08:17:55 From Yvette Guigneaux - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Avri et al - apologies for misunderstanding the time

08:18:08 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:

Repose is an excellent term

08:18:45 From Vanda Scartezini - Brazil to Everyone:

herb -hope to see you too there... since i will be closed with nomcom hope we can find a way to say hallo!

08:19:06 From Herb Waye Ombuds to Everyone:

Yes Vanda

08:19:54 From Wendy Profit to Everyone:

Safe travels!