

---

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the ALAC Monthly Teleconference Call on Tuesday the 27<sup>th</sup> of February 2021 at 16:00 UTC.

On the call today we have Maureen Hilyard, Dave Kissoondoyal, Sarah Kiden, Justine Chew, Joanna Kulesza, Jonathan Zuck, Barrack Otieno, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Tijani Been Jemaa, Bram Fudzulani, Shreedeeep Rayamajhi, Ana Sanchez, Lilian Ivette De Luque, Alan Greenberg, Aziz Hilali, Satish Babu, Sébastien Bachollet, José Lebron, Alberto Soto, Carlos Vera Quintana. And we have received apologies from Holly Raiche.

From staff we have Heidi Ullrich, Gisella Gruber, Evin Erdoğdu, Yeşim Nazlar, and myself, Claudia Ruiz, on call management.

Our Spanish interpreters for today are Verónica, David, and Sabrina. And our French interpreters are Isabelle, Camila, and Maria.

If I could please remind everyone to state their names when taking the floor for the transcription purposes and also so the interpreters can identify you on the other language channels. And to please keep your microphones muted when not speaking to prevent any background noise.

Thank you very much. And with this, I turn the call over to Maureen. Oh, and one more reminder that we do have real-time transcribing on the call. I will put a link in the agenda so you can follow along if you wish. Thank you very much. Over to you, Maureen.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much, Claudia. Wow. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening wherever you are today. We do have quite a significant number of people here today because we do have quite a different kind of agenda for our meeting today. So, I hope you enjoy it and that we will get a lot done today [inaudible].

Just going through, first of all, we do have some special guests with us today and I will introduce them. But we have our guests, and then we will continue on with, basically, a normal kind of ALAC agenda following on from this with some updates next.

Because we are going to be pressed for time and we do want to hear from these special guests that we actually have, I think we'll just get started quickly.

Okay. First of all, we do have action items. Are there any action items [inaudible]?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Hi, Maureen?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Heidi, yes?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Hi. So, I've seen that I'm actually supposed to add a regularly slot on the ALAC Monthly for NomCom updates. I did not do that yet, but I could

---

either add it under Operations, Maureen, or I could add it under AOB for this meeting. And then we can add it as a regular slot for the next meeting. Is that okay?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay, okay. Yeah, that's fine. We'll put it within the AOB for today. That's fine.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Okay. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: There are quite a few additional things that we put in this time, so we'll probably just drop something. But, yeah, that's easily fixed. Thank you very much, Heidi.

Okay. So, leaving that then, we'll just move on to the agenda. Back to the agenda, please. Okay.

So, one of the first things that we're going to have this morning—[inaudible] [morning my time] [inaudible] morning, actually—is the introduction to the Zoom interpretation feature that will be part of ICANN70. And we're very, very pleased to actually have Christina and Sara with us today to explain.

And I know that they've already done this to the Technology Task Force, and there have been some great reports. So, I'm really looking forward to being introduced to this, and I know that At-Large has been pushing

---

for improved services, for example. And this is something that we'll be very pleased to be able to see that has been made an improvement to, and looking forward to hearing more about it. Thank you, Christina and Sara.

SARA CAPLIS:

Hi, everyone. Next slide, please. For those of you that don't know me, my name is Sara Caplis and I'm the manager of Meetings Technical Services at ICANN. Today, I'm going to give a quick tutorial on the remote simultaneous interpretation feature within Zoom and how the integration is configured. Going forward, we'll refer to remote simultaneous interpretation as RSI.

So, for those of you that were able to download the Zoom application, you'll see the interpretation icon located in the Zoom toolbar. Please click on this icon now to select the language of your choice from the menu. Today we have English, French, and Spanish provided.

Regardless of which language you'll speak, go ahead and make sure that's selected prior to unmuting your microphone. So, today I'm speaking English so I have selected the English channel. You can also mut and unmute the original floor audio as you wish. When the original audio is unmuted, you'll hear it quietly in the background.

We recommend that until all of us are in the habit of selecting the proper language from this menu, that you leave the original floor audio unmuted. This will allow the person speaking to be heard even if they've forgotten or were unable to select the language from the language menu.

---

Please note that in order to use this feature, you have to download the Zoom application and join with your computer audio. Next slide, please.

This slide shows the integration between the RSI platform and Zoom which allowed us to simplify the service for our participants. During ICANN70, participants will use Zoom alone just as we're doing today. The RP Managers or staff facilitators and participants are displayed in the bottom left corner of this slide, and they're simply joining Zoom where they will be able to speak or hear any of the supported languages.

In the top left corner, we have the Language Services Team. They join the RSI platform and provide interpretation of the audio coming from Zoom. Each language is supported by three to four people, each taking turns providing interpretation and communicating requests or issues back to the Technical Support Team.

In a scenario where five or more languages are required, there may be 24 interpreters taking part in the call. In the top right, we have the Congress Rental Network Team, and they manage the RSI platform and the integration into Zoom. Their team is ensuring that the interpreters are receiving the proper audio needed to provide interpretation.

They're also responsible for sending the participants the proper audio from the RSI platform. This is done with a single computer for each language assigned to the proper channels within Zoom.

You can see on the slide there's a lot of red identified, and that's audio. That's always passing back and forth between Zoom and the RSI platform.

---

And then in the bottom right is the Meetings Technical Services Team, and we're responsible for managing Zoom and all other technical aspects of the call.

All three teams are in constant communication with one another and monitoring both platforms to relay and troubleshoot any issues. As you can see, providing this service requires many resources and proper planning, but ultimately provides an improved experience.

For those that are unable to download the Zoom application and therefore don't see this icon, during ICANN70 we'll have an alternative means for them to join. For the purposes of today's call, just make sure that you're using the Zoom application if possible.

With that, I'm going to pass to Christina Rodriguez to explain a little bit more. Thank you.

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ:

Hello, everyone. Thank you, Sara. My name is Christina Rodriguez and I am the Senior Director of the Language Services Department for ICANN. I am now going to be speaking Spanish, so I will change channels to do that. And that way, you can test a little more of how this works.

Before I do that, I'm just going to give you a brief history of what we did. So, as you may recall during the ICANN68 and ICANN69, participants had to operate two platforms, Zoom being one of them, to access and participate in the meeting or session as if you were in the meeting room doing a face-to-face meeting.

---

And then the Congress Rental Network platform to hear interpretation [being this] what will be replacing the headset that you pick up at the entrance of the meeting. So, this provided the option of having a cellphone to replace that headset.

So, in an effort to improve the experience, along with the Congress Rental work on trying to find a way to integrate the RSI, or Remote Simultaneous Interpretation, platform into Zoom so that we could provide this service for you in one single place and make this more friendly and easier for the participants to use.

So, now I'll move to the Spanish channel and provide you some way of testing how this is working.

[Speaking Spanish]

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you very much, Christina and Sara. We do have some questions. Sébastien, you may take the floor.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Thank you very much. Thank you, Christina, for the presentation. Just to be sure what I need to do if now I want to talk in French. I need to go like if I want to listen to the French channel and I start to talk there? Or how it is working?

---

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ: Yes, Sébastien. You are correct. All you need to do to interact in your own language is just choose the language at the bottom. If you choose French, you will be able to speak in French and to hear everything else in French as well. That will be the French interpreter or anybody that, in the session, was speaking French.

Of course, when you want to speak, you need to unmute yourself. Or if the meeting is a webinar where they need to give you access for speaking, they will do that. But as long as you have clicked on the icon of the language of your choice, you will be able to hear and speak everything in that language.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Okay. May I do the test, please?

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ: Of course.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: [Speaking French]

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ: Great. How did it work for you?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Christina. Judith, you have your hand up.



---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. Thank so much. So, Sara is also looking into my first question. I had two questions of why the RTT was not being ingested into Zoom. And that's possibly because, maybe, when they added the language feature on, they forgot to check the box. Who knows?

But my question is, if we're not using Zoom's language feature and we're using Congress Rental, does that many more languages are available to participants than those listed in the Zoom Language Interpretation?

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ: I think Sara and I will both need to actually respond to your questions. First of all, Zoom Interpretation doesn't exist yet. It's not a feature that is available to you, so this is ...

As I mentioned before, we worked to make this happen, so this is actually Congress Rental integrated into Zoom so that you and the rest of the community or any user can have the possibility of having a seamless and more agile and friendly environment to work without having to deal with too many devices at the same time so that it's all in one place.

In regards to RTT, this is a demo for interpretation, so I will give it to Sara to respond to you so that you have an answer and not just guessing. So, Sara, whatever you want to add my response.

SARA CAPLIS: Hi, everyone. So, to Judith's point in chat, the Zoom Interpretation feature exists in a form, but it does not exist in the professional manner

---

in which we provide interpretation. Meaning that the audio relay that we rely on to provide interpretation does not yet exist in Zoom. So, this feature is relatively new in terms of being considered non-Beta within Zoom, and we have continued to ask them to develop that. But in the meantime, we are using this integration with Congress Rental Network so that we can continue to provide the high standards that we're accustomed to.

That being said, from a technical perspective, you have the opportunity within the Zoom platform to relabel or have some ad hoc language choices. However, because we're using live interpreters, we will continue to provide the languages that we currently support. So, English, French, Spanish, Chinese, Russian, Arabic, and on occasion Portuguese.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you. Abdeldjalil.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much. First of all, thank you for the wonderful presentation. My question is, for example, if I'm not selecting any of the languages, what is the default language that I will be listening to? Because I noticed that when Sebastien was speaking in French, [inaudible].

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ: Is anybody speaking? I don't hear anybody speaking.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Oh, yes. Abdulkarim was speaking, but he may be speaking over the Adigo bridge. I hear him.

SARA CAPLIS: I hear him. I can take his question.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Oh, okay.

SARA CAPLIS: Go ahead and complete your question.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: What is going to be the default language [when I] do not select any of those other languages?

SARA CAPLIS: So, if you enter Zoom and you are unable to select a language or you just choose not to select a language from that icon, the language that you'll hear is called the original audio, sometimes referred to as the floor audio. And that's whatever the person who is speaking is actually speaking.

So, if I were to switch to French right now without having selected a language and you haven't selected a language, we would hear me in French.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Okay. Thank you.

SARA CAPLIS: You're welcome.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Abdulkarim. Actually, it's probably me, but I was actually calling on Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong to take the floor. Sorry, Abdeldjalil.

ABDELDJALIL BACHAR BONG: [Speaking French]

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you. I'm showing we have we have Sébastien. I guess, Abdulkarim, that's an old hand. Sébastien.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: [Speaking French]

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Sébastien, for that. I actually hadn't noticed that either, but [I don't] mind having that little muted voice in the background.

But I think that I'd really like to thank the members for asking your questions. But I truly do thank you, Sara and Christina, for this

---

demonstration. I think we and At-Large very much appreciate that ICANN's technical team has developed a solution that gives us an even more improved service than I expected, anyway. I'm just quite thrilled about it.

But as you've seen, there are many of our At-Large members who very much appreciate the service. And, as they say, not everyone had two pieces of equipment to actually use the service. And the fact that this has been integrated into the Zoom feature that we're using is really great.

What I wanted to ask is, is this just for ICANN meetings, or is it for all meetings?

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ: Go ahead, Sara.

SARA CAPLIS: Thanks. So, this feature will be used for ICANN meetings. It will also be used for regional meetings such as the DNS forums, for instance. But then regular meetings and webinars scheduled throughout the month will continue to be managed via teleconference interpretation.

MAUREEN HILYARD: All right. That's great. Thank you very much. Well, it all makes ICANN meetings seem a little bit different for us, and I think that's really, really great for all of us.

---

Thank you very much for coming today, and I understand you're going to be staying for a little while just to see how things go. So, you're welcome to stay as long as you like. Thank you very much.

SARA CAPLIS: Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay, thank you. So, let's carry on with our meeting using our new features for the Zoom meeting. Can I see the ... Oh, okay. Can we just go to the Agenda first, please?

And while Claudia is getting the agenda up, I see that Olivier has his hand up. So, we'll take that one question now. Olivier. [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I can't hear Olivier.

MAUREEN HILYARD: I can't.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Olivier, if you're speaking, try to get off mute.

---

CLAUDIA RUIZ: I believe Olivier may be trying to speak in French. Give it one moment, please. Maureen, we're not getting anything from Olivier. Perhaps we can move on until ...

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yeah. Later on. Okay. Let's move on, then.

Our next guest speaker is someone who's pretty well known to all of us. But the guest speaker series that we're actually establishing for ALAC ... I guess it has come about due to the formation of the Operations, Finance, and Budget Working Group [we now have], and that we've been going through the ICANN operational plans and just realizing that there is quite a lot happening within ICANN that we really should know more about because it actually does impact on us as a community of Internet users.

So, what I thought we would do is introduce a guest speaker from within the ICANN system to actually explain some of the things that are happening within ICANN. It would better inform us about the organization in which we operate.

The first one is someone I thought [inaudible]. He's a friend of At-Large, and we do need to know more about what is actually happening, especially as domain abuse is a real key policy area for us.

So, I'd like to welcome you, John. And we are looking forward to hearing more about the particular [inaudible] [involved in]. Thank you.

---

JOHN CRAIN: Thank you. Can everybody hear me? Or anybody hear me?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Start talking. We can.

JOHN CRAIN: Okay. So, interesting to hear about the translation devices. Bom dia. Buenos dias. Hoi [inaudible], I guess, for the people in the Netherlands and that part of the world. I've got this set to English which is my native language, and hopefully it works.

So, I'm going to talk a little bit about one very specific activity that we're doing in our group. I run a small group inside the office of the Chief Technology Officer. I am the Chief Security, Stability, and Resiliency Officer. And the group I manage tackles with a lot of the issues around security threats that either use or threaten the DNS ecosystem.

We have one particular tool that gathers a lot of interest and is often discussed within the ICANN community. And that's what we call DAAR, or the Domain Abuse Activity Reporting tool. Next slide, please.

So, what is DAAR? So, DAAR is literally just a measurement tool. We designed it quite a few years ago with some specific ideas in mind. The idea was that we would look at reputation data to look at what kind of threats were being seen out there by third parties related to domain names. And we were looking at this at the generic top-level domain level, and I'll come to that in a minute of why.



---

And one of the thoughts is [that] it could help the community and operators understand what their reputation is out there in the real Internet world—if you can call the Internet a real world—and how that’s affecting their anti-abuse programs, etc., and how maybe we can improve things.

A couple of things that people always ask us about is why doesn’t DAAR provide very specific actionable data (i.e. this specific domain name has this specific problem)?

One of the reasons is [that] it just wasn’t designed for that. It wasn’t part of the original design goal. And we also don’t currently rank the TLDs in order of who had the highest or the lowest concentration. That also wasn’t really one of the design goals. That doesn’t mean that in the future we can’t change the design goals as we evolve DAAR, but in the original design, that was not part of the plan. Next slide, please.

So, DAAR uses two types of data. One is zone data which is the DNS data related to gTLDs. And the other are what we call reputation block lists. These are the kinds of lists that people use to protect their online experience whether that’s in their firewalls on their networks or even in their browser.

And all of this data that we use is available in some matter, but some of it we actually have to license. So, some of it is public data and some of it is commercial data. Next slide, please.

So, we get the zone files from something called the Centralized Zone Data Service. It’s a service that ICANN runs and any researcher, or in theory, anybody can signup to get access to the zone files from the

---

generic top-level domain (TLDs). So, we try and use data that is available to other people, too. So, the CZDS is where we get the zone data.

We manage to collect zone files for approximately 1,220 TLDs every day. That's approximately 192 million domain names that are resolving, because they're in the zone files, that we look at. Why do we say approximately? Well, because we rely on CZDS, sometimes we can't get particular zone files. Anybody who does research in this area will be well aware of the struggle of making sure that you get every single piece of data every single day.

So, if you would go and look at the reports, which I'll [talk to] in a minute, you might see different numbers of gTLDs. And that's simply because of availability of the zone files. Next slide, please.

So, the kinds of reputation data we collect relates to four specific types of what we call security threats: phishing, malware, botnet command & control, and spam when it's used to facilitate the other threats. Next slide, please.

So, the basic methodology is you take the gTLD zone files. If the name is resolving, you see if the name is on a reputation block list. You do that for every single name. And this allows you to understand what we call an abuse score which is the number of security threats per gTLD. So, for every gTLD, we do actually get what we call an abuse score which is the number of threats in that TLD. Next slide, please.

So, there are two different ways you can see this data. Now, if you operate a gTLD—and I understand that many people in ALAC, just by the nature of the group, don't do so—you can actually get daily data dumps.

---

We have an API, an access portal, where the registries can go and get their daily scores via the MoSAPI. And all registries have access to that.

But for the public, we also publish monthly reports. And we publish them, and I'll come to the exact timing and stuff, every month and have been so for a few years now. Next slide, please.

So, the first week of every month, we go and look at the data from the previous month and we create a monthly report. If you go to this URL, then you can actually all of the reports going back to January 2018. We actually have data going back a little bit further than that, but we decided January was a good month to start, and in 2018 we started.

They are currently based on data from the last day of the month. We are looking at changing that to do an average over the month, and that change will be coming soon. But the original design was the last day of the month, and we're still on that at this moment.

So, the reports will contain anonymous and aggregated data. So, if you go see the reports, you will see some of the various types of data you can get. And I'll show you a couple of the graphs that we can generate ourselves from DAAR. We also have an interfaced where we can interrogate the data in different ways. But for the monthly reports, it's a set format. That format will be slightly changing going forward. Next slide, please.

So, if you look in DAAR data and you go back to October of 2017—as I said, we have data going back beyond the reports—you can see some basic general trend lines. The number of names in the zones, or the

---

number of names in use, is actually going up. I think there's no surprise there.

The number of security threats within the gTLDs is going down. Now if you look at that red one, you'll see that it actually fluctuates. It goes up and down as the year goes through. We're on an upward trend at the moment since about August, but if you take the [mean] here and you take the line, it is a general downward trend.

The blue line on the one graph and the red line on the upper graph is the implementation of something call GDPR. You may have heard of it. So, there's always the question of how did GDPR affect the data. There are lots of theories around this, but if you look at the data, the lines don't particularly seem to have changed. We'll know more along the term, but this is actual data that we're collecting on a daily basis and it is what it is. Next slide, please.

So, this is sort of the trend, but it also splits out the data by the type. As you can see, the spam, as a vector is, by far, the largest form of security threat that we see. But we do see phishing, malware, and command & control. Once again, this data goes back to October, so it predates the report slightly.

But you can see that general line, where it has been. In early 2018, the numbers were much higher than they are now. But in periods of 2019, they were lower. So, this does fluctuate. What DAAR does, and one of the biggest purposes of DAAR, was to actually let us measure this. So, this is the reputation of gTLDs over a period of time. And pre-DAAR, we really didn't have any data. Next slide, please.

---

And these are the various threat types split out by type. As you can see, they all fluctuate. What causes these is often interesting. If you see some of the spikes, if you look at the top one—that is the phishing—and the one below it—malware. What’s interesting about those threat types is [that] they’re often driven by large campaigns. And sometimes if you go back and you look at this data, you can actually match it up to some of the campaigns that were occurring. So, the behavior of the bad guys. When they do a new campaign, they often go and register new names related to that and bring them into use.

And you can sometimes see things like this in the data, which is really interesting—at least from a geek’s perspective like mine. I love having data because we can go look at it and say, “Oh. What caused this? Can we actually go and find something that looks like it co-relates to it?” Next slide, please.

So, something that’s new to DAAR in the last months is that we originally designed it for the gTLDs. The reason for that was really the data sets. There is no centralized source of zone file data for ccTLDs. But back last year, we decided to offer the service on a voluntary basis to any ccTLD who wanted to participate.

These listed here are the current participants. So, they also have access to the MoSAPI facility, so they can get their daily reports. But we decided nearly the end of last year that not everybody has the skillset to generate reports even if you give them data or the resources.

So, we’re doing an experiment at the moment, and we produced individualized monthly reports. So, you take the monthly report that we

---

make public and then we overlay that with the data of the particular TLD. And we send those to the ccTLDs operator. And those have been well received.

And we will be looking at whether or not we expand that to all TLDs. The first question we got from other operators was, "Oh, can we get these?" because it saves them doing the work. And it's actually not a lot of work on our side because we have all of the scripts and the technology in place to generate these reports.

So, that's a new service that we're giving currently to the ccTLDs who participate, but we are looking at giving them to anybody that is measured in DAAR at some point in the future. And there's a blog there about this. And hopefully we'll share the slides afterwards. Next slide, please.

So, this is for anybody who's a ccTLD. We try and make it fairly easy for them. I'm not going to spend a lot of time on this. You can write to myself or any of my staff and we can point this to you. But because it's on a voluntary basis, the ccTLDs actually have to come to us and go through a process so we can actually get their zone files on a daily basis. And then we also have to give them access to the MoSAPI so they can get the daily results.

We are seeing more and more ccTLDs come forward and saying that they actually want to participate. I think having a monthly report generated for them where they can compare themselves with the public report is a useful tool for the registries to understand where they sit in the ecosystem. Next slide, please.

So, what do we plan to do moving ahead? So, we've been discussing DAAR and have [had] DAAR, now, for a few years. We want to add more ccTLDs. We're seeing more and more coming forward and saying, "Yes, please. We'd really like to participate."

We really want to improve the visuals and the way that they can be interrogated. "Precision" is probably not the right word for this, but it's making sure that they're more understandable by the layperson. If you read the reports and you don't work on research and DNS abuse and security threats, sometimes it can be a little bit hard to follow. And we understand that, so we're going to try and make it easier to read.

We're also going to do some measurements slightly differently. We've had a lot of conversations with community. We specifically had a months-long discussion with the registries, the gTLDs registries. The RySG, which is part of the community, had a DAAR Working Group. And we had actually fantastic discussions with them about the technology and about the way we measured and the science beyond the measurements—partly to help them to understand the science, but also to understand where there were more things that we could do that were useful to them so that they could use the DAAR data in other ways; and also to add clarity to some of the things that even the, as people who work in the industry, were struggling with.

We want to add registrar-level metrics. It was a part of the original goals. There's a really interesting facet of identified data and registration data. There is not a single place where you can connect every name to its registrar. Well, there is, but it's WHOIS. And I personally believe that doing 192 or 200 million WHOIS queries a day is

---

---

not the most scalable way of collecting data. So, we're looking at different ways to scale our data collection so that we can actually couple every name with every registrar every day. It's actually quite a complex problem.

We are looking at other solutions, like should we just look to the block listed names and only query that and then find the number of names that a registrar has through some other mechanism? So, this is something we've been struggling with for quite a while, and we're actually working with the registries and registrars to try and see if there's a solution to actually solve this data. Not only for us at ICANN, but for other researchers.

One of the other unwritten goals of DAAR was for us to ... There's a saying in English about eating your own dogfood which sounds horrible, but what it really means is that you use your own tools and your own processes yourselves. If you inflict something on somebody else, you must also use it yourself to find where the real issues are.

So, this is one of the issues that we found when we did that. Issues around CZDS were also things that we found. So, any solution that we find to these problems we want to work for everybody. Next slide, please.

Okay. So, I think that this is where you can write if you have questions. But I'm happy to take questions about DAAR or other projects that the SSR group is working on because this, as I said, is just one of the many tools that we have. With that, I'm happy to take questions.



---

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much, John. Yeah. Thank you. We do have a hand up at the moment. Jonathan.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, Maureen. Thanks, John, for your presentation. I was struck by something you said at the end, that you want a system that works for everyone. And the system seems designed to be a tool of most use to the Contracted Parties themselves, to the operators. And I'm wondering what, if anything, you imagine to be the future of this tool to make it useful to security researchers, consumer protection agencies, individual users that are trying to choose an operator with whom they might do business.

How could it be made useful to those outside of the operator community?

JOHN CRAIN: So, myself and my researchers have a million and one ideas about things we could do, but we really look to community. And I do agree that because of the MoSAPI interface—which, by the way, I didn't even know existed when we started designing DAAR—it has become a more interesting tool for the Contracted Parties. But it was never really designed for that. It was really designed to help inform policy discussions or to have informed policy discussions, and to give us as research geeks insight.

If you look at some of the recommendations coming out of the reviews, there are recommendations in there about adding some level of

---

transparency about which gTLD is ranked where. Those reviews come in from the community. I don't know where they're going to end up, but there are certainly suggestions about adding more transparency about who is where. That might be useful to a consumer who's trying to pick where they want to be.

I have to say that I think the average consumer is not likely to use something like DAAR because it might be a little bit complex, but I could be completely wrong there.

There are probably other metrics. I think if we could solve the registrar problem, that may actually be more useful to consumers than at the TLD level. I wish that we could find a mechanism for sharing some of the more granular data. Most of the problems there are legal, not technical. As I said, we pay for licenses, and licenses restrict what we can [sift] through with the data.

So, more access to data, I think, would be useful. We try to ensure that our methodology is replicable so that people can use it. I know that there are at least some researchers who have taken parts of our methodology and applied it, which I think is good. I don't think that really applies to the end user although, obviously, there are end users that do like to build tools. I mean, geeks are end users. I'm an end user, too, in the end.

So, I think it's a really interesting question. I don't think there is a singular answer. I think it's more transparency into the data.

---

And I think another thing that we would like to do as we go into a redevelopment. We are planning to redevelop DAAR based on inputs that we've received. And we will open up for more input.

I think a more interactive interface, rather than a monthly, report where people can go in and, if you like, generate their own reports is one idea that we'd like to explore. We've not fully understood the operational implications of that: expense, etc.

But in general, I think what I say is we are open to any ideas of how we can improve this. And Jonathan, you and I have had discussions around abuse issues, and I know you'll have a strong interest in this. I'd like people to think beyond DAAR. What things would be useful to see measured. And what data would be useful to the community, no matter which area of the community; and to have tools built? Right?

We are doing other measurements around other things. A few things we're in the process of measuring is RDAP deployment. That's the new Registration Data Access Protocol. We've been measuring things around COVID. We're actually doing some actionable data around COVID things.

So, DAAR is one tool. So, if you can think of the wider question of, if I could have some measurement or some access to data that would be useful. I think that would be a great discussion to have.

I only have three researchers, which is a lot more than a lot of people have, I understand. But they are very eager to explore other avenues.

---

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, John. Can I just have one more question? Jonathan, if you could leave your question for John later. But, Alan, you've had your hand up for a while and we do have quite a bit of an agenda to get through in the last half hour of our meeting. Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you very much. Not really a question, but an observation. And maybe you'll give any thoughts you have on it. Your comments about cooperative work with registries and registrars is interesting. In any public meeting where DAAR is brought up, the comments from registries and registrars are invariably very, very negative, saying, "Yeah. It's using unreliable data. You can't trust it. We have problems with block lists all the time."

So, your comments of working cooperatively with them and them maybe being interesting in using the data is a sharp contrast with what seems to be said publicly. And I wonder if you have any thoughts on that.

JOHN CRAIN: Yeah. Welcome to my world. Buy me a beer at the bar and then beat me in public. I should have a t-shirt.

I think—and if you read the RySG letter—that they do have concerns about block lists. But I think they've accepted that this is a fairly normal process to use block lists. Right? The whole Internet industry uses them.

You'd have to ask them, but the discussions we had with the DAAR Working Group, which is a subset, were extremely professional and very

---

productive. There's no other way of really putting it. It was very much focused on discussion around the science and how to improve the DAAR reports and the DAAR system.

I'm very used to the anomaly that industry will often say one thing in public, but then when you ask them to work with you on private, they're happy to do so.

Yeah. It's interesting is all I can say to that. But, yes, it does seem a bit of an interesting phenomenon.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, John. Sébastien, I see your hand is up. If you could make a very, very quick intervention, that would be fine. Thank you.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: I will, Maureen. Thank you very much, John, for your presentation. I guess, for the first time, I understand what you were talking about. [inaudible].

JOHN CRAIN: I don't hear Sébastien, so I don't know if the translation is working.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I hear him.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yes. We can hear him.

JOHN CRAIN: Let me unmute the original and see if I can hear him.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: I am not talking in French, John.

JOHN CRAIN: Yeah. I had the original muted. I can only just hear him.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Okay, thank you.

JOHN CRAIN: Now I can.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you, John, for your presentation. And I want to repeat that for the first time, I understand the presentation about this topic. It was very well done.

I just wanted to suggest that maybe something you may wish to do is to come back to ... A long time ago when the first new gTLD came, and one of the reasons ICANN launched a second round in 2004 was to provide the possibility for ICANN to gather data to answer some of the questions we had in 2000 and 2004.

---

And I think some of them you are already doing, but some of them may be still useful. And I will be happy to discuss that with you when we will have a chance to have a drink together. Thank you.

JOHN CRAIN:

Yeah. Absolutely. And we do go back and look at things. But, yeah. If you can point me to certain things that you think would be useful, that's fantastic.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

[Part are] things that have been published and we need to discuss together. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you, Sébastien. Thank you, John. Because this is a topic that is more technical than many of us in At-Large can totally comprehend, I just think that ... I agree with Sébastien. There are many of us who are here today who will [inaudible] a lot more about what it is that ICANN's actually doing to ensure that the Internet is being kept [and that] they're actually keeping a tab on things so that, for us as ordinary Internet users, we can be assured that there are some protections in place to make sure that we can use it accordingly. Thanks, John.

JOHN CRAIN:

Yeah. Excellent. And on that. Well, firstly, thank you for inviting me. I love the At-Large community. They have the best events when we have meetings, which we don't have at the moment.

---

I will say when you find those technical types starting to speak Martian, which we have a habit of doing, please ... I mean, don't kick us, but just tell us because we do have habit of thinking that things we know, other people know. And obviously, that's not true. Everybody has their specialty, and it's good if you remind us to speak in plain language.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Awesome. Thank you. [inaudible]. Okay, let's move on. Very grateful for our presenters this morning, afternoon, or evening, wherever you are.

But let's move on because we do have a few important things to get through as part of our normal ALAC meeting. So, this one is Evin who will give us an update on our membership. And I'm sure she'll take [all of the three] minutes I'm going to give her. Thank you, Evin.

EVIN ERDOĞDU:

Thanks, Maureen. So, we have the tabs if you're on the agenda that you can scroll through, but the total number of ALSes is 250. And that's because, on the second tab, you'll see [that] two ALSes were recently certified. Both of them were from AFRALO.

There is one ALS that is in the process for decertification from EURALO, but it's just pending some confirmation before proceeding to the ALAC decertification vote. And otherwise, there's one application waiting for some feedback and several on hold at this stage.

For individuals, there are now 143 individuals and 20 observers. One was recently accepted in EURALO, and we have an application from an individual in APRALO on the way.



---

And just to note the individual's growth chart that was prepared by [APRIN] is on the agenda, but it's a little out of date. So, I'm just going to make a note to update this for the next call.

So, with that, unless there are questions, back to you, Maureen. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you so much, Evin. It was under two minutes. Okay, thank you.

Let's move on to our ... [inaudible] see the numbers [inaudible]. Moving on to our reports from our liaisons and RALO leaders, if there's anything absolutely missing.

Yes, Cheryl. You may take the floor.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:

Thank you, Maureen. Cheryl Langdon-Orr for the record. Absolutely essential from my perspective. I wanted to make sure it was on the record.

After—oh, boy—six years, and it feels like an eternity, I'm delighted to say that the next and most important step of the Subsequent Procedures Policy Development Process was recently jumped over, crawled through, burrowed through, whatever. We dug our way out of the quagmire, and it was an awful lot of dancing before the meeting.

But, at the February meeting, the link I put in the chat is to the GNSO Liaison Report page, and all the gory details are there. But there was a

---

unanimous vote to adopt the report from the Subsequent Procedures PDP Working Group. So, special thank to all of the At-Large community.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yay.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Yay, indeed. Special thanks to all of the At-Large community who contributed over the years, but obviously I have to call out, in particular, the heroic efforts both in the Subsequent Procedures PDP and for the Consolidated Policy Working Group that our very own Justine Chew has done. She's has been phenomenal. So, thank you and that's it from me. But lots more to read on the Report page.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Awesome. Thank you very much, Cheryl. Sébastien.

SÉBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Yes, thank you. Just a short [teasing]. At 7 pm UTC we will have the second addition of the monthly roundtable by EURALO with the topic of Internet and jurisdiction domain name issues. And we will talk also about what we just finished, the talk with John. And we will have Bertrand de la Chapelle as the primary speaker, and other speakers.

Please join us. Thank you.

---

MAUREEN HILYARD: Awesome. I thank you very much for raising that. And, yes, if you're available, please [pop] along to that event.

Yes, Abdeldjalil.

ABDELDJALIL BACHAR BONG: [Speaking French]

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much to AFRALO. And I think it's very important that at this particular meeting, this is an opportunity to definitely advertise, if you can call it that, what different RALOs are doing. And other RALOs are invited to participate and [attend them].

It really does show that the types of activities that are taking place at RALO level is really quite exciting and they're becoming very, very much engaging. And, in fact, a lot of people [inaudible], which is really great.

Okay, so moving. I don't see any other hands, and that's not a problem. [inaudible] at the moment. We'll just have a very quick update from the policy team. Olivier, Jonathan, or Holly? No, not Holly. She's not here. Olivier?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yeah. Hi, there. Is that to me? I thought it was Evin who usually gives a quick update on the policy. Evin Erdoğdu?

---

EVIN ERDOĞDU:

Okay, Maureen and Olivier. Thanks. I can just run through what's on the agenda here.

Statements ratified by the ALAC recently since the last ALAC meeting. There were two. One from OFB Working Group, on the FY22-26 Operating & Financial Plan and Budget; as well as the Operational Design Phase Concept Paper via the CPWG. And probably Olivier and Jonathan will discuss as well, Göran Marby was the guest to discuss that with the CPWG.

Public comment for decision. There are currently two. The first one there on IANA Naming Function Review is actually going to be shepherded by the Operations, Finance and Budget Working Group. There was just confirmation that Amy Creamer will present to the working group this week.

And there's also another ICANN public comment on the EPDP Phase 2 closing at the end of March.

So, current statements that are being developed. Actually, first is ALAC Advice to the ICANN Board on Subsequent Procedures led by Justine Chew. As well as the Second Security, Stability, and Resiliency Review Team Final Report with Alejandro and Greg on the drafting team.

And then finally, the EU Directive on the Security of Network and Information Systems, or NIS 2 Directive. There's a webinar this Friday discussing this in more detail held by ICANN and Elene Plexida of the CPWG last week to discuss this. And it's not a formal ICANN public comment, but it looks like ALAC will definitely have some comments on this.

---

Thanks. I'll turn it back to Olivier or Jonathan. Thanks.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, Evin.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: I was going to let Jonathan [inaudible].

JONATHAN ZUCK: Sure. Thanks, Olivier and Evin. Thanks for that overview, Evin. Yes, we were indeed ... We did have Göran speak at our last CPWG meeting on the ODP. And one of the things he really emphasized is for us not to underestimate the value and importance of our ability to advise directly to the Board.

But Alan and others pointed out that the most effective form of participation was along the way and making sure that—and Alan's probably going to speak to this—making sure that we have the capacity to participate fully throughout the process. And so, it wasn't anything about which we reached clarity on the last CPWG call, but some of those feelings were surfaced about the ODP.

Alan, I'll go ahead and let you explain your own comment.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. I wasn't going to speak on that. We made our comments. To be honest, I don't think we were successful, and I don't think we'll be

---

heated. But we made our comments. Göran was particularly not very receptive to the concept when we talked about it.

I put my hand up on NIS 2 just to note [that] there is a webinar this Friday with the EU people on NIS 2, and I'll be submitting a few questions to it in my own capacity. There's no time to do it on a formal basis. But anyone who's interested in NIS 2 should probably look at participating. It's a long two- or three-hour webinar. Let me check.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Yeah. Please do post the link. I think that will be an interesting one for those that—

ALAN GREENBERG: It is four and a half hours scheduled long. So, a real marathon and should be quite interesting. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Those that are sufficiently caffeinated, please give us the link, Alan. Thanks.

ALAN GREENBERG: And there seems to be already a link there. Someone [inaudible].

MAUREEN HILYARD: That's great.

---

JONATHAN ZUCK: I think that's it, Maureen. Back to you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Jonathan. Okay. So, moving on. As you can see, a very busy time for the policy teams.

Moving on. We're going on to just the ordinary work plan. [inaudible] ordinary, sort of like At-Large work plan. So, like what's ahead for these particular areas in March. If there's anything absolutely burning, because I'm only going to give you 30 seconds. Well, 30 seconds [inaudible] a minute [inaudible]. So [inaudible] work. If you have anything, can you put your hand up so I can see who's got something to actually raise over and above what's already on the screen?

We've already heard from policy anyway, and I know that there are some interesting things happening within Operations, Finance, and Budget, especially with the Work Stream 2 group that's been working very, very diligently on their prioritization activities.

Capacity Building. We've still got a major and really interesting webinar program that is in place already, as well as some ICANN Learn courses which I know are ... I think one of their ICANN Learn courses, Welcome to Our World, is almost ready to go out. They've been doing some final checks on that one, and it's been really interesting.

And moving up. I know that Daniel has arrived. Daniel, do you want to say anything about Outreach and Engagement? Can you speak?

---

DANIEL NANGHAKA: I hope you can hear me.

MAUREEN HILYARD: No, obviously not.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Sorry about that. [inaudible].

MAUREEN HILYARD: Lilian, because we have to [inaudible] leading into [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Maureen, Daniel is speaking.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Oh, is he? I'm not hearing anything.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: [inaudible]. At least we are putting forth strong [inaudible] together with the Social Media Working Group. [And it has been a] tremendous job. And since we changed our leadership, our structures in that was [inaudible] [hosting] the ICANN meeting. The current chair of [our respective region] with the liaison takes up [inaudible] respective activities. I'm happy to share that [inaudible] doing a great job there [inaudible] from there. Yeah.



---

Let me just give the floor back to Maureen. That was just a brief, quick update. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Am I the only one that actually can't hear Daniel?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Maureen, it's because you didn't unmute. You should never use Mute Original Audio. If you do that, you can't hear the people speaking in a different language.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Thank you, Judith. Maureen, Daniel already gave his update. If you can please move on to the next person.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Daniel was speaking in English.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay. I'm not quite sure why I couldn't hear it. That's okay. All right. Thank you, Daniel. Sorry I missed it.

Okay. [I have to look at] the channel [was up], but I do note that when I went into it, that I had muted the original audio even though I had it on English. So, yeah. That's something that I'll have to watch out for. Okay.

So, moving on. Is Lilian here just to give a very, very brief update on what's happening with social media?

LILIAN DE LUQUE BRUGES: [Speaking Spanish]

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yes, we can hear you, Lilian. Yes. Thank you very much.

LILIAN DE LUQUE BRUGES: Okay. [Speaking Spanish]

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much, Lilian, for that update. Very much appreciate it.

Moving on to Operations as we heard earlier. I think that one of the big milestones for us is achieving the Individual Members document that is actually being prepared at the moment. And that will certainly help us achieve some of the final [bits] to our At-Large Review [where we now] will have some very clear guidelines for ALSes and individual members moving forward. So, that's probably something that will be happening within the March timeframe.

Okay. I see Roberto's got his hand up. Yes, Roberto.

ROBERTO GAETANO: You said it all. I would just confirm that the final trimming and fine tuning is taking a little bit longer than expected. But we expect to have the last meeting of the working party this coming Monday, and to have

---

a document at least in draft form ready for distribution by then. Thank you. That's all.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

And I would like to thank Roberto and his team for the amazing effort that they've actually put into this. Great discussions, and I think that what they've come out with is something that, with Roberto's hard work, [inaudible] a consensus document that we can actually use to move forward with our individual members. Thank you for that.

Okay. So, moving on to the next item which is ...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

I lost audio.

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

If you're speaking, we cannot hear you.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Sorry. Yes. We're going to move on to Gisela to give a quick rundown on what we're doing with ICANN70. Thank you. Gisela? It's all yours.

GISELLA GRUBER:

Sorry, Maureen. Thank you very much, Maureen. So, we are just one month away from ICANN70. I'm just going to give a few brief reminders here prior to starting on our schedule. Please remember, first of all, to register for ICANN70. It's really important not only for the main ICANN

---

schedule, but also for what we call prep week which is running week of the 8th of March.

And note that all the meeting times that are posted are posted in Cancun time. That is, UTC minus five hours.

As I mentioned, prep week is running from the 8<sup>th</sup> to the 11<sup>th</sup> of March. I am going to post the link for prep week again in the chat. And as I said, to access prep week webinars, you do need to register for ICANN70.

You'll then receive a registration confirmation as well as login information for the schedule. And then once you log on to the schedule, you'll be able to sign up for ICANN70 prep week sessions.

And for security purposes, participation links will only be posted 24 hours prior to the start of the session. And there will be two prep webinars a day. Again, if you click on the link in the Zoom room, the information will be there.

And also, and a very important link, is the link to our At-Large ICANN70 Wiki page. And on this Wiki page, I believe you'll find all the information that you need. And we will also be posting the prep week webinars listed there.

So, during ICANN70 week itself, which is from the 22<sup>nd</sup> to the 25<sup>th</sup> of March, the At-Large sessions are posted under the daily tabs. Please bookmark the latest link that I did put in the Zoom chat to allow you to follow.

There we go now. For those of you in the Zoom room, it's not up in the Zoom room.

---

So, our sessions are divided into three tracks: At-Large Policy, Outreach & Engagement, and Operations. The agendas are also a work in progress and will be posted as soon as they're finalized on the daily schedule which is under ICANN70 Week 22-25 March that you see on the schedule.

Maureen, would you like to run through every day, or would you just like the participants now just to make sure that they check the sessions as we've just explained? It may not be necessary to run through the days.

MAUREEN HILYARD: I think we'll just leave, yeah. We'll just leave it.

GISELLA GRUBER: Yeah. Wonderful.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yeah, thank you.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Judith, is that a burning question?

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, and Alfredo has the same question as me. We were interested in knowing is the YouTube pilot running during the prep week.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Who knows an answer to that one? Jonathan? No.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Yeah. I can just answer. What they told is that [that] they're going to expand YouTube pilots to all of the plenaries and high-interest topic sessions during the actual ICANN meeting. So, it's more than last time, but it doesn't extend into prep week. The one other indication we were given was we were given permission to publicize the YouTube links that can only be found now by registering. But because there's no opportunity to bomb via YouTube, I think we were given tacit approval to do some of our own publicity around the YouTube links themselves. And we now will have information about which sessions are going to be on YouTube much sooner because it's all the plenaries and high-interest topics. I tried to be quick.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, and Sara had her hand up so she can maybe confirm this.

SARA CAPLIS: I'll just echo that Jonathan is correct on all points there.

---

MAUREEN HILYARD: [inaudible] thinking [inaudible] confirmation. Okay. That's great. Jonathan, do you have your hand up for something urgent?

JONATHAN ZUCK: Sorry. Old hand. I'm just not used to anybody every saying that, so I've got to record that. Thanks, bye.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much. We've reached the top of the hour and we've just got a couple more things [inaudible].

First of all, you'll probably see there's going to be a call forward about strategic trends. It's a special meeting that's been called by ICANN, and there's a limit of 30 people. So, it's the ALAC and ALT-PLUS members and RALO leaders who have been invited to this meeting. And I'd like them to be able to come back and talk to their people about what was discussed at that particular meeting. I'm not quite sure why there's a limit, but there is and that's the way it is. So, that's a meeting that's coming up, and I'm not sure that the date has actually been given yet.

And the final item was the one that Heidi mentioned which I'm going to get her to talk about because she said there was a NomCom update. Now who's giving it? Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Hi, Maureen. I don't know if you can hear me.

---

MAUREEN HILYARD: You've got 30 seconds. Yes, I can.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Maureen, can you hear me?

MAUREEN HILYARD: I can.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Okay. I believe Hadia ... I asked Hadia. Hadia, are you able to give the NomCom update very briefly?

HADIA ELMINIAWI: Yes.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you.

HADIA ELMINIAWI: So, I guess the most significant thing about the NomCom is that the deadline for the application has been extended. So, it's now the 29<sup>th</sup> of March. So, the application deadline is now the 29<sup>th</sup> of March instead of the 18<sup>th</sup> of March.

And then the positions that are available. We have three open positions for the ICANN Board of Directors. One position for the ccNSO Council. And three At-Large positions: one for Africa, the other for



---

Asia/Australia/Pacific, and the third is for Latin America and the Caribbean Islands.

And we have two GNSO Council positions: one voting for the Contracted Parties House, and another also voting for the non-Contracted Parties House.

Today, the NomCom met, and we are meeting also tomorrow. And so that's about it for me. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you very much. Very important to actually get that update. And if you know of anyone who is interested in applying for any of those positions, please get them to apply. It would be good to see some new faces around the place. And thank you very much.

I think we have to close. We actually are over time and we're keeping our interpreters who have been working very, very hard today and doing an amazing demonstration of what we can look forward to for our ICANN meetings and, as they said, the other regional meetings. And who knows, we may get more of it later on. But it's a great service. We do appreciate it. Thank you to John for his contribution today.

And thank you for the amazing number of people who have actually come along to our meeting today. Very much appreciate it.

And, yeah, I'll say good-bye now. Have a great day, afternoon, or evening, wherever you are. And take care. Thank you.

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks, Maureen.

[CLAUDIA RUIZ]: Thanks, everyone, for joining the call. This meeting is now adjourned.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPT]**