AT-LARGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
ALAC Statement on Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT3) Final Report

Introduction

On 16 June 2020, Public Comment opened for the Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT3) Final Report. On the same day, an At-Large workspace was created for the statement. The At-Large Operations, Finance and Budget Working Group (OFB-WG) decided it would be in the interest of end users to develop an ALAC statement on the Public Comment, and Joanna Kulesza, ALAC Member of the European Regional At-Large Organization (EURALO), Bastiaan Goslings, ALAC Member of EURALO, and Fouad Bajwa, member of the Asian, Australasian and Pacific Islands Regional At-Large Organization (APRALO), volunteered for the drafting team of the ALAC statement.

On 16 July 2020, Joanna Kulesza shared the first draft of the ALAC statement. ICANN Policy staff in support of the At-Large community posted the draft to its workspace, and issued a call for comments on the OFB-WG and ALAC mailing lists.

On 27 July 2020, after comments from the community and drafting team, Joanna Kulesza shared a revised draft. ICANN Policy staff in support of the At-Large community posted the draft to its workspace, and issued a call for comments on the OFB-WG and ALAC mailing lists.

On 28 July 2020, the drafting team presented the final statement to the OFB-WG. The OFB-WG decided that the statement could move to the ALAC for ratification before submission to ICANN Public Comment. Joanna Kulesza finalized the ALAC statement. The ALAC Chair, Maureen Hilyard, requested that the statement be ratified by the ALAC.

ALAC Statement on Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT3) Final Report

The ALAC, on behalf of the At-Large community, congratulates the Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT3) for the completion of its final report and recommendations to the ICANN Board of Directors.

We recognize the amount of effort required to assess ICANN's implementation of recommendations from past Review Teams. We are appreciative of the assessment as well as the ensuing recommendations, which incorporate valuable input from our community. We strongly support the limited and focused number of recommendations proposed by the ATRT3 report, reflecting the pending implementation of proposals from previous review teams.

We find the ATRT3 recommendations to be clear, appropriate and actionable. We thus support all five recommendations[1] and urge the ICANN Board to adopt them as a strategic priority towards enhancing the accountability and transparency culture within ICANN. The ALAC also considers that the Board and the ICANN organisation should take into account all suggestions made by ATRT3 in annexes A and B. They offer a good opportunity to advance ICANN's accountability and transparency.

In moving forward, and more specifically regarding the following recommendations, we advise the ICANN Board to:

1. Swiftly implement ATRT3 recommendation to evolve both specific and organizational reviews as per **Section 8** of the final report:
   1.1. with the creation of a Holistic Review to allow a global view of ICANN various structures and their relations;
   1.2. with the pause of specific reviews;
   1.3. with a common process (with possible adaptation by each SO/AC/NC) aimed towards ensuring continuous improvement of the ICANN community and the multistakeholder governance model it represents.

The ALAC follows the ATRT3 Review Team in recognizing the need for a readjustment of current review processes, allowing for them to be better aligned with community needs and available resources. The ALAC views this recommendation as a much-needed shift from obligatory to adaptable and coordinated (by Holistic Review) review processes granted to individual constituencies. This shift is a rational step towards streamlining community efforts and increasing the efficiency of available resources, especially those offered by individual end-user stakeholders, as represented by the At-Large. With that, the ALAC supports the ATRT3 suggestion to introduce changes to the current structure of reviews, specifically by implementing a moratorium on launching any new Organizational and Specific Reviews until it has made a decision on this recommendation, as per **Section 8** of the report).

2. The ALAC fully endorses the recommendation to enhance current methods of Prioritization and Rationalization of Activities, Policies, and Recommendations (as per **Section 10** of the report).

The ALAC and the At-Large community it represents advises the Board to implement the proposed creation of a community-led entity, tasked with conducting a prioritization process for recommendations made by former and current review teams as well as cross-community groups. The ALAC fully supports all efforts made by the community to further advance this effort, as it views it of top priority to ensure further efficiency of the multistakeholder model. The Internet end user community represented by At-Large, much like other constituencies, faces significant challenges with prioritizing both: policy work, as demanded by ongoing policy development processes often impacted

---

[1] See next page, "Addendum".

swiftly and directly by outside factors, as well as continuous community improvement, as recommended by various internal review documents. The creation of a dedicated task force, providing clear guidance and accessible language on ICANN community priorities, needs and obligations would be of great benefit to the further development of Internet end user representation as well as better understanding of community needs.

3. The ALAC shares the ATRT3 Review Team's approach to the review process and methodology behind it, aiming to ensure that all elements contributing to achieving strategic objectives and their subcomponents are Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant and Time-based (SMART) and that all reporting on these refers to well specified metrics, to be reviewed on a regular or timely basis (as per **Section 9** of the report).

The At-Large community has long supported the metrics-based approach to community work and participation, among others through the creation of the ALAC Subcommittee on Metrics. Adjusting all community processes to a clear metrics framework would significantly benefit the work done by the diverse, intercultural multistakeholder community, as it currently stands. With that, the ALAC advises the Board to take under careful consideration the recommendations on metrics and reporting, as per section 9 of the report.

----

1 Addendum - 5 recommendations:

11. Prioritization of Recommendations

ATRT3 has opted to prioritize its recommendations into three categories of high, medium, and low:

- High Priority Recommendations:
  - Recommendation from Section 8 regarding Assessment of Specific and Organizational Reviews.
  - Recommendation from Section 10 regarding Prioritization and Rationalization of Activities, Policies, and Recommendations.

- Medium Priority Recommendation:
  - Recommendation from Section 9 regarding the Accountability and Transparency of Strategic and Operating Plans including accountability indicators.

- Low Priority Recommendations:
  - Recommendation from Section 3 regarding Public Input.
  - Recommendation from Section 7 regarding the Assessment of the Implementation of ATRT2 recommendations.