

ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior

- Webpage:
<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/expected-standards-2016-06-28-en>
- PDF: [here](#)

ICANN Community Anti-Harassment Policy

- Webpage:
<https://www.icann.org/news/blog/community-anti-harassment-policy>

NomComRIWG

Meeting #58



29 October 2020 | 19:00-20:00 UTC

Agenda

1. Roll Call + SOI Updates
2. Introduction to the Proposed Bylaw Changes
3. Progress Report / Review of other recommendations
4. A.O.B.
5. Next Meeting

Roll Call + SOI Updates

Agenda Item #1

Agenda

2. Introduction to the Proposed Bylaw Changes
3. Progress Report / Review of other recommendations
4. A.O.B.
5. Next Meeting

Introduction to the Proposed Bylaw Changes

Agenda Item #2

Introduction to the Proposed Bylaw Changes

- **Document:** [LINK](#)
- Sent to ICANN Legal, input expected as from the week of November 2nd
- If a meeting is needed, questions should be submitted beforehand.

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 7: No updates**

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Determine which NomCom seats will be elected initially for one year and which seats immediately for two-year terms. <u>Note:</u> the seats that will be initially elected for one year will turn into two-year positions in the following year, resulting in half of the NomCom being replaced each year going forward. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Work with ICANN org to draft changes to Bylaws language: | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2a. | Decide whether term limits are 'consecutive' v 'life-time' limits. | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2b. | If term limits refer to consecutive terms, determine the minimum gap between terms | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2c. | How to deal with NomCom members who have been appointed by different SO/ACs. | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2.d | Assess whether past NomCom terms are counted towards the life-time limit in (a). | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2.e | Decide criteria determining how partial terms served impact the term restrictions. | ✓ | Q1-2020 |

Updated Implementation Steps

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 3 | NomCom RIWG to agree on answers/principles to the questions under 2, provide this list to ICANN org Legal. Legal to draft proposed Bylaws language based on NomCom RIWG input, and agree with NomComRIWG on finalized proposed language. NomCom RIWG to transmit proposed language to OEC for review and its recommendation to the Board to initiate Bylaws change | 🔄 | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | ICANN Board directs initiation of Bylaws change and oversees the process | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 5 | Bylaws change process takes place | ✗ | Q4-2020 – Q4-2021 |
| 6 | Subject to the outcome of the Bylaws change, NomCom RIWG to inform bodies appointing members to the NomCom about new term conditions going forward. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |
| 7 | Review and update NomCom Operating Procedures. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 9: No updates**

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🟡 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | NomComRIWG to reach out to all bodies that are appointing NomCom members about planned Bylaws change, including rationale, as detailed in the Final Report | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | ICANN Board directs the initiation of Bylaws change, Section 8.2., to allocate the same voting and participation rights for all NomCom members, and oversees the process. | 🟡 | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | Bylaws change process takes place. | ✗ | Q4-2020 Q4-2021 |
| 4 | If Bylaws are changed, NomComRIWG with support from ICANN org, to review and update the NomCom Operating Procedures. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |
| 5 | Subject to the outcome of the Bylaws change, NomCom RIWG to ensure that bodies appointing members to the NomCom are informed about all relevant changes to the NomCom members' participation rights. | ✗ | Q2-2022 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 10:** * Steps 4 to 7 were updated since the first Progress and Implementation Status Report.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|----|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | NomComRIWG to propose definition of relevant terms included in the recommendation and identify the intended purpose of the recommendation – as detailed in the final report. | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2 | Assess what principles and other factors were used to determine the current NomCom's composition. | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 3 | Consider Recommendation 8, and assess whether SOs/ACs seats need to be redistributed | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 4* | <p>Draft one or more rebalanced NomCom seat allocation scenarios and present this to the impacted SOs/ACs. Inform ICANN Board and the ICANN community during a public meeting, webinar, etc.</p> <p>• This is where we decided to split the recommendation into two phases:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Phase 1: Remove the GNSO hard coding from the ICANN Bylaws • Phase 2: Conduct rebalancing exercise | ✓ | Q2-2020 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 10:** * Steps 4 to 7 were updated since the first Progress and Implementation Status Report.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-------------------------------|--|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 7* Now 5 | Taking into account the input, including a consideration of whether a potential Bylaws change may receive community and Board support, NomComRIWG to revise the rebalancing proposal and ask the Board to initiate Bylaws changes, if needed, or recommendation to the Board that no Bylaws change should occur. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 5 | NomComRIWG to ask the Board to initiate Bylaws changes | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 8* 6 | If Bylaws changes are needed, and the ICANN Board is satisfied that the proposal will not impact on the effective conduct of the NomCom's selection work, the Board will direct the process to change the Bylaws. | ✗ | Q4-2020 Q4-2021 |
| 9* 7 | Bylaw change is accepted. and NomCom is rebalanced or Bylaw change is rejected, and status quo is maintained. The OEC decides who and how to conduct phase 2 of this recommendation. Options include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The NomComRIWG - The NomCom Standing Committee - A GNSO working group - A new cross-constituency working group | ✗ | Q1-2022 Q2-2022 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 24:** * Steps 10, 11 were updated since the first Progress and Implementation Status Report.

| # | Description | Status ✓ ▒ ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | NomComRIWG to discuss proposals for the structure and charter of this Standing Committee: | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 1a. | Nature: Cross-community group, Empowered NomCom Standing Committee, Working group | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 1b. | Composition: SO/AC appointed members, NomCom members... Large vs. Small group | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 2 | NomComRIWG to propose the scope of this new body, including: | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 2a. | Advisory/community feedback role, identify which processes are part of its remit, including but not limited to those listed in this detailed implementation plan. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 2b. | Avoid duplication of the NomCom's work (e.g. body will not participate in any way in the annual recruitment, evaluation or selection of candidates). | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 2c. | Role of the NomCom leadership team vis-à-vis the Standing Committee. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 2d. | Protecting the NomCom from undue influence from the Standing Committee. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 24:** * Steps 10, 11 were updated since the first Progress and Implementation Status Report.

| # | Description | Status ✓ ▒ ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 2d. | Protecting the NomCom from undue influence from the Standing Committee. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 2e. | Clarification on how the Standing Committee interplays with regular organizational review cycles. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 2f. | Ensuring that the definition of the Standing Committee does not negatively impact other improvements identified through the NomCom review process. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | Propose how communication between the body and the NomCom will be conducted, how it will be captured and how it will adhere to ICANN's transparency and accountability standards. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | Propose a membership size of the body, including its possible composition. | ▒ | Q3-2020 |
| 5 | Propose performance metrics for the Standing Committee, and how to review them annually. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 6 | ICANN Board, or a chosen delegate, to lead community conversation on all governance-related proposals put forward by the NomComRIWG. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 24:** * Steps 10, 11 were updated since the first Progress and Implementation Status Report.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|----|--|---------------------|-----------------------------|
| 6 | ICANN Board, or a chosen delegate, to lead community conversation on all governance-related proposals put forward by the NomComRIWG. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 7 | The Board, or its delegate, to work with the NomComRIWG and in consultation with the ICANN community to finalize a proposal on the governance structure of the Standing Committee, including protecting the NomCom from undue influence from the Standing Committee, clarification on how the Standing Committee interplays with regular organizational review cycles, and ensure that the definition of the Standing Committee does not negatively impact other improvements identified through the NomCom review process (see also 2 above). | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 8 | Following public comment, and based on feedback, ICANN Board, or its delegate, to finalize the governance structure. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 9 | ICANN org, in cooperation with NomComRIWG and ICANN community, to discuss what level of staff support and/or other support may be necessary to help the body perform its duties. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 10 | ICANN Board, or its delegate, to work with NomComRIWG to put the new body into place, i.e. Bylaw change and approval of the Standing Committee Charter , including additional public comment. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 11 | ICANN Board will direct any Bylaws changes, and public discussion on the Standing Committee Charter. | ✗ | Q4-2020 Q4-2021 |
| 12 | NomComRIWG to work with ICANN Board and ICANN org to initiate any budgetary requests needed for the operating of the body. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 27:** * Step 4 updated since the first Status Report. Steps 2, 3, 7, 8, 9 are new.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🟡 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Define 'ICANN unaffiliates', based on the findings of the Final Report, and whether a different term should be used. | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 2 | Review Bylaws and NomCom Operating Procedures and identify potential changes for this recommendation. | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 3 | Submit the Updated Bylaws to the OEC for review. | 🟡 | Q3-2020 |
| 2 4 | NomComRIWG to engage with the ICANN community, ICANN Board, and ICANN org, to obtain feedback on the definition of 'ICANN unaffiliates', and the questions of whether being an 'ICANN unaffiliates' should be an additional requirement for just some of the NomCom-appointed Board seats, and, if so, how many or for all of them . | 🟡 | Q3-2020 |
| 3 5 | NomComRIWG to develop a proposal for this recommendation regarding the need (or not) of NomCom-appointed Board directors who are 'ICANN unaffiliates'. | 🟡 | Q3-2020 |
| 4 6 | Review the proposal and ensure that it aligns with all relevant laws and IRS's regulatory standards applicable to the selection of ICANN's Board directors. | ✓ | Q3-2020 |

Updated Implementation Steps

- **Rec. 27:** * Steps 10, 11 were updated since the first Progress and Implementation Status Report.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 5 | Update NomCom Operating Procedures with definition and requirement | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 7 | ICANN Board directs the initiation of Bylaws change, Section 8.1. and oversees the process. | ✗ | Q4-2020 Q4-2021 |
| 8 | Bylaws change process takes place. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 9 | If Bylaws are changed, NomComRIWG with support from ICANN org, to review and update the NomCom Operating Procedures with definition and requirement. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |

Progress Report | Review of Other Recommendations

Agenda Item #2

Progress Report

- Progress and Implementation Status Report to be submitted up until 31 December 2020.
- Introduction to the Proposed Bylaws Changes will feed into the progress report

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 1: Formalize a job description for NomCom members that emphasizes experience, diversity, independence, and provide that description to the SOs/ACs.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|----|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 7 | NomComRIWG, with support from ICANN org, to draft proposed job description(s) for NomCom members, based on input received and NomComRIWG's discussion | ✓ | Q2-2020 |
| 8 | NomComRIWG to provide the draft document to the bodies that appoint members to the NomCom and ask for feedback. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 9 | Finalize job description(s) based on NomComRIWG consensus. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 10 | NomComRIWG, with support from ICANN org, to post job description(s) on ICANN.org and send document to bodies that appoint members to the NomCom. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 11 | Ensure that the Standing Committee (Rec 24) provides revisions, in cooperation with the bodies that appoint members to the NomCom, if and when appropriate. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 2: Implement and formalize training to further NomCom members' understanding of the roles and responsibilities of Board directors and the practices of high-performing Boards at other nonprofit organizations..

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 2 | Work with current/former NomCom and ICANN org to identify content requirements for the training course, as well as logistical dependencies. | ✓ | Q2-2019 |
| 3 | Make a FY21 budget request for possible pilot program. | 🔄 | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | Determine what metrics should be applied to determine success of training program. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 5 | Based on steps 1-4, NomComRIWG to: | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 5.a | Work with ICANN org to identify suitable vendors | ✗ | Q4-2020 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 2: Implement and formalize training to further NomCom members' understanding of the roles and responsibilities of Board directors and the practices of high-performing Boards at other nonprofit organizations..

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----------------|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 5.b | Work with current/former NomCom members and ICANN org to agree on final course logistics and course content | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5.c | Work with ICANN org to determine what budgetary requirements for the course are necessary, and, if required, initiate budget request for future budget cycles | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 6 | Make budget request as part of ICANN's budget cycle. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 7 | Once budget is secured, work with ICANN org to contract vendor, and determine when training for future NomComs can start/take place. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| NEW 8 | NomCom Standing Committee to periodically, when it's appropriate, refresh the NomCom training. | ✗ | TBD |


Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 3: Implement and formalize training for NomCom leadership to further their understanding of their roles, authority, and responsibilities, and confirm or appoint the next Chair earlier in the cycle.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🟡 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 2 | Work with current/former NomCom and ICANN org to identify content requirements for the training course, as well as logistical dependencies. | ✓ | Q2-2019 |
| 3 | Make a FY21 budget request for a possible pilot program. | 🟡 | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | Determine what metrics should be applied to determine success of a training program. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 5 | Based on steps 1-4, NomComRIWG to: | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 5a) | Work with ICANN org to identify suitable vendors | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 5b) | Work with current/former NomCom members and ICANN org to agree on final course logistics and course content | ✗ | Q1-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 4: Formalize training for NomCom members in the candidate evaluation process.

| # | Description | Status ✓  ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|--|---|--------------------------------|
| 2 | Work with current/former NomCom members and ICANN org to identify content requirements for the training course, as well as any logistical and timing dependencies. | ✓ | Q2-2019 |
| 3 | Determine what metrics should be applied to determine success of training program. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | Based on steps 1-3, NomComRIWG to: | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4.a | Work with ICANN org to identify suitable vendors | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4.b | Work with current/former NomCom members and ICANN org to agree on final course logistics and course content | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4.c | Work with ICANN org to determine what budgetary requirements for the course are necessary, and, if required, initiate a budget request. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Once budget is secured, work with ICANN org to contract vendor, and determine when training for future NomCom's leadership can start/take place. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 5: A professional recruiting consultant should continue to be involved in the role of identifying potential Board candidates. The role of the recruiting consultant should be clarified and published.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | Enquire with ICANN staff and the current NomCom what the contractually defined role of the recruiting consultant(s) is and whether further steps are required. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Revisit the current timeline for BGC and others to provide the incoming NomCom with job descriptions and other relevant information for recruitment process. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 3 | Create an overview document that summarizes the consultant(s)' role (paying attention to the need for capacity outreach to underrepresented regions with similar proficiency) | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 4 | Ensure that there is an ongoing outreach effort to under-represented regions within ICANN. This should be done in coordination with the marketing efforts, detailed in recommendation 13. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 5 | Draft a proposed role description for a professional recruiting consultant(s), based on input received and any additional NomComRIWG's input. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 5: A professional recruiting consultant should continue to be involved in the role of identifying potential Board candidates. The role of the recruiting consultant should be clarified and published.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|----|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 6 | Provide the document to ICANN Org and ask for feedback/concerns | ✗ | Q3-2021 |
| 7 | Finalize proposed role description for a professional consultant(s) based on NomComRIWG consensus | ✗ | Q3-2021 |
| 8 | Post role description on ICANN.org | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 9 | NomComRIWG to establish metrics for the Standing Committee and/or ICANN.org to use to assess the consultants performance. | ✗ | TBD |
| 10 | NomCom Standing Committee (see Recommendation #24) and/or ICANN.org to maintain and, if needed, update the role and responsibilities document of the recruiting company | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 6: A professional evaluation consultant should continue to be involved in the evaluation process for Board candidates. The role of the evaluation consultant should be clarified and published.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | NomComRIWG to decide what the process is of hiring an evaluation consultant and how it fits with the NomCom's annual selection cycle: | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 1a. | Enquire with ICANN Org and the current NomCom what are the responsibilities of the evaluation consultant vis-à-vis the current job descriptions for the vacancies to be filled by the NomCom. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1b. | Create an overview document that summarizes the responses | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 2 | Draft a proposed role description and Statement of Work for a professional evaluation consultant, based on input. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | Ensure the written job descriptions described in Recommendation #15 are utilized. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 11: The senior staff member supporting NomCom should be accountable to and report to the office of the CEO.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | Assess WS2 recommendation #7 for potential impact: https://www.icann.org/public-comments/ccwg-acct-ws2-final-2018-03-30-en | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 2 | NomComRIWG to communicate with ICANN org about NomCom support reporting structure | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 3 | NomComRIWG to assess what options there are, according to implemented WS2 Rec #7, for NomComRIWG to provide input into the reporting structure. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |
| 4 | Further steps depend on the outcome of task 3. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Email from Jay Sudowski (28 September 2020)

One recurring issue this year is the lack of formalized communication channels between NomCom and the Board. In fact, the situation is so dire that NomCom appointed Board members have essentially taken a position to recuse themselves from any NomCom related matters, even though the matters have been logistical in nature.

IMO, the Standing Committee could perhaps serve as an official communications channel between the NomCom and the Board in a formalized manner. Otherwise, I have the following input on the other tasks noted:

Oversee continuous improvement and one-time deviations to the NomCom Operating Procedures

- Just to clarify, this assumes that the NomCom itself will still have autonomy over the operating procedures?*

Capture interview questions asked by the NomCom, and seek feedback from the NomCom on usefulness of questions

- Often times the questions are ad-hoc in nature and/or the language is tweaked at the last minute. However this is implemented should ensure that the NomCom still has the flexibility and authority to ask whatever interview questions they need to during an interview.*

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 12: NomCom leadership should have input on the NomCom budget and staffing resources.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | NomComRIWG, with support/input from ICANN org, to identify a process, including detailed mechanism and appropriate timing, for NomCom leadership to provide meaningful input on resources via ICANN's annual budget cycle. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 2 | NomComRIWG to discuss with ICANN org and current NomCom leadership the feasibility of identified process. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 3 | NomComRIWG to coordinate with NomCom staff and NomCom leadership to assure leadership has the support needed to provide meaningful input. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | NomComRIWG to devise any applicable metrics. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Review and Update NomCom Operating Procedures to reflect budget input of NomCom leadership. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 6 | Identify the role of the Standing Committee to assist with this recommendation, once implemented. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 13: Publish a “Process Diagram” and codify key elements of the NomCom process. Each year, the NomCom should be required to highlight and explain process changes to the ICANN community in an open session.

| # | Description | Status ✓ ◻ ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | Consult with current/former NomCom members and ICANN org to document the NomCom’s annual cycle; including (but not limited to) appointment of the leadership team, seating of the incoming members, communication with Board and other ICANN bodies about skill requirements for new appointees, recruitment outreach, interviews, selection, and announcement of incoming appointees. | ◻✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 2 | Draft up a process diagram incorporating all relevant steps in the NomCom’s lifecycle, ensuring the process includes: determination by the current NomCom if they are going to follow the previously codified process; if not, how they plan to / have already communicate(d) the change to the ICANN community. | ◻✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 3 | Consult with current NomCom and NomCom staff to enquire about the comprehensiveness of diagram, including whether too little or too much details are included in the draft. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 4 | Update/finalize diagram | ✗ | Q3-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 13: Publish a “Process Diagram” and codify key elements of the NomCom process. Each year, the NomCom should be required to highlight and explain process changes to the ICANN community in an open session.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 5 | Reach out to decide if additional visual improvements to the diagram are desired and whether ICANN org can provide needed services. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |
| 6 | If a third-party vendor is required, NomComRIWG to enquire with ICANN org if current budget allows for the procurement of a third-party vendor; if it does not: NomComRIWG to coordinate a budget request for the next fiscal year via ICANN’s annual budget cycle. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 7 | Publish where appropriate and publicize among the community. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 8 | Ensure that the diagram is periodically reviewed and updated, if required and that the community is duly updated about any those process updates. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |
| 9 | Ensure that any deviation from the standard process by the NomCom is clearly communicated to the ICANN community | ✗ | Q2-2022 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 14: Formalize communication between the NomCom and the Board, SOs/ACs, and the PTI Board to understand needed competencies and experience.

| # | Description | Status ✓ ▒ ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 2 | NomComRIWG, in coordination with the current/former NomCom members and ICANN org and the bodies that receive NomCom appointees, including the ICANN Board and PTI Board, to identify what additional information (if any) can be shared. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 3 | NomComRIWG, in coordination with the current/former NomCom members, ICANN org and the bodies that receive NomCom appointees, including the ICANN Board and PTI Board, to identify whether improvements should be made to the timing of this exchange of information. | ▒ | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | NomComRIWG, in coordination with the ICANN Board and impacted portions of the ICANN community, to draft a communication process and timeline, including desired information to be shared, that the NomCom and the bodies that receive NomCom appointees should follow each year, including what information should be shared with the recruitment agency(ies). | ▒ | Q2-2021 |
| 5 | If applicable, updates should be made to the NomCom's operating procedures. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 15: The NomCom should publish detailed job descriptions for Board, SO/AC, and PTI Board positions. The job descriptions, in combination with specific needed competencies identified each year by the NomCom, should form a basis for recruiting and evaluation efforts.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | Await and collect the finalized job descriptions as per Rec 14. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |
| 2 | NomComRIWG, with support from ICANN org, to establish the process for the NomCom to make sure that when publishing the job descriptions, the NomCom is transparent if it decides to include other factors than those received through the suggestive Board advice or input from other bodies that receive NomCom appointees. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 3 | NomCom with support of ICANN org to update the NomCom Operating Procedure Manual with this new process | ✗ | Q1-2022 |
| 4 | Assure that the NomCom Standing Committee (Rec #24) performs annual outreach to Board, SO/AC, and PTI Board to receive feedback on specific needed competencies | ✗ | TBD |


Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 16: Implement and codify a system for providing feedback to the NomCom regarding the contributions and participation of members up for re-appointment by the NomCom.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🟡 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| 2 | NomComRIWG, with support from ICANN org and in coordination with the current/former NomCom members, ICANN org and the bodies that receive NomCom appointees, including the ICANN Board, to identify what additional information (if any) can be shared. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 3 | NomComRIWG, in coordination with the current/former NomCom members, ICANN org and the bodies that receive NomCom appointees, including the ICANN Board, to identify whether improvements should be made to the timing of this exchange of information. | 🟡 | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | NomComRIWG, in consultation with the ICANN Board and ICANN community, to draft a communication process and timeline, including desired information to be shared, that the NomCom and the bodies that receive NomCom appointees should follow each year, including what information should be shared with the recruitment agency(ies). | 🟡 | Q2-2021 |
| 5 | If applicable, updates should be made to the NomCom's operating procedures. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 18: Publish a candidate communication schedule and codify a communication process with candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓  ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Gain an overview of the current candidate communications of the NomCom by enquiring with current/former NomCom members and NomCom Staff. | ✓ | Q1-2020 |
| 2 | Talk to previous NomCom appointees to understand how they perceived the communication process. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | Propose a communication schedule including timing of communications with both successful and unsuccessful candidates. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | Discuss with current/former NomCom members, NomCom staff, and previous NomCom appointees whether proposed communication schedule meets requirements and what further improvements could be made. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Finalize communication process; this should include annual surveys of all NomCom applicants. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |
| 6 | Update NomCom's workflow (recommendation 13). | ✗ | Q4-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 18: Publish a candidate communication schedule and codify a communication process with candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 7 | Publish communication schedule and timelines for candidate communications. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 8 | Ensure the Standing Committee reviews the annual applicant survey results and makes any changes as needed for the following year. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 18: ICANN staff and the recruiting consultant, along with NomCom members, should leverage the detailed job description and desired competencies and experience to develop a marketing plan to better target prospective candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 📊 ✗ | <i>(Estimated)</i> Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|--|
| 1 | Reach out to NomCom, ICANN org, ICANN communication team, and the recruitment consultant(s), to understand what the state of current outreach and marketing is with regard to ensuring a diverse candidate pool in response to the NomCom’s annual recruitment efforts. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Identify possible improvements to the marketing plan and decide, in cooperation with the current NomCom, ICANN org, and the Standing Committee (if already in place), what additional efforts should be undertaken to target candidates for future NomCom’s recruitment cycles. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 3 | This marketing effort should also help educate potential outside candidates about ICANN. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | NomCom to conduct annual measurements related to the quality of the applicant pool. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 5 | Standing Committee (or NomComRIWG as long as the Standing Committee is not yet in place) to assess effectiveness of outreach/marketing efforts on an annual basis and work with the NomCom, ICANN org and the recruitment consultant(s) to make improvements for the following year as required. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 19: ICANN staff and the recruiting consultant, along with NomCom members, should leverage the detailed job description and desired competencies and experience to develop a marketing plan to better target prospective candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 📊 ✗ | <i>(Estimated)</i> Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|--|
| 1 | Reach out to NomCom, ICANN org, ICANN communication team, and the recruitment consultant(s), to understand what the state of current outreach and marketing is with regard to ensuring a diverse candidate pool in response to the NomCom's annual recruitment efforts. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Identify possible improvements to the marketing plan and decide, in cooperation with the current NomCom, ICANN org, and the Standing Committee (if already in place), what additional efforts should be undertaken to target candidates for future NomCom's recruitment cycles. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 3 | This marketing effort should also help educate potential outside candidates about ICANN. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | NomCom to conduct annual measurements related to the quality of the applicant pool. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 5 | Standing Committee (or NomComRIWG as long as the Standing Committee is not yet in place) to assess effectiveness of outreach/marketing efforts on an annual basis and work with the NomCom, ICANN org and the recruitment consultant(s) to make improvements for the following year as required. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |


Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 20: The evaluation consultant should undertake a preliminary screen of all Board candidates and provide blinded assessments to the NomCom to assist the NomCom with reducing the pool of candidates to the deep-dive shortlist.

| # | Description | Status ✓ ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|--|-----------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Consult with current and past NomComs as well as ICANN org to determine what candidate attributes/data should be anonymized during the blind assessment (and when to reveal all data points), including steps to prevent: | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.a | losing access to candidate data prior to sharing with the NomCom | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.b | limiting the NomCom's choices of candidates | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.c | making the firm's recommendation for a short list binding on the NomCom | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | NomComRIWG to establish when in the NomCom cycle the short list should be produced to have maximum benefit for the NomCom. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | If necessary, NomComRIWG to work with ICANN org to amend evaluation firm contract with the need to provide blind assessments and propose a deep-dive shortlist of the applicant pool (in accordance with 2 above), while preserving all application materials and making them available to the NomCom if so requested. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 20: The evaluation consultant should undertake a preliminary screen of all Board candidates and provide blinded assessments to the NomCom to assist the NomCom with reducing the pool of candidates to the deep-dive shortlist.

| # | Description | Status ✓  ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---|-----------------------------------|
| 4 | Establish a feedback mechanism to assess the effectiveness of the evaluation consultant providing a deep-dive shortlist to the NomCom and adjust the consultant's remit for the following year, if necessary (to be maintained by NomCom Standing Committee, see Recommendation #24). | ✗ | Q2-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 21: The NomCom should use a standardized tool to evaluate and prioritize candidates, based on desired competencies and experience as determined annually. This tool will not replace qualitative assessments of candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Determine what process information, and other relevant data (including diversity requirements), needs to be captured in the tool by: | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.a | Consulting current and former NomCom members | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.b | Consulting those bodies that appoint members to the NomCom | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.c | Consulting with ICANN org | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 1.d | Consulting with other sources to determine industry best practices, possibly ICANN HR | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Decide which additional tools should be part of the tool kit. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | Outreach to current and former NomCom members to solicit input what the toolkit should contain. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | Draft the tool kit components based on feedback and NomComRIWG input. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 21: The NomCom should use a standardized tool to evaluate and prioritize candidates, based on desired competencies and experience as determined annually. This tool will not replace qualitative assessments of candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 5 | Ensure that the evaluation toolkit information is shared in a timely manner with the incoming NomCom and overall community. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 6 | Incoming NomCom should amend the standardized toolkit based on the updated/latest job descriptions for positions to be filled. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 7 | Ensure the Standing Committee is aware of the necessity to maintain and update the evaluation toolkit on an annual basis accordingly to input from the outgoing NomCom, as well as each year's specific job description. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 22: The NomCom should provide consistent interview questions and an interviewer evaluation form for the candidates interviewed during the deep-dive phase and the final face-to-face interviews.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|-----|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Communicate with NomCom to capture and review what questions and evaluation tools are typically used by the NomCom during the deep-dive and final interview phases. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Establish which questions and tools should be included in the 'interview question library' used by every NomCom, (with the library included in the toolkit) by consulting: | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 2a. | Current and former NomCom members | ✓ | Q4-2020 |
| 2b. | Current and former NomCom appointees | ✓ | Q4-2020 |
| 2c. | NomCom supporting staff (HR) | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2d. | External firm(s) | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 2e. | Bodies receiving NomCom appointees | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 3 | Once finalized, integrate these questions into an interviewer evaluation form and incorporate into the evaluation toolkit (see Recommendation #21). | ✗ | Q1-2021 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 22: The NomCom should provide consistent interview questions and an interviewer evaluation form for the candidates interviewed during the deep-dive phase and the final face-to-face interviews.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 4 | Deep-dive team assignments should consider additional factors beyond simply time zone availability, such as, e.g., potential conflicts and different cultures. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Each new NomCom can generate its own questions as well as pull from the 'library' to conduct a 'semi-structured' interview. | ✗ | Q2-2021 |
| 6 | Instruct Standing Committee to capture the actual questions asked, scrubbing them of all identifying personal data, used at all stages, as well as seek feedback from each NomCom to assess usefulness of questions and update evaluation tool kit if and when needed. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 22: The NomCom should publish additional data on the candidate pool and the recruiting source of candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Work with ICANN org to establish what data about the candidate pool has been published over the past five years. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Work with ICANN org to determine what non-confidential, non-identifiable data has not been made public and why. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 3 | Consult with the wider ICANN community what additional non-confidential, non-identifiable data points should be collected and published. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | Reach consensus within NomComRIWG on what additional data, if any, should be published going forward and capture this consensus in the toolkit. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Coordinate with ICANN org to assure the additional data is captured and published. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 6 | Instruct Standing Committee to oversee the continuous publication of data, as defined, and to ensure analytics/trend analysis is conducted to decide if adjustments should be made (and if so what kind) for future NomComs. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 23: The NomCom should publish additional data on the candidate pool and the recruiting source of candidates.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Work with ICANN org to establish what data about the candidate pool has been published over the past five years. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Work with ICANN org to determine what non-confidential, non-identifiable data has not been made public and why. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 3 | Consult with the wider ICANN community what additional non-confidential, non-identifiable data points should be collected and published. | ✗ | Q4-2020 |
| 4 | Reach consensus within NomComRIWG on what additional data, if any, should be published going forward and capture this consensus in the toolkit. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Coordinate with ICANN org to assure the additional data is captured and published. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 6 | Instruct Standing Committee to oversee the continuous publication of data, as defined, and to ensure analytics/trend analysis is conducted to decide if adjustments should be made (and if so what kind) for future NomComs. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 25: Improve NomCom selection decisions by assessing the performance and needs of all bodies receiving NomCom appointees.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|--|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Consult with receiving bodies to understand what (if any) performance assessment of the body itself is conducted and what skill set needs derive from that (or any other assessment) for future NomCom appointees, to avoid creating a new line of assessment or review of the receiving bodies. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Propose additional/improved performance and needs assessment of receiving bodies, if needed, as it relates to identification of needs from NomCom appointees. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 3 | Propose how the NomCom can use the information from the receiving bodies (step 1) to assess the needs of these bodies to improve NomCom's selection decisions during its annual selection cycle. | ✗ | Q3-2020 |
| 4 | Agree with the receiving bodies how assessment and improved selection will be incorporated into the annual selection process, if appropriate/necessary. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 5 | Incorporate this assessment into the relevant job descriptions developed annually by the NomCom. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 6 | Determine how to facilitate the receiving bodies performing the assessments. | ✗ | Q2-2020 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 25: Improve NomCom selection decisions by assessing the performance and needs of all bodies receiving NomCom appointees.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 7 | Ensure that interdependency with other, relevant recommendations is taken into account. | ✗ | Q2-2020 |
| 8 | Standing Committee analyze the performance assessment of the receiving bodies on an annual basis and make adjustments (if/when needed) for the subsequent NomCom. | ✗ | TBD |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 26: ICANN should investigate advancing its nominations process into a Leadership Development function.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Reach out to ICANN org to discuss what would be involved in developing a leadership development function for unsuccessful NomCom applicants. | ✓ | Q4-2019 |
| 2 | Provide an overview of what kind of leadership development is currently in place, or how current outreach and volunteer development efforts could be adapted to harness unsuccessful NomCom candidates. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 3 | Discuss with current/former NomCom members and ICANN org how to identify unsuccessful applicants that would benefit from leadership development. | ✗ | Q1-2021 |
| 4 | Provide ICANN org with suggestions on what a leadership development could look like, what its goals would be, and what criteria might be relevant for its success. | ✗ | Q3-2021 |
| 5 | Investigate and to report back to NomComRIWG about the feasibility of such a leadership development function, which costs would be involved and what potential metrics for success could be applied. | ✗ | Q4-2021 |
| 6 | Launch development function if deemed feasible and potential for harnessing new volunteer talent is sufficiently high. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |

Review of Other Recommendations

Rec. 26: ICANN should investigate advancing its nominations process into a Leadership Development function.

| # | Description | Status ✓ 🔄 ✗ | (Estimated) Completion Date |
|---|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 7 | In addition, the NomComRIWG to ensure that the communication with unsuccessful candidates explains other volunteer opportunities within ICANN – such communication should be codified within the NomCom operating procedures. | ✗ | Q1-2022 |

Any Other Business

Agenda Item #4

Next Meeting

Agenda Item #5

Next Meetings

- **5 November 13:00 UTC**
- **12 November 19:00 UTC**
- **19 November 13:00 UTC**
- ~~**26 November 19:00 UTC**~~

Thank you!



Follow our wiki at <https://community.icann.org/x/aBpIBg>