ATRT3 stated objective "Review SO/AC/NC as a whole to determine if they continue to have a purpose in the ICANN structure as they are currently constituted or if any changes in structures and operations are desirable to improve the overall effectiveness of ICANN as well as ensure optimal representation of community views (but taking into consideration any impacts on the Board or the Empowered Community)."

Proposed analysis of ATRT3 stated objective based on discussions and comments from the Pilot Holistic Review ToR Team

The intent of the above-noted ATRT3 stated objective for the Holistic Review is to take a comprehensive view of ICANN structures, as there is currently no mechanism for such a comprehensive view. The stated objective provides an outline of elements that should be considered, but it does not offer definitions or means of accomplishing the stated objective. The Board action noted "...the caveat that more information is required to better understand how to operationalize the Holistic Review to ensure it yields the outcomes intended by the ATRT3."

The stated objective seems to focus on how the various component parts fit together to fulfill ICANN's mission. The questions of whether or not a given structure continues to have a purpose should be looked at in the context of the ICANN mission, as defined in the Bylaws. The stated objective also seeks to answer the question of how effectively a given organization serves/represents its constituencies and engages in the opportunities to participate within the ICANN system, which appears to be addressed in the second part of the objective.

The second part of the objective is focused on the effectiveness of structures and their operations with the measures being: a) contribution to the overall effectiveness of ICANN, and b) the optimal representation of community views.

In reflecting on the ATRT3 objective, it appears that the two parts are inextricably connected and should be addressed as such.

Proposed approach to delivering on the stated objective - this approach would also be applicable to the other ATRT3 stated objectives for the Holistic Review

Considering the complexity and significance of the stated objective, it seems that a "Holistic Review Program" should be developed to provide parameters and criteria for the eventual evaluation to maintain objectivity and ensure understanding and buy-in from all parts of ICANN that would be subject to the Holistic Review. Such eventual evaluation would be conducted by the subsequent Holistic Review Team, based on the guiding principles, parameters and criteria established by the Holistic Review Pilot.

In keeping with good practices common to similar evaluations, the "independent" or "impartial" review team conducting the eventual Holistic Review would look at how each structure evaluated itself as to fulfilling its purpose, contributing to the overall effectiveness of ICANN and ensuring optimal representation of community views. In this way, the Holistic Review Program would combine the views of each structure, respecting the important differences between them, and still applying consistent guiding principles across the structures.

The purpose of the Holistic Review Pilot would be to develop the program, the parameters and criteria, using the ATRT3 objectives as an outline. The structures would then participate in the program via self-assessment and the eventual Holistic Review team would have the necessary building blocks to do the comprehensive evaluation envisioned by the ATRT3 objectively.

In taking this approach, it may become clear that the separately envisioned development of the continuous improvement program would become an essential and inextricable aspect of the Holistic Review Program.

ATRT3 stated objective components	Holistic Review Pilot Target: Jan 2023	Self-Assessment by each SO/AC/NomCom & Continuous Improvement	Holistic Review Target: Jan 2031??? *(see below for sequence of activities)*
Continuing purpose	Develop principles & criteria in consultation with SO/AC/NomCom, ICANN org, and the ICANN Board.	Apply principles & criteria, publish self-assessment; implement improvements	
What if there is no continuing purpose or change is warranted?	Framework for determining how to address a structure that may not have a continuing purpose - restructure or remove?	Apply framework to identify structural changes within each organization, if applicable	Evaluate self-assessment, additional fact finding and analysis, formulate findings, make recommendations, etc.
Contribution to the overall effectiveness of ICANN	Develop principles & criteria in consultation with SO/AC/NomCom, ICANN org, and the ICANN Board.	Apply principles & criteria, publish self-assessment; implement improvements	
Optimal representation of community views	Develop principles & criteria in consultation with SO/AC/NomCom, ICANN org, and the ICANN Board.	Apply principles & criteria, publish self-assessment; implement improvements	

Activities leading up to the Holistic Review (post pilot), determined by the ATRT3 proposed cadence:
- **June 2022** - ToR draft complete - out for public comment
- **January 2023** - Holistic Review Pilot team selected, work begins (to be completed within 18 months)
- **June 2024** - Holistic Review Pilot team concludes their work, delivers final report
- **January 2025** - First Board action taken 6 months following receipt of Holistic Review Pilot report
- **January 2027** - ATRT4 begins (first Board action taken on Holistic Review triggers the countdown of 2 years for the ATRT4)
- **December 2027** - ATRT4 delivers final report, which could explore whether the timeline/cadence or configuration of ICANN Reviews should be revisited
- **June 2028** - Board action on ATRT4 recommendations
- **January 2031** - Holistic Review to begin 2 1/2 years after the Board approved the first recommendation from ATRT4