

---

# ICANN Specific Reviews – Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRRT3) Recommendation 3.4 - Implementation Documentation

ATRRT3 Final Report

<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/atrrt3-report-executive-summary-29may20-en.pdf>

Board resolution on ATRRT3 Final Report

<https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2020-11-30-en#1.a>

- Recommendation submitted: May 2020
- Recommendation approved: November 2020
- Implementation completed: June 2024

See <https://community.icann.org/display/atrrt/Implementation> for more information on ATRRT3 implementation.

## **ATRRT3 Recommendation 3.4**

ATRRT Reviews should continue essentially as they are currently constituted but with the following enhancements:

- Shall start no later than two years after the approval by the Board of the first recommendation of the Holistic Review.
- Shall maintain responsibility to recommend to the Board the termination or amendment of other periodic reviews and the creation of additional periodic reviews (including reassessing reviews terminated by previous ATRRTs).
  - All pre-identified documentation that is required for the review, such as the previous ATRRT's implementation report, shall be available at the first meeting of the review team.
- Terms of reference shall be established at the first meeting.
- Note: The Operating Standards for Specific Reviews shall be amended to allow review teams to obtain professional services, which is not covered by subject matter experts, should they require such services.

## **Board Action on ATRRT3 Recommendation 3.4**

The Board approves Recommendations 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, and 3.4, subject to community agreement to the Bylaws change. When deemed appropriate through the prioritization process, the Board directs ICANN org to begin the process to make the appropriate Bylaw amendments, but if the Empowered Community rejects the Bylaws changes, further ICANN community discussion would be required before implementation. Further, the Board notes that there may be a need to track implementation of Recommendations 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, and 3.4 separately due to the distinct work efforts and implementation steps required.

## **Final Implementation Report**

ATRRT3 Recommendation 3.4 called for ATRRT to start no later than two years after the approval by the Board of the first recommendation of the Holistic Review. This aspect of recommendation 3.4 has been overtaken by events and cannot be implemented. Depending on whether or not the Holistic Review is enshrined in the Bylaws (which will not be known

---

until the Board will make its decision after the conclusion of the Pilot Holistic Review), ICANN org will work to align the future review schedule to reflect this aspect of the ATRT3 recommendation.

- This recommendation 3.4 has a dependency on another recommendation from ATRT3, Recommendation 3.5, which calls for the creation of a new Holistic Review.
- The Board directed ICANN org to implement Recommendation 3.5 as a Pilot, before the Holistic Review could be enshrined in the Bylaws, as appropriate.
- The Pilot Holistic Review, initiated by the Board on 29 April 2024 ([see Board resolution](#)), is expected to begin in September 2024 and last for up to 14 months. Therefore, there has not yet been a Holistic Review and no recommendations for the Board to consider.
- Consequently, the timing of the next ATRT falls under the current Bylaws. Accordingly, the ATRT4 was due to be initiated in April 2024 and the Board took action to defer ATRT4 on 29 April 2024 ([see Board resolution](#)).
- ICANN org specifically flagged the ATRT3 recommendation 3.4 as part of the community conversation surrounding the timing of ATRT4. After consultation with the ICANN community, the Board [resolved](#) that ATRT4 will be initiated no later than April 2025 and plans are underway by org to support and facilitate this review.

Additionally, ATRT3 Recommendation 3.4 stipulated that ATRT shall maintain responsibility to recommend to the Board the termination or amendment of other periodic reviews and the creation of additional periodic reviews (including reassessing reviews terminated by previous ATRTs). This aspect of the recommendation is considered completed, as it is in line with the current Bylaws provision “(iv) The Accountability and Transparency Review Team may recommend to the Board the termination or amendment of other periodic reviews required by this Section 4.6, and may recommend to the Board the creation of additional periodic reviews.”

ATRT3 recommended that all pre-identified documentation that is required for the review, such as the previous ATRT’s implementation report, shall be available at the first meeting of the review team. This aspect of ATRT3 Recommendation 3.4 has been completed by inclusion in ICANN’s standard operating procedures for Specific Reviews.

- ICANN org (Implementation Operations team) produces quarterly implementation reports for all Specific Reviews, including ATRT3. See [listing of all implementation reports](#).
- ICANN org’s detailed project plan for ATRT4 includes a planned action to deliver the previous ATRT’s implementation reports (when available) ahead of the first meeting of ATRT4.

ATRT3 stipulated that terms of reference shall be established at the first meeting of the next ATRT. This element is considered to be complete, as ICANN org’s detailed project plan for ATRT4 includes a planned action to provide ATRT4 with a draft terms of reference for the Review Team’s adoption by the first meeting.

---

Finally, the ATRT3 Recommendation 3.4 included a “Note: The Operating Standards for Specific Reviews shall be amended to allow review teams to obtain professional services, which is not covered by subject matter experts, should they require such services.” Operating Standards for Specific Reviews are in the process of being updated and include a process by which a Review Team can request additional funding based on demonstrated need and Review Team justification for the Board’s consideration.

## Rationale

While portions of this recommendation are overtaken by events due to the timing of the Holistic Review and the ICANN community's support for proceeding with the ATRT4 in as timely a manner as possible, the other portions are appropriately marked as complete due to the incorporation into standard operating procedures. The decision to mark the recommendation as complete is respectful of the ongoing discussions, in collaboration with the community.

## Timeline

Expected implementation date: November 2024

Final implementation date: June 2024

## Milestones

- Creation of Pilot Holistic Review and ATRT4 project management documentation (by August 2024 and February 2025, respectively).
- Updating applicable sections of the Operating Standards for Specific Reviews.